

## EXTERNAL REVIEW REPORT – RESPONSES TO RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendation Category	Recommendation	Implement Now	Implement by the End of the PRMF	Consider for a Future Program	Responsibility	Start Finish
1. How to improve current delivery mechanisms	<p>A. <u>Upgrade provincial M&amp;E capabilities to be able to more accurately track progress of provincial development outcomes.</u></p> <p>a. Track peer-learning interaction formally for better understanding of who is providing what support to whom.</p> <p>b. Develop a standardized method of qualitative assessment of complex associations of variables.</p> <p>c. Allocate funds to test independent assessment of key reform areas.</p> <p>d. Utilise the LRMPAT as a self-administered and DILG-verified too, to independently assess LGU readiness for the NPLRM.</p>	<p>A. This is underway and will continue until the end of the PRMF.</p> <p>a. This is being incorporated in routine M&amp;E.</p> <p>b. Under routine development testing.</p> <p>c. Limited budget remains.</p> <p>d. This is planned but limited time and resources remain to do it.</p>	<p>A. By the end of the PRMF the 10 provinces will have fully functioning M&amp;E arrangements that will include comparative evaluation of PLGU M&amp;E capacity.</p> <p>d. This will be attempted within the remaining time and budget.</p>	<p>A. This should continue in any future program.</p> <p>c. This will be recommended for any future program.</p> <p>d. This will be recommended for any future program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• M&amp;E Officer.</li> <li>• Communications personnel.</li> <li>• Provincial personnel.</li> <li>• DFAT program planners.</li> </ul>	<p>Start: March on-going Finish: November 2015</p>
	<p>B. <u>Continue to build procurement, revenue generation and IAU capacity, as these are the keys to creating lasting reform in the road sector.</u></p> <p>a. Eliminate the third party procurement model and in which the DILG procures and vicariously manages contracts, and focus on PLGU capacity.</p> <p>b. Do not restrict CD to technical areas.</p>	<p>B. This is underway and will continue until the end of the PRMF.</p> <p>B. Being implemented.</p> <p>C. Being implemented with resource constraints.</p> <p>D. Reports released for use as bases for CD and institutional reform.</p>	<p>E. Expert provinces will be defined, model procedures developed, and a manual produced.</p> <p>d. This will be implemented if there are sufficient resources.</p>	<p>B. This should continue in any future program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• CD Manager.</li> <li>• Provincial Managers.</li> <li>• Step-up Consultancy.</li> </ul>	<p>Start: February 2015 Finish: March 2015</p>

Recommendation Category	Recommendation	Implement Now	Implement by the End of the PRMF	Consider for a Future Program	Responsibility	Start Finish
	c. Release the PFM reports for CD and institutional development purposes. d. Expand upon the LGI tax study to ensure the utility of the initial findings.					
	C. <u>Continue research on road surfaces.</u> a. Seek external resources to fund a national road management research series on options for road surfaces, maintenance, citizen participation.	C. The research continues but resources are limited.	C. An additional 2km trial is being commissioned using a grader and non-automated equipment, subject to resources).	a. While insufficient resources remain within the PRMF, this should be built into provincial and national agency routine in any future program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Physical Works Manager.</li> <li>• CD Manager.</li> <li>• Research &amp; Innovation Manager.</li> <li>• Provincial Managers.</li> </ul>	Start: December 2013 Finish: June 2015
	D. <u>Continue research on citizen participation, add new research based on needs for future programming to be able to both build the case of how road management reforms can result in better lives of people.</u> a. Assist Bohol and Aklan to establish institutional arrangements for assessing the utility of planned barangay road maintenance contracting.	D. This work is underway and will continue within financial constraints.	a. This might be accomplished if there are sufficient resources. Note that in Aklan the governor has initiated a pilot program of community-based contracting with PRMF CD help.	b. While insufficient resources remain within the PRMF, this should be incorporated in future program.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Physical Works Manager.</li> <li>• CD Manager.</li> <li>• Research &amp; Innovation Manager.</li> </ul>	Start: February 2015 Finish: June 2016
	E. <u>Improve communication of PRMF/DFAT with provinces, starting with distributing all analyses, assessments and reports addressing provincial issues.</u> a. Release the PFM	E. This is being implemented. a. The PFM reports have been released and newsletters and press releases	E. All research and learning resources will be distributed to all stakeholders before the end of the PRMF.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Facility Director</li> <li>• Communications personnel</li> <li>• Team Leader</li> </ul>	Start: February 2015 Finish: June 2016

Recommendation Category	Recommendation	Implement Now	Implement by the End of the PRMF	Consider for a Future Program	Responsibility	Start Finish
	reports for CD and institutional development purposes.	are pre being prepared routinely.				
	<p>F. <u>The environmental aspects of road management have received limited focus under PRMF.</u></p> <p>a. DFAT should consider allying with DENR to introduce an implementable landscape approach that engages road designers and citizens to build a collaborative understanding of the systems dynamics that facilitate a positive, long-term road/community interface.</p>	<p>F. This will continue until the end of the PRMF, within budget constraints.</p>		<p>a. This should continue in any future program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>DFAT</li> </ul>	<p>Start: February 2015 Finish: June 2016</p>
	<p>G. <u>Continue CD on road design and management, including whole of life costing of design options.</u></p>	<p>G. This will continue until the end of the PRMF, within budget constraints.</p>	<p>G. Whole of life design analysis will be introduced as part of the planning phase, within resource constraints.</p>	<p>G. This should continue in any future program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Short-term assistance from and Australian LGU.</li> <li>CD Manager.</li> <li>physical works specialists.</li> <li>PIMTs.</li> </ul>	<p>Start: October 2013 Finish: June 2016</p>
2 How to sustain gains in the future (primarily for DFAT on post-PRMF design)	<p>A. <u>Focus attention on achieving a successful completion of the NPLRM design and approval.</u></p>	<p>A. This will continue until the end of the PRMF.</p>	<p>A. Work continues on a budget submission for a national funds allocation system, and a draft EO for funds management.</p>	<p>A. This should continue in any future program.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>FMG.</li> <li>CD Manager.</li> <li>STA from an Australian LGU.</li> </ul>	<p>Start: February 2014 Finish: June 2016</p>
	<p>B. <u>In line with national law,</u></p>	<p>B. This is underway and will continue</p>		<p>B. This should continue in any</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Physical Works Manager.</li> </ul>	<p>Start: January 2015</p>

Recommendation Category	Recommendation	Implement Now	Implement by the End of the PRMF	Consider for a Future Program	Responsibility	Start Finish
	<p><u>DFAT should seek appropriate partners to assist in preparing guidance for provinces on how best to integrate accessibility needs into design.</u></p>	<p>until the end of the PRMF.</p>		<p>future program, particularly if not implemented fully.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Research &amp; Innovation Manager.</li> </ul>	<p>Finish: June 2016</p>
	<p>C. <u>Expand use of 3rd party assessment, benchmarking and ranking to ensure that LGUs engaged in NPLRM are fully prepared and continue to improve.</u></p>		<p>C. Continue to support COA in revising audit policy and procedures, establishing a contract for RBIS implementation, LGI extension, and DILG involvement with the LRMPAT.</p>	<p>C. This should continue in any future program, particularly if not implemented fully.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• FMG Institutional Reform Manager.</li> <li>• CD Manager</li> </ul>	<p>Start: September 2014 Finish: June 2016</p>
	<p>D. <u>DFAT should assist in ensuring that the national program contains multiple objectives that support quality road construction.</u></p> <p>a) Initiate a comparative study on maintenance approaches by administration currently used by the 10 provinces, and engage all provinces in a dialog on effective, legal improvement of traditional approaches.</p> <p>b) Analyse how LGUs utilize NPLRM resources and the resultant impacts on socioeconomic variables.</p>	<p>D. This is intended.</p>		<p>a) The PRMF will provide advice on how to include this in a future program and achieve sustainability.</p> <p>b) This principle will be included in discussion on a new program, but will depend much on GoA policy and budget.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• FMG institutional Reform Manager</li> <li>• LBG Capacity building Manager</li> <li>• DILG</li> <li>• Physical Works Manager (QA)</li> </ul>	<p>Start: March 2015 Finish: June 2016</p>

Recommendation Category	Recommendation	Implement Now	Implement by the End of the PRMF	Consider for a Future Program	Responsibility	Start Finish
	E. <u>Support provinces to prepare their own sustainability plans so they understand how they need to take full control of future reforms.</u>		E. The provinces will be included in all sustainability plan revisions, once the budget for 2014-2015 is official.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• DHOM</li> <li>• LBG personnel</li> <li>• FMG personnel</li> <li>• DILG</li> <li>• PEOs</li> </ul>	Start: May 2015 Finish: June 2016
	F. <u>Build an experiential learning framework to enhance innovation and adaptation.</u>		<p>F. Establish CDRR public access for the next management agency.</p> <p>F. Establish a learning suite within the auspices of the LGA.</p>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• FMG.</li> <li>• CD Manager.</li> </ul>	Start: January 2015 Finish: March 2016
	G. <u>Incorporate a participatory approach for Local Government Unit (LGU) office roles and functional analysis to drive rational re-organization/re-alignment.</u>			G. The lessons and experiences in PRMF on institutional development will help inform the design of future programs on capacity development for local governments.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• FMG Deputy Facility Director (DILG).</li> <li>• FMG Infrastructure Officer (DILG).</li> <li>• CD Manager.</li> <li>• World Bank representative.</li> </ul>	Start: May 2015 Finish: On-going
3. Other recommendations.	<p>A. In the interests of sustainability consider corporatizing aspects of road management operations through a joint venture to reduce LGU costs in maintaining equipment and other facilities.</p> <p>B. Continue in the PRMF</p>		<p>G. This will be completed by the end of the PRMF within budget and resource constraints.</p> <p>H. This will be completed by the end of the</p>	A. While this principle already is being discussed (e.g. joint-venture crushing facilities), there are insufficient resources in the PRMF to do it	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• FMG Deputy Facility Director (DILG).</li> <li>• FMG Infrastructure Officer (DILG).</li> <li>• CD Manager.</li> <li>• Physical Works Manager.</li> </ul>	Start: April 2015 Finish: June 2016

Recommendation Category	Recommendation	Implement Now	Implement by the End of the PRMF	Consider for a Future Program	Responsibility	Start Finish
	<p>successor program to include long-term scholarships for study abroad.</p> <p>C. Support to the creation of a community of local CD providers and mentors that oriented to road management (something that PAHRODF and LOGOTRI are not). This should include professional associations and NGAs, like DPWH and DENR.</p> <p>D. Continued support for building modern engineering design capacity. Surveying and mapping equipment will need to be provided for the less well-endowed LGUs.</p> <p>E. Establish links to the Australian Road Research Board (ARRB) would be beneficial in building sustainable capacity.</p> <p>F. Provide short-term scholarships for technical, professional development.</p> <p>G. Codify all PRMF CD interventions in a set of simple, facilitative manuals.</p> <p>H. Document current research modules and disseminate for use by other provinces.</p>		<p>PRMF within budget and resource constraints.</p>	<p>now. It should be consider in any new programme.</p> <p>B. Long-term scholarships will be recommended for inclusion in the successor program.</p> <p>C. While some work has been accomplished, much more will be required in the successor program.</p> <p>D. While some work has been accomplished, much more will be required in the successor program. Equipment might be provided jointly by donors, PLGUs, and GoP.</p> <p>E. This will be recommended for a future program.</p> <p>F. This was recommended through the Australian Scholarship program but did</p>		

Recommendation Category	Recommendation	Implement Now	Implement by the End of the PRMF	Consider for a Future Program	Responsibility	Start Finish
				<p>not comply with the scope. A policy change is required to incorporate this in a future program in a way that it would be useful.</p> <p>G. There is a legal framework and best practice in the Philippines for public-private partnerships and including joint ventures (e.g., BOT Law, JV Partnership - Civil Code) between LGUs, and the private sector.</p>		