



Australia Awards

Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility

Case Study in Mongolia -
management and
commerce fields

December 2017



Table of Contents

1. Executive Summary	7
1.1 Findings.....	7
2. Background of the Study	11
2.1 Objectives.....	11
2.2 Scope	11
2.3 Case Studies	11
2.4 Country context.....	12
3. Methodology	14
3.1 Overall Case Study design	14
3.2 Methods.....	15
3.3 Sample	15
3.4 Exclusions.....	18
3.5 Data collection	19
3.6 Process.....	19
3.7 Data management and reporting	19
3.8 Transcription approval and coding.....	19
3.9 Limitations.....	20
4. Development Outcomes	23
Summary findings.....	23
4.1 Introduction	23
4.2 Background.....	24
4.3 Alumni contributions.....	25
4.4 Key enabling factors.....	29
4.5 Key challenging factors	34
5. Economic and Public Diplomacy Outcomes	36
Summary findings.....	36
5.1 Introduction	37
5.2 Background.....	37
5.3 Examples of bilateral collaboration and institutional links	38
5.4 Key enabling factors.....	42
5.5 Key challenging factors	44
6. Views about Australia and Australian Expertise	46
Summary findings.....	46

6.1	Introduction	47
6.2	Background.....	47
6.3	Alumni had positive experiences of life in Australia	48
6.4	Alumni had positive experiences at their Australian institutions.....	48
6.5	Alumni have contributed to the Australia-Mongolia bilateral relationship.....	50
7.	Impact of Australia Awards on addressing equity issues	52
	Summary findings.....	52
7.1	Introduction.....	52
7.2	Gender equality and disability inclusiveness in Mongolia	53
7.3	Access to the Australia Awards scholarships	56
7.4	Impact of Australia Awards in addressing equity issues	60
8.	Conclusion	64
9.	Alumni Profiles	65
10.	References	71
	Annex 1: Case Study propositions	73
	Annex 2: Key participant questions.....	75
	Annex 3: Mongolia Case Study participants	82

Tables

Table 1	Mongolia Case Study alumni participants.....	16
Table 2	Key stakeholder and employer/colleague interviews.....	17

Acronyms and Abbreviations

ADB	Asian Development Bank
CEO	Chief Executive Officer
CPA	Certified Public Accountant
DFAT	Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GESI	Gender Equity & Social Inclusion
GPA	Grade Point Average
IELTS	International English Language Testing System
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
MCRI	Murdoch Children's Research Institute
MoF	Ministry of Finance (Mongolia)
The Mozzies	The Mongolia-Australia Society
NCCM	National Cancer Council Mongolia
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
PCC	Program Coordinating Committee
PPP	Public Private Partnership
SCB	Scholarships and Alumni Branch (DFAT)
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNSW	University of New South Wales
US	United States
UK	United Kingdom
WaSH	water, sanitation and hygiene
WLP	Women's Leadership Program

1. Executive Summary

This report details the outcomes of a Case Study of Australian development scholarship alumni from Mongolia. Alumni in this Case Study completed their scholarships between 2006 and 2010 in management and commerce-related fields of study. This research was conducted by the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade's (DFAT) Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility (the Facility).

1.1 Findings

1.1.1 Development contributions

Alumni in this Case Study provided strong examples of how their Australian Government funded scholarship enabled them to develop the skills, knowledge, or networks to **contribute to Mongolia's national development goals**. These are categorised as:

- developing fiscal policy and strengthening macroeconomic systems
- improving practice in financial risk assessment
- contributing to the capacity development of colleagues.

Factors that **enabled** alumni to contribute to national development goals included:

- strong Australia-Mongolia relations and an effective alumni association
- transferable and practical skills developed on award
- critical mass of alumni in finance sector
- multicultural learning environments in Australia
- alumni's personal motivation
- Mongolia's political and economic climate.

Factors that **challenged** alumni in making contributions toward achieving Mongolia's national development goals were:

- political and institutional changes in the public sector
- resistance to change in the workplace.

Findings presented here suggest that the **Australia Awards long-term Outcome 1 has been achieved**.

1.1.2 Economic and public diplomacy outcomes

Mongolia Case Study alumni provided some **examples of cooperation between Australia and Mongolia** that were developed as a result of studying in Australia. These were:

- an alumnus reconnected with fellow students and Australian institution staff when they visited Mongolia as potential investors and clients
- an alumnus and a key stakeholder fostered new knowledge and new links with Australian businesses and organisations through participating in Australia Awards fellowships.

Factors that **enabled** alumni to develop, maintain, or broaden networks and partnerships with Australia and Australians included the existence of a prominent and valued alumni association – the Mongolia-Australia Society, (the Mozzies), which promotes bilateral networking. In addition, an Australian-led initiative – the Australia Awards in Mongolia’s Women’s Leadership Program (WLP) – has been effective in fostering new networks and alumni networking skills.

Issues that have **challenged** alumni in developing, maintaining, or broadening networks and partnerships with Australia and Australians include a lack of time and opportunity to foster links while on award, and difficulties in harnessing specific sectoral links or partnerships.

Evidence presented here suggests the **Australia Awards long-term Outcomes 2 and 3 have been partly achieved.**

1.1.3 Views of Australia and Australian expertise

Alumni involved in this Case Study emphasised the respect that they have for Australia, Australians and Australian expertise that was fostered during their time studying in Australia. Alumni highlighted that:

- their positive experiences at Australian institutions underpins their positive views of Australian expertise
- they believe the Australia Awards is the ‘best’ scholarships program in Mongolia.

Alumni described promoting studying in Australia, using Australian expertise in their roles, and seeking to work with or recruit graduates of Australian institutions.

Findings presented against the **Australia Awards long-term Outcome 4 suggest that it has been achieved.**

1.1.4 Impact on addressing equity issues

The Australia Awards in Mongolia are proactive in implementing practical steps to **promote gender equality**. One such activity is the WLP which has proved highly effective in supporting Australia Awards alumni to participate equally in the workplace and develop leadership capacity, regardless of gender.

The Australia Awards in Mongolia actively **encourage and support the inclusion of people with disability** at the policy level and through engaging with disability experts. However, broader systemic issues within the education sector present a

major barrier for candidates with disability to meet the eligibility requirements for Australian tertiary scholarships.

1.1.5 Conclusion

The Australia Awards in Mongolia are proactive in implementing practical steps to **promote gender equality**. One such activity is the WLP which has proved highly effective in supporting Australia Awards alumni to participate equally in the workplace and develop leadership capacity, regardless of gender.

The Australia Awards in Mongolia actively **encourage and support the inclusion of people with disability** at the policy level and through engaging with disability experts. However, broader systemic issues within the education sector present a major barrier for candidates with disability to meet the eligibility requirements for Australian tertiary scholarships.

Australia Awards Alumni in Mongolia are supporting Mongolia's integration into global financial markets – study shows

Australia Awards alumni are contributing to:



Development of fiscal policy



Strengthening the bilateral relationship



Increasing credibility of the finance sector



A well-established alumni group

Australia Awards results

1 Alumni provided strong examples of development contributions

Achieved ✓

“The skills I learnt in Australia are relevant for shaping and formulating policies. Now and in the future it will allow us to contribute to the country's development.”



2 Alumni are contributing to cooperation between Australia and Mongolia

Achieved ✓

“The Mozzies serve as a network of Mongolian alumni of Australian universities, nurturing professional links. They actively promote cooperation between the two countries and celebrate the long-term friendship and ongoing cultural links with Australia.”



3 Alumni support effective institutional partnerships between Australia and Mongolia

Partly Achieved

“To improve opportunities for partnerships, maybe the university or certain organisations could facilitate connections between students and professional organisations when on award. Unfortunately, there was no experience like that for me.”



4 Alumni view Australia and Australian expertise positively

Achieved ✓

“Our teachers and lecturers provided advice at any time. They gave us advice on how to write papers and how to overcome some problems. The Australia Awards are the most prestigious scholarships available to us.”



Participants: Alumni who completed scholarships between 2006 and 2010

Case study participants:



- Female alumni
- Male alumni
- Employer of alumni
- Stakeholders

2. Background of the Study

The Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility (the Facility) is a four-year project funded by the Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT). Through this project, DFAT assesses the development contributions and public and economic diplomacy outcomes of Australia's investment in the Australia Awards.¹ The key research and reporting activities being undertaken are quantitative Tracer Surveys and qualitative Case Studies, which are prepared concurrently throughout the four years of the project.

This report presents the key findings of the Mongolia Case Study. Data collection was undertaken by the Facility in Mongolia in late October 2017.

2.1 Objectives

The Facility seeks to generate high-quality information on former scholarship holders, with a focus on less recent alumni. This information will provide a strong evidence base for country programs and the Scholarships and Alumni Branch (SCB) of DFAT to evaluate the impact of Australia Awards on alumni and, by implication, on their home institutions and countries.

2.2 Scope

The scope of the Facility is limited to alumni of DFAT's Australia Awards and previous DFAT-funded scholarships programs, awards (both long and short duration) and fellowships (managed by the Scholarships and Alumni Branch (SCB)).

2.3 Case Studies

The Case Studies are being conducted via an iterative approach whereby the qualitative phase is designed based on what is learned from the initial quantitative phase.

The Facility Case Study methodology is explanatory and multiple in design. That is, cases are selected based on findings from the quantitative (survey) research, and the 'how' and 'why' of alumni experiences is explained in detail. Multiple Case Studies enable the researcher to explore differences within and between cases. Case Studies contribute to the evidence base for country programs, providing useful comparison across cases and Case Studies to build a robust understanding of diverse alumni experience.

2.3.1 Year 1 of the Facility

In the first year of the Facility, however, Case Study countries and themes were based on criteria such as availability and range of alumni details in the Global Alumni database; previous country or thematic research undertaken; investment

¹ See <http://dfat.gov.au/people-to-people/public-diplomacy/Documents/public-diplomacy-strategy-2014-16.pdf> and <http://dfat.gov.au/trade/economic-diplomacy/pages/economic-diplomacy.aspx>

priorities, and partner-country priorities. The cohort for Year 1 Case Studies were alumni who graduated between 1952 and 1995. Case Studies will provide useful vignettes and quotes to build an understanding of alumni experiences. In Year 1, the selected Case Study countries were Fiji, Sri Lanka, Nepal, and Kenya. Field research took place between late October 2016 and March 2017.

2.3.2 Years 2 through 4

Subsequent Case Studies in Years 2 through 4 will be determined through the annual planning process. Case Studies will not be limited to geographic foci, and may be sectoral or regional as determined through findings of the annual Tracer Survey and planning and consultation process. Case Studies will also align with the priorities of the *Australia Awards Global Strategy: Investing in the next generation of global leaders for development 2016-2018* (the Global Strategy) and any other areas of importance as identified by SCB.

In **Year 2**, the selected Case Study countries and sectoral focus are Vanuatu – Law and Justice; Mongolia – Management and Commerce; Solomon Islands – Health; Indonesia – Education; and China – Agriculture, Environment, and Health. Field research will occur between mid-October 2017 and April 2018.

2.4 Country context

Mongolia is the world's most sparsely populated country, with a population of 3 million people and a land area of about 1.6 million sq. km. (UNDP, 2017). Of this, only 0.8 per cent is estimated to be arable land. One-third of Mongolia's population lives in the capital, Ulaanbaatar, and nearly 40 per cent is nomadic, herding livestock.

As a satellite state of the former Soviet Union, Mongolia was primarily an agrarian and centrally-planned economy (DFAT, 2017). However, following the dissolution of the Soviet Union, Mongolia underwent a relatively peaceful democratic revolution leading to a multi-party system, a new constitution in 1992, and a transition to a market economy. This period of change also had a significant impact on people's lives with the decline in trade with Russia by 80 per cent and withdrawal of social service sector support including free education from primary school through to tertiary education (UNDP; Prizzon et al., 2014, pp.8 – 9).

Since this transition to a capitalist democratic country, Mongolia has emerged as a developing country identified as one of the fastest-growing economies in the world. The economy is driven by mineral resources, with mining providing the majority of exports and about 17 per cent of GDP, and a private sector representing over 80 per cent of GDP. (DFAT, 2017; Asian Development Bank, p.3).

In achieving sustainable development, and to ensure inclusive growth, the World Bank (2017) identifies Mongolia 'will need to strengthen governance; build institutional capacity to manage public revenues efficiently; allocate its resources effectively among spending, investing, and saving; and ensure equal opportunities to all its citizens in urban and rural areas'. The focus on industrialisation has led to support for international scholarships by donor

countries such as Australia to assist in building human resource capacity and to 'establish the institutions of civil society'².

² Australian Ambassador to Mongolia, interview with Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility Case Study #6: Mongolia.

3. Methodology

This chapter includes an overview of the Case Study design, development and implementation. This is the sixth Case Study of the Facility. Mongolia was one of five Case Study countries proposed in the Year 2 Facility Annual Plan. Mongolia was selected as a Case Study country on the basis of having sufficiently large number of alumni participating in the Tracer Survey, and a clear alignment with investment in the management and commerce sectors. There was limited previous research covering this cohort and sector.

3.1 Overall Case Study design

The purpose of the Facility Case Studies is to collect detailed qualitative data on the impact and benefits of the Australia Awards. The Case Study methodology proposed is based on the Facility Case Study Approach, which was developed in the inception phase of the Facility and reported in the Annual Plan for Year 1.

The Global Strategy and the Australia Awards Global Monitoring and Evaluation Framework form the basis for the Case Study design. The research questions, propositions, data collection instruments, and report template are built around the long-term outcomes for the Australia Awards articulated in the Global Strategy.

These long-term outcomes are:

1. Alumni are using their skills, knowledge and networks to contribute to sustainable development.
2. Alumni are contributing to cooperation between Australia and partner countries.
3. Effective, mutually advantageous partnerships between institutions and businesses in Australia and partner countries.
4. Alumni view Australia, Australians and Australian expertise positively.

Case Studies also collect and analyse data on how Australia Awards programming addresses equity issues, and how Australia Awards alumni are making positive contributions to equity issues.

Findings reported by alumni are triangulated with relevant stakeholders such as employers and colleagues, and industry bodies providing further evidence to support or refute propositions. This methodology was developed by the Facility and SCB.

The overarching theory that has guided the design of this Case Study methodology is based upon the goal of the Australia Awards that ‘... partner countries progress their development goals and have positive relationships with Australia that advance mutual interests’.

The Case Study research questions are framed by the long-term outcomes of the Australia Awards as guided by the Framework. They are:

- a. How do alumni use the skills, knowledge and networks gained on award to contribute to achieving partner-country development goals?
- b. How are Australia Awards contributing to Australia's economic and public diplomacy outcomes?
- c. How has being an Australia Award alumni impacted alumni?
- d. Are the benefits of receiving a scholarship experienced equally by all groups who have received them?

The primary unit of analysis for this Case Study is the alumni. Case Studies seek to explore how alumni of Australia Awards have acted to contribute to the achievement of the goal and objectives of the Australia Awards.

3.2 Methods

The data collection method used for this Case Study was structured interviews. A set of questions was developed for each key participant group, namely alumni, colleagues and employers (both of alumni and generally), alumni associations; Program Coordination Committee members; and the DFAT staff and managing contractors working on the Australia Awards in partner countries. Questions for each key participant group (see Annex 2) align with the research propositions (located at Annex 1) and long-term outcomes of the Australia Awards. This ensures that data collected directly relate to the key questions the Case Studies are seeking to answer, and that there is consistency across each Case Study.

For this Case Study, Tracer Survey responses provided by alumni were reviewed prior to each interview. This approach was taken to avoid asking alumni questions that had been previously asked in the survey, and to incorporate data already provided, enabling interviewers to probe further on specific topics.

3.3 Sample

The alumni sample selected for this Case Study was chosen from the 39³ alumni who completed the Facility Tracer Survey Year 1 2016-17 (24 women, 14 men). This Case Study is the first to use the Tracer Survey as a means to select cases. At the relevant points in this report, findings from the Case Study are related to the Tracer Survey results (see Facility Tracer Survey Year 1 2016-17 Mongolia Country Report Alumni of 2006-10).

Of the Mongolian alumni who completed the Tracer Survey, 21 studied in the fields of management and commerce (12 women, nine men), which formed the target group for this Case Study. This target group was narrowed to focus on alumni working in a variety of positions in finance related fields which included nine alumni (five women, four men). The final sample of alumni from the target group was selected to ensure diversity across level of employment, gender, urban or rural, and disability (however, no alumni in this cohort identify as a person with disability).

³ Of the 74 scholarship alumni included in the target population, responses were received from 39, a response rate of 53 per cent. The overall survey response rate was 35.9 per cent.

At the time of sampling, the research team sought advice from the Australia Awards in Mongolia, to ensure a mix of urban and rurally located alumni were included in the Case Study. The research team was advised that due to the cohort parameters (2006-10) and sector of management and commerce, the sample comprised only urban dwelling participants. This is consistent with data provided by Mongolian Tracer Survey Year 1 2016-17 participants; all indicated that their current residential location was 'urban'⁴.

3.3.1 Contact details

Contact details existed as a result of collection in the Tracer Survey for all alumni in the target group. Nine alumni were contacted and of these, eight responded, and six were available during the field research timeframe to participate in interviews. These six became the key participants in the Mongolia Case Study (three men and three women). All six alumni live in Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia. Table 1 lists the alumni participants in the Mongolia Study.

Table 1 Mongolia Case Study alumni participants

Name*	Gender	Australian Government scholarship	Institution	Award Completed	Current position
Mr Javkhlanbaatar Sereeter	M	Australian Development Scholarship	Master of International Business University of Sydney	2008-2009	Self-employed consultant
Mr Yamaaranz Sainsanaa	M	Australian Development Scholarship	Master of Financial Management University of Melbourne	2008-2009	Director of International Audit Division, Petrovis Oil LLC
Mr Ognon Khuyagtsogt	M	Australian Development Scholarship	Master of Business Administration Australian National University	2007-2009	Director, Expenditure Division, Fiscal Policy Department, Ministry of Finance (MoF)
Ms Altantsetseg**	F	Australian Development Scholarship	Master of Taxation Curtin University	2006-2007	Consultant

⁴ The Tracer Survey instrument included the item "Current Residential location (Urban/Rural/Remote)"

Name*	Gender	Australian Government scholarship	Institution	Award Completed	Current position
Ms Enebish Ulambayar	F	Australian Development Scholarship	Master of Business Finance Victoria University	2007-2008	Chief Operating Officer, XacBank
Mrs Soyolmaa Dorjnamjaa	F	Australian Development Scholarship	Master of Business Victoria University	2005-2006	Officer, Budget Investment Department, Ministry of Finance (MoF)

*In this report, names are included as given name first, family name last, and hereafter referred to as Ms/Mr (Family Name).

**Ms Altantsetseg is an alias, used as requested for reporting on this Case Study.

In addition to the alumni who participated in the Case Study, 11 other people were interviewed in order to provide context, triangulate alumni perspectives and better understand the impact of the Australian scholarships on the outcomes for Mongolia and Australia.

These additional interviews included current stakeholders such as: the Australian Embassy in Ulaanbaatar; the managing contractor of the Australia Awards in Mongolia; the Mozzies; as well as peak bodies such as the Mongolian Chamber of Commerce and Industry. Where possible and available, employers and colleagues were also interviewed to triangulate alumni data and gather further information about the impact of the alumni.

Table 2 lists these participants. In total, 17 people were interviewed for the Mongolia Case Study in 16 separate interviews.

Table 2 Key stakeholder and employer/colleague interviews

Name*	Position	Reason for interview
Mr Shayne McKenna	First Secretary, Australian Embassy	Australia Awards key stakeholder (DFAT)
H.E. Mr John Langtry	Australian Ambassador to Mongolia	Australia Awards key stakeholder (DFAT)
Ms Yundendorj Tsetsgee	Country Program Manager, Australia Awards in Mongolia (on behalf of Coffey International Development)	Australia Awards key stakeholder
Mrs Lkhagvasuren Ariunaa	Executive Director, The Mongolia-Australia Society (the Mozzies) (Also alumni)	Head of alumni association

Name*	Position	Reason for interview
Mr Chimed Khurelbaatar	Minister of Finance, Government of Mongolia	General employer of Australia Awards alumni
Ms L. Bat-Otgon	Member of the Australia Awards Program Coordinating Committee (PCC)* (co-chaired by the Mongolian and Australian Governments) Executive Director of the Union of the Persons with Disabilities of Mongolia	Gender Equity and Social Inclusion (GESI) expert and Australia Awards Program Coordination Committee Member
Ms Nasanjargal Dolgormaa	Member of the Australia Awards Program Coordinating Committee (PCC) (co-chaired by the Mongolian and Australian Governments) Department Head, Department of the Mongolian Chamber of Commerce and Industry	General employer of Australia Awards alumni, and Australia Awards Program Coordination Committee member
Dr Batmunkh Tsetsegsaikhan	Founder and Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of the Mongolian Cancer Council, and Advisor to the Acting Minister for Health, Government of Mongolia	Graduate of the University of New South Wales (UNSW), an Australian Awards alumni Participated in the first Women's Leadership Program (WLP) in 2015 supported by the Australia Awards in Mongolia
Dr Sanjaasuren Oyun	Executive Director, Zorig Foundation	Zorig Foundation Head
Ms Tsolmon Bayar	Support Officer, Zorig Foundation	Zorig Foundation officer
Ms Maral Gankhuyag	Program Director of the Women's Leadership Program (WLP), Zorig Foundation	Main organiser for the Australia Awards in Mongolia Women's Leadership Program (WLP)

*The PCC is the committee responsible for program oversight and members include representatives from the Government of Australia and Government of Mongolia and other key stakeholders

3.4 Exclusions

Alumni were excluded from the final sample if they did not currently work in management and commerce-related fields. This variable was chosen to ensure that data could be, where possible, cascaded up to the organisation and sector level. When Case Study alumni work in a single sector, researchers can aggregate data, determine the relationship between cases and reach the point of data saturation. This allows researchers to locate patterns and themes related to an organisation, field of study, sector, and the Australia Awards. Without a chosen sector, data can only be related and compared using other variables such as cohort, age, field of study, gender, and country.

Steps were also taken to ensure a gender balance and diversity across level of employment within the finance sector.

3.5 Data collection

The Facility piloted all Case Study instruments with Australia Awards alumni who resided in Australia. This process validated the instruments and adaptations to questions were made. In addition, an interview guide template for researchers to record all data collected was developed and utilised. Following a review of Year 1 Case Study data, questions were adjusted for clarity.

This Case Study was conducted by Ms Rachel Parker and Ms Jennie Chainey, core Facility and Research Pool staff who bring relevant expertise in qualitative research and international development. Case Study researchers worked together to undertake data collection and report writing: one conducted the interview and the other recorded and took notes. This enabled high-quality reliable data to be gathered. At the conclusion of interviews, the researchers discussed the data collected to moderate and verify emerging interpretations and ensure completeness and accuracy.

3.6 Process

The Case Study field research was undertaken in Mongolia from 20 to 26 October 2017. Alumni were requested to provide their resume to researchers where available for further background information. Participants were provided with background information relating to the research and the Facility, and all provided written informed consent to their participation.

3.7 Data management and reporting

Thirteen interviews were voice recorded with approval granted to do so, and three were not recorded.

For these three interviews, the Case Study researchers elected not to voice record the interview for two reasons; deference (Minister of Finance, Mr Chimed Khurelbaatar; and the Australian Ambassador Mr John Langtry), and background noise (Meeting with Head of the Zorig Foundation). During these interviews, the second Case Study researcher annotated responses during the interview.

After the completion of the interview process, the Case Study researchers consolidated the written and oral recordings into a single near-verbatim transcript (with restarting of sentences and fillers excluded).

3.8 Transcription approval and coding

Completed interview transcripts and notes were sent back to key stakeholders such as the Australian Embassy representatives for their review and approval, to ensure that what was recorded was correct and to provide participants with an opportunity to clarify or adjust their transcripts.

Transcript review by participants is not consistently used in qualitative research, but was done for key stakeholders as a courtesy, and to ensure the validity of the data and avoid errors. Key stakeholders were advised at the end of the interview

that they would be given this opportunity, but participation in this step was not essential to proceed with using their data as permission had already been granted. Key stakeholders from DFAT and the managing contractor for the Australia Awards reviewed their transcripts, offering minor edits and clarifications of names.

Interview scripts were subsequently coded in a template in accordance with the research questions and propositions. This enabled emerging themes to be identified and links to be made between participants that supported or refuted the research propositions.

Analysis of the Case Study data involved a strategy that was guided by the theoretical proposition developed under the conceptual framework for the Case Study and by the techniques identified in the Facility's Case Study Approach document. Researchers used analytic techniques such as pattern matching and explanation building to explore all the evidence, and explored alternative interpretations through the post interview moderation process.

3.9 Limitations

There were a number of limitations of this research that were inherent to both the nature of the research and the research process, as discussed below.

3.9.1 Positive response bias

It is probable that alumni who felt that they had a positive experience as an Australian Government scholar and/or had met the expectations of receiving an award during their career progress are more likely to agree to participate in Case Studies. In a study by the Commonwealth Scholarship Commission in the UK, 'A study of research methodology used in evaluations of international scholarship schemes for higher education' (Mawer, 2014) the recognition of positive response bias was highlighted.

...there is widespread recognition that a more pressing problem is nonresponse bias in which those who reply to sample surveys are likely to be engaged with alumni associations or tracing (e.g. Day, Stackhouse and Geddes, 2009) and disproportionately represent the 'successful' outcomes of scholarship programmes. (Mawer, 2014)

In addition, positive response bias that is likely to occur in the Case Study results as alumni participating is limited to those who can be traced, and those who choose to participate which typically tends to be those with positive outcomes to share. Further, when the output of the research includes naming and profiling alumni, it is possible that alumni more frequently select positive experiences to share.

Accordingly, it is likely that the sample of alumni in the Mongolia Case Study was biased towards those who had positive experiences and achievements to share. Conversely, it is reasonable to assume that those who exited their bond agreement early and/or have moved abroad may be less likely to agree to participate. However, the Case Study team endeavoured to address this imbalance by including a range of alumni.

The Facility has also developed interview questions and analyses approaches to reduce the impact of this bias – these are applied consistently across all Case

Studies. Through this approach, leading questions are avoided and alumni are offered opportunities to reflect on their outcomes at the beginning and at the end of the interview without specific questions to guide their answers.

3.9.2 Nature of the research

Outcome 1 of the Global Strategy is that ‘alumni are using the skills, knowledge and networks gained on award to contribute to achieving partner-country development goals’. However, some alumni have shaped development goals rather than contributed to them, and while it may be outside the purview of partner-country development goals that this research is being evaluated against, such contributions are still significant.

The Case Study researchers experienced difficulty in evaluating Outcome 2 ‘alumni are contributing to cooperation between Australia and partner countries’, and Outcome 3 ‘effective, mutually advantageous partnerships between institutions and business [have been developed] in Australia and partner countries’. These two outcomes are aligned with the second research question for the Case Study ‘How are Australia Awards contributing to Australia’s economic and public diplomacy outcomes?’ There is an overlap and difficulty in differentiating ‘cooperation’ and ‘partnerships’. The research team delineated them by determining that Outcome 2 relates to people-to-people links including informal relationships; whereas Outcome 3 specifically relates to institutional links between the partner-country and Australia, which alumni have contributed to establishing.

No issues were encountered by the research team in collecting, collating, coding or analysing data related to Outcome 4 of the Australia Awards. Outcome 4 is ‘Alumni view Australia, Australians and Australian expertise positively’.

3.9.3 Research process

The ability to code the interview transcripts effectively was dependent on understanding the partner-country development goals, which was not always possible. Researchers involved in the Case Study made concerted attempts to identify relevant secondary data such as policy documents, papers, books and digital resources to provide background and insight into development plans, policies and changes over the time span of 2006 – 2010, the years of focus for Year 2 when these alumni commenced their scholarship.

3.9.4 Timing of the Case Study

The fieldwork component of this Case Study coincided with the preparation of the Bill on the 2018 State Budget, which was submitted to the Mongolian Parliament on 27 October 2017. A number of Mongolia Case Study participants played a central role in the preparation of this submission, and consequently, were subjected to higher than usual work demands; one mentioned working through the night. Consequently, two participants apologised at times during their interviews for their affected recall of words in English as a second language. However, timing did not affect participation; the fact that they were available during this extremely busy period speaks to their high regard of the Australia Awards and the Australia-Mongolia bilateral relationship.

Facility researchers acknowledge and sincerely thank the Case Study participants from the Ministry of Finance, particularly Minister of Finance Mr Chimed

Khurelbaatar, for generously making time to meet. We also acknowledge the Minister of Defence Mr Nyamaa Enkhbold and President of the Mongolia Australia Society (the Mozzies), for his efforts in responding to meeting requests, which unfortunately did not eventuate due to scheduling conflicts. Mr Enkhbold's and team were especially accommodating given that the Case Study field research coincided with the national budget submission to Parliament.

Facility Case Study researchers in planning the undertaking of Case Studies try to ensure they are aware of conflicting dates (such as public holidays) that would occur during fieldwork, however unexpected conflicts do arise. When this occurs, the Case Study researchers ensure they can make themselves available to meet at a time and location convenient to the participant, or to schedule a phone interview during a time outside of the fieldwork dates if preferred.

4. Development Outcomes

Summary findings

Development contributions

Alumni provided strong examples of how their Australian Government funded scholarship enabled them to develop the skills, knowledge, or networks to contribute to Mongolia's national development goals. These are categorised as:

- developing fiscal policy and strengthening macroeconomic systems
- improving practice in financial risk assessment
- contributing to the capacity development of colleagues.

Key enabling factors

Alumni were assisted in making these contributions through a range of factors including:

- strong Australia-Mongolia relations and an effective alumni association
- transferable and practical skills developed on award
- employer support
- critical mass of alumni in the finance sector
- multicultural learning environments
- alumni personal motivation
- Mongolia's political and economic climate.

Key challenging factors

Further progress could be made for alumni if a number of specific challenges were addressed, including:

- political and institutional changes in the public sector
- resistance to change in the workplace.

Findings from this chapter suggest that the **Australia Awards long-term Outcome 1 has been achieved.**

4.1 Introduction

This chapter of the report explores the contribution and impact of alumni in achieving sustainable economic development with specific reference to the following Australia Awards long-term outcome.

- 1 Alumni use their skills, knowledge and networks to contribute to achieving partner-country development goals.

Based on long-term Outcome 1, the chapter seeks to answer the following Case Study propositions:

- i. Alumni develop skills, knowledge and networks on award that enable and are used to contribute to achieving partner-country development goals.
- ii. Alumni understand, value and want to contribute to partner-country development goals.

Based on this framework, analysis of the Case Study interviews suggests alumni have made strong contribution in supporting country development at the policy level and in practice. A multitude of factors have enabled alumni to contribute including individual motivation and a critical mass of Australia Awards alumni working together in the field of management, commerce and finance.

4.2 Background

After structural reforms in the 1990s, Mongolia transitioned from a centralised planned economy to an open market democracy (DFAT; World Bank, 2017). Mongolia now seeks to engage countries holding similar democratic and free market values such as Australia, in order to seize opportunities for international trade and foreign investment (DFAT).

An Australia-Mongolia Joint Statement issued in 2011 by the then Prime Minister of Australia recognized ‘...the importance of open and transparent markets, and the rule of law, to promote further trade and investment between the countries’ (p.1). According to Ambassador Langtry, Mongolia’s transition to an open market democracy also led to an increased demand for international education, to build capacity in areas such as global market economies and democratic systems.

One alumnus, **Mr Yamaaranz Sainsanaa** recalled:

‘Every sector of Mongolia was thirsty for international [access]... after 1990 we wanted to be part of the world. So we needed knowledge and standards, proficiency of modern international [principles] ...We can’t find it in Mongolia so everybody needed to get knowledge from abroad to refuel the Mongolian economy, the Mongolian political system’.

Economic development remains a key objective for the Government of Mongolia as stated in ‘Mongolia Sustainable Development Vision 2030’ (Government of Mongolia, 2016, p.11) More specifically, the ‘Action Program of the Government of Mongolia for 2016-2020’ states Mongolia’s main priority is to ‘...revitalize the economy within a short period of time, promote growth, support social sectors and drastically improve the well-being of its citizens’ (Government of Mongolia, 2016, p.1). This objective will be achieved, in part, through strengthening macroeconomic policies and establishing a favourable business environment (Government of Mongolia, 2016).

Australia continues to contribute to Mongolia’s strategy for sustainable economic development in the public and private sectors by building skills and capacity through the Australia aid program (DFAT 2017). Tertiary education is one the main focus areas of Australia’s support: ‘Our aid program builds skills, relationships and

capacity in the public and private sectors, through scholarships for study in Australia' (DFAT 2017, p.1).

4.3 Alumni contributions

Alumni have made strong contributions to partner-country development priorities in the finance sector. These include developing fiscal policy, strengthening macroeconomic systems, and financial risk assessment while supporting the capacity development of colleagues.

4.3.1 Developing fiscal policy and strengthening macroeconomic systems

Five alumni in this Case Study described contributing to the development of fiscal policy and strengthening macroeconomic systems as a result of their study in Australia and the skills and knowledge gained.

Mr Ognon Khuyagtsogt, following his award, has undertaken roles such as Director of the Sovereign Wealth Fund/Asset Management Division. In this role, Mr Khuyagtsogt was able to significantly contribute to the achievement of Mongolia's stated macroeconomic principle 'Implement policies to hedge the country from international market and commodity price fluctuations and create a sovereign wealth fund and accumulate the funds' (Government of Mongolia, 2016, p.12), by drafting policies on wealth management, and implementing the human development and fiscal stability funds. Mr Khuyagtsogt also led the establishment of the Asset Management Unit in the Ministry of Finance, which he considers one of his biggest achievements.

Mr Javkhlanbaatar Sereeter has worked in both the public and private sectors since he graduated with a Master of International Business from the University of Sydney. His impressive work history – including positions at: the Ministry of Economic Development; Invest Mongolia Agency; and as an independent consultant – has resulted in a number of contributions to national development. Mr Sereeter's current role as an independent consultant involves advising foreign investors on Mongolia's business operating environment, including legislative requirements. This supports foreign investors to enter the Mongolian financial market, directly contributing to Mongolia's goal of establishing a favourable business environment for economic development (Government of Mongolia, 2016).

Mr Sereeter also held a leading role in the negotiations for Mongolia's first ever free trade agreement negotiation with Japan. Further to this, Mr Sereeter has contributed to approximately ten of Mongolia's bilateral investment agreements, and was involved in settling more than 30 private public partnerships (PPP). These examples suggest Mr Sereeter has significantly contributed to sustainable economic development through the government's stated macroeconomic principles to '...sign agreements on economic cooperation and free trade... and 'promote public private partnership' (Government of Mongolia, 2016, p. 12).

Mrs Soyolmaa Dorjnamjaa similarly shared experiences resulting in substantial contributions to development, such as operationalising a large-scale project for the Budget Investment Department of the Ministry of Finance, aimed at improving business procedures. Based on her overseas education and experience working on projects such as this, she is gaining access to other opportunities for

contributing to development outcomes: 'Thanks to these projects, to studies in Australia, I was responsible for foreign work relations in our department, relations with other donor organisations'.

Mrs Dorjnamjaa is also responsible for public investment programs: '...I am working with Korean specialists and advisors, giving them information about our project investment for the medium term...' As a result, Mrs Dorjnamjaa actively contributes to Mongolia's objective of sustainable economic development through the stated principle: 'Cooperate with international economic cooperation organizations, join their initiatives, sign agreements on economic cooperation and free trade, and implement major regional projects' (Government of Mongolia, 2016, p.12).

In the future, Mrs Dorjnamjaa will work with the International Monetary Fund and the Asian Development Bank (ADB) to improve project planning, finance and monitoring, and intends to use cost benefit analyses for her upcoming projects, an approach she learned in Australia. This suggests Mrs Dorjnamjaa has a long-term vision to continuing to use her skills and knowledge gained in Australia to contribute to Mongolia's economic development.

After graduating from the Master of Business Administration at Victoria University, **Ms Enebish Ulambayar** worked at the Central Bank of Mongolia as Senior Supervisor in the Policy and Restructuring Department. During this time, Ms Ulambayar was responsible for banking supervision, including developing policies and corporate governance standards to ensure the stability of the banking system and prevent bankruptcy and default.

Additionally, Ms Ulambayar has utilised the research skills she developed on award to investigate advanced models of internal auditing used in other countries. Ms Ulambayar conducted a gap analysis to better understand what is needed in Mongolia, suggesting she understands and is committed to utilising the skills she developed on award to contribute to Mongolia's economic development objective of establishing '...sound development finance and financial market system that would help promote stable economic growth' (Government of Mongolia, 2016, p.21).

Ms Ulambayar was appointed XacBank's Chief Operating Officer in November 2015 and attributes her success to the Australia Awards. She stated that her Australian degree afforded her credibility and 'acceptance' in her workplace; an organisation with numerous international and internationally educated senior managers.

4.3.2 Improving practice in financial risk assessment

Two alumni in this Case Study reported using skills and knowledge acquired in risk-based internal auditing to contribute to the financial stability and competitiveness of their organisations.

Internationally, internal auditing practices have developed over time to respond to accelerating changes in the business landscape with new competitors, technologies financial instruments, cost structures and regulations (KPMG, 2007). New approaches to internal auditing such as risk-based internal auditing look beyond the traditional approach of regulatory compliance, extending and improving

the risk assessment model. Instead of viewing business processes within a system of internal control, risk-based internal auditing seeks to *prevent* the occurrence of adverse outcomes through risk assessments that are more efficient and cost-effective (McNamee, 1997).

Mr Sainsanaa highlighted that studying the Master of Financial Management at the University of Melbourne enabled him to understand and apply international standards of internal auditing to his work, subsequently introducing new practices: 'In Mongolia we had only traditional internal auditing...risk-based is totally different'. Mr Sainsanaa used the skills and knowledge he acquired on award to lead XacBank's transition from the outdated traditional framework, to the risk-based internal auditing model.

He also supported the long-term sustainability of the risk-based internal auditing model through supporting XacBank through an institutional transition, changing '...mindset, structure, the papers, manual, charter...' Mr Sainsanaa went on to win the Mongolian Banking Association's 'Banker of the Year' award in 2014, for leading the successful implementation of a high-risk project to upgrade the core banking system of XacBank. Mr Sainsanaa's contributions align with the Mongolian national development objective of ensuring '...long-term sustainability, credibility and accountability in the banking and financial sectors...' (Government of Mongolia, 2016, p. 12).

Mr Sainsanaa has gone on to implement risk-based internal auditing model in his current role as Director of the Internal Audit Division of Petrovis Oil LLC, in accordance with legislation and regulations. He was also instrumental in transforming the organisational mindset from a traditional auditing style, to a forward-thinking approach of identifying '...the main risk hindering us to achieve the task... [and] how to resolve those'. Mr Sainsanaa illustrated the value of transitioning to risk based internal auditing for an organisation through the following example:

So according to traditional internal auditing, we would go to one gas station and we find an error and we blame the head of that gas station and tell them to just correct it. That's it. Then we go to the next gas station...We have 400 gas stations. There are only 10 people. And the furthest gas station is from here, 2,000 kilometres. So it will take the whole year... the risk-based method is: we will visit 10-20 per cent of all gas stations and we will find all the errors and we will list them and we will rank them: how significant the error, what should be the impact of the error, and then we will find how to correct it systematically in all gas stations...

Ms Ulambayar also advised her Australian degree provided her with a comprehensive understanding of risk-based internal auditing and business management, which enabled her to integrate a systemised business model, a crucial aspect of her work:

...to be internal audit, you need to be not only a risk person, you need to be a business person... it's very important, actually, how to run the business... it helped me to understand in a more systemic way. For example, for internal audit actuary, I introduced totally new to the market...risk-based internal audit approach...Risk-based internal audit is more prevention, so it's more forward looking...these kinds

of things I think I gained during my courses, more like an analytical, critical, forward looking thinking.

According to Ms Ulambayar, a sound understanding of micro level management, including internal audit, is crucial to providing a valuable contribution at the macro level. She emphasised the importance of ‘...giving [stakeholders] the assurance there is internal control frameworks, internal control governance and risk management is properly established, the framework and properly functioning’. These demonstrate Ms Ulambayar’s high level understanding of and contribution to Mongolia’s goal of ensuring ‘...long-term sustainability, credibility and accountability in the banking and financial sectors’ (Government of Mongolia, 2016, p.12).

4.3.3 Contributing to the capacity development of colleagues

Five alumni interviewed in this Case Study provided specific examples of how they utilised the knowledge and skills acquired on award to support the capacity development of their colleagues. Their contributions assist in supporting the development of institutional knowledge.

Mr Sereeter, Ms Ulambayar, Mr Khuyagtsogt, and Mr Sainsanaa all shared similar experiences as leaders providing skills development and sharing their knowledge with their teams to build their capacity, particularly as their work involved introducing new practices. For example, Mr Sereeter recalled:

...when I got Deputy Director in the Ministry... there were some experienced people, but my approach was a little bit different and new, and there were new people, new staff, no experience, no knowledge of cases. Let’s say, no master’s degrees in Australia, for example.

He explained how he mentored his team members, and emphasised his collaborative approach: ‘At the end, everyone should have equal knowledge, equal understanding [of] what we are doing’. This suggests Mr Sereeter forged a path for others to learn and apply the principles of international business, supporting the sustainability of Mongolia’s market economy. Mr Sereeter explained that people wanted to learn from him because he introduced a new approach to business and trade agreements, based on the knowledge and skills he acquired on award: ‘That’s why I think many people followed me to study, to explore this area, or my contribution to this.’

Similarly, Ms Ulambayar, when she joined the internal audit team at XacBank, identified a number of capacity gaps in relation to auditing skills, language proficiency, systems and processes. In order to address this gap, Ms Ulambayar recruited other young graduates from overseas institutions, and helped develop their capacity for internal auditing through training and mentoring: ‘I needed to teach them, everyone... I coached all of them in terms of building their capacity’ to undertake high quality work. Ms Ulambayar is clearly proud of her team’s development, advising internal audit was underperforming before she commenced in the role. Ms Ulambayar reflected that internal audit is now one of the most respected teams. She expressed admiration for how they are now conducting risk analysis.

Mrs Dorjnamjaa, delivered training sessions based on her course content for her colleagues following her return from study in Australia. During these sessions she passed on her skills and knowledge on topics such as project implementation, PPP, public investment procedures, team work, organisation culture, and how to engage with private organisations and individuals to improve public administration. As a result of the training, her colleagues have applied this learning to their work, developing new ideas that she states 'have gone forward', contributing to the long-term sustainability of these principles.

4.4 Key enabling factors

4.4.1 Strong Australia-Mongolia relationship and effective alumni association

The Australia Awards in Mongolia is unique in that that Australian Embassy in Mongolia was established only recently in 2015 further solidifying Australia-Mongolia relations. Case Study researchers observed that in this short time frame, the Embassy has forged strong and successful engagement with Australia Awards Mongolian alumni. Professional development and networking activities include a joint approach with the Mozzies to support alumni reintegration through the establishment of sectoral networks to enable alumni networking.

The Mozzies contribute to Mongolia's development through professional development initiatives such as supporting members to coordinate sector-specific knowledge-sharing seminars. Mrs Lkhagvasuren Ariunaa, Executive Director of the Mozzies, identified this approach as an effective method for supporting the sustainability of sectoral learning: '...professional development, that is what we can provide, support is organising those knowledge sharing seminars.' The Mozzies have also created a repository to store alumni research papers. The Mozzies plan to provide Mongolian university students and teachers with access to this database of academic sources.

Ms Yundendorj Tsetsgee, Country Program Manager, Australia Awards in Mongolia, advised some alumni are not successful in reintegrating into their previous workplaces. Australia Awards in Mongolia and the Mozzies support alumni reintegration into their relevant sectors by establishing sectoral networks:

'...we really try to reintegrate them into their sectors, as well as to the alumni association because the members are people who would understand each other... having shared knowledge, understanding and try to get something done as a group of individuals'.

According to Ms Tsetsgee, alumni from previous cohorts also support the reintegration of more recent returnees:

'...the top management people – some of them are our alumni – had continuously supported the new generation of the alumni, easily welcoming them back and understanding how important these Australian graduates would be in the certain position and organisation'.

These types of networks help support alumni to successfully reintegrate into their relevant sector, and actively contribute to the achievement of Mongolia's development outcomes.

The following sections in this chapter are the key enabling factors supporting alumni to utilise their skills and knowledge as identified by the alumni in this Case Study.

4.4.2 Alumni developed valuable transferrable and practical skills

Alumni in this Case Study developed valuable skills on award, which they have been able to apply to their work. Mr Khuyagtsogt, Ms Ulambayar, Mrs Dorjnamjaa and Mr Sereeter shared how their awards have assisted them in their career outcomes.

Mr Khuyagtsogt was promoted to Director of the Sovereign Wealth Fund/Asset Management Division within two years of return from scholarship. He emphasised that his Australian qualification prepared him for this role, indicating that skills and knowledge gained in Australia were relevant to this position.

Ms Ulambayar identified collaborative leadership skills gained in Australia were valuable to her professional life. Ms Ulambayar added the written and spoken communication skills she acquired on award enabled her to clearly express herself, particularly now in her role as Chief Operations Officer she is required to do numerous presentations.

Ms Ulambayar attributed her professional success to her experience studying in Australia, where she was supported to compare and analyse different banking systems. These experiences equipped her with the skills and knowledge required to identify issues within the Mongolian banking system on her return.

Mrs Dorjnamjaa also credited her developed teamwork skills to her experience studying in Australia: 'In Australia I heard for the first time about team work and team culture and also project management'. She advised that her studies taught her how to research and resolve issues through practical exercises.

Mr Sereeter noted that the practical elements of his course supported him in developing his high level skills:

...in many ways it assisted: academic knowledge, team working...and negotiation tactics. So when I studied, there were many case studies, so the mentors and the doctors, teachers, they used in the case studies, team work, so that, I think, helped.

4.4.3 Critical mass of alumni in finance sector contributes to strong fiscal policy and development

There are a significant number of Australia Awards alumni working in the finance sector, who collectively are making a strong contribution to achieving objectives in economic development. Mr Khuyagtsogt recognised the benefit of the Australia Awards at the national level, and specifically for the Ministry of Finance:

...as an institution, we [get] more benefits because people, those who studied in Australia...all now are working as key [people] managing and formulating policies in economic and financial areas of the country.

Mr Khuyagtsogt explained the Australia Awards has multi-tiered benefits as a result of individuals advancing to positions of influence after graduating and are therefore positioned to make institutional change through policy development and

implementation. This subsequently has an impact at the national level, making a significant contribution to development:

...skills learnt in Australia and working in many different positions, those are more relevant for shaping and formulating the policies. Now and in the future it will allow us to contribute to the country's development... in terms of the skills learnt in Australia, they are helping this critical mass and power.

Minister Khurelbaatar, also an Australian Government funded scholarship alumnus, graduated with First Class honours with a Master of Economics from University of Sydney. He agreed with Mr Khuyagtsogt's view, emphasising the valuable contributions of Australia Awards alumni. Minister Khurelbaatar shared that high-level decisions at the Ministry of Finance are often made in consultation with other graduates who provide a high calibre of input on policy and practice matters.

Ms Tsetsgee further noted that 'critical mass is the strength'. According to Ms Tsetsgee, there is evidence of '...critical mass making some impact at the policy formulation and implementation levels', with a significant number of alumni in senior positions within multiple ministries and banks. In addition, Ms Tsetsgee observed that generally, Australia Awards alumni develop shared values and approaches:

Because [Australian] universities have very much stable standards and treat everybody in a very much similar way, I really see this pool of people having shared understanding, similar thinking...critical thinking is one example.

4.4.4 Multicultural learning environments have enabled alumni to develop valuable intercultural competency

Alumni in this Case Study described **exposure to an international community at their Australian institutions as a particularly valuable aspect of their time in Australia**. This was a particular highlight for Mr Sereeter, Mr Khuyagtsogt, Ms Ulambayar, Mr Sainsanaa and Mrs Dorjnamjaa. Mr Sereeter in particular attributed his highly developed inter-cultural competency to his experiential learning in Australia:

...in your classroom there are many people from different countries...and so you realise they are not the same... it depends on the culture, it depends on gender, it depends on education...that's one of the key components in negotiations.

This intercultural learning experience has resulted in valuable skills alumni are able to utilise in the workplace. Ms Ulambayar who works in a multicultural organisation emphasised working in a multi-cultural environment can be difficult without those skills '...if you don't know how to communicate with these people, not only in terms of speaking to them, also expressing yourself in writing'. For Mr Sereeter, he identified intercultural competency as instrumental to a successful negotiation of transnational agreements.

Mr Sainsanaa directly linked learning to work collaboratively with international students on team projects to his ability to successfully manage a cross-divisional, cross-cultural project team consisting of 59 staff members including Indian software programmers and Mongolian finance staff: '...my experience in Australia working with students from different countries and doing...the project stages... everything helped me to successfully implement that project'.

A case of good practice: The Women's Leadership Program (WLP) community services project contributing to Mongolia's development outcomes

Background of the WLP:

The WLP is a program funded by the Australian Embassy in Mongolia and supported through the Australia Awards in Mongolia. **The WLP supports members to develop and apply transferrable skills** such as negotiation, communication, fundraising and leadership. These skills then support alumni to advance in their careers and more effectively contribute to country development outcomes. Although titled the Women's Leadership Program, the program is for both male and female alumni as the purpose of the WLP is to encourage all alumni to advocates for greater numbers of female leaders in their communities.

The WLP community services project:

The community service project component of the WLP provides alumni with an opportunity to develop their understanding of challenges to achieving country development objectives. Although alumni generally have high quality professional skills, the community service project component of the WLP supports participants to better identify and effectively respond to development issues. This aims to support alumni to apply the skills and knowledge they have acquired on award, to contribute to Mongolia's development priorities (DFAT 2014). The community project requires members to work as a team to develop and implement a concept aligned with one of the '4 program priority employment sectors or aimed at promoting gender equality' (DFAT, 2014, p.10).

This is demonstrated by one project which aims to improve access to early childhood educational resources for nomadic families, contributing to a national development objective of improving learning of Mongolian language (Government of Mongolia, 2016). This project, implemented in the North Western Province, produced a mobile children's library in response to an identified barrier experienced by nomadic families – lack of access to educational resources for children. One hundred households benefited from this initiative, receiving boxed books and hygiene kits.

The WLP also link alumni with mentors which has led to stronger institutional linkages, as discussed on pages 38 – 39 of this report.

4.4.5 Alumni are motivated to contribute to country development

A significant factor in the successful contribution by alumni is their high-level understanding of and commitment to contributing to national development objectives. Alumni in the Mongolia Case Study possess qualities and attributes which have assisted or underpinned their ability to contribute to partner-country development goals, including a desire to contribute or make a positive difference. This can be demonstrated by the views shared by alumni such as Mr Khuyagsogt who said:

...we have commitments for the Australian Government scholarship. We come here, work for a period of time to contribute what we learnt with the support of the people of Australia. So for me, I have to dedicate myself to the wellbeing of the

people in Mongolia because that's why the Australian Government provided us with a scholarship.

This finding confirms the emphasis given to alumni motivation in the Australia Awards screening and selection process. According to DFAT First Secretary Mr Shayne McKenna, the Australia Awards successfully selects and supports quality applicants who intend to contribute to the achievement of the Australia Awards outcomes. Mr McKenna suggested that Mongolian Australia Awards alumni are generally committed to contributing to development on their return, an attribute identified during the selection process and further '...developed by the methodology of the Australia Awards itself'. He noted the Australia Awards '...encourages people to apply who have a vision for how their skills will be utilised on return'. **This commitment and vision is then nurtured through the scholarship experience itself.** Mr McKenna suggested that this creates a cohort of graduates who, on their return to Mongolia, 'tend to do what they planned to do because they've got that commitment behind it'. Mr McKenna highlighted the importance of the selection process in identifying candidates with this type of potential, and how critical it is to have highly experienced people with broad policy perspectives on the selection panel, who can recognise this potential in candidates.

Ms L. Bat-Otgon, member of the Australia Awards Program Coordination Committee and Executive Director of the union of the Persons with Disabilities of Mongolia, agreed. She noted that the application process prompts candidates to consider what they plan to do on their return to Mongolia. This **compels the applicant to think about their long-term goals and contributions to Mongolia's development.** When Ms Bat-Otgon disseminates information about the Australia Awards, she asks potential applicants 'what would you do for the social benefit or for the welfare of the whole society?' noting she specifically looks for responses that demonstrate a '...long-term vision for this specific purpose'.

4.4.6 The political and economic climate in Mongolia

Since the 1990s, Mongolia has gone through a significant political and economic change which has created opportunities for alumni in this Case Study to pursue Australia Awards scholarships and apply their learning on their return to Mongolia.

Mr Khuyagtsogt was promoted to Director of the Sovereign Wealth Fund of the Ministry of Finance in 2011, and became responsible for, amongst other things, collecting revenue from the minerals sector. After a period of economic development and the mining boom in 2012, the Government of Mongolia focused on strengthening its management of domestic revenue and assets: '...because of the mining boom, because of the excessive revenue... the government realised the need to have such capacity and institutions to overview those kinds of issues'. According to Mr Khuyagtsogt, this provided an opportunity for him to gain experience and significantly contribute to Mongolia's economic development in the areas of fiscal policy and wealth management.

Mr Sainsanaa advised that all sectors were eager for access to global markets and needed knowledge, standards and proficiency in global practices.

Mr Sereeter explained the political and economic climate and limited skilled workforce provided an opportunity for him to significantly contribute to shaping international business and foreign investment in Mongolia:

...There are not many experienced people because of our historic development... [we] were part of the Soviet model of agreements, which are not really business and trade agreement.

4.5 Key challenging factors

The following factors are those that alumni described as challenging their ability to contribute to partner country development goals.

4.5.1 Political and institutional changes in the public sector

Two alumni in this Case Study shared experiencing the effect of political or institutional changes that directly impacted their ability to progress their careers in the public service, and therefore their contribution to national development goals.

Some context to this was provided by Mr McKenna, who explained that change of government tends to lead to extensive public service personnel changes. He added this occurs after every election, and also '...every time a Minister changes'. According to Mr McKenna, this creates a certain level of job insecurity for employees in the public sector, potentially including the majority of alumni: '...55 per cent of our graduates are from the public sector... so public services changes obviously impacts on the majority of the alumni cohort'.

Mrs Dorjnamjaa experienced these kinds of challenges to her career advancement, advising 'there are a lot of changes in our department. We have had three heads for three years'. She explained '...I applied five years ago with a colleague from our department to be promoted to become a senior officer... but there was no reply because of structural changes... there were a lot of changes in structure in our ministry.'

Ms Tsetsgee explained this is a recurring challenge some alumni have to overcome to progress in their careers: '...restructuring tends to happen quite regularly, meaning the agencies under the ministers can disappear easily, or merge with [others]...' She advised some alumni do not have positions at their previous place of employment to return to.

Mr McKenna qualified that political and institutional change interrupts (but does not necessarily prevent) alumni from contributing to partner-country development goals. He clarified: 'A lot of public sector returnees will actually either go to the private sector, the same sector, or form their own NGOs... then return [to the public sector] at a later date'.

This suggests the public sector doesn't necessarily lose the institutional knowledge developed, because people often return to their previous roles or at least to the same sector but such interruptions may have an effect on sustainability of alumni contributions.

4.5.2 Resistance to change in the workplace

While alumni are returning with new ideas and practices, and despite a mass of fellow alumni in the workplace that have returned with similarly shared values,

some barriers to change remain. This may be a reflection of the dispersion of this mass across different organisations and departments.

Ms Ulambayar advised in the Tracer Survey that a significant constraint for her to apply her skills back in Mongolia was the stagnation of the work culture she returned to. She further explained:

There was nothing moving forward... I was developing policies, procedures, frameworks and law drafts... There was no movement. I asked, "Do you agree with my ideas? Why didn't you promote it?"

According to Ms Ulambayar, this stagnated work culture continued for two and a half years, preventing her from contributing to Mongolia's development goals. Ms Ulambayar's experience of personal and professional growth in Australia led to returning to Mongolia very motivated to implement change, but she was unable to progress in the work environment she returned to.

Ms Ulambayar further advised Mongolia's stage of economic development and developing banking sector as a restricting barrier: 'We have a very basic old accounting product. We are using in a very limited way...' Mrs Dorjnamjaa also uses outdated resources that prevent her from applying her skills and knowledge gained in Australia. She explained that constraints in program systems development have prevented her from applying her skills and knowledge: '...our department was just using an Excel program...technology, systems and programs need upgrading...'

5. Economic and Public Diplomacy Outcomes

Summary findings

Economic and Public Diplomacy Outcomes

Mongolia Case Study alumni provided **some examples of cooperation between Australia and Mongolia** that were developed as a result of studying in Australia. These were:

- an alumnus reconnected with fellow students and Australian institutions staff when they visited Mongolia as potential investors and clients
- an alumnus and a key stakeholder fostered new knowledge and new links with Australian businesses and organisations through participating in Australia Awards fellowships
- an alumna established the first national cancer education and support organisation, the Mongolian National Cancer Council, as a result of her experience studying in Australia.⁵

Key enabling factors

Factors that enabled alumni to develop, maintain, or broaden networks and partnerships with Australia and Australians were:

- the Mozzies, as an established, prominent, valued, and well-governed alumni organisation, effectively promotes bilateral networking in Mongolia
- strong student networks, when developed on award, were seen as an important precursor to in-country networking upon return
- the WLP, which has been effective in fostering new networks and networking ability.

Key challenging factors

Factors that challenged alumni in developing, maintaining, or broadening networks and partnerships with Australia and Australians were:

- the lack of time and opportunity to foster links on award
- the Mozzies is limited in its ability to link alumni with Australians/Australian organisations outside Mongolia
- the Mozzies diverse membership limits its ability to foster specific sectoral links and partnerships.

⁵ This example is outside the parameters of this Case Study, but included as a good practice example of general interest and high value to the Australia Awards.

Evidence presented by Mongolia Case Study participants suggests that **Australia Awards long-term Outcome 2 and Outcome 3 have been partially achieved.**

5.1 Introduction

This chapter describes how alumni have contributed to **Australia Awards long-term Outcome 2 ‘cooperation between Australia and Mongolia’**, and to **Australia Awards long-term Outcome 3 ‘establish effective, mutually advantageous partnerships between institutions and/or businesses in Mongolia and institutions and/or businesses in Australia’**.

Data were coded against these two long-term outcomes of the Australia Awards.

The Australia Awards Global M&E Framework describes activities under these outcomes as facilitating business or trade links, participating in international or regional bodies, or advocating for aspects of the relationship (for example, promoting study in Australia).

Australia Awards fellowships are specifically intended to support connections between governments, businesses, and NGOs in partner countries and Australia. This is due to their ‘tailored approach to skills development’ (DFAT 2016) which may include opportunities to network, or undertake internships or work placements.

One of the implied on award activities underpinning achievement of Australia Awards long-term Outcomes 2 and 3 is that scholars get the opportunity to make contact with Australian organisations while studying in Australia. This chapter explores this and other assumptions and describes the achievements of alumni in contributing to Australia Awards long-term Outcomes 2 and 3.

5.2 Background

Conducted during the 45th anniversary of Australia-Mongolia diplomatic relations, the timing of the field research for this Case Study was auspicious. On 18 and 19 October 2017, the newly appointed Prime Minister of Mongolia, Mr Ukhnaagiin Khurelsukh, announced his Cabinet including three alumni of Australian Government funded scholarships, namely:

- Minister of Finance –Mr Chimed Khurelbaatar
- Minister of Foreign Affairs –Mr Tsogtbaatar Damdin
- Minister of Defence –Mr Nyamaa Enkhbold.

Minister Enkhbold also currently serves as the President of the Mozzies. To date, this is the largest number of currently serving Mongolian Cabinet Ministers who received a scholarship to study in Australia. Most Case Study participants, particularly key stakeholders, were prompt in citing this as evidence of the impact of the Australia Awards and the potential for strengthened Australia-Mongolia relations in the future.

Furthermore, the Australian Embassy in Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia, was opened only recently, in December 2015. Previously, the Australian Embassy in Beijing, China, was responsible for managing Australia’s diplomatic and development cooperation relationships with Mongolia. The opening of the Australian Embassy in Mongolia

signifies Australia's important relationship with Mongolia, as an investor with shared interests and mutual commitments to democracy and rules-based regional order (DFAT, 2017). Ambassador Langtry, underlined these statements by praising Mongolia's **'very positive disposition to recognise the things we have in common or value.'**

Underpinning Australia-Mongolia relations and referred to by many key stakeholders in this Case Study, is the Australia-Mongolia Joint Statement issued in 2011 by the then Prime Minister of Australia acknowledging the friendly and growing relations between Australia and Mongolia. The Joint Statement describes four bilateral agreements signed by the then Prime Minister of Mongolia and the Prime Minister of Australia concerning cooperation in vocational education, agricultural development, governance, and science. This statement included the commitment by Australia to open the Embassy, provide funding for water, sanitation and hygiene (WaSH) projects and supporting children with disability, and, most relevant to this study, 'increase Australian Government scholarships to almost 40 each year from 2012'.

Specifically, the Joint Statement acknowledges the growing people-to-people links and the contribution of the Australia Awards in Mongolia and the Mozzies in sustaining bilateral link.

5.3 Examples of bilateral collaboration and institutional links

The Tracer Survey Year 1 2016-17 found that 39 per cent of Mongolian alumni indicated that they had professional links with an Australian organisation at some time following award. Alumni in this Case Study provided few concrete examples of collaboration and institutional links with Australia. The two examples described below relate to an alumnus' ability to foster networks during his degree, and an alumnus and key stakeholder's participation in Australia Awards fellowships, which fostered new knowledge and links with Australians and Australian organisations.

5.3.1 Linking with Australians on award enabled an alumnus to reconnect with potential investors and clients when visiting Mongolia

Mr Sereeter described meeting potential investors while undertaking his Master of International Business at the University of Sydney. Mr Sereeter explained how he formed connections with lecturers and fellow students with whom he shared information about the investment and legal environment in Mongolia. A number of these contacts visited Mongolia for conferences and business, during which time Mr Sereeter met with them and maintains these links to this day.

Mr Sereeter's ability to facilitate these connections was enhanced by his positions in both the Department of Foreign Trade and Economic Development and Department of Foreign Investment Policy and Management. In these positions, it was Mr Sereeter's job to 'take care of foreign investors' and 'promote Mongolian business', not just with Australia but globally. However, he described his affiliation with Australia as a 'second citizenship' featuring mutually beneficial long-lasting business connections and friendships. This example illustrates that Mr Sereeter was able to make valuable connections during his studies which were leveraged upon return; these connections appeared to have been made without additional networking, business matching or internship opportunities. The success factors

here could have been Mr Sereeter's networking skills, his role in foreign investment, the type of course and fellow students who were also professional peers, and the interest in the Mongolian economy at the time.

5.3.2 Australia Awards fellowships have played an important role in fostering new knowledge and professional links

Both an alumnus and a key stakeholder in this Case Study described participating in Australia Awards fellowship programs hosted by Griffith University as useful in imparting new knowledge and fostering important people-to-people links. In total, four Australia Awards fellowships Rounds have been delivered by Griffith University, as follows:

- Leadership, Change Management and Sustainable Governance Frameworks (Round 13)
- The Monitoring and Evaluation Planning Program for Mongolia (Round 14)
- Economic growth, human resource development through increased expertise in mining taxation (Mongolia) (Round 15)
- Promoting effective mining sector governance through capacity building in research and engagement (Round 17).

Mr Khuyagtsogt participated in Round 15 and described gaining valuable knowledge from the training on how to best tax the mining sector to establish a fund for national development. In an interview with the Fraser Coast Chronicle, Mr Khuyagtsogt described how important it was to connect with and learn from a government with similar mining sector experience.⁶ The Australia Awards fellowship provided Mr Khuyagtsogt with links with the Queensland Government and to the work of the Queensland Treasury in collecting mining and petroleum royalties.

Ms Nasanjargal Dolgormaa, of the Mongolian National Chamber of Commerce and Industry, a key stakeholder to this Case Study and member of the Australia Awards Project Coordination Committee, participated in Round 13. She expanded her knowledge about governance and justice, which she was able to impart to colleagues in a series of debriefing sessions. She stated that the Australia Awards fellowships are beneficial in providing exposure to Australian institutions and systems and obtaining greater understanding of sectoral issues.

Other examples of bilateral collaboration beyond the scope of this Case Study were provided by Ambassador Langtry. These included collaboration on approaches to emergency management such as hosting the 2018 Asian Ministerial Conference on Disaster Risk Reduction in Mongolia involving the contribution of alumni; and Rio Tinto's sponsorship of an Australian expert to advise Mongolia's National Emergency Management Agency. In addition, Ambassador Langtry mentioned an Australia Awards alumna, Dr Batmunkh Tsetsegsaikhan, who had effectively utilised the links she established in Australia while on award to design and implement projects and to establish the National Cancer Council of Mongolia.

⁶ For more information, see: <https://www.frasercoastchronicle.com.au/news/mongolia-learning-aus-how-make-most-mining-boom/1654781/>

While outside the scope of this Case Study, we interviewed Dr Tsetsegsaikhan and included her case here as an example of good practice which fully illustrates the magnitude of possibilities for alumni to access support and contribute to the Australia Awards long-term Outcomes 2 and 3.

A case of good practice: the National Cancer Council of Mongolia

The National Cancer Council of Mongolia (NCCM), established by Australia Awards alumna Dr Tsetsegsaikhan, demonstrates good practice in fostering bilateral collaboration and institutional links.

Background

Dr Tsetsegsaikhan is the founder and CEO of the National Cancer Council of Mongolia (NCCM), which aims to reduce the risks of cancer and provides assistance and training for patients and families diagnosed with and living with cancer. She received an Australia Award to undertake a Master of Public Health and Health Management at the University of New South Wales (UNSW) from 2013 to 2014.

During her studies, Dr Tsetsegsaikhan submitted an application to UNSW undertake a three-month internship at a health sector-related organisation. Dr Tsetsegsaikhan initially hoped for a placement at the Department of Health, as this corresponded with her position in Mongolia with the Ministry of Health. However the selection panel proposed **an internship in the Policy and Advocacy Unit of the Cancer Council New South Wales (NSW)**, which she accepted; a decision that ultimately 'changed [her] life.'

Dr Tsetsegsaikhan described the exposure to Australian workplace culture as an 'eye-opening experience' and 'very different from being a student.' In particular, Dr Tsetsegsaikhan highlighted the lack of hierarchy in the organisation which encouraged open communication between colleagues, and flexible working arrangements. She described the congruence between the organisation's mandate and employee's daily habits in prioritising their health and work-life balance as practices she aims encourage in her workplaces in the future.

Establishing the National Cancer Council of Mongolia

During her time at the Cancer Council NSW, which culminated as a six-month placement, Dr Tsetsegsaikhan reflected on the services they provided and those lacking in Mongolia. In Mongolia, medical facilities offer cancer treatment, but psychosocial support was a missing service sorely needed by patients and families.

Dr Tsetsegsaikhan was assigned a mentor at the Cancer Council NSW, Ms Bernadette Roberts, who encouraged her to establish NCCM. Ms Roberts has continued to assist Dr Tsetsegsaikhan, providing materials, support, and advice to this day. **Dr Tsetsegsaikhan regularly receives technical advice from the Cancer Council NSW, and from other organisations with whom she has since developed**

Enhancing partnerships through the Australia Awards in Mongolia Women's Leadership Program (WLP) and Australia Awards fellowships

Dr Tsetsegsaikhan established the NCCM in 2014, and subsequently in 2015 was selected to participate in the first intake of the Australia Awards in Mongolia WLP. Through the WLP, Dr Tsetsegsaikhan improved her ability to promote the NCCM by developing her leadership, communication, public speaking, and networking skills. In addition, the WLP connected Dr Tsetsegsaikhan with another mentor in Australia, Ms Lou de Castro Myles, and provided the opportunity to return to Australia to further develop skills in leadership communication, networking and planning.

Ms de Castro Myles linked Dr Tsetsegsaikhan with Cancer Council Queensland, the University of Queensland, and Queensland University of Technology. Consequently, **Dr Tsetsegsaikhan collaborated with Australian institutions to design an Australia Awards fellowship for 14 participants from Mongolia to travel to Brisbane** for one month including a one week intensive with the Cancer Council Queensland.

Participants learned about the range of support programs offered and issues faced by the organisation; a valuable experience for NCCM staff. Cancer Council Queensland have since supported NCCM in a number of ways, including providing NCCM with materials to translate and promote events such as the Mongolian equivalent event of *Australia's Biggest Morning Tea*.

Future/challenges

Dr Tsetsegsaikhan clearly demonstrated that establishing a national civil society organisation like NCCM from the ground up requires a multitude of mentors, active networks, and mutually supportive partnerships over a period of years to be successful and sustainable; initial support would not suffice. NCCM, with the support of the Australian Embassy in Mongolia via the Direct Aid Program, and the Murdoch Children's Research Institute (MCRI), is currently working on a project to address the high rate of Human Papillomavirus infection (HPV) in Mongolia, which leads to cervical cancer. The project aims to provide evidence-based research about the health outcomes of HPV vaccination. In the first instance the team will undertake a HPV prevalence study, followed by a survey of community attitudes, perceptions about the HPV vaccination, and finally implement a communication strategy to transmit accurate information about the issue.

NCCM is also developing a first for Mongolia: a 'lodge' for rurally-located cancer patients and families to be accommodated while undergoing treatment in Ulaanbaatar. Dr Tsetsegsaikhan described the need for fundraising skills, knowledge, and experience as one the challenges of the organisation. However, she was optimistic about her future as founder and CEO of NCCM, as she moves toward running the organisation on a full-time basis from 2018. **Ambassador Langtry commended the work of Dr Tsetsegsaikhan and partners as an exceptional case of bilateral collaboration.**

5.4 Key enabling factors

5.4.1 The Mozzies, as an established, prominent, valued, and well-governed alumni organisation, effectively promotes bilateral networking in Mongolia

The Mozzies was founded in 1998. The past ten years has seen **significant membership growth; from around 20 members in 2008 to 330 members currently registered**. Membership comprises Mongolians who have received an Australian Government funded scholarship and self-funded alumni. There are also a small number of 'friends of Australia'; mostly senior government officials that have an affiliation with Australia through business and or family connections. The organisation comprises four committees through which activity programming is aligned. These are Social Activities; External Relations; Committee of working with Members; and Committee of working with the Australian Community in Mongolia.

The aims of the Mozzies broadly align with the long-term outcomes of the Australia Awards, including statements such as 'serv[ing] as a network of Mongolian alumni of Australian universities, nurturing professional links'; 'actively promot[ing] cooperation between the two countries'; and 'celebrat[ing] the long-term friendship and ongoing cultural link with Australia, keeping it alive through a diverse program of activities'.⁷

One of the critical success factors attributed to the Mozzies is their independence. While they receive some support from the Australian Embassy in Mongolia, according to DFAT First Secretary Mr McKenna, 'it is an organically grown organisation that has developed over time in its own way'. In addition, the Mozzies leadership team are continually seeking ways to improve their services. This is exemplified by Mrs Ariunaa and her plans to seek ways to link with other alumni and professional organisations, establish new and innovation programs and services, and encourage membership growth.

Alumni see the benefit of the Mozzies network and membership. Minister Khurelbaatar and graduate of the University of Sydney (Master of Economics, First Class Honours), stated that the Mozzies is important in supporting links with Australian organisations. This is evidenced by the Australia-Mongolia Joint Statement, and the mutual respect by both governments for the organisation and its members.

Mr Sainsanaa referred to the Mozzies collaboration with AustCham and the Australian Embassy in Mongolia as valuable. Mrs Dorjnamjaa agreed, and **Ms Altantsetseg** confirmed that the Mozzies Association is a strong and successful organisation that gathers people in the one place who are doing great work to share knowledge. These alumni asserted that Mozzies are people who have had a similar experience in Australia and know what needs to be done to develop Mongolia.

However the challenge for the Mozzies is that participation and leadership is voluntary. Mrs Ariunaa noted that staffing and resourcing a large membership

⁷ Charter of the Mongolia-Australia Society, doc location http://www.mozzies.mn/?page_id=39

organisation on a voluntary basis is difficult, and not all members are active. Further, the demands of alumni's work often take precedence over participation in alumni activities. These challenges are addressed in part through the support provided by the Australia Awards in Mongolia, and by designing activities in response to the preference and needs of members.

In particular, social events are very important to members and an aspect of the Mozzies that it is famous for, according to Mrs Ariunaa. 'Social activities are a necessary element when you talk about the substance of the engagement', said Mr McKenna of DFAT. These activities are well attended, attract new members, are high profile and enjoyable, and invite alumni to feel the sense of belonging to an organisation and community that celebrates the bilateral relationship. Mrs Ariunaa commended the support provided by the President of the Mozzies, Minister Enkhbold, who despite his high profile and demanding role in the public service, attends every event and in turn encourages participation from other members

While undertaking field research in Mongolia, the authors of this report were fortunate to join a Mozzies event in Mongolia attended by approximately 30 alumni and Ambassador Langtry. The Ambassador's frequent promotion and participation in alumni events was commended by the Australia Awards in Mongolia staff as vital to their success.⁸

5.4.2 Strong student networks developed on award were seen as an important precursor to in-country networking upon return

Most alumni in the Mongolia Case Study reported making connections within their cohort while studying in Australia. Mr Khuyagtsogt stated that during his time in Australia, there were colleagues from the Ministry of Finance, and other ministries and departments from Mongolia also undertaking studies. Mr Khuyagtsogt explained that they formed a kind of 'local community' to 'share experiences and support each other to survive there'.

Ms Altantsetseg agreed that during her time in Australia she formed strong relationships with fellow students that exist to this day. While not strictly bilateral networks, these strong student networks could be seen as an important precursor to in-country networking. Mr Sainsanaa asserted that he retained a close relationship with the six Mongolian students he arrived with in Melbourne, and that other Australian scholarship students from other countries were helpful in welcoming them to Australia and providing an informal orientation. However, these links with international students were not maintained post return. The Tracer Survey Year 1 2016-17 found that one third of Mongolian alumni had maintained frequent contact with fellow alumni since returning to Mongolia.

Ms Tsetsgee added that on award networking that occurs in Australia is important. She inferred that the Australia Awards provides the opportunity for those who may not have interacted in Mongolia to share experiences, network and form links which can be leveraged upon return.

⁸ Information about the event is available here:
<https://globalalumni.gov.au/News/Details?ArticleId=583>

5.4.3 Women's Leadership Program is effective in fostering networks and networking ability

The Australia Awards WLP, delivered by Queensland University of Technology includes a two-week intensive fellowship in Australia for selected participants. Further, it provides alumni with professional development in establishing, developing, and expanding diverse personal and professional networks.⁹ According to Ms Tsetsgee, this aspect of the program has enabled alumni to foster professional links with Australians and is working very well.

As explained by WLP Program Director Ms Maral Gankhuyag, one of the objectives of the program is to improve alumni's links with Australia. Networking events are provided throughout the program and business matching is offered where participants are divided by sectors and linked with Australian institutions they are interested in collaborating with. In this way, the program attends to both the people-to-people and institutional links important for the bilateral relationship.

5.5 Key challenging factors

5.5.1 Lack of time and opportunity to foster links on award

Alumni indicated that the lack of time and opportunity to forge links with Australians and Australian organisations undermined their ability to contribute to bilateral cooperation and develop institutional links. While some alumni formed networks on award, these were not always sustained post return.

These findings echo the results of the Tracer Survey Year 1, 2016-17, which found that only 19 per cent of alumni had frequent contact with friends in Australia and only 14 per cent had frequent contact with Australian students/alumni (Edwards & Hong, 2017).

Similar issues have been highlighted by alumni in other countries such as Vanuatu and Kenya as part of the research undertaken by the Facility (Edwards & Taylor, 2017; Edwards & Capel, 2017).

Ms Ulambayar, who undertook condensed courses to complete her degree over a shorter time period, described having scarce time to undertake an internship or connect with other people as the demands of the course were too great. Mr Sainsanaa concurred that he was not able to form professional links while undertaking his Master of Financial Management at the University of Melbourne. When asked what was needed to support alumni to foster these relationships, Mr Sainsanaa suggested that one or two month internships with Australian companies would be very beneficial.

Mr Sainsanaa, who is currently Director of Internal Audit for Petrovis Oil, a Mongolian market leader for petroleum wholesale and retail with over 2,000 employees, sought work experience while in Australia but was unsuccessful. Mr Sainsanaa had significant experience working in the banking sector, having previously worked as Supervisor in the Internal Audit Department for the Bank of Mongolia, but was not able to secure even a bank teller position in Australia. He explains; 'everybody tried [to obtain paid work], at first aggressively in the first six or seven months, then gave up. Without salary, I would like to [have accepted] an internship. It would [have been] a great experience.'

⁹ Further detail at <http://australiaawardsmongolia.org/index.php/en/alumni-2/australia-awards-alumni>

Mr McKenna of DFAT expanded that internships could offer a structured way of creating links between individuals and organisations that could lead to greater outcomes.

Ms Altantsetseg is a member of professional organisations, such as CPA Australia, but has not maintained professional links with Australians. Mrs Dorjnamjaa stated she made no professional links while in Australia, and believes that host institutions could play a role in connecting students with professional associations or organisations while they are studying in Australia.

5.5.2 Mozzies are limited in their ability to link alumni with Australians/Australian organisations outside Mongolia

While the Mozzies fulfil a vital role connecting Mongolian alumni with Australians and Australian businesses in Mongolia, they are limited in their ability to foster bilateral collaboration and institutional links with Australians and Australian organisations outside of Mongolia. To address this, Mrs Ariunaa, Executive Director of the Mozzies, sees the Australia Global Alumni portal as an important conduit to raise the profile of the Mozzies and link members with overseas alumni and alumni associations. Mrs Ariunaa believes that alumni associations can learn from each other if connected via a virtual or actual global alumni forum.

Further, she indicated that joining Australian professional sector-level organisations is a beneficial way of creating links. Finally, she indicated that fellowships or short course awards that involve in-country visits are important to update alumni's knowledge about Australia and forge new links. Ms Tsetsgee agreed that short term awards are useful to support achievement of the Australia Awards long-term Outcomes 2 and 3. She stated 'when they are [in Australia for long-term awards], they only focus on their academic studies' and cannot extend themselves much beyond this. She claims that 'this is why they are really keen to go back and gain other experiences'.

However, Mrs Ariunaa acknowledged the challenges for alumni in participating in Australia Awards fellowships; alumni need to possess the connection with the Australian organisation who initiates the application and understand the application process. Mrs Ariunaa recognised that the Mozzies could play a role in advocacy and informing alumni about this opportunity.

5.5.3 Mozzies' diverse membership limits its ability to foster sectoral links and partnerships

Although Mozzies members share the experience of studying in Australia, in many cases little else connects them due to their diverse sectors, positions, ages and workplaces. Mrs Ariunaa said: 'to organise something which is of common interest to everyone; it's a challenge.' She stated that the attraction of other sector-focused networking events is strong for alumni, as these are connected with their workplace/business and livelihoods, whereas Mozzies can be seen as more of an extraneous activity. This is why, according to Mrs Ariunaa, social activities have been very popular as they are seen as neutral. Mr McKenna of DFAT inferred that a greater sectoral focus across the various Australia Awards alumni platforms would extend the capacity for bilateral networking and achieve a number of the public sector diplomacy objectives.

6. Views about Australia and Australian Expertise

Summary findings

Alumni in the Mongolia Case Study held **very positive views about Australia, Australians and Australian expertise**. Further, key stakeholders suggested that the strong bilateral relationship was based on **shared values, perceived cultural similarities and other geographic and industry-related areas of common interest**.

All alumni described positive experiences at their institutions, citing important features such as:

- access to assistance from lecturers and professors
- support from their institution's scholarships office
- pedagogical approaches used that mirror future work requirements.

Alumni and key stakeholders also highlighted that they believed that the Australia Awards is the 'best' scholarships initiative in Mongolia.

All alumni described their experience of life in Australia in positive terms, citing key aspects such as:

- the generosity demonstrated by fellow students
- the opportunity to develop advanced English language skills
- the opportunity to learn in multicultural settings
- the benefits to family relationships
- enhanced understanding about people with disability.

Alumni provided examples of how positive views were applied. These included:

- promoting studying in Australia
- using Australian expertise in their roles
- seeking to work with or recruit graduates of Australian institutions acknowledging the quality of education they had received.

In summary, the evidence provided demonstrates that the **Australia Awards long-term Outcome 4, that 'Alumni view Australia, Australians, and Australian expertise positively', has been achieved**.

6.1 Introduction

Alumni views of Australia, Australians and Australian expertise has been identified as an area of change sought through the Australia Awards (DFAT, 2016). The theory of change that underpins the Australia Awards is that undertaking an Australian scholarship will result in outputs that include:

- Alumni and their families have a positive experience of life in Australia
- Alumni complete good quality, relevant education, training, other professional development and research activities.

It is assumed that these factors will translate to the long-term outcome of alumni viewing Australia, Australians and Australian expertise positively. This outcome, in tandem with those on skills, networks, cooperation and partnerships, will contribute to the goal of the Australia Awards that partner countries progress their development goals and have positive relationships with Australia that advance mutual interests (DFAT, 2016).

This chapter includes evidence of Mongolian Australia Awards alumni's views about Australians and Australian expertise based on their experiences in Australia and at Australian institutions and how these views have been enacted since returning to Mongolia.

6.2 Background

Interviews with key stakeholders such as Ambassador Langtry, Minister of Finance, Minister Khurelbaatar and Executive Director of the Mozzies, Mrs Ariunaa, revealed a consistent finding; **a general strong disposition to fostering the bilateral relationship based on shared values, perceived cultural similarities and other geographic and industry-related areas of common interest.**

Ambassador Langtry indicated that the overall relationship could be characterised by the positive inclination to 'recognise the things we have in common or value' such as our open societies, commonality in United Nations-related matters, and shared experience governing a country where the resources sector makes a major contribution to national wealth. Minister Khurelbaatar expressed strong respect for Ambassador Langtry as someone he could 'talk with as a friend on any issue' and that his time in Australia equipped him to relate effectively to Australians including DFAT staff. Minister Khurelbaatar acknowledged the respect shown by Australian Government officials when visiting Mongolian Government officials and Mozzies members, and referred to the Joint Statement as emblematic of the relationship. Mrs Ariunaa said:

I think the Australian [ways]...are very close to Mongolian ways; how we are; that despite our different development stages, we share similar attitudes, which is what keeps us connected. The Mozzies fosters this connection through its name, which refers to a kind of second citizenship as alumni view themselves as "Mongolian Aussies".

6.3 Alumni had positive experiences of life in Australia

All alumni described their time in Australia as a student in positive terms. Some of the features of their experiences included the kindness and generosity shown by Australians and other international or Mongolian students in orienting them or connecting with them on campus. In particular, two alumni referred to studying in a multicultural setting as a novel and positive experience, which improved their skills in working with diverse teams. Most alumni referred to the opportunity to develop high-level English language skills via immersion in Australian as valuable to their professional lives.

These benefits also extended to their accompanying partners and children. One alumna asserted that 'you learn not only academically, but about child rearing, personal development, from the parents of your children's friends'. She said it was good to experience a new culture, to become more independent. In addition, she described the positive benefits for her relationship with her husband, as studying in Australia 'opened her eyes to gender equality'. She said that her husband now understands that she can develop her career too. She said 'Australia influenced our small family environment; we became supportive of each other'. These perceptions extended to other family members; she affirmed that her husband's family see her with more knowledge which has improved her status in the family.

Ms Bat-Otgon described how the experience of studying in Australia extends more broadly, altering alumni's attitudes and values. She said 'when they come [home], they have a certain change, not only in their education level but also attitude. They have observed firsthand how society in general includes people with disability in Australia' and that this knowledge becomes a collective asset of the alumni association. She inferred that alumni, internationally educated and in many cases senior or high-ranking staff, have the influence to 'reach certain layers in society' and advocate for much needed changes to attitudes about and service provision for people with disability.

The evidence presented **affirms that alumni and their families have had a positive experience of life in Australia, which has contributed to achieving the Australia Awards' long-term outcome of positive views of Australia, Australians, and Australian expertise.**

These findings mirror those from the Tracer Survey Year 1 2016-17 which found that all alumni from Mongolia indicated their experience in Australia positively influenced their perception of Australia.

6.4 Alumni had positive experiences at their Australian institutions

All alumni interviewed as part of this Case Study **spoke highly of the Australian institutions they attended.** As discussed in Chapter 4, alumni provided examples of how they were able to use the skills and knowledge they had gained in Australia to advance their careers, support colleagues to gain knowledge, and to the benefit of their institutions and sector. This application of skills and knowledge speaks to its relevance to alumni's workplaces and sectors.

Positive views held by alumni about Australia were not necessarily based solely on their experience studying there. One alumna stated that his opinion about the

quality of the University of Melbourne was based on the Times Higher Education World University Rankings. Mr Sainsanaa stated that at the time of his award, the University of Melbourne was ranked first in Australia and this influenced his decision to select this institution as his study destination. Ms Ulambayar stated that she considered a number of factors in selecting her institution; her preference for nature, good weather and sun helped her choose Australia over the United States, the United Kingdom, or Japan. In addition, her own research revealed that the courses at Victoria University were practical and applied, which appealed to her.

A number of alumni highlighted particular aspects of their educational experience in Australia which shaped their favourable view of their time on scholarship. Mrs Dorjnamjaa, who studied a Master of Business at Victoria University, highlighted the accessibility of Australian lecturers and professors as a feature distinct from education in Mongolia or Russia. She said 'we had contact from our teachers [and] lecturers and we got advice from them at any time...they gave us advice on how to write papers and how to overcome some problems'. Similarly, Ms Altantsetseg praised the support provided by the scholarships office at Curtin University, sharing that they considered the scholarship students to be the best students, and they motivated her to do her best.

Ms Ulambayar said at Victoria University, she developed her communication skills – verbal and written – and in turn her confidence to take on new professional challenges and advance her career. She said 'I gained essay writing skills in Australia...how to express yourself concisely...in a clear way.' She also praised the staged and cumulative way in which assignments and learning outcomes were structured. She found this style of teaching and learning useful as it is 'exactly the same as how we now do [our] job' at XacBank, which has an international senior management team where advanced English language communication skills are vital and project-based management approaches are used. Ms Ulambayar concluded that if she had not completed a degree from Australia, she would not be accepted in her senior role as Chief Operating Officer at XacBank. She said '[in] our Senior Management Team, there is one person from Harvard, one person is from Boston, one is from Yale...there is no-one who doesn't have a post-graduate degree...it's very important'.

Not only did alumni possess positive views of Australian institutions based on their experiences studying in Australia; they also held positive views of the Australia Awards. **Minister Khurelbaatar stated that the Australian Government scholarships program is the 'best' on the basis of the contribution that alumni are making, particularly in education, health, and the private sector.** 'Most of them are in top leadership positions...doing a great job' he said, concluding that the experience and knowledge gained in Australia is valuable.

Mr Khuyagtsoigt stated that he was familiar with Australian Government scholarships as his colleagues had applied. He said the Australian Government scholarships were 'the most famous, prestigious scholarships here [in Mongolia]'. Key stakeholders interviewed agreed; Ms Gankhuyag, Program Director of the WLP stated 'Australia Awards are the most prestigious'. Ms Ulambayar emphasised that another benefit of the Australian Government scholarship was

that they were more generous than others in terms of allowance, which was important to her when considering covering family expenses.

This evidence presented, combined with the evidence presented in Chapter 4 affirms that **alumni complete good quality, relevant education, training, other professional development and research activities**. This has **contributed to achieving the overall long-term outcome of positive views of Australia, Australians, and Australian expertise**.

6.5 Alumni have contributed to the Australia-Mongolia bilateral relationship

Alumni and key stakeholders shared their views of Australia with others in Mongolia by encouraging Australia and Australian education to others, using Australian expertise in their roles, and promoting graduates of Australian institutions in terms of the skills and knowledge they possess. These findings are consistent with the Tracer Survey Year 1 2016-17 which found that all Mongolian alumni reported having provided advice to people in Mongolia about pursuing opportunities in Australia.

Mr Sereeter described promoting studying in Australia and its benefits to many colleagues at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. He said he recommended studying in Australia to a number of colleagues, and ‘because of my recommendation, they also did their master’s degree, in the same way’.

Ms Altantsetseg stated that for her assignments she referred to Australian Government websites for regulations and information, and continued this practice upon return to Mongolia. When Ms Altantsetseg wanted to develop a piece of legislation, she described how **she looked to Australian regulations and rules first, as good examples**. When she was looking for a country comparison she would always chose Australia over Mongolia’s closest geographic and trade partners, Russia and China. She said ‘Australia is our third neighbour. We have a lot of Australian investment and Australian graduates. While we are very far, we are very close to each other. I think Mongolia should have a treaty with Australia’.

As described in Chapter 4, in Australia Mr Sereeter developed valuable negotiation and teamwork skills which were enhanced through the experience of working with multicultural teams. This was useful as he drew upon these experiences to negotiate foreign investment deals and trade agreements with foreign government representatives. Mr Sainsanaa applied the skills and knowledge he gained in Australia in risk-based internal auditing, overhauling traditional audit practices in favour of newer, internationally recognised approaches. Mr Sainsanaa applied these skills and trained colleagues in the use of these approaches in the senior roles he occupied in both XacBank and Petrovis. Ms Ulambayar developed research and analytical skills in Australia which she applied in her role leading operations for the XacBank group. Mrs Dorjnamjaa developed skills in project planning, execution and monitoring and evaluation she put into practice at the Ministry of Finance.

Most significantly, **Minister Khurelbaatar acknowledged the quality and rigour of Australian education**. He stated that from his experience completing a Master

of Economics at the University of Sydney, he knows the standards and commitment required to obtain top grades, and the level of knowledge that graduates will have as a result, **which is why he looks out for these qualifications when recruiting for Ministry staff.** Ms Ulambayar agrees, stating that the internal audit departments she has led would have benefited from the experience of Australian-educated graduates.

This evidence suggests that alumni **hold positive views of Australia, Australians and Australian expertise and convey these views in ways that enhance the bilateral relationship and support the achievement of the remaining long-term outcomes of the Australia Awards.**

7. Impact of Australia Awards on addressing equity issues

Summary findings

Gender

The Australia Awards in Mongolia are proactive in implementing practical steps to promote gender equality. One such activity is the WLP designed to foster engagement with all alumni to raise awareness of gender equality issues, and support women's empowerment through post-award capacity building and development of leadership skills.

Disability

The Australia Awards in Mongolia actively encourage and support the inclusion of people with disability at the policy level and through engaging with disability experts. However, broader systemic issues within the education sector present a major barrier for candidates with disability to meet the eligibility requirements for Australian tertiary scholarships.

Rural populations

Australia Awards scholarships are less accessible for rural groups, due to limited access to quality education, English language education, and limited access to information about the Australia Awards. The Australia Awards in Mongolia are exploring innovative approaches to engage rural groups.

7.1 Introduction

Chapter 7 describes the impact of the Australia Awards in addressing equity and disadvantage in Mongolia. It explores how interventions to 'address barriers to participation and provide on award/post-award support where participation by women, people with disability and other disadvantaged members of society is low' (DFAT, 2016, p. 12). Additionally, this chapter seeks to answer 'research question d: Are the benefits of receiving a scholarship experienced equally by all groups who have received them?'

This chapter discusses the impact the scholarships have had on the Case Study alumni in addressing equity issues, and explores the identified enablers and barriers to gender, disability and rural inclusion in Mongolia. English as a second language is also identified as a cross-cutting barrier affecting access and participation in the Australia Awards.

The Mongolian alumni sample group included three men and three women, which provided an equal gender representation for this Case Study. The opportunity to fully investigate the impact of Australia Awards scholarships on people with disability was limited as no alumni identified as a person with disability within the field of Management and Commerce in the 2006-10 cohort.

However, Ms Bat-Otgon, Executive Director of the Union of the Persons with Disabilities of Mongolia and member of the Australia Awards Project Coordination Committee was interviewed as part of this Case Study. Her expertise in the field of disability and knowledge of the Australia Awards has been included in this Case Study, along with insights from the Australian Embassy and the Australia Awards in Mongolia.

7.2 Gender equality and disability inclusiveness in Mongolia

A cross-cutting objective of the Australia Awards is to positively affect and support gender equality and disability inclusiveness, and social inclusion more broadly. This section outlines the background context of gender and disability in Mongolia.

7.2.1 Gender

The guiding principle for gender equality included in the Constitution of Mongolia, states ‘...men and women shall have equal right in political, economic, social, cultural fields and in family affairs’ (Government of Mongolia, 1992, p. 6). It is further reinforced in the *Mongolia Sustainable Development Vision 2030*, which recognises a principle for achieving sustainable social development is to ‘[ensure] gender equality in social development, and create a pleasant environment for equal participation in social welfare’ (p. 23).

However, in practice entrenched cultural and traditional gender norms create significant challenges for women and men to access the same opportunities. These ingrained norms strengthen institutional and attitudinal barriers, and perpetuate gender stereotypes from the household to the national level. According to Ms Gankhuyag, Program Director of the WLP, men are traditionally respected as the symbolic head of the family, while women typically provide a supporting role and are generally responsible for the majority of non-paid household work including family budgeting.

These gendered roles carry through to the business and political spheres, where men are perceived to possess stronger intellectual abilities, desired traits in successful leaders. Conversely, women are generally perceived as being short-sighted and detail-oriented – attributes believed to be more suited for secretarial tasks and support roles. These ingrained gender norms subsequently instil a societal perception that women are inherently less capable than men. Ms Gankhuyag states that these barriers serve to disempower women and limit their potential for career progression in both the public and private sectors.

However, secondary and tertiary education institutions in Mongolia are dominated by women, due to two major factors: 1) men (in particular those living in rural areas) are more likely to transition into vocations involving manual labour such as farming, and therefore are not expected or required to continue studying; and 2) generally, men have clearer pathways to professional advancement compared to women, and **therefore do not necessarily require further education in order to progress in their careers**. This results in more women pursuing higher education compared to men, creating a larger pool of eligible women applicants for the Australia Awards (DFAT, 2014).

Systemic barriers to accessing advancement opportunities

Although women generally have more opportunity to access higher education, **women in Mongolia do not have access to the same career opportunities compared to men** and are ‘... under-represented in decision-making and leadership positions in the workforce’ (DFAT, 2014). A gender analysis undertaken by the Australia Awards in Mongolia revealed: ‘...most women in general work sectors in Mongolia are employed in junior, middle and auxiliary positions, and are concentrated in the lower income levels of both the public and private sectors’ (Lunden, 2014, p. 3).

Australia Awards alumnae interviewed in this Case Study experienced or perceived there to be prevalent **gender bias throughout the public and private sectors in Mongolia**. They perceived male employees enjoying more access to opportunities for advancement and leadership roles, taking on more responsibility, and receiving more recognition for their accomplishments. Ms Ulambayar asserted: ‘If we look into government, you will see a lot of the male cabinet members rather than women... In our institution, actually more than 60 per cent of all the staff are women, but in the management level, only 30 per cent are women managers. So people are usually giving preferences to the guys’.

One alumnus, Mr Sereeter was promoted to Deputy Director General in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs directly upon returning to Mongolia. He also observed that in both private and public sectors the majority of employees are women, but ‘...the managers, higher ranks, mostly they are males...’. One alumna, Ms Altantsetseg also observed of her place of employment, ‘...usually [there are] males at the head of every department’.

The experiences described in this Case Study are supported by a gender analysis undertaken in 2014, which revealed 18 per cent of alumnae were promoted to a middle or senior management position, compared to 37 per cent of male alumni (Lunden, 2014, p.3). This is also true of the management and commerce sector specifically, with **male alumni generally advancing more quickly upon their return to Mongolia, compared to alumnae**.

When probed about career advancement in relation to gender, Mr Sainsanaa confirmed: ‘We [men] have this advantage in a career’. In contrast to the quick rate of advancement of her fellow alumni in this Case Study, Mrs Dorjnamjaa reported lack of opportunity as a major barrier in her career. She described how she applied for advancement upon her return to Mongolia, and was advised the timing was not suitable because there were no positions available. Despite having a large portfolio of high level responsibilities, she stated: ‘My career has not progressed.... I am in the same position’.

Attitudinal barriers to accessing advancement opportunities

Underpinning the systemic barriers to career advancement for women in Mongolia are the attitudinal beliefs regarding capabilities. **Entrenched gender norms are a major contributor to this barrier, and to gender inequality in Mongolia**.

According to Ms Gankhuyag, gender inequality is ‘really ingrained in our culture and tradition... [so improving gender equality] is the hardest thing because it’s part of our identity’. Ms Gankhuyag explained how these factors contribute to women’s low self-confidence and uncertainty in their capabilities: ‘...the cultural stereotype

serves as the main barrier for women to take up a leadership role...if you don't believe in yourself, if you think you're not skilled enough... [you think] a man, he can do it better'.

Dr Tsetsegsaikhan added that commonly held misperceptions about women's ability has a detrimental impact on women's careers: '...Mostly people don't like women leaders... people think that women are not capable leaders...'. This is supported by research undertaken by the Australia Awards in Mongolia that revealed '**gender inequality in [the] workplace is often driven by male managers**' (Lunden, 2014, p.3). This is not limited to supervisors – male peers also uphold these attitudinal barriers.

Cultural perceptions of appropriate behaviour for women further reinforces barriers in the workplace. For example, Ms Ulambayar's ability to meet with colleagues or business partners in more informal settings is restricted: '...it will be perceived like I am inviting them for a date'. These unofficial gatherings often involve business discussions, but this informal method of discourse automatically excludes women from participation.

Generally, men are less engaged with gender equality compared to women in Mongolia. This is illustrated by an underrepresentation of men in the WLP. Revealingly, feedback received from men who participate in the WLP indicate they place a high value on the program outcomes. According to Ms Gankhuyag, further feedback from men indicated that men may be unwilling to join the WLP due a misinterpretation of the name 'Women's Leadership Program'. This name may suggest the program is designed specifically for women, which might discourage men from applying.

Conversely, Ms Gankhuyag noted the WLP has received critical feedback and complaints from the public due to their ineligibility to become members. This demonstrates a public demand for the program, beyond the scope of Australia Awards alumni.

7.2.2 Disability

A legal framework for disability inclusion has been established in Mongolia, signified by its formal accession to the *Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities* in 2009. Additionally, ensuring '...equal participation for citizens with physical disabilities...' is a stated principle in the *Mongolia Sustainable Development Vision 2030* (Government of Mongolia, 2016).

However, the practical implementation of this legislative framework has proved challenging in Mongolia, with significant institutional, physical and attitudinal barriers limiting equal access to education and employment opportunities for people with disability. Executive Director of the Union of the Persons with Disabilities of Mongolia Ms Bat-Otgon confirmed '...the legal framework in [Mongolia] is already established... [but] systemic issues of limited accessibility and attitudinal barriers remaining prominent'. This is further reinforced by DFAT First Secretary Mr McKenna, who confirmed the legislative framework has been established, but the challenge remains for people with disability to be treated equally in practice.

According to Ms Tsetsgee, institutional barriers are one of the major challenges experienced by people with disability. Ms Bat-Otgon agreed with this assertion, adding that disability awareness has improved in recent years, but the education system does not specifically address special education needs: 'In the kindergartens or secondary schools or universities there is still no inclusion of people with disabilities. There is no equitable opportunity for them to get education'.

Ms Bat-Otgon advised the other major barrier for people with disability in Mongolia is attitudinal, with little recognition that people with disability can provide a valuable contribution to society. This is reinforced by the welfare model of disability applied in the Mongolia context. According to Ms Bat-Otgon, 'The government still treats persons with disabilities as a part of the vulnerable groups that should be taken care of... care does not exceed beyond the welfare that they provide'. This model is substantiated by the Constitution of Mongolia which prohibits any form of discrimination, but only references people with disability in relation to their '... right to material and financial assistance' (Government of Mongolia, 1992). Ms Bat-Otgon emphasised the main priority is for perceptions of disability to change, including self-perception: '...persons with disabilities themselves need to change their mentality on how they view themselves... as a profitable part of society'.

Ms Bat-Otgon also identified **employment opportunities for alumni with disabilities as a significant challenge**: '...with employment prospects, it is very hard for them really to identify a place to work, and there are no mediation services to link them with employment opportunities'. Although Article 111 of the Mongolian Labour Code (Law of Mongolia, 1999) requires businesses with over 50 employees to reach a 3 per cent quota of employees with disability, according to Ms Bat-Otgon this provision is not generally complied with. She emphasised **employment as a crucial factor for changing perceptions of people with disabilities as valuable contributors to society**.

7.3 Access to the Australia Awards scholarships

7.3.1 Gendered barriers to access

Primary education is generally viewed as equally important for boys and girls in Mongolia. However, Ms Gankhuyag advised when families are faced with deciding which of their children to support through higher education, daughters are usually given priority, particularly amongst nomadic families where sons are expected to continue farming. Ms Tsetsgee attributes this trend to ingrained cultural gender norms: '**Traditionally, we tend to believe that men can do whatever they want... [whereas] girls should go and start to study and learn to be powerful or resourceful**'. According to Mr McKenna, this results in '...greater numbers of women achieving higher levels of education'.

This norm is compounded by the tendency for men to progress in their careers without tertiary qualifications, while '...it is almost obligatory for women to have better education in order to be placed in managerial position' (Lunden, 2014). According to the Australia Awards in Mongolia, **men generally have clearer pathways for advancement, which encourages them to remain employed and demotivates them from pursuing further study**, at the risk of losing momentum

in their career progression. Conversely, **women are less likely to progress in their careers, and as such perceive the pursuit of further education as a lower risk investment with a higher potential benefit in return.**

Mr McKenna advised this propensity for more women to participate in higher education compared to men results in a larger number of women applicants, and subsequently **a higher number of women alumnae of Australia Awards scholarships.** According to Mr McKenna, '...the proportion of males is slowly increasing... [and] more males have been moving through the system...'

The only gendered barrier experienced by an alumna in this Case Study to accessing the Australia Awards was in response to an application for deferral. One alumna, Ms Ulambayar described her experience of receiving a scholarship in 2003. Due to pregnancy, Ms Ulambayar was unable to move to Australia and as such applied for a deferral in accordance with the 'Australia Awards Scholarships Policy Handbook'. Her application for deferral was declined and her scholarship withdrawn, with reasons cited as relating to the financial year of the offer. Ms Ulambayar reapplied when practical and was awarded another scholarship in 2006.

7.3.2 Barriers to access for people with disability

People with disability face significant, systemic and cumulative barriers to accessing the Australia Awards. According to the Australian Embassy and the Union of the Persons with Disabilities of Mongolia, these barriers comprise of three main elements commencing from the schooling system:

- 1 **Access to quality educational opportunities in Mongolia** that would contribute to potential applicants' capacity to meet the Australia Awards selection criteria. As described by Mr McKenna: 'The scholarship scheme requires certain criteria to be met, including achieving a minimum grade point average (GPA). If you've got issues with the access...to the schooling system, then it will be more difficult to meet these criteria'.
- 2 **Physical access to participating in application processes.** DFAT explained that the Australia Awards makes arrangements to ensure people with disabilities can participate in the application process. This can include providing physical assistance to enter buildings or participating in interviews via skype. Mongolia, and many other countries, faces challenges as most buildings do not provide ramp access. Physical access to facilities for people with disabilities is a systemic and pervasive problem across Ulaanbaatar.
- 3 **Access to Australia,** DFAT clarified that scholars with disability are sometimes prevented from travelling to Australia due to the inability to obtain medical insurance for pre-existing conditions. Australia Awards works diligently with government stakeholders to overcome these issues on a case by case basis and adds to their bank of knowledge and strategies with every case.

Ms Bat-Otgon agreed the first challenge for people with disability is accessing quality education in Mongolia. She explained that Mongolia's primary and secondary school system delivers a curriculum of basic literacy and numeracy, and is not tailored to the specific needs of students with disabilities: 'It does not provide

them with the basis to... access or join the universities'. Ms Bat-Otgon further noted **there is no systemic process in place to support people with disability to access higher education**. Rather, it is completely dependent on the individual and their family's capacity to investigate and pursue available options.

This prerequisite level of experience determined by social insurance is problematic, as **many young people with disability face employment discrimination and as such are unable to meet the eligibility criteria**. According to Ms Bat-Otgon, the Union of the Persons with Disabilities of Mongolia offer a volunteer program which provides young people an opportunity to gain experience, but the program is unpaid and as such does not provide social insurance.

The Australian Embassy endeavours to respond to barriers preventing individuals from accessing the Australia Awards. However, DFAT explained their capacity to implement change is limited due to the above mentioned barriers that extend beyond the Australia Awards. The Australian Embassy has investigated options for adapting application and interview processes to be more inclusive, but have limited access to resources such as special needs aides and accessible interview venues.

7.3.3 Barriers to access for rural populations

According to DFAT, the Australia Awards are less accessible for rural groups, and in particular those living nomadic lifestyles, due to reduced access to quality primary, secondary and English language educational opportunities and resources. Quality education is far less accessible for rural students compared to those in Ulaanbaatar due to physical remoteness. Mr McKenna identified **English language as a major barrier experienced disproportionately by rural candidates**. He added that **rural groups are further disadvantaged from accessing the Australia Awards due to an information access** and technology barrier: 'Rural applicants don't tend to have the same access to information about the scholarships that their city counterparts [have]...' Consequently, it is possible that suitably qualified individuals who meet the Australia Awards requirements and have an interest in studying abroad may not even be aware of the scholarships. DFAT plans to address these issues in their selection process by offering outreach of IELTS testing services to a minimum number of rural applicants.

7.3.4 Language as a cross-cutting barrier

Ms Tsetsgee identified **limited English language proficiency as the overall biggest barrier to accessing an Australia Awards scholarship in Mongolia**: '...the English language is the most and the first top priority constraint'. This statement was supported by the experiences of most of the alumni in this Case Study. Ms Altantsetseg, Mrs Dorjnamjaa, Mr Sereeter, Mr Sainsanaa and Mr Khuyagtsogt all identified English language proficiency as a barrier to accessing an Australia Awards scholarship.

Quality English language training has proved effective in overcoming language barriers. The Australia Awards in Mongolia offer an English language training course to candidates whose English language proficiency is not strong

enough for study at Australian institutions¹⁰. Mr Sainsanaa demonstrates the success of this approach. Although he did not meet the language requirements, he received an offer which included a nine month English language course in Mongolia. This course supported him to meet the language requirements of the scholarship, with a final overall score that exceeded the minimum language requirements.

Ambassador Langtry emphasised the importance of considering language competency requirements and ensuring the inclusion of candidates who meet all eligibility requirements other than language proficiency. English language courses can then support these scholars to improve their English language proficiency in order to meet the language requirements and help prepare them for studying in Australian institutions.

While English language proficiency is a challenge for the broad range of candidates in Mongolia, **this barrier is doubly problematic amongst rural applicants and people with disability.**

According to DFAT, the necessity to travel to Ulaanbaatar to participate in English language training and access to the International English Language Testing System (IELTS) testing adds a financial burden for rural applicants, which many cannot afford. Mr McKenna advised in order to alleviate this financial burden for rural candidates, plans are being developed to introduce English language training and IELTS testing in rural centres: 'We are trying to [find] cohorts of interested applicants where we can actually run English language tests in smaller population centres.' However to date, the minimum required number of geographically clustered applicants (14) has not been met, preventing the IELTS centre from implementing this initiative.

For people with disability, Ms Bat-Otgon described limited English language proficiency as '...the biggest barrier...' to accessing the Australia Awards scholarships. This barrier is compounded for people with disability due to the inaccessibility of the English language training courses offered. This prevents otherwise suitably qualified individuals from meeting the Australia Awards language requirements, as required by institutions.

Finally, according to Ambassador Langtry the Australian visa application process does not provide language assistance. This adds an additional hurdle for applicants to correctly follow procedures and successfully gain entry to Australia.

¹⁰ Details of the English Language Training provided by the Australia Awards in Mongolia can be found here: <http://www.australiaawardsmongolia.org/index.php/en/australia-awards-in-mongolia-2/english-language-training>

7.4 Impact of Australia Awards in addressing equity issues

7.4.1 Gender equality

The impact the Australia Awards has on gender equality is influenced by the following factors identified in this Case Study:

- the role of the Australia Awards in Mongolia, specifically the WLP in supporting gender equality and women's empowerment through post-award capacity building;
- the potential of the Australia Awards experience to support all alumni develop their awareness and perspectives on gender equity issues.

The role of the Australia Awards in Mongolia

The Australia Awards in Mongolia is instrumental in integrating gender equality programming. Their contribution is underpinned by the 'Gender and Disability Strategy' which was endorsed by the PCC 2013 (Lunden, 2014) and updated in 2017. This strategy guides the Australia Awards operations in Mongolia '...to integrate gender equality... across the scholarships cycle' (DFAT, 2017). The Australia Awards in Mongolia also appointed a gender representative to the PCC to advise on gender equity issues, and designed the WLP to 'increase female alumni's leadership skills and to enhance women's professional development after completing an Australia Award' (DFAT, 2014, p. v).

The WLP, managed by the Zorig Foundation, is intended to support existing policies on gender equality in Mongolia (DFAT, 2014) through supporting Australia Awards alumni to participate equally in the workplace and develop leadership capacity, regardless of gender. Ms Gankhuyag believes the WLP effectively responds to gender equity issues through:

- 1 Supporting alumnae to improve their leadership skills, gain self-confidence and build their capacity in transferrable skills.
- 2 Transforming alumni views on gender through raising awareness of equity issues.

Regarding the first point, Ms Gankhuyag emphasised the importance of '...working first on improving the self-respect...' and identified the biggest result of the WLP as the increased self-confidence of alumnae: '...it's that self-awareness and self-confidence that helps them tackle their next objective or goal'. This strengthens the foundation for women to build capacity in other areas such as leadership and transferrable skills.

...the biggest result we see from our program is that the level of self-confidence [of women] increases exponentially because they meet with these amazing, passionate proactive capable women out there who serve as a role model for them and help them see that there's no actual limit or barrier there, that the barrier, they possibly can have in their minds and once they believe in themselves and believe in their capability, it's possible to achieve what they're set out for.

Alumni have a major role in supporting the WLP participants, through knowledge-sharing and mentoring. Previous WLP participants deliver orientation sessions to share their experience of personal development, and provide advice on how to

best utilise the program. Multiple alumnae confirmed the value in this component of the WLP. For example, Ms Altantsetseg advised the WLP assisted her in taking on '...a leadership role and to learn about how to manage others...'

Dr Tsetsegsaikhan also participated in the WLP and identified many benefits, including opportunities to '...improve a lot of skills which are not taught at university, such as how to improve your leadership skills, how to improve your communication skills, how to have good public speaking and how to improve your networking skills'. Dr Tsetsegsaikhan further emphasised the high value of the mentoring component of the WLP, which connected her with a mentor during a two-week fellowship in Australia: '...she's very supportive and still we're in contact and she's mentoring me on different issues ...this is very supportive in terms of professional career development'.

Regarding the awareness-raising component, the WLP has been successful in developing all alumni's understanding of gender equity issues and barriers, including one senior executive alumnus, Mr Sainsanaa: '[The WLP] has changed my mindset about the gender equality. Now I think we are the same, men and women. I thought that we were different. [But] we are all human beings.'

Mr McKenna agrees the WLP is effective in supporting alumnae to progress in their careers and promoting gender equality amongst the WLP members, in particular generating improved understanding and support amongst male alumni. Mr McKenna also emphasised the WLP as an example of a successful evidence-based supplementary component of the Australia Awards, designed to respond to a country-specific issue identified in Mongolia. Ambassador Langtry spoke highly of the WLP, noting that other organisations have indicated interest in adopting similar models.

The Australian Embassy has also contributed to raising awareness of gender equality. Mr McKenna provided the recent example of a coordinated panel discussion to explore personal experiences of gender issues, and the wider context of gender equality in Mongolia. According to Mr McKenna, this panel comprised of female ambassadors and the Australian Ambassador, with hundreds of alumni invited to join in the general discussion after each presentation. Mr McKenna highlighted this participatory approach enabled a high level of interaction and alumni engagement: '...we gave an opportunity, a venue for a debate around Mongolian gender policy to the alumni community broadly... we're supporting the alumni to think broadly about how their jobs and their own lives support these type of issues'.

The Mozzies also seek to address gender equity issues post-award, through implementing inclusion strategies. Executive Director Mrs Ariunaa advised the Mozzies integrate gender equality programming in social and activities to ensure a balanced gender representation: 'For example, in this volleyball or basketball competition, we insisted that at least two members of the team should be female... so that it's not only a male dominated sport... [and] we will have a Mozzies Grand Slam... it will be individual male, female and a ...female and male pair'.

The Australia Awards experience supports alumni to develop awareness of gender equity issues

The impact of the Australia Awards on gender equality has also been attributed to alumni experiences of studying, living and working in Australia. This **experiential learning has influenced alumni perspectives of gender norms, and helped alumnae gain confidence as leaders**. One alumna, Ms Altantsetseg observed that Australia Awards alumnae seem more confident to communicate assertively and more empowered to identify and respond to instances of gender inequality. Ms Altantsetseg also noted the experience of living in Australia assisted her husband in developing his understanding of gender equality, and contributed to a more mutually supportive dynamic.

Another alumna, Ms Ulambayar identified a direct link between studying in Australia and her enhanced confidence and willingness to respond to instances of gender inequality. Ms Ulambayar explained that before studying in Australia she was ‘...very shy...to be like a leader or to express myself. But after my course work, I got a lot of confidence...’ When asked how she now responds to instances of gender inequality compared to before she studied in Australia, Ms Ulambayar provided the example of being overlooked during business meetings, with her male colleagues being addressed first: ‘...everyone will look at him, they will think he’s the boss’. Ms Ulambayar described her newfound willingness to respond to this kind of gender bias: ‘...now [I] say that I’m that person... I am the person to talk to’.

7.4.2 Disability inclusiveness

The Australia Awards in Mongolia have integrated disability inclusive programming, as detailed in the *Gender and Disability Strategy* (Lunden, 2014). Ms Tsetsgee advised the Australia Awards in Mongolia also appointed a disability representative to the PCC, who is responsible for analysing disability inclusive programming, and supports a process of reflecting on lessons learned.

Ms Bat-Otgon recognised **the Australia Awards as the only scholarship program in Mongolia to adopt a disability inclusive program design**, noting to date there have been ‘...eight or nine graduates, persons with disabilities who have benefited from the Australia Awards...’ Ms Bat-Otgon also reflected on how the Australia Awards inclusiveness has progressed in recent years, and now ‘...covers not only the person with the disability but also the caregiver’. Mr McKenna highlighted the impact of supporting caregivers, illustrated by the inclusion of one alum who is the primary carer of a child with a disability: ‘This person wouldn’t have taken up their scholarship...without being able to retain their primary carer’s role’.

Ms Bat-Otgon believes the **Australia Awards are contributing significantly to changing public perception about people with disability in Mongolia**, in a number of ways. First, opportunities for young people with disability to undertake education overseas helps to improve awareness around the potential of people with disability in Mongolia, which is crucial to implementing change in the government’s approach to recognising people with disability as valuable contributors to society. Ms Bat-Otgon advised this is a major step to achieving societal inclusivity in Mongolia.

The second way the Australia Awards contribute to changing perception is by enabling alumni with disability to participate in high profile events, which provides a

platform for highly-educated people with disability to engage with influential members of society. This type of advocacy is crucial to raising awareness and breaking down attitudinal barriers towards people with disability. Ms Bat-Otgon emphasised the value of this type of advocacy, stating ‘I see these people have changed a lot and they are the driving force to change the public attitude in Mongolia’.

Additionally, Ms Bat-Otgon explained that **Australia Awards alumni actively seek opportunities to build the capacity of people with disability on their return** to Mongolia. Ms Bat-Otgon provided an example of one alum who approached the Union of the Persons with Disabilities of Mongolia to arrange a training course to support people with disability to prepare for entering the labour market. This initiative directly responds to one of the biggest hurdles that people with disability face in Mongolia – successfully gaining employment. Additionally, the community service project component of the WLP supports the achievement of broader gender equality and social inclusion (GESI) aims including disability inclusion.

Ms Tsetsgee provided the example of a community project led by a WLP member who established links with a non-governmental organisation that produces wheelchairs. According to Ms Tsetsgee, this alumna facilitated the shipment of approximately 400 wheelchairs to Mongolia as her WLP community project deliverable, enabling people with mobility impairments to increase their independence through utilising physical aids.

The Mozzies are also cognisant of the accessibility needs of members, and strive to incorporate inclusive practices. Mrs Ariunaa advised one alumna and member of the Mozzies has a physical disability and requires the use of a wheelchair. According to Mrs Ariunaa, the Mozzies consider her accessibility requirements when coordinating events to enable her participation, for example ensuring her accessibility through ramps at venues.

7.4.3 Rural populations

Australia Awards scholarships are largely inaccessible for rural groups. This is due to limited access to quality education and a technology barrier which prevents potential applicants from accessing information about the Australia Awards. Innovative approaches to engaging rural groups are currently being explored by the Australia Awards in Mongolia¹¹. Ms Tsetsgee is confident that participation will increase through improved information dissemination and targeted support for rural applicants.

¹¹ Details of the strategy to improve participation by rural groups can be found in ‘Appendix 9: Provincial Participation Plan’, updated October 2017.

8. Conclusion

This Case Study demonstrates the role of Australian Government scholarships in the sustainable development of Mongolia and its continuing bilateral relationship with Australia. The examples collated in this report specifically emphasise contributions of alumni who completed their Australian scholarships in the mid-to-late 2000s and have worked in the Mongolian financial sector both in public and private organisations.

The findings from the Mongolia Case Study suggest that **Australia Awards long-term Outcome 1 – that alumni are using their skills, knowledge and networks to contribute to sustainable development – is being achieved**. Examples from the alumni in this Case Study show substantial contributions to the professionalism, international credibility and sustained growth of the Mongolian financial sector. Alumni have had specific involvement in significant achievements for Mongolia, such as through establishment of free-trade agreements with key partners. Alumni have also contributed to substantial improvements in auditing, risk assessment as well as helping to up-skill colleagues in the areas in which they studied in Australia. The examples of alumni contributions identified in this report are directly benefiting core national strategies, in particular the ‘Mongolia Sustainable Development Vision 2030’.

The Mongolian alumni involved in this Case Study also offered some **evidence of support to Australia Awards Outcomes 2 and 3 – alumni contributions to developing cooperation, networks and partnerships between Australia and partner countries**. Examples of this included ongoing relationships with fellow students and academics from Australia and some links developed with Australian business. There is still potential for broader contribution against these long-term outcomes, and the Mozzies continues to work alongside the Australia Awards in Mongolia to develop further networking opportunities with Australia for alumni.

Alumni have **strong positive views about Australia and Australian expertise, indicating achievement of Australia Awards Outcome 4**. Alumni in this Case Study have a strong connection to Australia, established as a result of their time in Australia. The highly-valued Mozzies group works closely with Australia’s new embassy in Mongolia to keep the association between the two countries strong and vibrant.

This Case Study also examined the role of the Australia Awards in impacting equality in Mongolia. It is clear that the Australia Awards in Mongolia are proactive in implementing practical steps to **promote gender equality**. The WLP is a specific example identified by a number of alumni and stakeholders as playing a key role for alumni on return to Mongolia. On issues of disability inclusiveness and accessibility to the Australia Awards for rural populations, the Australia Awards in Mongolia is involved in implementing innovative approaches to improve access, although entrenched disadvantage for such groups poses a substantial challenge.

Alumni and stakeholders involved in this research provide inspiration, motivation and confidence in the long-term benefits of Australia Awards to Mongolia, especially in this instance, in the financial sector.

9. Alumni Profiles

Mr Javkhlanbaatar Sereeter

I headed the negotiations between Mongolia's first ever free trade agreement negotiation with Japan [which has] lasted four years...[studying in Australia assisted me] in learning how to negotiate...because in the classroom there are many people from different countries...so you realise they are not the same and how your approach them is [dependent on] culture, gender, education.



Scholarship	Australian Development Scholarship
Years	2008 – 2009
Degree	Master of International Business
Institution	University of Sydney
Field	International trade and investment
Current position	International business consultant – self-employed
Brief biography	<p>Mr Sereeter worked for the Government of Mongolia for 15 years, and since 2016 has been a self-employed consultant in the area of international trade and investment. Before this, Mr Sereeter was the Director General of the Invest Mongolia Agency reporting directly to the Prime Minister.</p> <p>In 1996 Mr Sereeter completed a Bachelor of Economics at the National University of Mongolia, followed by a Turkish Language Course at Ankara University in Turkey followed by a Bachelor of International Economics at Istanbul University from 1996 to 2001. Mr Sereeter then began work as an attaché in the Division of Protocol and then the Department of Europe for the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA). Before receiving his scholarship to study in Australia, Mr Sereeter was the Third Secretary for the Department of Europe.</p> <p>Mr Sereeter received an Australian Development Scholarship to study a Master of International Business at the University of Sydney from 2008 to 2009.</p> <p>On his return to Mongolia, Mr Sereeter was offered the position of Deputy Director General for MFA in recognition of his study specialisation. In this role, Mr Sereeter oversaw the department responsible for international investment and trade.</p>

Location at time of field research: Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
Date of interview: 23 October 2017

Ms Enebish Ulambayar

[The Internal audit team at XacBank] was an exceptional case for me. When I [started] no one spoke English or could audit properly...I coached all of them in terms of building their capacity. I am very proud of my team, actually, even though I know I'm no longer part of it. The internal audit was a very poor performing team compared to other teams in the bank. Now it's one of the [most] appreciated teams...They showed me recently how they are doing their risk analysis now. It's already two years since I left their team and I am quite impressed...



Scholarship	Australian Development Scholarship
Years	2007 – 2008
Degree	Master of Business Finance
Institution	Victoria University
Field	Banking and finance
Current position	Chief Operating Officer (COO), XacBank

Brief biography Ms Ulambayar is COO of XacBank, part of the TenGer Financial Group where she is also a member of the Senior Executive. Until May 2016, Ms Ulambayar was also concurrently the Chief Internal Auditor where she was responsible for the internal audit function of six subsidiary companies within the TenGer Financial Group.

Graduating in 1999, Ms Ulambayar studied a Bachelor of Business Administration majoring in banking and finance at the Mongolian National University. She began her career as a supervisor with the Central Bank of Mongolia overseeing onsite inspections, offsite monitoring, and policy development for the banking and finance sector.

Ms Ulambayar was awarded an Australian Development Scholarship in 2007 to study a Master of Business Finance at Victoria University, graduating in 2008.

On her return to work at the Central Bank of Mongolia, Ms Ulambayar was promoted to Senior Supervisor in the Policy and Restructuring Department overseeing governance and regulation to ensure the stability of the banking sector. In 2011, Ms Ulambayar undertook the role of COO at the Development Bank of Mongolia. The following year Ms Ulambayar joined Oyu Tolgoi LLC, a Rio Tinto subsidiary and a joint venture with the Government of Mongolia, as Acting Manager for Stakeholder Engagement. In 2013 Ms Ulambayar moved to XacBank as Chief International Auditor where she was then promoted to her current role as COO in 2015.

Location at time of field research: Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
Date of interview: 25 October 2017

Mr Yamaaranz Sainsanaa

In 2014 I [was awarded] Banker of the Year because I successfully implemented the upgrade of the core banking system of XacBank. That's a very sensitive and very risky task, because if we fail, all 2 million customers of XacBank will fail. So during the project in XacBank, [we] had 59 people. My experience in Australia working with students from different countries and [learning] how to plan a project etcetera helped me to successfully implement [this largescale] project.



Scholarship Australian Development Scholarship

Years 2008 – 2009

Degree Master of Financial Management

Institution University of Melbourne

Field Internal auditing

Current position Director of Internal Audit Division, Petrovis Oil LLC

Brief biography Mr Sainsanaa is the Director of Internal Audit Division for Petrovis Oil, and is responsible for risk management control and governance processes of the company. In this role, Mr Sainsanaa has developed the internal audit charter to reflect international standards.

Before this, Mr Sainsanaa completed a Bachelor of Finance at the National University of Mongolia in 1998. He began his professional career as an accountant with the Savings Bank of Mongolia before transferring to the Central Bank of Mongolia. In 2008, with ten years of professional experience, Mr Sainsanaa was successful in his application for an Australian Development Scholarship to undertake the Master of Financial Management course at the University of Melbourne. During his time in Australia, Mr Sainsanaa served as student-mentor with the International Student Services at the University of Melbourne where he assisted new international students during their first month of study.

Post-award, Mr Sainsanaa returned to the Internal Audit Department at the Bank of Mongolia where he developed the risk-based internal audit manual, upgrading the practices of the bank. In 2013 Mr Sainsanaa was then invited by XacBank to serve as the Director of the Internal Audit Division and as Project Manager leading the upgrade of the core banking system, for which he received the honour of Banker of 2014. Following this role, Mr Sainsanaa undertook his current position as Director at Petrovis Oil.

Location at time of field research: Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
Date of interview: 24 October 2017

Mrs Soyolmaa Dorjnamjaa

To study abroad, especially in Australia, is a big opportunity to gain knowledge and experience. To learn from other countries' experiences helps our country's development, and economic development. It also contributes a lot to the development of our organisation as it motivates a person to increase their knowledge and gain experiences.



Scholarship Australian Development Scholarship

Years 2005 – 2006

Degree Master of Business

Institution Victoria University

Field Public-sector finance

Current position Officer, Public Investment Department, Ministry of Finance

Brief biography Mrs Dorjnamjaa is an officer in the Public Investment Department of the Ministry of Finance (MoF). In this role, Mrs Dorjnamjaa is responsible for the Public Investment Program for medium-term development projects, and the justice and defence sectors.

Completing high school in Mongolia, Mrs Dorjnamjaa completed a bachelor's degree in mining and engineering in Russia. Prior to her study in Australia, Mrs Dorjnamjaa began her career with the MoF in the Public Investment Department.

Seeking to expand her knowledge, Mrs Dorjnamjaa received an Australian Development Scholarship to study a Master of Business at Victoria University from 2005 to 2006.

On her return to Mongolia, Mrs Dorjnamjaa resumed her position in the Public Investment Department and hosted a one-day workshop to share her knowledge and experiences from her study in Australia with colleagues. This resulted in the implementation of improved procedural processes in public investment. Mrs Dorjnamjaa is currently working closely with specialists and advisors from Korea to implement medium-term projects within the Public Investment Program.

Location at time of field research: Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
Date of interview: 26 October 2017

Mr Ognon Khuyagtsogt

Working in [my] current position is one of the achievements that I've made so far, but it's a very responsible position to deal with the difficult situations that the country is facing... The knowledge and experience and the skills, also the networking are the benefits from Australia, supporting us to deal with these challenges, to overcome them and make some structural changes and policy changes etc. But again, I'm not doing it alone, but with my colleagues, including previous and current graduates of Australian Government scholarships.



Scholarship	Australian Development Scholarship
Years	2007 – 2009
Degree	Master of Business Administration
Institution	Australian National University
Field	Public-sector finance
Current position	Director, Expenditure Division, Fiscal Policy Department, Ministry of Finance

Brief biography Mr Khuyagtsogt is the Director of the Expenditure Division within the Fiscal Policy Department of the Ministry of Finance (MoF). In this role, he is responsible for the drafting of government budget expenditure policies and planning annual and medium-term government budget proposals.

Completing a Bachelor of Science at the Mongolian National University in 1999 Mr Khuyagtsogt began working for the Mongolian People's Revolutionary Party. In 2002 he then started his career in the MoF as an officer in the Procurement Division. While working, in 2006 Mr Khuyagtsogt completed a second Bachelor degree in Business Administration at the Institute of Finance and Economics of Mongolia.

In 2007, Mr Khuyagtsogt was selected for an Australian Development Scholarship to study a Master of Business Administration at the Australian National University where he majored in Finance.

On return to Mongolia in 2009 Mr Khuyagtsogt was promoted to Specialist in the Public Expenditure Division where he was responsible for the government budget proposal and effectiveness in the energy and agriculture sectors. In 2011, Mr Khuyagtsogt was promoted to Director of the Sovereign Wealth Fund/Asset Management Division, and again promoted in 2013 to his current role.

Location at time of field research: Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia
Date of interview: 25 October 2017

Ms Altantsetseg*

My achievement is my tax knowledge. My mind is tax. I am eager to talk about tax, how to develop it. People are complaining about paying high taxes [but] I tell people...taxes are for the development of the country. The world is e-commerce and I see the need to develop myself... I have utilised all the knowledge gained in Australian to draft legislation and policy... if I didn't study in Australia I would not have had the opportunity to [do this].

Scholarship Australian Development Scholarship

Years 2006 – 2007

Degree Master of Taxation

Institution Curtin University

Field Taxation

Current position Consultant

Brief biography Ms Altantsetseg is a consultant working in taxation. She began her career as a tax inspector and was motivated to extend her knowledge to be able to contribute to the development of legislation.

In 2006 Ms Altantsetseg received an Australian Development Scholarship to study a Master of Taxation at Curtin University.

On her return to Mongolia in 2007 she was promoted to tax inspector in recognition of her advanced qualification. Ms Altantsetseg has since been able to apply her new knowledge and skills as a tax inspector in the public sector. She was promoted again to senior tax inspector in the international tax area. After 2013, Ms Altantsetseg moved to the private sector to work as a consultant.

*Ms Altantsetseg requested an alias be used for reporting on this Case Study

Location at time of field research: Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia

Date of interview: 25 October 2017

10. References

- Action Program of the Government of Mongolia for 2016-2020 (2016).
http://www.mfa.gov.mn/wp-content/uploads/2015/06/2016-2020_Gov_AP_Eng_Revised.pdf
- Asian Development Bank. 'Development Effectiveness Country Brief: Mongolia'.
<https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/publication/28777/mongolia.pdf>.
- DFAT (2014). 'Australia Awards Mongolia: Women's Leadership Program (WLP) Design Document'. June 2014.
- DFAT (2016). 'Australia Awards Global Strategy: Investing in the next generation of global leaders for development 2016-2018'. Canberra: Australian Government. <http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/pages/australia-awards-global-strategy.aspx>
- DFAT. (2016). Australia Awards Global Monitoring and Evaluation Framework. Canberra: Australian Government.
- DFAT (2017). 'Mongolia country brief'.
<http://dfat.gov.au/geo/mongolia/pages/mongolia-country-brief.aspx>.
- DFAT (2017). 'Overview of Australia's aid program to Mongolia: How we are helping'. <http://dfat.gov.au/geo/mongolia/development-assistance/Pages/development-assistance-in-mongolia.aspx>.
- DFAT (2017). 'Appendix 8: Gender and Disability Inclusion Strategy and Plan'. Updated October 2017.
- DFAT (2017). 'Appendix 9: Provincial Participation Plan'. Updated October 2017.
- DFAT (2017). Mongolia Aid fact sheet: Updated October 2017.
<http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/aid-fact-sheet-mongolia.pdf>
- Edwards, D. and Capel, A. (2017). 'Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility Case Study #3: Kenya'. Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility.
- Edwards, D. and Hong, J. (2017). 'Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility Year 1 Tracer Survey'. Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility.
- Edwards, D. and Taylor, A. (2017). 'Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility Case Study #5: Vanuatu. Australia Awards Global Tracer Facility.
- Engel, J., Prizzon, A. and Amgaabazar, G. (2014). 'From decline to recovery Post-primary education in Mongolia'. Case Study Report: Education. London: Overseas Development Institute.
<https://www.odi.org/sites/odi.org.uk/files/odi-assets/publications-opinion-files/9053.pdf>
- Government of Mongolia (2016). 'Mongolia Sustainable Development Vision 2030'. Ulaanbaatar: The Secretariat of the State Great Hural Mongolia.

- Government of Mongolia (1992). 'Constitution of Mongolia'. State Bulletin No 1. 13 January 1992.
<http://www.unesco.org/education/edurights/media/docs/6a6a23469e136afaa4860bf5869f6f8f659c6688.pdf>
- KPMG Advisory (2007). 'The evolving role of the internal auditor: Value creation and preservation form and internal audit perspective'.
<https://home.kpmg.com/content/dam/kpmg/kz/pdf/kz-ias-evolving-role-internal-auditor-200710.pdf>.
- Law of Mongolia (1999), 'Labour Code "State Bulletin", No. 25, 1999'. May 14 1999. Ulaanbaatar.
<http://admin.theiguides.org/Media/Documents/LabourCode1999.pdf>.
- Lunden, E (2014). 'Gender Analysis'. Unpublished.
- Mongolia's Political and Economic Transition: Challenges and Opportunities. 'A Conference in Celebration of the Tenth Anniversary of The Asia Foundation's Mongolia Program. Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia (11-13 September, 2000),
<https://asiafoundation.org/resources/pdfs/MongloiaPolEconTransition.pdf>
- McNamee D. (1997). 'Risk-based auditing'. Internal Auditor. 54.4 (Aug. 1997).
<http://go.galegroup.com/ps/i.do?id=GALE%7CA20021804&sid=googleScholar&v=2.1&it=r&linkaccess=fulltext&issn=00205745&p=AONE&sw=w&authCount=1&u=61ench&selfRedirect=true>
- The World Bank (2017). 'The World Bank in Mongolia',
<http://www.worldbank.org/en/country/mongolia/overview>
- UNDP (2017). 'About Mongolia'.
<http://www.mn.undp.org/content/mongolia/en/home/countryinfo.html>.
- .

Annex 1: Case Study propositions

Explanatory Case Studies require the development of propositions that are intricately linked to the original research questions. A proposition is a statement that helps direct attention to something that should be examined in a Case Study. The researcher has to make a speculation, on the basis of the literature and any other earlier evidence, as to what they expect the findings of the research to be. When a Case Study proposal includes specific propositions, it increases the likelihood that the researcher can limit the scope of study and complete the project. The researcher can have several propositions to guide the study, but each must have a distinct focus and purpose. The data collection and analysis can then be structured in order to support or refute the research propositions.

For the Facility, propositions were formed using the Global Strategy outcomes as the basis. Sub-propositions were formulated by speculating on the underlying assumption or enabling factors that realise the proposition. In alignment with the methodology, instruments will be designed to collect data that both support and refute the propositions.

- 1 Alumni use their skills knowledge and networks to contribute to achieving partner-country development goals¹².
 - a. alumni develop skills, knowledge and networks on award that enable and are used to contribute to achieving partner-country development goals
 - b. alumni understand, value and want to contribute to partner-country development goals.
- 2 Alumni are contributing to cooperation between Australia and partner countries
 - a. alumni possess and are able to leverage their useful networks and relationships.
- 3 Effective, mutually advantageous partnerships between institutions and business [have been developed] in Australia and partner countries
 - a. alumni possess and are able to leverage their useful networks and relationships
 - b. partnerships that are developed are effective and mutually advantageous to participating countries.
- 4 Alumni view Australia and Australian expertise positively

¹² This proposition differs from the Australia Awards Program Logic long-term outcome number 1 in order to link this proposition to the Goal of the Australia Awards Program. The use of the term 'partner-country development goals instead of 'sustainable development' makes the proposition and ensuing questions more relevant and relatable to alumni.

- a. alumni's views are underpinned by their experiences in Australia.
- 5 The benefits of receiving an Australia Award or scholarship are experienced equally by all recipients.
- a. receiving an Australia Award or scholarship positively addresses, rather than reinforces, imbalances that are associated with gender and disability.

Annex 2: Key participant questions

Alumni

[Validation question]

We understand you received an Australian Government Scholarship to study [level, field, years], is this correct?

Could you please confirm your current role and organisation?

1. Can you please tell us why you applied? What was your motivation?
 - a Were there any barriers to accepting a scholarships and coming to Australia? [e.g. employer support, family responsibilities]
2. Can you tell me about your time in Australia experience as a student?
 - a Did you make any professional networks?
 - b Thinking about the networks that you might have developed during your scholarship, were there any that were long lasting; that resulted in working together or connecting other people?
3. After you returned, what was your job?
 - a What skills and knowledge gained during your time in Australia have been applicable in your work?
 - b What are some of the things that made it possible for you to apply your skills and knowledge after you returned home?
 - c What were some of the things that made it difficult to apply the skills and knowledge you gained after you returned home?
 - d What do you think is needed to assist alumni to use their skills and knowledge when they return home?
4. What do you believe are the greatest benefits of the Australian Government scholarship program?
5. Throughout your career, in what ways have you used Australian expertise in your work?
 - a Can you give an example of this, such as Australian-developed practices, equipment, ways of working, processes, theory/theorists, consultants, journals, models, etc.?
6. Are you currently or have been a member of an alumni association? (University/Australian Government scholarship /ADS)
 - a What was the name of the association?
 - b What do you get out of it?
 - c What more could alumni associations do for alumni?

- d If not (a member of an association) why not?
7. Can you describe an achievement that you are most proud of, in your work or community?
 8. Compared with the males/females who have received a scholarship from (country x), how has your career progressed since returning home?
 9. Have there been any barriers you have had to overcome to progress in your career?
 10. Compared to peers similar to you but did not receive an opportunity to study overseas, do you believe there are any differences in how your careers have progressed?
 11. (Supporting Interviewer) did you have any questions you would like to ask of (alumni X)?

Employers/colleagues – For interviews regarding an individual alumni

[Validation question]

Could you please confirm your role and organisation?

1. Could you please tell us how long have you known [Alumni X] and in what capacity?
 - a Did you know [Alumni X] before s/he received the scholarship?
 - b Were you his/her manager?
2. To your knowledge, what new skills and knowledge did [Alumni X] use [in the workplace following their studies in Australia]?
 - a Could you provide examples of how this was applied?
3. How did the organisation support X to use his/her new skills and knowledge after returning from Australia?
 - a Did you have a role in supporting [alumni X] to reintegrate following their scholarship?
 - i If so why? What did this involve?
 - ii If not, why?
 - iii Developing a reintegration/return to work plan?
 - b Did X return to the same role following their scholarship?
 - c Did they receive additional responsibilities after their scholarship?
4. In your view, how did studying in Australia impact [Alumni X's] career?
5. Have you or your organisation benefited from any networks or friendships between [country X] and Australia created by the [Alumni X] as a result of receiving an Australian Government scholarship?
 - a Please explain further; who and what?

- b What about any other countries?
- 6. Are you aware of any other links [Alumni X] has created between people in [country X] and Australia as a result of receiving an Australian Government scholarship?
 - a Please explain further; who, what why?
 - b What about between people in [country X] and any other countries?
- 7. What more could be done to increase opportunities to create institutional links between Australia and your country?
- 8. How has having an Australian Government scholar in your organisation impacted how you view Australia and Australian expertise?
- 9. Do you draw on Australian expertise for your work?

Employers/stakeholders – For interviews regarding alumni generally

[Validation question]

Could you please confirm your role in (X organisation)?

- 1. How familiar are you with the Australia Awards?

[If YES; a suggested probe if needed]

- a Estimated, how many Australian scholarship recipients have worked for your [ministry/organisation/sector/field]?

[If NO; probe further with]

- b Do you know of anyone who has received an Australian Government scholarship in your [ministry/organisation/sector/field]?
- 2. Has your (ministry/organisation/sector/field) benefitted from any links or networks developed by Australian Government scholarship alumni?
 - a Do you have any examples?
 - b What have been the results of this?
- 3. Has having Australian Government scholarship recipients in your (ministry/organisation/sector/field) influenced the way you view Australia and Australian expertise?
- 4. Have Australian Government scholarship recipients established any links between your [ministry/organisation/sector/field] and organisations in Australia?
 - a If yes what has been the result of these links?
 - b Benefits to you?
 - c Benefits to your workplace?
 - d Benefits to your country?
 - e If no, why not?

5. Are you aware if alumni have presented any opportunities on return to link your workplace or any other organisation in your country with an organisation in another country?
 - a If yes what has been the result of these links?
 - b Benefits to you?
 - c Benefits to your workplace?
 - d Benefits to your country?
 - e If no, why not?
6. What more do you think could be done to support links with Australian organisations?
7. In your view, what has been the overall long-term impact of having Australian Government scholarship recipients in your [ministry/organisation/sector/field]?
 - a How has having a number of Australian Government scholarship recipients over a number of years influenced your department's ability to achieve its goals and /or objectives?
 - b With regards to skills and knowledge; i.e. changed practices, processes or systems?
8. What are some of the things that make it easy or difficult for women to progress in their careers in your country?
9. What are some of the things that make it easy or difficult for those with a disability to progress in their careers in your country?
10. Comparing Australian Government scholarship recipients to their peers who did not receive an opportunity to study overseas, do you believe there are any differences in how their careers have progressed?

DFAT

[Validation question]

Could you please tell us about yourself and your role with the Australia Awards Program?

1. In your own words, what is the purpose of the Australia Awards Program?
 - a In your own words how does the Program achieve [points stated in the previous response]?
2. Based on your experience what would you say are the strengths of the Australia Awards Program?
3. How do you think alumni participation in the Australia Awards Program contributes to [Country X's] development goals?

- a What evidence have you seen of this either personally or professionally?
 - b How do you think the program lead to benefits for both Australia and [Country X]?
4. In your opinion, how do you think an alumni's participation in the Australia Awards Program contributes to a positive relationships between [Country X] and Australia?
 - a What factors/events have informed this opinion?
 5. How do you think the Australia Awards contributes to gender equality and disability inclusiveness?
 6. What other barriers do you think Australia Awards alumni have to overcome to progress in their careers in [Country X]?
 7. What do you think are the barriers to achieving gender equality and disability inclusiveness?
 - a Do you feel [barriers stated in the previous response] have changed over time?
 - b In what way?
 - c Any other barriers?
 8. If you had the power to change things about the Australia Awards what would you make different?
 9. That covers the things I wanted to ask. Anything you would like to add?

Alumni Association

[Validation question]

Could you please tell us about yourself and your role with the alumni association?

1. In your own words, what is the purpose of the alumni association?
 - a What sort of services does the association provide?
2. What is the most valuable contribution the association provides for alumni?
3. What are some of the challenges involved in running an alumni association for alumni who have studied in Australia?
4. What activities does the alumni association provide to support women to progress in their careers in your country?
 - a What have been the outcomes of the program/s?
5. What activities does the alumni association provide to support those with a disability to progress in their careers in your country?

- a What have been the outcomes of the program/s?
- 6. In what ways does the alumni association enable alumni to form new professional and personal networks?
- 7. What activities does the alumni association provide to help alumni remain connected to each other through face-to-face activities and social media?
- 8. How does the alumni association support alumni to remain connected to Australia?
- 9. What role does the alumni association play in fostering cooperation between your country and Australia?
- 10. What do you think should be done to assist your alumni association to contribute to greater cooperation between Australia and [Country X]?
- 11. Is the alumni association partnered with any institutions and businesses in Australia?
 - a If yes, what has been the result of these links?
 - i Benefits to you/association?
 - ii Benefits to alumni?
 - b If no, why not?
- 12. What more could be done to increase opportunities to create institutional links between Australia and your country?
- 13. How does the alumni association promote Australia and Australian expertise?

Gender Equality and Disability Inclusiveness Experts

Gender Equality

1. How does gender impact career?
2. What barriers are there to achieving gender equality?
3. What could or should be done to improve gender equality?
4. Compared with males who receive a scholarship to study overseas, how do you feel women's careers progress? [for DFAT or those with knowledge of scholarships]

Disability Inclusion

1. How does disability impact career?
2. What barriers are there to achieving disability inclusion?
3. What could or should be done to improve disability inclusion?

4. Compared with others who receive a scholarship to study overseas, how do you feel people with disability career's progress? [for DFAT or those with knowledge of scholarships]

Annex 3: Mongolia Case Study participants

Type	Date	Name	Position or Degree
Alumni	23/10	Mr Javkhlanbaatar Sereeter	Master of International Business, University of Sydney Self-employed consultant
	24/10	Mr Yamaaranz Sainsanaa	Master of Financial Management, University of Melbourne Director of International Audit Division, Petrovis Oil LLC
	25/10	Mr Ognon Khuyagtsogt	Master of Business Administration, Australian National University Director, Expenditure Division, Fiscal Policy Department, Ministry of Finance (MoF)
	25/10	Ms Altantsetseg	Master of Taxation, Curtin University Consultant
	25/10	Ms Enebish Ulambayar	Master of Business Finance, Victoria University Chief Operating Officer, XacBank
	25/10	Mrs Soyolmaa Dorjnamjaa	Master of Business, Victoria University Officer, Budget Investment Department, Ministry of Finance (MoF)
Alumni employers or colleagues	24/10	Mr Chimed Khurelbaatar	Minister of Finance, Government of Mongolia
Australian Embassy Mongolia	20/10	H.E. Mr John Langtry	Australian Ambassador to Mongolia
	20/10	Mr Shayne McKenna	First Secretary, Australian Embassy
Australia Awards in Mongolia	20/10	Ms Yundendorj Tsetsgee	Country Program Manager, Australia Awards in Mongolia
Other stakeholders	23/10	Mrs Lkhagvasuren	Executive Director, The Mongolia-Australia Society (the Mozzies)

Type	Date	Name	Position or Degree
	23/10	Ms L. Bat-Otgon	Member of the Australia Awards Project Coordination Committee (co-chaired by the Mongolian and Australian Governments) Executive Director of the Union of the Persons with Disabilities of Mongolia
	24/10	Ms Nasanjargal Dolgormaa	Member of the Australia Awards Program Coordinating Committee (co-chaired by the Mongolian and Australian Governments) Department Head, Department of the Mongolian Chamber of Commerce and Industry
	26/10	Dr Batmunkh Tsetsegsaikhan	Founder and Chief Executive Officer of the Mongolian Cancer Council Advisor to the Acting Minister for Health, Government of Mongolia
	26/10	Dr Sanjaasuren Oyun	Executive Director, Zorig Foundation
	26/10	Ms Tsolmon Bayar	Support Officer, Zorig Foundation
	26/10	Ms Maral Gankhuyag	Program Director of the Women's Leadership Program (WLP), Zorig Foundation

