



Aid Program Performance Report 2013-14

Pakistan

September 2014

Key Messages

- Strong progress was made in supporting the delivery of health and education services, particularly for women and girls, which provide the building blocks for Pakistan's prosperity and stability. Investments in agriculture also had strong results, however greater attention is required to maximise the impact of agricultural productivity gains and expand pro-poor value chains. More focused investments are also required to boost trade, private sector development and women's empowerment, building on gains made in human development.
- Investing resources in influencing Pakistan's reform efforts enabled Australian's aid program to be catalytic and influential in 2013-14. This policy engagement, which is critical to the success of our aid investments, will continue to be a strong focus of our work in 2014-15.
- > Pakistan has a very challenging security environment, which impacted on the development outcomes of Australian aid and how DFAT managed its investments in 2013-14.
- In 2013-14 the Pakistan program began transitioning to give effect to the Australian Government's development policy and performance framework for the Australian aid program. Australian aid to Pakistan will focus on two strategic priorities:
 - 1. Generating economic growth and employment through increased trade and improvements in agriculture and industry; and
 - 2. Investing in Pakistan's people through health and education.
- Strong progress was made streamlining and improving program management and quality in 2013-14, to ensure Australia's aid program in Pakistan is delivering value for money and results. Further work is now required to increase our management efficiency by consolidating the Pakistan program to focus on fewer, larger investments.

Context

Pakistan faces immense development challenges and is a complex operating environment. The economy has not fully recovered from the aftermath of the global financial crisis, with only modest economic growth, persistently high inflation and a rise in formal unemployment. Insecurity and significant human displacement continues to undermine Pakistan's stability and development, particularly in provinces bordering Afghanistan where economic and human development indicators are amongst the poorest in the country. ²

 $^{^{}m 1}$ World Bank (2013), Rethinking Development Policy Choices: Contributions to the Emerging Agenda

 $^{^{\}rm 2}$ Pakistan MDGs – Report 2013, Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan.

At almost 200 million people, Pakistan is the sixth most populous country and is expected to grow to almost 300 million by 2050. It needs to create about 1.5 million new jobs per year – double the current rate – to prevent further rises in formal unemployment.³ Agriculture is a critical sector in this regard, accounting for almost 21% of the national GDP and 45% of Pakistan's labour force.⁴ However, agricultural output is decelerating, with constraints including access to assets (land, capital and water), weak research and development, and poor service delivery and water management practices.⁵ Water management in the Indus Basin is a major issue, as the basin is highly vulnerable and critical to agricultural productivity in Pakistan.⁶ Doing business in Pakistan is challenging. In 2013 Pakistan ranked 110 out of 189 countries on the World Bank's Ease of Doing Business Index,⁷ and key barriers include corruption, political instability, access to finance and inadequate infrastructure.⁸

In 2013, Pakistan was categorised as a Low Human Development country, ranking 146 on the Human Development Index. Five out of eight Millennium Development Goals were off track.⁹ In 2013, only 57% of children enrolled in primary school and only 50% completed Grade 5. It is estimated that 30% of men and 53% of women are illiterate. ¹⁰ Education outcomes in the Western and Northern provinces are among the poorest, as conflict, on-going militancy and natural disasters have destroyed thousands of schools and continue to prevent education service delivery.¹¹ The situation for girls is dire. Nationally, only 40% of girls complete primary school, and in Balochistan the girls' completion rate is 16%.¹² The quality of education is also poor as teachers are often

<u></u>	Eradicate Extreme Poverty and Hunger	Off Track
Î ²	Achieve Universal Primary Education	Off Track
Ō,	Promote Gender Equality & Empower Women	Off Track
W t	Reduce Child Mortality	Off Track
٦٠	Improve Maternal Health	Off Track
± °	Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria & other diseases	On Track
₩'	Ensure Environmental Sustainability	On Track
***************************************	Develop a global partnership for development	

Status of MDGs in Pakistan Status

not well trained, have irregular attendance and have limited knowledge of the curriculum. Since 2003, health outcomes for Pakistan's people have improved but at a slower rate than neighbouring countries. ¹³ Women's and children's health is a particular concern, with indicators on maternal and child health lagging behind other countries in the region. Malnutrition indicators for Pakistani women and children are among the highest in the world, and nutritional stunting among children under the age of 5 (43.7%) has remained largely unchanged since

 $^{^{}m 3}$ World Bank, Rethinking Development Policy Choices: Contributions to the Emerging Agenda, 2013

 $^{^{4}}$ World Bank, Pakistan Country Partnership Strategy 2015-2019

 $^{^{5}}$ World Bank, Agriculture and Water Policy: Towards Sustainable Inclusive Growth, Policy Paper Series on Pakistan , 2013

⁶ Report of the Water Sector Taskforce of the Friends of Democratic Pakistan, A Productive and Water-Secure Pakistan, 2012

World Bank, Ease of Doing Business Index, http://www.doingbusiness.org/rankings

 $^{^{8}}$ World Economic Forum, The Global Competitiveness Report 2012-13

⁹ UNDP 2013 Human Development Report, http://hdr.undp.org/en/2013-report

 $^{10\ \}mbox{Pakistan}$ MDGs – Report 2013, Planning Commission, Government of Pakistan.

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² Ibid.

 $^{^{13}}$ The Lancet, Pakistan: Health is an Opportunity to be Seized, Vol. 381, No. 9867, 23 February 2013

 $1965.^{14}$ This has a draining effect on the economy, and some estimates suggest malnutrition costs Pakistan 3% of its GDP annually. 15

Pakistan is one of the most inequitable countries in the world for women, ranking 127 out of 152 countries on the UN Development Program's Gender Inequality Index. ¹⁶ Female participation in the labour market is 22% compared to 69% for men ¹⁷. Pakistan is also ranked among the countries with the highest stillbirth rates, largely due to delays in receiving appropriate care from a skilled health worker. ¹⁸ Only 49% of births are attended by a skilled medical professional. ¹⁹ Up to 90% of women are subjected to violence with many women and girls in Pakistan subject to acid burning, rape, honour killing and forced marriages. ²⁰

Pakistan again experienced a number of natural disasters and continued displacement of people due to ongoing conflict in 2013-14. This included monsoon floods which affected 1.5 million people in 2013-14, earthquakes in Balochistan, and a drought which resulted in deaths and increased malnutrition in Sindh in 2014. In addition, over 1.6 million registered Afghan refugees continue to reside in Pakistan and over a million people were displaced from North Waziristan in 2014, 74% of whom were women and children.²¹

Australia's development assistance

Pakistan's stability and its commitment to combating violent extremism are critical for regional and global security, and support from the international community is important in promoting development and stability. In 2010 the 18th Amendment to Pakistan's Constitution devolved a number of responsibilities, such as education and health, from the federal to provincial governments. However provincial governments' capacity to provide basic services and security to their citizens remains limited. Given Australia's strategic interests and our commitment to promoting stability in Pakistan, Australia is helping to create an environment conducive to economic growth and increased

Donor			
Donor	ODA	% of total ODA	
United States	625.9	21.7	
IDA	554.8	19.2	
Japan	302.4	10.5	
United Kingdom	301.2	10.4	
EU Institutions	190.1	6.6	
Germany	163.4	5.7	
GAVI	154.0	5.3	
United Arab Emirates	88.8	3.1	
Australia	88.0	3.0	
AsDB Special Funds	47.6	1.6	
All other donors	373.6	12.9	
All donors, Total	2,889.9	100	
	DA Japan Jnited Kingdom EU Institutions Germany GAVI Jnited Arab Emirates Australia ASDB Special Funds	DA 554.8 Japan 302.4 United Kingdom 301.2 EU Institutions 190.1 Germany 163.4 GAVI 154.0 United Arab Emirates 88.8 Australia 88.0 AsDB Special Funds 47.6 All other donors 373.6 All donors, Total 2,889.9	

Source: OECD Statistics

trade. This includes investing in human development to enable Pakistan to make faster

 $^{^{14}}$ World Bank, Expanding Quality Health, Population and Nutrition Services, Pakistan Policy Note, June 2013

 $^{^{15}}$ The Lancet, Pakistan: Health is an Opportunity to be Seized, Vol. 381, No. 9867, 23 February 2013

 $^{^{16}}$ UNDP, Human Development Report, Gender Inequality Index, 2013

¹⁷ Undp Human Development Index, 2013, p. 1

¹⁸ Cousens S, Blencowe H, Stanton C, et al. National, regional, and worldwide estimates of stillbirth rates in 2009 with trends since 1995: a systematic analysis. Lancet 2011; 377: 1319–30.

¹⁹ WHO (2011) Pakistan: Establishing an HRH Coordination Process

²⁰ Thomas Reuters Foundation, Trust Law, 'FACTSHEET - The world's most dangerous countries for women', June 2011.

²¹ UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs, Pakistan: Humanitarian Snapshot - Internal Displacement NWA and the rest of KP and FATA, http://reliefweb.int/report/pakistan/pakistan-humanitarian-snapshot-internal-displacement-nwa-and-rest-kp-and-fata-15-aug

progress in economic growth and job creation, and delivering aid in provinces which are most affected by conflict and have the lowest development outcomes.

Australian aid grew to AUD78.3 million in 2013-14. As a middle sized donor, Australia's contribution is small in comparison to other government and development financing. This directly influences decisions about the selection of investments and implementation approaches. Australia works in partnership with larger development actors to maximise our impact, and focuses on piloting and demonstrating approaches which can be implemented by government and the private sector. Australia also leverages our comparative advantage and expertise – for example through partnerships with the Australian Centre for International Agricultural Research (ACIAR) in agriculture and the Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation (CSIRO) in water – which are highly valued by Pakistan, and can influence government reforms.

Australia is re-shaping its development assistance program in Pakistan in line with the Australian Government's development policy 'Australian aid: Promoting prosperity, reducing poverty, enhancing stability' and the Government of Pakistan's development priorities. The program will focus on two strategic priorities:

- 1. Generating sustainable growth and employment through increased trade and improvements in agriculture and industry.
- 2. Investing in Pakistan's people through health and education.

In recognition of the high levels of insecurity and weak government institutions, strengthening government responsiveness to citizens, particularly women and girls underpins all of our work.

Expenditure

Table 1 Expenditure in FY 2013-14 (Total: AUD67.1 million)

Objective	A\$ million	% of bilateral program
Objective 1 Generating economic growth and employment	6	9%
Objective 2 Investing in Pakistan's people through health and education	32.9	49%
Cross-sectoral programs	28.1	42%

Australian aid by sector
2013-14
3%

Education

Economic growth and employment
Health

Scholarships

Cross sectoral

Source: Pakistan Program Pipeline

In addition, AUD11.2 million was delivered in Pakistan via regional programs. This will be reported via the South and West Asia Aid Program Performance Report. AUD3.1 million was also delivered by the Australian Federal Police, Attorney-General's Department, Australian Customs and Border Protection Service, the Department of Education and the Department of the Environment.

 $^{^{\}rm 22}$ In 2012, Australian assistance to Pakistan represented 4.36% of ODA, and 0.04 of GDP.

Progress towards objectives

Ratings are based on an assessment against the Pakistan development program's performance assessment framework for 2013-14.

Table 2 Rating of the program's progress towards Australia's aid objectives

Objective Objective 1: Generating economic growth and employment through increased trade and improvements in agriculture and industry	Previous Rating N/A	Current Rating Amber
Objective 2: Investing in Pakistan's people through health and education	N/A	Amber

Note:

- Green. Progress is as expected for this point in time and it is likely that the objective will be achieved. Standard program management practices are sufficient.
- Amber. Progress is somewhat less than expected for this point in time and restorative action will be necessary if the objective is to be achieved. Close performance monitoring is recommended.
- Red. Progress is significantly less than expected for this point in time and the objective is not likely to be met given available resources and priorities. Recasting the objective may be required.

Objective 1: Generating economic growth and employment through increased trade and improvements in agriculture and industry

The objective was rated amber because progress towards outputs over the reporting period was uneven. Good results were achieved in many investments, but a greater focus is required on policy reform, sharing learnings across the sector, and ensuring new technologies and practices are adopted and translate into improved income and employment opportunities – especially for women. Australia's aid investments work towards three outcomes:

Outcome 1: Poor women and men have increased income through business and employment opportunities and increased value of agricultural produce

With around 45% of Pakistan's population employed in agriculture, opportunities for economic growth lie in strengthening community level small businesses and agricultural production, and developing linkages with markets. Australian aid focuses on increasing poor people's incomes by training farmers in new technologies and farming practices to increase crop yields, supporting small businesses – especially women's businesses – to create jobs, and linking farmers to markets.

Australian support enabled over 33,000 farmers (24% women farmers) to access new agricultural technologies and management practices in 2013-



A farmer from Sargodha-Punjab demonstrates a more efficient irrigation method for his citrus trees learned through the agriculture sector linkages program. Photo courtesy of ACIAR.

14. In addition, 1270 small businesses were established or restored to operations, of which 1,100 were women's businesses. This was on track with expected results.²³ ACIAR's Australia-Pakistan Agricultural Sector Linkages Program builds on Australian expertise in agriculture. New

²³ Independent Review of the Livelihood Strengthening Program in Border Districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, March 2014; Livelihood Strengthening Program monitoring data, 2014; Agricultural Sector Linkages Program monitoring data, 2014.

technologies and practices which were demonstrated to over 24,000 farmers in the dairy, citrus and mango sectors in 2013-14 offer promising opportunities to improve the productivity, quality and market access of farming. ²⁴ Training extension workers in agriculture, livestock and poultry management under the Sarhad Rural Support Program was also effective in 2013-14. An independent review confirmed that this program had exceeded its targets for sharing new farming approaches at the community level, and was highly successful in reaching the extreme poor. ²⁵ In Balochistan, security issues, difficulties recruiting qualified staff (particularly women) and low capacity in communities caused delays in agribusiness programs throughout the year which meant that progress fell short of targets, however the program is expected to achieve targets in 2014-15. ²⁶ In addition to community level activities in Pakistan, twelve Australia Awards were offered for students to undertake rural development and food security studies in

Melad received an Australia Award to undertake studies in Pro-poor Market Development in Rural Areas. He now works as the Program Manager – High Value Agriculture and Food Security for his organization, drawing on and sharing the expertise he gained through the course.

Australia, six of which were awarded to women.

The effectiveness of agricultural technology transfer, capacity building and small loans varied across the portfolio in 2013-14. Overall, over 3,800 people, including over 1,400 women, increased their income as a result of Australian aid. In Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), an independent review of the Livelihood Strengthening Program in Border Districts found that capacity building was highly effective in providing skills and opportunities for earning, and enabling women to access microfinance through community investment funds was highly effective. Of the 1,100 small loans provided to women, 90% of women have seen a significant increase in their income and the remainder have seen a small increase.²⁷ However an independent review of this program found that a greater focus on market linkages is required to maximise the impacts on poverty reduction, particularly for women

who experience a range of mobility and access constraints.²⁸ In the Agricultural Sector Linkages Program, only 5% of people who gained access to new technologies adopted those technologies in 2013-14, and the results for women were low. Better sharing of successful approaches across Australia's agribusiness investments would increase the overall impacts of Australia's investments.

To increase our focus on market linkages and value chains, Australia invested in a Market Development Facility in 2013-14. The Facility made strong progress in its first year: sector assessments in four pro-poor sectors (dairy, meat, leather and horticulture) were undertaken

²⁴ Agricultural Sector Linkages Program Quality at Implementation report, March 2014.

 $^{^{25}}$ Independent review of the Livelihood Strengthening Program in Border Districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, March 2014.

 $^{^{26}}$ Australian Assistance to Agriculture Development in Balochistan Border Areas Quality at Implementation report, 2014

 $^{^{\}rm 27}$ Livelihood Strengthening Program Quality at Implementation report, 2014

²⁸ Independent Review of the Livelihood Strengthening Program in Border Districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, March 2014

and the first two business partnerships were established.²⁹ All business partnerships under the Facility will be on the basis of a 50/50 cost sharing model, as are investments in supply chains, processing and distribution in Balochistan. This will leverage private sector and community financing and ensure that investments are financially viable in the long term.

Where women's empowerment was an explicit aim of programming, positive results were achieved in 2013-14. For example, targeting microfinance directly to women in KP enabled all 1,100 women to increase their incomes, whereas in Balochistan and under the Agriculture Sector Linkages Program, while women constituted 20-40% of training participants, the limited impacts on women's adoption of technologies or increased incomes needs improvement.³⁰ The lack of disaggregated data in economic revitalisation programs delivered through the Multi-Donor Trust Fund in FATA, KP and Balochistan meant that it was not possible to assess the impacts of these programs on women.

Outcome 2: Target provincial governments implement agricultural policy reforms and are responsive to citizens' needs

Partnerships with CSIRO and ACIAR built on Australian agricultural and water management expertise in 2013-14. The CSIRO Indus Basin Project is designed to improve water resource management in the Indus Basin by helping Pakistan develop a model of its water resources. This will enable Pakistan to better understand how much water flows through the Indus Basin. Phase One was completed in July 2014 on schedule, with CSIRO officials establishing strong relationships with key agencies in Pakistan and development of a prototype Indus River model. Australia also provides support to the governments of Balochistan and KP to reform agriculture policy at the provincial level,



Advocacy led by women in the Water User Committee in Najeemabad has resulted in timely and consistent supply of water to their community. The women reported that having a formal committee has enabled them to get their problems addressed.

Credit: Mahwish Humayun, CESSD

which contributed to Balochistan developing a draft agricultural policy which was endorsed by the Chief Minister in 2014.

Given instability and weak government institutions in the areas where Australian assistance is provided, Australia also supports community organisations to strengthen their engagement with government. Australian support exceeded our targets in KP, but fell just short In Balochistan, where projects had been delayed due to the 2013 elections. Despite ongoing efforts by the Food and Agriculture Organisation to engage and support women's participation, the target for establishing women's organisations was not met. However, with sufficient female staff now on board, the Food and Agriculture Organisation is confident that targets for women will be achieved in 2014-15. In KP, there was evidence of government responsiveness to these community organisations in 2013-14. The KP government formally recognised 229 Water Users

 $^{^{29}\,\}text{Market Development Facility Independent Advisory Group Mission to Pakistan report, May 2014}$

³⁰ Agriculture Sector Linkages Program Quality at Implementation Report, March 2014

Committees and allocated two billion rupees to community participation approaches demonstrated through programs supported by Australia. 31

Outcome 3: Reduction in the time, cost and bureaucracy associated with cross-border trade in goods in target locations

This is a new area of focus for the Australian aid program in Pakistan, and will give effect to the development priorities of the Australian Government and the Government of Pakistan. Investing in this area, including in ways that enable women's economic empowerment, is a key priority for DFAT in 2014-15.

Objective 2: Investing in Pakistan's people through education and health

The objective was rated amber because strong progress was made in some investments, but delays in key education and health investments in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) meant that targets in those programs were not achieved. Australia's aid investments work towards four outcomes:

Outcome 4: More girls and boys in target districts complete early childhood and basic education, and have higher learning outcomes



Education in Faryal's province has been adversely affected by conflict, militancy, natural disasters and strong cultural barriers for girls' education. After one year at an early childhood centre in her village, Faryal was able to enrol in a government primary school, and was top of her year in her first year of studies.

Credit: Muhammad Yar Khan, Save the Children

Australian aid directly supported 179,523 students, of whom 86,779 were girls, to access higher quality education in KP, Balochistan and GB in 2013-14. This included supporting the refurbishment of 241 early childhood centres in KP - almost double the annual target - which benefited more than 218,982 children (101,245 girls). Similarly, 219 community-based early childhood centres were established in Balochistan, which benefited 8,750 children (6,727 girls).32 The increased numbers of centres particularly benefits girls, who are often unable to travel to other districts for education. Australian support also enabled the first analysis of children with disabilities to be undertaken in Gilgit-Baltistan, and 234 additional children with disabilities were enrolled in schools. Capacity constraints within the Government of KP have slowed

a major investment in partnership with the UK Department for International Development (DfID) and the KP Government. Delays with procurement processes meant that the construction and refurbishment of classrooms did not commence in 2013-14, and much of the early focus has been on education systems and governance. However the focus is now shifting to delivering quality basic education, and classroom construction work was tendered in March 2014. Ensuring the pace of activities will pick is a major priority in 2014-15.

 $^{31\,\}mathrm{KP\,Directorate\,of\,Information\,and\,Public\,Relations:\,http://www.infokhyberpakhtunkhwa.gov.pk/doit/?p=13612\#more-13612}$

 $^{^{32}}$ Balochistan Early Childhood Development M&E Report, 27 December 2013

Significant efforts to improve Australia's investment in early childhood education in Balochistan with the Aga Khan Foundation had positive results in 2013-14. Implementation of this program had been delayed for over a year due to the volatile security situation, rising construction costs and the need for greater engagement with the provincial government. Australia worked extensively with the Aga Khan Foundation and the Government of Balochistan to resolve bottlenecks with additional technical expertise and more feasible construction approaches. These efforts have paid off – construction commenced in 2013 and classrooms will be seismic resistant to act as safe houses against earthquakes.³³ The provincial government has indicated that it will maintain schools and fund the salaries of early childhood teachers following completion of the program.³⁴

Building teachers' capacity to deliver higher quality education is a long-term exercise. The low skill base of many teachers, insecurity and barriers for women's involvement pose ongoing challenges. In 2013-14 Australia's work on education quality included co-funding curriculum training for 16,784 primary school teachers, of whom 6110 were women, achieving 92% of our training target in KP.35 Teacher training targets in Balochistan were exceeded in 2013-14, including targets for women.36 Despite these challenges, and the difficulty in measuring the long-term impacts of capacity-building, there is evidence that results are being achieved. For example, a study undertaken in 2013 on the impacts of teacher training in five districts of KP found that students' test scores had improved



Ruqaiya received training on school management and early childhood education, and has now set-up learning areas in her classroom, including developing low or no-cost resources. Ruqaiya feels that improving the quality of her teaching has led to higher enrolment rates in her classes.

Credit: Aga Khan University-Institute for Educational Development

and that teachers' use of practical demonstrations in the classroom increased by 22%.37

The high turnover of government officials continues to undermine efforts to build capacity and governance of the education sector. Australia and our partners responded by engaging incoming officials early, and raising the issue with relevant provincial governments. However this is a wide-spread issue and will not be resolved easily. Results in 2013-14 also show that targeted approaches are required to build the capacity of women government officials. For example, additional support is often required for women to travel to training and to apply new skills in the workplace. Australia also offered 16 scholarships in the education sector in 2013-14, including 12 awarded to women.

³³ Balochistan - Early Childhood Development Project Quality at Implementation report, March 2014

³⁴ Balochistan - Early Childhood Development Project Quality at Implementation report, March 2014

³⁵ Education Sector Development Program in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Quality at Implementation report, March 2014

³⁶ Balochistan - Early Childhood Development Project Quality at Implementation report, March 2014

 $^{^{}m 37}$ First Follow-up Study on the Impact of Teacher In-Service Training in 5 Districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, 2013

Outcome 5: Citizens (particularly women and children) have improved access to nutrition and relief, including in humanitarian crises

Australia is a leader in improved nutrition in Pakistan, and our focus is on supporting provincial governments to effectively respond to malnutrition and to provide nutrition services to women and children. This program also leverages a 20% financial commitment by provincial governments. Work in this sector is relatively new, and mobilisation of activities has been slow, particularly due to slow Pakistan government approval processes. However, provincial nutrition plans have now been approved with relevant provincial governments, and have informed investments by other donors. ³⁸ Community level activities will commence in 2014-15.

Australian support provided relief to over 278,000 people in humanitarian crises in 2013-14, in partnership with the World Food Programme. This included drought relief, feeding programs and support to internally displaced persons. Three million dollars of Australian assistance was provided through a 'twinning' approach, which covers the cost of processing, transporting and distributing in kind donations of wheat from the Government of Pakistan.

Outcome 6: Women access quality social services specific to their needs

To improve maternal and child health outcomes in Balochistan, Australia is supporting Save the Children to manage rural health clinics and provide technical assistance to the

government to improve the delivery of maternal and child health services. The program achieved its targets. Management of all ten targeted rural health clinics was handed over to Save the Children, and seven out of ten rural health clinics commenced 24/7 operations in 2013-14. The difficulty of engaging female staff in rural and conflict-affected areas caused delays over the year, but Save the Children have persevered and worked creatively to over-come barriers. Effective

Only 49% of births are attended by a skilled birth attendant in Pakistan

Improving Maternal Health in Balochistan

Kaz Bano developed fistula after giving birth, and her inability to control her bladder led to depression and isolation from her community. Through Lady Health Visitors supported by Save the Children and the Australian Government, Kaz received surgery to fix her condition. She is now a strong believer that women should seek proper medical care instead of relying on unskilled workers.

Credit: Dr. Mohammad Hayat Roonjho, Save the Children

strategies included repairing accommodation for women health workers at clinics, working closely with communities to identify women candidates for training, and funding child care for mothers who need to attend training in other districts. The initial results of this program are promising. Increased access to health care for women and newborns exceeded expectations – in 2013-14 there was a 37% increase in women who had at least one antenatal visit, and 30% more women received postnatal care within 24 hours.³⁹

Government buy-in is critical to the success of this service delivery model. Over 2013-14, public officials were engaged through the steering committee and management teams. Community

Aid Program Performance Report 2013-14

 $^{^{38}}$ For example, a nutrition business case under development by DfID has been informed by Australia's investments.

 $^{^{}m 39}$ Maternal Newborn Health in Balochistan (IMNCH) Quality at Implementation report, 2014.

members were also engaged in monitoring teams to monitor and improve service delivered by the facility. Australia's support was limited in 2013-14 by our inability to travel to Balochistan to attend Steering Committee meetings. Regular meetings were held with projects staff and government officials to compensate, however travel restrictions are a major challenge.

Outcome 7: National and relevant provincial education and health departments better plan and manage target sectors, and are responsive to citizens' needs

Australia invested heavily in supporting national and provincial governments to better plan and manage the education and health sectors in 2013-14. This included taking leadership positions in multiple policy forums and providing valuable technical support. Low provincial government capacity to plan and manage services was a key challenge in 2013-14, and building capacity to deliver services is very slow, but important work. Results in 2013-14 indicate that Australia's influence is greatest where we have the expertise to provide technical support, where we are flexible and responsive to changing circumstances, and where the benefits and viability of reforms we support have been demonstrated in practice through our aid investments.

Australia's leadership of the KP Education Development Partners Group and co-chairing of the KP Strategic Development Partnership Framework Education Working Group saw donors and the KP government working much more closely to progress reforms in the education sector. For example, the simplification of reporting, and better donor coordination enabled the Government of KP to reduce duplication of investments across the province. ⁴⁰ In early childhood education, Australia's longstanding policy dialogue and participation in key working groups contributed to positive commitments by the governments of Balochistan and KP in 2013-14. The government of Balochistan committed to building and maintaining an early childhood classroom in 2000 new schools and to funding early childhood teacher salaries after the pilot concludes. The Government of KP committed 158 million rupees funding for early childhood classrooms in its 2013-14 budget. ⁴¹ In terms of uptake of early childhood education pilots, an evaluation of the pilot in KP delivered a clear lesson that pilots need to be cost-effective for governments if they are to be taken up. Australia and Save the Children will work now with the Government of KP to develop low and medium cost options which draw on the successful elements of the pilot.

Progress in the health sector was much more challenging. The Federal Government was responsible for maternal and child health services until 2010, so provincial governments are still in the process of establishing health systems. The national Ministry of Health was reestablished in 2013-14, but its functions, roles and responsibilities remain unclear. Australia commenced chairing the Health Donors Group in 2013-14 to better support health sector reforms, and provided technical expertise to provincial governments. The value of this assistance was evidenced by the high demand for support, and the expertise which Australia provided enabled all provincial governments to finalise health strategic plans in 2013-14.

 $^{^{\}rm 40}$ KP Education Sector Program Quality at Implementation report, 2014

 $^{41~\}textrm{KP Directorate of Information and Public Relations, } http://www.infokhyberpakhtunkhwa.gov.pk/doit/?p=13612\#more-13612, \\ May 2014$

⁴² Maternal Newborn Health in Balochistan (IMNCH) Quality at Implementation report, 2014.

Australia's support to the Fred Hollows Foundation enabled five centres of excellence to provide training and specialist eye care, as well as strengthening the capacity of eye units in eleven district hospitals. In 2013-14, over 230,000 people (over 108,000 women) received screening and over 22,000 people (over 10,000 women) received treatment for eye conditions.

A critical element of service delivery is accountability to parents and communities, given the conflict-affected context in some areas where Australian aid is delivered. Support for Parent Teacher Committees was highly effective in 2013-14.⁴³ Primary health care management

committees have had positive impacts on the quality of health care services in project districts. For example in 2013-14, 90% of primary health care facility users in target areas reported that they were satisfied with the quality of service provided. However, their influence at a provincial level has been limited. In terms of the impacts of these social accountability mechanisms on building citizen-state trust, there were some early indications in 2013-14 to suggest that trust is increasing through the MDTF Border Areas investments. DFAT needs to ensure that this is systematically monitored, given that building state capacity is fundamental to stability and prosperity.



Rimsha is 3 years old, and has congenital cataract in both eyes. Rimsha's family could not afford cataract surgery, but surgery provided through a paediatric centre supported by the Fred Hollows Foundation and Australian Government has allowed Rishma to see. She is very excited with her new connection to her family and the world. Credit: Fred Hollows Foundation

Mutual Obligations

Australia and Pakistan did not have a current partnership agreement outlining our mutual obligations in 2013-14, however high level talks are planned for 2014-15. In the absence of this agreement, mutual obligations have been agreed with the national and provincial governments in the context of Australia's specific investments. At the national level, the Government's commitment to nutrition, co-contribution to match Australia's humanitarian assistance, and re-establishment of a federal Ministry of Health were positive steps in 2013-14. Clarifying roles and responsibilities for the new Ministry, and formal coordination mechanisms with provincial ministries is now a priority, as this will underpin reform in the health sector.

At a provincial level, the Government of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa's (KP) increased leadership in the education sector was instrumental to the policy reform achieved in this sector in 2013-14. The Government established a donor engagement framework which helped to reduce duplication in the sector, and committed to fund early childhood centres and Parent Teacher Committees in 2013-14. The KP Government also made progress on the implementation of its Education

⁴³ Parent Teacher Committees are being supported to rehabilitate school infrastructure and were trained in five districts on roles and responsibilities, management skills, school improvement plans and financial management in 2013-14. The quality of PTCs was rated high in the 2013 Citizen Engagement for Social Service Delivery survey.

 $^{^{\}rm 44}$ Citizen Engagement for Social Service Delivery Quality at Implementation report, 2014.

 $^{^{}m 45}$ MDTF in KP, FATA and Balochistan, Beneficiary feedback survey, 2013.

 $^{^{}m 46}$ Early Childhood Care and Education in KP, Independent Mid-Term Review, 2014

Sector Plan, including agreeing new governance indicators. The KP Government's support for Parent Teacher Committees and health care committees and approval of a poverty alleviation program at an estimated cost of 2 billion rupees is also a positive step in increasing responsiveness to citizens' needs. In Balochistan, the Chief Minister's endorsement of the draft Agriculture Policy was very positive. The policy now requires government approval. The government's approval of the Education Sector Plan and commitment to construct and fund the maintenance of early childhood classrooms, and pay salaries for early childhood teachers were also very positive. Coordination of the education and health sectors in Balochistan is not strong, and formal coordination mechanisms are required.

In 2013-14, the approval of nutrition plans by all provincial governments after significant delays, and commitment to co-finance nutrition activities by Balochistan and KP governments paved the way for activities to address malnutrition to commence in 2014-15. Across all sectors, the frequent turn-over and rotation of government officials has negative implications on the delivery of basic services by provincial governments and on Australia's efforts to build the capacity of government officials.

Program Quality and Management

Program performance and quality

Significant improvements have been made in relation to the quality and performance of Australian aid in Pakistan in 2013-14. Two strategic objectives were developed to re-shape the Pakistan development program in line with the Australian Government's new strategic directions for the aid program. A pilot performance assessment framework was developed, and both a Program Fund Plan and Risk and Fraud Management Plan were developed to assist with efficient management of Australian aid. Australia developed a strategic multiyear framework to guide investments to respond to humanitarian needs in Pakistan. Priority recommendations will be implemented in 2014-15. A corporate Health Check in 2014 concluded that the program performed well in 2013-14, particularly given the complexity of the operating environment. Strong progress was made integrating the former AusAID and DFAT in 2013-14 and we will continue to build on this in 2014-15, particularly in terms of the opportunities for stronger policy engagement with the Pakistan government.

Direct monitoring of investments by DFAT staff remains a major concern for the Pakistan program. Restrictions on travelling within KP and a deteriorating security situation have limited the ability of Australia and our partners to monitor programs, and increased our reliance on third party monitoring. Two independent evaluations of Australian-funded projects were undertaken in 2013-14, and the findings have been used to inform ongoing management and future directions of Australian aid. With several investments nearing completion, planning and designing new programs will also be a priority in 2014-15.

At an individual investment level, the underperforming investment in early childhood education in Balochistan was improved through concerted efforts by Australia and our partners, and is back on track. In the 2013-14 reporting cycle, Australia's joint investment with DfID in education in KP was rated unsatisfactory on both the effectiveness and efficiency criteria, and the Agricultural Sector Linkages Program also received low ratings. We will take remedial action for these investments to ensure they make satisfactory progress in 2014-15. The quality of

monitoring and evaluation (M&E) systems increased for 7 out of 14 investments in 2013-14, however M&E remains a challenge in several investments.

Performance of key delivery partners

Given the security and fiduciary risks in Pakistan, Australia works with trusted and experienced partners to deliver our aid. In 2013-14, multilateral partners performed well in their governance work with provincial governments, including working through government systems and strengthening the procurement, finance and operational capabilities of these systems. The technical expertise and ability to engage at senior levels of government which multilateral organisations bring is critical to the policy reform agenda in many sectors. However, increased focus on gender and conflict-sensitive approaches is often required, and some multilateral organisations struggle at times to be responsive. By contrast, the World Food Programme offers good examples of both flexible and responsive programming as well as a strong commitment to gender equality.

Non-government organisations demonstrated impressive approaches to advancing gender equality in 2013-14, working responsively and creatively to ensure programs deliver benefits for women and girls. Their flexibility and ability to access locations and populations which are difficult for bilateral and multilateral organisations to reach made them a key delivery partner in 2013-14. NGOs can be less influential at policy engagement, and examples in 2013-14 of programs having insufficient engagement with government, or struggling to operate outside their historical geographic location highlight the importance of ensuring the right partners are selected for Australian programming.

Australia maintained strong relationships with donor partners in 2013-14. Given Australia is often a smaller player compared to other donors, the program must maintain a strong level of visibility and influence in programming decisions to ensure Australia's priorities are pursued.

Risks

The aid program developed and implemented a new Risk and Fraud Management Plan in 2014, which is reviewed and updated on a monthly basis.

Table: Management of key risks to achieving objectives

Key risks

Deteriorating security environment challenges program delivery and effective monitoring of programs, particularly in the focus border provinces.

What actions were taken to manage the risks over the past year?

- Ongoing monitoring of security situation and response to DFAT security advice.
- Used trusted partners for program delivery.
- Use of third party monitoring to independently verify results, where appropriate.
- Ongoing dialogue (both informal and formal) with partners on program effectiveness and outcomes.
- Monitoring missions undertaken, where possible.

What further actions will be taken to manage the risks in the coming year?

- Develop an annual monitoring plan, including monitoring missions in accordance with Australian Government work health and safety provisions.
- Select partners that can work in restricted areas and use models of delivery suitable for insecure environment.
- Continue monitoring partners' security plans.
- Seek clarity regarding duty of care under the WHS Act.

Corruption and fraud result in the loss of public funds and undermines development outcomes.

The need to spread

greater diversity of

priorities impedes

consolidation in the Pakistan program.

Weak government

capacity to plan and

reforms undermines

the effectiveness of

Australian aid

manage basic service

delivery and undertake

risk and to address a

Australian Government

- A dedicated Performance & Quality Coordinator appointed who is responsible for managing the fraud case load.
- A system has been put in place to review fraud registers on monthly basis and minutes kept.
- Updates shared with Canberra on priority basis.
- Development of a consolidation plan for the Pakistan program.
- Review and revised Fraud & Risk Management Plan on annually
- Continue monitoring and updating F&R registers on monthly basis and keeping minutes
- Work with the implementing partners on fraud monitoring and reporting as a part of program engagement.
- Agree on strategic programming with the GOP.
- Implementation of consolidation plan, and monitoring through the Aid Program Performance Reporting process.
- Regular engagement with the MFA on AIP and APPR.
- Regular and active engagement with the GoP at the federal and provincial levels on Australian aid interventions
- Mutual obligations with the government agreed at the program level.
- Provision of technical assistance through programs, where required.
- Strong partnerships with multilateral and bilateral partners with proven capacity for effective program delivery in Pakistan
- Proactive engagement with government to agree on a new partnership agreement
- Continued monitoring of low capacity and structural weaknesses affecting programs and provision of technical assistance, as appropriate
- Advocacy at federal and provincial government levels to develop and implement policies. Escalate issues were required and consider requests for high level technical advice on public sector reform
- Advocacy at the federal and provincial levels to ensure strong development partner coordination that is led by government and aligns to government priorities and plans

Management Responses

To support the delivery of Australia's aid program in Pakistan in 2014-15 DFAT will:

- Increase the level of Australia's aid investments which contribute to gender-inclusive trade facilitation and private sector development, and which address barriers to women's economic empowerment, such as low labour force participation, exclusion from economic resources and gender-based violence.
- Develop a more strategic approach to our investments in agriculture, including strengthening policy engagement and links between investments. This should include a strong focus on women's economic empowerment and monitoring and evaluation.
- > Monitor and engage closely on basic education investments in KP to ensure that program implementation gains momentum in 2014-15.
- Work with partners and relevant provincial governments to develop cost-effective models for the delivery of early childhood education.
- Review Australia's ongoing engagement on education in Balochistan, and commence design or transition work as required.
- Develop a longer-term approach to humanitarian assistance including through a multi-year partnership with the World Food Programme and leveraging existing investments in FATA, Balochistan and KP.
- Agree annual development talks with the Government of Pakistan, and develop an Aid Investment Plan as the strategic framework for Australian aid to Pakistan for 2014-2017.
- Work with partners to address monitoring and evaluation issues in relevant investments, including advocating for monitoring of impacts on state-citizen trust on an annual basis.

Annex A

Progress in addressing 2012-13 management responses

Management consequences identified in 2012-13 APPR	Rating	Progress made in 2013-14
Implementation of new travel guidance and other security recommendations, including advanced driver training, once completed and approved by DFAT.	Achieved	Guidance and security recommendations implemented in full.
Coordinate with other donors to encourage greater leadership from new national and provincial governments.	Partly achieved	Donor coordination was improved in the education sector, and the Government of KP has taken greater leadership in this sector. Coordination has not been as strong in the health sector, and government leadership is weaker due to greater challenges in this sector.
Finalise and implement plans to improve the quality and frequency of engagement with governments and implementing partners. Second an education program officer to DFID.	Not achieved	One plan will be undertaken to guide engagement with all partners and governments. The secondment of an education office has been discontinued due to budget constraints.
Finalise the country program strategy; secure renewal of the partnership; and secure agreement for the strategy from the Government of Pakistan.	Partially achieved	New strategic objectives were developed in line with the new Australian Government's development priorities. A new development partnership and Aid Investment Plan will be developed in 2014-15.
Finalise critical delivery strategies (humanitarian and disaster risk reduction and education sector) and review current investments to ensure strategic alignment.	Achieved	The Pakistan development program investment pipeline was reviewed over the 2013-14 financial year to ensure strategic alignment with the Government's new development policy. The humanitarian sector plan was finalised, and priority recommendations will be implemented. An education sector plan was not progressed due to revised Australian Government priorities.
Recruit a Corporate Manager and action critical corporate reforms.	Achieved	A program quality and operations staff member was engaged and corporate reform priorities such as strengthening risk management systems were undertaken.

Note:

- Achieved. Significant progress has been made in addressing the issue
- Partly achieved. Some progress has been made in addressing the issue, but the issue has not been resolved
- Not achieved. Progress in addressing the issue has been significantly below expectations

Annex B – Quality at Implementation ratings

Investment name	Investment value	Qal year	Relevance	Effectiveness	Efficiency	Monitoring and Evaluation	Sustainability	Gender equality
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Education Sector Program	65,351,127	2013	5	3	3	5	4	4
		2012	6	4	3	5	4	5
World Bank MDTF - Partnership for Nutrition	41,000,000	2013	E	E	E	E	E	Е
Pakistan Budget Initiative - Health	39,629,012	2013	6	5	4	5	4	6
Tanotan Baagat milatira Tranta	00,020,022	2012	5	5	5	4	5	5
Pakistan ADS Scholarships	26,929,994	2013	5	5	5	5	5	4
Takistan Abo Scholarships	20,023,334		5	5	5	4	5	4
Citizen Engagement for Social Service Delivery III	19,266,600	2013	Е	E	Е	E	Е	Е
Early Childhood Care and Education in KPK	14,130,009	2013	5	4	4	5	3	6
Larry Official Council and Education in ACA		2012	6	5	5	4	4	5
Phase 2 - Agriculture Sector Linkages Program	13,753,367	2013	5	3	4	3	4	3
Thase 2 / ignoration decide Eminages Program	13,733,307	2012	5	4	4	3	4	4
Maternal Newborn Health in Balochistan	13,610,800	2013	5	4	5	4	4	5
Material Newborn Health in Balochistan	13,010,800	2012	5	5	5	4	4	5
WB Multi Donor Trust Fund Balochistan, FATA & KPK	13,606,960	2013	5	4	4	3	4	4
WE Walt Bollot Hust Fully Balochistan, FATA & N. N.	13,000,900	2012	5	4	4	4	4	5
FAO AusABBA	12,880,000	2013	5	4	4	4	4	4
I NO NUSABBA	12,000,000	2012	5	4	4	4	4	4
Gilgit-Baltistan Education Development & Improvement	12,468,000	2013	5	4	4	4	3	5
Giigit-baitistan Education bevelopment & improvement	12,400,000	2012	5	4	3	4	3	5
SRSP Livelihood Strengthening Programme in KPK	10,553,448	2013	6	5	5	5	5	6

		2012	5	4	4	4	3	4
Pakistan Market Development Facility & RD planning	9,404,510	2013	E	E	E	E	Е	E
- and a state of the state of t		2012	E	E	E	E	E	Е
Governance Sector Projects	9,165,321	2013	6	5	4	6	4	4
	-,,,	2012	5	5	4	5	3	4
Education Sector Development Programme KPK	8,066,385	2013	5	4	4	5	5	4
	-,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	2012	5	4	4	4	5	5
Scholarships Islamabad ADS 2011 Intake	7,783,921	2013	5	5	5	5	5	4
	, = = ,=	2012	5	5	5	4	5	4
Pakistan Australia Sub-Specialty Eye Care Project	5,238,388	2013	4	5	4	4	4	5
	,,	2012	4	5	5	4	5	5
Balochistan-Early Childhood Development Project	4,750,260	2013	5	4	4	4	5	5
		2012	5	3	3	4	4	5

E = exempt from Quality at Implementation process

Definitions of rating scale:

Satisfactory (4, 5 and 6)

- = 6 = Very high quality
- = 5 = Good quality
- = 4 = Adequate quality, needs some work

Less than satisfactory (1, 2 and 3)

- = 3 = Less than adequate quality; needs significant work
- = 2 = Poor quality; needs major work to improve
- = 1 = Very poor quality; needs major overhaul

Annex C

Evaluation and Review Pipeline Planning

List of evaluations completed in the reporting period

Name of Investment	Aidworks number	Name of evaluation	Date finalised	Date Evaluation report Uploaded into Aidworks	Date Management response uploaded into Aidworks	Published on website
Early Childhood Care and Education in KP	INJ785	Mid-Term Review	April 2014	20 June 2014	20 June 2014	Intend to publish
SRSP Livelihood Strengthening Programme in KPK	INJ207	Independent evaluation	March 2014	26 March 2014		Intend to publish
UNDP Elections Program mid- term review	INK087	Mid-Term Review	July 2014			Not for publication

List of evaluations planned in the next 12 months

Name of Investment	Aidworks number	Type of evaluation	Purpose of evaluation	Expected completion date
Maternal Newborn Health in Balochistan (IMNCH)	INK363	Independent evaluation	To review the effectiveness of the service delivery model; the performance-based incentives component of the program; and the community consultation mechanisms to inform possible scale-up.	February 2015
Citizen Engagement for Social Service Delivery III	INH762	Independent evaluation	To assess the effectiveness of CESSD activities on improving basic service delivery and their impacts on improving citizen-state trust in participating communities.	June 2015

Annex D Performance Benchmarks 2014 -15

Strategic objective	2014-15 benchmark	Rationale for selecting this performance benchmark
Generating economic growth and employment through increased trade and improvements in	Establish 12 new business partnerships to facilitate the development of pro-poor agriculture value chains	Agribusiness represents approximately 10% of DFAT's aid expenditure in Pakistan. Australia aims to establish business partnerships with the private sector under which investments are financed on a 50/50 cost share basis. This enables us to leverage private sector financing and ensure that supply chains and improvements to production and distribution are commercially viable. Two business partnerships were established in 2013-14, and it is anticipated that 12 new business partnerships will be established in 2014-15.
agriculture and industry	Launch a new trade and investment program to reduce the barriers to cross-border trade	In line with the Australian Government's new strategic targets for the aid program, the Pakistan program will increase its expenditure on aid for trade by investing in programs which aim to reduce the barriers to cross-border trade in target areas.
Investing in Pakistan's people through education	Over 120,000 children directly supported by the program, including over 65,000 girls, enrolled in basic education	Approximately 23% of the Pakistan development program is currently committed to investments which improve access to and the quality of education service delivery. In 2013-14, Australian aid supported 116,643 children (including 60,479 girls) to enrol in basic education, and trained over 4,000 teachers
and health	Over 3000 teachers (including over 1,500 women) are trained to improve education quality	(including over 1,800 women). In 2014-15, it is expected that the number of children enrolled in basic education directly supported by the program to reach 120,000, including 65,000 girls. Due to shifts in the focus of some programs, the number of teachers trained will be over 3,000, including over 1,500 women.
	Commence providing nutrition services in 3 districts of Balochistan and 5 districts in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Australia's investment in nutrition is a major priority under our strategic objective of Investing in Pakistan's people through education and health. Australia is a lead donor in this sector, and nutrition represents just under 10% of DFAT's aid expenditure in Pakistan. Government approvals and provincial nutrition strategies were completed in 2013-14, and activities to address malnutrition will commence in 2014-15 in the provinces of Balochistan and KP.
	4300 additional births attended by a skilled birth attendant	Investment in maternal, neonatal and child health represents approximately 5% of the Pakistan portfolio. It is a major priority because of the potential for this model of service delivery to be adopted more widely at a provincial level, and also because of the high maternal mortality rate in the province. In 2013-14, 4300 additional births (from the baseline) were attended by a skilled birth attendant, and the program aims to sustain this result in 2014-15.

Strategic objective	2014-15 benchmark	Rationale for selecting this performance benchmark
	500 additional women survivors of violence access quality support services in target areas through programme interventions	Supporting national efforts to address violence against women is a high priority for Australia, and projects to support the elimination of violence against women were developed in 2013-14. The emphasis is on strengthening service delivery for women affected by violence, developing approaches to reduce tolerance towards violence against women and strengthening the capacity of legislative and enforcement bodies to respond to cases of violence against women. As 2014-15 is the first year of full implementation no baseline is available, however the target of 500 women is considered to be sufficiently ambitious given the extremely challenging context and security limitations in which this project operates.
Management efficiency	Reduce the total number of initiatives under the Pakistan program to 24.	To improve management efficiency and meet the Australian Government's target of reducing the number of initiatives by 20%, the Pakistan development program will reduce the total number of initiatives from 27 to 24 in 2014-15.