

MEDIA DEVELOPMENT INITIATIVE

Independent Review

August 2020

Prepared by Annmaree O'Keeffe AM, Will Paxton
and Moale Vagikapi, OPM MDI Review Team

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	4
Introduction	6
Background	6
Objective Of MDI	6
Review Purpose	6
Methodology And Constraints	7
Team Resources	7
Operating Context	9
PNG’s Media	9
Voice And Accountability	11
Findings And Conclusions	12
Effectiveness	13
Relevance	21
Sustainability	25
Summary Of Conclusions	25
Future Options	27
Six Potential Future Directions	27
Implications For The Design And Focus Of MDI Into The Next Phase Of Programming	31
Annex 1 – PNG Media	32
Annex 2 – Factors Affecting Voice And Accountability	33
Annex 3 – Review Questions	35
Annex 4 – Stakeholders Interviewed	37

Table of Figures, Tables and Boxes

Table 1: Program framework	13
Box 1: Addressing gender and disability inclusiveness	20
Box 2: Issue Based Approach	30

Principal audiences for this document

This document is the report of the review of the Media Development Initiative (MDI). This approach has been developed in line with the Terms of Reference developed by QTAG, DFAT and DCP and the Review Plan approved by DFAT.

The **primary audiences** for this document are:

- The DFAT Sub-National Governance Team (Australian High Commission (AHC) in Port Moresby); and
- The Managing Contractor of the DCP Program, Abt Associates and MDI Program Manager ABC International Development.

Executive Summary

This report by the Quality and Technical Assurance Group (QTAG) reviews the Media Development Initiative (MDI), an activity under the Decentralisation and Citizen Participation Program (DCP). Now in its 15th year, MDI underwent a significant change in 2018 when the breadth of its work was expanded with a primary emphasis on Voice and Accountability (V&A). This review assessed MDI's current design and mode of operation and considered what direction and focus MDI should take in any future activity.

Because of the restrictions imposed on personal interaction and travel as a result of COVID-19, the review had to be home-based with stakeholder interviews conducted by telephone/internet.

In assessing MDI's performance, the review focused on its effectiveness, relevance and sustainability. The review team gathered evidence from program reporting and other documents as well as stakeholder interviews. It also considered the broader contextual issues impacting on PNG's media landscape – both traditional media and social media - as well as the political, economic and cultural issues which influence voice and accountability.

The shift in MDI's focus onto voice and accountability in 2018 was in part influenced by the role which the media can play as a neutral agent for citizen-state engagement in a robust democracy such as PNG. It was seen as a natural evolution of MDI's work in strengthening PNG's media. However, the challenges confronting PNG's media and the impediments to achieving voice and accountability in the PNG context are significant and deeply entrenched. As such, any perceptible improvements in the responsiveness of decision makers require a sustained and consistent approach involving strategic multi-stakeholder engagement. Within that joined-up engagement, the media plays just one part.

The review found that MDI has been more successful in supporting voice whereas eliciting greater accountability has been and remains a major challenge in the PNG cultural and political context. Overall, the review found there is still an important role for MDI to play by focussing on voice and media strengthening or as part of a strategic multi-stakeholder approach within a broader V&A approach.

In considering MDI's effectiveness and relevance as well as the sustainability of its work, the review team came to several conclusions:

- Despite mid-course changes to its MEF plus revisions to its most recent workplan to respond to COVID-19, MDI has gone some way in meeting its objectives and contributing to the projected outcomes. It has proved harder to make progress on achieving decision maker responsiveness and meaningful accountability but MDI has been more successful in achieving the "voice" element of V&A. Given more time, it could provide solid foundations for visible incremental change in voice as this is MDI's strength.
- The more ambitious goal of achieving accountability of decision makers requires multi-stakeholder engagement. And while MDI's placement within the DCP team should have played to that, the overarching operating framework has not been sufficiently conducive to effective collaboration and complementarity despite the higher-level objective.
- The layered administrative complexity (AHC/Abt/MDI) adds to an already difficult operating environment and has resulted in delays in communication and action.
- The administrative complexity has also contributed to a MEF which has had to be altered mid-course to meet DCP's objectives and reporting is not satisfactorily capturing MDI's product.

- Achieving sustained accountability and decision maker responsiveness will require a more fundamental change in program design and a significantly longer time horizon. MDI's relevance could be strengthened by focusing on fewer objectives with more tangible and achievable outcomes.
- Of the three hubs, the district hub seems to have been the most effective in its district-specific activities. Given the size of MDI, there is a question about the need to maintain three hubs rather than simply drawing creative and news gathering resources on a needs basis.
- At the activity level, MDI's work remains relevant and is welcomed by the groups it works with whether media or community. However, the program is working to a framework which has set objectives that are too ambitious. In turn, this has necessitated a work program that attempts to do too much and runs the risk of implementing too many one-offs.
- MDI has been energetic in supporting and facilitating the use of social media whether by media organisations, community groups or decision makers. However, as elsewhere, the emphasis in capacity building needs to be on the responsible and ethical use of this communication platform.
- MDI's work with NBC over the past 15 years can be seen to have achieved sustainable outcomes. Particularly valuable is the contribution the NBC-ABC relationship, facilitated by MDI, makes to Australia's geo-strategic priorities.
- MDI's efforts to embrace gender and disability inclusiveness have been energetic and effective, and in some ways, a noteworthy exemplar.

In considering future options for MDI, the review team has devised six potential future directions and their implications for the design and focus of MDI. The six directions are:

- Sub-national level – expansion across more districts
- 2022 election – initial focus on voice, followed by pre- and post-election focus on accountability
- New partnership with the churches
- Increasing national decision-making responsiveness through an “issue based” approach
- Shift towards social media but clarity on rationale and purpose
- Better understanding of decision makers' media consumption

Drawing on the analysis of these possible directions, the review has identified three possible design options. In doing so, it notes that the demands of achieving meaningful decision maker accountability in PNG are high. MDI continues to have much to contribute but it is also important to be realistic. The three design options are:

- Option 1: a refocused MDI but improved links to wider DFAT governance programming
- Option 2: splitting MDI and development of new “issue-based” policy influencing program
- Option 3: an expanded MDI, with specific accountability and policy influencing expertise

It is also recommended that the geo-strategically important relationship between NBC and the ABC be taken into account when considering any of these options.

Introduction

This report by the Quality and Technical Assurance Group (QTAG) reviews the Media Development Initiative (MDI), an activity under the Decentralisation and Citizen Participation Program (DCP).

Due to the major ongoing COVID-19 related disruptions that prohibit travel and close personal interaction both in Papua New Guinea (PNG) and Australia, this review required the stakeholder consultations to be conducted via internet-based platforms or phone. While this desk-based approach to the review was challenging at times given the communication infrastructure in PNG, the team was able to talk to a significant range of key stakeholders. The review covers the period of MDI's current phase which began in January 2018.

Background

Now in its 15th year, the MDI has been implemented by the Australian Broadcasting Corporation (ABC) International Development (ABCID) since its inception. In this current phase, it is part of the overarching DCP for which Abt Associates is the contractor.

Administratively, MDI has moved from a program funded directly by the Australian Government (through AusAID) under a contract with the ABC from 2005 to 2012, to an activity under the Strongim Pipol Strongim Nesen program and now as part of Australia-PNG Governance Partnership under the DCP.

A significant change in MDI's approach came in 2018 when the breadth of its work was expanded with a primary emphasis on Voice and Accountability (V&A). Sitting within DCP, MDI's activities are expected to align with the DCP objective: *PNG's national, sub-national and inter-governmental institutions are better able to provide quality services and development outcomes that respond to the needs of citizens*. Now in the third year of this revised approach, MDI is funded until October 2020.

Objective of MDI

In accordance with its alignment with DCP, MDI's design goal is *to enable PNG media to better focus on their role in facilitating voice and accountability (responsiveness)*.

This is achieved through meeting the overall objective: *Media enables citizens to effectively express their views and facilitates responsiveness of government*. Its intermediate objectives are:

1. Greater professionalism of the media on voice and accountability
2. Incremental transformation of PNG's National Broadcasting Corporation (NBC)
3. Creation of innovative, quality V&A content
4. Increased access and dialogue by citizens
5. Enhanced responsiveness of decision makers

MDI aims to achieve these objectives by producing and supporting media content which holds decision makers to account around issues faced by the community.

Review Purpose

In line with the terms of reference approved by DFAT in February 2020, the purpose of the review is to assess the current design and mode of operation of MDI to determine if it is best placed to support the development of an independent, objective media in PNG.

The desk-based approach has focused on three areas:

1. **Effectiveness:** An assessment of the achievements and challenges of the current implementation approach;
2. **Relevance:** Review of the relevance of the design within the evolving operating context; and
3. **Sustainability:** Assessment of the sustainability of the outcomes achieved to date.

The review was required to take a broad-brush assessment of progress to date and challenges encountered by the initiative. Evidence has been gathered from program reporting and stakeholder interviews to develop findings and provide the basis for recommendations regarding future directions of the program.

In its assessment, the review has considered the broader contextual issues including the media landscape of PNG focusing on both traditional and social media and the country's political economy as it impacts on voice and accountability.

Methodology and constraints

In light of the unique COVID-19 related situation in which this review has been conducted, the methodological approach has been constrained by access to and availability of partners and stakeholders in MDI and its activities. While the documentation review was straight forward, the stakeholder consultations had to be conducted via telephone/internet which at times was problematic due to abiding telecommunication constraints in PNG. The team overcame this through persistence and was able to conduct a good range of interviews to ensure a broad representation of stakeholder views. The interviews were guided by a comprehensive list of questions (See Annex 3) relevant to the three review areas and consideration of future directions for MDI. Those interviewed included the MDI team – both PNG based and Australia based; relevant AHC staff; DCP staff; NBC staff; a range of other beneficiaries, and PNG political economy experts. The full list of those interviewed is in Annex 4.

The review schedule was as follows:

- Documentation review and stakeholder consultations: May 18 to June 4
- Aide-memoire drafting and submission: June 5 – 12
- Report drafting: June 15 – July 3

Team resources

Team Leader: Annmaree O’Keeffe AM: Annmaree has an historical understanding of MDI having reviewed the program in previous phases and has also reviewed Australian Government media development activities in Cambodia and other parts of the Pacific. She has a deep appreciation of the role of Australia’s aid program stemming from her time in senior management positions within AusAID.

EVA Programming Specialists: Kivu International: Kivu has extensive experience in designing and implementing effective approaches to increased accountability of government. Kivu’s experience across Africa and Asia includes supporting think tanks and advocacy organisations to develop a

range of communication tools to influence policy in Myanmar, Nepal, Rwanda, Zambia, India and Bangladesh.

PNG Development Specialist: *Moale Vagikapi*: An independent consultant and development specialist based in PNG, Moale is a Papua New Guinean with recent experience in the designs and reviews of Australian development investments in PNG and the region. Moale has previous experience managing AusAID programs in the areas of public financial management, sub-national governance and policy reform and as a senior manager with the PNG public service, she has a depth of knowledge and understanding of public policy within PNG.

QTAG Program Manager: *Kate Michelly*: coordination support for the team.

Operating Context

PNG's media

The operating environment

In November 2018, Scott Waide, an eminent PNG television reporter and a quality journalism trainer for MDI, was suspended by his employer, EMTV, after he broadcast a story criticising the PNG Government's purchase of 40 luxury Maseratis to be used during the APEC leaders' meeting to be held in Port Moresby that same month.

However, after widespread criticism of EMTV's action, he was reinstated. The incident highlighted the ongoing challenge for Papua New Guinean journalists if they raise issues which cause embarrassment or worse for those in power. In a subsequent interview with the ABC's Pacific Beat program, he said that management was often told not to run stories or to tone them down. "Increasingly, not just EMTV, but nearly every other media organisation in PNG has been interfered with by their boards or politicians or various other players in society," he said at the time¹.

The 2020 global survey of media freedom by Reporters without Borders (RWB) ranks PNG² at 46 (out of 180 countries), down eight places on 2019. While the legislative environment is supportive of free media, the survey notes that their independence is endangered. But on a positive note, RWB suggests that although violations of press freedom increased during Peter O'Neill's tenure as PM, there are encouraging signs of greater media independence under his successor, James Marape. However, RWB notes the lack of funding and resources hinders investigative journalism resulting in "copy and paste" practices.

Other factors³ contributing to the difficult environment for the independent media in PNG include:

- The cultural context reinforcing unquestioning respect for the "Big Man" and "Big Meri".
- External editorial influence on traditional media
- Dwindling pool of trained recruits as funding for the journalism course at UPNG has dropped off. However, the Catholic-run Divine Word University, has a comprehensive journalism degree program but entry is highly competitive.
- Low admission rates from high school to PNG universities more broadly resulting in a stark drop of people seeking careers in the media.

Media Usage

The 2014 PNG Citizen Access to Information survey⁴ commissioned by ABCID showed that consumption of different media was largely a function of access than choice particularly in rural areas where the vast majority of Papua New Guineans live and where access is limited by poor infrastructure, weak signals or cost. In urban centres, consumption was more commonly dictated by choice. Overall, weekly consumption of different media which was largely a function of media

¹ <https://www.abc.net.au/news/2018-11-26/suspension-of-png-journalist-overtuned-after-public-pressure/10556204> .

² 2020 World Freedom Index, Reporters without Borders, <https://rsf.org/en/papua-new-guinea>

³ Papua New Guinea's untold media freedom challenge, Himmat Shaligram, The Interpreter, Lowy Institute for International Policy, October 2019, <https://www.lowyinstitute.org/the-interpreter/papua-new-guinea-s-untold-media-freedom-challenge>

⁴ Citizen Access to Information in Papua New Guinea 2014 included a combination of citizen group discussions in Central, Western Highlands, West New Britain and Morobe provinces and a quantitative survey in Central, Milne Bay, Madang, Morobe, Eastern Highlands, Western Highlands, East New Britain and New Ireland.

access was led by mobile phones (71% of survey respondents), newspapers (56%) and radio (53%), followed by television (41%). Internet was well behind on 18%.

Five years later, the 2019 Citizen Perception and Media Engagement report also commissioned by ABCID showed that mobile phone and internet access and usage had increased significantly, up 13% and 19% respectively. Newspaper and radio consumption had decreased slightly while television consumption was steady.

But the mainstream media remained the top sources of news and information - newspapers as the most important (mentioned by 69%), followed by radio (mentioned by 58%), and television (mentioned by 43%). (For a comprehensive list of PNG's mainstream and online media, see Annex 1.)

Social media

The 2019 Survey showed that while two thirds of the PNG population now live in areas with at least a 2G mobile signal, a large number of citizens in rural remote areas remain unconnected because of the difficulty involved in extending mobile networks to remote mountainous areas. Furthermore, the gender gap in mobile phone ownership and usage is typical of many developing countries and is attributable to poor affordability and accessibility (including limited access to identity documents, electricity, and network coverage), safety concerns, usability issues, and a lack of skills. Low levels of digital literacy are also likely to be a major barrier to use among older citizens.

The proportion of survey respondents reporting they use the internet daily was small (10%) and about one third use the internet at least a few times a week. The vast majority (99%) of those using the internet access it via a mobile phone. Use of computers and tablets for accessing the internet is much lower (13% and 11% respectively). Consistent with findings around access to mobile phones, the survey showed that rural/remote residents, women and older citizens are less likely to be regular (weekly) internet users.

Cost is also a major factor influencing social media usage and internet access. Although the Coral Sea Cable, completed in December 2019 promised faster, cheaper and more reliable communications, the high prices being charged by Data Co, the PNG SOE responsible for the system remain uncompetitive for internet providers. Although PNG's National ICT Authority had set Coral Sea Cable pricing at \$US55/megabits per second/month in December, a report⁵ maintains that Data Co has been charging wholesale rates of \$US350/mbps/month for a 20 mbps connection while satellite companies are offering broadly equivalent packages at \$US250. This leaves the Coral Sea cable promise unfulfilled until pricing can become more affordable.

Who to believe?

The research survey results indicated that the most trusted sources of information for PNG citizens were the churches, newspapers, radio, and television. The church was universally the most trusted source in all provinces surveyed and among all citizen groups. Among the lowest trusted sources, newer digital sources of information (including social media) enjoy relatively higher trust among regular users (men, young people, those in urban areas, those with white collar occupations, and more affluent households).

⁵ *China fears over PNG cable too dear to use*, Ben Packham, Foreign Affairs correspondent, The Australian, May 14, 2020

Voice and accountability

In 2018, MDI shifted its focus to “voice and accountability”. This includes both increasing Papua New Guineans’ ability to express preferences and views, and also increasing the responsiveness of decision makers.

Efforts to increase voice and accountability need to be grounded in an understanding of PNG’s political economy. An understanding of the context is particularly important for increasing responsiveness from decision makers.

In its approach to voice and accountability, MDI has been guided by the V&A principles outlined in the original project design document. Recognising that citizens’ engagement and accountability of decision makers are important dimensions of governance in PNG, citizens need effective “voice” to convey their views so that decision makers are held accountable for their actions and are more likely to respond to the needs and demands. The media plays a central role in providing structures that facilitate meaningful government-citizen interface and place governance issues in the public domain in a sustained manner to have traction. The media, as a neutral agent for citizen-state engagement is critical. In its execution of V&A, the project has used a mixture of traditional media working with journalists from print and electronic media as well as mobile telephony and internet to improve citizen opportunities to express themselves. Community based approaches, as exemplified by MDI’s work in Talasea district, also use a mix of traditional and digital media as well as word of mouth communication channels to reinforce and contextualise discussions.

Several aspects of PNG’s political economy mean that achieving meaningful policy maker responsiveness is highly challenging. These include:

- A weak relationship between the majority of Papua New Guineans and the state: for many living in remote areas the state is largely invisible and irrelevant to their day-to-day lives.
- Weak government bureaucracy: even politicians who want to respond to citizen demands and improve policy outcomes may struggle to do so as government systems remain weak.
- Weak political parties: a highly fragmented system, with weak parties struggling to build stable political coalitions capable of delivering improved policy outcomes.
- A cultural reluctance to challenge authority.

Overall, it is well established that the PNG system of governance struggles to generate improved policy outcomes. This makes it important that efforts to increase voice and accountability must go with the grain of local context – this means working with the underlying political and cultural dynamics in PNG, rather than against them.

Some relevant political and cultural factors for voice and accountability programming include:

1. Dominance of informal networks of power, and predominance of Open MPs;
 2. “Competitiveness” of the PNG political process;
 3. The growing importance of sub-national centres of power;
 4. Weak state, strong society – and the importance of churches;
 5. National level decision maker responsiveness is particularly challenging, but possible “when the stars align”;
 6. Growing middle class and demographic change; and
 7. The current political context and 2022 election.
- See Annex 2 for a detailed analysis of issues affecting these factors.

Findings and conclusions

The shift in MDI's focus onto voice and accountability in 2018 was in part influenced by the role which the media can play as a neutral agent for citizen-state engagement in a robust democracy such as PNG. It was seen as a natural evolution of MDI's work in strengthening PNG's media. However, as discussed in the previous chapter, the challenges confronting PNG's media and the impediments to achieving voice and accountability in the PNG context are significant and deeply entrenched. As such, any perceptible improvements in the responsiveness of decision makers require a sustained and consistent approach involving strategic multi-stakeholder engagement. Within that joined-up engagement, the media plays just one part.

It should not be surprising, therefore, that the review found that MDI has been more successful in supporting voice whereas eliciting greater accountability has been and remains a major challenge in the PNG cultural and political context. That said, the project has been very energetic in implementing a range of V&A and quality journalism activities which appear to meet the immediate communication and content needs of PNG's mainstream media as well as community and decision makers at the Talasea district level.

The V&A content has covered a range of initiatives including:

- background briefings designed to strengthen the informed “voice” of traditional media in their professional interactions with decision makers in seeking greater accountability
- press club events which provide public fora where decision makers can be held accountable by better informed and trained journalists
- core content guides and production “bibles” to improve understanding of key national issues and how to cover them
- television and social media drama pieces focused on priority social issues
- regular provincial radio talkback programs and on-air engagement with district decision-makers
- focus on gender and diversity
- decision-maker promise tracking system

Overall, the review found there is still an important role for MDI to play focused on voice and media strengthening or as part of a strategic multi-stakeholder approach within the broader V&A programming.

This chapter sets out the review teams findings behind that conclusion. The following sections provide the detailed accounts of how well or otherwise, MDI has demonstrated effectiveness, relevance and sustainability. In doing so, the team took into account the mid-course changes to its MEF in the second full year of operation (2019-2020). The team understands that these changes were linked in part to changes in the approach taken by DCP in its empowerment, voice and accountability work. As noted in the 2018-2019 review of the PNG-Australia Governance Partnership, discussions were underway at that time between the DCP team and the AHC in a bid to achieve a tighter focus as the EVA component had a greater legacy of prior programs which needed rationalisation. Consequent changes to MDI's performance framework were only finalised at the end of July 2019. Furthermore, as of April 2020, there have been operational changes with the work plan revised to support the COVID-19 response.

Effectiveness

The review team approached the assessment of MDI’s effectiveness in two ways. Firstly, it was guided by MDI’s monitoring and evaluation frameworks (MEF) to determine how well it had achieved each objective’s projected outcomes. The second approach was to explore a range of effectiveness-related issues with stakeholders: appropriateness of five objectives, MDI’s application of V&A principles, the extent of its partnerships, the use of the three hubs and other activity modalities, social media, M&E, and GESI with discussion guided by a set of questions set out in the agreed review plan. (See Annex 3)

MDI is placed operationally under the DCP. Accordingly, there is a pyramid of objectives which work towards achieving an overarching DCP objective as seen below in Table 1 with MDI’s objective being: *media enables citizens to effectively express their views and facilitates responsiveness of decision makers*. Supporting this objective are five “intermediate” objectives:

1. Greater professionalism of the media on voice and accountability
2. Incremental transformation of PNG’s National Broadcasting Corporation (NBC)
3. Creation of innovative, quality V&A content
4. Increased access and dialogue by citizens
5. Enhanced responsiveness of decision makers

Table 1: Program framework

DCP Program 3 Objective: Citizens are better informed and to influence their access to services and economic opportunity, and hold their government to account.
MDI Project Objective: Media enables citizens to effectively express their views and facilitates responsiveness of decision makers.
Expected Change: Media widens access to information and supports more effective citizen voice and responsiveness of decision makers.

Objective 1: Greater professionalism of media organisations on voice and accountability issues

2018-2019 Outcomes	2019-2020 Outcomes by July 2020
Peak body facilitates access to and responses from decision-makers (Press Club events) Better use of experts by media to influence topics and questions (Press Club events) Background briefings provided to media Women in Media research identifies local solutions to promote equality of women in the workplace	Improved quality of stories published by media (diversity of sources, topics and speakers)

Objective 2: Incremental transformation of NBC

NBC has enhanced understanding of audiences and local context Core V&A programs in TV and Radio Divisions transformed to audience orientation Leadership and Senior Management become change leaders	Improved organisational efficacy and content
--	--

Objective 3: Creation of innovative, quality V&A content

<p>Professional content assessment by drama expert</p> <p>Content generated as a result of mentoring in all the hubs and information included into CCG and shared through current affairs hub</p> <p>Assess increase in quantity and quality of V&A content in Talasea.</p> <p>Monitor effectiveness of 'Hashtag Campaign'</p> <p>Monitor effectiveness of 'Hashtag Campaign'</p>	<p>Increase in quality and quantity of content delivered in more diverse ways</p>
---	---

Objective 4: Increased citizen access and dialogue

<p>Citizens more aware of how to access decision makers</p> <p>Diverse voices engaged</p>	<p>Improved quality of stories published by media (diversity of sources, topics and speakers)</p>
---	---

Objective 5: Enhanced responsiveness of decision makers

<p>Decision makers more aware of citizen expectations including women, youth and vulnerable people</p>	<p>Greater accountability</p>
--	-------------------------------

This section looks at how effectively MDI has met each of its intermediate objectives.

Objective 1: Greater professionalism of the media on voice accountability

As can be seen in Table 1, in 2018-2019, MDI had been expected to work towards four outcomes:

- Peak body facilitates access to and responses from decision makers (Press Club events)
- Better use of experts by media to influence topics and questions (Press Club events)
- Background briefings provided to media
- Women in Media research identifies local solutions to promote equality of women in the workplace

Project activity reports and feedback from stakeholders suggest that MDI had made some progress towards meeting all four of these outcomes. Background briefings initiated by MDI to improve the quality of questioning at Press Club events has been a significant vehicle for supporting three of the four outcomes. Project reporting shows that there has been a progressive development of the press club/background briefing initiatives with an expansion of the press club concept into the provinces (Provincial Panels) in the second half of 2019. The Women in Media initiative was an early and important achievement and has been used to influence and inform PNG's mainstream media. It also fed into the 2019 PNG Country Update process. (See Box 1 – Addressing gender and disability).

As a result of changes to the MEF for 2019-2020 (see Table 1), the previous outcomes were scrapped and replaced by one: *improved quality of stories published by media (diversity of sources, topics and speakers)*. The broadness of this new outcome and the fact that it has only been incorporated into MDI's MEF since the end of July 2019 makes it difficult to assess. However, the project activity report available subsequent to this change reflects an innovative period with the instigation of the Provincial Panels coinciding with outside broadcasts in WNB with local panels discussing law and order issues in front of local audience who were able to ask questions of the panel and discuss ways to deal with the issues. Workshops to improve financial and economic reporting were also held during this period bringing together Treasury officials including Treasury's secretary with MDI's media partners.

Objective 2: Incremental transformation of PNG's National Broadcasting Corporation (NBC)

Under the 2018-2019 MEF, the outcomes for objective 2 were:

- NBC has enhanced understanding of audiences and local context
- Core V&A programs in TV and Radio Divisions transformed to audience orientation
- Leadership and Senior Management become change leaders

A range of activities responding to these outcomes have been undertaken including the compilation of a guide on audience use of media, transformation plans, putting more of an emphasis on V&A in NBC TV's nightly current affairs program. NBC was also successful in getting a much-needed budget increase with the mentoring support of MDI.

Similar to Objective 1, there was a major change to the MEF for the following year which saw the outcome boiled down to one: *Improved organisational efficacy and content*. While again it is difficult to determine how effective MDI has been in meeting this outcome given the brevity of time since its introduction, MDI working with NBC and Deloitte PNG has been successful in developing a realignment plan for the organisation, an initiative which was sought by NBC's Managing Director. Training and mentoring senior staff in change management practices has also been part of the approach.

As ongoing activities, it would seem that MDI has been effective in meeting this objective, building on its previous work with NBC since MDI began in 2005 while managing senior NBC staff turnover and a recent change in the board.

Objective 3: Creation of innovative, quality V&A content

Again, there are differences between the expected outcomes for 2018-2019 and 2019-2020 with the former comprising:

- Creative hub generates drama script and audio visual ‘teaser’ and development of funding strategy
- Current affairs focus facilitates critical mass of reporting and media follow up
- District hub generate local level media solutions
- Hashtag campaign for V&A content
- Core content guide (CCG)

The more recent outcome is simply *increase in quality and quantity of content delivered in more diverse ways*. The review team noted that the former outcomes were more akin to outputs but were inherited from the original program design document as were all 2018-2019 outcomes.

In its attempt to meet the various outcomes and serve all five objectives, MDI initiated a three hubs approach – district, current affairs and creative. According to MDI, the idea behind the creation of the hubs was to provide the training and create the material which would support the work undertaken under all five objectives.

In assessing MDI’s effectiveness under this objective, overall it would seem that it has been active in facilitating and supporting a range of V&A material. It is clear too that these hubs have not become silos. Instead, there is evidence that there has been valuable cross over of ideas and activity with collaboration on a number of occasions e.g. creative hub workshops on script-writing social smart-phone dramas at the district level.

In comparing the three hubs, the district hub seems to have been the most successful in its fruitful engagement with Talasea’s community, leaders and media. In part, this can be attributed to the advantages of working locally. It has been fortunate too in having an energetic and responsive local NBC station manager and the presence of a DCP adviser who has facilitated engagement. That said, the creative and current affairs hubs have both supported the district hub’s work but the question remains whether the outcomes achieved could not be just as effectively realised through a less structured creative and current affairs approach drawing on those resources as needed.

Objective 4: Increased access and dialogue by citizens

MEF outcomes for 2018-2019 were:

- Citizens more aware of how to access decision makers
- Diverse voices engaged

MEF outcome for 2019-2020: *More diverse voices on air*

While different again, the outcomes are similar in their intent so can be combined in this assessment of effectiveness. An early effort to instigate a “one brand” around V&A through its three hubs was found to be unpopular and was set aside. But other work included:

- Media engagement workshops for Talasea district communities.
- Content from the Mama Foundation and Kina Bungim Kina (KBK) made available to wider audiences through NBC and Facebook, promoting two-way engagement

- NBC's WNB talkback program, Tokaut Tok Stret.

An important outcome of MDI's work in the district has been the engagement of women from Talasea in the Local Level Government elections in 2019. This is an important outcome of the program's district level work.

A major piece of work has been the 2019 PNG Citizen Perception and Media Engagement Survey. This survey aimed to identify citizen attitudes and perceptions of PNG governance, citizen engagement with social and political issues and understand where citizens are accessing information and how they are consuming media. The results of the survey provide important benchmarks and point to trends and perceptions which can be used to shape the focus of MDI and more broadly, other V&A type activities being undertaken by the Australia's aid program in PNG. This survey builds on an earlier survey undertaken by MDI in 2014.

Objective 5: Enhanced responsiveness of decision makers

MEF outcome 2018-2019: *Decision makers more aware of citizen expectations including women, youth and vulnerable people.*

MEF outcome 2019-2020: *Greater accountability*

Enhanced responsiveness of PNG's decision makers is affected by a dynamic range of cultural, political and social dimensions. No one party, trend or project can take credit for what improvements may occur, if they are even measurable at least in the short to medium term.

However, there are some specific activities MDI undertook to respond to this objective including promise tracking. This involves content makers keeping a record of commitments made by leaders and then following them up. Because of the lack of a central "secretariat" to keep the record up to date, this has proved to be difficult to maintain and requires regular maintenance by MDI which is untenable into the future. It is also questionable whether this broad ranging approach to promise tracking would be a useful form of accountability even if it could be kept up to date – the existing tools are spread very thinly across a wide range of "promises". Meaningful accountability for commitments will likely need to be more focused on issues/concerns which are salient for the public and which journalists may be motivated to return to.

At the district level, MDI has worked with Talasea district MP, Governor Frances Maneke, to improve his communications with his constituency. While he eschewed social media, he agreed to sending out a regular (paper) newsletter for which MDI produced the template. Again it is difficult to assess how this would continue with MDI's eventual absence.

Stakeholder responses

This section responds to the questions which were put to stakeholders about MDI's effectiveness in particular areas as highlighted below (see Annex 3 for the full list of questions.)

Objectives: The feedback from almost all stakeholders interviewed was that five objectives were too many for such a small project stretching its capacity too thinly to be able to cover each adequately. There was also concern that MDI was not demonstrating outcomes linked to the objectives with its regular reporting focused on outputs. However, it was also recognised that the timeframe was too short to be able to identify sustained outcomes. A common view was that MDI has made less progress on achieving decision maker responsiveness than on the other goals.

Engagement with mainstream media: Given MDI's legacy and the predominantly journalism-related skill set of its team both in PNG and ABCID, it is not surprising that the main focus of its activities has been engagement with the mainstream media. It has signed partnerships with NBC,

Digicel, Christian Media Network TV and the Institute of National Affairs. In addition, it has non-signed but active partnerships with EMTV, FM100, PNGFM, The National, Post Courier, Wantok newspaper, Sunday Bulletin, and Sunday Chronicle. A strong example of MDI working with other partners is the establishment of the Press Club events which MDI facilitated for NBC and the PNG Media Council during its previous phase. The associated background briefings introduced since 2017 aim to improve the quality of journalistic interaction at the Press Club events. However, the MDI team despite being composed of Papua New Guineans, has at times found it difficult to get traction with the national level media because of perceptions that it is a mouthpiece for DFAT pushing Australian Government views.

Social media: MDI has been actively engaged with a range of social media related activities including basic social media workshops with community groups in Talasea focusing on social media platforms more widely accessible in PNG notably Facebook and WhatsApp, creation of a WhatsApp current affairs hub group to share news, and the development of a guide to the use of social media for NBC to underpin ethical and responsible use of social media in keeping with quality journalism and the development of podcasting. As noted by several stakeholders, working with social media in PNG is not straightforward. Accessibility and cost are two important factors but there is also the way it is used. According to one senior prominent journalist, social media can be a double-edged sword. “There is a lot of activism online in PNG; but that needs to be translated into action within the community. The media needs to pick up on the trends coming through in social media and translate it into reliable information with credible weight.”

Voice and accountability: A common theme in the interviews was that ensuring meaningful responsiveness of decision makers through the media is highly challenging in PNG. There is a shared view that MDI has made progress on increasing voice (“access and dialogue by citizens”) but made less progress on achieving decision maker responsiveness. Reasons proffered by stakeholders include: (i) the continued dominance of wantok and informal processes which fall outside the purview of the media; (ii) structural constraints in the media industry (ownership and management of parts of the national media (see Annex 1 for list of media ownership)); (iii) cultural factors (a reluctance to challenge authority); and (iv) reformers who may want to respond to media pressure struggle to do so because of the weakness of the PNG bureaucratic systems. In any context, using the media to ensure meaningful responsiveness from decision makers is challenging. But in PNG the challenge feels particularly acute.

Three-hub approach: Each hub had its own focus but there has been constructive crossover between the three. For example, the creative hub was used to develop scripts focusing on critical social issues affecting Papua New Guineans. At least in one case, this involved the three hubs as a drama series developed for Talasea district was then used by the current affairs hub to develop news features focusing again on these issues. However, feedback suggests that it can be difficult to see how the output of the three hubs link to support enduring outcomes. Instead, there is a risk that the activities are simply one-offs which because of their time-limited nature are not sufficient to gain enduring traction.

District hub: The Talasea district hub stands out as one where MDI had been successful in engaging with media, civil society and local decision makers, including the Open Member, to facilitate improved community dialogue. Replicating the district hub approach in other areas of PNG was raised by several stakeholders and was seen as a possibility but with caution. Firstly, MDI’s presence in Talasea benefitted from the presence of the DCP adviser who was able to facilitate MDI engagement. But Talasea is a small district in an island province. How the Talasea approach would translate to other districts would need to take account of location-specific culture and the willingness of the local community and its leaders to consider such an approach. While

care would be needed with any expansion to other Districts, it may represent an attractive strategic direction for the program – as well as building from successes and lessons from Talasea, an expanded District focus goes with the grain of PNG’s political economy, given the power and prominence of Open MPs.

Monitoring and evaluating: This has been a particularly challenging area for MDI for a number of reasons. As noted earlier, there was a significant change to the outcomes introduced by DFAT and Abt in MDI’s second year linked in part to changes to the overarching DCP EVA strategy. It would seem too that there have been frustrations with the style of reporting by MDI on the outcomes which was viewed as a focus on outputs rather than outcomes although as noted earlier, a number of the earlier approved outcomes were essentially outputs. As one stakeholder put it, DFAT’s “so what” question has not been answered. Secondly, there seems to be a mismatch in expectations and understanding of what reporting on outcomes actually means with one part of MDI taking the view that outcomes had been reported on while another recognised that the scale of the program both in terms of resources and time wasn’t commensurate with its ambitions. That said, there was recognition that the expectations that MDI would be able to answer the “so what” question after such a short time frame was unrealistic.

Complicating matters further were the different perspectives of what MDI should be doing. Within DFAT there was one view that MDI should be more strongly focused on public diplomacy, supporting a positive perspective of the Australian Government’s aid activities in PNG. Ironically, this has been shown to be a negative from the national media perspective. Other parts of DFAT and DCP wanted MDI’s focus to be squarely targeted on encouraging greater responsiveness by leaders and decision makers to their community’s concerns while MDI itself has been caught in the middle trying to respond to various pressures from DFAT and DCP to changes in focus and design and requests to undertake tasks outside of their workplans.

The multi-layered administrative framework (MDI/DCP (Abt)/DFAT) has at times also complicated and slowed communication between the three parties to a degree which has resulted in late take up of operational changes. This was exacerbated earlier in the first 18 months of this phase when Abt was not kept sufficiently in the loop as the AHC took a close operational involvement in MDI’s operation.

Gender and disability issues: MDI’s approach to addressing gender and disability issues has been comprehensive and stakeholders described it as a driving force for change in this space – a view that was shared by other stakeholders. Examples include the Women in Media report, the focus on GESI issues in radio dramas, and encouragement of women’s participation in the Press Club events (see Box 1 – Addressing gender and disability) However, there was concern that the GESI focus, in direct response to Australian Government priorities, has tended to divert attention away from other social issues which can be of greater concern to Papua New Guineans. In a project that aims to encourage citizens to articulate their own needs and issues “in an informed manner and subsequently effect improvements in governance, service delivery and economic opportunity” [DCP’s expected change], insisting on an emphasis on GESI can mean a shift away from those needs and issues. This is not a criticism of MDI, or even DFAT’s inclusion of GESI. In itself, this is worthwhile particularly given the massive challenges facing women and disabled people in PNG. It is simply a reminder that achieving positive outcomes for GESI will be incremental and will require addressing issues of more immediate concern to the ordinary Papua New Guinean to assist the change process.

Box 1: Addressing gender and disability inclusiveness

A cross-cutting priority for MDI has been to address issues underlying gender and disability inclusiveness. The makeup of the MDI team itself is an important signal to stakeholders that MDI sees gender inclusiveness as vital. With a woman leading the in-country team, the fact that it is one of the few Australian Government development programs run by a Papua New Guinean is another positive signal of its approach to inclusiveness; indeed it is an exemplar.

In terms of implementation, MDI has also been very energetic in aiming for gender equity in its activities. In the PNG context, this has been challenging as the initial attendance at the background briefings demonstrates. For example, in the second half of its first year, no women attended the briefings. But in the next six months, the ratio was more than 50/50 in favour of women and while subsequent attendances have been mixed the trend has been in a positive direction for gender inclusiveness.

A standout initiative has been the Women in Media report which provided an overview of the profile of women in the Papua New Guinea media sector, focussing on major or significant media outlets in the capital. The report provides background information and recommendations on overcoming barriers to gender equity within the media industry. It revealed significant disparities in the gender balance of media organisations with only one in five having gender equality policies and just over one in ten undertaking any equality monitoring. Challenges for women in media included safety concerns, sexual harassment, gender influencing managerial decisions, and gaining male subordinates' respect. An important outcome so far has been the responsiveness of media companies who have asked MDI to talk further with their individual human resource departments to address the issues raised in the report.

In terms of disability inclusiveness, MDI piloted an inclusive reporting workshop in Port Moresby in December 2019. The aim was to train content makers with the skill levels to report on gender and social inclusion with an emphasis on people with disability in a way that is supportive and sensitive to these communities. Although the turnout was disappointing, perhaps reflecting the reality that this is still a largely ignored issue, group feedback suggested that the desired outcome had been achieved. But it was recognised that there were still many journalists to reach and inclusive reporting needs to be attended by managers too so that a top down approach can feed into the national approach to inclusivity.

Another initiative focused on women with disability was the production by the creative hub of the film, *Julie's Story* which describes the challenges faced by a young woman in Talasea after she lost one of her legs in an accident. The film was completed as part of a creative hub workshop and calls for better services for people living with a disability. Julie herself worked as the disability support office for the community development division in Talasea district. The film was launched in Port Moresby in November 2018, broadcast on NBC, received news coverage and was subsequently screened in Talasea with the audience including members of the local and provincial government business council as part of the ongoing effort to improve responsiveness to the issues faced by people living with a disability in the district and nationally.

Film was also the medium to focus on women's economic empowerment, disability inclusion, family violence and conflict resolution through the development of a TV series. This initiative followed the request of NBC's managing director to MDI to explore social drama as a means of promoting positive behavioural change. A pilot, with the working title, *Sagata*, was produced and a funding strategy developed to finance the series. Despite early encouragement by the AHC, a change in funding priorities meant the series could not proceed. However, NBC's senior management encouragement is an indicator of an increasingly responsive environment to addressing these issues.

Overall, while any of these initiatives alone will not be enough to shift attitude and understanding of inclusiveness, together they add to a continuum of broader community effort. MDI's contribution has been to strengthen the voice of those pushing for change.

Relevance

Similar to its approach with assessing Effectiveness, the review team has considered MDI's relevance from two perspectives – in relation to its objectives and taking into account stakeholder responses to a specific set of questions (see Annex 3 for list of questions).

The work of MDI remains highly relevant to Australia's aid program in PNG. While suffering adjustment pains from being a small legacy program retro-fitted into a large governance facility, there is a clear logical trajectory of objectives from the PNG-Australia Governance Partnership through to MDI. Furthermore, the priorities addressed through the activities of that partnership align with and respond to PNG's priorities as set out in PNG's Alotau Accord II, the Medium Term Development Plan III and the economic and human development aspirations in PNG's Vision 2050 and associated policies.

It also highly relevant to the Australian Government's geo-strategic priorities in terms of the collegiate and constructive relationship between Australia's and PNG's public broadcasters. The value of this relationship lies in the reality that in the absence of the ABC, NBC made it clear that it would accept support from other State controlled broadcasters, notably the China Media Group, also known as Voice of China. China is already supporting NBC with the construction of its new headquarters.

Looking specifically at the relevance of its activities linked to each objective, under **objective 1**, it is evident that MDI's work strongly reflects a practical relevance to the PNG media context where opportunity for practitioners to improve their skills and strengthen professionalism is very limited. MDI has embarked on an ambitious program of engagement with an expanded range of the country's media. Moving beyond its previous sole focus on NBC, MDI has reached out to work with mainstream private sector media while maintaining its development relationship with NBC.

In terms of its work with NBC, **objective 2**, the realignment and change management work MDI has undertaken and facilitated has been in direct response to the vision of NBC's managing director who in his own words "wanted to sort out the work culture and bring change to the work ethics". While there has been resistance to change within the organisation below top management, NBC's significance as a vital public institution for PNG cannot be underestimated. ABCID's engagement with NBC is relevant not just from a development perspective but also supports Australia's national interest. It became evident during stakeholder discussions that NBC is willing to accept other international state support if Australia withdrew but it would prefer Australia's and notably ABCID because of the historical and ongoing public broadcasting links. Given that NBC's reach across the country is unparalleled by any of the other media, it plays a critical role not just as a news and entertainment media, but in supporting emergency responses to crises such as COVID-19.

The relevance of its work to meet **objective 3** (creation of innovative and quality V&A content) relates to the broader aspirations for change to bring about greater accountability by government and other decision makers. As already noted, this is a difficult area to achieve change in such a short time frame. Therefore, the question remains about how relevant its work in this area is to making the long-term change. While the sum of its own work in this area is significant from the perspective of the program's resources, in the broader PNG environment, it is very small as such change requires a major multi-faceted joined up effort beyond MDI. It also needs demonstrable PNG political leadership.

As for **objective 4** (increased access and dialogue by citizens), the work it has undertaken through the hubs has been an attempt to create material which is relevant to the lives of citizens. In doing this, it has been more successful at the district level in Talasea where close and constructive relationships are able to be forged both with the media and local authorities as well as community groups. NBC's WNB station has been most receptive to supporting community feedback and dialogue.

A key step in ensuring ongoing relevance has been the 2019 Citizens Perception and Media Engagement Survey to identify citizen attitudes and perceptions of governance, as well as social and political issues, and to understand where citizens are accessing information and how they are consuming media. This exercise follows a media-specific survey undertaken by MDI in 2014 and builds its understanding of citizen governance expectations and media usage and accessibility all of which provides the feedback necessary to maintain the relevance of MDI's activities.

The relevance of its work to enhance the responsiveness of decision makers (**objective 5**) has to be judged by the willingness of decision makers to be responsive. This reflects the finding of the 2019 review of the PNG-Australia Governance Partnership which noted that "engagement is more likely to be sustained where there is a significant response from government and other duty bearers".⁶ So while MDI's work in this area is theoretically relevant in that it attempts to enhance responsiveness, it is very much limited by what the politicians and decision makers are willing to tolerate. It has had some limited success in Talasea with the Open Member in terms of improving his communications with his constituents. But the promise tracking initiative has little likelihood of sustainability and its relevance lies in its endurance, not as an MDI-supported one-off. This objective of seeking improved decision maker responsiveness in PNG is relevant, but whether MDI on its own is able to achieve this is unlikely.

Stakeholder responses

This section responds to the questions which were put to stakeholders about MDI's relevance in particular areas as highlighted below.

Goal and objectives: MDI's intermediate objectives are ambitious, to the point of being aspirational rather than achievable in the short to medium term. MDI's approach should be more focused and identifiably incremental. Not only are there too many objectives for an activity the size of MDI, it is evident both from the project documents and reports as well as discussions with stakeholders that its direction has to a degree been forced by an overarching requirement to fit within the DCP and broader PGF architecture.

Voice & accountability approach: It is important that MDI is focused on outcomes which go beyond media capacity building. The questions, however, are what outcomes are realistic for a program of MDI's design and size to achieve in PNG and what approaches hold the most promise in the PNG context? While several interviewees reported a reluctance to challenge authority, there is a strong underlying democratic culture in PNG, which manifests itself in robust and substantial debate and engagement. This potential for expanding voice is reflected in MDI's experience with several important examples of expanding access and participation in the media.

In terms of which approaches hold the most potential and are most relevant in PNG, while the formal structures of the state are relatively centralised, a large amount of meaningful power – and

⁶ <https://www.dfat.gov.au/sites/default/files/annual-review-of-the-papua-new-guinea-australia-governance-partnership-2019.pdf> p. 10

interactions between most citizens and any form of “government” – is localised. This decentralisation is longstanding in some respects with Open MPs accumulating considerable power. This suggests that relevance of MDI has been significantly increased as a result of the Talasea District project – but it could be increased further if the sub-national components of the program were carefully, expanded further.

An additional question about relevance concerns the mix and balance of media outlets and channels that MDI works with. This is discussed further below in relation to the churches (where increasing relevance may be achieved by strengthening partnerships) and social media (where there are clear opportunities, but drawbacks need to be recognised). Earlier experiences of efforts to improve accountability could also be drawn on. For example, in the early 2010s, the PNG departments of Finance and Treasury jointly released lists of all Treasury warrants disbursed to Provinces, Districts and LLG’s for public accountability. This was in response to citizens’ outcry on where public monies were going to for their electorates. This initiative was supported through an AusAID governance program. The response by citizens was overwhelming as now they knew the status of funding allocations appropriated and amount disbursed per quarter. A combination of greater transparency on local budgets and an expansion of MDI activity at the district level may, in time, lead to improved accountability.

Monitoring and Evaluation Framework: As already noted, there have been a number of issues which have affected the MEF. This has impacted on its relevance as it has not always been able to provide the information sought by two key stakeholders (AHC and Abt). Responsibility for this failure, however, lies not so much at MDI’s feet but is tied up in the way in which MDI has been required to alter its MEF and workplans to respond to changes both within the overarching DCP program as well as the broader context, notably COVID-19. Indeed, at the time of the 2018-2019 Annual Review of the PNG Australia Governance Partnership, the DCP team was in the process of revising its own PAF as the then version for DCP stated “overambitious outcomes and lacked clear targets against the indicators and was therefore not fit for the purposes of accountability, learning and adaptive management” according to the team who undertook the 2019 review of DCP⁷.

The likelihood that DCP will not continue in its current form offers any ongoing MDI the opportunity to restructure the MEF to better reflect the reality that achieving the type of cultural change envisaged within its program logic requires a long-term view with evaluation requirements adjusted to meet that reality. That said, the MEF has still been a useful tool in identifying lessons coming out of the activities and enabling the team to make alterations to suit the local context and changing needs. In terms of the program logic and MEF providing the program with the structure it needs to adapt to the evolving operating context, MDI has been expected to fit within DCP’s overarching architecture.

Training as a perceived dominant delivery mechanism: While training is an important element and essential to build capacity in producing V&A approaches and content across TV, radio, print, social media and mobile platforms, the project also undertakes a broader mix of activities including research, development of reporting and issue-specific guidelines, background briefings, script development, change management support, and conducting workshops on V&A for communities and decision-makers. This mix is ongoing and would seem to be relevant to the needs of the different sectors that MDI is working with.

That said, a concern was raised about the relevance of some of the training for journalists in terms of the appropriateness of the Australian experience to the PNG reality. As one stakeholder said,

⁷ <https://www.dfat.gov.au/sites/default/files/annual-review-of-the-papua-new-guinea-australia-governance-partnership-2019.pdf>

“we have their knowledge, but we can’t apply it here. And that’s not just an issue for MDI”. Instead, there needed to be recognition of the local skill set and experience, drawing on it to complement but not replace the Australian approach.

Program partners: MDI works with a comprehensive group of media operators and any expansion should require MDI to be particularly strategic in its engagement to avoid any further stretching of its already tight resources. One area of stronger engagement could be with the church media. While there was a view that church broadcasters didn’t need MDI, strengthening links to the churches’ media has the advantage of broadening the reach of MDI’s V&A activities. Although MDI would have to be wary of inadvertently supporting proselytising activities, links to the church and other organisations such as Transparency International would be a valuable way to pick up issues affecting communities.

Social media: With regard to the relevance of MDI’s ongoing work to expand the understanding of and to strengthen the responsible use of social media, this is a given when considering the expanding role social media is playing in the lives of Papua New Guineans as discussed earlier. It is also an important means of reaching PNG’s younger demographics. Internet use in PNG is growing: in 2016, just 19% of the population had ever used it. By 2019, 43% said they used it occasionally (although only 10% used it daily). The expectation must be that internet usage continues to grow rapidly.

Interviews painted a mixed picture on whether social media influenced decision makers. Some leading politicians are using social media and there are signs that MPs and government are concerned about it. But a number of stakeholders emphasised the continued importance of radio and newspapers.

However, there is a strong case for MDI focusing more on social media. But the pace and focus of that shift by MDI may require careful thought. Internet usage in PNG remains uneven, skewed towards the urban and the young. While hopes are pinned to the Coral Cable initiative expanding internet access, cost and accessibility particularly for rural and remote communities which are by far the majority of PNG’s population, remain major challenges. How the Coral Cable will remedy the cost factor remains unknown due to the high cost pricing policy of the SOE responsible for management of the new infrastructure. (See earlier discussion.) Even as more of the population start using the internet, it will not necessarily be the best medium for hosting trustworthy public discourse. There is clear recognition (see MDI 2019 Citizens Perceptions survey focus groups) of the problem of ‘fake news’ spreading online, and traditional media is much more trusted as a source of information.

Furthermore, the mainstream media (radio/print media) in PNG is still an essential mode of information and communication and will be for a while yet. Culturally Papua New Guineans are oral or narrative people. They easily relate to storytelling/tanoa and have been passing down their cultural history and practises through this practise through generations.

Sustainability

The latest phase of MDI builds, in part, on its earlier work which had been focused on NBC. In that regard, the sustainability of its work is cumulative. Now in its 15th year of working with NBC, previous reviews (2010, 2012, 2015), show that MDI has had a clear and positive impact on NBC's ability to serve the people of PNG. The 2015 review observed that the work of MDI to support improved management had had an important sustained outcome with strong leadership making good use of MDI support. That outcome has been maintained as NBC's MD has worked with MDI in this latest phase to bring about the type of restructuring needed to support NBC into the future.

Less evident is MDI's success in underpinning sustainability of the focus of its voice and accountability activities in large part because it is still very much in its early days of working towards its ambitious objective of media enabling citizens to effectively express their views and facilitates responsiveness of decision makers. It has to be assumed that giving people the skills and capacity along with technical resources to learn about and apply quality journalism adds value to PNG's media landscape. For example, while there are question marks about the durability of the Press Club events should MDI no longer be involved, it is evident that where there is a capacity and will, what has been learnt and developed through MDI's activities has a reasonable chance of being sustained. This is evident in the case of MDI's work with NBC in West New Britain where there has been an enthusiastic embrace of the voice and accountability approaches appropriate for a broadcaster including talkback, Open Mike and Discussion Forums which give voice to citizens and seek responsiveness from local decision makers.

The successful applicability of the Talasea district experience elsewhere will depend on a number of factors as already discussed but key to the Talasea success has been the local response. Leadership and appetite to sustain successful outcomes of the MDI program would be the key issue here.

In short, the sustainability of MDI's focus on voice and accountability needs to be measured on a continuum basis and not as a snapshot just as the sustainability of MDI's work with NBC becomes evident thanks to the legacy of earlier reviews which provide value benchmarks.

Summary of conclusions

Below is the summary of conclusions on MDI's performance during the period under review. Recommendations for the future are discussed in the next chapter.

- Overall, despite the mid-course changes to its MEF plus revisions to its most recent workplan to respond to COVID-19, MDI has gone some way in meeting its objectives and contributing to the projected outcomes. It has proved harder to make progress on achieving decision maker responsiveness and meaningful accountability but MDI has been more successful in achieving the "voice" element of V&A.
- Given more time, it could provide solid foundations for visible incremental change in voice. This includes continuing to support expanded access to the media and the expansion of locally generated content on issues which matter to Papua New Guineans. This is MDI's strength which should be recognised in any future continuation of MDI.
- The more ambitious goal of achieving accountability of decision makers requires multi-stakeholder engagement. And while MDI's placement within the DCP team should have played to that, the overarching operating framework has not been sufficiently conducive to effective collaboration and complementarity despite the higher-level objective.

- The layered administrative complexity (AHC/Abt/MDI) adds to an already difficult operating environment and has resulted in delays in communication and action. This was exacerbated earlier in the phase when Abt was not kept sufficiently in the loop as the AHC took a close operational involvement in MDI's operations.
- The administrative complexity has also contributed to a MEF which has had to be altered mid-course to meet DCP's objectives and subsequent reporting is not satisfactorily capturing MDI's product.
- Achieving sustained accountability and decision maker responsiveness will require a more fundamental change in program design and a significantly longer time horizon. MDI's relevance could be strengthened by focusing on fewer objectives with more tangible and achievable outcomes.
- Of the three hubs, the district hub seems to have been the most effective both in its district-specific activities but also drawing on the resources of the creative and current affairs hubs. Given the size of MDI, there is a question about the need to maintain three hubs rather than simply drawing creative and news gathering resources on a needs basis.
- At the activity level, MDI's work remains relevant and is welcomed by the groups it works with whether media or community. However, the program is working to a framework which has set objectives that are too ambitious. In turn, this has necessitated a work program that attempts to do too much and runs the risk of implementing too many one-offs.
- MDI has been energetic in supporting and facilitating the use of social media whether by media organisations, community groups or decision makers. However, as elsewhere, the emphasis in capacity building needs to be on the responsible and ethical use of this communication platform.
- MDI's work with NBC over the past 15 years can be seen to have achieved sustainable outcomes. In a difficult operating environment, this is impressive and important. Particularly valuable is the contribution the NBC-ABC relationship facilitated by MDI continues to make to Australia's broader strategic interests.
- MDI's efforts to embrace gender and disability inclusiveness have been energetic and effective, and in some ways, a noteworthy exemplar.

Future Options

This section looks at potential future options for MDI. The options suggested start from the premise that DFAT will remain, across its wider governance programming, focused on voice and accountability, seeking to increase the responsiveness of policy makers to Papua New Guineans' interests.

The options discussed are also grounded in a recognition that achieving policy maker responsiveness is highly challenging in PNG. Continuing to work with the media will have an important role to play in achieving the wider goal of more responsive decision making. Continued organisational support for NBC, expanded access, and deeper citizen engagement through the media remain important objectives. But, while it may be realistic to expect MDI to increase citizen voice, it is more questionable whether it can on its own be expected to increase decision maker responsiveness.

This is why some of the options below suggest ways in which media-sector programming can link to other potential partners and activities. To achieve real impact on government decision making, it will be necessary to integrate MDI's core business with other accountability focused programming/activities. As such the options suggested below could feed into the broader DFAT accountability review.

This section first presents six potential future directions, and then sets out possible implications for the design and focus of MDI.

Six potential future directions

(1) Sub-national level – expansion across more districts

There is a strong case for expanding MDI's work at the District and Provincial level. The power of Open MPs, including their control over DSIPs, is a noteworthy feature of the PNG context. But the existing media infrastructure, access, and generation of locally relevant content is still a challenge at the local level. MDI's Talasea District Hub has allowed it to learn lessons and the program could usefully expand into other Districts.

How best to do this would need further consideration. Some questions include:

- *The balance between widening access/voice and increasing accountability:* it may be sensible to initially focus sub-national activities on improving the media infrastructure and the culture of using the media as a platform for public discussion and debate. This initial focus on increasing voice could provide the platform to do more accountability focused activities (e.g. pre and post the 2022 election).
- *The balance between supporting incumbent MPs and promoting accountability:* It appears that in Talasea work supporting the Open MP to promote his own activities has made more headway than supporting citizens to hold the MP to account. Securing the MP's support and buy-in is likely sensible but striking the right balance between supporting incumbents and holding them to account will need careful ongoing consideration.
- *Breadth vs depth:* Is there a case for working across one province, allowing for some comparisons on the performance of MPs between districts? Is it better to work in detail in a

small number of further Districts, or to seek to work less intensively across a larger number? The Talasea work benefitted from the presence of the DCP adviser who was able to facilitate the district hub's links to the broader community.

(2) 2022 election – initial focus on voice, followed by pre-and post-election focus on accountability

MDI could consider how best to use the 2022 elections as an opportunity. The high level of MP turnover suggests some form of “accountability”, through the wantok system, already exists. At present this is unlikely to be based on the delivery of improved policy outcomes, responding to local priorities. But how can MDI use the media in the run up to the election in a way which goes with the grain of the wantok relationships, but starts to make MP accountability more linked to the delivery of substantive benefits for communities (as opposed to cash or some other form of short-term vote buying)? The media could be used to:

- Provide clear information on candidates, including potential funding relationships.
- Articulate the main local concerns during the campaign: for example, develop a focus on local issues which motivate communities. A media focus on a small number of salient issues in the pre-election period (which may extract commitments from candidates) would then provide the basis of post-election accountability work. This could be a far more effective approach than the broad and unfocused use of promise trackers.

MDI could also seek sequence activities over the coming few years and use the period over 2020/21 to focus on building up capacity for citizen voice in preparation for a focus on accountability in the more immediate run-up to the election 2022. For instance, the Talasea program, and other District level programs that start before then, could support the local NBC radio stations, and other local stations as relevant, which seek to develop a culture of debate. Or they could focus on building up on-line spaces for debate between people. This would increase voice amongst a manageable number of Talasea citizens over a significant period. As the 2022 election approaches, the content could begin to turn from issue-based discussion to election-based discussion, demonstrating the links between public issues and electoral accountability.

(3) New partnership with the churches

The review team asked interviewees about the case for an MDI partnership with the churches. The response has been largely positive. There is common agreement and strong evidence that the churches are widely trusted. Some church figures and denominations were also reported as being interested in developing more of a policy influencing role. Given the churches' large role in service delivery, they have an interest in engaging in certain policy debates. The full extent of the appetite amongst church leaders for this would need further investigation: how do church leaders interpret engagement in “policy influencing”? Which denominations would be most influential/interested? Which issues would they be most likely to focus on?

One decision for MDI in the future would be what form of partnership could they develop with the churches, and for what purpose. One option would be to focus on partnering with the church because of their current and potential media platform – so could MDI work with the churches as they expand their own media radio services? This may expand public access to trusted sources of information. Another option would be to focus on partnering with the churches as potential influential advocates for change – who decision makers may listen to. Influential church figures could, for example, be linked to a strand of MDI work focused on particular “issues”.

In all of this, care would need to be taken to ensure that MDI was not seen as facilitating the churches' proselytising work or supporting issues-based perspectives which may run counter to secular views. It should also be noted that MDI's efforts to date to engage with churches has had limited success due to a lack of responsiveness on the part of the churches, notably the PNG Council of Churches.

(4) Increasing national decision maker responsiveness – an “issue based” approach

One option, which draws on the experience of other voice and accountability development programming in other contexts, is to adopt an “issue-based” approach.

In contrast to programming that focuses largely on organisational capacity building, an issue-based approach starts from a consideration of which issues have the potential for change. Box 2 below provides some further details. Having selected the issue, the mix of tactics and activities adopted to influence policy makers would vary. In some cases, public advocacy using the media would be important. It might be, for example, that a social media campaign was deemed to have the right potential pressure decision makers. In other cases, achieving change may require a mix of public advocacy and more private or informal forms of policy influencing.

Issue-based programming requires partnerships with a wider range of partners, beyond the media. The exact mix of partners would depend on the issue, but it could include research institutes/think tanks, interested groups, traditional leaders, the churches. Because this approach would bring in a wider range of partners, we are not suggesting that MDI in its current form could adopt this approach.

There is a potential tension here, between a more issue-based approach and a commitment to editorial independence. MDI and the journalists they work with seem (rightly) cautious about appearing to be a mouthpiece for DFAT. This would ultimately undermine relationships and impact. But if the issues are carefully selected to go with the grain of local PNG views and concerns, this tension could be effectively managed.

(5) Shift towards social media, but clarity on rationale and purpose

Internet use in PNG is growing: in 2016, just 19% of the population had ever used it. By 2019, 43% said they used it occasionally (although only 10% used it daily). The expectation is that internet usage continues to grow rapidly. Some leading politicians are clearly using social media and there are signs that MPs and government are concerned about it.

Overall, there is an obvious case for MDI focusing more on social media. But the pace and purpose of that shift may require careful thought. Internet usage in PNG remains uneven, skewed towards the urban and the young. And even as that changes and more of the population start using the internet, it will not necessarily be the best medium for hosting trustworthy public discourse. There is clear recognition (see MDI 2019 focus groups) of the problem of ‘fake news’ spreading online, and traditional media is much more trusted as a source of information.

One point worth considering is adopting a differentiated use of social media at the national/elite vs. local levels. In 2016, among those who used the internet the day before the survey, 59% of rural respondents used it for social networking and just 35% for gathering news from the various PNG sources. For urban respondents, this is reversed – 55% used it for news, against 39% for social networking. That will have changed by now, and the distinction between news and networking is blurred. But it suggests that as internet reach extends into more remote parts of PNG, its primary effect could be to allow for greater communication between people rather than greater

broadcasting at people. While amongst the urban middle class it maybe that the focus is more on using social media to mount campaigns which pressure decision makers – on some policy issues, which motivate a younger and urban demographic – social media maybe the best medium. This could be linked more “issue-based” programming discussed in the previous point.

Box 2: Issue Based Approach

Some development programming now uses what is called an “issue-based” approach. For example, much recent DFID governance programming uses this approach. Key characteristics include:

- Careful politically informed selection of issues where it is judged there is some potential for achieving change. The potential for change could be because the issue is salient and matters to decision makers, because there is a potentially powerful enough coalition of interests in favour of change etc.
- Development of “change strategies” which will be tailored to the specific issue. Change strategies may involve a different mix of partners (CSOs, Businesses, Faith Groups, more elite vs community organisation etc.). They will also involve a carefully chosen mix of “influencing” activities, sometimes predominantly public advocacy, sometimes elite level “insider”, and sometimes “bottom-up” based on mobilising communities.
- Work on some issues may run for years and the “coalitions” could be relatively structured and formal. But in other cases, work could be more short-term and responsive.

Organisational capacity building is still possible as part of an issue-based programme. In some cases, by working with local partners on issues that they care about, it is possible to achieve *more meaningful capacity building* by adopting a learning through doing approach rather than a more traditional workshop and training-based model.

Media partners play a vital role in this form of programming. For example, in Zambia a DFID funded programme that the review team have experience of has a team which combines expertise in (a) media, (b) policy influencing/advocacy, and (c) polling and political analysis. This combination allows for the development of sophisticated “change strategies”, on issues with the potential for change.

(6) Better understand decision makers’ media consumption

MDI has excellent data on PNG citizens’ media use and views on governance. It has less evidence on what media decision makers consume and consider important. One option to consider would be a survey of MPs/PNG elites, which assessed decision maker media use/attitudes. There are methodological challenges, particularly with the most senior policy makers, but some pollsters/survey companies are able to get some insights into this question, or more informal approaches could be used to assess what the PNG media landscape looks like “looking out from positions of power”.

Implications for next phase of programming

The demands of achieving meaningful decision maker accountability in PNG are high. MDI continues to have much to contribute, but it is also important to be realistic. In addition, some of the future options above would involve new ways of working. For these reasons, to influence policy and hold government to account DFAT may need to consider different programme design options for the future. These could include:

(1) Option 1: A Refocused MDI, but improved links to wider DFAT government programming

This would involve MDI objectives being rationalised with a focus on extending citizen *voice*, but also clearer links between MDI and other governance programs. MDI could still adopt some useful reforms/evolutions to its work, including (i) expansion at the sub-national level, (ii) developing a partnership with the Churches, and (iii) deepening the social media focus. But for example, programs working with civil society organisations/interest groups could help generate the content on salient/topical issues which MDI and its media partners pick up and use. Achieving responsiveness from decision makers would be the goal of a wider suite of programs, rather than just that of MDI.

(2) Option 2: Splitting MDI and development of new “issue-based” policy influencing program

Recognising the Australian and PNG national interest element of the ABC’s work with NBC, MDI would be split into two separate activities. One would remain focused on achieving “voice” through the media, essentially a continuation of the traditional MDI work building on its current expansion to the broader PNG media. The second activity would be a specific governance/voice and accountability activity working with the key civil society organisations to bring about improved decision maker responsiveness. Both projects would be required to collaborate closely but would not necessarily be managed by the same entities as a question surrounds ABC’s core skill set to undertake a more extensive voice and accountability activity.

(3) Option 3: An expanded MDI, with specific accountability and policy influencing expertise

Recognising the difficulty of achieving responsiveness from decision makers, MDI could be expanded. An increased budget and reforms to the team structure could allow for the deepening of MDI’s partnerships with non-media organisations, including for example civil society organisations and interest groups with influence in PNG (the churches, NGOs such as Transparency International, think tanks etc.) Developing this wide range of partnerships would allow for a more comprehensive approach to influencing decision makers

It is also recommended that the strategically important relationship between NBC and the ABC be taken into account when considering any of these options.

Annex 1 – PNG media

Name	Proprietor	Medium + Geographical coverage
Print media		
Post Courier	News Ltd	national
The National	Rimbunan Hijau (Malaysian multinational)	national
Sunday Chronicle	Wesley Raminai published by PNG Magazines	national
Stella Magazine	Pacific Pencil	National and Pacific
Electronic media - TV		
NBC	GoPNG	National and provincial – radio and TV
EMTV	Telikom PNG through Media Niugini Ltd	38 centres across PNG via satellite Plus EMTV Online
TVWan	Digicel PNG	
Click TV aka PNG TV	Click Pacific Ltd	NCD
Tumbuna TV	D-jest Investment Ltd	Madang and Morobe
Channel 8	Digicel PNG	Cable TV provider
TV Wan Sports	Digicel PNG	Subscription
Electronic media – radio		
Hot FM	Telekom PNG	PNG wide
Legend FM	Communications Fiji Ltd	PNG wide
Yumi FM	Communications Fiji Ltd	PNG wide
Nau FM	Communications Fiji Ltd	PNG wide
FM 100	Telikom PNG	PNG wide
Lalokau FM		NC & Central
New Dawn	ABG	Buka
Online		
Loop PNG	Digicel PNG	Online
PNG Blog		Online
PNGexposed		Online
Keith Jackson and Friends	Keith Jackson	Online
PNG Attitude	Keith Jackson	Online
The Garamut	Deni ToKunai	Online
Malum Nalu	Malum Nalu	Online
My Land My Country	Scott Waide	Online
PNG News	Loop/Digicel	Online
Sharp Talk	Facebook group	Facebook
Kramer Report	Bryan Kramer MP	Facebook
Church radio		
Krai Belong Baibel Network /Bible FM	Brad and Deborah Wells, American Baptist preachers	WHP
Wantok Radio Light	PNG Christian Broadcasting Network	PNG wide
Radio Maria	World Family Radio, Catholic Church	Milne Bay, Rabaul, Vanimo, Wewak, Enmga, Lae, Mt Hagen, Kimbe, NCD.
Trinity FM	Catholic Diocese of Mt Hagen	WHP
Voice of Peter ToRot	Catholic Church	ENB
Laif FM		Wewak
2 Witnesses Radio	Sir John Pundari Foundation	NCD & Central
Hope FM	SDA	Lae and Kimbe
Kristen Radio	ELCPNG	Lae transmission and online + App
Church newspapers		
Wantok Niuspepa	Word Publishing (owned by mainline churches in PNG)	National

Annex 2 – Factors affecting V&A

Some relevant political and cultural factors for voice and accountability programming include:

(1) Dominance of informal networks of power, and predominance of Open MPs

The distinction between the formal structures and institutions, and the informal processes of power in PNG is large. The wantok system remains powerful and unlikely to change. While the majority of Papua New Guineans have a limited relationship with the state, they have strong relationships through the wantok system to “big men”.

Enhancing accountability in PNG may require going with the grain of the wantok system. For example, in the case of the political system wantok has contributed to the predominance of Open MPs, with control over budgets (the District Service Improvement Plans – DSIPs). The wantok relationship manifests itself in part through “vote buying”, but also through MPs making promises to their clans and electoral bases. It is also noteworthy that while many challenges remain, including a lack of transparency, DSIP spending was considered by some interviewees to be one of the more “functional” parts of PNG system.

(2) “Competitiveness” of the PNG political process.

In addition to Open MPs having power and control over budget, they are also subject to high levels of turnover and electoral competition. In the 2017 elections only 41% of MPs retained their seats. This is against a backdrop of high reported levels of political interest and engagement. MDI’s “PNG Citizen Perceptions of Governance and Media Engagement 2019” found that 85% of respondents “agreed” or “strongly agreed” that it is important to participate in elections and to vote. One interviewee for this review stated that “politics is the national sport in PNG”.

This high level of turnover is explained in part because of the vagaries of the electoral system – despite the introduction of Limited Preferential Voting (LPV), MPs require a low proportion of their overall electorate to secure victory. But it also implies that voters can vote out poorly performing MPs. At present the basis of any assessment of performance may be based on narrow perceptions of whether an MP has delivered for their wantok/clan, rather than a more informed view from voters on the MP’s performance. But being able to *go with the grain* of this nascent or immature “accountability relationship” represents an opportunity but one that requires careful consideration to avoid assertions of nepotism.

(3) The growing importance of sub-national centres of power

While the formal structures of the state are relatively centralised, most meaningful power – and interactions between most citizens and any form of “government” – is localised. This decentralisation is longstanding in some respects: as set out above, Open MPs have considerable power. MDI’s *PNG Citizen Perceptions of Governance and Media Engagement 2019* found higher levels of political efficacy at the local level than the national level. There are also some trends which may be increasing the importance of sub-national polls of power. As stated in DFAT’s *Strategic Framework on Engaging with PNG’s Institutions*: “Some PNG leaders are discussing federalism models for PNG. If such models gain broader traction, this may offer a way forward. Sharing more power and authority with provinces or regions may act as a stabilising force in PNG’s future.”

(4) Weak state, strong society – and the importance of churches

The weakness of the formal state structures has already been noted. In contrast, in some respects, society is strong manifesting itself in the importance of community elders, and wantok.

Non-state actors are also strong in other respects. Large private sector interests have considerable influence, particularly in the extractive sector and behind the scenes are major political players. And the churches have often stepped in where the state is weak. Much service provision is undertaken by the church and church leaders are highly trusted and influential in PNG society. One of the top “civic actions” reported in *PNG Citizen Perceptions of Governance and Media Engagement 2019 survey* was engagement with a church leader (alongside engagement with a “community elder”).

(5) National level decision maker responsiveness is particularly challenging, but possible “when the stars align”

As a result of some of the factors listed above (low capacity bureaucracy, weak party system etc) the political system struggles to generate improved policy outcomes. It is hard to forge sufficiently large/powerful groups of individuals and interests to push for positive change at the national level. Interviewees referred to individual potential “reform champions”, but, given all the countervailing pressures, they often struggle to deliver change. The obstacles to ensuring national level decision makers respond positively to external pressure are therefore unusually high.

However national level change was reported to be possible when “the stars align”: Examples of change at the national level, in which the media played a role, provided by interviewees included: (i) some fiscal and macro-economic policy decisions; (ii) forestry reform; and (iii) debates on mega project decisions. Change was reported to have happened when there is a sufficiently broadly shared agreement about a problem, a concerted focus on an issue over time, and where a powerful enough coalition of interests came together to support change.

(6) Growing middle class and demographic change

There are some underlying trends suggest that improved debate and potential national level policy change/government responsiveness may be more likely in the future. The literature and interviewees pointed to the growth of the middle class, a young and increasingly urban electorate, and the role of social media as a platform. Interviewees linked this to ongoing lively debate at the national level, in Port Moresby – including through think tanks, research institutes, and NGOs (like Transparency International PNG). The optimistic view is that these trends will both create new interests with political power, and a more informed citizenry with higher motivation and ability to hold government to account. The slightly more cautious view expressed in interviews was that even better off, urban communities remain “stuck” in the wantok system with a social pressure to look after their clans, rather than engage in wider political engagement.

(7) The current political context and 2022 election

James Marape, elected in May 2019 has a political base in the populous and politically important Highlands region. One positive view of Marape was that he is relatively “pro-reform”. He has made some moves, for example, on corruption. More generally he is seen as being potentially more connected to younger and emerging middle-class voters. A more sceptical view was that he has no clear agenda or policy arguments, and in any case the underlying structures of power in PNG are too strong.

Finally, the 2022 elections represent a potentially important moment for voice and accountability programming. Points (1), (2) and (3) above suggest that going with the grain of local context in PNG will mean thinking hard about how V&A programming relates to the election.

Annex 3 – Review questions

In line with the review’s objective and drawing on the revised approach to the review and feedback from AHC, the following questions guided the team’s assessment approach.

Issue	Questions
<p>1. Effectiveness of the current implementation approach and theory of change</p>	<p>How is the program tracking against each of its five objectives? Are there too many objectives for a program this size?</p> <p>How successful has the program been in involving mainstream media beyond NBC and utilising social media?</p> <p>Has the V&A approach been an effective means to support the goal and objectives?</p> <p>Can the program divide its effort successfully between three implementation hubs?</p> <p>What lessons can be drawn from the work conducted in the ‘district hub’ in Talasea?</p> <p>Is the current program logic and associated monitoring and evaluation framework (MEF) an accurate reflection of program implementation and is reporting generating the information required to effectively manage the initiative?</p> <p>Specifically, has it been possible to determine the level of impact made by the program?</p> <p>What strategies have been implemented to address gender and disability issues? Are there specific outcomes or impacts for women and people with disabilities?</p> <p>Are there ways gender and inclusion principles could be strengthened to increase effectiveness of the program?</p>

<p>2. Design Relevance</p>	<p>Is the program goal, overarching objective and five intermediate objectives still relevant and realistic?</p> <p>Is the V&A approach relevant to the PNG context?</p> <p>Have the program logic and MEF provided the program with the structure it needs to adapt to the evolving operating context?</p> <p>Is the project's delivery approach (conducting media training for stakeholders) realistically delivering on the goal and objectives?</p> <p>Are the current program partners the most relevant? Are there other partnerships which could be developed?</p> <p>Can social media be better leveraged/engaged to drive the program goals and objectives?</p>
<p>3. Sustainability</p>	<p>Are there sustainable strategies in place to allow PNG stakeholders to continue building on MDI's achievements after the exit of DFAT? What is the GoPNG's contribution to the current activity?</p> <p>Are their achievements from the current program that can be built upon and taken to scale?</p>

Annex 4 – Stakeholders interviewed

Name	Organisation & position	Date interviewed
AHC/DFAT		
Fiona Crockford	Former First secretary, Subnational program	18/5/20
Junita Goma	Senior Program Manager, Subnational Development	29/5/20
Jane Nohou-Illam	Subnational Development	29/5/20
Joanna Larvin	Second secretary, Public Diplomacy	25/5/20
Steve Bertram	Adviser to DCP and member of accountability program design team	19/6/20
ABC ID		
Jo Elsom	Lead ABCID	19/5/20
Vipul Khosla	ABCID Design and Evaluation	19/5/20
Rob Batten	MDI Project Director	19/5/20
Hare Haro	MDI team leader	22/5/20
Joys Eggins	MDI Research M&E	22/5/20
Abt Assocs		
Justice Gua	Abt Associates, Deputy Director, Overseas MDI and part of DCP	21/5/20
Lucy Moore	Abt Associates, M&E adviser	21/5/20
Suzanne Sjyme	Churches Partnership Program	28/5/20
Maryanne Kehalie	Churches Partnership Program	28/5/20
Caroline McGann	Abt Associates, former Senior Program Manager, DCP	3/6/20

Quality journalism & NBC Transformation		
Kora Nou	Managing Director, NBC	1/6/20
Scott Waide	Deputy Regional Head of News, EMTV	27/5/20
Paul Barker	Director, Institute of National Affairs	21/5/2020
Michael Samuga	Executive Director, Provincial Radio, NBC	2/6/20
Lyndel Melrose	Partner, Consulting Services, Deloitte, PNG	3/6/20
Innovative Content		
Domenic Friguglietti	TV Drama Investment strategy specialist and former head of ABC ID	21/5/20
Christine Peipul	Focus Marketing Solutions	3/6/20
General		
Catherine Levy	Author/researcher MDI annual report 2018-2019	2/6/20
Alex Rheeney	Adviser and editor, Samoa Observer	22/5/20
Jonathan Pryke	Director, Pacific Program, Lowy Institute for International Policy	7/5/20
Shane McLeod	Research Fellow, Australia-PNG Network, Lowy Institute for International Policy	7/5/20
Jenny Hayward-Jones	Former Director, Melanesia Program, Lowy Institute for International Policy	8/5/20
District		
Dorcas Tindri	NBC WNB, A/g director	4/6/20
Melchior Babo	Talasea District, Deputy District Administrator and chairman of DDA	28/5/20