



# Aid Program Performance Report 2012–13 Pakistan

## Key messages

- > This report summarises progress in Australia's aid program in Pakistan in 2012–13, under the Australia – Pakistan Development Partnership (APDP).
- > The Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) plans to prepare a new strategy in 2013–14, around a new set of objectives:
  - To provide basic services<sup>1</sup>, particularly to women and children, in health, education and rural development through credible and experienced partners.
  - To address the needs of communities most vulnerable to the effects of conflict, remoteness, marginalisation, and natural hazards and disasters.
  - To engage with national and provincial governments on development priorities that reduce poverty and support greater peace and stability in Pakistan.
- > This Aid Program Performance Report (APPR) reports against the new objectives.
- > Pakistan's security challenges and its strategic importance to Australia require a long-term focus on democratic stability, more effective political governance, broad-based economic and social development, and poverty reduction.
- > During the reporting period, Pakistan's security and political context continued to make it difficult to deliver aid. Engagement with the Government of Pakistan was limited, and security concerns hampered DFAT's ability to meet with provincial governments and to monitor investments.
- > Although Pakistan is making slow progress in reducing maternal, newborn and child mortality, Australia's support to the Government of Pakistan to implement its National Maternal, Newborn and Child Health (MNCH) Program is on track to achieve most of its objectives.
- > Australia's support to the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) to strengthen the electoral system contributed to national and provincial elections. This program was considered a success by the international community.
- > Support for implementing provincial-level education sector plans and sponsoring early childhood education is showing positive results.
- > Australia's response to the needs of vulnerable communities affected by conflict and natural disasters in Pakistan has been effective, with life-saving assistance provided to more than 395 000 people through food and livelihood assistance.
- > Australia's humanitarian activities have been largely reactive and DFAT aims to develop a disaster response and disaster risk reduction delivery strategy by early 2014 to help

---

<sup>1</sup> Basic services refers to the level of services included in the Millennium Development Goals and targets  
<http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/host.aspx?Content=indicators/officiallist.htm>

establish national capacity to prepare for and reduce the human and economic costs of crises.

## Context

Australia has global interests, shared by the international community, and bilateral interests in Pakistan. Pakistan's stability and its commitment to combating violent extremism are critical for regional and global security, as well as for stability in Afghanistan. These challenges require a long-term focus on promoting more effective political and administrative governance as well as broad-based economic and social development, and poverty reduction. To address these challenges, Pakistan needs sustained support from the international community. With limited capacity to provide basic services and security to its citizens, achieving development outcomes is difficult. Given Australia's strategic interests and the desire to contribute to development and stability, Australia is committed to continuing its aid support to Pakistan.

This APPR outlines performance against the three new program objectives, marking a change from the 2011 Annual Program Performance Report (APPR),<sup>2</sup> which reported against the five previous objectives.

The new objectives better represent Australian aid's capacity to make a difference, noting that total official development assistance (ODA) represents just 1.7 per cent of Pakistan's gross national income, and our ODA contribution is 1.8 per cent of Pakistan's total ODA.<sup>3</sup> The objectives will be incorporated into the new country program strategy DFAT is developing in 2013–14.

### Pakistan's operating environment

Pakistan is a complex operating environment. It is the sixth most populous country in the world, with an estimated population of more than 180 million.<sup>4</sup> Decades of internal political instability and low levels of foreign investment have resulted in sluggish growth and slow development progress. With high population growth and gross domestic product growing at an average of 3.5 per cent since 2007,<sup>5</sup> Pakistan struggles to maintain standards of living and create jobs for its youth.

### Progress against the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)

Progress towards the MDGs is slow. Only two-thirds of children are enrolled in primary school (MDG 2) and more than half the population is illiterate. The maternal mortality rate (MDG 5) remains high at 260 deaths per 100 000 live births,<sup>6</sup> and a skilled midwife attends only 39 per cent of births.<sup>7</sup> The Government's 2011 National Nutrition Survey showed that 30 per cent of children under the age of five years are malnourished (MDG 4).

According to the United Nations Human Development Index 2013, Pakistan is a country with low human development, ranking 146 out of 186 countries.<sup>8</sup> It rates 123 out of 148 countries

---

<sup>2</sup> Prior to 2012-13 Aid Program Performance Reports were called Annual Program Performance Reports.

<sup>3</sup> Organisation for Economic Co-operation Development statistics, <http://stats.oecd.org/>

<sup>4</sup> UNDP Human Development Report 2013.

<sup>5</sup> World Bank data, <http://www.tradingeconomics.com/pakistan/gdp-growth>

<sup>6</sup> UNDP, Human Development Indicators, <http://hdrstats.undp.org/en/indicators/89006.html>

<sup>7</sup> Save the Children (2011), *Missing Midwives*, [http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/sites/default/files/docs/Missing\\_Midwives\\_1.pdf](http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/sites/default/files/docs/Missing_Midwives_1.pdf)

<sup>8</sup> UNDP Human Development Report 2013.

on gender equality.<sup>9</sup> Its minority populations face barriers to inclusion in social and economic life, lack political influence, and are frequently victims of violence and ethnic or religious persecution. While an official figure on the people living with disability in Pakistan is not available, estimates indicate it is between 2.5 per cent and 10 per cent which is high by global standards.<sup>10-11</sup>

### Conflict and disasters

Pakistan is vulnerable to natural disasters and the effects of conflict. In 2008–09 approximately 3 million people were internally displaced due to ongoing conflict between militants and the Pakistan military, largely in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA).<sup>12</sup> Currently, 1.05 million displaced people are in need of humanitarian assistance in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) and FATA.<sup>13</sup> The 2010, 2011 and 2012 floods affected approximately 20 million, 5.2 million and 4.8 million people respectively destroying agriculturally productive land resulting in severe economic hardship for affected populations.

Insecurity remains a challenge across Pakistan, with more than 1 million registered internally displaced persons in KP and FATA<sup>14</sup>, spilling over the border from neighboring Afghanistan. Politically motivated violence, insurgency, law enforcement operations and kidnapping continue to threaten stability and development in Pakistan and the region. 2012 and 2013 saw a spike in the targeting of foreign aid workers.

### Economy

Pakistan's economy remains vulnerable to external and domestic shocks.<sup>15</sup> A dysfunctional energy sector acts as a significant brake to economic activity and dampens growth prospects. This difficult business environment, coupled with sharp falls in investment, double-digit inflation and a growing budget deficit remain major concerns. The balance of payments position remains precarious due to declining financial inflows and growing debt repayments, pressuring foreign exchange reserves. Despite subdued growth compared to other countries in the region, 2012 saw some resilience with gross domestic product growing 3.7 per cent (compared to 3 per cent in 2011) despite severe flooding, increases in fuel and commodity prices and the impact of the global slowdown. The benefits of stronger export performance in 2012 were undermined by a 15 per cent growth in imports, resulting in a large trade deficit. Growth in remittances helped contain the current account deficit. Growth in real gross domestic product, forecast to slow to 3.5 per cent in 2013,<sup>16</sup> is insufficient to generate economic activity and revenues needed for employment growth and to fund social services for the country's growing population.<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>9</sup> Ibid .

<sup>10</sup> *World Report on Disability 2011*, World Bank and the World Health Organization (WHO); Chapter 2 estimates the global prevalence of disability is 15 per cent.

<sup>11</sup> The most recent data available is from WHO National Policy for Persons with Disabilities 2002 and Pakistan's 1998 National Census Report.

<sup>12</sup> Internal Displacement Monitoring Centre and Norwegian Refugee Council, 2012, 'Global Overview 2012—People Internally Displaced by Conflict and Violence',

<http://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/Pakistan%20FATA%20Displacements%20Sit%20Report%20No%202.pdf>

<sup>13</sup> Ibid.

<sup>14</sup> <http://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/OCHA-HB-Issue16.pdf>

<sup>15</sup> IMF, *Country Report No. 12/35*, February 2012,

<http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/scr/2012/cr1235.pdf>

<sup>16</sup> IMF, *World Economic Outlook 2013*, <http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/weo/2013/01/pdf/text.pdf>

<sup>17</sup> Population Council (2013), *Capturing the Demographic Dividend in Pakistan*,

[http://www.popcouncil.org/pdfs/2013\\_PakistanDividend/Chapter6.pdf](http://www.popcouncil.org/pdfs/2013_PakistanDividend/Chapter6.pdf)

In 2008, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) approved a US\$7.6 billion stand-by arrangement to support Pakistan's macroeconomic stabilisation program.<sup>18</sup> This committed Pakistan to economic reforms designed to increase government revenue, broaden the tax base and eliminate energy tariff subsidies. Measures were not fully implemented before the arrangement lapsed at the end of 2011. Media reports in May 2013 indicated that Pakistan repaid an installment of US\$386 million in debt to the IMF on 26 May 2013 and will pay another US\$140 million by 28 June 2013.

### **Governance, devolution and elections**

Good governance continues to be a challenge. Pakistan ranked 139 out of 176 countries listed in Transparency International's 2012 Corruption Perceptions Index.<sup>19</sup> At 14.36 per cent, government revenue as a share of gross domestic product ranked Pakistan as the third lowest in 42 countries classified as fragile and conflict affected<sup>20</sup> by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development.<sup>21</sup> This, coupled with endemic corruption and poor institutional capability, severely limits government service provision and constrains inclusive development.

While donors broadly welcomed the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment to Pakistan's Constitution in 2010, which devolved a number of responsibilities, such as education, health and local government, from the federal government to provincial governments,<sup>22</sup> implementation has been problematic. While the Federal Government has provided certainty in revenue distribution to provinces, it lacks oversight of provincial budget decisions. Shifting provincial priorities have resulted in increased budget uncertainty for sector planning. For example, analysis of the KP health budget has highlighted underfunding for drugs and medicines since 2011, while allocations for repairs and maintenance for district health facilities are down 5% since 2010–11.<sup>23</sup>

Pakistan's 2013 election resulted in the first democratic transition since independence. With this important milestone, the foundations for effective government are now in place with the moderate Pakistan Muslim League leading a majority federal government. The Government faces significant pressure to reform the economy and solve the energy crisis during its five-year term. Early indications suggest it will seek to rationalise the tax base to increase revenues to reduce the budget deficit, direct energy subsidies more accurately to the poor and introduce policies to encourage greater foreign direct investment. However, powerful political interests are at play and the Government needs considerable determination to push through these reforms.

### **Australia's development assistance**

Against this challenging context, Australia's development assistance program continues to grow. In 2012–13 we committed \$85.7 million in ODA.

Australia focuses most of its aid on the border areas with Afghanistan, including the provinces of Balochistan, FATA and KP. These areas are home to some of Pakistan's most vulnerable populations and are where we can best apply resources to meet gaps in donor assistance. Our development assistance in Balochistan and KP began in 1998 in the health sector. Australia's

---

<sup>18</sup> <http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2008/pr08303.htm>

<sup>19</sup> Transparency International, <http://cpi.transparency.org/cpi2012/results/#myAnchor1>

<sup>20</sup> Pakistan figures for 2010 from 'Fragile states 2013: Resource flows and trends in a shifting world—OECD 2012'.

<sup>21</sup> Ibid.

<sup>22</sup> *Pakistan General Elections: Report of the Commonwealth Observer Mission 11 May 2013*, Commonwealth Secretariat.

<sup>23</sup> 'Health and the Health Sector in Pakistan: An issues paper contributing to a new health delivery framework for AusAID in Pakistan', December 2012, Health Resource Facility.

recent investment through a World Bank-managed Multi-Donor Trust Fund (MDTF) in 2009 has seen Australia's engagement extend to FATA.

Australian aid is managed principally by DFAT, with 6.5 per cent of the program delivered by the Australian Centre for International Agricultural Research (ACIAR) and the Australian Federal Police. DFAT manages its assistance through partnerships with multilateral, bilateral and non-government organisation (NGO) partners including the World Bank, United Nations (UN) agencies, the United Kingdom's Department for International Development (DFID) and Save the Children. This approach leverages larger investment, improves donor coordination, shares expertise and minimises duplication and shares risk. For example, DFAT participates in joint monitoring and evaluation activities with partners.

Australia's bilateral investments are complemented by a South and West Asia regional program that supports broader regional approaches to climate change and economic integration, benefiting Pakistan.

The Australia – Pakistan Development Partnership agreement expires in June 2013 and will be re-negotiated in 2014. Under the partnership, Australia and Pakistan will agree on a new country program strategy for Australian aid, focused on supporting the Government of Pakistan to maintain a stable, secure and democratic country through equitable social and economic development and poverty reduction. The strategy will focus on three high-level program objectives:

- > To provide basic services, particularly to women and children, in health, education and rural development through credible and experienced partners.
- > To address the needs of communities most vulnerable to the effects of conflict, remoteness, marginalisation, and natural hazards and disasters.
- > To engage with national and provincial governments on development priorities that reduce poverty and support greater peace and stability in Pakistan.

These new objectives align with Pakistan's national and provincial development plans, relevant sector-specific strategies and the Australian Government's aid policy priorities.

## Expenditure

To align with the timing of the Annual Review of Aid Effectiveness, APPRs are moving from calendar year to financial year reporting. As a result, for this year financial expenditure will be reported in two periods, the first covering January 2012 to June 2012, with the second covering the 2012–13 financial year.

Table 1A Expenditure 01 Jan 2012- 30 Jun 2012

Objective	A\$ million	% of bilateral program*
Objective 1: To provide basic services, particularly to women and children, in health, education and rural development through credible and experienced partners.	11.9	15
Objective 2: To address the needs of communities most vulnerable to the effects of conflict, remoteness, marginalisation, natural hazards and disasters.	9.9	12.5
Objective 3: To engage with national and provincial governments on development priorities that reduce poverty and support greater peace and stability.	16.7	21.2

\*Note: The expenditure figures are for a six-month period, and are a proportion of the 2011–12 financial year bilateral program budget of \$78.9 million.

Table 1B Estimated expenditure in FY 2012-13\*

Objective	A\$ million	% of bilateral program
Objective 1: To provide basic services, particularly to women and children, in health, education and rural development through credible and experienced partners.	34	53
Objective 2: To address the needs of communities most vulnerable to the effects of conflict, remoteness, marginalisation, natural hazards and disasters.	14.1	21.9
Objective 3: To engage with national and provincial governments on development priorities that reduce poverty and support greater peace and stability.	16	25

\*Note: These figures have been updated since the estimate of \$70.1 million from *Budget: Australia's international development assistance program 2012-13*, and are based on the updated estimate of the bilateral program budget of \$64.1 million.

## Progress towards objectives

In 2013–14, the program will develop and negotiate a new country program strategy and performance assessment framework, which will help DFAT measure performance of investments and ensure that reporting aligns with agreed performance objectives. For 2012–13, our reporting against the new objectives as part of the program’s new strategic framework can form the basis for future reporting.

Table 2 Rating of the program's progress towards the objectives

Objective	Current Rating
Objective 1	Amber
Objective 2	Amber
Objective 3	Amber

Note:

- Green. Progress is as expected for this point in time and it is likely that the objective will be achieved. Standard program management practices are sufficient.
- Amber. Progress is somewhat less than expected for this point in time and restorative action will be necessary if the objective is to be achieved. Close performance monitoring is recommended.
- Red. Progress is significantly less than expected for this point in time and the objective is not likely to be met given available resources and priorities. Recasting the objective may be required.

### Objective 1: To provide basic services, particularly to women and children, in health, education and rural development through credible and experienced partners.

*The amber rating reflects that a number of factors hampered progress against this objective. Insecurity and national and provincial elections significantly inhibited the implementation of programs during the reporting period. The push to devolve service delivery responsibility to provinces exposed significant capacity deficits, hampering efforts designed to deliver assistance through government.*

Australia’s assistance is producing early results, particularly in advancing provincial-level health and education policies and plans. We have been instrumental in securing commitments from the Government of KP to introduce early childhood education. Rural development initiatives delivered some good results, but the footprint of DFAT’s engagement limits the number who directly benefit.

**Australia's health and education assistance addresses factors that support human development.** DFAT’s focus on: maternal, neonatal and child healthcare, especially on the critical first five years of life; avoidable blindness; nutrition; and engagement in early childhood development; and basic education aim to support Pakistan's efforts to give the next

generation of women and men the best chance for a peaceful and productive life. DFAT's rural development assistance supports farmers to better access markets, and tests and introduces appropriate technologies and processes that will, in time, strengthen rural livelihoods, particularly of vulnerable communities in border regions.

**Gender equality and women's empowerment are integrated at every step of the program's design, implementation, and monitoring and evaluation process.** An example of this is a program under the joint DFAT – Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) initiative, the CESSD III Project (Citizen Engagement for Effective Service Delivery) in KP. Through this program, women are encouraged to have a stake and participate in parent teacher councils so they are equally involved in running their local schools.

**Australia's aid program in Pakistan focuses principally on KP and Balochistan,** two provinces with some of the lowest development indicators. A low population density makes providing basic services difficult. Two examples illustrating this are:

- > the female literacy rate in KP, estimated at 31 per cent (down to 3 per cent in one district) compared to the national average of 45 per cent<sup>24</sup>
- > poverty incidence (people living on less than US\$1.25 per day) in Balochistan is 50.9 per cent<sup>25</sup> compared to the national average of 21 per cent.<sup>26</sup>

**The difficult operating environment has meant that some programs are off track.** Our partnership with DFID<sup>27</sup> to support the KP Government's Education Sector Plan has moved much slower than anticipated, owing in large part to limited government capacity and a hiatus in government decision making in the lead up to elections.

**With rural development, some livelihood programs operate in Balochistan.** This work is being structured to increase engagement with farmers in border provinces to ensure innovative farming practices are taken up in these remote areas. One program (managed by ACIAR) operates in Punjab and Sindh.

**To mitigate the risks of working in Pakistan, Australia delivers its health, education and rural development programs through credible and experienced partners,** such as the World Bank, UN agencies, other donors such as DFID, and international and domestic NGOs. Working through these partners also allows us to invest in larger programs to achieve more significant and sustainable results. DFAT's ability to directly monitor programs in Pakistan is extremely limited by security issues, so there is reliance on regular monitoring by implementing partners and third party validation to track programs and results. Many of DFAT's partners commission remote monitoring to monitor on their behalf. For example, the World Bank MDTF for KP, FATA and Balochistan has local monitoring agents to undertake this work in each province. However, the capacity of locally based monitoring and evaluation agencies is limited so it is no panacea to the challenge of being able to comprehensively monitor our programs.

**Australia's assistance to the health sector aims to improve maternal and child health, reduce childhood malnutrition and reduce the incidence of avoidable blindness.** Our efforts to improve maternal and child health are aligned with national and provincial government strategies. These strategies aim to fill gaps in the health system; primarily through providing emergency obstetric and new-born services, training a new cadre of community midwives, and introducing improved management systems, especially at provincial and

---

<sup>24</sup> UNDP and Government of KP (2011), *Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Millennium Development Goals Report 2011*.

<sup>25</sup> UNDP and Government of Balochistan (2011), *Balochistan Millennium Development Goals Report 2011*.

<sup>26</sup> World Bank (2012), World Development Indicators.

<sup>27</sup> Australia's contribution currently makes up 24 per cent of the program.

district levels, to support delivering MNCH services. Long-term goals are to reduce the maternal mortality ratio to 200 per 100 000 live births (from 260) and lower the neonatal mortality rate to less than 40 per 1000 live births (from 54).<sup>28</sup>

**Australia's support to the health sector, post devolution, has contributed to the development of provincial health and nutrition plans which provide all donors, including DFAT, with the opportunity to align support.** Our collaboration with DFID to support the Government of Pakistan to implement its National MNCH Program has supported the development of provincial health plans for Balochistan, KP, Punjab and Sindh.

**Australia's partnership with DFID (as part of our MNCH delegated cooperation agreement) is on track to achieve most objectives,** particularly those related to increasing the number of skilled birth attendants and institutional deliveries in public sector facilities. Australian support has already helped 8078 community midwives to complete training, of which 4859 have been deployed to serve.<sup>29</sup> More than 9200 healthcare workers have also been trained in newborn childhood illnesses, emergency obstetrics and newborn care, as well as in ultra-sound and family planning in rural areas.<sup>30</sup> Deliveries attended by a community midwife per month increased in the last 12 months from 1.6 to 3, while institutional deliveries in public sector facilities increased from 11 per cent in 2010 to 13.2 per cent in 2011 and to 19 per cent in the first quarter of 2013.<sup>31</sup>

**Australia's recently approved support to the World Bank's MDTF for Nutrition will support the implementation of the National Nutrition Strategy in Balochistan and KP.** With this support, by 2016–17 we aim to provide nutrition services in Balochistan to 167 000 women of childbearing age and 207 000 children aged zero to 24 months.. Similar figures will be available for KP when project designs are finalised.

**Australia supports the Government of Pakistan to reduce the incidence of avoidable blindness.** Through a partnership with the Fred Hollows Foundation, DFAT continued to make a substantive contribution through the second phase of the Pakistan District Eye Care Project (PADEC Phase II) and the Pakistan Australia Sub-Specialty Eye Care Project (PASEC). In 2012, 290 healthcare workers were trained various skills related to eye care, more than 13 000 cataract surgeries performed and 2496 free spectacles provided for children. In delivering these services, the Fred Hollows Foundation aims to maximise access for women and girls by:

- > training and deploying Lady Health Workers who can reach women and girls
- > launching initiatives in the public sector (so people on low incomes can access services)
- > providing separate treatment and waiting room areas for women.

These minor inputs provide substantially greater access to eye care for females. In some districts, project data shows women are visiting eye units more than the men.<sup>32</sup>

**Australia has made catalytic investments in early childhood education, which has markedly improved the availability and quality of early childhood schooling in KP.**

Through a project with Save the Children, DFAT aims to improve educational outcomes and access to 120 000 children in 400 government schools in KP for children aged 3 to 8 years of age. In 2012, this project trained more than 1500 teachers, refurbished 160 classrooms,

---

<sup>28</sup> Quality at Implementation Report for *Delivering Better Health Budget Initiative/ Pakistan: Improving Maternal and Child Health (MNCH)*.

<sup>29</sup> Aide Memoire, 4<sup>th</sup> Annual Review of the National MNCH program for 2012, p.6.

<sup>30</sup> Ibid.

<sup>31</sup> Ibid.

<sup>32</sup> 2012–13 Quality at Implementation report for PASEC (2012–13), p. 6; 2012–13 Quality at Implementation for PADEC II, p.7.



supported early childhood curriculum development and established 136 school libraries and book banks.<sup>33</sup> This early success has resulted in children moving from private schools to the government schools participating in the program, as parents consider the quality of education in government schools to now be superior.

**The Government of KP, as a consequence of the success of this project, has formally introduced early childhood care and education (ECCE) to the school system.** As part of its plan to expand the project across other districts, the Government has allocated funds to build 500 additional ECCE classrooms.<sup>34</sup>

**The joint DFAT – CIDA CESSD III Project<sup>35</sup> has seen attendance rates of students markedly improve in KP.** Reporting on student enrolment rates in CESSD-designated schools in KP indicate overall enrolment rates have improved from 31 per cent to 64 per cent, which includes an improvement in enrolment rates for boys of 31 per cent and for girls of 36 per cent. .<sup>36</sup>

**The Australian Government-supported education programs have not all had the desired impact.** The Australian Government-supported Early Childhood Development Project (ECDP), delivered by the Aga Khan Foundation (AKF) suffered delays in 2011 and early 2012 due to insecurity preventing AKF from contracting construction firms and a high turnover in government officials and teachers. A mid-term review identified some progress and recommended a two-year, no-cost extension to enable planned work to be completed. Given these challenges, DFAT and AKF have agreed on a strategy to more closely guide the project to achieve results. The AKF programs have been extended until 2015 to ensure outcomes are met.

**Australia's assistance to the agriculture and rural development sector in Pakistan aims to improve livelihoods for the rural poor in Pakistan.** Australia—aligning with the Government of Pakistan's Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper II 2009—is collaborating with a number of partners to build Pakistan's technical capacity to improve agricultural production. Through ACIAR's Agriculture Sector Linkages Program (ASLP) Phase II, Australia is helping to build linkages between Pakistan's research agencies, expand local research capacity and test agricultural technologies and approaches. While lacking the capacity to support farmers at scale, the program's innovations are being adopted by farmers participating in trial activities. For example, 1300 smallholder farmers have been engaged in adopting new practices to improve the productivity and health of their dairy herds.

**Developing effective pro-poor approaches to enhance rural employment opportunities and incomes remain a challenge.** While the ASLP has made strong progress in building Pakistan's agricultural research capacity and allowed some products to secure new markets, adopting improved farm management practices and greater market access for smallholders remains limited. Our other rural development activities, however, more directly target improving the livelihoods of poor rural communities. In 2012–13, the Sarhad Rural Support Programme in KP increased the incomes of 725 poor women and 175 men, and provided access to agricultural technologies for 295 poor women and 323 men. The program also established 145 infrastructure schemes, providing almost 360 000 men and women with access to clean drinking water, improved irrigation, improved sanitation and better market access through building link roads.<sup>37</sup>

---

<sup>33</sup> Save the Children Beneficiary Matrix June 2012 to February 2013.

<sup>34</sup> Ibid.

<sup>35</sup> Australia's contribution currently makes up 50 per cent of the program.

<sup>36</sup> *CESSD III, Cowater Annual Report 2012-13*, Cowater International.

<sup>37</sup> *Sarhad Rural Support Program Annual Report 2012–13*.

**Australia is supporting a Balochistan Border Areas program implemented by the Food and Agricultural Organisation (FAO) to improve the pro-poor focus of DFAT's contribution to the rural development sector.** While in its early stages of implementation, the program extends a successful USAID-sponsored initiative to another six districts. The new initiative will improve food and nutrition security and increase the income of up to 30 600 poor households from 340 rural communities.

**Objective 2: To address the needs of communities most vulnerable to the effects of conflict, remoteness, marginalisation, natural hazards and disasters.**

*The amber rating reflects that, while individual activities have performed well in a difficult operating environment, Australia's engagement is reactive and at times lacks strategic direction. Much of our humanitarian funding has been recently disbursed and not all results were available at time of writing.*

**Beyond security-related drivers, a rapidly growing population moving to marginal land that is more vulnerable to disaster, coupled with environmental degradation and poor economic performance, make Pakistan extremely sensitive to staple food and energy price fluctuations.** Australia's humanitarian partners performed well in 2012–13, despite a difficult operating environment. A challenge for the coordination of an effective international disaster response has been the reluctance of the Pakistan Government to call for international help or agree to the initiation of a common appeal in times of major crisis, and restrictions on access to affected populations by humanitarian workers.

From July 2012 to May 2013, 25 Pakistani humanitarian workers were killed and four kidnapped in targeted attacks in FATA, KP and Sindh. This insecurity meant that Australia and its partners could not directly monitor activities and relied on third parties to verify results.

**In 2012 Australia provided life-saving assistance to vulnerable communities to help them recover from natural disasters and conflict.** The department supported the FAO to help 245 000 vulnerable people (35 000 farming families) recover livelihoods following the 2011 Pakistan floods through the provision of seeds, fertiliser and agricultural training.<sup>38</sup> An assessment of FAO's livelihood initiatives indicated that every US\$1 invested generated US\$3.03 worth of production value for beneficiaries.<sup>39</sup> Australia provided the major portion of its humanitarian assistance through the World Food Programme's (WFP) Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation.<sup>40</sup> As the world's largest food aid provider, the WFP has the purchasing power to source food close to the destination, saving transport costs and ensuring food is culturally and nutritionally appropriate. This maximises the aid dollar impact to deliver a humanitarian outcome. In 2012, the WFP provided food assistance to more than 7.9 million people affected by floods and displaced by conflict in FATA and KP. Another 975 000 internally displaced people were assisted in 2013.<sup>41</sup>

**In the first half of 2013, Australian funds assisted the UN High Commissioner for Refugees to provide protection to and meet the basic needs (shelter, health, education and water and sanitation) of 1.5 million Afghan refugees, 700 000 internally displaced people and their host communities.** Another 400 000 former internally displaced people who still required humanitarian assistance were helped on return to their homes.

---

<sup>38</sup> FAO (2013), *Emergency livelihood assistance to support flood-affected vulnerable farmers in Sindh Province, Pakistan – Final Report*.

<sup>39</sup> Ibid.

<sup>40</sup> Australia's contribution currently makes up 1.9 per cent of the program.

<sup>41</sup> WFP (2013), *Standard Project Report 2012—Pakistan— Food Assistance for Household Food Security, Early Recovery and Social Stability*.

**Straddling the humanitarian and development divide, Australia continued to support post-disaster and post-conflict reconstruction through the World Bank's MDTF for KP, FATA and Balochistan.**<sup>42</sup> Working through provincial government systems has led to delays in project implementation. However, the MDTF picked up pace this year with 12 km of road completed and 181 small and medium enterprises supported to rebuild their businesses, creating 210 additional jobs in the process.<sup>43</sup> Through its efforts in the sensitive area of justice reform, the MDTF supported the peaceful resolution of 190 legal cases by the FATA Tribunal (some of which had been pending since 1998) and 532 cases by the Ombudsman's Office. The Australian Government was engaged in a recent donor review that found the MDTF has proved to be a catalyst for better planning and prioritising of development investments by provincial governments and donors. It achieved this through its ability to bring together partners, its technical analysis and its capacity building ability in core areas of government.

**Despite the effectiveness of individual activities, Australia's humanitarian investments have been largely reactive, responding to those most in need in the midst of conflict or in the wake of natural disasters.** The massive damages or losses resulting from a series of major disasters in Pakistan highlighted the need to invest more heavily in disaster preparedness, management and risk reduction. DFAT does not support stand-alone disaster risk reduction programs in Pakistan, but has incorporated disaster risk reduction into some, although not all, of the programs it supports. The department identified the vulnerability of school buildings; supported the development of a Safe School Strategy; constructed and refurbished schools to earthquake resilient standards; trained government officials departments, school staff, students and parent-teacher communities to prepare for and respond to disasters; prepared disaster risk reduction modules for teacher training; and constructed flood protection for agricultural land. Australian Government funds have also helped strengthen the capacity of the Balochistan Provincial Disaster Management Authority to prepare for and respond to disasters, under the World Bank's MDTF for KP, FATA and Balochistan.

**Many humanitarian and development challenges call for a medium to long-term strategy that positions the humanitarian program to work within the broader development framework.** DFAT has begun work on a delivery strategy to guide humanitarian and disaster risk reduction activities in Pakistan. With completion planned by mid-2014, this strategy will further integrate disaster risk reduction activities across all Australian development activities.

### **Objective 3: To engage with national and provincial governments on development priorities that reduce poverty and support greater peace and stability.**

*Australia has achieved modest progress in supporting strengthened electoral processes, provincial government education sector plans and a national health program. The amber rating reflects that, in spite of this progress, overall government engagement remained limited. Security concerns hampered the ability of Australian embassy staff to travel and meet regularly with provincial government officials, and general elections made it difficult to engage with key government counterparts, particularly during the caretaker period. This delayed the renewing of the Australia – Pakistan Development Partnership.*

Since independence, Pakistan has moved between periods of democracy and military rule, disrupting the development of the key institutions of a democratic state. With new signs of political stability and the increased role of provincial governments post-devolution, Australian aid needs to focus support on home-grown efforts to strengthen state legitimacy and help build

---

<sup>42</sup> Australia's contribution currently makes up 16 per cent of the program.

<sup>43</sup> World Bank records.

the compact between state and citizens to provide the necessary foundation for a more peaceful and stable state.

**Given that Australian ODA to Pakistan represents a very small contribution of Pakistan's total ODA (1.8 per cent), DFAT has limited its engagement to a few strategic areas.** DFAT's engagement in governance has focused on supporting government policy and planning in education and health through sector-based investments. The Australian Government's direct governance programming in the reporting year also focused on support to the May 2013 elections. Another important area of engagement with national and provincial governments was our support to provincial-level education sector plans and a national health program.

**Australia has made good progress on strengthening the electoral system and processes.** In partnership with UNDP<sup>44</sup>, the Australian Government supported the Electoral Commission of Pakistan (ECP) to prepare for the May 11 elections. This support helped train more than 330 000 election officials, support a voter education campaign focusing on women and youth, and delivered 65 000 ballot boxes.<sup>45</sup> The Australian Government also supported the ECP to implement its strategic plan; strengthen electoral laws and procedures; and improve the engagement of citizens, particularly women, in electoral processes. Early reporting on the election noted improvement in administrative arrangements and voter turnout, estimated at 60 per cent, but expressed concern about the high level of violence and low numbers of women candidates and polling officials.

**Progress has also been made through Australian support to provincial governments to help them develop and implement provincial-level education sector plans.** These plans provide an overall framework for provincial governments to identify policy targets to improve services. They also provide donors with a way to align support to the education sector and to guide policy discussion with authorities. DFAT, through DFID, provides joint support for the implementation of the KP Education Sector Plan. Implementation was delayed over 2012 as the capacity to deliver reform in the education department was limited, and relationships with other key departments required strengthening. Capacity gaps were compounded by delays in deploying a technical assistance team. Some delays were addressed in late 2012 and the program is now showing stronger performance with the delivery of stipends to 400 000 girls and grants to more than 6000 Parent – Teacher Committees. The stipends are allowing 69 per cent of girls to attend school regularly.<sup>46</sup>

**In partnership with the German Agency for International Cooperation, DFAT is supporting the KP Education Capacity Development Strategy.** During 2011, Australian support enabled in-service training and supervision for teachers to be provided in selected schools. This resulted in improved learning outcomes in target schools with total achievement scores 9 per cent higher for Grade 3 students and 7 per cent higher for Grade 5 students. These positive outcomes led the Government of KP to agree to scaling up training and supervision to all schools in three districts. In March 2013, as a result of the success of the Australian-funded ECCE Program in KP, the Government of KP further demonstrated its commitment to improved education services by formalising the four-year-old starting age for pre-primary classes and allocating government funds to build 500 early childhood classrooms.<sup>47</sup>

**Australia's assistance to education in Pakistan has helped the Government of KP improve the quality of, and access to, education for girls and boys.** In this province, 16 per

---

<sup>44</sup> Australia's contribution currently makes up 38 per cent of the program.

<sup>45</sup> UNDP Election Program Quarterly Progress reports and field reports.

<sup>46</sup> *Third Party Validation of Stipends to Girl Students in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa*, p. 30.

<sup>47</sup> Announced by the Secretary of the Government of KP's Elementary and Secondary Education Department at the KP Education Donor Coordination Meeting, 2 May 2013.

cent of children aged 5 to 16 years of age, and 65 per cent of children aged 3 to 5 years of age, are not attending school. The Government of KP has prioritised the implementation of an education strategy designed to redress these deficits and improve the equity and quality of education, allocating 16 per cent of its development spending for 2013–14 to education (approximately \$125 million). It is also acting to ensure that 70 per cent of the ODA budget to KP benefits girls through incentives including accommodation, transport and allowances for female teachers and deputy education officers working in underdeveloped areas, as well as a scholarship program for girls living in the most undeveloped districts of the province.

**Pakistan is making slow progress in reducing maternal, newborn and child mortality.**

However, as noted in Objective 1, Australia's partnership with DFID to support the Government of Pakistan to implement its National MNCH Program is on track to achieve most objectives. Our support to the Research and Advocacy Fund and the Technical Resource Facility helped inform a revision of the community midwives curriculum. This was approved by the Pakistan Nursing Council and measures were taken to introduce more reforms in the examination system. DFAT has recently invested in a World Bank-managed MDTF which will support the implementation of government nutrition strategies and programs to expand the coverage and access to nutrition services. DFAT expects to report on results in 2013–14.

**Despite progress at program level, overall engagement by Australia with provincial and national governments was limited during the reporting period.** At the national level, government inertia meant that the main forum for aid coordination and development policy engagement, the Pakistan Development Forum has not been convened since November 2010. A subgrouping of the Government and the 10 major donors in the Pakistan Development Forum, the D10, also did not meet during the period.

**With devolution, provincial governments play an increasingly pivotal role in the delivery of basic services in Pakistan.** However high levels of insecurity limited Australian embassy staff's visits to Balochistan and KP to seven with none taking place in the first half of 2013. This reduced our capacity to directly monitor investments. As some of DFAT's bigger programs are delivered through delegated cooperation arrangements, there is a risk of decreasing visibility of Australian support to development programs at provincial level.

**Opportunities for high-level policy discussion with national and provincial governments were limited during the lead up to the May 2013 elections.** At official level, the caretaker period meant that many key counterparts were redeployed, which halted preparations for the senior-level dialogue to be held under the Australia – Pakistan Development Partnership agreement, due to expire on 30 June 2013. This dialogue is an important mechanism for the Australian Government's bilateral policy engagement with the Government of Pakistan. The first was held in Islamabad on 28 March 2012.

At the dialogue, it was agreed that the Australian Government develop a new strategy for Australia's aid program in Pakistan to focus on fewer sectors and larger programs but remain largely geographically focused on Balochistan and KP. Talks will resume on the partnership and the new country program strategy once ministers and senior officials are in their positions under the new government.

## Quality at Implementation ratings

Pakistan is a difficult environment in which to deliver effective aid. Flood recovery and responses to the consecutive floods of 2010, 2011 and 2012, as well as ongoing security concerns and challenges engaging with key government contacts, made it difficult to progress many activities. It also made it difficult for the aid program to monitor implementation. For these reasons, DFAT relies heavily on working through delegated cooperation arrangements with other bilateral organisations (DFID and CIDA) and multilateral organisations (the World Bank and FAO). Despite limitations, most partnerships are operating well and some—such as

the World Bank MDTF for KP Balochistan and FATA—improved performance during the reporting period.

As a result of these challenges, there has been very little change in Quality at Implementation ratings this year. Long-standing, well-established programs—such as those delivered by the Fred Hollows Foundation and Save the Children—continued to deliver good results and all but three programs continued to be rated 4 or 5 in each criterion.

## Partner performance

As a part of this APPR, DFAT assessed its partnerships and identified some key developments and challenges. DFAT relies heavily on working through delegated cooperation arrangements with larger bilateral and multilateral development organisations. These arrangements allow DFAT to leverage the reach, capacity and authority of these agencies with national stakeholders to maximise results.

In 2011–12, the Australian Government entered into a delegated cooperation agreement with DFID to support the KP Education Sector Program. In 2012, program implementation was delayed due to limited capacity for reform in the education department, and required strengthening of relationships with other key departments. Gaps in the capacity of provincial government departments were compounded by delays in deploying a technical assistance team. In 2013, DFID is working to address these issues and DFAT is providing support with a DFAT secondment to DFID, to assist with program implementation. DFAT will also initiate a formalised engagement strategy to be agreed by the heads of DFAT and DFID at Post.

The partnership with the World Bank MDTF for Balochistan, FATA and KP improved performance during the reporting period. Recognising its leadership in areas such as nutrition, the Australian Government became the founding donor of a World Bank MDTF for improved nutrition which will support improved nutrition for children and mothers in Balochistan and KP.

DFAT support to avoidable blindness has been delivered through the Fred Hollows Foundation. The Foundation is moving from direct health service delivery to working with health systems to improve eye-care programs in Pakistan. This change could potentially raise challenges for DFAT given the Foundation's relatively limited experience in system strengthening at the provincial level in Pakistan. DFAT is working closely with the Foundation to ensure the program delivers on strengthening eye health service delivery.

The World Bank is an important development partner for DFAT in the area of nutrition, with a solid track record and significant expertise in designing and implementing large-scale health programs. It is also one of the few organisations operating in Pakistan with the capacity to work in all relevant sectors contributing to addressing malnutrition, at the scale necessary for significant impact.

A mid-term review of the ASLP Phase 2, implemented by ACIAR, was conducted in April 2013. The review was supportive of ASLP Phase 2 progress and recommended favourable consideration of Phase 3. It also identified that DFAT and ACIAR need to work more closely.

## Management consequences

### Response to management consequences identified in 2011

The program management actions identified in the 2011 APPR focused on preparing the new country program strategy, increasing engagement with the Government of Pakistan, strengthening partner and donor coordination, and dedicating greater program management and staff resources to support increased activities, including the development of sector

strategies and planning for pipeline activities. Annex A outlines actions taken since the 2011 report in these areas.

These actions have been implemented to the extent possible given the operating environment in Pakistan and the hiatus in government engagement in the lead-up to national and provincial government elections.

In the reporting period:

- > The second Australia – Pakistan Development Partnership talks were initiated but then postponed due to elections.
- > The unanticipated turnover in senior positions in Canberra and Islamabad presented significant challenges for program management. However, an additional Australian-based officer started at Post to oversee the education, governance and scholarships portfolio.
- > Efforts to engage with border province governments were achieved to the degree possible by meeting with interlocutors in Islamabad and Quetta when the security situation allowed (the KP capital of Peshawar was designated ‘do not travel’ for the entire reporting period).
- > Donor coordination efforts continued despite little government leadership, through the ADB-led Donor Coordination Forum and more specific forums such as the KP, Balochistan and FATA MDTF steering and advisory committees.
- > The need for more effective donor coordination efforts at provincial level was identified as a key priority for donors and the Australian Government took steps to broker for small and medium-sized donors to the education sector. In June, Australia was invited to replace the United Kingdom as co-chair of the MDTF Advisory Committee along with the FATA administration.
- > An Australian-based secondment to DFID was approved in the education sector.
- > A review of the overseas-based remuneration framework was completed and a four-month corporate short-term mission approved to conduct a health check of systems and processes at Post, recruit and train an overseas-based Corporate Manager and undertake some higher-level corporate tasks in the interim.
- > DFAT completed a country situation analysis of Pakistan.

### **Program management issues and actions**

**1. Enhance security systems and processes to facilitate performance management and monitoring.** Travel to KP was stopped for the reporting period and travel to other areas ceased for significant periods. The High Commission was forced to close twice during the reporting period, including for four days in January 2013, due to escalated protest activity in Islamabad.

**Consequences:** Staff at Post have been unable to directly monitor investments or hold one-on-one meetings with provincial government officials. This presents a risk to the early identification of program implementation problems and limits the capacity to consult on future programming. It also limits the visibility of Australian aid investments in Pakistan.

Actions planned:

- > Implementation of new travel guidance and other security recommendations, including advanced driver training, once completed and approved by DFAT.

**2. Strengthen policy discourse with implementing partners and national and provincial governments.** As well as security constraints, the lead-up to the elections and resultant spill of positions at senior-official level in key government agencies limited national government engagement. Moribund donor coordination mechanisms limited donor coordination efforts.

**Consequences:** Reduced partner engagement inhibited good quality program planning and coordination, and decreased capacity to promote Australian development contributions with government and community stakeholders. In addition, limited donor coordination risks poor targeting of our aid investments.

Actions planned:

- > Coordinate with other donors to encourage greater leadership from new national and provincial governments.
- > Finalise and implement plans to improve the quality and frequency of engagement with governments and implementing partners. Second an education program officer to DFID.

**3. Finalise country strategy architecture and sectoral focus.** The program does not have a current country strategy and the Pakistan Partnership for Development agreement expired on 30 June 2013. As a result, the current Pakistan program pipeline is undeveloped and requires a stronger strategic framework.

**Consequences:** The Pakistan Government is yet to be engaged in the lead-up to the development of the new country program strategy which may result in disagreement about the focus of Australian aid to 2018. Failure to finalise the strategy, and lower-level delivery strategies, may result in poor program alignment. This could, in turn, undermine the achievement of results contributing to whole-of-program outcomes.

Actions planned:

- > Finalise the country program strategy; secure renewal of the partnership; and secure agreement for the strategy from the Government of Pakistan.
- > Finalise critical delivery strategies (humanitarian and disaster risk reduction and education sector) and review current investments to ensure strategic alignment.

**4. Establish internal corporate systems and management capacity.** The DFAT Counsellor has a significant corporate workload and needs additional corporate support for day-to-day finance and office management.

**Consequences:** The Counsellor has limited time to focus on developing and managing the program and developing strong relationships with Pakistan government officials and other development partners.

Actions planned:

- > Recruit a Corporate Manager and action critical corporate reforms.

Most significant risks	Management response
Difficult operating environment limits program monitoring and engagement with government	Implementation of comprehensive new travel guidance informed by assessment undertaken by DFAT's Security Management Section, and introduction of mandatory training for all staff.
Limited partner engagement inhibits good program planning and coordination	Active participation in all government-donor fora, including leadership of the donor group convened to increase the influence of smaller donors in the education sector, and co-convening a nutrition partners' forum.
Limited opportunities to engage with government officials due to caretaker period and the May 2013 election	Plans to initiate discussions at senior level as soon as possible and set a date for partnership discussions.



---

Risk to program coherence due to lack of strategic program framework

Planned development of a country program strategy and performance assessment framework. Work has started on key sector delivery strategies.

---

## Annex A

### Progress in addressing 2011 management consequences

Management consequences identified in 2011 APPR	Rating	Progress made in 2012–13
Preparation of the country program strategy and sector strategies, as well as a country performance framework and a risk management strategy.	Amber	The Pakistan country situational analysis was finalised. Work started on a humanitarian/disaster risk reduction delivery strategy and an education sector delivery strategy. A performance assessment framework will be completed in 2013.
Hold the first partnership talks and start the process for updating the partnership document which lapses in mid-2013.	Amber	The second Australia – Pakistan Development Partnership talks were initiated but then postponed due to elections. A new country program strategy will be negotiated during the talks.
Increase direct engagement with the governments of DFAT's target provinces (Balochistan and KPK), following devolution.	Amber	Efforts to engage with border province governments were achieved to the degree possible by meeting with interlocutors in Islamabad and Quetta when the security situation allowed (the KP capital of Peshawar was designated 'do not travel' for the entire reporting year).
Work with partners to analyse devolution and resource allocation between Pakistan's federal and provincial governments to support service delivery.	Green	Donor coordination efforts continued despite little government leadership, through the ADB-led Donor Coordination Forum and more specific forums such as the KP, Balochistan and FATA MDTF steering and advisory committees.
Promote donor coordination and aid effectiveness through active participation in forums such as the Pakistan Development Forum and continue to advocate for it to be held annually.	Green	The need for more effective donor coordination efforts at provincial level was identified as a key priority for donors. DFAT took steps to broker for small and medium-sized donors to the education sector. Australia agreed in June to replace the United Kingdom as co-chair of the MDTF Advisory Committee, along with the FATA administration.

---

Recruit additional staff for Post, including an additional First Secretary, an agricultural and rural development adviser and corporate support positions.

Green

The unanticipated turnover in senior positions in Canberra and Islamabad presented significant challenges for program management. However, an additional Australian-based officer started at Post to oversee the education, governance and scholarships portfolio. A short term mission to scope corporate needs at Post has been approved.

An Australian-based secondment in the education sector to DFID was approved. A process is underway to fill the role.

A review of the overseas-based remuneration framework was completed and a four-month corporate short-term mission approved to conduct a health check of systems and processes at Post, recruit and train an overseas-based Corporate Manager and undertake some higher-level corporate tasks in the interim.

---

Note:

- Green. Progress is as expected for this point in time and it is likely that the objective will be achieved. Standard program management practices are sufficient.
- Amber. Progress is somewhat less than expected for this point in time and restorative action will be necessary if the objective is to be achieved. Close performance monitoring is recommended.
- Red. Progress is significantly less than expected for this point in time and the objective is not likely to be met given available resources and priorities. Recasting the objective may be required.

## Annex B

### Quality at Implementation ratings

Initiative name	Approved budget and duration	QAI year	Relevance	Effectiveness	Efficiency	Monitoring and evaluation	Sustainability	Gender equality	Risk management
<b>Education</b>									
INJ060—Balochistan Early Childhood Development Project	\$4.75m (2010–13)	2012	5	3	3	4	4	5	I
		2011	4	2	2	4	4	4	I
INJ061—Gilgit-Baltistan Education Development and Improvement Program	\$12.46m (2010–13)	2012	5	4	3	4	3	5	I
		2011	4	4	3	4	4	4	I
INJ785—Early childhood Care and Education in KP Project	\$14m (2011–14)	2012	6	5	5	4	4	5	I
		2011	5	4	5	5	4	5	I
INJ786—Education Sector Development Programme KP	\$7.97m (2011–15)	2012	5	4	4	4	5	5	I
		2011	5	5	5	5	5	5	I
INK420—KP Education Sector Program	\$65.35m (2012–16)	2012	6	4	3	5	4	5	B
INJ290—Interim support to Education in KP	\$11.3m (2010–11)	2011	5	5	5	4	4	5	I
<b>Health</b>									
INH723 (07B452)—Improving Maternal and Child Health	\$30.5m (2008–14)	2012	5	5	5	5	4	5	I
		2011	5	4	4	5	4	5	I
INH723 (11A304)—Joint One UN Program—JPC 3—Nutrition	\$6.98m (2011–12)	2012	5	5	5	4	5	5	I
INH502—Pakistan – Australia sub-Specialty Eye Care Project Phase II	\$5.23m (2007–13)	2012	4	5	5	4	5	5	I
		2011	4	5	5	4	5	5	I
INK363—Integrated Maternal, Newborn and Child Healthcare (IMNCH) Project	\$13.61m (2012–16)	2012	5	5	5	4	4	5	I
INH326—Pakistan – Australia District Comprehensive Eye Care Project (PADECII)	\$2.12m (2007–13)	2012	4	5	5	4	5	5	I
		2011	4	5	5	4	5	5	I
<b>Rural development and agriculture</b>									
INJ207—SRSP Livelihood Strengthening Program	\$9.98m (2010–13)	2012	5	4	4	4	3	4	I
		2011	5	4	4	3	4	4	I
INJ015—Agriculture Sector Linkages Program	\$12.96m (2010–15)	2012	5	4	4	3	4	4	I
		2011	5	4	4	4	4	3	I
INK575—FAO Australian Assistance to Agriculture Development in Balochistan Border Areas	\$12.88m (2012–16)	2012	5	4	4	4	4	4	I

### Good governance

INJ885—Communication for Effective Social Service Delivery II Project	\$3.67m (2011–12)	2012	5	4	5	4	4	5	I
		2011	5	4	4	4	4	5	B
INH868—Border Area Development—Democratic Governance and Social Harmony Program	\$2.9m (2009–12)	2011	4	4	4	3	3	3	I
INK087—Governance Sector Projects/Pakistan UNDP Elections Basket Fund	\$7m (2012–14)	2012	5	5	4	5	3	4	I

### Humanitarian

ING453—Pakistan Earthquake Reconstruction Program*	\$39.99m (2005–12)	2012							
		2011	5	4	5	5	5	4	M
INK576—World Bank MDTF for KP, FATA and Balochistan (started in 2012)	\$23.2m (2009–13)	2012	5	4	4	4	4	5	I

### Scholarships

INI611/INJ492—Australian development scholarships	INI611—\$23.29m (2009–15) INJ492—\$7.78m (2010–15)	2012	5	5	5	4	5	4	I
		2011	5	4	4	5	4	3	I

\* ING453 comprises three activities. Two are now completed and the UNICEF component will undergo a Quality at Implementation in 2013.

#### Definitions of rating scale:

Satisfactory (4, 5 and 6)

■ = 6 = Very high quality

■ = 5 = Good quality

■ = 4 = Adequate quality, needs some work

Less than satisfactory (1, 2 and 3)

■ = 3 = Less than adequate quality; needs significant work

■ = 2 = Poor quality; needs major work to improve

■ = 1 = Very poor quality; needs major overhaul

#### Risk Management scale:

■ Mature (M). Indicates the initiative manager conducts risk discussions on at least a monthly basis with all stakeholders and updates the risk registry quarterly.

■ Intermediate (I). Indicates the initiative manager conducts ad-hoc risk discussion and updates the risk register occasionally.

■ Basic (B). Indicates there are limited or few risk discussions and the risk register has not been updated in the past 12 months.

## Annex C

### Evaluation and review pipeline planning

List of evaluations completed in the reporting period

Name of Initiative	Aidworks number	Type of evaluation	Date evaluation report received	Date evaluation report uploaded Into Aidworks	Date management response uploaded Into Aidworks	Published on website
Balochistan—Early Childhood Development Project	INJ060	Mid-term review	February 2013	29 May 2013	30 May 2013	No
Gilgit-Baltistan education development and improvement program	INJ061	Mid-term review	February 2013	29 May 2013	30 May 2013	No
Early childhood care and education in KP	INJ785	Mid-term review	January 2013	29 May 2013	30 May 2013	No
Australian development scholarships	INI611	Independent progress report	March 2013	30 May 2013	30 May 2013	No
Phase 2—Agriculture Sector Linkages Program	INJ015	Mid-term review	June 2013	1 July 2013	To be advised	No

List of evaluations planned in the next 12 months

Name of Initiative	Aidworks number	Type of evaluation	Purpose of evaluation	Expected completion date
Education Sector Development Program KP	INJ786	Joint evaluation	Inform future programming	July 2013
SRSP Livelihood Strengthening Program in KP	INJ027	Completion report	Verify program outcomes and inform potential future programming	October 2013
Joint One UN Program—JPC 3—Nutrition	INH723(11A304)	Completion report	Verify program outcomes	February 2014
Pakistan – Australia District Comprehensive Eye Care Project (PADECI)	INH326	Completion report	Verify program outcomes and inform future programming	July 2014