

**Mid-Term Review of Vois Blong Yumi**  
**A Program of Support to the Vanuatu Broadcasting  
and Television Corporation**

**FINAL**

**Pamela Thomas**  
**February 2012**

## **Table of Contents**

<b>Acronyms</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>1.0 Introduction</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>2.0 Program design</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>3.0 Program management</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>4.0 Terms of reference</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>5.0 Evaluation methodology</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>6.0 Review findings</b>	<b>9</b>
6.1 Overview	9
6.2 Relevance	10
6.3 Analysis and learning	11
6.4 Effectiveness	12
6.5 Efficiency	12
6.6 Monitoring and evaluation	13
6.7 Sustainability	13
6.8 Gender equality and cross cutting issues	14
<b>7.0 Program achievements and key issues, by component</b>	<b>14</b>
7.1 Component One: Organisational development	15
7.2 Component Two: Access	17
7.3 Component Three: Voice and content	18
7.4 Component Four: Outreach	21
<b>8.0 Overall VBY relevance, linkages and opportunities</b>	<b>22</b>
<b>9.0 Other issues</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>10.0 Recommendations and options for the future</b>	<b>25</b>
<b>Appendices</b>	
Appendix A: Board and management Committee members	27
Appendix B: Terms of reference	28
Appendix C: Monitoring and evaluation Plan	40
Appendix D: People interviewed	46
Appendix E: Reference and source documents	48
Appendix F: Progress against Annual Plans, Phase 3	50

## Acronyms

ABC	Australian Broadcasting Corporation
ADB	Asian Development Bank
AusAID	Australian Agency for International Development
CREST	Community Radio East Tanna
DWA	Department of Women's Affairs
EC	European Commission
GBE	Government Business Enterprise
GOA	Government of Australia
GOV	Government of the Republic of Vanuatu
JICA	Japanese International Cooperation Agency
MAV	Media Association of Vanuatu
MC	Management Committee
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
NZAID	New Zealand Agency for International Development
PACMAS	Pacific Media Assistance Scheme
NGO	Non government organisation
PINA	Pacific Island News Association
ROU	Record of Understanding
SPC	South Pacific Community
STI	Sexually Transmitted Infection
VBTC	Vanuatu Broadcasting and Television Corporation
VBV	Vois Blong Yumi
VCC	Vanuatu Christian Council
VCPP	Vanuatu Churches Partnership Program
VNCW	Vanuatu National Council of Women
WSB	Wan Smolbag Theatre

## Acknowledgements

I would especially like to thank the AusAID team Anna Naupa, Obed Timakata and Kylie Mullins who have willingly provided ongoing help and information – well beyond the call of duty. This was greatly appreciated. I would also like to thank Elder William for helping arrange our field trips to Santo and Tanna and Elizabeth Graham of VBTC who provided ongoing help and accompanied us to Santo and Tanna and arranged a special talkback radio show on listener opinions of Radio Vanuatu. And thanks to the Radio Vanuatu Team Leaders who spent time to discuss their progress.

# Executive Summary

## Introduction

This mid-term review covers Phase 3 of the AusAID supported Vanuatu Media Strengthening Program (Vois Blong Yumi). It is part of a cluster evaluation of two civil society and a media program which also includes the Vanuatu Church Partnership Program (VCPP) and the Vanuatu Kastom Governance Partnership Program (VKGP). The in-country review of the VCPP and Vois Blong Yumi (VBY) took place November 14-26, 2011. The VKGP will be reviewed in February, 2012.

The VBY program began in April 2007 with Australia providing up to \$5.2 million from June 2007-June 2012 for support to the Vanuatu Broadcasting and Television Corporation (VBTC) of which \$2.3 million is provided for phase 3 (June 2010-June 2012).

The program focus is on *“building the nation through rebuilding the national radio service so it can promote knowledge of social and economic issues such as good governance, HIV/AIDS, gender equity and agricultural development”*. The four program components cover:

- governance and organisation development;
- improved access and coverage;
- program development (voice and content); and
- support for broader media development in Vanuatu.

The program is implemented, managed and monitored by the Australian Broadcasting Corporation, through a twinning arrangement between the ABC International Projects Unit and Radio Vanuatu. The VBTC, ABC, Government of Vanuatu (GOV) and AusAID form the Management Committee which has oversight of the program.

The MTR includes the following objectives:

1. Assess what has been achieved, with special focus on problems identified in the December 2009 evaluation.
2. Consider how Radio Vanuatu stakeholders have engaged with the program during Phase 3.
3. Review how well the VBY achievements match with the direction of Australia’s development partnership with the GOV and how the program links with the VBTC Board’s reform agenda and the Vanuatu Government’s own reform agenda for government business enterprises;
4. Consider what support would be most appropriate to VBTC and the Vanuatu media in future.

## Review findings

Overall, the findings show that for AusAID, engaging in the country’s national broadcaster has had social, economic and political relevance. In this phase, important outcomes have been achieved in two of four outcome areas - access and transmission coverage and development of quality programs and news. The research indicates an effective middle management team, almost 100 percent transmission coverage of the country; greatly improved programming and newscasting including the involvement of key stakeholders in developing programs. Those living on outer islands are now able to engage in dialogue on key development topics through radio talkback programs. Achievements have been mixed in the other two outcome areas with no improvement in senior management or financial accountability. The major problems outlined in the 2009 evaluation remain the same. The planned review linked to the VBTC and GOV reform agenda continues to be postponed.

## Recommendations and future options

For the current, and any future, life of the program it is recommended that:

***Demonstration of organisational commitment to a high performing VBTC***

1. The VBTC implement the recommendations of the review of the Broadcasting Act and the GOV progress the ADB review of government business enterprises planned for 2010 but held over until 2012.
2. VBTC sign the outstanding team leaders' contracts and the staff Partnership Agreement immediately and funds allocated for technical maintenance are provided as scheduled.

***Re-allocation of existing program budget to other areas***

3. AusAID re-allocate the Santo studio budget and equipment towards expanding and upgrading a provincial radio network with consideration given to installing a line between CREST FM, Tanna and Radio Vanuatu.
4. AusAID seriously consider continuing to fund VBTC as this could be construed as condoning mismanagement, poor governance and blatant disregard for AusAID-funded advice.

***Expanding Radio Vanuatu access, voice and content***

5. ABC oversee training in social and economic development processes and good governance for program, news and talkback staff.
6. ABC encourage further support to increasing access to the media by women, youth and rural audiences to ensure they have a more equal voice and the program continues to focus on those groups most frequently overlooked.
7. ABC and VBTC continue current efforts to provide more reliable, high quality transmission and that AusAID organise a donor roundtable to ensure that further support to VBTC media, including provision of transmission equipment is harmonised and strategic.
8. In the remaining life of the program the focus is on Radio Vanuatu.
9. ABC implement, as soon as possible, develops a strategy and begins implementation to expand provincial radio networks to all provinces and to explore the suitability of suitcase radio stations. Implementation should begin prior to June 2012.
10. Follow-up discussions are held with PACMAS to identify ways that could support VBTC in future.

***Future options***

11. Any further funding be made conditional on actions to improve management performance. If there has been inadequate progress with implementing the Broadcasting Act, undertaking the ADB review and signing outstanding reports, agreements and team leaders contracts that the program end on June 30, 2012, If progress has been made consideration should be given for an extension until December 31, 2012 given the important role Radio Vanuatu will need to play in the October 30 elections.
12. Support from PACMAS be explored, most particularly for support with certificated, on-the-job engineering training. PACMAS offers a wide range of training and support for programming, news and content and broadcasting leadership but VBTC would have to compete for places.
13. If there has been good progress on provincial radio support by May 31, 2012, it is recommended that consideration be given to a new program which focuses on a strong and viable provincial radio network.

Funding for the majority of recommendations are available from the ABC's unspent budget.

# 1. Introduction

## 1.1 Background

This report covers the mid-term review of Phase 3 of Vois Blong Yumi, an AusAID funded program of support to the Vanuatu Broadcasting and Television Corporation (VBTC). It is part of a cluster evaluation that also includes two civil society programs – the Vanuatu Churches Partnership Program and the Kastom Governance Partnership. The in-country review for this program and the Vanuatu Churches Partnership Program took place November 14-26, 2011.

Vois Blong Yumi (VBY) is managed by the Australian Broadcasting Corporation's International Projects and implemented through a twinning arrangement between the ABC and the Vanuatu Broadcasting and Television Corporation (VBTC). The program builds on a long-standing informal relationship between ABC Radio Australia and the VBTC.

VBY began in May 2007. Phase 1 ended in June 2009 and phase 2 in June 2010. In December 2009, a second independent evaluation noted the progress of the program and recommended that it be extended for a further two years recommending further assistance to VBTC with strengthening content and technical capacity to maintain and develop its technical infrastructure. The evaluation also recommended including assistance to the commercial unit as well as some support for television through content development and production training. Phase 3 is due to end in June 2012. Australia is providing funding of up to \$5.2 million from June 2007-June 2012, of which Phase 3 comprises \$2.3million.

VBTC is a Government Business Enterprise which receives an annual government grant of around VT45 million but is expected to generate revenue through broadcast licences and from sale of air-time.<sup>1</sup> There is the expectation that VBTC will in future operate at a profit. This currently seems unlikely as it carries a long-term debt of around VT100 million and operates neither as a business nor an enterprise.<sup>2</sup> Radio Vanuatu is the country's national broadcaster and is Vanuatu's major means of communication

Prior to the VBY program, Radio Vanuatu had very limited coverage, high staff turnover, political restrictions on news reporting, political interference in staffing, regular transmitter breakdowns and poor quality transmission. There were few opportunities for people's views and interests to be represented; lack of staff skills and incentives; little locally generated content and an urban bias. Buildings and equipment needed urgent renovation and upgrading. In addition, there was a major challenge regarding content as there was no programme or editorial policy and no clear view of what the VBTC was trying to achieve as the national broadcaster.<sup>3</sup>

The VBY program focuses on nation building through supporting a national service which reflects the concerns, interests, languages and current affairs of Vanuatu. In particular it focuses on rebuilding the national radio service so it can be used to promote knowledge of social and economic issues such as HIV/AIDS, gender equity, good governance and agricultural development as well as providing a vital communication tool for disaster risk management.

At the time of this review Radio Vanuatu had almost 100 per cent coverage of the country and news content that was relatively free of political interference. The review found it had interesting and varied programs that cover provincial as well as national issues. Through talkback sessions

---

<sup>1</sup> See Vois Blong Yumi Design Document, 2006:4.

<sup>2</sup> Pers.Comm. Michael Francino, Public Financial Management Coordinator, Governance for Growth Program

<sup>3</sup> Op.cit pp10-11

and content from provincial governments and civil society organisations it now includes the voices and issues of those outside the urban centres.

**The Vanuatu context:** The context for the program is a rapidly growing population, 66 per cent of whom live in rural areas and engage in agriculture.<sup>4</sup> The country comprises many mountainous islands with scattered, and in many cases, hard to reach, populations. Physical communication is difficult, time-consuming, expensive and subject to the weather. The country is politically volatile with five changes of government in the past year. Government has limited reach beyond the urban centres with many higher level government positions filled by political appointees.<sup>5</sup> Culturally, women have very low status and are seldom involved in decision-making. Given this context, a strong, effective and independent Radio Vanuatu is a vital tool for effective social, economic, democratic and political development.

## 2.0 Program design

The program approach is one of progressive engagement over the long term – initially anticipated at between 7 to 10 years. The planned outputs and activities vary from year to year depending on achievements. The program goal is to support the achievement of VBTC's vision for Radio Vanuatu which is:

*'Building the nation by linking its past to its future and connecting people to knowledge and to each other'*

The program purpose is:

*'To support the development of an accessible, responsive and professional Radio Vanuatu, managed by a well performing and respected VBTC'.*

The goal and purpose were developed by the VBTC managers and senior staff during the design of Phase 1. There are four component objectives. With the exception of an amendment to component 1 they remain relevant.

### Component 1: Governance and organisational development

Objective: *To improve the governance, management and operations of the VBTC.*

### Component 2: Access

Objective: *To extend the reach of Radio Vanuatu and improve the quality of reception*

### Component 3: Voice and content

Objective: *To develop program content that serves people's needs*

### Component 4: Outreach

Objective: *To support the development of a free and fair media via support to other stakeholders*

## 3.0 Program management

The program works with Radio Vanuatu as a specific service and the VBTC as the organisation responsible for delivering the service. The program is implemented, managed and monitored by the ABC through a twinning arrangement between the ABC International Projects Unit and Radio Vanuatu.

A Program Management Committee has oversight of the program. It comprises representatives of the VBTC, including the five middle management team leaders<sup>6</sup>, the ABC,

---

<sup>4</sup> National Census of Population and Housing, Summary Release, 2009, Vanuatu Statistics Office, p.iii

<sup>5</sup> See Marcus Cox, Hannington Alatoa et al, 2007, 'The Unfinished State Drivers of Change in Vanuatu', AusAID pp.ix-x

<sup>6</sup> The team leaders management : News, Technical Services, Radio Vanuatu Programming, Corporate Services and Commercial Sales, Television



AusAID, VANGO, Women's Affairs, the Prime Minister's Office and Wan Smolbag Theatre as the youth representative. In addition there is a VBTC Executive Board comprising the General Manager and six politicians each representing a different political party.<sup>7</sup> Members of the Program Management Committee and Executive Board are listed in Appendix A.

Under Phase 3, the ABC has had two long-term in-country advisers – a Team Leader and a Commercial/Marketing Adviser. An additional four short-term advisers have also provided training in specific activities. The advisers report to the VBTC General Manager.

There are management meetings twice a year. The ABC Team Leader meets weekly with the General Manager or his representative and AusAID.

#### **4.0 Terms of Reference**

The TOR for this review covers two activities - one relates to a cluster evaluation of AusAID Vanuatu civil society and media programs that will articulate the rationale for ongoing engagement with civil society and media within the Vanuatu-Australia Partnership for Development - the other is specific to the VBY. In addition to reporting performance against relevance, analysis and learning, effectiveness, efficiency, monitoring and evaluation, sustainability and gender equality, it includes the following questions:

1. What has been achieved in Phase 3, with a particular focus on the problem areas identified by the Independent Evaluation report of February 2010 (sic) (i.e. components 1 and 4).
2. Are there any ongoing issues in relation to the achievement of activities? Does the design focus remain relevant and appropriate?
3. How have stakeholders engaged in the program during Phase 3 and to what extent has the nature of this engagement contributed to activity progress?
4. How does the program link with the VBTC Board's reform agenda and the Vanuatu Government's own reform agenda for government business enterprise?
5. How close do the achievements of the VBY program match up with the direction of Australia's development partnership discussion with the Vanuatu Government? What is the program's longer-term role in contributing to the higher level objectives of the aid program?
6. Do the program management and monitoring arrangements remain appropriate for a program of this size and significance?
7. With the commencement of PACMAS this year, what opportunities are there for support to VBTC to be transferred to the regional program? What is appropriate future support for VBTC and the media in Vanuatu?

The TOR is in Appendix B.

#### **5.0 Evaluation methodology**

This evaluation was guided by drivers of change theory. The aim of the evaluation, developed in collaboration with partners, was to: review what has been achieved, and why, and to use the results to best plan for the future. It was planned to be as participatory as possible given the very limited time available in country. The optimistic timeframe for two program reviews to be undertaken in 10 working days did not allow for the collection of in-depth information suitable for useful case studies. A variety of research methods were used including literature and document reviews, reviews of radio program schedules and talkback radio program records, group discussions, observation, and individual and group interviews with program managers, trainers, key stakeholders, and beneficiaries in both urban and rural areas. An important focus of the

---

<sup>7</sup> People's Progressive Party, Nagriamel, NUP, UMP, Greens and PPP.



review was to include the opinions of men and women living in rural communities and to validate initial findings with stakeholders during data collection.

Field visits were made to Tanna and Santo to review program content and Vois Blong Yumi impact on the Santo Studio 5 North and CREST Community Radio stations; to meet with community leaders, NGOs and Provincial Government personnel. The opportunity was taken during meetings relating to the VCPP to enquire about radio listenership and opinions of Radio Vanuatu. The reviewer sat in on a radio talkback session.

Analysis focused on improvements in services, community connections, social inclusion, informed and active citizens and more effective, accountable and transparent government taking into consideration different geographic and social contexts. Where appropriate, results were triangulated to ensure their validity, and finally validated with stakeholders in a workshop where the draft MTR results were fed back and discussed. A monitoring and evaluation plan including key evaluation principles, questions and analytical tools was discussed via teleconference with the Vanuatu Cluster Evaluation Reference Group and other key partners (see Appendix C for the M&E plan and Appendix D for those participating in the evaluation).

## **6.0 Review findings**

### **6.1 Overview**

Overall, the VBY program has been successful in restoring credibility, legitimacy and regular listeners to Radio Vanuatu. Technically, the Radio Vanuatu signal now reaches almost 100 per cent of the country providing rural people who in the past could not receive a radio signal with access to news and current affairs. Between 2008 and 2010 the proportion of radio listeners who said they preferred to listen to Radio Vanuatu increased from 39 per cent of listeners to 68 per cent<sup>8</sup> indicative of improved coverage, quality and breadth of programming. Regular on-the-job training and mentoring for news and program staff, the establishment of new program formats, training for technical staff and improved staff conditions have had a positive impact on the quality of the programs and on staff morale.

Phase 3 has built on earlier successes with middle management, coverage and programming and has already helped strengthen and improve knowledge of good leadership and governance among staff. This Phase has provided access to information and an opportunity for those in rural villages and urban communities across the country to express their opinions on development-related issues. Dialogue between citizens and provincial and national government has improved through more inclusive and relevant radio programming, including talkback.

During Phase 3 a Strategic Plan was developed, approved and partly implemented; a second Organisational Climate Survey was conducted in April 2011 and a Transmission Mapping Survey and the second Audience Research Survey have been completed. VBTC now uses modern IT and transmission equipment. Program, news and announcing staff are familiar with computerised programming and editing, including the use of AudioVAULT.

Training for national and provincial-based news reporters and programmers has resulted in greater provincial news coverage and the opportunity for provincial and national governments, NGOs and community groups to contribute programs for national transmission. News at the time of elections can now be broadcast without fear or favour – in the past there was political interference and news staff and announcers were threatened and sometimes attacked.

---

<sup>8</sup> 'National Survey of Media Usage', VBTC, 2010:15

Government ministries and provincial government personnel have been given media training and encouraged to use Radio Vanuatu to advise citizens of government activities and issues. This proved useful during November 2011 Sanma provincial elections. Prior to the elections the Sanma Provincial Government broadcast a number of programmes informing people about the elections, what to do and what their roles and rights were. In the past there had been episodes of violence around elections with the Provincial Government office besieged by people wanting information. This year, the elections occurred without incident and the Assistant Secretary, Santo Provincial Council<sup>9</sup> reported very few election enquiries at the office.

During Phase 3 Radio Vanuatu has consolidated its 'image' through outside live broadcasts at special events including the recent Fes'Napuan Cultural Music Festival, November 12-13, 2011, where live interviews and live music broadcasts created considerable interest and audiences. Live coverage was provided of the Sanma elections in November and for the last two years Radio Vanuatu has organised and provided live outside broadcasts of visiting musicians and a Christmas Festival on the waterfront. These events have provided the opportunity for good public relations and a new way for marketing and 'branding' Radio Vanuatu. Radio Vanuatu banners, T shirts and hats support the outside broadcasts. Improvements in marketing however have done little to improve the VBTC financial situation. Its debt is reported to exceed income by around 14 per cent annually. In 2011 the reported loss was VT34.6 million.<sup>10</sup> There appears to be little senior management interest in addressing the issue and VBTC continues to pay a late payment surcharge on electricity and other accounts.

Although on-going mentoring and training in governance and good management principles have been provided for senior management and the VBTC Executive Board, this has had little effect on leadership particularly in human resource and fiscal management. It has however been effective at middle management level. VBTC is hampered in fulfilling its potential by lack of political will to ensure more effective management of the country's major communication provider.

Improvements have been achieved in a very volatile political environment which has not been conducive to effective decision making, financial regularity or enforcing regulations. A table including achievements against planned activities and objectives for Phase 3 is included in Appendix F.

## 6.2 Relevance

Engaging with and improving the quality and coverage of the country's national broadcaster is highly relevant to both the Australian and Vanuatu Governments. Radio Vanuatu is now contributing to the priorities outlined in the Australia-Vanuatu Partnership for Development<sup>11</sup> by providing information that supports improvements in health, education, agriculture, gender equality, good governance and disaster preparedness. It also supports three of the four key areas outlined in the Partnership. The vision upon which the Program is based is also that of the GOV Priorities and Action Agenda 2006-2015 – an "Educated, Healthy and Wealthy Vanuatu".<sup>12</sup> It supports dialogue between national and provincial governments and ni-Vanuatu citizens and the two provincial stations provide a community voice. The program is aligned to the VBTC Reform Program and the VBTC Strategic Plan incorporates activities from those documents.

---

<sup>9</sup> Pers. Comm. Romeo Vunari, Assistant Secretary, Santo Provincial Council, Luganville

<sup>10</sup> 'Bildim Fiutja Blong Yumi' VBTC Strategic Plan 2010-2015, p.7

<sup>11</sup> See 'Partnership for Development between the Government of Australia and the Government of Vanuatu' 2009,

<sup>12</sup> See 'Priorities and Action Agenda 2006-2015 – An Educated, Healthy and Wealthy Vanuatu', Department of Economic and Sector Planning, Ministry of Finance and Economic Management, GOV.

The program components and core objectives remain relevant but in any future phase the focus of activities would need to be on ensuring reliable and high quality transmission, building a stronger connection to rural communities and improving the development focus of programs.

It is noted that none of the development agreements between the Australian and Vanuatu Governments between 2005 and 2009, nor the recent *Independent Review of Australian Aid*, 2011 or the Government response to it, identify the role of broadcasting as an important development infrastructure. Telecommunications are included in the discussion on infrastructure but pertain solely to the internet and mobile telephony.<sup>13</sup> It is therefore not surprising that the GOV has not paid much attention to VBTC.

### **6.3 Analysis and learning**

The situational analysis for the original design is thorough, appropriate and frank and was instrumental in shaping the design. The program is based on a rolling design with annual plans reflecting an analysis of how well activities were achieved and what the supporting or constraining factors were. This learning was then fed into the subsequent plan and where necessary new approaches were taken to overcome difficulties or changing external environments. In this way, the program is both re-active and pro-active. Important learnings from the program have been the value of partnerships and trust, in particular those between the ABC advisers and the middle managers; the importance of a longer-term approach and the need for adaptability to enable negotiation of rapid political change. An analysis of the life of the program exemplifies the difficulty of achieving even small improvements in high level governance in a situation of weak government and political instability. Monitoring and evaluation have provided an important aspect of ABC management and this feeds into analysis and learning.

A National Survey of Media Usage was conducted in 2007 and again in 2010 to measure changes in transmission coverage and listenership of Radio Vanuatu. The key findings were a large increase in coverage, a very much larger audience and an increase in listener preference for Radio Vanuatu. It also found that reception was poor in Santo and Tanna<sup>14</sup> and that men are more regular listeners than women and young people more regular listeners than those over 35 years. Subsequent activities were planned to address these situations.

An Organisational Climate Survey conducted in 2007 was repeated in 2011. It measured staff opinions of VBTC progress, management, ethical leadership, decision making, staff welfare, the work environment, and internal communication. The recent survey found widespread staff disappointment that the hard work of the ABC Team Leader and VBTC staff had not resulted in accountability for continued abuse of privilege; nor had it resulted in policies and procedures being followed; or important decisions being made in a timely fashion. 'The review found that there is still no clear sense of who is in charge – the Board or the GM'. Communication between the Board and the staff remains minimal.<sup>15</sup>

Staff suggestions for priorities that needed to be addressed included: a competent administrator who could provide leadership; more training for the team leaders to upgrade their qualifications

---

<sup>13</sup> See 'Partnership for Development between the Government of Australia and the Government of Vanuatu', 2009; 'Australia-Vanuatu Joint Development Cooperation Strategy 2005-2010'; Government of the Republic of Vanuatu, 'Priorities and Action Agenda 2006-2015' and *An Effective Aid Program for Australia*, p35.

<sup>14</sup> National Survey of Media Usage 2010, Vois Blong Yumi Project, VBTC page 7.

<sup>15</sup> 'Tingting Blong Yumi long Vanuatu Broadcasting Corporation', Organisational Climate Survey, April 2011, VBTC, pp6-7.

and skills; succession planning; human resource development; improving morale, resolving long standing unpaid leave and work conditions; sound financial management and an end to resource abuse. In addition they suggested the need for a separately funded technical operation to ensure that new transmission and production equipment is maintained and serviced.<sup>16</sup>

Issues over which the VBY program has control are being addressed in the Annual Plan July 2011 to June 2012. These are middle management and Radio Vanuatu news and program content; upgrading technical services and providing a greater voice for women, youth and rural people.

#### **6.4 Effectiveness**

The objectives are appropriate, clearly articulated and measurable and progress towards them is regularly monitored. The levels of progress vary. Some aspects of components one and four have been achieved while others have not been amenable to improvement and are unlikely to change. Various ways of dealing with these difficulties have been tried with little success. The problem areas and lack of achievement are dealt with in the next section. The objectives remain appropriate.

The VBY design incorporates increased involvement of civil society in Radio Vanuatu news and programs. This has been more successful than anticipated and is evident in an analysis of talkback programs and in the number of programmes such as Vois Blong Yut and provincial news and current affairs which are either produced by, or incorporate, civil society organisations and citizens.

The program supports the fundamental purpose of Australian aid and four of its five strategic goals. These are 'saving lives, promoting opportunities for all, effective governance and humanitarian and disaster responses'<sup>17</sup> and more specifically, the objective of 'improving governance in developing countries to deliver services, improve security, and enhance justice and human rights for poor people'<sup>18</sup>

VBY has strong links to the *Review of Aid Effectiveness* and the AusAID response to it in that its goal and components seek to build the nation and develop program content that service people's needs. Radio Vanuatu now regularly broadcasts development-related information in the form of news, current affairs, talk back and drama that encourage better health, education for children, good governance, child protection and gender equality. Radio Vanuatu also fulfils a critical broadcasting role for humanitarian and disaster response. For example, it provided important information and updates during the various 2011 tsunamis.

ABC management of the program has been effective in terms of planning, implementation and monitoring and evaluation. It has resulted in improved coverage, better quality and diversity of programming, a new and effective middle management and inclusion of a provincial voice.

#### **6.5 Efficiency**

In a country where transport is expensive, difficult and unreliable and communication slow, VBY has been an effective use of AusAID funds. The program has achieved a very efficient means of development communication and an effective way of establishing dialogue with a large proportion of the population. Radio Vanuatu is now capable of linking the provinces and national

---

<sup>16</sup> Loc.cit.

<sup>17</sup> *An effective aid program for Australia : Making a real difference-Delivering real results*, Commonwealth of Australia 2011 p.4

<sup>18</sup> Loc.cit pp.36 and 38

centre through provincial news links and programs based on provincial issues. Through links with Radio Vanuatu Studio 5 Not in Santo can broadcast nationally programs from Santo-based NGOs and Provincial Government. CREST FM Community Radio on Tanna also contributes Tafea provincial news to the national newscasts and is now waiting for a telephone link with VBTC so this can be done live.

The VBY inputs and modes of delivery have been, and remain, appropriate to meeting the objectives with the exception of improving governance and senior management of VBTC. The review found that the ABC management of the program had been efficient and that every effort had been made to address the areas where progress was not being made. AusAID has a good relationship with the ABC and the only minor complaint is that reports are regularly three months late.

The risks to the program have been managed as effectively as possible given the unstable political environment and its influence on the Board and senior management.<sup>19</sup> It is noted that the risks that relate to governance, management and financial viability as outlined in the Phase 3 Annual Plans downplay the likelihood, impact and level of risk. This is a major risk with major impacts.

## **6.6 Monitoring and evaluation**

The program design was based on detailed research into the Vanuatu social political economic and geographic context and makes detailed provision for monitoring and evaluation. The monitoring and evaluation framework is appropriate and throughout the program the ABC has continued to provide thorough and regular monitoring and evaluation. Independent reviews were conducted early and late 2009. The Program Management Committee meets twice a year and informal meetings are held regularly between AusAID and the VBY Team Leader. There have been regular and detailed progress reports throughout.

## **6.7 Sustainability**

The design identifies intended sustainable benefits of the program and strategies for, and constraints against, achieving them. While the political context was a known risk and strategies for risk management seemed appropriate, the impact of very high levels of political instability over the last three years have been difficult to manage. Any further phase of the program would need to give greater consideration to addressing political instability and political interference.

The management and operational structure of the program is appropriate. While the very strong support provided by the ABC and the Team Leader in particular has had a noticeably positive impact on coverage and program quality and, at lower levels, on management and staff morale, this raises questions of sustainability given the staff's very heavy reliance on him.

The improved quality and reach of Radio Vanuatu are not sustainable at their current level without ensuring that staff skills and motivation are retained, and reliable and high quality transmission can be assured. This will require full or part-time international technical assistance together with further in-depth technical training for local engineers, and continued encouragement and upgrading of skills for news reporters, announcers and commercial staff. It will also require that VBTC becomes more financially sustainable. This will be difficult given its very large debt, the small size of the Vanuatu commercial sector and the growing competition for advertising revenue from private commercial stations.

---

<sup>19</sup> VBY Annual Plan, Phase 3, July 1,2010-June 30,2011, p.9



Financially, the VBTC is not sustainable and under current management is likely to continue to carry a very high level of debt. Although officially it is a Government Business Enterprise and as such is expected to be self supporting, it relies on a VT45 million grant from government and income from commercial advertising. It should receive income from broadcasting licenses but does not enforce collection of this. As mentioned earlier it has a debt of around VT100 million and currently operates at a loss of around VT35 million a year.<sup>20</sup> It is the opinion of the former VBY Team Leader and a Public Financial Management Coordinator<sup>21</sup> that VBTC could never become financially viable.

Continued ABC presence would provide on-going support and training, and also help maintain a reasonable level of staff morale.

Sustainability could be supported to some extent by a corps of well trained media professionals in Vanuatu and by the establishment of small, inexpensive, provincial radio stations with two or three part-time staff and links to Radio Vanuatu. This could diffuse the difficulties with senior management and provide a provincial pool of trained journalists and broadcasters.

## **6.8 Gender equality and cross cutting issues**

The program design incorporates gender issues. While there have been no specific gender-related activities included in Annual Plans as recommended in the Independent Review of December 2009, the Annual Plan for July 2010-June 2011 includes increasing the participation of women, youth and rural audiences. Recognition of the need for gender equality has improved during Phase 3 and is being practiced within Radio Vanuatu. Three of the five middle managers are female and weekly programs cover gender, youth, HIV/AIDS and disability issues. Responsibility for producing the weekly youth program, Vois Blong Yut, is rotated between five different youth organisations. Provincial women's groups, including Sanma Crisis Centre and the WSB Youth Reproductive Health Clinic in Luganville, Santo provide weekly programs covering issues for women, young people and on preventing violence against women. They are played locally and relayed to Radio Vanuatu, Vila. Talkback sessions regularly deal with gender issues, including women in business, women in leadership and attract a higher proportion of women callers than usual.

Given the political climate, these are considerable achievements that now need to be embedded and upgraded by further training and good middle management support. This is particularly the case in news reporting and increased media support for provincial and NGO partners. Talkback programs will be further improved with additional knowledge of development issues and training in moderating talkback discussion to achieve a wider range of opinions including those of women and young people.

## **7.0 Program achievements and key issues, by component**

This section considers the achievements of the program since the beginning of Phase 3 with a particular focus on the problem areas identified by the Independent Evaluation Report of December 2009

### **7.1 Component 1: Organisational development**

**Objective:** *To improve governance, management and operations of the VBTC.*

**2009 Review:** The 2009 evaluation found that while good progress had been made on VBTC's reform plans, a number of major organisational issues still needed to be addressed including:

---

<sup>20</sup> 'Bildim Fiutja Blong Yumi', VBTC's Strategic Plan 2010-2015, p7

<sup>21</sup> Pers.Comm. Francis Hermann, PACMAS and Michael Francino, Public Financial Management Coordinator

*None of us had previous management or leadership experience or training but we worked closely with the VBY Team Leader and learned about dealing with staff, planning and making decisions, and how to manage the department. This was very useful and I am using these skills. I also learned about having a program philosophy to cover the areas we should work in - like education, health, agriculture, governance, shipping news – areas that affect people.*

*The training was really helpful, but we had only two and then no more. We need more training to help us build on our experience and do better programs*

Elizabeth Graham, Team Leader,  
Radio Vanuatu Programming,  
November 16, 2011.

poor financial management, inadequate revenues and outstanding debt; inadequacies in the Broadcasting Act and the need to build senior management capacity.

**2011 Review:** This review found that while many of the planned activities and outputs for this component have been achieved, the component objective has been only partially met.

**Activities and outputs completed:**

- An extensive Leadership Development Program was provided for the GM, Board and the middle management team. It outlined management roles and responsibilities at different levels, ethical principles of leadership, planning and monitoring activities and procedures and responsibilities for financial accountability and for human resource management including discipline. This program ceased in April 2011 due to instability in Board membership.
- With nine months support from a Marketing Adviser, the Commercial Team Leader has developed a marketing strategy and put this into practice. A small sales team working on commission has been employed and has been successful in getting sponsorship for sports and

outside broadcast entertainment events including *Fes’Napuan* - a weekend music and culture festival in early November and the visit of a South African Reggae Band.

- It remains difficult to attract commercial contracts as there is a limited business clientele willing to pay for advertising<sup>22</sup> and there are now other private, urban, commercial stations who have the attraction of having programs with a high content of music.
- A Partnership Agreement which covers all aspects of VBTC human resources policies and procedures has been developed to legally cover processes for recruitment, pay and allowances, performance management and disciplinary procedures. The policies have been agreed to by staff, the Labour Commissioner and were agreed to by the Staff Union in August, 2011 and given to the GM for signature. Three months later it still had not been signed off by the GM. The GM had agreed to sign it once he received it from the Corporate Manager.
- Component achievements also include the establishment of five middle management roles and intensive on-the-job training in management and leadership.<sup>23</sup> The Team Leaders are considered the backbone of Radio Vanuatu (see box).
- The middle management team were included in a Leadership Development Program.

<sup>22</sup> According to the Radio Vanuatu commercial sales people, the increase in Asian-owned businesses in the two main urban centres, has made advertising sales more difficult as they do not buy advertising.

<sup>23</sup> Joe Harry, Corporate Services, Elizabeth Graham, Programmes; Olivia Williams, News; Warren Melanie, Technical Services; Ellencon Taurakoto, Commercial Services.



*Now we know what the role of the Board is and the role of the GM and what our role is. Now we know where the boundaries are, so we know when the Board wants to interfere we just tell them “this is what I can do and this is what I am supposed to do”. This is a big change we have been able to put in place with the help from VBY. So now we have procedures to deal with complaints from outside – politicians. We don’t get so many complaints as in the past (Pers. Comm. Olivia Williams, Team Leader, News, November 16, 2011)*

The refurbishment of the studios and the Radio Vanuatu buildings has been largely completed.

**Progress with problem areas:**

- While there was positive feedback and a unanimous request for continuing the Leadership Development Training these skills have not been put into practice by senior management. There is scepticism about what can be achieved in circumstances which include changing governments, changing political affiliations, changing Board members and the accompanying lack of political will to enforce necessary changes.
- A human resources staff manual (Partnership Agreement), which incorporates all VBTC human resource policies and performance management, was developed at the beginning of Phase 3 and was finally agreed by all parties, with the exception of senior management. At the time of this review it had not been signed by the GM and therefore cannot be implemented. The VBY's offer to make available a short-term HR expert to guide VBTC through its implementation has not been taken up.
- As planned, a review of broadcasting legislation (Broadcasting and Television Act No.3) is being undertaken by a specialist in broadcast regulatory law but necessary input from VBTC management has not been forthcoming.
- VBTC's regulatory functions are not being enforced and private broadcasters ignore guidelines and refuse to pay licence fees. The approval of a commercial TV licence has been made contrary to the Broadcast Licensing Advisory Committee recommendations. There appears to be limited political will to change the situation.
- The middle managers' contracts have remained unsigned after nearly two years – a situation which comes increasingly unsettling for the staff concerned.
- The volatile political situation over the last 15 months and frequent changes in government and accompanying changes in the Executive Board and Board Chairman, together with changes in who has ultimate responsibility for VBTC decision-making have led to on-going uncertainty about who is the final VBTC authority. The lack of any staff disciplinary action - usually the responsibility of top management - continues to exacerbate poor staff morale and lack of job satisfaction.
- The VBTC still has a VT100 million debt and its outgoings continue to be larger than its income although it is reported that commercial marketing has had some success with sponsorship and advertising. It remains difficult to get accurate information on the actual income.
- Financial accountability remains a difficult area. Financial advisers provided by VBY have had difficulty accessing adequate financial records and requests for a government

or independent audit of VBTC have to date had little effect. There has been an on-going difficulty in finding reliable financial assistance. In part the problem may be exacerbated by the somewhat uncertain status of the VBTC. Officially it is a Government Business Enterprise but is not run as such. This situation is still unclear and may be resolved by the review of the Broadcasting Act.

It is widely felt among media and program management that unless there is strong political will from government it is doubtful if any sustainable progress can be achieved in improving governance, financial accountability and management of VBTC.

The delays in signing and implementing agreed activities and lack of enforcing regulation and oversight both hinder the achievement of program goals and lead to lack of staff morale throughout the organisation. In the longer term these difficulties are likely to negate the impressive improvements made and will have a negative impact on the standing of the country's national broadcaster and in turn on the people of Vanuatu.

## **7.2 Component 2: Access**

**Objective:** *To extend the reach of Radio Vanuatu and improve the quality of reception.*

**2009 Review:** Steady progress had been made with 100 per cent Radio Vanuatu coverage with further work needed to ensure the sustainability of the transmission network.

**2011 Review:** Four of the five outputs have been achieved. Technically there have been great improvements in Radio Vanuatu coverage and transmission quality with the installation of new equipment and upgrading and standardising old equipment. This has been time consuming as different types of equipment provided in the past by a number of different donors including NZAID, JICA and China has had to be standardised.

### **Activities and Outputs completed**

- A second Transmission Mapping Survey was completed. It shows 2011 transmission coverage, the strength and quality of signal and identifies outstanding transmission issues that needed to be dealt with.
- Radio Vanuatu's short wave transmitters have been restored and modified. Radio Vanuatu's on air and production studio facilities have been replaced; up to date studio and IT equipment including AudioVAULT have been installed, and training in their use provided.
- A skills audit of VBTC's technical department has been completed and some on-the-job technical training provided. The technical department has been re-equipped and standby generators provided to installations on Efate and Santo.
- A new PABX system has been installed and is operating well.
- A Technical Master Plan and a Technical Maintenance Plan have been completed.

### **Progress with problem areas:**

- A Technical Maintenance Plan which spells out the maintenance schedule was completed early in Phase 3 but has been only partly implemented. Although annual capital expenditure was put aside for maintenance these funds have not been forthcoming. Lack of regular maintenance and a serious shortage of skills are resulting in regular breaks in transmission. In the words of the former VBY Team Leader:

*The risk remains high that the new technical broadcasting facilities installed or about to be installed will be severely compromised if the current situation continues. There needs to be a serious effort by senior management to make budgetary provisions for maintenance and upgrades. Without reliable transmission and a quality signal all other achievements of VBY have little value (Pers. Comm. Francis Herman, December 6, 2011).*

- A Technical Adviser Broadcast Engineer will be appointed during Phase 3.
- Upgrading VBTC's Studio 5 Not (North) in Luganville has been on hold for three years pending evidence of transfer of land to VBTC. AusAID had been formally requested to fund the relocation and necessary renovations of the radio station which is currently housed in little more than two cupboards. The proposed new building would house VBTC's radio and television for northern Vanuatu. It was agreed that VBY would facilitate the necessary fit-out and a budget of \$A75,000 was allowed for this. Early 2011 the VBTC Board decided to acquire a block of land in Luganville and build an income-generating complex which would also house Studio 5 Not. AusAID does not yet have evidence of the transfer of land to VBTC. Meanwhile, the equipment purchased for Studio 5 Not three years ago remains in boxes in Port Vila. Some reported irregularity with the tender for the new building would suggest the funding allocated would be better spent elsewhere.

#### **Example of rural audiences:**

*Now we can all listen to Radio Vanuatu. We like what they talk about. It is good for social studies and we have a bigger view – we hear what is happening around the country and in the government. It is helpful. Sometimes we hear about new things to do in agriculture and about health. We'd like to be in talkback but we are behind the mountain – no (phone) signal.*

Dicki Lehi, Principal, Maria Lehi, Social Science Teacher, and Elsie Palma, English Teacher, Navele Secondary School, Big Bay Bush, Santo

### **7.3 Component 3: Voice and content**

**Objective:** *To develop program content that services people's needs*

**2009 Review:** Good progress was made in program content and reach with a special note on the growing interest and popularity of talkback radio. A challenge was to attract more female callers and more people from rural areas, particularly small and remote islands. There needs to be more content produced from rural areas and provinces.

**2011 Review:** The outputs and objective planned for Phase 3 have been largely met. The program is varied and interesting and has a high level of input from the provinces, civil society organisations and individuals and growing input from women and young people. There is an increase in input from small and remote islands with the regular input from the islands of Torba and Ambrym.

#### **Achievements and outputs completed**

- The second Audience Research Survey was completed in Phase 3. It showed an impressive increase in the Radio Vanuatu audience. It also showed that the largest audience was young people and that men were much more likely to be listeners than women.
- 50 provincial journalists, program makers and provincial civil society and government personnel were trained in basic reporting and production skills. This will require follow-up training to reinforce skills.

- The planned *Vois Blong Provins* program has begun with a weekly half hour session with each of the six provinces taking it in turn. Programs include provincial news, interviews and public commentary.
- The popular talkback programs have been increased from one to three a day – morning, lunchtime and evening. Training in moderating talkback sessions has been provided to program and announcing staff but further training and a better understanding of key development issues are needed to make this fully effective.
- In the week November 21-25 the topics covered in talkback included health, women in business, the business prospects of growing sandalwood, the Tobacco Control Act, business and finance, domestic violence and marine resources. The average number of callers for each talkback session in November was 21. Most callers were men although efforts have been made to encourage more participation from women. Talkback and opportunities for dialogue have been made possible by the recent widespread availability of inexpensive mobile phones.
- On-going training is being provided to improve the news, current affairs and sports content.
- A second Content Analysis was conducted in March 2011 to measure audience needs and identify areas that needed further attention. Significant progress was noted but it suggested increased airtime to women, youth, sports, rural affairs and music. The daily program schedules for Radio Vanuatu and for Studio 5 Not indicate that there is now greater airtime given to women, youth and rural affairs.
- The improvements in Radio Vanuatu programming and news reporting are widely recognised. Radio Vanuatu now offers a varied, interesting and informative program that incorporates national and provincial news, programs on agriculture, health, sports, current affairs, women's and young people's activities and good governance and before and during elections information on electoral rights. Through three talkback programs daily and the daily 'Aelan Call' listeners from many parts of the country can participate in live discussions on current and sometimes controversial issues.
- The review found that people in rural areas who previously had no coverage enjoyed listening to Radio Vanuatu, especially to talkback and news. For example, during a review visit to a fairly remote and mountainous area of Santo the staff and students of a secondary boarding school said they turned on the electricity generator so they could all listen to Radio Vanuatu's evening program. They especially liked the news, the community programs and talkback (see box above).

**Example of citizens' voice:**

The reviewer participated in a radio talkback session on November 25. The topic of discussion was the service provided by Radio Vanuatu. Two announcers provided a brief overview and posed a set of five questions. There were 22 callers, the majority of whom were from Vila or surrounding areas, four were from the island of Malekula, three from Santo and two from Ambrym. Three were women. Overall, the opinions were very positive. Four suggested more devotional programs.

**Example of ‘development’ program content:**

*Programs are more engaging than in the past – they debate relevant issues – women in business, children’s issues, governance issues and youth unemployment. Even the provincial people are good now – they are bringing out issues like gender. Radio audiences now feel that Radio Vanuatu is relevant for them.*

Dorosdae Kenneth,  
Department of Women’s  
Affairs, November 17, 2011

- As the program schedules indicates there is a daily news link from Radio 5 Not to Radio Vanuatu. Radio Vanuatu also broadcasts programs from Santo-based NGOs and provincial government. CREST Community Radio on the Island of Tanna contributes Tafea provincial news and is now waiting for a telephone link with VBTC so their links to Radio Vanuatu can be transmitted live.
- The review found an increased relationship between VBTC, civil society and national and provincial governments. Vila-based and provincial civil society organisations now provide programs for national broadcast on a regular basis. The contributing organisations include Save the Children, Wan Smol Bag Theatre (WSB), the Cultural Centre, the Vanuatu Women’s Centre, the Young People’s Project, the

Sanma Crisis Centre, the WSB Youth Health Centre, Santo and the Vanuatu Agricultural College, Santo.

- A Program Bank has been established as a repository for development-related documentaries and current affairs for use where appropriate. The aim of the initiative is to provide a greater community voice to Radio Vanuatu. VBY offers civil society organisations and community groups training in interviewing and recording techniques, provision of a small MP3 recorder and instruction how to use it. A small grant covers travel and other expenses incurred while collecting material. In February, 2011, applications from eight different organisations were approved including two from the islands of Ambrym and the very remote northern island of Torba. Three of the approved applications were from women’s groups.<sup>24</sup> Continued effort will be made to extend the number of provincial contributors.
- A weekly youth program, Vois Blong Yut, has been introduced with five different organisations taking it in turns to provide content.<sup>25</sup> On Thursdays there is a one hour women’s program. News is broadcast every hour – alternating between Bislama, English and French.
- Much has been achieved but news and program staff now need greater insight and depth to their interviewing, reporting and talkback sessions. In general, the media in Vanuatu needs an in-depth understanding of key development issues in relation to health, education, women’s and youth development.

**Progress with problem areas:**

- Good progress is being made on addressing an increased contribution from women, youth and rural people.

<sup>24</sup> These included the Vanuatu Young Peoples’ Project, the Vanuatu Disabled People’s Association, Ekoftau Bible Studies Association, North Ambrym Women, Edgar Howard in Torba Province, Vanuatu National Council of Women and the Vanuatu Women’s Centre.

<sup>25</sup> These include the Youth program at Wan Smol Bag Theatre, The Youth Desk at the Vanuatu Christian Council, the Department of Youth Affairs, and the Youth program at the Cultural Centre.



## 7.4 Component 4: Outreach

**Objective:** *To support the development of a free and fair media via support to other stakeholders*

**2009 Review:** Progress has been slow and while the Prime Minister's Office has directed that government departments use VBTC, more work is needed to ensure this occurs. There has been little success with providing assistance to Media Association of Vanuatu (MAV).

**2011 Review:** There has been some progress on this component during Phase 3. The two outputs relate to 1) GOV and NGOs receiving advice on using the media effectively and 2) exploring options to increase participation of women, youth and rural audiences in media. The output relating to supporting capacity building of the MAV was not included in the annual plan July 2011-June 2012.

### **Achievements and outputs completed**

- In response to a request from the Prime Minister's Office VBY organised a series of workshops for senior government officials on using the media to communicate important government information to citizens. Further workshops are planned for early 2012. To date there has been little increase in national government use of Radio Vanuatu as they are expected to enter into a contract with VBTC and pay for airtime. However, two provincial governments are now involved in using the media regularly. The Sanma Provincial Government has a media officer in place and prior to and during the November provincial elections made good use of radio. The officer was appreciative of the training and anxious to 'provide a voice for people in the rural areas who have different problems from those in the town'.<sup>26</sup> The Tafea Provincial Government is also using the community station, CREST, to broadcast provincial information locally and nationally and has the support of the Provincial Secretary General. In both cases there is a small radio station in the main provincial town.
- The planned output to increase the participation of women, youth and rural audiences is being met. As shown in component 3 above, there has been progress in including the participation and interests of women, youth and rural audiences. Issues of gender and violence against women and children have been the focus of some of the programme bank materials and have attracted considerable interest and discussion in talkback sessions. More work will need to be done to encourage more women and young people to participate in talkback. The next Audience Survey, planned for 2012, will address this issue.

### **Progress with problem area:**

- No progress has been made with planned support to improve the skills of media professionals through the Media Association of Vanuatu (MAV). This has been stalled for three years due to internal problems within MAV leadership.

### **Example of improved programs:**

*There have been huge improvements since VBY – its now very interesting. The programs are developing so well – we didn't have anything like this in the past. Talkback is having a huge impact on Santo. People, even from the bush now have mobile phones and phone into the studio with news. We have our own local news and news from Vila for 3 minutes every hour. We link to Radio Vanuatu through a telephone line. We have had good training – in news and programming but not yet in marketing.*

James Moli, Manager, Studio 5 Not, Luganville.

<sup>26</sup> Kensley Micah suggested that further training was needed to upgrade the skills of local reporters and more awareness was needed of the role of the media in supporting social and economic development.

The key challenges outlined in the 2009 evaluation remain the same with the exception of number 4 where an in-country Commercial Marketing Adviser was in place for nine months. The challenges outlined in 2009 were:

1. Progress in the governance of VBTC is directly linked to the government at the time. Changes in government can result in a new agenda for VBTC.
2. The historical debt impacts on financial decisions made on a daily basis. The debt needs to be addressed.
3. The lack of clarity on financial issues and the difficulty in appointing and retaining a reliable Financial Controller is holding back progress.
4. If local expertise in sales and marketing is unavailable alternative sources of funding must be explored. Lack of revenue places VBTC's future at risk.

## **8.0 Overall VBY relevance, linkages and opportunities**

### **8.1 On-going issues in relation to the achievements of activities and relevance of design**

As discussed above many of the activities and outputs have been completed in a timely fashion without them achieving the component objectives. This relates particularly to aspects of Component 1 and 4. The on-going difficulties relate to poor senior management, political patronage and lack of financial accountability. It appears to be impossible to overcome these issues and any future design needs to work around these problems and focus on other priority needs that are amendable to improvement.

### **8.2 Stakeholder engagement and its impact on progress during Phase 3**

Support from Provincial Governments began during Phase 3 and needs to be encouraged. Sanma and Tafea Provincial Governments are using the media and are aware of its power. The Assistant Secretary of the Santo Provincial Council expressed his satisfaction with the training provided by VBY and in particular the value of radio in preparations and run up to the Sanma Provincial Elections. He would like to see a provincial network in future and the capacity to do live broadcasts.

*'We can't do live outside broadcasts here. We would like live coverage of the Council sessions – we would like the first sitting to be broadcast live – this would educate people about how the Council works and support better performance and accountability within the Council'. (Pers.Comm. Romeo Vunari, Assistant Secretary, Santo Provincial Council, November 18, Luganville).*

The Tafea Provincial Council in Tanna provides accommodation for CREST FM, the Tanna-based provincial community radio station which relies on commercial advertising and is run by volunteers. The station covers 75 per cent of the population in Tanna and also part of Erromanga. Their daily program includes *kastom* stories, programmes on traditional life, food and customs and programs for women. The women's program is produced by a local school teacher. 'She talks about women's lives, society here, recipes for local food. Women's Corner is broadcast live once a week and repeated'. They also broadcast local church programs and programs from Wan Smolbag Theatre including *Famili blong Sara*, *Tok save long loa*, *Yangfala long tourism* and *Shirley the Nurse*.

*'We broadcast programs for parents about awareness of education and the importance of sending children to school... technically, CREST does not have a direct link with Radio Vanuatu but have to send their programs...the GM says it is too expensive for a link. A link would be easier. At the moment it takes time to upload the Vila broadcast (Pers.Comm. David Klein, Manager, CREST).*



The Tafea Provincial Secretary General<sup>27</sup>, reports that they are proud of their community station and hope that VBTC can put in a line to Tanna so they can take direct links and broadcast live. The economic life of the community station is in doubt as a licence has been granted to FM107, a private commercial station which is expected to start transmission early 2012.

The other three provincial news programs are provided by freelance journalists working on the outer islands. They have received VBY training and have been provided with MP3 recorders.

### **8.3 Program linkage with reform agendas including those for Government Business Enterprises**

The VBTC Strategic Plan 2010-2015 incorporates activities from the Board's Reform Program and current VBY plans are linked to this. In particular the program has attempted to bring about the key goals outlined in the strategic plan to: 'bring about necessary legislative framework to clarify the regulatory environment' and 'redefine the role of VBTC and operate a professional and accountable institution committed to the principles of good management, shared ownership, due process and transparency'.<sup>28</sup>

The program is also aligned with the Government's Business Enterprise agenda which aims for all GBE's including VBTC to be self funding and effective. Although efforts have been made by VBY to help achieve this, VBTC has a V100 million debt, its expenditure is larger than its income and the organisation does not adhere to proper corporate governance and does not use the government subsidy for capital expenses only as agreed.

The Asian Development Bank's review of GBEs originally planned for 2010 will be undertaken in 2012. In the view of the AusAID Governance for Growth Program's Public Financial Management Coordinator<sup>29</sup> the VBTC and some other Vanuatu GBEs are neither businesses nor enterprises. Those GBEs that were overtly commercial or struggling have either been sold or given up. In his opinion VBTC can never be a commercial business. 'It should be a fully funded government entity or at arms length from government with its board and management appointed independently of government. Legally it would need to be located under a government ministry'.<sup>30</sup>

The situation may be clarified with the completion of the review of the Broadcasting Act and the ADB's review of GBEs.

### **8.4 Conformity of VBY achievements to Australia's development partnership with GOV and VBY longer-term role in contributing to higher level objectives of the aid program**

VBY is fully aligned with Australia's development partnership with the GOV.<sup>31</sup>

The program is delivering agreed support that will strengthen VBTC's systems and processes and build capacity to effectively use them. It is supporting agreed approaches and partnership among media partners and donors and support for Vanuatu's policy on GBEs.

---

<sup>25</sup> Pers. Comm. Kathie Napuat, Secretary General, Tafea Provincial Council, Tanna, November 23

<sup>28</sup> VBTC 2010, 'Bildim Fiutja Blong Yumi', Vanuatu Broadcasting and Television Corporation Strategic Plan 2010-2015, pp. 4-7.

<sup>29</sup> Pers. Comm. Michael Francino, November 25

<sup>30</sup> Pers. Comm. Michael Francino. 'An example is the Reserve Bank of Vanuatu which is at arm's length from government. It has a strong Governor and the Board is independent of government and members have to be qualified or useful. Directors are employed for five years and while they behave well they remain'. In Francino's opinion it is inappropriate for a donor to be involved in a state owned enterprise.

<sup>31</sup> See 'Partnership for Development between the Government of Australia and the Government of Vanuatu', 2009, Attachment A: Partnership Priority Outcomes 1-4.

Through building the capacity of VBTC and the reach and quality of Radio Vanuatu it is directly supporting inclusion of those in rural areas, and on-going support for health, education, good governance and gender equity.

VBY has an important role to play in future in contributing to the higher level objectives of Australian aid as outlined in the recent *Independent Review of Aid Effectiveness*, 2011 and the Australian Government's response to it, *An Effective Aid Program for Australia*, 2011.

### **8.5 Appropriateness of the VBY management and monitoring arrangements given the program's size and significance**

The ABC's management and monitoring arrangements have been good throughout and are likely to remain so. The ABC's International Division have provided strong support and guidance.

In Phase 3, a full time Team Leader has been in-country; a commercial adviser for nine months in addition to two financial advisers who remained in country for a short time only. Short-term advisors have been provided for leadership training and it is planned to have an adviser to support human resources. Some assistance and training has been provided for the technical engineers and one engineer given training outside Vanuatu. This level of advice has been appropriate. Further training in programming, news and development would now be appropriate to upgrade skills further. There was a danger that the VBTC staff were too reliant on the support of the ABC Team Leader and that this could have a negative impact on the sustainability of the program.

The program has been closely monitored throughout. Monitoring has been regular and results fed back into program planning.

### **8.6 Opportunities for VBTC to be transferred to PACMAS and appropriate future support for VBTC and the media**

PACMAS, an AusAID-supported regional program that aims to upgrade media in the Pacific, officially opened its regional office in Port Vila in November 2011. The former Team Leader of VBY is the new Director. PACMAS will provide a range of services, in radio, television and the print media, including support for improving management structures and organisational systems, media leadership, governance issues, engineering training and support with transmission systems. It will also provide training in news collection, editing and presentation, and programming.

PACMAS offers a certificated training program for broadcast engineers, which consists a number of modules which can be undertaken on-the-job over an 18 month period. This would be of considerable value to VBTC. Those broadcasting organisation wishing to utilise PACMAS training need to send in a proposal to PACMAS. This is then assessed by the PACMAS Board of Directors and relevant decisions made.

While PACMAS provides opportunities for VBTC to further improve voice and access, it is unlikely that it would get the level of support it has had to date as it would need to share PACMAS support with other larger media organisations in the Pacific region.

There is a possibility that some of the senior management issues at VBTC could be addressed through PACMAS using a more regional approach where a number of senior broadcasting managers work together in a workshop situation where they are encouraged to discuss and

critique the management systems, structures and challenges in the organisations represented, and suggest approaches for improvement.

## **9.0 Other issues**

The review found increased linkages with a variety of civil society organisations. The churches, in particular their women's and youth groups, and the AusAID funded Vanuatu Churches Partnership Program are planning on being more involved in radio as a way of enhancing their social development and good governance and are interested in having media training.

The review found that among Radio Vanuatu staff and media personnel generally there was a lack of understanding of issues such as good governance, child protection, gender equality, and inclusion. Radio Vanuatu's importance as a major channel of information and discussion on key development issues would be strongly supported by a development desk or a development and gender focal point and by training for news and program staff in social, economic and political development.

Talkback sessions indicated a lack of clear understanding of the word gender. It is widely assumed to mean women. In part, this is a language problem as Bislama does not have adequate words for some of the development-related terms.

Changes in the ABC management staff in both Vanuatu and Australia has led to a lack of continuity and to some extent loss of corporate memory. A major change is now the replacement of the former VBY Team Leader. He was very popular and Radio Vanuatu staff relied heavily on his on-going support. He will remain in Vanuatu as the new Director, PACMAS, the AusAID supported regional media assistance program. It is likely that he will be asked to provide assistance and advice by Radio Vanuatu staff. Care will have to be taken in handling this situation as the PACMAS regional office is located in Port Vila with the opportunity of him being overwhelmed by Vanuatu issues.

This review indicates that it is unlikely that VBTC could ever be a financially viable 'business' given current management, government expectations, the large historical debt and a reduction of 50 per cent to government financial support in 2011.<sup>32</sup> The commercial sector is too small to support a commercially viable VBTC. This becomes even less likely with the granting of additional licences to private commercial broadcasting companies and a reluctance of many business owners to advertise. It suggests that if Radio Vanuatu is to remain and expand its role as a respected "Vois Blong Yumi" it is going to require either full government funding or on-going support from donors.

The nature of Vanuatu's political system will continue to threaten the stability of government, given that it is influenced and largely shaped by changing political allegiances. The political environment contributes to frequent changes in economic policy, government reforms, and appointments to senior management positions in government entities such as the VBTC. This environment will continue to be taken into account by the project team. (Annual Plan Phase 3 July 1, 2011-June 30, 2012).

## **10.0 Recommendations and options for the future**

Based on discussions with key stakeholders, observation and a review of the plans, reports and independent reviews this review recommends that:

---

<sup>32</sup> It is anticipated there will be a further 5 per cent reduction in 2012. See Project Management Committee Meeting minutes, August 29, 2011.

***Demonstration of organisational commitment to a high performing VBTC***

1. The VBTC implement the recommendations of the review of the Broadcasting Act and the GOV progress the ADB review of government business enterprises planned for 2010 but held over until 2012.
2. The VBTC sign the outstanding team leaders' contracts and the staff Partnership Agreement immediately and funds allocated for technical maintenance are provided as scheduled.

***Re-allocation of existing program budget to other areas***

3. AusAID re-allocate the Santo studio budget and equipment towards expanding and upgrading a provincial radio network with consideration given to installing a line between CREST FM, Tanna and Radio Vanuatu.
4. AusAID seriously consider continuing to fund VBTC as this could be construed as condoning mismanagement, poor governance and blatant disregard for AusAID-funded advice.

***Expanding Radio Vanuatu access, voice and content***

5. The ABC oversee training in social and economic development processes and good governance for program, news and talkback staff.
6. The ABC encourage further support to increasing access to the media by women, youth and rural audiences to ensure they have a more equal voice and the program continues to focus on those groups most frequently overlooked.
7. The ABC and VBTC continue current efforts to provide more reliable, high quality transmission and that AusAID organise a donor roundtable to ensure that further support to VBTC media, including provision of transmission equipment is harmonised and strategic.
8. The remaining life of the program focus on Radio Vanuatu.
9. As soon as possible the ABC develops a strategy and begins implementation to expand provincial radio networks to all provinces and to explore the suitability of suitcase radio stations. Implementation should begin prior to June 2012.
10. Follow-up discussions are held with PACMAS to identify ways that could support VBTC in future.

***Future options***

11. Any further funding be made conditional on actions to improve management performance. If there has been inadequate progress with implementing the Broadcasting Act, undertaking the ADB review and signing outstanding reports, agreements and team leaders contracts the program should end on June 30, 2012, If progress has been made consideration should be given for an extension to December 30, 2012 given the important role Radio Vanuatu will need to play in the October 30 elections.
12. It is suggested that support from PACMAS be explored, most particularly for certificated, on-the-job engineering training. PACMAS offers a wide range of training and support for programming, news and content and broadcasting leadership but VBTC would have to compete for places.
13. If there has been good progress by May 2012 on provincial radio support, it is recommended that consideration be given to a new program which focuses on a strong and viable provincial radio network.

Funding for the majority of recommendations is available from the ABC's unspent allocations.

## Appendix A: VBTC Executive Board Members and Management Committee Members

VBTC Executive Board Members	
Name	Organisation
Christian Bihi, Board Chairman	Peoples Progressive Party
Jeff Joel Patavanu	Nagriamel
Bruno Legnkone	National United Party
Joseph Zachary	Union of Moderate Parties
Richard Leo	Greens
Edmond Joseph	Vanuaku People's Party
Members of the TVBC Program Management Committee	
Fred Vurobaravu, General Manager	VBTC
Dominic Friguglietti, Director	ABC International
Anna Naupa, Program Manager	AusAID
Dorosdae Kenneth, Women's Representative	Department of Women's Affairs
Michael Taurakoto, Youth Representative	Wan Smolbag Theatre
Vivienne Obed, NGO Representative	VANGO
Jean Francois Metmetsan, Media Analyst	Prime Minister's Office

## Appendix B: Terms of Reference

### Cluster Evaluation of AusAID Vanuatu civil society and media programs September 2011

#### Purpose

1. Undertake individual Mid-Term Reviews for the Kastom Governance Partnership, Churches Program Partnership and the Vois Blong Yumi media strengthening program.
2. Contribute to a Drivers of Change<sup>33</sup> reflection on AusAID's bilateral programs in Vanuatu, particularly in relation to civil society<sup>34</sup>:
  - a. Articulating the rationale for ongoing engagement with civil society and media within the Vanuatu-Australia Partnership for Development.

#### Background

Australia currently directs approximately 10% of the Vanuatu bilateral program towards initiatives involving civil society. In addition, AusAID's regional programs provide funding across a range of civil society organisations. Australia's support to media, community partnerships, leadership and the land sector in Vanuatu do not feature as explicit priorities in the Partnership for Development, although, as the major donor in Vanuatu, these activities are an important element of a more conscious effort to engage with, and support, organisations outside government who play a critical role in development.

With three mid-term reviews due for three major civil society partnerships: the Kastom Governance Partnership (\$2.7 million from 2009-2013), the Churches Program Partnership (\$4 million from 2009-2012) and the Vois Blong Yumi media strengthening program (Phase 3 is \$2.3 million 2009-2012) in Vanuatu, a cluster evaluation will enable better sharing of lessons learned and cohesion between programs that engage civil society

AusAID's *Guidance on Monitoring and Evaluation for Civil Society Programs* requires that any analysis of civil society programs be situated within the broader context of change and power (including gender relations). In 2007, AusAID commissioned a Drivers of Change study of Vanuatu, the first of its kind for the agency. 'Drivers of Change' is a tool of political economy analysis devised by the UK development agency, DFID, to assist donors in assessing the prospects for and constraints on development in particular political systems. The 2007 report identified opportunities for AusAID to strategically support non-state actors to 'build demand for better governance' and strengthen their capacity to participate in political processes and engage in policy dialogue. The report also identified issues where coalitions for change are most likely to emerge, such as land, with strong interest across the political sphere and civil society. Since 2007, AusAID has established and expanded a number of partnerships with churches, chiefs and the media, and also works across government and civil society on a national land program.

The Office of Development Effectiveness's 2010 *Evaluation of AusAID's Engagement with Civil Society in Vanuatu* noted that while "AusAID's engagement with civil society is relevant to the social and political context of Vanuatu ... extending the reach of this engagement to other sectors and geography will be the next challenge for the program." Furthermore, "There is a need for AusAID in Vanuatu to articulate its strategy with civil society as a tool for guiding program decisions, measuring progress and communication across the whole aid program and among whole-of-government partners."

---

<sup>33</sup> In 2007, a Drivers of Change analysis of Vanuatu was conducted that assessed the prospects for and constraints on development within Vanuatu's social, economic, cultural and political systems (?). It is planned to undertake a follow-up Drivers of Change analysis in late 2011; information gained through these mid-term reviews will be considered as part of that analysis.

<sup>34</sup> In this context, civil society includes a range of players including community organisations, religious organisations, cultural governance structure, development NGOs and the media.



AusAID is now seeking a monitoring and evaluation expert to undertake three mid-term reviews of the Kastom Governance Partnership, Churches Program Partnership and the Vois Blong Yumi media strengthening program in Vanuatu. This cluster evaluation will be used to inform a broader Drivers of Change reflection of Australia's bilateral aid program and contribute to articulating a the rationale for ongoing engagement with civil society and media within the Vanuatu-Australia Partnership for Development.

### **Scope of Services**

The Consultant will:

1. Undertake individual Mid-Term Reviews for the Kastom Governance Partnership, Churches Program Partnership and the Vois Blong Yumi media strengthening program.
2. Contribute to a Drivers of Change reflection on AusAIDs bilateral programs in Vanuatu, particularly in relation to civil society:
  - a. Articulating the rationale for ongoing engagement with civil society and media within the Vanuatu-Australia Partnership for Development

The Consultant will be a monitoring and evaluation expert, preferably with strong experience in civil society evaluations, with the following demonstrated skills and experience:

- Monitoring and evaluation expertise;
- Relevant technical expertise, particularly regarding political analysis;
- Expertise in engagement with civil society
- Local knowledge;
- Consultative and participatory research methods;
- Gender equality analysis skills; and
- Appropriate analytical, research and report writing skills.

The Consultant will produce individual mid-term reviews of the three identified programs, which will include a summary of common themes emerging from the partnerships.

### **Detailed Discussion of Services**

The Consultant shall provide the following services:

- a) Undertake individual Mid-Term Reviews for the Kastom Governance Partnership, Churches Program Partnership and the Vois Blong Yumi media strengthening program addressing key questions identified in Annexes A-C of these terms of reference as well as the following program performance criteria:
  1. **Relevance**
    - i. Assess the extent to which the activity is aligned, is appropriate and contributes to the Vanuatu-Australia Partnership for Development;
    - ii. Determine if the core objective of each program is still relevant, and whether the components to achieve this objective are still appropriate?
  2. **Analysis and Learning**
    - i. Assess the extent to which the activity design incorporates relevant and appropriate situational analysis and lessons from past experience to formulate desired objectives and approach;
    - ii. Where action research methodology has been applied, assess the extent of implementation and adoption of key findings within the program beneficiaries.
  3. **Effectiveness**
    - i. Assess the extent to which the objectives have been clearly articulated, are measurable and whether they are likely to be met;
    - ii. Identify intended and unintended results of AusAID's engagement with civil society through each program;
    - iii. Identify how each program links – or fails to link - with Australia's response to the review of aid effectiveness (2010).



4. **Efficiency**
    - i. Assess the extent to which the activity partnerships provide value-for-money
    - ii. Assess whether inputs in terms of funds, staff and other resources are appropriate for the activity objectives and delivery modes
    - iii. Determine whether the risks to the activity progress and outcomes are appropriately managed by the design.
  5. **Monitoring and Evaluation**
    - i. Assess the extent to which the activity M&E framework is appropriate for collecting robust management information for implementation and decision-making, as well as evidence of effectiveness;
    - ii. Consider whether the program management and monitoring arrangements remain appropriate for a program of this size, and provide recommendations where appropriate.
  6. **Sustainability**
    - i. Assess the extent to which the activity design identifies intended sustainable benefits, strategies for and constraints to achieving them;
    - ii. Assess the appropriateness and effectiveness of the management and operational structure for each program;
    - iii. Identify emerging risks which may impact on the sustainability of program outcomes after the completion of the program.
  7. **Gender Equality**
    - i. Assess the extent to which the activity integrates gender-sensitive practice in objective setting, implementation and risk management arrangements;
    - ii. Assess the extent to which the activity will advance and improve gender equality, benefits, decision-making, women's rights and capacity development.
- b) **Contribute to a Drivers of Change reflection on AusAIDs bilateral programs in Vanuatu, particularly in relation to civil society<sup>35</sup>:**
1. Work with the Post-convened Drivers of Change team to share common themes emerging from the cluster evaluation of civil society in Vanuatu, to assist with articulating the rationale for ongoing engagement with civil society and media within the Vanuatu-Australia Partnership for Development

### **Monitoring Methodology**

In undertaking the above, the Consultant is required to:

- Review the key documents and prepare a plan for the cluster evaluation, including identifying field visits in collaboration with the AusAID Program Manager.
- Draw on any additional information considered appropriate to contribute to the report.
- Undertake 1 to 3 in-country visits to conduct consultations in Vanuatu in October/November 2011 with key stakeholders (identified in the annexes, or as identified as relevant by the Team).
- Travel to 1-2 outer provinces will also be required as part of the in-country consultations, and field visits will be identified through discussion with the AusAID Program Manager
- Present an Aide Memoire to AusAID on x date in Port Vila.
- Prepare draft individual mid-term reviews to be submitted electronically to AusAID by x date.
- Prepare final individual mid-term reviews to be submitted electronically to AusAID by x date.
- Mid-Term reviews should each include 2-3 case studies and a Theory of Change model to illustrate the impact of the programs.

### **Outputs**

---

The following Outputs are required:

- Output 1 – Aide Memoire in a structure agreed by AusAID on completion of each in-country mission as one signed hardcopy and one electronic copy in a format compatible with Microsoft Office 2003 (eg Word 2003);
- Output 2 – Individual mid-term reviews by x date as one signed hardcopy and one electronic copy in a format compatible with Microsoft Office 2003 (eg Word 2003).
- Output 3 – Executive Summary of main findings and recommendations across all mid-term reviews by x date as one signed hardcopy and one electronic copy in a format compatible with Microsoft Office 2003 (eg Word 2003).

Payments associated with Outputs will be on AusAID acceptance that the Output meets its requirements and is of a standard expected of a professional working in the sector.

### **Roles and Responsibilities**

The **Monitoring and Evaluation Consultant** has the prime responsibility to plan, prepare and produce all outputs. The Consultant will work closely with the AusAID Evaluation Manager, Evaluation Assistant and relevant Program Manager to plan for and conduct field consultations and meet the expectations of the assignment. The Consultant is expected to manage the participation of partner representatives where appropriate. The Consultant is also required to work closely with the Drivers of Change Expert to contribute to discussions of AusAID's broader engagement with civil society in Vanuatu, and will assist with an articulation of rationale for ongoing engagement with civil society and media within the Vanuatu-Australia Partnership for Development.

The **AusAID Evaluation Manager** is required to support the Consultant in producing all the outputs, and contributing to the writing of the final report. This officer will be responsible for the management of an evaluation assistant and relevant Program Manager to support the review process, and will be responsible for the overall budget for the review. This officer will be the point of contact between the review consultant and the Post.

The **AusAID Program Manager** is required to support the Consultant in planning for and conducting field consultations, which may include participating in all interviews (translating where necessary) and contributing to the writing of the final report. The Program Manager will provide additional support as appropriate under the direction of the Evaluation Manager.

The **Evaluation Assistant** will support the review team in arranging a program schedule for the in-country consultations, in consultation with AusAID Post, the Consultant prior to each review visit. The assistant will support the Evaluation Manager and Program Manager in drafting relevant contracts, organising review logistics and maintaining review records.

### **Duration**

The Consultant shall commence the Services outlined in this Terms of Reference on x date and complete all Outputs before x date. A maximum of 50 consulting days is allocated for these Outputs.

<b>Activity</b>	<b>Estimated Days</b>	<b>Comment</b>
Desk-based review of key documents	6 days (2 days per program)	No travel required.
Preparation of cluster evaluation methodology/plan	1 day	In consultation with Post.
Preparation for in-country program consultations	1 day	In consultation with Post.
Vois Blong Yumi in-country consultations	5 days maximum	Includes site visit to Province
VCPD in-country consultations	10 days	Includes site visit to
Kastom Governance in-country consultations	10 days	Includes site visit to ...
Desk-based consultations with the ABC, ANCP and ACPACS	As appropriate over 5 days	Teleconferences

and other Posts as relevant		
Drafting of MTRs and summary	6 days	No travel required
Finalise MTRs and summary following feedback	1 -3 days	No travel required
<b>TOTAL DAYS:</b>	<b>50 days</b>	

### Reporting Requirements

The Consultant is required to provide an Aide Memoire to AusAID detailing initial findings from each in-country mission. The Aide Memoire will be provided prior to departing from Vanuatu.

The Consultant has the primary responsibility to collect information, analyse and produce individual mid-term reviews as the final output of the consultancy. An executive summary for the cluster evaluation is to also be provided identifying common themes for civil society engagement that can contribute to the planned drivers of change analysis.

Individual mid-term reviews should be a maximum of 20 pages. Key contents are:

- An executive summary;
- Background on AusAID's support for civil society and the specific program in Vanuatu;
- An outline of the review objectives and methods;
- Findings against the research questions; and
- Conclusions and recommendations.
- Annexes/Case Studies as appropriate

The draft reports are to be received by AusAID in electronic format by x date. The final versions are to be received by AusAID in electronic format by x date. The reports should be emailed to Counsellor, AusAID Port Vila.

### Key documents

- AusAID *Guidance on Monitoring and Evaluation for Civil Society Programs*
- Vanuatu-Australia Partnership for Development
- *The Unfinished State: Drivers of Change in Vanuatu 2007* analysis
- *ODE Evaluation of AusAID's Engagement with Civil Society in Vanuatu September 2010*
- The Vanuatu Government's *Priorities and Action Agenda 2006-2012* and the *Planning Long Acting Short 2009-2011* policy documents.
- Key program documents detailed in the annexes to these terms of reference
- Other documents as deemed relevant by AusAID and the Team.

### Next Steps

The mid-term reviews will be assessed as per AusAID's quality and performance processes and will be used to inform future program support. They will also be used to inform a broader Drivers of Change analysis of AusAID's bilateral programs in Vanuatu.

## ANNEX A – VANUATU MEDIA STRENGTHENING PROGRAM

Australia currently provides funding of up to \$5.2 million from June 2007- June 2012 for the implementation of the “Vois Blong Yumi” program of support to the Vanuatu Broadcasting and Television Corporation (VBTC), of which Phase 3 is valued at \$2.3 million from 2009-2012. The Program goal is to support the achievement of VBTC’s vision for Radio Vanuatu, which will be clarified by the end of the program of support. The program purpose is to support the development of an accessible, responsive and professional Radio Vanuatu, managed by a well performing and respected VBTC.

The Vois Blong Yumi Program focuses on nation building by way of support for a national service which can reflect the concerns, interests, languages and current affairs of Vanuatu. In particular, it focuses on rebuilding the national radio service so that it can be used to promote knowledge for social and economic issues such as HIV/AIDS, gender equity, agricultural development. It is also a vital communication tool for disaster and risk management, as demonstrated during the multiple tsunami alerts since October 2009. While the focus is particularly on Radio Vanuatu, this is underpinned by organisation development of the VBTC, with some small scale support for other media stakeholders. The program approach is one of progressive engagement over the long term.

### Program Components

The Vois Blong Yumi program is implemented as a rolling design under four main components:

**Component 1: Governance and Organisation Development** – this involves a financial analysis to assist in management and decision making, a survey of the organisational climate, an organisational change plan, a revision of licensing procedures and minor building refurbishment.

**Component 2: Access** – this is addressed through the development of a transmission strategy. Technical stabilisation of equipment and capacity building of staff is also a focus to address the technical quality and reliability of broadcasts.

**Component 3: Voice and Content** – an audience survey provides information on which to base program development. Editorial and program policies have been developed to address issues of accuracy, impartiality and objectivity. A program bank mechanism lays the foundations of more contemporary programming and reinvigorates content. News and current affairs are also supported, as are the interactive and scheduling capacity.

**Component 4: Outreach** – support to other stakeholders will identify opportunities for support to broader media development than the Radio Vanuatu and the VBTC.

### Summary of previous program evaluations:

The program commenced in April 2007. An independent evaluation, conducted in early 2009, found that good progress had been made in Components 2 and 3 but was slow for Components 1 and 4. It recommended a twelve month extension. Subsequently, AusAID agreed to continue funding the program until December 2009 with any further support contingent on a demonstrated commitment to VBTC from the Government of Vanuatu.

A second independent evaluation in December 2009 noted the increased commitment by the VBTC Board and Management to address organizational reform issues, particularly in relation to financial management and human resource development. VBTC developed a strategic reform plan, which the Vois Blong Yumi program supported. The evaluation recommended that while there was more traction on Components 1 and 4, there was still some way to go to assisting VBTC with strengthening content and technical capacity to maintain and develop its technical infrastructure. The evaluation recommended a third phase of support to June 2012, and for this to include particular assistance to the commercial unit within the organization and some support for television broadcasting through content development and production training.

### Management and Technical Assistance

The Program works with Radio Vanuatu as a specific service, and the VBTC as the organisation responsible for delivering this service. The program is implemented, managed and monitored by the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (the ABC) through a twinning arrangement between the ABC International Projects Unit and Radio Vanuatu. The VBTC and Government of Vanuatu, the ABC and AusAID form the core of the Management Committee which has oversight of the program. In addition, NGO representatives from the Vanuatu National Council of Women and the Vanuatu Association of NGOs sit on the Committee.

Under Phase 3 the ABC provides two long-term in-country advisers, a Team Leader and a Commercial/Marketing Adviser. An additional 4 short-term advisers are also provided for discrete activities. The advisers report to the VBTC General Manager for General Operations.

### **KEY GUIDING QUESTIONS FOR THE ASSESSMENT**

In addition to assessment against the seven program performance criteria (Relevance, Analysis and Learning, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Monitoring and Evaluation, Sustainability and Gender Equality), the assessment must address the following questions:

1. Since the commencement of Phase 3 what has been achieved in by the program, with a particular focus on the problem areas identified by the Independent Evaluation report of February 2010 (i.e. components 1 and 4)?
2. Are there any ongoing issues in relation to the achievements of activities? Does the design focus remain relevant and appropriate?
3. How have stakeholders engaged in the program during Phase 3? To what extent has the nature of this engagement contributed to activity progress?
4. How does the program link with the VBTC Board's reform agenda and the Vanuatu Government's own reform agenda for government business enterprises?
5. How close do the achievements of the Vois Blong Yumi program match up with the direction of Australia's development partnership discussions with the Vanuatu Government? What is the program's longer-term role in contributing to the higher level objectives of the aid program?
6. Do the program management and monitoring arrangements remain appropriate for a program of this size and significance?
7. With the commencement of PACMAS Phase 2 this year, what opportunities are there for support to VBTC to be transferred to the regional program? What is appropriate future support for VBTC and media in Vanuatu?

### **Key Documents**

The following are key documents for the Review:

- The Program Design Document dated 18 December 2006;
- VBTC's Strategic Reform Plan 2010-11;
- Schedule of ROU with ABC;
- Australia-Vanuatu Joint Cooperation Strategy 2005-2011;
  - Demand for Better Governance thematic strategy
  - ABC's Progress Reports and Financial Acquittals in relation to the six-month extension of the program
  - Vois Blong Yumi Evaluation Reports of March 2009 and December 2009
  - Vois Blong Yumi Phase 3 Annual Plans
  - Minutes of Program Management meetings
  - the Vanuatu Government's *Priorities and Action Agenda 2006-2011*
  - Audience Survey 2011
  - Transmission Mapping Survey 2010

## ANNEX B – VANUATU CHURCHES PARTNERSHIP PROGRAM

### BACKGROUND

The Vanuatu Church Partnership Program (VCPP) has been established under the Australian commitment to building demand for better governance in the Pacific and follows through on a commitment between the Australian and Vanuatu governments to increase community engagement.

The VCPP began in 2009 as a three year program with an allocation of just over \$4 million from the Government of Australia, and financial and in-kind contributions from the five Australian Non-government Organizations (ANGOs) and Vanuatu Churches, and the Government of Vanuatu.

The goal of the program is:

**To contribute to a healthy, educated and wealthy Vanuatu recognising traditional Melanesian values, faith in God and Christian principles.**

The objective of the program is:

**The Vanuatu Christian Council and Churches in Vanuatu, individually and collectively, play an increasingly recognised and effective role in improving governance and service delivery at national and local levels.**

The program has four major areas of assistance:

1. Strengthening governance, management and operations of the Vanuatu Christian Council.
2. Institutional strengthening of individual Churches in Vanuatu.
3. Resourcing and support for Churches in Vanuatu to expand and improve development initiatives.
4. Common activities implemented by Churches collaboratively.

The program is built on a partnership between AusAID, the Government of Vanuatu and the Churches in Vanuatu with their Australian NGO counterparts. Vanuatu Church partners in the program are the Vanuatu Council of Churches, Apostolic Church, Assemblies of God, Church of Melanesia, Church of Christ, Presbyterian Church of Vanuatu and Seventh Day Adventist Church. Australian Church agency partners are Act for Peace, ADRA Australia, Anglican Board of Mission, Baptist World Aid Australia, and UnitingWorld.

### Scope of the Review

The VCPP is a modest program with six Church agencies and the Vanuatu Christian Council (VCC) operating in different locations across Vanuatu, undertaking various types of development interventions. There is much that could be reviewed under this MTR however the intended scope of the review has been restricted to specific areas.

The review is intended to provide information which will be of most use in further development of the program towards effective outcomes. The VCPP ANGO Group and AusAID have determined therefore that the review will focus on the following areas:

a) The review will look at what has been achieved, and why, against stated program objectives. The evaluative process will assess gender and gender relations. In addition the opportunity presents during this review to at least consider the impact of the program upon the lives of some people in communities. While this will not be a major focus of the review, some consideration of impact at this time will assist in development of a basis for more complete impact assessment during future evaluations of VCPP.

b) An essential element in the design of VCPP is the partnership between the Vanuatu and Australian Churches. The MTR will assess the role and development of these relationships since the implementation of VCPP, including identifying the contribution made by both Vanuatu and Australian partners and areas that need to be focussed on in the future, particularly for the sustainability of the program.



c) Attention will be given to the management and governance of VCPP by AusAID, ANGOs and VCC members.

c) The review should also consider the next phase of VCPP, both from the viewpoint of the Churches and what they are trying to achieve for the people they are working with, as well as from the perspective of engaging with AusAID and the Government. Specifically this will consider options for how VCPP will move forward after 2009, including what the next phase of VCPP might look like, the nature of the engagement with AusAID and the Government.

### **Key Questions To Be Addressed In The Assessment**

It is anticipated that the mid-term review will evaluate the performance of the VCPP program in the context of the performance criteria:

1. **Relevance**
2. **Analysis and Learning**
3. **Effectiveness**
4. **Efficiency**
5. **Monitoring and Evaluation**
6. **Sustainability**
7. **Gender Equality**

(see Cluster Evaluation Terms of Reference for full discussion of these criteria.)

In addition, the mid-term review should address the following specific questions relevant to the VCPP program:

1. The types and levels of activities, collaboration and engagement that occurred
  - a) between the church agencies and their Australian church counterparts
  - b) between the Vanuatu Church agencies in relation to development activities
2. Perceptions of key staff of the strengths and weaknesses of governance structures in their development, health and education administrative bodies
3. Frequency and observed impact of staff training in leadership, structures of governance, and ethics in management
4. What formal or informal channels of dialogue have been created between the Churches and different levels of Vanuatu government have been created to discuss needs and services of citizens, and policy issues in general? How effective are these channels?
5. Identify 4- 6 specific & measurable performance indicators that could be used in assessing the outcomes of the work undertaken in the areas of:
  - Enhanced Vanuatu Church involvement in improving governance
  - Strengthened Vanuatu Churches institutional capacity
  - Improved service delivery by the Churches to local communities
  - Increased levels of collaboration between the Churches participating in CPP

### **Key Documents**

- The Program Design Document – November 2008;
- VCPP Baseline Report – June 2008;
- Census 2009 – Religious Affiliation
- Minutes of the First and Second Governing Council meetings: 2009 and 2010
- Minutes of the annual VCCP Partnership meetings 2009 and 2010
- VCPP Coordinator Terms of Reference
- ABM report December 2009
- BWAA Vanuatu Report December 2009
- ADRA Vanuatu report January 2010



- Funding Agreement 37879 ABMA
- Funding Agreement 37914 NCAA
- Funding Agreement 37933 UCOA
- Funding Agreement 37880 ADRA

### **Key Stakeholders**

Church leaders  
 CPP Coordinators  
 Beneficiaries in areas of health and education  
 Provincial government representatives  
 Department of Health  
 Department of Education

## **ANNEX C – KASTOM GOVERNANCE PARTNERSHIP**

### **BACKGROUND**

The Vanuatu Kastom Governance Partnership relates to the ‘Demand for Better Governance’ measure which comes under the broad umbrella of the Australian Government’s Australia–Vanuatu Joint Development Cooperation Strategy. The partnership program is distinct in its attempt to challenge the idea of a ‘fragile state’ with the alternative notion of a ‘hybrid political order’. This hybrid order recognises both customary approaches to governance and the post-independence Westminster system of governance.

The program had a pilot phase from 2005, an interim phase from October 2006 to December 2007, and a third phase from December 2009. It began with action research in 2005 supporting three workshops on conflict resolution. The partnership was significantly expanded in the Vanuatu Kastom Governance Partnership design for the period October 2006 – December 2007 (\$0.5m, plus an additional \$0.15m for bridging activities). Concurrently AusAID commissioned the “Drivers of Change” (DoC) study in Vanuatu, an analysis of the political economy which identified the key role of kastom, chiefs and churches in community governance and service delivery.

Phase 3 of the Vanuatu Kastom Governance Partnership was developed in recognition of the authority and centrality of chiefs and kastom in Vanuatu life identified through the DoC. Funding of A\$2.7m was allocated to the program. The design for Phase 3 was completed in March 2008, but implementation was delayed while awaiting budget submissions from both the Australian Centre for Peace and Conflict Studies (ACPACS) and Malvatumauri Vanuatu National Council of Chiefs (MVNCC). Due to the delay the Program Design Document (PDD) for phase 3 was reviewed by DPAG in February 2009. The program commenced in October 2009 and is scheduled for completion in December 2012. AusAID financial support is provided through separate contracts with the MVNCC and the Australian Centre for Peace and Conflict Studies (ACPACS), which in turn engages with other civil society actors through community leaders involved in the research process, the dialogues, and the development of action plans.

### **Objectives**

The objective of the program is to explore, deepen understanding of and strengthen kastom governance systems’ contribution to contemporary Vanuatu, in support of the overarching goal of strengthening governance in Vanuatu.

The program aims to achieve its objective through 5 key components:

- research on the value and role of kastom governance, and its interaction with post-independence governance systems and to community governance
- action learning through dialogues/workshops (storians) among community leaders aimed at drawing out the contribution of kastom governance to development and conflict resolution and prevention

- support to community leaders and members of the Malvatumauri National Council of Chiefs (MVNCC), to build links with other organisations and mobilise assistance to implement their action plans developed as part of the workshops
- support for facilities and strengthening the management and administrative skills of the MVNCC. It should be noted that there are several kinds of chiefly systems, with considerable variation across islands and between rural and urban communities. The National Council of Chiefs Act of 2006 and the establishment of the VNCC is an attempt to provide a national structure of chiefly councils.
- Annual forums to enable national level discussion on kastom governance and specific development issues with the Government of Vanuatu, churches and civil society organisations, including media.

## **Previous Reviews**

To be added

## **Key Questions To Be Addressed In The Assessment**

It is anticipated that the mid-term review will evaluate the performance of the MVNCC program in the context of the performance criteria:

1. **Relevance**
2. **Analysis and Learning**
3. **Effectiveness**
4. **Efficiency**
5. **Monitoring and Evaluation**
6. **Sustainability**
7. **Gender Equality**

(see Drivers of Change Terms of Reference for full discussion of these criteria.)

In addition, the mid-term review should address the following specific questions relevant to the MVNCC program:

1. What is the quality of the partnership interaction between AusAID, ACPAS and MVNCC?
2. What is the quality of MVNCC's relationships with other stakeholders, in particular the Government of Vanuatu's Mama Graon (lands program), women's organisations and leaders, youth-focused organisations such as Wan Smol Bag, churches and church organisations, and representatives of post-independence governance systems such as State Law Office and the Vanuatu Police Force?
3. Customary governance is traditionally exclusionary of women and youth. Has the program impacted on perceptions of the role of women and youth in Vanuatu kastom and community governance?
4. The program was to be monitored through an action research model, where all components will be subject to critical reflection to continuously learn from and refine implementation methods. Has this approach been appropriately applied? Are MVNCC staff, including facilitators, participating in this process?
5. Are there any ongoing issues in relation to the achievements of activities? Does the annual plan for 2009/10 remain relevant and appropriate?
6. Research is a core component of the program design, to further identify how to support and further the potential of customary and community governance to contribute to a stable, peaceful and lively national life. However, it's also noted that presentation of the research findings in Vanuatu, in a variety of formats, is crucial. Has presentation met these aims, and have collaboration with the Vanuatu Cultural Centre, University of South Pacific, and Melanesian Institute of Philosophy and Technology (Pentecost) been successful?

## **Key Documents**

The following are key documents for the Review:

- The Program Design Document - March 2009;
- Malvatumauri Business Plan 2010-2012 – September 2009
- Malvatumauri Proposed Structure - September 2009
- Malvatumauri Strategic Plan 2009-2012 – September 2009
- National Council of Chiefs Act No. 23 of 2006
- 2010 Year 1 Implementation Plan – April 2010
- Annex 6 - Implementation Schedule October 2009 to March 2013.doc – October 2010
- Sample Storian Program for a) governance b) conflict resolution c) community development
- 2010 Annual Report – January 2010
- Year 2 Annual Plan – January 2010
- Australia-Vanuatu Joint Cooperation Strategy 2005-2011;
- Demand for Better Governance thematic strategy
- Vanuatu Government's Priorities and Action Agenda 2006-2011
- Funding Agreement 52750 with VMNCC
- Funding Agreement 52751 with ACPAS
- Aide Memoire: Review of The Chiefs Pilot Project, Vanuatu, 24-28 April, 2006
- Review of Interim Phase (Phase 2) – November 2007
- Evaluation of AusAID's Engagement with Civil Society in Vanuatu – ODE September 2010
- Analysis of five cases of AusAID Engagement with Civil Society in Vanuatu, Papua New Guinea and the Philippines – ODE January 2011

#### **Key Stakeholders to Consult With**

To be added

## Appendix C: Monitoring and Evaluation Plan

### Monitoring and Evaluation Plan: Vanuatu Churches Partnership Program and Vois Blong Yumi: for discussion

---

#### Introduction

This outline covers the monitoring and evaluation of two of three AusAID-supported programs - the Vanuatu Churches Partnership Program and the Vois Blong Yumi Media Strengthening Program. The evaluation of the Kastom Governance Program will be undertaken early in 2012. The results of all three programs are intended to inform and support strong planning for the future. They will also inform a Cluster Evaluation of AusAID's civil society engagement. The following monitoring and evaluation matrices incorporate the suggestions arising for a teleconference between the Cluster Evaluation Reference Group and the consultant.

#### Guiding principles

The suggested principles to drive the mid-term reviews include:

- Stakeholder agreement on the review processes and methodology.
- An iterative process of reflection, learning from experience and incorporating lessons into future planning.
- Participatory research approaches throughout.
- Social, gender and geographic inclusion - seeking the experience and opinions of all strata of society – national, provincial and village leadership; those implementing the program; and those utilising services in urban and rural communities, including the experience and opinions of those living in more remote, hard to reach communities giving consideration to women and young people.
- Consideration of different context – culture, power relations and the size, structure and situation of the organisations involved in the programs.
- Review results with stakeholders and feed back of final MTR.

#### Aim of the evaluations

The aim of the evaluations is:

***To review what has been achieved, and why, and use the results to best plan for the future***

The major objectives of the review are to:

1. Assess the achievements and any unintended changes in the management capacity, operation and governance of civil society and media programs and the reasons for the changes.
2. Identify improved, expanded or new development initiatives or services and their most significant impacts, both intended and unintended, on institutions, communities and individuals including women and young people.
3. Assess key program partnerships; the extent and nature of communication and collaboration between civil society organizations, civil society and government, civil society and individuals and participation in governance.
4. Review cross cutting issues (eg. gender, HIV/AIDS, youth, child protection, sustainability and disability).
5. Identify key options and aims for the future, based on lessons learned, and as envisioned by the different program partners.

## Methodology

The reviews will focus on the achievements of the programs, reflection on the experience, and feeding back results into plans for the future. It will use a variety of research methods with data collected from a number of different sources in both urban and rural locations. Methods include using primary and secondary sources; reviewing key planning, reporting and financial documents; workshops with key partners; small focus group discussions with different stakeholders and partners in urban and rural locations; interviews with key national and provincial government personnel; semi-structured interviews with those implementing the program activities at community level and with community members including chiefs, pastors, teachers, health workers, women and youth.

Where appropriate, on rural field visits we will collect information on both the VCPP and VBY programs, in particular on Radio Vanuatu coverage and transmission quality and reliability and sources of information on governance issues. Care will be taken to ensure that sources of information are clearly stated.

The data will be analysed using a theory of change model (see below) which draws out improvements in services, more connected communities, greater social inclusion, more informed and active citizens and more effective, accountable and transparent government. An important aspect of the methodology will be on-going validation of results with stakeholders and through a final workshop to feedback and discuss results. Results will be triangulated where appropriate to ensure their validity.

A set of key questions will guide most of the research. Many of the same questions will be asked of different respondents. This is shown on the following matrix. The way the questions are phrased will need to be adapted to the specific context and/or respondent. Together with the program monitoring and evaluation personnel and church coordinators more focused questions will be developed for assessing the role of partnerships and collaboration, for interviewing those delivering health, education, women's and youth services to ensure we can adequately consider the opinions and program experience of individuals in the community.

**Drivers of Change methodology:** Drivers of change is a theory of change that identifies the key pathways that can lead to successful and sustainable development. It is based on six major outcomes which reflect positive change and key opportunities for development. They are:

- better services and service delivery;
- less conflict between and within communities;
- more connected communities;
- greater social inclusion;
- more informed and active citizens; and
- more effective, accountable and transparent government.

The data collected from the three reviews will be analysed using this framework.

## ***Draft Monitoring and Evaluation Matrix : Vois Blong Yumi program***

<b>Objectives/Activities</b>	<b>Respondents</b>	<b>Methodology</b>	<b>Possible key questions</b>
Review relevant documents & develop draft M&E Plan	Consultant		
In country stakeholders provide input into M&E Plan	Reference group and relevant partners, VCPP and VYB managers/coordinators	Working Group	The following are some suggested questions only. They need to be revised by partners using on-the-ground knowledge of the programs.
<b>Area 1: Strengthening governance, management</b>	VBTC Board members and management  ABC program managers  Team leaders within Radio Vanuatu and VBTC  Key GOV officials	Face to face interviews	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What are the most significant changes in Radio Vanuatu and VBTC management and leadership in Phase 3 ?</li> <li>• What changes have occurred in licensing?</li> <li>• What infrastructural and building refurbishments have been undertaken?</li> <li>• What changes have there been in human resource development activities?</li> <li>• What changes have there been in staff morale?</li> <li>• What changes are there in the financial viability of VCTC and financial record keeping?</li> <li>• What are the enabling and constraining factors to further management development?</li> </ul>
<b>Area 2: Transmission coverage and quality</b>	<div>Team leader, Technical Services</div> <div>Village level</div>	Face to face interviews	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What progress has been made with implementing the Technical Master Plan and what has the impact been?</li> <li>• Can you receive Radio Vanuatu and how reliable and clear is it?</li> </ul>
	VBTC Team Leader , Technical Services, IT specialist, VBY Team Leader	Face to face discussion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To what extent has transmission improved?</li> <li>• How is the current IT system working and what are the priorities for improvement?</li> <li>• What technical training has taken place and what are the significant changes in technical skills?</li> </ul>



	Community members and urban and rural areas	Face to face interviews	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How well can you hear Radio Vanuatu programs?</li> <li>• What is the quality of sound?</li> <li>• Can you hear it most of the time?</li> <li>• What time of day do you listen?</li> <li>• What kinds of radio programs do you prefer?</li> </ul>
	Consultant	Revue coverage and transmission quality documents	
<b>Area 3: Improved content and skills of radio staff in provinces</b>	VBTC trainers, Team Leaders, VBY team leader	Face to face discussion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What are the most significant impacts of training for journalists outside Vila?</li> <li>• What was the content of the training?</li> <li>• What did you learn and how have you applied this learning?</li> <li>• To what extent has it improved your skills?</li> <li>• How could the training be improved?</li> <li>• How would you assess the journalism training VBTC has provided?</li> </ul>
	Trained journalists	Face to face interviews	
	Team Leaders, VBY Team Leader, Consultant	Review of audience surveys	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What is listenership of Radio Vanuatu across the country – urban and rural?</li> <li>• What is the level of audience satisfaction?</li> <li>• Do people listen to Radio Vanuatu and what programs do they prefer?</li> <li>• Who listens? Men, women or youth?</li> <li>• What is their opinion of quality</li> <li>• What kinds of programs would they like to hear in future?</li> </ul>
	General public in urban and rural areas	Face to face interviews	
	Team Leader responsible for the Program Bank and Consultant	Review of programmes in the Programme Bank	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• How much material in the Program Bank?</li> <li>• How often is it used?</li> <li>• How long is it kept?</li> <li>• What is its quality?</li> <li>• Who has provided it?</li> <li>• What languages are the programmes in?</li> <li>• How do they portray gender issues, attitudes to HIV/AIDS</li> </ul>

<b>Area 4: Support for media development in Vanuatu</b>	All key stakeholders	Group discussion	<p>What have been the significant impacts of the training program for media professionals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What role does VBTC have in supporting MAV training?</li> </ul>
	Team Leader Commercial	Face to face interview	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To what extent has there been increased use of media by GOV, the business sector and NGOs?</li> <li>• How popular is interactive programming and talk back?</li> </ul>
	VBTC Team Leaders VBY Team leader	Discussion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• What is the gender balance among guest speakers ?</li> <li>• What kinds of programs deal with gender and human rights issues, including gender violence?</li> <li>• What is the proportion of “public service” broadcasts or programming?</li> <li>• To what extent do women and young people participate in broadcast material?</li> </ul>
<b>Other Issues: Cross cutting issues</b>	All key stakeholders	Workshop	To discuss results and the way forward



## Appendix D : People Interviewed

Name	Organisation	Position
Rob Batten	ABC	VBY Program Manager
Christien Bihu	VBTC	Chairman of Board
Stanley Bule	Navele Secondary School, Santo	Maths teacher
Helen Corrigan	AusAID	Senior Program Manager, Law and Justice
Ruth Dovo	Vanuatu Christian Council	Women's Officer
Michael Francino	ADB/AusAID	Public Finance Adviser
Domenic Friguglietti	ABC	Director, International Services
Elizabeth Graham	Radio Vanuatu	Team Leader, Programs
Joe Harry	VBTC	Team Leader, Corporate Services
Francis Herman	PACMAS	Director (former ABC Team Leader, VBY)
Alan Kalfabun	AusAID	Former Commercial Adviser, VBY
Dorosdae Kenneth	Department of Women's Affairs	Director
David Kiel	CREST Radio, Tanna	Manager
Dorolyn Leloya	SDA Church	Women's Affairs
Dicki Lehi	Navele Secondary School, Santo	Principal
Maria Lehi	Navele Secondary School, Santo	Social Science Teacher
Jenny Ligo	Former Vanuatu National Women's Organisation	
Bob Makin	MAV	Journalist
Antoine Malsungai	Radio Vanuatu	Talkback host
Clarence Marae	Prime Minister's Office	PM's Public Relations Officer
Warren Maleni	VBTC	Team Leader, Technical
Jean Francis Metmetsan	Prime Minister's Office	Media Analyst
Gnari Michael	AusAID	
James Moli	Studio 5 Not, Santo	Manager
David Momcilovic	AusAID	First Secretary
Jonas Mosavich	Vanuatu Agricultural College	Lecturer, Media Officer
Kylie Mullins	AusAID	Assistant Program Manager
Anna Naupa	AusAID	Senior Program Manager
Gregoire Nimbtik	DSPACC	Director

<b>Name</b>	<b>Organisation</b>	<b>Position</b>
Katie Napuat	Tafea Provincial Council	Secretary General
Annie Philemon	Sanma Counselling Centre	Director
Katherine Ruiz-Avila	AusAID	Counsellor
Ellenson Taurakoto	VBTC	Team Leader, Commercial Marketing
Michael Taurakoto	Wan Smolbag Theatre	Chief Executive
Romeo Vunari	Sanma Provincial Council	Assistant Secretary General
Fred Vurubaravu	VBTC	General Manager
Robert Warren	Radio Vanuatu	Team Leader, Technical
Emma Walker	ABC	VBY Program Officer
Olivia Williams	VBTC	Team Leader, News

## Appendix E: References and Source Documents

AusAID, 2006, Vois Blong Yumi – Program of Support to Vanuatu Broadcasting and Television Corporation (Program Design Document)

AusAID and Government of Vanuatu, 2005, 'Australia-Vanuatu Joint Development Cooperation Strategy, 2005-2010', Port Vila

AusAID, May 2009, 'Partnership for Development between the Government of Australia and the Government of Vanuatu', Port Vila

AusAID, December 10, 2009, Independent Monitoring of Phase 2: 'Vois Blog Yumi' Program of Support to the Vanuatu Broadcasting and Television Corporation

AusAID, February 2009, Independent Evaluation of Voice Blong Yumi Program

Commonwealth of Australia, 2011, *An effective aid program for Australia: Making a real difference-delivering real results*, Canberra

Commonwealth of Australia, 2011, *Independent Review of Aid Effectiveness*, Canberra

Government of Vanuatu, 2005, 'Priorities and Action Agenda 2006-2015-An Educated, Healthy and Wealthy Vanuatu ', Ministry of Finance and Economic Management, Port Vila

Government of Vanuatu, 2009, 'National Census of Population and Housing, Summary Release', Vanuatu Statistics Office, Port Vila

VBTC/ABC, Annual Plans, Phases 2 and 3, July 1-June 30, 2009; 2010; 2011 and 2012

VBTC/ABC, Annual Progress Reports, 2008, 2009

VBTC/ABC, Six monthly Report January –June, 2010

VBTC, 2010, 'National Survey of Media Usage'

VBTC, 2010, Transmission Mapping Survey

VBTC, April 2011, 'Tingting Blong Yumi long Vanuatu Broadcasting Corporation', Organisational Climate Survey.



VBTC, 2010, 'Bildim Fiutja Blong Yumi' Vanuatu Broadcasting and Television Corporation Strategic Plan 2010-2015

VBV, Minutes of the Project Management Committee meetings, June 8, 2020, August 29, 2011,

## Appendix F: Progress against Annual Plans Phase 3 (July 1, 2010 – June 30, 2012)

As many of the outputs and activities are the same for each Annual Plan, the table combines the two. The outputs and activities that relate to 2011-2012 are in bold type and are marked.

Activity	End date	Status	Progress	Issues
<b>Component 1: Governance and Organisation Development</b> <b>Objective: To improve governance, management and operations of VBTC</b>				
Output 1.1 VBTC submits proposals to GOV on amendments to the Broadcasting and Television Act	December 2010 <b>December 2011</b>	Not achieved	No progress – moved to 2011-2012	Review still waiting for GM to provide amendments
Output 1.2 Decision-making skills of the VBTC Board  Enhanced/efficient functions of the VBTC Board	December 2010  <b>June 2012</b>	On-going  On-going	Training and on-going support provided. Very little obvious progress.	Changes of Board members and lack of interest from GM have created an insoluble problem with senior management.
Activity 1.2.1 Provide day to day advice to VBTC Board	June 2011	On-going	Little obvious progress	
Output 1.3 Leadership and management skills of the VBTC and GM and management team enhanced, and Corporate Services Department reviewed				
Activity 1.3.1 Provide regular coaching and advice to the GM and	June 2010	Achieved and on-going	VBTC Team leaders have had regular coaching and support. Marked	In future focus on supporting middle management

VBTC management team			improvement among middle managers	
Activity 1.3.2 Deliver structured Leadership development program for VBTC	February 2011	Achieved	Program was appreciated by all. Middle managers are putting leadership learning into practice. No progress with GM & board.	In future focus on supporting middle management.
Activity 1.3.3 Facilitate review of Corporate Services Department	July 2010 <b>December 2011</b>	Achieved	Review completed and finally agreed by staff and staff union August 2011. Partnership Agreement not signed by GM so cannot be implemented. Staff contracts still not signed after 2 years	Senior management not undertaking disciplinary measures.
Output 1.4 VBTC's financial management enhanced, VBTC begins implementing Strategic Plan; and revenue generation increased				
Activity 1.4.1 Strategic Financial Advice  <b>Activity 1.3.2</b>	June 2011  <b>June 2012</b>	Partially achieved	Financial controller/adviser appointed but did not stay Improved financial management not achieved. Revenue generation on going – actual situation unclear.	On-going problems with financial accountability and lack of transparency. VBTC's expenditure continues to be 14% higher than income. It is time to make reviews public.
Activity 1.4.2 Facilitate finalisation and implementation of VBTC Strategic Plan	June 2011	Partially Achieved	Plan completed but only partially implemented	

Activity 1.4.3 Provide advice and support to VBTC on revenue generation <b>Activity 1.3.3</b>	2011  <b>June 2012</b>	Achieved	A Commercial Marketing adviser assisted for 9 months. A marketing plan developed and innovative strategies developed and implemented	The success of the marketing strategy is unclear as accurate records of commercial income are not available.
Activity 1.4.4. Deliver training course on radio and TV promotions	June 2011	Achieved		
Activity 1.4.5 Facilitate preparation of proposal seeking assistance on VBTC debt	August 2010	Partly achieved		Difficulty in getting sufficient accurate financial information to support the proposal
Output 1.5 VBTC finalises and begins implementation of Partnership Agreement <b>Output 1.4</b>	June 2011  <b>June 2012</b>	Partly achieved	Partnership Agreement finalised but not implemented. Not signed off by GM.	Growing staff unrest and declining morale will need to be addressed. The legal requirements of the agreement are not being met.
Output 1.6 Review of Licensing Procedures completed	October 2010	Not achieved		Payment of licensing fees still not being enforced
Output 1.7 Approved building refurbishment completed	June 2011	Achieved		
Output 1.8 In-house awards system implemented <b>Output 1.5</b>	June 2011  <b>June 2012</b>	On-going	Awards announced August 2011	
Output 1.9 Attachments completed for selected personnel	June 2011	On-going		

<b>Output 1.7</b>	<b>June 2012</b>			
Output 1.10 Television Blong Vanuatu production staff enhanced skills	June 2011	On-going	Limited support provided	At this stage it maybe advisable to focus on Radio Vanuatu
<b>Output 1.6</b>	<b>June 2012</b>			
Output 1.11 Organisational Climate survey completed	April 2011	Achieved	Serious problems not addressed	Staff dissatisfaction will need to be met
<b>Component 2: Access</b>				
<b>Objective: To extend the reach of Radio Vanuatu and improve the quality of reception</b>				
Output 2.1 Transmission Mapping Survey completed	August 2010	Achieved	Results used to focus on areas where coverage is poor	
Output 2.2 VBTC begins to implement Technical Master Plan	June 2011	On-going	Planned maintenance not being undertaken – funds not being made available	The Board need to ensure funds are provided for planned maintenance
Output 2.3 VBTC's Information Technology systems upgraded	June 2011	Achieved	AUDIOVAULT being used	IT systems seem to be working well
Output 2.4 VBTC's Studio 5 Not renovated				
Activity 2.4.1. Develop Scope of Works	June 2011	Achieved	No progress with Studio 5. Evidence of land transfer not provided	Board and GM have bought land to construct an investment property planned to include Studio

				5. There are some doubts about the legality of this. AusAID withdraw allocated funding.
Activity 2.4.2 Facilitate local tender process	June 2011	Achieved	Problems with tender transparency	AusAID withdraw fund allocated for studio refit.
Activity 2.4.3 Facilitate renovation of Santo studio	June 2011	Not achieved		As above.
Output 2.5 Technical Stabilisation achieved <b>Output 2.1 (2012)</b>				
Activity 2.5.1 Studio refurbishment and digitalisation of Santo studio	June 2011	Waiting	Waiting	As above
<b>Activity 2.1.3 (2012)</b>	<b>June 2012</b>	<b>Waiting</b>	<b>Waiting</b>	
Activity 2.5.2 Installation of internal monitoring system at Santo studio	June 2011	Waiting	Waiting	As above
<b>Activity 2.4.1 (2012)</b>	<b>June 2012</b>	<b>Waiting</b>	<b>Waiting</b>	
Activity 2.5.3 Install a PABX system	July 2010	Achieved	Installed	
Output 2.6 Skills audit of broadcast technicians conducted and training plan finalised	June 2011	Achieved		
<b>Activity 2.1.1 Strengthening VBTC's transmission grid (2012)</b>	<b>June 2012</b>	<b>On-going</b>		



<b>Activity 2.1.2 Training VBTC Technical staff (2012)</b>	<b>June 2012</b>	<b>On-going</b>		Further training is needed and greater support from international engineers
Output 2.4 Commissioning PABX system	July 2011	Achieved	PABX system is working well	
<b>Component 3: Voice and Content</b> <b>Objective: To develop program content that serves people's needs</b>				
Output 3.1 Audience Research Survey conducted	July 2010	Achieved	Results being used to inform program	
<b>Output 3.1 Program makers in provinces increase skills 2012</b>	<b>June 2012</b>	<b>On-going</b>	Provincial training for 50 government and NGO personnel was provided together with small recorders and how to use them.	This is a valuable initiative and will need further follow up, encouragement and training.
Output 3.2 Journalists in provinces increase skills and receive audio equipment	June 2011	On-going	Material is being provided to Radio Vanuatu from provinces	Further training and expansion of this activity would increase spread and quality
<b>Output 3.2 Develop a provincial radio network 2012</b>	<b>June 2012</b>	<b>On-going</b>	Provinces are sending monthly reports, news and current affairs for Vois Blong Provins. FM services still need to be expanded.	This is working well. Provincial reports are on time. While of variable quality the provincial news is appreciated. Further training for

				provincial people would improve quality. Great VBY support in future needs to be put into developing the provincial network.
Output 3.3 Radio Vanuatu sets up content exchange with CREST FM	July 2010	Achieved	Exchange working well. Weekly programs from CREST broadcast on RV	Providing CREST with a line to Vila would allow a increased opportunity for exchanges. The current process for sending material is time consuming and slow
<b>Output 3.3 (2012) and Output 3.6 (2011) Improve skills of Radio Vanuatu's staff working on interactive programs</b>				
<b>Activity 3.3.1 Build capacity to provide relevant programs and greater voice for rural audiences</b>	<b>June 2012</b>	On-going	Great progress is being made with the interactive programs.	Further training will be needed in moderating talkback and IslanCall programs. The development and broadcast of policies regarding appropriate calls and content would reduce "nuisance" calls.
<b>Output 3.4 VBTC makes further improvements to news, current affairs and sports content July 2011 and 2012</b>				

Activity 3.4.1 Review newsroom operations	June 2011	Achieved		
Activity 3.4.2 Provision of specialist training to VBTC editorial staff	June 2011	Achieved	Marked improvements in news programs noted	On-going training will be required to further upgrade skills
Output 3.5 Civil society groups and NGOs continue to provide content to Radio Vanuatu under Program Bank funding initiative	June 2011	Partly achieved	Women's groups and the disabled group are now providing material for the Program Bank. Eight new groups have been approved for funding and training, including 3 women's groups.	Further skill upgrading and encouragement would provide better quality programs from NGOs new to the program
<b>Output 3.5 Content Analysis (2012)</b>	<b>April 2012</b>			
Output 3.7 Content Analysis completed	April 2011	Achieved		
<b>Component 4: Outreach</b> <b>Objective: To support the development of a free and fair media via support to other stakeholders</b>				
Output 4.1 Advice provided to MAV on assessing training needs of Vanuatu media professionals and creation of a training plan	June 2011	Not achieved	No progress. MAV have not provided a draft training plan	On-going leadership problems within MAV. Suggest providing support elsewhere.

<b>Output 4.1 (2012) and Output 4.2 (2011) GOV and NGOs received advice on using the media to communicate with Ni-Vanuatu</b>	<b>June 2011 and June 2012</b>	On-going	Good progress with training to date	
<b>Output 4.3 (2011) and Output 4.2 (June 2012) VBTC explores options to increase participation of women, youth and rural audiences</b>	<b>June 2011 and June 2012</b>	On-going	Good progress to date. New programs including weekly one hour Women's Program, weekly Voice blong Yut, women's programs from Santo and gender and youth issues raised on talkback	These issues need to be kept to the fore. Training for news and program staff in development issues including gender, child protection, HIV/AIDS, good governance would help improve the quality of programs and news.