

Annex 1

Decentralisation lessons learned in other countries

Annex 1: Decentralisation lessons learned in other countries

Overview of international experience

Many countries implemented decentralisation with a view to reducing poverty and improving service delivery. Some lessons learned from this experience relevant to PNG are summarised here. An OECD DAC-commissioned review of decentralisation in 19 countries, found that countries with a functioning central state committed to the devolution of power to local tiers of government could use decentralisation as an effective means of promoting improved representation of the poor and enhancing targeted service delivery.¹ The same review identified a risk of decentralisation leading to increased poverty where the central state lacks the capacity to fulfil basic functions.

The linkage between decentralisation and poverty reduction remains unproven and the results of government efforts to decentralise have been highly variable across the developing world. Decentralisation has not turned out to be the development panacea that many had hoped it would be, and while there have been success stories, many decentralisation efforts have resulted in reduced service delivery, increased corruption and further marginalisation of already vulnerable groups – despite significant levels of donor support for these efforts.²

Lessons learned in other countries

Flexible approaches deliver good results^{3,4}. For example, decentralisation in Vietnam since 1986 has been applied in different forms depending on political context, local capacity and local needs. Some public administration functions were relocated from a central level to a provincial level – this is **deconcentration** and does not change the organisation or functions of public administration. Other public administration functions were redistributed so that the responsibility and administrative power was allocated to lower levels of government – this is **administrative decentralisation**. The most ambitious form of administrative decentralization is **devolution**, which moves authority and responsibility away from direct control of the central government and provides lower levels of government with absolute and direct authority stated by law. Vietnam used different forms of decentralisation for different sectors and for different regions – recognising the socio-economic diversity and ethnic variation across the country.

Lessons learned from Indonesia, Philippines and Vietnam confirm the importance of a legal foundation and related institutional arrangements for decentralisation^{3, 4,5}. For example lessons learned from the health sector in Indonesia, Philippines and Vietnam demonstrate the benefits of institutional arrangements that clearly assign functions, roles and responsibilities at all levels of government^{3,6}. To avoid confusion and help public administrators at all levels understand their function – roles, responsibilities and accountabilities – there is a need for a definitive specification of responsibilities and functions at national, provincial, district and local government levels. Service delivery is

¹ J. Jutting, C. Kauffmann, I. McDonnell, H. Osterrieder, N. Pinaud and L. Wegner (2004) Decentralisation and Poverty in Developing Countries: Exploring the Impact, *OECD Development Centre Working Paper No. 236*, OECD, Paris France p.5

² World Bank (2008), *Decentralization in Client Countries: An Evaluation of World Bank Support, 1990-2007*, World Bank Independent Evaluation Group, Washington DC, USA

³ World Bank (2004) Lessons learned from decentralisation of health services: a comparative analysis of Indonesia, Philippines and Vietnam. World Bank, Washington DC, USA.

⁴ Edquist, L. (2005) Decentralization of Educational Management in Vietnam. MA Thesis, Jönköping University, Sweden.

⁵ Phuc, T. V. (2006) Decentralization and delegation during PAR process in Vietnam. Paper delivered by Minister of Home Affairs at the regional forum on reinventing government in Asia. Seoul, Korea September 6-8, 2006.

⁶ Fford, A. (2003) Decentralisation in Vietnam – working effectively at provincial and local government level: A comparative analysis of Long An and Quang Ngai provinces. Report produced for AusAID, Hanoi, Vietnam.

strengthened if central agencies such as the Department of Health set clear objectives for public health that are consistent with other policies and are reflected in budgeted programs. A stewardship role for national agencies includes setting practical minimum standards, development of consistent health messages and related in-service training and extension materials³. For example, the Ministry of Health in Vietnam set minimum standards for child immunisation and supervised births that recognised the importance of these interventions for women and children but also the capacity, logistic and resource constraints faced at sub-district levels. Where national agencies set minimum standards that sub-national governments can realistically achieve, performance improves and the foundation for continuous improvement is established^{3,6}.

Evidence from Indonesia, the Philippines and Vietnam highlight that services improve with political commitment, finance that follows function and finance allocated according to need³. Lessons learned from Vietnam demonstrate that reform of service delivery was driven by political commitment at all levels of government^{6,7}. The reform processes in Indonesia, Philippines and Vietnam, whilst responding to popular demands for improved public services, were driven by political leaders with a commitment to improving delivery of services³. Budget process that transfer funds from central to sub-national government according to function and the estimated cost of services are shown to be effective. For example, in the Philippines poor fiscal design led to a mismatch between budget allocation and function, leading to poor service delivery at Province and Barangay (district) levels. When the national government reformed the process to better match grants and function, health outcomes improved. Conversely, poor health sector outcomes resulted in Vietnam when budget allocations were made on the basis of population rather than need and fiscal capacity of provincial governments³. This is consistent with evidence from PNG. Service delivery is most effective when program allocations to sub-national levels are made according to need and fiscal capacity and not allocated on an equal share basis⁸.

Lessons learned from the health sector in Indonesia, Philippines and Vietnam demonstrate the benefits of using just a few targeted programs for sub-national service delivery in each sector³. Multiple programs create confusion and lead to small budget allocations per program while simple programs are more transparent and more likely to lead to positive outcomes. If budget allocations are inappropriate, service delivery depends on user fees but where these represent a significant source of funding for the recurrent costs of sub-national service provision, the poorest in the community are less likely to access those services. For example, in Vietnam, decentralisation reform included an increased sub-provincial share of total provincial expenditures. This was measured to result in negative impacts on the poorest 20% of the community through both decreased household income and reduce access to health and other services⁹. The introduction and funding of a national Health Care for the Poor program reformed the budget process and increased the share of national funding allocated to health service delivery at provincial and district levels, which resulted in service improvement⁷.

Attraction, in-service training and retention of competent public service staff at sub-national levels is critical for sustainable and effective service delivery^{3,4}. This requires attention to human resource management issues such as fair compensation, suitable conditions of service including housing and regular in-service training. Human resource

⁷ Fehner, W. (2009) Decentralisation, administrative reform and strengthening communal self-administration in Vietnam. Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung e.V.

⁸ DLPGA and NDoH (2008) Joint Case Study of District and Facility Service Delivery Funding. Department of Provincial and Local Government Affairs, Port Moresby, PNG.

⁹ Nguyen, H. P. (2008) What is in it for the poor? Evidence from fiscal decentralization in Vietnam. MPRA Paper No. 9344. Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs, Syracuse University, USA.

management supports creativity and pro-activity by sub-national governments – something that is critical if decentralisation is to be successful. As an example, in the area of planning and management in Vietnam there is no clear mechanism that enables or encourages the provincial and district governments to be pro-active or creative. While the central administration has expertise and its national programs reflect both national concerns and the means of delivering expertise to the provinces, central administrators may not have enough local information to make decisions. Local planning and management tasks, especially at the district and commune (LLG) level, require professional expertise that should be encouraged through in-service training and incentives for pro-active and creative problem solving⁶. This highlights the importance of connecting top-down policy-making and resourcing with bottom-up planning and implementation⁴. Related to this is the role of civil society as a legitimate partner for sub-national service delivery. Experience in Vietnam emphasises the contribution that civil society can make as a partner in service delivery at local levels⁷. For example, women's groups play an active role in ante-natal care of pregnant women and communicating safe birth messages.

The role of development assistance in decentralisation

The DAC Review found that external support to decentralisation programs broadly consisted of three types of assistance¹:

- **Creating a favourable legal and political environment** – which may include technical support to develop important policies and laws, facilitation of linkages between officials from other decentralised settings, and facilitating a national dialogue.
- **Assistance to start implementation** – which may take the form of training and other capacity building support for personnel and elected officials at different levels of government. Development of the detailed regulations required in areas such as budgeting and fiscal transfers are also included in this category
- **Assistance to deepen and sustain decentralisation** – particularly where policies have not been fully implemented. Specific forms of support under this category may include assistance to help lagging sectors to better devolve, or support to civil society to deepen accountability at the local level.

Analysis of the Annual Performance Reviews for 91 DFID projects supporting decentralisation found the following factors to be important for decentralisation support activities¹⁰:

- understanding local politics and securing political commitment at the local level;
- building partnerships with partner governments at multiple levels, and with donors;
- working effectively with civil society organisations;
- managing institutional complexity by establishing sound communication and coordination practices along with opportunities to participate across levels and parts of government and NGOs.
- ensuring effective M&E by focusing on outcomes.

Lessons learned in other countries and donor evaluations identify consistent themes and good practice guidelines for decentralisation support that are presented in an internal AusAID review¹¹. In summary, these are:

¹⁰ DFID (2008) *DFID's Contribution to Decentralisation and Local Governance: A Stocktake*. Governance and Social Development Group Policy and Research Division, Department for International Development, London, UK

¹¹ AusAID (2009) *Decentralisation and sub-national government support activities – a review of development partner evaluations*. Unpublished internal review, Australian Agency for International Development. Canberra, Australia

- Development partners must better understand the full complexity of issues in decentralised/decentralising environments.
- Partner government commitment to decentralisation is critical
- Greater alignment with partner government policies, priorities and systems is necessary
- It is important to build inclusive partnerships across all levels of government.
- Focus on building capacity at both central and local levels
- Engage effectively with Civil Society
- Increase and improve the quality of harmonisation between development partners
- Enhance the quality of Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E)
- Maintain realistic expectations, flexibility and a long term view

Lessons learned and recommendations for donors and governments from the DAC review can be summarised as¹:

General

- Donors need to provide support over time in order to see results
- Central government commitment is a precondition for success
- Co-ordinate support with partner governments' policies and implementation plans
- Establish arenas for information sharing and donor co-ordination
- Support partner government in poverty orientation of programs

Support for fiscal decentralisation

- More focus on local government's own financial development and sustainability
- Support LG fiscal system in a holistic way not undermining local government's incentives to improve

Support for local accountability

- Combined support to local government and civil society groups
- Enhance local government –civil society interaction at the lowest level of the local government system
- Stimulate grassroots-based governance-building from below

Annex 2

Partnership for Development

Annex 2 - The PNG-Australia Partnership for Development

Prime Ministers Rudd and Somare signed the PNG-Australia Partnership for Development in Niue on 20 August 2008. The Partnership aims to provide better access to markets and services through improved transport infrastructure; faster progress towards universal basic education; improved health outcomes; strengthened public administration at the provincial and district levels; and improved statistical data.

The Partnership enshrines the principles of mutual respect and mutual accountability for development results, and offers the potential to reinvigorate the Australian aid program in PNG and increase its effectiveness. It commits PNG to implement its national development plans to improve governance, invest in economic infrastructure, improve health and education outcomes, and improve the effectiveness of its expenditures.

The joint PNG-Australia Development Cooperation Strategy 2006-2010, upon which the Partnership builds, emphasises joint working arrangements with both governments working together in support of agreed development priorities. The Partnership furthers this approach, committing Australia and PNG to work together towards common goals, jointly address key constraints to service delivery, and make shared resource commitments.

Annex 3

References

Annex 3: References

- AusAID Australian Government Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy 2007 – 2011 Draft Design Document August 2006
- Department of Provincial and Local Level Government Affairs (DPLGA) Guide to Services and Performance Requirements under the Provincial Performance Management Initiative (PPII) 2007
- Government Printing Office (2007) National Gazette Alteration to the Organic Law on Provincial Governments and Local Level Governments 31 October, 2007
- Department of Treasury/National Economic and Fiscal Commission (2007) National Government Goods and Services Funding to Provincial and Local Level Governments Fourth Quarter Update of 2007 Budget
- Eastern Highlands Provincial Administration Eastern Highlands Province Corporate Management Improvement Plan 2006 – 2009.
- AusAID Sub-National Strategy Research Programme Concept Paper on Focus Areas for Initial Research Programme.
- AusAID Sub-National Strategy Monitoring and Evaluation Framework Version One February 2008.
- AusAID Sub-National Strategy Quarterly Report May 2007.
- AusAID Sub-National Strategy Quarterly Report December 2007.
- Department of Provincial and Local Level Government Affairs/Department of National Planning and Monitoring Provincial Performance Improvement Initiative Eastern Highlands Monitoring Report 2007 and Recommendation for 2008 Incentive Payment.
- Department of Provincial and Local Level Government Affairs Eastern Highlands Criteria. To Remain Phase 2 Province Checklist February 2008.
- National Research Institute The Quest for Good Governance: A Survey of Literature on the Reform of Intergovernmental Relation in Papua New Guinea 2008.
- National Economic Fiscal Commission. Its More Than Numbers – Review of All Expenditure in 2006 by Provincial Governments.
- NEFC Review of Intergovernmental Financing Arrangements – Plain English Guide to the new funding system for Provincial Governments and Local Level Government 2007.
- National Research Institute Spotlight with NRI Development Issues, Policies and Trends Vol. 3 No.2 March 2009.
- Implementing Service Provider to the Sub-National Strategy “The Implementing Service Provider Model” Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid-Term Review Position Paper No.4 March 2009.
- Government of Australia and Government of Papua New Guinea Partnership For Development Between the Government of Australia and the Government of Papua New Guinea 2008.

- National Economic and Fiscal Commission of Provincial Revenues. 2004–2007 June 2008.
- National Economic and Fiscal Commission. Its More Than Numbers Review of All Expenditure in 2006 by Provincial Governments June 2008.
- National Economic and Fiscal Commission Closing The Gap Review of All Expenditure in 2007 By Provincial Governments January 2009.
- National Economic and Fiscal Commission 2009 Fiscal Report (2008).
- AusAID Sub-National Strategy Implementing Service Provider Progress Report August to December, 2008 January 2009.
- Independent State of Papua New Guinea Volume 1 Economic and Development Policies for the Year Ending 31 December 2009 November 2008.
- Public Sector Reform Management Unit Reference Handbook for Local Level Government Administration PNG. Provincial and Local Level Government Reforms ‘The Nature, Meaning and Aims of the Organic Law Reforms’ Volume 1 March 2008.
- Public Sector Reform Management Unit Reference Handbook for Local Level Government Administration Papua New Guinea Management and Administration of the Reforms at the Sub-National Level Volume 2 March 2008.
- Department of Provincial and Local Level Government Affairs.
 - Provincial and Local Level Government Service Monitoring Authority (PLLSMA) PLLSMA Sub-Committee Brief October 2008.
 - Provincial and Local Level Government Service Monitoring Authority (PLLSMA) PLLSMA Function Assignment Brief 2008.
 - Provincial and Local Level Government Service Monitoring Authority (PLLSMA).
 - Intergovernmental Relations (Function and Funding) Act 2008 Determination and Assignment of Service Delivery Functions and Responsibilities November, 2008.
 - PLLSMA Sub-Committee Brief February 2009.
 - PLLSMA Sub-Committee Brief Department of Provincial and Local Level Government Affairs Performance Monitoring Division Act Plan 2009.
 - AusAid Sub-National Strategy Quarterly Report November 2008 (Draft)
 - AusAid Sub-National Strategy Quarterly Report August 2008.
 - AusAid Sub-National Strategy Quarterly Report May 2008.
- Coffey International Development Overview of PCMC’s Provincial Co-ordination and Monitoring Committees October, 2008.
- Independent Review Group Report on Sub-National Strategy 21 – 26 July, 2008 September 2008.
- Department of Provincial and Local Level Government and National Department of Health Joint Case Study of District and Facility Service Delivery Funding Interim Summary of East New Britain Field Visit 27 – 31 October 2008.
- Department of Provincial and Local Level Government Affairs Provincial Performance Improvement Initiative District Implementation Support Team Scoping

Mission Huon gulf District – Morobe Province 24 – 27 November 2008 December 2008.

- Department of Provincial and Local Level Government Affairs S119 Reporting Format.
- AusAID Linking the Functions of the Strategic Result Areas CSRA Teams with the ENBPA Planning Budgeting Monitoring and Evaluation Processes. February 2009 (Draft).
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid-Term Review Case Study No.1: Improving the Planning and Budgeting Systems of the ENB Provincial Administration: Reflections over the last 4 years. February 2009.
- AusAID Mid-Term Review Information Paper: Incentives in PPII March 2009.
- AusAID SNS Mid-Term Review Reading Documents 2 – 20 March (Disc).
- AusAID Sub-National Strategy (SNS) Implementing Service Provider Progress Report August to December 2008 – January 2009.
- Australian Government Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy 2007 – 2011 Draft Design Document August 2006.
- AusAID Sub-National Improvement Initiative Scoping Report August 1, 2004 (Draft)
- Department of PLLGA Guide to Services and Performance Requirements under the Provincial Performance Initiative (PPII) 2007.
- DPLLGA Decentralisation Toolkit – a Brief on Papua New Guinea’s Decentralised Service Delivery System. (Part 1) September 2008. (Part 2) September, 2008.
- Department Of Provincial And Local Level Government Affairs And The National Economic Fiscal Commission. Plain English Guide To Service Delivery Functions & Responsibilities Department Of Provincial Affairs, Version 19. November, 2008.
- AusAID The Evolution Of The Sub-National Strategy (SNS) AusAID Peer Review May 2006.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy “Improving The Coherence Of Aid Delivery At The Sub-National Level: Stocktake And Options” February 2008.
- AusAID Provincial Performance Improvement Initiative PPII District Implementation Support Team Scoping Mission Huon Gulf District – Morobe Province 24–27 November 2008.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy SNS Approach To Sustained Improvements To The Delivery Of Services Through Improved Capacity Of Decentralised Governance February 2009.
- AusAid Guideline Manage The Independent Evaluation Of An Aid Activity November 2008.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid-Term Review Case Study No.3 “PPII Supporting Devolution Of HR Powers In PNG”.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid-Term Review Position Paper No.7 “The Role Of DPLGA And Other GoPNG Agencies In Capacity Building Of Sub-National Administration February 2009”
- Autonomous Region Of Bougainville Project Proposal Towards The Bougainville PPI Integrate A Extension Improvement Project 2009.

- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid-Term Review Case Study No.2 “The Sub-National Strategy In The Context Of The Decentralisation Debates” February 2009.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea SNS Position Paper – Co-Location Approach February, 2009.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid Term Review Position Paper No.1 “SNS Approach To Sustained Improvements To The Delivery Of Services Through Improved Capacity Of Decentralised Governance” February 2009.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid Term Review Case Study No.2 “PPII: A First Attempt At Using Provincial Public Financial Management Systems” February 2009.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid Term Review Case Study No.4 “Policy Process Supporting Intergovernmental Reforms” February 2009.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid Term Review Case Study No.5 “SNS Support To DPLGA To Reinvigorate PLLSMA And Establish Pcmcs” February 2009.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid Term Review Position Paper No.4 The Implementing Service Provider Model.
- AusAID Papua New Guinea Sub-National Strategy Mid Term Review Case Study No.2 The Sub-National Strategy In The Context Of The Decentralisation Debates” February 2009.
- AusAID Review Of Governance And Implementation Fund 2004–2008 Annex 1 November 2008 (Draft).
- Government Of Papua New Guinea Final Report To The National Development Summit On Papua New Guinea National Strategic Plan 2010–2050. PNG Institute Of Public Administration September 2008 (Draft).
- AusAID Decentralisation & Sub-National Government Support And Activities Review Of Development Partner Evaluations Draft 2008.

Additional references (International comparison)

- AusAID (2009) Decentralisation and sub-national government support activities – a review of development partner evaluations. Unpublished internal review, Australian Agency for International Development. Canberra, Australia
- DFID (2008) DFID’s Contribution to Decentralisation and Local Governance: A Stocktake. Governance and Social Development Group Policy and Research Division, Department for International Development, London, UK
- DLPGA and NDoH (2008) Joint Case Study of District and Facility Service Delivery Funding. Department of Provincial and Local Government Affairs, Port Moresby, PNG.
- Edquist, L. (2005) Decentralization of Educational Management in Vietnam. MA Thesis, Jönköping University, Sweden.
- Fford, A. (2003) Decentralisation in Vietnam – working effectively at provincial and local government level: A comparative analysis of Long An and Quang Ngai provinces. AusAID, Hanoi.

-
- Frehner, W. (2009) Decentralisation, administrative reform and strengthening communal self-administration in Vietnam. Konrad-Adenauer-Stiftung e.V.
 - Jutting, J., Kauffmann, C., McDonnell, I., Osterrieder, H., Pinaud, N. and Wegner, L. (2004) Decentralisation and Poverty in Developing Countries: Exploring the Impact, OECD Development Centre Working Paper No. 236, OECD, Paris
 - Nguyen, H. P. (2008) What is in it for the poor? Evidence from fiscal decentralization in Vietnam. MPRA Paper No. 9344. Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs, Syracuse University, USA.
 - OECD DAC (2006) Indicators of progress agreed at the High Level Forum on Aid Effectiveness in Paris in March 2005. Sourced March 2009 from: http://www.oecd.org/document/12/0,3343,en_21571361_39494699_39503692_1_1_1_1,00.html
 - Phuc, T. V. (2006) Decentralization and delegation during PAR process in Vietnam. Paper delivered by Minister of Home Affairs at the regional forum on reinventing government in Asia. Seoul, September 6-8, 2006.
 - World Bank (2004) Lessons learned from decentralisation of health services: a comparative analysis of Indonesia, Philippines and Vietnam. World Bank, Washington DC, USA.

Annex 4

Itinerary and stakeholders consulted

Annex 4: Itinerary and stakeholders consulted

Team One

Felecia Dobunaba (TL),
DNPM Illivi Senato (DNPM – tbc)
Michelle Lowe (AusAID) from 4th March 09
John Fargher

Team Two

Tony Land (TL),
Ben Nakin (DPLGA)
Dr Alphonse Gelu
Steve Hogg (Week One only) + Carli Shilito

Week One

Day /Time	Activities	Comments Venue	Contact Person	Day /Time	Activities	Comments Venue	Contact Person
Monday 2nd March 2009				Monday 2nd March 2009			
0830 - 1200	Review Team 1 & 2 meeting <u>Agenda</u>	Deloitte, Level 4 Kapul Room	Tom Nettleton Ph 321 6444 ext 127	AM and first part of the PM	Review Team 1 & 2 meeting <u>Agenda</u>	Deloitte, Level 4, Kapul Room	Tom Nettleton Ph 321 6444 ext 127
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Briefing - SNS team Review Team to discuss & agree on methodology 	Confirmed			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Briefing - SNS team Review Team to discuss & agree on methodology 	Confirmed	
1200 – 1300	Lunch	Susan Ferguson & Enaha Kwa meets with both teams.	Tom Nettleton Ph 321 6444 ext 127	1200 – 1300	Lunch		
		Confirm					

1300 – Continue with the Deloitte, Level 4 Tom Nettleton
 1500 Review Team 1 & 2 Kapul Room Ph 321 6444 ext 127
 meeting

Confirmed

1600 – Joint meeting with Bill Deloitte, Level 4, Tom Nettleton
 1700 Costello Minister Kapul Room Ph 321 6444 ext 127
 Counsellor, AusAID and
 Manasupe Zurenuoc Secretary DPLGA
Confirmed
(subject to CACC)

Tuesday 3rd March 2009

0830 – Meeting with Russell DPLGA Paul Bridgeman
 0930 Ikosi Deputy Secretary Secretary's Office 301 1081-
 Secretarial Services DPLGA
 DPLGA and **Confirmed** 697 8292 - Mob
 Tau Vali Deputy
 Secretary Monitoring &
 Technical DPLGA

0945 –
 1045 *Free time*

1300 - Continue with the Deloitte, Tom Nettleton
 1500 Review Team 1 & 2 Level 4 Ph 321 6444
 meeting Kapul Room ext 127

Confirmed

1500 - Joint meeting with Deloitte, Tom Nettleton
 1630 Bill Costello Level 4, Ph 321 6444
 Minister Counsellor, Kapul Room ext 127
 AusAID and
 Manasupe Zurenuoc Secretary DPLGA
Confirmed
(subject to CACC)

Tuesday 3rd March 2009

0830 – Meeting with Deloitte, Tom Nettleton
 0930 Transport sector Level 4 Kapul Ph 321 6444
 Room ext 127

Confirmed

0945 – Meeting with Deloitte, Tom Nettleton
 1045 Education sector Level 4 Kapul Ph 321 6444
 Room ext 127

Confirmed

1100	- Meeting with Julius	DPLGA -	Paul Bridgeman
1200	Wargirai Performance Monitoring Division	<i>Confirmed</i>	301 1081-DPLGA 697 8292 - Mob
1300	- Meeting with Gabriel	DPLGA	Paul Bridgeman
1430	Ngat Director Legal and Policy Division DPLGA	<i>Confirmed</i>	301 1081-DPLGA 697 8292 - Mob
1445	- Meeting with	DPLGA	Paul Bridgeman
1600	Legal/Policy Adviser, PLLSMA Adviser PPII advisers (Flying squad)	<i>Confirmed</i>	301 1081-DPLGA 697 8292 - Mob
1600	- Review Team's wrap up session	To be decided by the Review Team	Rakwa Ua, ISP 323 6623 X 123
1700	(Optional)	<i>Confirmed</i>	

Wednesday 4th March 2009

Meeting with PPII Steering and PLLSMA members

1100	- Free		
1200			
1300	- Meeting with Law & Justice sectors,	Deloitte, Level 4 Kapul Room	Tom Nettleton Ph 321 6444 ext 127
1430			
		<i>Confirmed</i>	
1445	- Meeting with ISP	ISP meeting room	Rakwa Ua, ISP
1600	Diane Barr Team Leader		323 6623 X 123
	Emmanuel Wrakuale Deputy Team Leader	<i>Confirmed</i>	
	Kate Lollback, Project Manager,		
	To discuss ISP model		
1600	Review Team's wrap up session	To be decided by the Review Team	Rakwa Ua, ISP 323 6623 X 123
1700	(Optional)	<i>Confirmed</i>	

Wednesday 4th March 2009

Meeting with Sectors

0830 0930	- Meeting with Department of National Planning and Monitoring	4 th Floor Vulupindi Haus –	John Ndremei Deputy Sec, Otto Tien, Director Provin & District Coordinator, Illivi Senato,	0830 - Meeting with Deloitte, 0930 Economic and Public Level 4 Kapul Sector Development Room	Tom/Ruth 3216444 X 127/139
		<i>Confirmed</i>		<i>Confirmed</i>	
1000 1100	- Meeting with Department of Personnel Management	2 nd Floor, Morauta Building	Raquel Painap, Deputy Sec Policy	1000 - Meeting with Health, 1100 sector	Tom/Ruth 3216444 X 127/139
		<i>Confirmed</i> <i>Cancelled</i>	(tentatively yes but subject to ISP follow up in the morning)	<i>Confirmed</i>	
1115 1200	- Meeting with Department of Prime Minister and NEC	5 th Floor, Morauta Building – tbc	ISP to confirm tomorrow morning.	1100 - Meeting with HIV/ 1200 AIDS	Tom/Ruth 3216444 X 127/139
				<i>Confirmed</i>	
1330 1430	- Meeting with Department of Finance	4 th Floor Vulupindi Haus	ISP to confirm tomorrow morning.	1330 - National Department 1430 of Transport	Enga Haus, 7 Mile
				<i>Confirmed</i>	
1445 1545	- Meeting with Department of Treasury	4 th Floor Vulupindi Haus	Simon Tosali, Secretary	1445 - National Department 1545 of Health.	Aopi Building, Waigani
				<i>Confirmed</i>	
1445 1545	- Meeting with Department of Treasury	4 th Floor Vulupindi Haus	Simon Tosali, Secretary	1600 - Free 1700	

1600 – Meeting with Dickson
 1700 Guina, Director, Capacity
 Building Division, DPLGA

Confirmed
 ISP meeting room Rakwa Ua, ISP
 323 6623 X 123

Confirmed
 (Review team
 decides on where to
 have the wrap up
 sessions after this
 meeting.)

Thursday 5 March 2009

0445 **Team 1**
 POM- Mad PX 116
 ETD 0645 ETA 0745
Passenger Lists
 Felecia Dobunaba(TL),
 Illivi Senato (DNPM)
 Michelle Lowe, AusAID
 John Fargher

Hotel shuttle bus
 for pick up and
 drop off.

Cancelled

Paul Bridgeman
 301 1081-
 DPLGA
 697 8292 - Mob

Whole Day
 Activities in Madang –
 site visits

Paul Bridgeman
 301 1081-
 DPLGA
 697 8292 - Mob

Friday 6 March 2009

Whole Day
 Activities in Madang –
 As above

Paul Bridgeman

Thursday 5 March 2009

Team 2 to travel
 POM-LAE PX 100
 ETD 0600 ETA 0645
Passenger Lists
 Tony Land (TL),
 Ben Nakin (DPLGA)
 Dr Alphonse Gelu
 Carli Shilito

Hotel shuttle bus
 for pick up and drop
 off.

Paul Bridgeman
 301 1081-
 DPLGA
 697 8292 –
 Mob

Activities in Lae
 Site visits

Geoving
 Bilong,
 Deputy PA
 Tel 4731521

Geoving
 Bilong,
 Deputy PA
 Tel 4731521

Friday 6 March 2009

PM **Team Two**
 Hotel shuttle Paul

Day	site visits ? tbc	301 DPLGA 697 8292 - Mob	1081-		Lae – POM PX 103 ETD 1315 ETA 1400	bus for pick up and drop off	Bridgeman 301 1081- DPLGA 697 8292 - Mob
-----	-------------------	--------------------------------	-------	--	---------------------------------------	------------------------------------	--

Saturday 7 March

0700- 0730	Team 1 MAD/POM PX 111 ETD 0930- ETA 1030	Hotel shuttle bus for pick up and drop off
---------------	---	--

Team Two free

Sunday 8th March 2009

Flight to Alotau. Hotel shuttle bus
Departing POM at 0600 for pick up &
am drop off Jimmy Morona
Ph: 641 1248
678 7685 Mob

Sunday 8th March 2009

AM Team wrap up Crowne Plaza

Confirmed

Passenger Lists
Felecia Dobunaba(TL),
Illivi Senato
Michelle Lowe
John Fargher

Confirmed

Clyde H
[678 3101](#)
B Mobile

Team One

Felecia Dobunaba (TL),
Illivi Senato (DNPM)
Michelle Lowe (AusAID)

Team Two

Tony Land (TL),
Ben Nakin (DPLGA)
Dr Alphonse Gelu

John Fargher

Carli Shilito

Week Two

Day /Time	Activities	Comments	Contact Person	Day /Time	Activities	Comments	Contact Person
Monday 9 th March 2009				Monday 9 th March 2009			
	Activities in Alotau	Refer to SNS Co-located officers for provincial program	Jimmy Morona Ph: 641 1248 678 7685 Mob Clyde H 678 3101 B Mobile	0400 - 0430	Vanimo, Sandaun POM/Vai PX 142 0600/0835 <u>Passenger Lists</u> Tony Land (TL), Ben Nakin (DPLGA) Dr Alphonse Gelu Carli Shilito	Hotel shuttle bus for pick up & drop off	
				PM	Vanimo - Activities to be advised		James Ogia, PPII Adviser Mob: 654 2689 Ph: 857 1200
Tuesday 10 th March 2009				Tuesday 10 th March 2009			
	Activities in Alotau	Refer to SNS Co-located officers for provincial program.	Jimmy Morona Ph: 641 1248 678 7685 Mob Clyde H 678 3101		Vanimo	Activities in Vanimo	James Ogia, PPII Adviser Mob: 654 2689 Ph: 857 1200

B Mobile

Activities in Vanimo Site
visitsActivities in
VanimoJames Ogia,
PPII Adviser

Mob: 654 2689

Ph: 857 1200

Wednesday 11th March 2009Activities in Alotau
Site visitsRefer to SNS Co-
located officers for
provincial
program.Jimmy Morona
Ph: 641 1248
678 7685 MobClyde H
678 3101
B MobileWednesday 11th March 2009

Vanimo

Activities in
VanimoJames Ogia,
PPII Adviser

Mob: 654 2689

Ph: 857 1200

Return from Vanimo
VAI/POM PX 143
ETD 1505 ETA 1740Hotel shuttle
bus for pick
up & drop
offThursday 12th March 2009

AM

Return from Alotau
GUR-POM PX 155
ETD 0820 ETA0910Hotel shuttle bus
for pick up & drop
offThursday 12th March 200908.30
0930Democratic Governance
(Leonie Whyte & two
others from the DG
section)AusAID
Conference
Room, AHC
ConfirmedTom Nettleton
Ph 321 6444 ext
1270930-
1045Meeting with Peter
CoventryAusAID
Conference
Room, AHCTom Nettleton
Ph 321 6444 ext
127**Confirmed**

				1045-1200	Meeting with Soli Middleby,	AusAID Conference Room, AHC	Tom Nettleton Ph 321 6444 ext 127
				<i>Confirmed</i>			
1300-1430	Meeting with NEFC	NEFC room	meeting	George Salvenera 693 3096 Dr Nao Badu	1300 - Meeting with Central Province(<i>Cancelled</i>)	Central Province Headquarters	Colin Wiltshire Arilla Haro
1500 - 1600	Meeting with CACC	PM & NEC		Tom Nettleton 6513535	1500-1600 Meeting with CACC	PM & NEC <i>Confirmed</i>	Tom Nettleton 6513535
Friday 13 th March 2009				Friday 13 th March 2009			
Review Teams 1 & 2 meeting at ISP – ISP Meeting Room				Rakwa Ua, ISP 323 6623 X 123	Review Teams 1 & 2 meeting at ISP – ISP Meeting Room		Rakwa Ua, ISP 323 6623 X 123
<i>Confirmed</i>				<i>Confirmed</i>			
1400- 1500	Meeting with Bill Costello			Deloitte Level 4, Torosel Room	1400- 1500 Meeting with Bill Costello – Deloitte Level 4, Torosel Room		Deloitte Level 4, Torosel Room
<i>Confirmed</i>				<i>Confirmed</i>			
1500-1630	Meeting with Linda Kelly (telephone hook-up), Richard Slattery & Kathy Whimp			Deloitte Level 4, Torosel Room +675 3216444 ext 112	1500-1630 Meeting with Linda Kelly (telephone hook-up), Richard Slattery & Kathy Whimp		Deloitte Level 4, Torosel Room +675 3216444 ext 112
<i>Confirmed</i>				<i>Confirmed</i>			

Team One Felecia Dobunaba (TL), Illivi Senato (DNPM) Michelle Lowe (AusAID) John Fargher	Team Two Tony Land (TL), Ben Nakin (DPLGA) Dr Alphonse Gelu Carli Shilito
---	--

Week Three

Day /Time	Activities	Comments	Contact Person	Day /Time	Activities	Comment	Contact Person
				Sunday 15th March 2009			
				1200 -	Travel to Rabaul	Hotel	
				1230	POM/RAB PX 274	Shuttle	
					ETD 1455 ETA 1620		
					<u>Passenger Lists</u>	Confirmed	
					Tony Land (TL),		
					Ben Nakin (DPLGA)		
					Dr Alphonse Gelu		
Monday 16th March 2009				Monday 16 March 2009			
0500	- Flight to Buka	Refer to	Roselyn		Full day in Rabaul -	Refer to	Dorothy
0530	POM/BUA PX 218	SNS Co-	Kenneth		Activities	SNS Co-	Luana
	ETD0700/ETA1050	located	Ph 9739222			located	Ph: 9829198
	<u>Passenger Lists</u>	officers for	6504067 Mob			officers for	6903540
	Felecia Dobunaba(TL),	provincial				provincial	Mob
	Illivi Senato (DNPM)	program.				program	

Whole Day	Review Team One and Two meeting	Deloitte, Level 4
-----------	---------------------------------	-------------------

Kapul Room				Kapul Room			
<i>Confirmed</i>				<i>Confirmed</i>			
Friday 20th March 2009				Friday 20th March 2009			
0900 - Combine debrief by Deloitte, Tom 1200 Team 1 and Team 2 Level 4 Nettleton Kapul Room Ph 321 6444 <i>Confirmed</i> ext 127				0900 - Combine debrief by Deloitte, Tom 1200 Team 1 and Team 2 Level 4 Nettleton Kapul Room Ph 321 6444 <i>Confirmed</i> ext 127			
1300-1500 Aide Memoire Gateway Tom presentation by Hotel Nettleton Review Teams 1&2 <i>Confirmed</i> Ph 321 6444 <i>Confirmed</i> ext 127				1300- Aide Memoire Gateway Tom 1500 presentation by Review Hotel Nettleton Teams 1&2 <i>Confirmed</i> Ph 321 6444 <i>Confirmed</i> ext 127			
1500-1630 Debrief Session Venue: tbc Review Team SNS Team & Bill Costello <i>Confirmed</i>				1500- Debrief Session Venue: tbc 1630 Review Team SNS Team & Bill Costello <i>Confirmed</i>			

List of Persons met

<u>AusAID Port Moresby (including managing contractors and SNS advisors)</u>	
<u>Name</u>	<u>Designation</u>
Bill Costello	Minister Counselor, AusAID
Joanne Choe	SNS, Program Manager
Romias Waki	Deputy Director, SNS
Tom Nettleton	First Secretary, SNS
Steve Hogg	ADG OPS
Cedric Soldhana	Former adviser to AusAID on SNS
Keith Joyce	First Secretary, Transport sector
Pam Griffith	
Tony Partridge	TSSP
Andrea Cole	
Chris Graham	Second Secretary, Education Sector
Wendy Gilson	ECBP
Simon Ellis	BEDP
Justice Gua	Provincial Engagement Advisor, Law and Justice Sector Program
Gabriel Kubul,	Snr Program Officer, Law and Justice Sector Program
Stephen Mokis	Provincial Engagement Advisor, Law and Justice Sector Program
Warren Turner	AusAID, Economic and Public Sector Management Sector
David Mean	Program Director Economic Public Sector Program
Lucy Tia	AusAID, Economic and Public Sector Management Sector
Andrew Lepani	UNDP – representative of PCAP project
Cornelius Rocha	AusAID, Economic and Public Sector Management Sector
Peta Leeman	Health Section
Jessie Belcher	Health Section
Fiona Cornwell	Counselor, Service Delivery Section
	Program Director, CBSC
Donna-Jean Nicholson	HIV/AIDS Sector
Abraham Opito	AusAID HIV/AIDS Adviser
Ninkana Moiya	AusAID HIV/AIDS Adviser
Kath Taplin	Democratic Governance Section
Urgei Akon	Democratic Governance Section

Leonie Whyte	Democratic Governance Section
Sarah McCana	Democratic Governance Section
Peter Coventry	AusAID, High Commission
Susan Fergusson	Gender Advisor AusAID
Enaha Kua	Gender Advisor, SNS
Dianne Barr	Team Leader, SNS Implementing Service Provider (ISP)
Emmanuel Wrakuale	Deputy Team Leader (ISP)
Wanda Powell	Human Resource Manager (ISP)
Rakwa Ua	Project Co-ordinator (ISP)
Anelta Taula	Travel Officer (ISP)
Kathy Whimp	Strategic Management Advisor Intergovernmental Policy.
Solstice Middleby	Former Programme Director, SNS
Richard Slattery	Advisor, SNS/Education/Democratic Governance.
Linda Kelly	SNS M&E Advisor
<u>GoPNG NATIONAL DEPARTMENTS</u>	
<u>Name</u>	<u>Designation</u>
Manasupe Zurenouc	Secretary, DPLGA
Russell Ikosi	Deputy Secretary Policy, DPLGA
Tau Vali	Deputy Secretary Operations, DPLGA
Julius Wargirai	Director Monitoring and Evaluation Division, DPLGA
Dickson Guina	Director Capacity Building Division, DPLGA
Saba Retnasaba	Performance Management Advisor, DPLGA
Miriam Midire	HRM Advisor, DPLGA
John Piel	Finance Advisor, DPLGA
John Simango	Human Resources Advisor, DPLGA
Simon Tosali	Secretary, Department of Treasury
Joseph Lelang	Secretary Department of National Planning & Monitoring
Bill Kua	Director, PSRMU
Joseph Sukianomb	PSRMU
Tony Keket	PSRMU
Mollie Daure	Deputy Secretary, DCD
Ricky Kumung	PLLSMA, Implementation Advisor, DPLGA
Felecity Herbert	Policy Advisor, DPLGA
Dr. Nao Badu	Chairman, NEFC

George Selveneva	Strategic Management Advisor, NEFC
Ellison ToWollom	A/Director, National Co-ordination Office for Bougainville Affairs.
Camilus Midire	General Manager, PNGSDP
Joshua Nawara	Planner, Integrated Transport Planning, Nat Transport Department
Morea Lohia	Principal Policy & Research Officer, Nat Transport Department
Philemon Meapa	Snr. Policy Research Officer, Nat Transport Department
Dr. Clement Malau	Secretary, National Department of Health
Development Partners	
Mel Jones	Program Manager EU
Gillian Brown	Snr. Social Development Specialist, World Bank
Roberto Cecutti	First Secretary, Delegation European Commission
<u>MILNE BAY PROVINCE GOVERNMENT</u>	
<u>Name</u>	<u>Designation</u>
Jean-Luc Critten	Governor, Milne Bay Provincial Government
Henry Bailasi	Provincial Administrator, MBP
Richard Kawana	Division of Health
Tawa TArarau	Provincial Planner
Michael Kape	Provincial Advisor, LLG Affairs
Allen Jonathan	Caretaker Manager, Works Unit
Siemu Bate	HIV Response Co-ordinator, MBPAC
Wilson Lote	PA Law of Order
Rachael Ou	Acting Manager (HRM)
Maxiner Nadile	Manager, Milne Bay Tourism Bureau
Michael Ova	Principal Advisor, Education
Leki Romale	A/Principal Advisor, Division Agric & Livestock
Bobby Baloiloi	Provincial Advisor, Lands
Thomas Pilai	District Administrator, Esa'ala
Ben Bagita	Manager, Finance and Administration
Sedrick Noel	A/Principal Advisor
Sunema Manoa Bagita	Principal Advisor – Community Development
Nimrod Mark	Director Governance and Community Development
Chris Sionwai	Planning Officer
Phil Tabua	Planning Officer
Sharon Mua	Planning Officer

Gune Senavath	Finance Advisor
Gerega Kila	A/Dept. Administration, Corporate
Roma Tuidam	Secondary/TVET Liaison Officer
Esuva Puele	Primary Schools Liaison Officer/BEDPMBP Co-ordinator
Tirah Cyprian	Elementary Schools Liaison Officer
Penias Tobewa	Headmaster, East Cape Primary School
Jeffrey Sivelaki	Appointment Officer
Peter Barnabas	SDA, MBP
Pastor Ledimo Edoni	United Church, MBP
	Bishop, United Church, MBP
Sima Koupere	Milne Bay Counselling
Ofara Petilani	Milne Bay Church Development Fund Association.
Rev. Clyde Igara	Anglican Church, Alotau
David Mitchell	Conservation International
Leslie Benua	Anglican Church, Alotau
Sebastian Miyoni	Mango (CSO)
Jeffrey Abel	President MBP Chamber of Commerce
John Silcox	Vice President MBP Chamber of Commerce
Clyde Hamilton	Development Specialist, MBP (AusAid)
Jimmy Mirou	Senior Program Officer (AusAid)
AUTONOMOUS REGION OF BOUGAINVILLE	
<u>Name</u>	<u>Designation</u>
Patrick Koles	A/Chief Administrator, ARB Provincial Administration
Raymond Masono	Deputy Administrator – Policy
Puara Kamariki	A/Deputy Administration – Operations
Leslie Iseraba	CEO – Planning
John Kolan	A/CEO – Technical Services
Stephen Burain	CEO – Mining
Kapeatu Puaria	A/CEO – Autonomy
Chris Siriosi	CEO – Law & Justice
Sam Gagau	CEO – Human Resource Development
	A/CEO – Local Level Government
Michael Metten	A/CEO – Education
Jobson Misang	A/CEO – Veteran Affairs

John Karai	CEO – Finance & Treasury
Anthony Ropa	Regional Treasurer
Dr Cyril Imako	CEO – Buka Hospital
Albert Kinani	A/CEO – Commerce
Peter Siana	Chief Tax Collector
Ephraim Eminoni	Special Projects Officer
Peter Auko	Senior Planner
Jim Jansen	Executive Manager – Torokina
Joycelin Tsiamalili	GIF Program Co-ordinator
Wesley Kenneth	UNDP
Murray Lewis	NZ Police
Raewyn Tretheway	LJSP
Ludovick Shirima	Budget & Planning Advisor
Mark Smith	Taxation & Revenue Advisor
James Biscoe	Economic Development Advisor
Stan Basiou	Procurement & Contract Management Advisor
Edwina Betts	Development Specialist, ABG (AusAid)
Roslyn Kenneth	Senior Program Officer, ABG (AusAid)
MOROBE PROVINCE	
Weti Zozingao	PPA, Fisheries
M. Yarding	Dep. PPA, Health Division
Kerry Boeara	Internal Auditor
Carole Pinggah	Provincial Finance Manager (Acting)
Sheila Harou	As. Deputy PA (District Administration)
Amet Fongenmale	PPA, Community Development
Amos Buieba	Food Coordinator, DAL
Robin Calistus	Special Duties Officer, PA's office
Ludwig Peka	Acting PPA, Sports, Culture, Tourism
Robin Kiki	Project officer, MNRE
Jonah Matthews	Acting DA, Nawneb District
Nicholas Abraham	Acting Senior Planner, Planning Division
Buids Botikie	Acting DA, Lae District
Aaron Anbang	District Officer in charge, Huon District
Ottu Giria	Acting PPA, DAL

Bohage Bebinabo	District Administrator, Markham
Murika Bihoro	PPA, Education
Geoving Bilong	Acting DPA-Corporate Affairs, Administration Office
	Lae District Youth Council
	Umu-Kamit Community Development Association

SANDAUN PROVINCE

James Ogia	PPII Corporate Plan Implementation Adviser
Paul Nengai	Exec Officer, PA
Henry Norm	Deputy PA, Districts/LLGs
Rose Uri	Provincial HIV/AIDS Coordinator
Julie Kai	Community Development Adviser
Adolf Kajir	Provincial Education Adviser
Henry Norm	Deputy PA (Responsible for Districts and LLGs)
Tobias Welly	Deputy PA, Policy
Bonny Kawat	Provincial Planner
Ambrose Sikre	Provincial Budget Officer
Desak Drolit	Provincial Health Adviser
Binus Naugre	Treasury
Jack Ambasi	Finance Inspector
Conrad Tilau	District Administrator Telefomin
Lou Badui	District Administrator Vanimo
Simon Amo	Parliamentary Services Adviser
Peter Aibung	A/g Head of Division – Works and Technical Services
Grace Ina	PPII Administration
Eugen Raire	Human Resources Officer
Danny Welly	Liquor Licensing Officer
Godfried Yawi	Asset Management Officer
Roselyn Rodney	Admin support to the Provincial Planner
Moses Kempa	Transport Officer (EO to Prov Land Transport Board)
Desmond Viruri	Senior Revenue Officer
Joseph Naiso	Revenue Officer (Traffic)
Seith Yapriha	Provincial Statistics Officer
Daniel Waranduo	Provincial Lands Officer
Andrew Moinbi	Materials Supply Officer, Education
Francis Mason	Provincial Appointments Officer (education)

Daniel Yaman	Inspector, Technical and Vocational Education
Bertha Kavavore	Representative of Nurses' Association
Lawrence Walemi	President of Public Employees' Association
Francis Petos	Representative from Caritas
Pr Samuel Gedesa	Pastor for Assemblies of God
Pr Robin Kumblao	Com Dev Chairman of the PEC
Clement Tumana	Provincial Agriculture Adviser

EAST BRITAIN PROVINCE	NEW
--------------------------------------	------------

Alphonse Bera	PPII Budget & Expenditure Adviser
Carolyn Mom	PPII HR Adviser
Dorothy Luana	Co-located Officer ENB
Akuila Tubal	Provincial Administrator
Matalau Nakikus	Director, Corporate Affairs
Bernard Lukara	Dep. Administrator, Policy Planning & Evaluation
Clement Irasua	Dep. Administrator, Coordination & Implementation
Ephraim Rainui	Adviser, Finance & Revenue
Blaise Magaga	Adviser, Environment (DPI)
Christine Masiu	Adviser, Community Development Adviser
Mary Dadatliu	Adviser, Lands Division
Allan Tovue	Adviser, Technical services Division
Fidelis Bola	Adviser, Health Division
Wesley Pagot	Adviser, Human Resources
Aaron Maramun	Adviser, LLG
Pius Gawi	Adviser, Education
Mary Dadatliu	Adviser, Lands
Elias Babate	Disaster Representative
Xystus Kinala	Snr. Planner
Molly Waninara	Planner
Saireen Enos	Budget Officer

Marakan Uvano	Snr. Planner
Wilson Matava	Member of Original PPII Team / District Administrator, Rabaul
Levi Mano	Member of Original PPII Team / Adviser, Planning & Research
Peter Peniat	District Administrator, Kokopo
Stanley Maroro	District Administrator, Gazelle
Steven Tamti	Provincial Treasurer

Relly Manning	Business Women
Lady Tololo	Women's leader
Darusilla Namaliu	Women's leader
Simon Pasingan	Community representative
Rosemary Sovek	Business Women
Max Inia	Field Workers Association representative
Theresa Arek	Pacific Spice Ltd
Rusiana Teko	Pila Pila Community representative
Alice Pawa	Community Development
Sir Ronald Tovue	Provincial Spokesmen, Leader
James Agi	United Church Health Services
Steven Auri	Provincial AIDS Committee
Ruby Matane	Grace Counseling
Elizabeth Konmil	Dove Center
Moses Boganori	Catholic Health Services

Annex 5

Terms of reference for MTR

Annex 5: Terms of reference for MTR

1. Context

SNS is a program of the Australian Government that seeks to contribute to improved service delivery in PNG through support for the GoPNG program of decentralized government. SNS also seeks to contribute to the improvement of the Australian government program in PNG through support for and engagement with the wider AusAID program in PNG.

The review will focus upon the achievement and functioning of SNS and the degree to which it has been able to fulfil these twin objectives. The review will explore the functioning and achievements of many areas of the GoPNG work in order to understand the nature of what has been able to be achieved with SNS support.

2. Objectives

The purpose of the MTR is to provide all stakeholders with a clear assessment of the progress and value of the SNS program.

- Accountability: To provide stakeholders with an assessment of the effectiveness and efficiency of SNS to date¹²
- Program Improvement: To Provide stakeholders with insight into possible further development of SNS

3. Scope

The scope of the review will focus on four major areas:

(a) Review of achievements and outcomes to date¹³

SNS and the preceding pilot, SNI have sought to make a contribution to service delivery through three main areas of work. These are:

- Support for improvement of sub-national administration. This has included the PPII program and also other programs such as support to the autonomous region of Bougainville.
- Support for sections of the GoPNG that have been concerned with sub-national governance. In particular this has included work with various divisions within DPLGA and also significant support for the work of NEFC and NRI.
- Working with and informing other AusAID sectors and programs in PNG so that they are better able to respond to service delivery challenges at the Sub-National level.

MTR scope

1. The MTR review is expected to draw upon the existing evidence base and undertake some additional validation and checking of this evidence to identify the key achievements and outcomes (either positive or negative) across these three work areas since the inception of the program (that is since the commencement of the SNI).

¹² The review gives particular attention to the AusAID key quality indicators, that is efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, relevance, gender, analysis and learning and M&E. Attention to each of these will be noted throughout the TOR.

¹³ In quality terms this refers to the effectiveness of the SNS program

2. In addition, as far as possible the MTR is expected to provide some comment on the degree to which outcomes and achievements within these three work areas have made a contribution to improved service delivery in PNG.
3. The review team is asked to consider the scope of SNS support through PPII and special case provinces (that is which provinces receive assistance and what form that assistance takes) and the degree to which poverty and disadvantage are addressed through this current scope
4. Finally the MTR is expected to recommend how the support provided by SNS can be better positioned and developed in order to support the achievement of further and improved outcomes for the future.

(b) Review of mechanism and systems to implement SNS¹⁴

SNS has employed a range of particular implementation mechanism. In particular these include:

- Co-located AusAID officers
- An incentive system (within the PPII program)
- Use of government systems for implementation and assessment across the program
- Direct AusAID management together with the support of an implementing service provider.
- Use of TA as the major instrument of a capacity development approach.
- An M&E system which is focused upon selected outcomes and process

MTR scope

1. The MTR is expected, as far as possible to identify the degree to which each of these systems individually or in combination have influenced the negative and positive outcomes of SNS to date.
2. The review is also expected to provide comment and recommendations on how these and any other implementation mechanisms could be further developed for the future of SNS.

(c) Comparison with international best practice¹⁵

In line with the twin objectives of this review, to both provide accountability about the progress of SNS and also seek to improve the program, the review is expected to undertake a comparison of SNS with the available examples and information about comparable programs of donor support to decentralized service delivery in other locations.

In addition, the review is expected to consider the approach and implementation of SNS in light of the commitments made by the Australia Government to the Accra Agenda for Action.

MTR scope

1. While it is appreciated that there are few completely similar examples available, the review team are expected to draw on the international experience to highlight relevant points of information or comparison that inform and challenge the further development of the SNS program.
2. In light of this comparison how realistic are the current objectives and scope of SNS?

¹⁴ This area of focus directly address the efficiency and relevance of the SNS program

¹⁵ This area of focus addresses the quality indicators of analysis and learning and also of sustainability.

3. In light of this comparison the review team is expected to recommend how the SNS program could develop or change its approach and strategies in order to better meet the program goal and purpose.

(d) Recommendations on how SNS can respond effectively to both PNG and Australian Government direction

Decentralization in PNG remains a work in progress and it will be critical that SNS is positioned to respond effectively to the evolving context of decentralized service delivery. This can and will include major reforms such as the new intergovernmental financing systems as well as Government direction to improve service delivery capacity at the District Level.

MTR scope

1. How flexible is the SNS to respond to changing and evolving Government of PNG policy on decentralized service delivery?
2. Analysis should focus on considering key developments in GoPNG policy context, such as the increased focus on the districts as a key level of government for service delivery.
3. What recommendations can the review team make for SNS in order that it might best support service delivery improvements with a fluid policy context.

4. TEAM COMPOSITION

Independent Consultants

Three Independent consultants will lead the team with complementary skills in decentralization, capacity building, use of GoPNG systems, and Monitoring and Evaluation. Specifically:

1. They will contribute specialist knowledge and technical understanding in the areas of sub national governance structures and approaches to capacity building.
2. Two will act as (co) team leaders by providing leadership and assuming overall responsibility for the whole review. In this shared role will be responsible for the final report although various sections will be contributed by other team members under their direction.
3. Be responsible to AusAID for the overall conduct and management of the review including appropriate engagement with all team members, appropriate presentation of the review purpose and scope and appropriate engagement with review participants
4. Be responsible for the rigor of the overall review and the application of appropriate methodological inquiry to each area of the MTR focus. The M&E consultant will be expected to ensure that the findings and recommendation of the team are evidence based and that the analysis and presentation of that evidence is clearly presented in the final report. The M&E specialist will contribute significantly to the final report preparation in terms of these methodological matters.

Government of PNG representatives

In addition to DNPM a representative from DPLGA and the National Research Institute will join the team.

- The DNPM representative will play the key Government liaison role and provide the PNG context on Aid effectiveness. They will play a critical role assessing the implementation of the PNG Commitment on Aid Effectiveness through SNS.
- The DPLGA representative will assist the team understand the role and history of DPLGA as well as clarify issues around PPII and PLLSMA.

- The representative from the National Research Institute will be selected from the decentralization program and will play a critical role in advise the team on issues relating to the decentralized system of governance in PNG

The GoPNG representatives are expected to contribute substantially to the evidence base and analysis undertaken by the team. They may contribute directly to some areas of the review report but are expected to be consulted fully in preparation and drafting of the report.

AusAID Representatives

The role of the AusAID representatives is to provide AusAID's corporate perspective and information to the review. The representatives will be selected on the basis of their knowledge of the PNG program and the history of the development of SNS, the agencies work on use of partner government systems and corporate issues relating to co-location and the Implementing Service Provider model. They will also play a critical role assisting the team to assess internal AusAID coherence issues as well as development effectiveness and international best practice issues.

TEAM ONE		TEAM TWO	
Felicia Dobunaba TEAM LEADER	Independent Consultant	Tony Land TEAM LEADER	Independent Consultant
John Fargher	Independent Consultant	Dr Alphonse Gelu	National Research Institute (NRI)
TBC	DNPM Representative	Ben Nakin	DPLGA Representative
Michelle Lowe	AusAID Representative	Steve Hogg (1 wk only) + Carli Shilito	AusAID Representative

5. TIMING

The review will be undertaken over a three week period from the 2nd to the 20th of March 2009. With 5 days desk review for the independent consultants (includes review of concept papers and preparation of international best practice material) allowed prior to the review and an additional month to analyze the data, consult with the entire team and then draft the report. A further 10 days will be allowed to finalize the report following AusAID and GoPNG comments.

	Team 1	Team 2
Week One	Review Team Briefing (1 Day) DPLGA, PLLSMA, PPII (2 days)	Review Team Briefing (1 Day) Sectors and ISP (2 days) Preparatory Morobe (2 days)
Week Two	Phase Two Milne Bay (3 days) NEFC (1 day) Review (1 day)	Phase One Sandaun (3 days) NEFC (1 day) Review (1 day)
Week Three	Special Case	Phase Two

	Bougainville (3 days) Review Team Discussion and Debrief and Steering Committee (2 Day)	East New Britain (3 days) Review Team Discussions and Steering Committee Debrief (2 Day)
--	---	--

6. Reporting Requirements

- The Review Team to agree on the evaluation methodology and plan by COB Tuesday 3 March
- Short Aide Memoire submitted by 20 March 2009
- Draft report by 20 April 2009
- Final Report 10 days after receiving AusAID and GoPNG comments on the draft

The report will be no longer than 30 pages exclusive of annexes. Most of the detailed data and analysis of data is expected to be presented within the annexes.

7. Methodology

The methodological approach for the MTR is expected to use a mixture of data sources across multiple locations and stakeholder groups. This provides important opportunity to both understand situation within their context (e.g. Why change in one province is significant yet the same change elsewhere would be less important) and also to triangulate the major findings and theme. It is expected that the review will generate a rich field of qualitative and quantitative data and that the team will need to undertake ongoing analysis of this data as it is collected as well as having sufficient time after field work to undertake detailed and adequate data interpretation, analysis and presentation. The methodology as proposed below will draw upon existing material, research undertaken prior to the review (specifically designed to contribute to the review) and direct data gathering and validation by the review team.

Review Focus areas	Proposed data collection process and sample		
Review of achievements and outcomes to date.	For the first area of focus, it is proposed that the team splits its consultations as follows. Clearly these visits will also be an opportunity for the teams to collect data about the second and third focus areas as required.		
		Team one	Team Two
	(i) Sub-National	Preparatory, Phase two provinces, Special Case	Preparatory, Phase one & two
	(ii) National	DPLGA, PLLSMA, PPII, NEFC	NEFC
1. Support for improvement of sub-national administration. This has included the PPII	(iii) AusAID Programs	Central and Line Agencies in which AusAID Operate	Other AusAID Programs Other Donors
	Data collection processes for this area will include: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Review of existing documentation 2. Review and interrogation of concept papers (currently under preparation) 		

<p>program and also other programs such as support to the autonomous region of Bougainville.</p>	<p>3. Program of provincial visits with the following inclusions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Courtesy call on Governor/PA • Incoming brief with PMT and short focus group session • Individual interviews with Co-located staff/Advisers • Individual interviews with supported functions (usually planning, budgeting, HR) • Focus Group with selected Sector managers/District Administrators (if required on top of PMT) • Individual interviews with other AusAID programs/ supported NGOs / other donors etc in the province (CBST, PCAB, etc) • Interviews with Provincial Aids Committee, chamber of commerce, women's council or others as appropriate • Initial Briefing from DPLGA contact officer
<p>2. Support for sections of the GoPNG that have been concerned with sub-national governance. In particular this has included work with various divisions within DPLGA and also significant support for the work of NEFC.</p>	<p>Data collection processes for this area will include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review of existing documentation • Review and interrogation of the case study papers (currently under preparation). • Interviews with <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Key officials from the relevant agencies of DPLGA, DNP, NEFC and NRI b. provincial administration c. With key GoPNG departments that engage with PPII and PLLSMA. These would include central agencies such as DPM, Treasury and Finance as well as line agencies such as Health, transport Education and PSRMU.
<p>3. Work with other AusAID sectors and programs in PNG to so that they are better able to respond to service delivery challenges at the Sub-National level.</p>	<p>Data collection processes for this area will include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review of existing documentation • Interviews with AusAID program staff from other sectors • Interviews with AusAID implementing agencies in the provinces and also in POM. That is managing contractors and advisors. The aim would be to understand the practical difference experienced by programs as a result of cooperation or contact with SNS. • One piece of research undertaken prior to the review. This would be a review of all design and reviews and strategy papers developed in the past two years to identify the way in which these documents have reflected an understanding and response to the GoPNG decentralisation approach. Would be undertaken by an independent researcher prior to the arrival of the review team and made available to the team as part of their data collection process.
<p>Review of mechanism and systems to implement SNS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Co-located AusAID officers 	<p>Data collection:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Interrogation of the concept paper (currently under preparation) 2. Comparison with international practice 3. Interviews with provincial administrative staff and other provincial stakeholders

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An incentive system (within the PPII program) 	<p>Data collection:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Research undertaken in advance which would track how the PPII money has been used in each PPII province. For what purpose, how it complements the wider budget of the province, what has it enabled the province to achieve, both in actual services but also in terms of reorientating their administration to better service delivery (how it has been used for capacity building for example or as an internal incentive). 2. Interviews with provincial administrative staff. 3. Interviews with DPLGA and other GoPNG departments about the program.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Use of government systems for implementation and assessment across the program 	<p>Data collection:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Interrogation of the concept paper on SNS Theory of change 2. Comparison to international literature and experience 3. Interviews with wider AusAID program and also with GoPNG departments.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Direct AusAID management together with the support of an implementing service provider 	<p>Data collection</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Interrogation of the concept paper (currently being prepared) 2. Comparison with more traditional AusAID approaches on the basis of costs, personnel required, availability of skill mix, flow and management of information. 3. Interviews with ISP, GoPNG departments including DPLGA and NEFC and also with AusAID senior management.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extensive use of TA under a capacity development approach 	<p>Data collection:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Consideration of best practice and current SNS practice in comparison with this. 2. Interviews with key provincial and other departmental staff to explore the effective development of capacity through the program. 3. Interrogation of the concept paper on capacity building (under preparation). 4. Consideration of achievement versus costs and sustainability, undertaken through interviews and also quantitative data as prepared by the ISP on TA costs.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A broad based M&E systems which focuses on selected outcome areas as well as process 	<p>Data collection:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Review of available M&E reports in light of best practice and wider examples.

Comparison with international best practice

In line with the twin objectives of this review, to both provide accountability about the progress of SNS and also seek to improve the program, the review is expected to undertake a comparison of SNS with the available examples and information about comparable programs of donor support to decentralised service delivery in other locations.

While it is appreciated that there are few completely similar examples available, the review team are expected to draw on the international experience to highlight relevant points of information or comparison that inform and challenge the further development of the SNS program.

data collection:

1. Interrogation of concept papers
2. Review team preparation and analysis in particular in the areas of :
 - a. Decentralised government systems and service delivery
 - b. The commitments made by the Australian Government at Accra
 - c. Working through partner government systems
 - d. Co-location of donor government staff
 - e. Specialist areas related to these including:
 - i. Gender
 - ii. M&E
 - iii. HIV/AIDS