Stocktaking Research Initiatives of Development Organizations to Work with Parliamentarians in Indonesia

Revision 14 February 2014

List of Abbreviation

ASEAN BALEG	Association of South East Asian Nations Badan Legislative (Legislative Body of the Parliament)		
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women		
CSO	Civil Society Organization		
DANINDA	Danish International Development Agency		
DPR	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat (House of Representatives)		
DPRD	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah (Regional House of		
	Representatives)		
ELSAM	nbaga Studi Advokasi Masyarakat (People Advocacy Study		
	Institute)		
FGD	Focus Group Discussion		
GAP	Gender Analytical Pathway		
IPC	International Parliamentary Commission		
IRI	International Republican Institute		
KIBBLA	Kesehatan Ibu, Bayi Baru Lahir, Bayi Dan Anak Balita (Maternal,		
VID	Infant, Child Health)		
KID	<i>Komite Indonesia untuk Demokrasi</i> (Indonesian Committee for Democracy)		
KOPEL	<i>Komite Pemantau Legislatif</i> (Legislative Monitoring Committee)		
KPI	Kaukus Perempuan Indonesia (Indonesian Women Coalition)		
KPP-RI	Kaukus Perempuan Parlemen Republik Indonesia (Women		
	Parliamentary Caucus of the Republic of Indonesia		
KPU	Komisi Pemilihan Umum (General Election Commission)		
LEAD	Leveraging and Educating Accountable Democracy		
MAMPU	Maju Perempuan Indonesia untuk Penanggulangan Kemiskinan		
	(Empowering Indonesian Women for Poverty Reduction)		
MDGs	Millennium Development Goals		
MP	Member of Parliament		
MPR	Majelis Permusyawaratan Raykat (Peoples Consultative		
	Assembly)		
NDI	National Democratic Institute		
NGO	Non Government Organization		
PROREP	Program Representasi		
UNDP	United Nations Development Program		
UNFPA	United Nations Fund for Population Administration		
USAID	United States Agency foe International Development		

Table of Content

List of Abbreviation	i
Table of Content	ii
Executive Summary	iii
1. Introduction	1
2. Women in post reform Indonesian politics	2
3. Typology and Thematic Coverage in Existing Parliamentary Support	
Initiatives	14
Typology	14
Capacity Building	14
Research and Information Support	
Networking and Advocacy	
Thematic Coverage of Existing Initiatives	
Basic Role and Function	
Public Outreach and Media Relations	19
Initiatives for women parliamentarians	20
International Comparison	
4. Lessons and Identified Gaps from Existing Support Programs	22
Lessons Learned	
Identified Gaps	
5. Conclusion and Recommendations for Possible Points of Intervention	c
for Support Program under MAMPU	
Conclusion	
Recommendations	-
<u>General</u>	
Considerations for MAMPU	
Possible points of Intervention for MAMPU Component Two	
Annex 1: List of FGD Participants and People Interviewed	
Annex 2: Summary of Parliamentary Support Initiatives Reviewed	36
Annex 3: Summary of Focus Group Discussions Notes	42

Executive Summary

The Government of Australia through the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade supported the program of Empowering Indonesian Women for Poverty Reduction or *Maju Perempuan Indonesia untuk Penanggulangan Kemiskinan* (MAMPU). Managed by Cowater International Inc., the MAMPU program is aimed to improve the welfare of poor women in Indonesia by strengthening women's and gender-interested organizations and parliamentarians in order to influence government policies and services. The program will support a selection of national and sub-national women's and gender-interested organizations and their local partners to forge coalitions with others within the public and private sectors through multi-stakeholder processes. MAMPU has two key Components of: 1) Support to partners to contribute to policy, regulatory, or service delivery reform at the national and local levels within MAMPU's five thematic areas; and 2) Support partners to work with the national and local women's parliamentary caucuses, and gender advocate male parliamentarians as a way to mobilize parliamentarians to advocate for reform.

As part of preparatory works for the detailed design of Component Two, a stocktaking exercise was carried out by *Kemitraan*, on behalf of MAMPU, with the main objective of gathering information about the lessons learned and linkage between past and existing works focusing on female and male parliamentarians and their contribution to gender-responsive policies, legislation and budgets at national and local levels.

Review of the current state-of-play of women's role in Indonesia's politics suggest that there have been notable improvement promoting women in politics although women representation in the DPR still falls short of the 30% minimum quota. Indonesian women politicians have also proven capable of holding high offices albeit imperfect track records both in policy making, and with the occurrence of several corruption cases implicating women politicians. In practice, affirmative action for women's roles in representative politics remains largely non-systemic, with recent Constitutional Court decision on judicial review of the Election Law favoring the largest number of votes over the party list, which 'accidently' weakening women's quota policies and regulations. To make the 30% quota 'enforceable', further amendment of the election law would be required in the medium term. This is with the backdrop of the on-going debate on whether central party board should hold a full control in getting candidates elected to office.

Survey of existing parliamentary support initiatives, including those specifically promoting pro-poor and gender sensitive policy agenda shows consistent typology of these initiatives. Support to political parties, elected Members of Parliaments (MPs), advocacy CSO partners, and parliament secretariats both for

capacity building, research and information, and partnership/networking are among the most common forms. Typical subjects of the support include basic roles and functions of the parliamentarians, skills in politics, pro-poor and gender sensitive policy-making processes, and public and media outreach.

Most common lessons drawn from such support initiatives are the importance of providing assistance to both politicians, their political parties, and the advocacy NGO/CSO partners, as to built a balanced capacity between the political agents, policy makers and the concerned public. Most initiatives also found that induction program and support on budgeting role are often perceived as more tangible. However, in the long-run only through political education and strengthening of analytical and information services that quality policy outcomes could be expected from the parliaments.

Views gathered from the parliamentarians and CSO partners showed a strong demand for more practical and timely support to help MPs quickly capture the substance of policy initiatives being tabled, both from pro-poor and genderdimensions, as well as from the broader public interest perspectives. Credible and timely information, regardless of sources, is proven capable of influencing legislative, budget as well as oversight policies.

Overall, support to women activists, politicians and MPs is urgently required to allow them to be effective proponents for gender-sensitive development policies and program, to make them appealing to voters, as well as to make them effective as a block of voice once they are elected into parliaments. Such support need to be broad-based and neutral and can be delivered through network of NGOs, CSOs and universities.

For the design of MAMPU Component Two a combination of establishing a facility type of operation and promoting institutional development could be considered. The facility may support partners in delivering capacity development activities, short-term induction, research and information services, and advocacy to the parliamentarians to take advantage of any reform momentum. The institutional development may be used to promote the identification of national centers of excellence for political education and parliamentary support, building and strengthening networks of gender and propoor advocacy partners, and promoting the recognition of pro-poor and gendersensitive policy achievements. Overall, MAMPU's support may be provided to broader parliamentary stakeholders beyond the women caucuses. This is to avoid the formation of formal caucus, especially at local level, becoming an objective in itself rather than as a means to advance gender-sensitive development agenda

1. Introduction

The Government of Australia through the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade supported the program of Empowering Indonesian Women for Poverty Reduction or *Maju Perempuan Indonesia untuk Penanggulangan Kemiskinan* (MAMPU). Managed by Cowater International Inc., the MAMPU program is aimed to improve the welfare of poor women in Indonesia by strengthening women's and gender-interested organizations and parliamentarians in order to influence government policies and services. The program will support a selection of national and sub-national women's and gender-interested organizations and their local partners to forge coalitions with others within the public and private sectors through multi-stakeholder processes. Within MAMPU, the organizations are expected to analyze constraints, identify and test solutions, work with the media, as well as use an evidence base to advocate for change.¹

The MAMPU program focuses on five thematic areas of: 1) Improving women's access to government social protection programs; 2) Increasing women's access to jobs and removing workplace discrimination; 3) Improving conditions for women's overseas labor migration; 4) Strengthening women's leadership for better maternal and reproductive health; and 5) Strengthening women's leadership to reduce violence against women. The program has two key Components of: 1) Support to partners to contribute to policy, regulatory, or service delivery reform at the national and local levels within MAMPU's five thematic areas; and 2) Support partners to work with the national and local women's parliamentary caucuses, and gender advocate male parliamentarians as a way to mobilize parliamentarians to advocate for reform.

As part of preparatory works for the detailed design of Component Two, research and analysis are carried out in the first 12-moth of the program period between 2013-2016. Considering that there has been considerable works undertaken to engage with parliamentarians for gender-responsive policy advocacy, a stocktaking exercise was carried out by *Kemitraan* on behalf of MAMPU with the main objective of gathering information about the lessons learned and linkage between past and existing works focusing on female and male parliamentarians and their contribution to gender-responsive policies, legislation and budgets at national and local levels.

The stocktaking includes literature review, Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) among partners and local parliamentarians, and interview with selected national legislators. Literature review was conducted by studying program documents and published reports from the donor agencies, implementing partners, and civil society of organizations. FGDs were conducted in Surabaya, Cirebon, East

¹ Term of Reference Taking Stock of Initiatives of Development Organizations to Work with Parliamentarians in Indonesia, MAMPU, October 2013

Lombok, Bandung, and Jakarta, participated by representations of various CSOs working on related issues and parliaments' members (both female and male MPs), whereas FGD in Jakarta were participated by International and National CSOs. In total 101 people contributed in the stock taking exercise, consisted of 68 CSOs activists and 33 MPs at national and local levels. Fifty three percent of the participants in this exercise are women.

This report started with an overview of the current state of play of women in politics in Indonesia providing the current problem context. The report then summarizes the typology of initiatives that support parliaments in a broader term, including few that are specifically addressing gender balanced representations. Lessons learned and gaps identified by the above initiatives and as expressed by the FGDs and interview participants are then presented as the consideration in drawing key recommendations for the detailed design of Component Two of MAMPU.

2. Women in post reform Indonesian politics

This section is an overview of the state-of-play of women's role in Indonesian politics. It is based on the literature review as well as Focus Group Discussions with CSOs and Members of Parliaments carried out during the stock taking research.

Since Reformasi, on paper there have been notable improvement promoting women in politics. Fifteen years after the *Reformasi*, which started in 1998, Indonesia has achieved significant vet continually challenged progress in its effort to implement gender-sensitive policies and service delivery in the context of its democratization. Indonesia indeed had ratified the UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women or CEDAW through Law no. 7, 1984.² The law ensures women's rights are fulfilled; one of which is the right of women in political life. Article 7 in the Law No.7, 1984 states that States Parties shall eliminate discrimination against women in political and public life, in particular guarantees for women, on equal terms with men for; elect and be elected, to participate in the formulation of government policy and its implementation, to hold public office and perform all public functions at all levels, participating in organizations and associations of non-governmentrelated political and public life. The article of this Law guarantees the right of women to vote and to be elected in the general election and also ensure that women have the right to participate in the formulation of policies that have an impact on society.

Since the 1955 election until the most recent election in 2009, the proportion of women in the national parliament continued to increase in a steady trend albeit fall short of the 30 percent quota as mandated by the most recent election Law

² Soetjipto, Ani Widyani. Politik Perempuan Bukan Gerhana; Esai-Esai Pilihan, Jakarta: Kompas, 2005.

number 10/2008 (see Figure 1). It is important to note that although the postreform election law has specific stipulation on women representation, it still fails to lift the women representation meaningfully. Because of the low number of women in the current DPR, for instance, there is no sufficient woman MPs to be spread proportionally across all parliamentary commissions (Figure 2). As a result, even in the commission overseeing women empowerment and child protection (Commission VIII), women only account for 23 percent.



Figure 1. Steadily increasing trend of women in DPR



Figure 2. Proportion of Women MPs in DPR Commissions

There have also been noteworthy gender-sensitive laws policies, institutions and capacity at national and local levels but not without challenges. There are already gender sensitive laws that have been ratified by the government of Indonesia. Those laws are: (1) Law on Population and Development of Family No. 52/2009. (2) Law on Domestic Violence No. 23/2004. (3) Law on Citizen Administration No. 23/2006. (4) Law on Political Party No.2/2011, (5) Law on Election No.8/2012, (6) Law on Trafficking No. 21/2007, and Law on Health No. 36/2009.

The Government of Indonesia has also created institutions to support the implementation of gender mainstreaming. Based on Presidential Instruction No.9/2000, the Ministry for Women Empowerment and Child Protection has been assigned as the leader for gender equality advocacy. The Ministry is also expected to give technical assistances in gender mainstreaming process, which includes three scopes: planning, implementation, and monitoring and evaluation. An analytical tool called Gender Analytical Pathway (GAP) has been developed with the assistance from Bappenas. To support this, assignment of Gender Focal Point in every ministry has been formalized³. For sub-national level, a Decree of Ministry of Home Affairs No.15/2008 which was further revised as Decree No. 67/2011 on the Guideline for the Implementation of Gender Mainstreaming in Local Development had been issued.

The instrument for gender mainstreaming has also started to be incorporated into the process of the planning and budgeting of central/national and local governments. The implementation of gender mainstreaming was also supported by the gender responsive budgeting procedure. Through the Regulation of Finance Minister No.119/2009, a guideline about drafting and analyzing the work plan and budget of state ministry/institutions for 7 ministries has been produced. The ministries include:

- 1. Ministry of Finance
- 2. Ministry of Agriculture
- 3. Ministry of National Education
- 4. Ministry of Health
- 5. Ministry of Public Works
- 6. Ministry of Women Empowerment and Child Protection
- 7. The National Development Planning Agency (Bappenas)

Through other regulations (Regulation of Finance Ministry No.104/201 and No.63/2011), the gender responsive budgeting was expanded to the other development sectors, such as social, economy and politics. For local level,

³ Kertas Kebijakan 1: Pengarusutamaan Gender

another regulation from Ministry of Home Affairs No.22/2011 on the guideline for drafting local budget year 2012 has been produced. ⁴

Despite the issuance of gender sensitive policies above, decentralization process has also witnessed the birth of local regulations discriminative against women. In 2009, *Komnas Perempuan* identified 154 local regulations that discriminate women, which then increased to 282 by 2012. From total 282 local regulations, 207 of them discriminate women on the right for freedom of expression (60 rules of regulating the dress code), reduction of the right to protection and legal certainty for criminalizing women (96 policies on prostitution and pornography), the elimination of the right to protection and law certainty (10 policies on the prohibition of close proximity commonly known as *"khalwat"* and 3 regulations on public space separation between men and women), and local policies related to curfew (38 policies).⁵

In addition, there were 7 rules regarding employment that resulted in abandonment of women's rights to protection and free from discrimination. The other 31 regulations are related to restriction of rights to freedom of religion which resulted in exclusion of minority groups, consisting of 27 restriction policies for the *Ahmadiyyah* group, 2 regulations against Christian churches, 1 rule banning *Millata Abraham* faiths in Aceh and another regarding religion blasphemy issued by the Central Government. All of these discriminatory policies consisted of 189 local regulations, 1 village by-law, 1 act, 6 Regional Head Appeal letters, 8 Regional Head Instructions, 18 Regional Head Regulations, 24 Regional Head Circulars, 28 Regional Head Decrees and 7 joint decrees.

Discriminatory policies at the local level were spread over 100 districts in 28 provinces throughout Indonesia, in which West Java, West Sumatra, South Kalimantan, South Sulawesi, West Nusa Tenggara and East Java are the 6 provinces that have the most discriminative local policies. More than half of discriminatory policies (178 policies) in the name of religion and morality were published in the period of 2003 to 2009, which were closely related to self-image building by the political elites to mobilize public support for the upcoming elections.

Based on the Focused Group Discussions conducted in Bandung, it was found that both CSOs and the parliament members (province and district level) identified the same crucial gender related problems in the area. These problems

⁴ Report of Komnas Perempuan, "Pengarusutamaan Gender dalam Kembijakan Pembangunan", by Hj. Tumbu Saraswati, SH, 13 Nov 2013. See:

http://www.komnasperempuan.or.id/2013/11/pengarusutamaan-gender-dalam-kebijakan-pembangunan/, taken on November 26, 2013.

⁵ Kompas.com, Komnas Perempuan Temukan 282 Perda Diskriminatif, Nov 2012,

http://nasional.kompas.com/read/2012/11/23/05393810/Komnas.Perempuan.Temukan.282.Perda.Disk riminatif

include: violence against women including sexual violence and domestic violence as well as violence towards overseas women migrant worker, human trafficking, high rate of maternal and children mortality. At the same time there are only few local regulations that address these problems. In 2008, the West Java Provincial Parliament (*DPRD Jawa Barat*) passed only one regulation regarding human trafficking (Bylaw No. 03/2008). There is clearly imbalance when there were less women protection regulations while more discriminative policies towards women were emerging.

Currently, many local parliaments are focused more on the "neutral" issues such as education, health, and poverty reduction. In addition, these local regulations has general content, with less attention towards women. However, there are two promising initiatives that had been implemented by the local parliament: Bylaw on maternal, infant and child health (*KIBBLA*) in the Regency of Bandung, and the pro-women budget allocation for voter education in the City of Cimahi. In East Lombok, a draft of local regulation on Child Protection, Child Trafficking, Child Abuse and Migrant Worker has been proposed by the executive branch and is now at the stage of public scrutiny. In addition, the local legislative branch has developed the draft of local bylaw on Participatory Development Planning Consultation (*Musrenbang*) which included a clause on minimum 30% women representation in the planning process.

Despite the above positive trends at local level, in Cirebon where there are many locals becoming overseas women migrant workers, the draft regulation (*Raperda*) regarding the protection of Migrant Worker has been not passed since 2005. According to some local MPs the lack of gender-sensitive local bylaws is a reflection of their lack of perspective and understanding on the subject. This is often worsened by the lack of political will from executive to mainstreaming gender in the policies, programs and budget being put forward to the local parliaments.

Indonesian women politicians have proven capable of holding high offices albeit imperfect track records. The World Economic Forum's Global Gender Gap Report of 2013 ranked Indonesia 95th out of 136 countries, the third among its ASEAN fellows after the Philippines (5) and Vietnam (73)⁶. The index measures women's economic participation and opportunity, educational attainment, health and survival, and political empowerment. Under the political empowerment indicators, Indonesia ranked 74 on the indicator of Women in Parliament in 2013 (reflecting the current seating of parliaments), significantly up from its 89th ranking in 2008 report which reflected the 2004-2009 parliamentary seating.

⁶ The Global Gender Gap Report 2013. World Economic Forum

Despite the above improvement, however, Indonesia's ranks on other key indicators for the same period experienced a significant drop with the Economic Participation and Opportunity indicator down to 103th in 2013 from 90th in 2008, the Educational attainment down to 101th from 97th; whereas Health and Survival was also down to 107th from 82^{nd7}. Although the Global Gender Gap Report is only one mechanism to analyze gender gap, its multi-year comparative picture above for Indonesia shows a mismatch between improved women political representation with the policy outcomes as reflected in the above key service delivery indicators critical for the welfare of women.

In terms of women holding the position of high offices, Indonesia has a relatively a good record with having a female head of state (from 2006-2009) as well as several female professionals holding key ministries such as finance, health, planning, trade and tourism. Indonesia's former finance minister is currently holding the position of Chief Operating Officer of the World Bank, the second in command after its President who has traditionally been held by an American male. In the composition of current parliamentary commissions, women parliamentarians remain generally under represented, although in Commission IX overseeing Health, Labor, Transmigration, Citizenship and Food & Drug, women accounts for 42.5% and also chaired the Special Committee deliberating the Health Law. This Commission also among the most prominent in producing gender-sensitive policies such as the one on dual citizenship for children of mixed marriage which have long been advocated by many female activists, and on budget allocation for health service delivery.

Despite the above achievement of women in high offices, the year of 2013 has not been a good year for the advocacy of increased women representation in politics. Contrary to the believe during the 2009 election when women candidates were considered to be less likely corrupt, the year 2013 saw several high profile women politicians implicated in major corruption cases. The above mixed record clearly suggest that female politicians are as capable yet also as vulnerable to corruption as their male counterparts, in that increasing their representation only is not sufficient. Ensuring that women politicians will have the necessary political skills and integrity are equally urgent.

Overall, policy outcomes coming out of the parliament continue to be low, with some local parliaments taking good initiatives. Based on the studies conducted by ELSAM on the DPR's performance from 2004 to 2009, 68% or around 193 of 284 bills have been ratified. Of the list of priority bills, there were actually only 47% bills successfully ratified. The remaining bills were not deliberated as the DPR members spend most of their time on their oversight function likely driven by transactional politics to increase their bargaining

⁷ The Global Gender Gap Report 2008. World Economic Forum

position with the government.⁸ Target numbers of bills ratified were not only low, but also the quality of the bills was questionable as indicated by their frequent review by the Constitutional Court.

Record of the Constitutional Court shows that since its establishment in 2003 until July 2012, the Court had annulled 322 Laws of the 460 Laws that went through judicial review on the ground of unconstitutionality. According to the previous Chair of the Court, Mahfud MD, the decreasing quality of Laws initiated by either government or DPR was because the unprofessionalism of the law makers and existing transactional politics.⁹ Since 2010, the target was also never reaching beyond 50% as presented in Table 1 below.

Based on the List of Priority Bills in 2012, of the 64 bills that were targeted to be ratified by the Government and DPR, 42 bills or 66% were initiated by the DPR. According to Indonesia Parliamentary Center (IPC), however, these bills were not supported by the proper academic papers. The situation was similar in 2013 during which 70 bills were deliberated, with 43 of coming from the DPR's initiatives.¹⁰

Year	Bills Targeted in List of Priority Bills	Bills Passed	Percentage
2010	70 Bills	14 Laws	20%
2011	93 Bills	24 Laws	26%
2012	64 Bills	32 Laws	50%

 Table 1. Comparison between Targeted and Passed Bills 2010 - 2012

Source: compiled by Kemitraan from many sources

The overall low constitutional quality and quantity of legislations produced by the DPR, according to ELSAM, also indicated that right-based approach was not well considered during parliamentary deliberation. While the DPR often put higher priority on exercising their oversight function, this too was also carried out with insufficient consideration for right-based approach as indicated by the low priority given to the handling of issues of malnutrition or access to medicine for the poor, compared to the enormous attention given to high profile cases like Bank Century.

⁸ ELSAM, ASASI Journal; Intervensi Terhadap Legislasi, 2011

⁹ AntaraNews.com, 9 Tahun MK Batalkan 322 Undang-Undang, <u>http://www.antara-</u>

sulawesiselatan.com/berita/40333/9-tahun-mk-batalkan-322-undang-undang

¹⁰ AntaraNews.com, DPR dan Ambisi Legislasinya, <u>http://www.antaranews.com/print/167650/</u>

Box 1. Good local initiative on gender-sensitive policy

In Bandung, Perda KIBBLA (local bylaw on maternal, infant and child health) was advocated by Sapa Institute -- a women organization in West Java – in 2009. Although considered still weak in socialization, there is a tendency towards positive outcomes in terms of implementation including through the issuance of implementing Regulation by the Regent.

The existence of the local regulations is considered capable of reducing maternal and child mortality in Bandung regency until 50%, when compared to before the enactment of these laws. Sri Mulyati, the Coordinator of Sapa Institute said that at the very least, the implementation of KIBBLA is a sign of gender-sensitive policy improvement. *"The score is increasing from 5.5 to 6.5 covering four points, in terms of commitment of parliament/policy makers, change people's behavior, contraceptive services, and maternal care"*.¹¹

The passage of KIBBLA bylaw is a good example of gender-sensitive policy initiative at the district level, which came into being because of strong partnership between men and women parliamentarians, local CSOs and the executive branch. Advocacy and research for this bylaw was supported by capacity building program like the LEAD program of Kemitraan, but relying on local activists and women parliamentary caucus for their delivery. In demonstrates that external capacity building and partnership support program provided through local CSO could facilitate local politicians to work together to produce gender sensitive policy outcome.

In practice, affirmative action for women's roles in representative politics remains largely non-systemic. To understand whether there has been a genuine affirmative action to ensure women's increased representation in politics, one may start by looking at party membership. In the current tenure of the central boards of major parties, the proportion of women politicians holding key positions remain marginal (Figure 3). Only 3 major parties namely: Golkar, PKB and HANURA, that have slightly more than 30% women in its party central boards.

The next important indicator on the seriousness of political parties in increasing women representation is whether they put their women candidates on top of the party list to ensure that when they do not receive enough vote to meet the threshold to be directly elected, they would still have a chance to get the largest proportion of vote that the party will distribute. This factor is important because 93% of women candidates received only less than 10 pecent of vote required compared to 85% for men candidates in 2009¹².

¹¹ Inilah.com, <u>http://m.inilah.com/read/detail/1914931/perda-kibbla-kab-bandung-dinilai-minim-sosialisasi</u>

¹² The Impact of the Decision on Most Votes on Women's Representation and Movement. Women Research Institute



Figure 3. Proportion of Women holding positions in Party Central Boards

In addition to the 30% quota for candidates required in the Election Law, the General Election Commission (KPU) had in fact issue a regulation 13/2013 which requires parties to field 30% women candidate in a *zipper system*, meaning that for every 3 elected candidates, one have to be a woman. But, with the recent decision of the Constitutional Court, which annulled an article on the determination of elected candidate based on the party list in favor of the most vote, the affirmative action put in place by the KPU regulation becomes invalid. The Court's decision is certainly important to protect citizens' constitutional right as reflected in their majority vote preference. But, this case clearly highlights the fundamental weaknesses in the current affirmative action for women representation, which is practically still non-systemic. The article on 30% quota for women candidate in the Election Law, for instance, is not supported by the necessary measures to safeguard the quota in the subsequent electoral process such as the order of candidate listing, and the seat apportionment in the case where a candidate does not get the minimum vote required.

The establishment of women caucuses provided platforms for communication, mutual support and advocacy for women politicians. To-date Indonesia has two women caucuses, the KPPI (Indonesian Women Political Caucus) and the KPP-RI (Women Parliamentary Caucus of the Republic of Indonesia). The Indonesian Women Political Caucus (KPPI) was established on 17 August 2000 as a platform for coordinating and consolidating the efforts of concerned citizens on increasing women's role in politics. The Caucus aims to

promote the independence of women politicians through the provision of capacity building in political skills, constituent relations, and leadership. The KPPI's program includes: establishing chapters in 28 provinces, training on character building, and familiarization on electoral and political processes. The KPPI works collaboratively with women politicians in the DPR, DPRD and political parties, the Ministry for Women Empowerment and Child Protection, relevant government agencies, and with the NDI and IRI with the support of USAID.

The Women Parliamentary Caucus of the Republic of Indonesia (KPP-RI) was established on 19 July 2001 as a more formal form of parliamentary caucus comprising of MPs under the Women Parliamentarians of the DPR (PP-DPR-RI) and Women Parliamentarians of the DPD (PP-DPD-RI). The vision of the KPP-RI is an accelerated Indonesian democracy implemented through a mission of increasing women participation in every public policy decision-making. The KPP-RI has a formal structure including honorary council, advisory council, and legislative, budgeting, oversight, cooperation, and public relations units, as well as dedicated secretariat staffs. In conducting its activities, the KPP-RI uses the resources provided by the Secretariats General, especially for activities within the DPR or DPD. The KPP-RI has unwritten policy of not taking support from external sources, hence never willing to become implementing agency¹³. For other activities outside the parliaments, such as for conducting training or public discussion with provincial caucuses, the KPP-RI collaborates with government agencies as well as international and national development organization partners. The KPP-RI generally prefers this model where they act as activity partner and can participate in activities organized by others as they see fit and where they are not perceived as being externally influenced¹⁴. Although the KPP-RI initially was intended to become a joint caucus between members of DPR and DPD, throughout its existence it has stronger association with the DPR. To-date noted women MP figures of the DPD had established its own caucus known as the KPP-DPD RI. This caucus is more pro-active and takes a more open approach to collaboration with external partners, including with international organizations.

Study of literatures¹⁵ indicates that the KPPI had carried out many advocacy works to provide women activists and politicians with the support they need to be able to learn and work on development issues that they can pursue in their political endeavor. The KPPI being more broad based had also demonstrated its ability to reach out to the top political leadership of major parties to promote the

¹³ Personal communication between Kemitraan research team and Staff of the KPP-RI Secretariat

¹⁴ Personal communication between Kemitraan research team with the KPP-RI Secretary General

¹⁵ "*KPPI dan Upaya Peningkatan SDM Perempuan Partai Politik*" (KPPI and Efforts to Develop Women Human Resources of Political Parties), presentation by Ratu Dian Hatifah, Secretary General of KPPI

increased role of women. The KPP-RI, on the other hand, being setup more formally within the DPR and DPD have created initial critical mass of women MPs inside the parliaments, and have started introducing gender issues in the parliamentary processes.¹⁶

Responses gathered during the FGD and interviews indicated that women activists, politicians and MPs see the above caucuses as having complimentary roles. In combination they form a support group for women politicians outside (in the case of KPPI) and inside (in the case of KPP-RI) the parliaments. Both caucuses are present only at provincial level, although their members include district level MPs. As a more formal setup, the KPP-RI is only allowed to rely only on resources provided by the secretariats and from MPs own contribution, although it welcomes joint activities supported by external partners.

There remain underlying challenges faced by women parliamentarians. Despite the above complex challenges to increase women representation in parliaments, for those who have been elected in office there remain significant challenges in their day-today political life. Feedback gathered during the FGDs with local parliamentarians and their CSO partners, as well as interview with national parliamentarians, reveals the following underlying challenges confronting the women parliamentarians:

- 1. **Balancing between politics and policy-making**: most parliamentarians are constantly faced with the dilemma between doing politics and actually making policy. Party rivalries, the difficulty to navigate complicated political economy often forced women MPs to enter into concession putting public interests as second priority.
- 2. **Substance over procedural politics**: most MPs especially those newly in office are often spending a lot of time following procedural political process with so many meetings in the working committees, organs and even factions, where in the end the very substance that s/he was advocating may be dissipating as it goes through the different streams of process. This also highlights the differing type of substantive supports that may be needed to help parliamentary organs, factions and caucuses keep track the key substance that they each advocate.
- 3. Shortage of continued mentoring, advisory and closed Technical Assistance for local MPs: while national parliamentarians are crowded by many offers of assistance, new local parliamentarians are struggling just to survive in their new roles and responsibilities vis-à-vis the demand for public service which they are closely associated with. The local parliamentarians also require more practical and often much simpler

¹⁶ Information on KPP-RI structures and activities can be accessed at kppri.dpr.go.id

advice and inputs, but they have to be available quickly as time is of essence in local public service provision.

- 4. Budgeting power as the obvious entry points with leverage but insufficiently capitalized: although MPs has legislative, budgeting and oversight functions in the public policy making process, in practice the budgeting role is more time-bound (i.e., has to be completed in any given time each year), and has immediate implication on public resource allocation and service delivery. At the same time it requires more technical analysis. Therefore strengthening MPs capacity and support system on budgeting role may give the largest impact in terms of policy outcome.
- 5. The absence of institutionalized capacity building support system for parliamentarian: it is ironic that while parliamentarian is a profession that holds a key decision making power, its entry qualification and skill development requirements are relatively lower compared to its civil service counterpart. The need for capacity building in policy-making for parliamentarians (as the public policy makers) is rarely considered as a necessary public investment. To-date there is still no dedicated budget allocated for capacity development of parliamentarians, especially at the local level where it is needed the most.
- 6. **Classroom training is not effective and too time consuming**: many MPs interviewed during the study highlighted the demanding work schedule put upon them. Expecting the MPs to attend classroom type of training may be unrealistic, while providing more practical (tips and trick) but deeply substantive advisory may be more appropriate.
- 7. Continued political consolidation means no guarantee for reelection, hence may give little incentive to perform: the on-going political consolidation where party politics and electoral reform is yet reaching a balance means that MPs are torn between being loyal to the party versus to the voters. An MP may choose to prioritize the interest of party leadership in the hope that s/he be re-nominated by the party as top candidate in the next election, potentially sidelining public interests. Continued support for skills development on genuine constituent relation including using the media is urgently needed. Such skills include understanding people's aspiration, and determining priority public policy. Over time such skill will build the confidence of the MP that only through prioritizing public interest that s/he will have better chance to get reelected, and hence becoming the party's political asset.
- 8. Lack of understanding on policy options beyond hierarchical regulatory system: many MPs and their counterparts in the executive branch typically cannot distinguish between legislation as an act of legalizing public policy, and a law as one of the products of a legislative process. A lot of energy was spent on producing laws and bylaws, not

much on implementing them. Occasional exposure to international experiences for both MPs and their executive counterparts on different policy-making experiences to address cross-cutting subjects such as gender may be useful in helping the MPs from getting trapped into nomenclature and semantics.

9. **Caucuses are seen as another parliamentary organs:** experience from the interaction within the two existing women caucuses, the KPI and KPP-RI, suggests that there is a perception that caucus is another form of parliamentary organ that has to be formalized and given specific mandates. The FGDs in the regions reveal that there have been no women caucus formed at local level mainly because local MPs are waiting for some sort of official formation of the caucus, instead of naturally forming alliances among diverse political forces who advocate for common cause. It would be important to correct this misconception in subsequent parliamentary support initiatives.

3. Typology and Thematic Coverage in Existing Parliamentary Support Initiatives

This section is drawn from the literature review mainly from the project documentations of the existing parliamentary support initiatives. The section on Typology looks at common structures and approaches applied by the initiatives and how they performed. The section on Thematic Coverage looks at the topical subjects being covered by the initiatives and the rationale behind their selections. An international comparison is presented using the program in Timor Leste as comparator. The selection of Timor Leste is based on consideration that there are relatively sufficient information on the support initiatives in the country, and that Timor Leste as a newly independent nation is entering a new era of democratization where comprehensive external supports are still at play.

Typology

Capacity Building

Most initiatives started from providing induction and capacity building training to elected parliamentarians. After the first general election in 1999, Indonesian parliamentarians were generally more open to receive external assistance. Hence, donor and NGOs started to consider this opportunity as they formulated projects/program arrangements and the conditions of the assistance. From our study, in terms of capacity building, a lot of support have been given to MPs, both male and female, to increase their competence to function effectively.

To give an example, following the first democratic election in 1999, the National Democratic Institute (NDI) conducted a two-year program (2000 -2002) to increase the ability of political parties and individual MPs at the national level (BALEG, Commission in Parliament/DPR) to play a meaningful role in public debate, allocation of public resources, government oversight, policy development, and how to conduct legislative affairs in an ethical, responsive and

transparent manner. The methods of the capacity buildings applied by the NDI were technical assistance for both national and local parliaments as well as for the Association of DPRD Kota and Kabupaten, research and information services, technical support to MPR Working Committee on Constitutional Amendments, and constituency outreach for MPs. NDI continued their works in 2005 – 2007 organized trainings through the Personal Assistant Communication Forum of the DPR, an organization representing the personal staff of DPR members were also provided. Furthermore, NDI continued its ongoing relationship with the DPR Public Relations Bureau (HUMAS) and used the opportunity provided by the Civic Info Fair to undertake a consultation on media strategy with the head of the Public Relations Bureau and the head of the Bureau of Press Relations.

With the support of the Government of Norway, the Asia Foundation (TAF) implemented a project on Increasing Women's Political Participation and Strengthening Good Governance in Indonesia from 2007-2010. The project has two core objectives: 1) reducing barriers to women's political participation, and 2) Strengthening capacity and skills of women in politics. It covered four provinces including Jakarta, Aceh, East Java and South Sulawesi. Under its second objective, the project carried out training for prospective women candidates on basic political skills, and training for women parliamentarians on democratic values and accountability.

Few initiatives moved upstream to support political education to citizen, *political activists and party members.* Although many NGOs and donors realize that fundamental change can only occur through longer-term political and civic education, only few moved to this upstream domain. Among the most notable initiative is that of the Komite Indonesia untuk Demokrasi (KID - Indonesian Committee for Democracy) who established, among others, Democracy School, Political Party Consultation, and Community Committee. This program covers the broader spectrum of active party members, political activists, and community at large. The KID Democracy School (Sekolah Demokrasi-SD), for instance, had established 6 branches stretching from Aceh, South Sumatera, Banten, East Java, West Kalimantan, South Sulawesi, East Nusa Tenggara, and Papua. Jointly with Kemitraan's LEAD Program, the SD had trained more than 90 'students' with 25 percent of them women. Not all of SD's alumni, however, are bound to be politicians. In fact, large proportions of the student were citizens, students or professional who became aware of politics and how to contribute their respective roles in building a healthy political and democratic life.

The UNDP implemented a Civic Engagement in Democratic Governance (CIVED) project between 2006-2009, aimed at promoting greater civic awareness and encouraging citizens' day-to-day political participation beyond regular election cycle. The project promoted civic awareness through media campaign and the use of ambassadors drawn from among music celebrities to promote the

message, as well as dialogue and student video competition. Although the project was designed to address broad civic awareness, its relatively small funding (\$724,775) and the choice of implementing agency (i.e., the Ministry of Home Affairs – who is perceived more as traditional regulatory government authority) may have hindered its full potential from reaching broader civic spectrum.

Kemitraan under the LEAD program also implemented the WOMEN project promoting women political leaders by providing different levels of support to women politicians since they are entering politics as activists or party members, until they became candidates and elected MPs. The project use a network of local NGOs and working in 4 regions including West Java, Yogyakarta, North Sulawesi and Bali. Support provided includes advocacy on women's in politics, gendersensitive and pro-poor policy, and political skills building.¹⁷

Research and Information Support

Advisory, information and research supports provided through parliamentary secretariats and political assistants are seen as logical entry points. Some international organizations and national NGOs had conducted research to support MPs including women parliamentarians in fulfilling their tasks. This technical assistance on research was needed by the MPs due to the limited resources in P3DI, the research, and information unit of the DPR. The theme of the research depended on which DPR's commission was receiving the assistance. The theme of the researches could also depend on the issue being promoted or pushed forward by the NGOs.

The importance of good research support, such as the one conducted by Puskapol UI, resulted in the strong advocacy for articles in the Election Law which put women candidates on the top of party ballot lists. UNDP through PRIDE (Parliamentary Reform Initiative and DPD Empowerment) provided assistance to the DPD through Research and Analysis on organizational structure and procedural framework. The research provided assessment on ideal bicameral system for Indonesia and developing working mechanism for DPD secretariats in provinces. UNDP also provided research on how to improve DPD accountability system and strengthen performance-based management. The Netherlands Embassy & DANIDA partnering with *Kemitraan* implemented MDGs program aimed to speed up MDGs achievement. This program developed women leadership model though research and established knowledge center management for women leadership. Another initiative by local NGO in Cirebon, JIMAT, provided data from their research for MPs who advocates for local regulation on anti human trafficking.

¹⁷ Enhancing Women's olitical Leadership in the Policy Making Process. Project Fact Sheet, Kemitraan

Many of the funding agencies usually channeled their funding through grants for national research institutions. However, some of the international NGOs conducted their own researches to support the MPs in their legislation function.

Networking and Advocacy

Supports provided to activists and NGOs in key legislative, budgetary and oversight initiatives are effective approach to safeguard public inputs. Another types of support for women in parliament provided by donor or NGOs involved activity in creating partnership and networking. In most cases, these activities engaged MPs to enlarge their current networks to different organizations, communities, or government, sometimes on selected issues. One of the example coming from *Komite Pemantau Legislatif* (KOPEL) who has developed one program which was aimed at building partnership among government, parliament and civil society to support pro poor and gender responsive budget. This was implemented in 2008 to 2010 in four areas in South Sulawesi: Makassar, Bantaeng, Luwu Timur and Tanah Toraja.

Another type of partnership and networking as implemented by USAID through ProRep (Program Representasi) is to encourage MPs to interact with their nontraditional basis. Prorep with their *Jabat* initiative aims to strengthen relationship between MP and their constituents. *Jabat* involves 17 MPs and half of them are women. This activity connects MPs and their new networks in their electoral districts (Dapil) as the new constituents. Partnership and networking were made especially during recess visits when they reach new communities and organizations to cooperate and to follow people aspirations.

The International Republican Institute (IRI) worked on facilitating the communication forum in the provincial level to discuss the issues based on the needs of each province or based on the issues that are being pursued at that time. The forum consists of MPs, CSO members, and party representatives. The importance of this kind of forum was confirmed by the result of the research conducted by Puskapol UI, which suggests that MPs who have better communication with women's mass organizations/CSOs has successfully established and maintained the women parliamentary caucus of West Java. It also promoted the importance of increasing the capacity of the CSOs on the strategic issues, in particular in the issue of electoral politics and understanding the policy making process.

From the information extracted from FGDs, some initiatives have been implemented by CSOs to support women parliamentarians with reported positive results. These initiatives includes: (1) discussion forum of women parliamentarian across political parties (KPP-RI), (2) informal meeting between CSOs and members of parliament to advocate and monitor strategic issues, (3)

presentation of research on women's rights to MPs through a brief and simple messages, and (4) facilitation of informal meeting to discuss women's issues. Overall, many parliamentarians still consider the NGO's advocacy more as public pressure instead of source of policy inspiration.

Thematic Coverage of Existing Initiatives

Basic Role and Function

Basic role and function of parliamentarians continue to be essential subjects. Since the first post-reform general election in 1999, capacity building on the subject of basic role and function of parliamentarians has become a crucial subject. In 1999, the parliamentarians were for the first time having genuine representation and legislative roles as compared to the rubber stamp parliaments during the New Order era. International organizations such as NDI, UNDP, GTZ and USAID were among those who provide early capacity building support on lawmaking, budgeting and oversight. Constituent relations critical to the main role of the parliamentarians which is representation was also a common subject, and continue to be important even for the MPs elected in 2004 The difference between the deliberation procedures of acts and 2009. originating from the parliamentary initiatives versus those proposed by the Government, for example, forms the majority of the content for the legislative training. The challenge for improving the existing practice is of course the fact that any process within a parliament as a political institution is inherently a reflection of compromising interests. Therefore, as MPs are getting more experienced in making political compromise, capacity building on this subject becomes even more important to ensure that these basic roles and functions are undertaken with high degree of integrity.

Most parliamentarians appreciated support to improve political skills. An interesting revelation gathered during the FGDs with local parliamentarians was the fact that many of them lack the basic political skills to understand issues, determine policy position, and negotiate them with differing opinions, and compromise for acceptable policy options. Several local first time parliamentarians admitted that they were initially confused as to what's going on around them. Several suggested that navigating between their own political conscience, their party line, and even sometimes to what they believe is part of money politics, is a major challenge. Recent corruption cases implicating parliamentarians indeed were originated from the lack of understanding among the newly elected members between what is required, what is typically acceptable practice, versus what is legally prohibited. In a political institution where decisions have legal and financial ramifications, such confusion may lead to policies that are in fact damaging the public's interests. In response to ths type

of challenge the Asia Foundation, for example, provided training for prospective women candidates on political skills such as bargaining with political parties for party nominations and seats; political mapping and networking; campaign management, finance, and fundraising; recruiting campaign volunteers; developing political platforms that are engaging and responsive to voter needs; articulating and disseminating political messages; and communication and media interaction.

Political Leadership and Gender-sensitive Policy Making

Political leadership, pro-poor and gender-sensitive budgeting are important subjects. Beside NDI, other organizations including UNDP-Indonesia, Komite Pemantau Legislatif (KOPEL), International Republican Institute (IRI), Kemitraan, UNFPA, the Asia Foundation, and Chemonics/USAID provided supports were targeted to women candidates and women MPs. In 2008 -2009 implemented program on "Advancing Women's Kemitraan Political Representation" designed to increase women's participation in national, provincial and city/regency parliaments using methods of civic advocacy, public campaign for women candidates, multi stakeholders coordination. This was followed by the continuing program under theme of "Enhancing Women's Political Leadership in the Policy Making Process" in 2010 – 2014 with objectives to strengthen political leadership of women in promoting the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). In aligning with this program, Kemitraan together with three national NGOs, conducted one project of "Achievement of MDGs Through Good Governance" aiming to speed up the achievement of MDGs in eight provinces with activities of building capacity of local governments and civil society networks in achieving MDGs and policy advocacy to create pro poor and gender policies as well as gender responsive budgeting at local level. Despite the various capacity building supports, gendersensitive policy remains a subject that is not easy to comprehend.

Public Outreach and Media Relations

Public and media relations are favorite subjects especially if accompanied by practice. Working with media has always been one effective tool for MPs to distribute information about their works and at the same time allows MPs to receive updated information regarding crucial issues in their electoral district. Within *Jabat* initiative, MPs have been encouraged to make connection with media. Usually MPs will arrange meetings and have dialogue with media during recess visit. Another activity with media involves an arrangement with local radio or community radio. For example MP Eva Kusuma Sundari is successfully working with several radios in her electoral district, Blitar, Kediri and Tulungagung. Her radio program was live discussion and dialogue segmented youth and particular community. The dialogue program discussed various topics at national or national level.

The Asia Foundation took different approach through its program, "Increasing Women's Political Participation and Strengthening Good Governance in Indonesia" that aim to increase awareness of women and broader community on the importance of women representation in the parliaments through the use of media. The program mobilized broad public support for women in politics by providing women candidates the opportunity to take their message to the public through candidate debates in East Java and South Sulawesi. The debates received much media coverage due to their popularity. Over a hundred of radio stations aired women campaigns and thousands of brochures were also distributed.

Meanwhile, based on our finding from the FGDs in Lombok, Bandung, Cirebon and Surabaya, media has been considered as effective tool used by both MPs and CSOs. Some MPs often utilize media as a method to grow their self-image in the eyes of public. They learned that to raise and sound the important issues to the public sphere as well as to bring their statements, they have to work with media, both local and national. For example, CSOs in Lombok and in Jakarta had involved media to advocate local regulations on participative development system. Usually, the CSOs conducted hearings, followed by personal approach to MPs and related commission, and then contacted the media to communicate the issues of concern. Women MPs in Bandung and Cimahi had also been using media – radio and local newspaper – to throw their ideas and opinion on pertinent topics in their regions. Media also helps to set up agendas and public opinion on the policy issues. Currently, social media, such as facebook and tweeter, are popular among MPs and political members to communicate with public, disseminate and "market" themselves and their programs. One male MPs, FGD's participant even developed his own website to reach out to his constituents and public in general.

Initiatives for women parliamentarians

There are several initiatives covering special subjects that find relevance for the women parliamentarians. The literature review and FGDs carried out also found several initiatives undertaken by CSOs or Parliaments that specifically support especially women MPs. These activities include:

(1) Dissemination of book which contains best practice or lesson learned in conducting effective parliamentary recess provided by *Jabat* Initiative by ProRep project. The initiative supported MPs in conducting effective recess and the results compiled into two types of book, one aimed for MPs and the other for public. The book contains best practices of recess visit that could be replicated by current or future MPs.

(2) Women Knowledge Center: Through WOMEN project under LEAD, Kemitraan establish women knowledge/resource center in 4 provinces: Bali, North Sulawesi, Jogjakarta, and West Java. This forum which functions as peer-to-peer forum aimed to strengthen women MPs network in achieving MDGs policies. The forum is not exclusive only for women MPs, but also open to participations by CSOs, activists and academicians.

(3) Support for community-based monitoring, such as for the KIBBLA Bylaw in Bandung. Kemitraan through LEAD, particularly the WOMEN project, developed a community-based monitoring system to ensure the implementation of such law This initiative focused on monitoring system consisted of several activists who monitor actively and intensively the implementation of gender-sensitive policies.

(4) Public support for candidates with a good track record to win seats in the election: this initiative is known as public campaign to promote women candidates. Kemitraan with the support of DANIDA carried out this public campaign during the 2009 election. Through a public rally followed by 100 women as participants, the initiative tried to influence people to vote for women candidates.

[5] Training for elected women parliamentarians: the Asia Foundation provided training to MPs in the provinces and at the national parliament on the subjects of democratic values and accountability, legislative drafting, budgeting, effective oversight and communications.

International Comparison

Comparable international initiative which provides comprehensive support to parliament and their women members has similar typology and general thematic coverage. In Timor Leste, the UNDP provided a comprehensive support program on Strengthening Parliamentary Democracy, with funding from multi-donor including Australia, Norway, Sweden and Italy, while another program supporting Strengthening of Institutional Capacity of National Parliament is funded by the European Union. The first program provides capacity building support on legislative process and oversight role for the MPs at the same time supports the strengthening of the secretariat, and promoting transparency and accountability. The second program supports the strengthening of parliamentary administration in providing non-partisan support, capacity building of legislators, their staffs and civil servant as well as national experts on legal drafting, and mobilizing external support from CSOs, and promoting inter-parliamentary relations.

On gender mainstreaming, the UN-WOMEN provided support to the civil society and the government to place gender equity in the country's development agenda, and to promote women's leadership in policy making and politics. The program also conducted study on violence against women to understand the causes and the services (or lack thereof) provided to the violence victims. ¹⁸

The above international comparative examples are consistent with the typology and overall thematic areas of support in Indonesia. Capacity strengthening of the politicians, the institutional support system like the secretariat (especially their research and information function), and the broader external and CSO partners are as equally important. Basic political role and functions of MPs, political and policy-making skills, as well as public outreach and accountability are also considered as key components of the support package.

4. Lessons and Identified Gaps from Existing Support Programs

Based on the above overview of the state-of-play of women in Indonesian politics and the review of the existing support initiatives, both of which are based on combined literature review and FGDs, several key lessons as well as identified gaps in parliamentary support are outlined below.

Lessons Learned

- a. In reality **political parties cannot be considered as a fully honest broker of political education** because of their inherent vested interest to win power. Although the development of representative politics cannot be achieved without strengthening the quality of the political parties, the process of their capacity building cannot be undertaken as a standalone effort. Training of members and cadres of political parties cannot be done in isolation, as it may be perceived as giving advantage for some and not the others. Instead it needs to be done in parallel and within the broader political education program. Review of the Asia Foundation's Increasing Women's Political Participation project, for instance, suggests that elected women MPs who gained from the project's activities (the promotion of women political participation as well as from capacity building programs) had been the elite groups, who often comprised of people closed to the party leaderships such as their friends or relatives.
- b. External support to MPs whether it's direct or through intermediary NGOs is always perceived as political interventions/influencing. No matter how subtle the approach taken by an externally funded support program for the parliamentarians, it will always be seen as potentially

¹⁸ UN WOMEN Timor Leste Fact Sheet

intervening in the internal matters of the country. However, national NGOs are often considered as important political counterbalance forces even by the politicians in the parliaments. Therefore, it is important to strengthen partners such as national NGOs/CSOs especially to play a role as effective knowledge and information intermediaries.

- c. Induction program, however well designed, is more like a retrofitting approach. Induction is an effort to work with what exists rather than to build a strong foundation of qualified policy makers. It can be an effective way of engaging newly elected MPs, but unless it is followed up by continued technical assistance advisory/mentoring and advocacy throughout the MPs tenure -, its potential positive influence may be too weak as compared to the day-to-day political temptation that the MPs will be confronted with. Induction also cannot be expected to significantly change the quality of the politicians if their entry requirements are already low.
- d. **Providing effective and scalable support to nearly 500 local parliaments with most of their members being novice politicians is an enormous challenge**. It will be important to build some sort of parliamentary resource centers, preferably in neutral but reputable academic institution that can service MPs across Indonesia including with funding from the secretariat budget. While there are many local CSO partners who are dedicated to supporting parliamentary capacity building, experience from the WOMEN project of Kemitraan indicated that some of the local CSOs are too small to be able to invest and maintain their intellectual resources (i.e., experts and facilitators).
- e. **Training on very basic political skills is un-admittedly in high demand**. Although most MPs will not admit that they need training on basic political skills such as picking an issue, determining position, negotiating and making compromise for acceptable policy options, they appreciated support which helps them exercise these skills. Many local MPs participated in the FGDs for this stocktaking research indicated that they need a very basic support just to be able to understand the political dynamics and processes occurring around them. While initiatives such as Sekolah Demokrasi of the KID provided political training and the Asia Foundation's project build political skills of women candidates, their alumni may not get elected and those elected may never received prior political skills training.
- f. Capacity building to support budgeting role have the most demonstrable impact (and in highest demand), but in the long run support needs to cover the entire policy spectrum. Many MPs admitted that they are often in the dark when reviewing budget proposal submitted by the executive branch. At the same time recent corruption case by

parliamentarians involved collusive 'budget engineering'. It is therefore important to consider capitalizing on the budget policy making capacity building to both increased skills, achieve concrete policy outcome (i.e., propoor and gender-sensitive resource allocation), and prevent corruption. However, in the long run, capacity building in a broader public policy making, including through legislation and oversight, would be the key.

Box 2. Lessons from Kemitraan's WOMEN project and LEAD program

Right before the 2009 election, *Kemitraan* formulated a comprehensive program on building substantive democracy in Indonesia through a program called LEAD. Under the program, support is provided for electoral reform, political education, political party reform, capacity building of parliamentarians, integrity system in civil service, and decentralized service delivery.

One project under the LEAD is on women political representation and women political leadership in the achievement of MDGs. The program was designed with the full spectrum considered since political education, capacity building for political activists and party cadres, advocacy for women representation in parliaments, capacity building and analytical and information support for elected MPs on pro-poor and gender-sensitive policy making. While design could be perfect, quality implementation will depend on the capacity of partners and the politicians in undertaking the right intervention. *"There were too many variations on the interpretation of the program and even gender-sensitive concept by the partners"* said Utama Sanjaya the Chief of Democratic Governance Cluster of Kemitraan.

Preliminary evaluation of the program suggests that the large spectrum of the program and the political dynamics in the institutions involved made the implementation becoming non-linear. There are still too many unknown while partner institutions had weak resource capacity to maintain their presence. As democratic consolidation is a long-term process, capacity building investment is consequently a long-term investment. For this, perhaps it is time for Indonesia to have one of its leading and reputable state institutions of higher learning (i.e., state university) to take up the challenge of becoming the anchor for political education and capacity building for the country. We may only need one anchor, but it needs to be stable and stay in the business for long-time.

Identified Gaps

Gap in existing capacity development support. The core functions of DPR members are legislation, budgeting, monitoring, selection of public officials, and giving recommendation to President for certain tasks. Even though some members of DPR have already had the capacity and competence in completing their tasks, they often need to have supports on specific expertise. For that reason, an established expertise support system is needed. Even though, there are already support staff and expert staff for MPs, not all of them have the

qualifications to assist their own MPs. The Law No. 27/2009 has mandated the development of functional/expert team and increasing their competence through better coordination, recruitment system, mechanism and working procedure, career system and remuneration system.¹⁹

As mentioned previously, there are several types of capacity development conducted by local and international NGOs for parliamentary support program in Indonesia. The Secretariat General of DPR RI usually conducts an orientation program, which includes the core functions of MPs in the beginning of their term. Most of the additional capacity developments from the local or international NGOs for MPs are skills to support these core functions. However, once elected the MPs usually have limited time to participate in the capacity building training. Some of the capacity development has therefore gone to the support staff of the MPs with the hope that they will become the conduit for quality information to support the policy making. Until such time when parliamentary staffers become a professional career, this capacity building program will continue to face the challenge of achieving sustainability.

Gap in Research and Information Support. For research, DPR Members are supposed to get the support from the P3DI (*Pusat Pengkajian dan Pengolahan data dan Informasi* (Center for Research and Data and Information Management). The P3DI currently has 41 researchers and 42 administrative staffs under the Secretary General of DPR RI. The researcher should theoretically support individual legislator or the heads of factions, commissions and committees. They are different from the personal staff (*staf pribadi* or *asisten pribadi*) and expert staff (*staff ahli* or *tenaga ahli*) who are attached to individual MPs.

Researchers conduct studies and analysis on current issues and produce books, reports and academic papers on draft bills. Upon the request of DPR members, researchers of P3DI also prepare papers and speeches for official duties and personal needs in some cases. Members can utilize the products of P3DI and request its services through its head. Some members have developed personal relationships with researchers and therefore they often direct their requests directly to certain researcher.

According to many members interviewed in this study, some services provided by staff at the DPR do not correspond to the needs of the legislators, their factions, commissions and committees. Due to the ambiguity of reporting responsibility of P3DI, the researchers are not directly accountable to the legislators on the quality of their research products. This can lead to a mismatch between the research conducted and the actual needs of the MPs. Researchers often produce products that do not provide timely information that has practical

¹⁹Ibid, page 35

benefit to house members. Even based on the informal survey of parliamentarians, it showed that 63% of the respondents do not know of P3DI's existence.

As a result, many DPR members conduct their work without sufficient data, analysis and information. The survey also found that 75% of the respondents feel they do not have sufficient information to make decisions. Members very often have to use personal resources to receive information needed²⁰.

Box 3. Good information and research, regardless of source, is key to decision making

As mentioned by Sumarjati Aryoso, women MP from Gerindra Fraction, "Data support through evidence based researches is needed in order to produce the right decision"²¹. This statement also came from Abdul Malik Haramain, MP from National Awakening Party (PKB) who believe on different perspective that can be obtained through research. "Papers and researches from NGO will give us an alternative perception. Changing our attitude significantly"²².

Some MPs believe that CSOs can play an important role to work together with parliament with evidence-based research as a way. One of success story reflected in Bandung in the deliberation process of local regulation on Maternal, Infant, Child Health. Sapa Institute is one of the NGO that advocate this local regulation consistently. As mentioned by Sri Mulyati from Sapa Institute, Sapa Institute was working through researches on maternal mortality causes before developed academic paper as a baseline of that local regulation. They advocated these baseline facts to the parliament. Subsequently, parliament ratified this local regulation with Sapa Institute's inputs written in the regulation. Unfortunately, the parliament not considred all recommendation submitted by Sapa Institute.

"The shortcoming is the local governments and legislators do not want to include the particular percentage of the budget for maternal and child health, because there is no rule in national level that ensures the budget for maternal and child health. The second shortcoming is related to law enforcement mechanism", Sri Mulyati Said²³.

Despite the existing technical assistances on research directly provided to MPs or prepared by P3DI and national or international NGOs, many research have not been utilized well by the MPs for several of reasons. According to one MP as they

²⁰Towards a More Effective Indonesian House of Representatives: Options for Positive Change by Legislators, NDI, Jakarta, 2005

²¹ Kemitraan's Interview Trancript with Sumarjati Aryoso

²² Kemitraan's Interview Trancript with Abdul Malik Haramain

²³ FGD Result in Bandung City, November 14 2013

have limited time to study thick reports, it was suggested that research findings are presented in a more concise format rather than a full academic papers. On the other hand, NGOs often has limited capacity to do proper research, and there is also very limited qualified policy research institution in Indonesia especially on strategic issue such as women in decision making positions.

Gap in partnership and networking support. Based on the recent research conducted by Kemitraan on the comparison of the women parliamentary caucus of Indonesia and Timor Leste, it was found that women representation in politics in both countries are still descriptive, not yet substantive. In other word, they failed to move from formalities and procedural processes to representative substance on gender. Both caucuses, however had successfully produced regulations which support more women in politics, but not yet enable them to produce gender sensitive regulations.²⁴

There are presently no formal linkages between women representatives working at different levels of government. The establishment of the network which is vertically linked with women representatives at the local, sub-national and national level would aid in strengthening the capacities and collectivity of women representatives. Through such a network, women representatives can create their own power base and help one another to push the gender equality agenda in parliamentary work.²⁵One of parliamentary support program of UNDP has successfully initiated facilitation the network between the national women parliamentary caucus with the local one. Other national or international NGOs has also supported either national or local women parliamentary caucus. However, this kind of supports are not long term. They need to seek a more established financial supports such as from the parliamentary secretariats.

Issue-based cross-party caucuses for the promotion of gender equality and women's empowerment should also to be established. When women identify and mobilise around a common concern, they are in a better position to achieve their goals.²⁶Some of the women parliamentary activists who are not active in KPP-RI become part of these kind of caucuses, such as Parliamentary Caucus for Myanmar, Caucus for MDGs, etc. Lastly, inter-parliamentary networking of Indonesian women parliamentarians within the region and with developed democracies in the world may provide them with the opportunity to share experiences and enhance their knowledge about effective strategies that have been used by women legislators in other countries to promote and protect women's interests through legislation and public policy.²⁷

²⁴ ibid

²⁵ Women's Political Participation in Politics and Government in Indonesia, UNDP, 2010

²⁶ Ibid

²⁷ Ibid

5. Conclusion and Recommendations for Possible Points of Interventions for Support Program under MAMPU

Conclusion

- Indonesian women politicians have proven to be capable of holding public offices although their proportional representation continued to be low. To achieve the minimum 30% quota of women in parliaments, Indonesia needs both affirmative regulatory framework and capacity development to ensure increased representation.
- The existing women parliamentary caucuses played the role more as a support group for women politicians rather than as political alliance or force for gender-sensitive policy advocacy. The women parliamentary caucuses are mainly setup at provincial level, and not at the district. Women caucus at the province usually includes women MPs from the district level. The provincial women parliamentary caucuses have yet act as pioneer to promote gender sensitive policy.
- Existing support initiatives to parliaments provided the impetus for more systemic capacity building, policy advocacy, research, and networking approach to promote better policy outcomes as reflected in the representation, legislative, budgeting and oversight roles of the parliaments. These supports were either provided through the parliament secretariats and internal supplemental structure, or through NGO/CSO partners who are considered as neutral intermediaries.
- Most Member of Parliament both at national and local level are quite conversant on local issues. Most of problems encountered by MPs in their electoral districts are about issues on education, economic, health, unemployment and infrastructure. Local MPs need practical examples on how gender can be mainstreamed in the policy, budgeting and oversight processes in these sectors.
- Given the right support from the civil society and development partners, local parliaments are capable of producing gender-sensitive policy and program such as the experience KIBBLA in Bandung.Support to women legislative candidates is best provided during the campaign period of the legislative elections, and by providing training to women activists in the political parties. Experiences from previous initiatives suggest that such support could be made neutral and broad based (including to local CSOs and activists) providing equal opportunity to all interested politicians.

Recommendations

<u>General</u>

- Existing networks of women representatives should be supported and strengthened. Currently, two women's caucuses, the Women Parliamentary Caucus of Indonesia (KPP-RI) and Women Political Caucus (KPI) of Indonesia are working in Indonesia. These caucuses need to become effective support group for women MPs to be more pro-active and confident in advocating gender-sensitive legislation, budgets, and greater oversight roles in governance.
- In order for sound policies to be introduced and deliberated, the role of caucuses must be further enhanced. Improving the leadership composition and less attention towards the institutionalization of the caucuses must be considered. The main reason the caucuses are ineffective is the over emphasis of the formalistic nature of the caucuses itself. More work must be done to ensure that the caucus has clear policy agendas and strategies to achieve such agenda that can be agreed by all the members from different political background.

Considerations for MAMPU

- As part of MAMPU, efforts could be undertaken to enhance the NGO's capacity to provide better supporting system to the Parliament. Both sides must be made aware of the mutual benefits that they'll receive. The types of supporting role that NGOs can provide may include among others, providing research-based data for policy making process, providing technical assistance in the capacity building process, and conduct public campaign on specific issues.
- Many programs have been conducted with the aim of enhancing the capacity of Parliamentarians in executing their legislative, budgeting, and oversight role. In most of these programs, the activities are conducted through the conventional in-class training method, although its effectiveness is questionable. For the purposes of MAMPU's program, it is recommended a more effective and innovative approach to capacity building must be considered. This may include mentoring during recess, policy dialogue and debates on practical gender-issues using role play, study visits to specific gender case areas.
- Considering that the lack of advocacy on the issues of promoting and empowering women's is due to the NGOs' weak capacity and specialization on the subject, it is important for the MAMPU program to

provide more in-depth knowledge to both MPs and their NGO partners on a range of issues. These may include increasing women's representation at the private sector, entrepreneurship, expanding and widening women's access to microfinance, providing technical assistance to startup and expand small and medium enterprise, and for access to the markets. These issues can also be integrated to the MAMPU's five thematic areas.

- Besides targeting Women Parliamentary Caucus, MAMPU should also build cooperation with parliament secretariats (especially the one at local level), and with supplemental internal structures such as Legal Bureau for policy formulation, as well as with budgeting council to secure budget commitment for capacity building.
- MAMPU could consider providing initial intervention by training women legislative candidate or women activist in political party so that they can use gender as their platform and subsequently advocate gender sensitive policy when they are elected. Such support, however, needs to be broad based and neutral, delivered through NGO/CSO and university partners.

Possible points of Intervention for MAMPU Component Two

a. Establishment of support facility providing seed funding for 4 priority streams:

1-capacity building support to political parties for their women cadres,

- 2-induction programs for elected MPs on gender-sensitive policy making,
- 3-parliamentary resource centers on gender-sensitive issues and the corresponding types of policy initiative, and

4-advocacy support for priority gender policy initiatives;

Provided that sufficient funding resource is available for the facility, it could strengthen partners and institutions working in each stream to form a national network that support pro-poor and gender sensitive development agenda at national and sub-national level. The facility could be managed by MAMPU or in collaboration with a reputable national partner.

b. Promotion of the development of professional centers of excellence to provide long-term political education and continued capacity building for activists, cadres and politicians in MAMPU's 5 thematic areas and in broader gender issues. This component could be targeted to foster the establishment, development or selection of national centers of excellence from among reputable and credible state universities to serve as anchor(s) for Indonesia's long-term political education and public policy development. State universities as intellectual assets of the country could be encouraged to play a greater role as the guardian of quality politics and public policy, especially in pro-poor and gender sensitive development agendas. As public institutions of higher education, state universities typically hold sufficient intellectual power capable of maintaining higher standard of integrity in educating future leaders and policy makers of the country.

c. Building and strengthening network of gender advocacy NGOs/partners at national and local levels through support for research, analysis, debates and policy actions on priority and current issues (e.g., amendment of election law to enforce gender quota).

This component could provide support to network of advocacy partners in pro-poor and gender sensitive policy to respond to priority issues through quality public debates and policy actions supported by strong and credible research, analysis and information. The support could be in the form of access to expertise, provision of resources to facilitate joint advocacy, public policy debates, and joint actions.

d. Support the professionalization of parliamentary staffer, especially those with special skills on gender-sensitive and pro-poor policy analysis, legal drafting, and budget appropriation strategy.

This component could focus on fostering the professional recognition of parliamentary staffer. The current staffers consisted mixed of political cadres, expert advisor, personal assistants and even close relatives of the MPs. MAMPU could work with reputable higher education institution and/or national NGOs to develop core competence for political staffers and a qualification system to be used as the basis for parliamentary secretariats general in allowing their entry into the profession.

e. Incentivizing public outreach on parliamentarian's achievement on gender related policy outcomes (e.g., legislation produced, program budget allocated, gender-sensitive service delivery improved, etc.), by providing spots in TV program and print publicity.

This component could be targeted to close the loop of public policy cycles where good policy and development outcomes are disseminated, scrutinized and acknowledged by the public. It could be structured as
incentive packages where element of the public helps determine which good policy outcomes deserve such publicity and outreach incentive.

As MAMPU has a focus on supporting women caucuses, it is highly recommended that the term local women caucus is used more flexibly as to avoid the bureaucratization of the caucuses, which may lead to the formation of the local women causes becoming an objective in itself rather than as a means to advance gender-sensitive development agenda.

-00000-

No.	Name	Institution	L/P
	BA	NDUNG, 14 NOV 2013	
1	Dadang Rusdiana	DPRD kab. Bandung (Hanura)	L
2	Riki Akhmad	asst. Dadang Rusdiana	L
3	Aida Cakrawati	DPRD kota Cimahi	Р
4	Ike Hikmawati	DPRD kota Cimahi	Р
5	Saeful Bahri	DPRD kab. Bandung	L
6	Achmad Riza	DPRD Prov. Jabar	L
7	Effi Novliawati	DPRD Kab. Bandung	Р
8	Maryati	DPRD Kab. Bandung Barat	Р
9	Wawan Gunawan	Jakatarub	L
10	Fera Eka	Sapa Institut	Р
	Nok Paridah	Sapa Institut	Р
12	Nina Fitriana	Binangkit	Р
13	E. Budiah	KPPI Kab. Bandung	Р
14	Hj. Lilies Budiman	KPPI Jabar	Р
15	Karmila	GKP	Р
16	Eti Sumiati	YS Jari Relawan Independen	Р
17	Elin Purwanti	BAHTERA	Р
18	Susane Febriyati	Sapa Institut	Р
19	Asep Hermawan	FNSPI	L
20	Asep Malik	SBMI Cianjur	L
21	Tursiani Ratnawati	KPPI Kota Bandung	Р
	LOM	BOK TIMUR, 14 NOV 2013	
1	Abdullah Muzakkar	Dosen STKIP Hamzanwadi	L
2	Saswadi Kamrin	LPKM	L
3	Lalo Handani	Yayasan Insan Hayati	L
4	Handam	LPA LoTim	L
5	Hirsan	Gema Alam NTB	L
6	Ririn Hayudiani	LPSDM	Р
7	Bagus Aryawa	Mitra Samya (fasilitator)	L
8	M. Ali Hanapiah	LPSDM	L
9	Ardi Ibrahim	YPPM	L
10	Taharudin	Pers	L
11	Sairu M	Lensa Demokrasi	L
12	M.Mu'azz Farin	Konsorsium	L
13	Zaenal Amilin	Konsorsium LSM LoTeng	L
14	Muslihatun	LPSDM	L
15	Nasrudi	LPSDM	L
16	Zuarno Saputra	Al Kahfi	L
17	Roma Hidayat	Lensa Demokrasi	L

Annex 1: List of FGD Participants and People Interviewed

18	Hamidah	LPSPM	Р
19	H. Huspiani	DPRD LoTIM (PBR)	L
20	Hj. Masruri Aini	DPRD LoTIM (PBR)	Р
21	Harpan Bawa	DPRD LoTim (Demokrat)	L
22	H.M. Qiyamuddin S.	DPRD LoTim (PAN)	L
23	H.M. Edwin H	DPRD LoTim (PBB)	L
24	Hj. Baiq Mihmal	DPRD LoTim (Golkar)	L
25	Rahadian Soedjono	DPRD LoTim (Demokrat)	L
26	Akhmad Husyairi	DPRD LoTeng (PKNU)	L
	1	SURABAYA, 21 NOV 2013	Г
1	Ana Bilqis Fajarwati	PSGA UIN/IAIN Sunan Ampel Sby	Р
2	Rumi H	KPS2K (Kelompok Perempuan Sumber- Sumber Kehidupan)	Р
3	Wiwik A	KPI Wil. Jatim	Р
4	Eka Dian Savitri	KPI Wil. Jatim	Р
5	Hery Pratono	Patiro Surabaya	L
6	Eka Rahmawati	SA KPPD (Samitra Abhaya Kelompok Perempuan Pro Demokrasi)	р
7	Hudiyah	PC. Fatayah NU Surabaya	L
8	Dahlan	Fitra Jatim	L
9	Dian Noeswantari	Pusat Kajian Hukum Univ. Surabaya	Р
10	Novita Herikristanti	ISCO(Indonesia Street Children Organization) Foundation	Р
11	Hamidah	KPPI	Р
12	Falmi Asri	KPPI Gresik	Р
13	Saleh F. Mukarom	DPRD Jatim	L
14	S. Tarida Hutabarat	DPRD Jatim	Р
15	Anwar Sadad	DPRD Jatim	L
16	Kartika H	DPRD Jatim	Р
		CIREBON 14 NOV 2013	
1	Leni Marleni	Fahmina	Р
2	Uswatun Hasanah	Fahmina	Р
3	Husnul Khotimah		Р
4	Masyithoh	Bayt Al Hikmah	Р
5	Marzuki Rais	Fahmina	L
6	Sa'adah	WCC Balqis	Р
7	Alifatul Arifiati	Fahmina	Р
8	Rosidin	Fahmina	L
9	Hasan Ma'Arif	HU Fajar Cirebon	L
10	Akbarudin Sucipta	Amparan Jati	L

11	Abdul Rosyidi	Fajar Cirebon	L
12	Hj. Euis Suhartati	Banati	Р
13	Hj. Afwah M.	ISIF	Р
14	Iroh Rohayati	-	Р
15	Hj. Yuningsih	DPRD	Р
16	Suhendi	DPRD	L
17	Hj. Rita Muliana	DPRD	Р
18	Vivi Vilianti	DPRD	Р
19	Nina Kerisnawati	DPRD	Р
20	Dewi Fatmawati	DPRD	Р
21	Hj. Amenah, S.E	DPRD	Р
22	Hj. Lilik N. Fuady	DPRD	Р
		JAKARTA, 18 NOV 2013	
1	Rohidin Sudarno	PATTIRO	L
2	Hana Satriyo	The Asia Foundation	Р
3	Sulastio	IPC	L
4	Masruchah	Komnas Perempuan	Р
5	Delima Saragih	IRI	Р
6	S. Aisyah Purnamasari	NDI	Р
	Teresita Poespowardojo	NDI	Р
7	Yolanda Panjaitan	Puskapol UI	Р
9	Nurharsono	Migrant Care	L
	Siti Badriyah	Migrant Care	Р
10	Arif Nur Alam	AIPD	L
11	Agung Wijaya	AIPD	L
12	Eva Sundari	DPR RI (Interview)	Р
13	Soemintarsih Muntoro	DPR RI (Interview)	Р
14	Abdul Malik Haramain	DPR RI (Interview)	L
15	Teguh Juwarno	DPR RI (Interview)	L
16	Sumaryati Aryoso	DPR RI (Interview)	Р

Annex 2: Summary of Parliamentary Support Initiatives Reviewed

Objective	Activities	Target Group	Reported Achievement		
	INDP – Parliamentary Reform and Public Engagement Revitalization (PROPER), Budget \$1,342,000, 2006-2009				
To establish a more accountable representation and more intensive public engagement in parliamentary process in DPR	 Induction of new members Support to Secretariat General to deliver services to organs and functions Support to provision of public information 	 Members Secretariat General Parliamentary Organs and Party factions 	 Improved transparency and communication More responsive parliament Promote concept of representation Supported efforts to increase women representation • 		
	ve and DPD Empowerment (PRIDE), Bud	<u>lget: \$978,911, 2006-2009</u>			
Supports the DPD to establish sound institutional capacity based on recognized regulatory frameworks that enhance the accountability of the DPD	 Capacity building of members to be effective regional representation Formulation of regulatory frameworks to strengthen DPD's role Support the establishment of regional accountability system 	 Members Secretariat General Parliamentary Organs 	 Research and analysis on DPD's organizational structure Assessment of ideal bicameral system Supported working mechanism of DPD Legal drafting training Catalogue of women DPD members' experiences 		
UNDP – Governance Reform and DPD E	Empowerment (GRADE), Budget: \$392,3	96, 2006-2009			
To develop regional/local democratic governance capacity	 Development of training modules for local parliamentarians Provision of capacity building support in basic role and function of local parliaments Facilitation support for budgeting and oversight functions for selected regional parliaments 	 Ministry oh Home Affairs All provincial DPRDs in Sulawesi DPRDs of South Minahasa, Takalar, Boalemo, Palu 	 10 training modules developed 160 DPRD members and support staffs trained Issue mapping support for DPRDs Budget and oversight initiatives facilitated in the targeted DPRDs 		

UNDP – Civic Education in Democratic Governance (CIVED), Budget: \$724,775, 2006-2009				
To empower citizens through information and knowledge dissemination about their civic rights and responsibilities	 Support media campaign on civic rights and responsibilities Public consultations and dialogues Video competition for the youth Development of portal for first time voters 	Ministry of Home AffairsYouth	 Selection of CIVED ambassadors drawn from music celebrities Dialogues among students of faith- based schools Media programs: sitcom, talk shows on civic education Public consultations on Adat law 	
NDI – Electoral Assistance, Strengthen	ing Political Parties, Increased Women's	s Representation, Budget: N/A, 1997, 20	04, 2009	
Strengthening of political parties, elected bodies and civil society organizations	 Support party caucuses(fraksi) in the legislature as they generate and review new legislation, conduct government oversight and reach out to constituents. Provision of comparative advice from experts around the world, along with information, mentoring and training to party representatives and parliamentary staff at the national and local levels. Organize a series of issue-based forums to bolster communication between legislators and policy-focused civil society organizations on issues of mutual concern Focus groups with party fraksi and the Women's Parliamentary Caucus of Indonesia to show how qualitative research can be used to develop policy 		 Increased women representation in 2009 election by 7 percent Initiated the Asian Political Leadership Program (APLP) a regional hub for experience sharing among political party leaders Support civil society and political parties establish democratic governance and free and fair elections in the province since the signing of the 2005 Aceh Peace Agreement 	

Kemitraan – Leveraging and Educat \$8,887.562, 2008-2012	ing Accountable Democracy (LEAD): Er	hancing Women Political Leadership i	in the Policy Making Process, Budget:
To strengthen the political leadership of women in promoting the achievement of the Millennium Development Goals (MDG) policies	 Support to research and information on MDG based policy Support public campaign on the importance of MDG achievement Lecture to mass organization, party cadres, candidates and elected candidates on MDGs Support meeting between partners Facilitation support to partners for advocacy to include pro-poor and gender policy in regional legislative agenda (Prolegda) Facilitation support to partners for advocacy of pro-poor and gender sensitive budget deliberations 	 CSO partners Members of political parties Elected Members of Parliaments Locations: Bali, West Java, North Sulawesi, Yogyakarta, 	 More than 20 training sessions for political party members, candidates and elected MPs, CSOs carried out in 4 provinces Thematic discussions on MDG related development issues held in 4 provinces Enactment of KIBBLA (maternal, infant and child health) Bylaw in Bandung District Activate Women Caucus in West Java to push forward gender-sensitive policy agenda
Asia Foundation - Increasing Women'	s Political Participation and Strengthen	ing Good Governance in Indonesia, Budg	et: \$1,200,000, 2007-2010
Reducing Barriers to Women's Political Participation, and Strengthening Capacity and Skills of Women in Politics	 Critical analysis and advocacy support for of amendments proposed by Ministry of Home Affairs for Gender-equitable perspective Recommendations for political parties to reform internal regulations Focus Groups Discussions and public seminars on increasing women's political participation Candidate debates featuring women's candidates and their platforms Multi-media campaign 	 Ministry of Home Affairs Local parliaments in Aceh, South Sulawesi, East Java, Jakarta 	 18% of female representation in politics in Indonesia (GE 2009) 487 female candidates in 3 targeted provinces and national level trained 164 female elected MPs were trained and equipped with basic knowledge and skills on the roles and mandates of legislators 300 people were trained in electoral witness and monitoring in Aceh. Trained Elected Female MPs exercised women's rights into their party's platform; Some initiations to bring women's rights into agenda and to include

		2007	 them into the '3 Divas' media - CSO - MP's action plan (South Sulawesi) 2 Laws, concerning 3 issues to include more women in the legislative bodies were amended 3 supplements through 20,000 exemplars of a national magazine; (2) political debates are covered by media
	en Programme, Budget: N/A, sinc		
To strengthen women's capacities and qualifications and enable them to successfully pursue their career in politics	• Seminars and trainings for politically active women on topics like political communication, argumentation- and presentation skills and internal democratic party structures.	 Women party members and cadres Women MPs 	• Increased representation of female interests
USAID – Program Representasi (ProRe	p), Budget: \$20-25million, 2011-2016		
 To improve representation by increasing the inclusiveness and effectiveness of groups, networks and institutions that seek to represent people's views, interests and aspirations to government To improve the responsiveness, effectiveness and transparency of legislative processes 	 Strengthening the representational capacity of membership- and constituency-based CSOs Building the capacity of selected universities, think tanks and CSOs to conduct policy-relevant research and analysis on key policy and governance issues Supporting more effective, responsive and transparent legislative processes Providing timely assistance for special initiatives needed to protect or advance democratic governance 	 Membership- and constituency- based and advocacy CSOs (including CSOs that represent women) Universities, think tanks and CSOs engaged in policy-relevant research and analysis DPR members, groupings within the DPR, and the DPR Secretariat, Selected executive branch agencies and the DPD 	 CSOs capacity building on advocacy strategy, constituent building, grant management delivered Training on fiscal impact analysis and legal drafting developed Workshops and FGDs on budget oversight including with the BAKN (State Finance Accountability Body) Established research institution network

IRI - Women's Political Participation,	Budget: N/A, - present		
To strengthen women's representation, enable the governing ability of parliamentary bodies and the ability of successful, democratically- minded women to be re-elected by their constituents	 Workshops for women candidates from all eligible parties Tenggara to improve campaign skills Workshops for the newly-elected women on effectively representing their constituents' interests 	 Youth and women political activists, party members, and candidates Locations Aceh, East Nusa Tenggara, North Sumatra, South Sulawesi and West Nusa 	 Indonesia Poll on Economy over Corruption conducted "Winning with Women 2014" Campaign launched Stakeholders collaboration to strengthen poverty reduction legislations Advocacy by political party activists in Nusa Tenggara on Migrant Workers welfare
International Comparison – Timor Le UNDP - Strenathenina Parliamentary	iste Democracy in Timor-Leste, Budget: \$15,	.300.000. 2010-2013	
 • To support the consolidation of parliamentary processes • To expand existing capacity building initiatives into a comprehensive capacity development strategy 	 Provision legislative support through advisory services to the leadership, as well as substantive support to the Standing Committees, particularly with respect to analyzing legislation and organizing public hearings Provision of support to partners in and to Committees on Finance, Economy and Anti-Corruption in on budget oversight Technical Assistance to the Secretariat to implement best management practices Provision of supports to parliament in disseminating information of its activities to the public Capacity building of gender analysis for parliamentary works through the 	 Leadership and members of parliaments, and Standing Committee Secretariat General CSO partners 	 Passage of two budgets with substantive scrutiny by Committees on Finance, Economy and Anti- Corruption Strengthened capacity of National Parliament to effectively analyze, debate and then pass in time, the electoral law for the 2007 elections Transmission of parliamentary debates through radio and television Establishment and active engagement of Women's Caucus in National Parliament

	Gender Resource Center		
UNDP - Strengthening institutional ca	∟ pacity of the National Parliament in Tin	⊥ nor-Leste, Budget []4,000,000, 2011-201	5
To strengthen the democratic foundations of oversight, accountability and transparency through effective, self-reliant, standardized and sustainable institutional capacity development in the National Parliament	 Provision of technical assistance and advisory to improve planning and budgeting of procurement, and administrative processing of the secretariat Provision of technical assistance and advisory to improve language and analysis skills of MPs, staffs and experts, transcription system and information management Provision of technical assistance and advisory for improved oversight support capacity of the parliament Facilitate inter-parliamentary relations with other Portuguese speaking countries 	 Parliamentary Secretariat Members of Parliament 	 Advisors and experts for capacity building, legal, and gender provided by the project Training for 15 transcribers provided Training for analyst for budget oversight provided Study tour organized to the Philippines to learn experiences in addressing domestic violence and maternal mortality issues
UN WOMEN – Timor Leste Programme			1
To support the Government of Timor Leste and civil society partners address national priorities for gender equality and women's empowerment, working together with the UN Integrated Mission in Timor-Leste and as part of the UN Country Team	 Provision of training to women who were interested in standing for political office Studies on violence against women and survey to monitor improvement on gender equality 	 CSOs In support of other UN programmes 	• 671 women candidates representin 21 political parties, as opposed to the Parliamentary elections in 2007 with 242 women candidates from 1 political parties

Annex 3: Summary of Focus Group Discussions Notes

Bandung

Topic Inquired	Resp	Responses	
	CSO	Parliamentarian	
Understanding of local problems	Some significant women related problems:, 1.Poverty in general children and its impacts (school drop-out among children, especially girls), 2.SGBV including sexual exploitation towards women and children and domestic violence 4.Human trafficking 5.Violation of rights of religion (West Java Province is one with the highest rate in its intolerance in Indonesia) 6.Discriminative local regulations/ policies in civil rights towards minority groups(women, religion groups, masyarakatadat), 7. HIV/Aids	Some significant women related problems:, 1.Sexual Gender Based Violence/SGBV, including domestic violence sexual exploitation towards women and children. 2.Human trafficking: a. high rate in Bandung Regent, highest rate in West Java among other provinces. b. violent toward women migrant workers and lack of budget to handle the problem c. Low protection towards women migrant abroad, esp. in Arab Saudi. 3.Minimum of gender- based regulations, only one Local Regulation related to gender issue with weak supervision on the implementation 4.High mortality rate of women and children 5 High rate of discriminative local regulations in West Java. 6.Low quality of human resource	Almost no different knowledge and perception between CSOs and 1.Local regulations produced are still limited in number on pro-women policies
What had been done?	1.Programs on Human Trafficking:a. Education and dissemination of safe migrationb. Advocacy of rights of women migrant worker	1.Produced some Local Regulations/PERDA: a. Local Regulation on Prevention and handling of Human Trafficking (PERDA NO. 3 TAHUN 2008 PERDA	Local regulations produced are still limited in number on pro-women policies.

			1
	c. Advocacy of Local Regulation on	TENTANG PENCEGAHAN DAN	
	human trafficking in Cianjur Regent	PENANGANAN PERDAGANGAN	
	d. Research	ORANG)	
	e. Handling of trafficking cases	b. Local Regulation on Eradication of	
		Poverty in Cimahi City	
		c. Local Regulation on	
		Employment(PERDA	
		Tenaga Kerja) in Cimahi City 2012:	
		rights of women is more	
		accommodated.	
		d. Local Regulation on women	
		maternal	
		health (PERDA KIBBLA Tahun 2008)	
		in	
		Bandung Regent.	
		e. Local Regulation on Education in	
		Bandung Regent (PERDA	
		PENDIDIKAN KAB.BANDUNG): free of	
		educational cost , from elementary	
		until senior high school	
		f. Local Regulation on Public Health	
		Insurance year 2009 in Bandung	
		Regent (PERDA JPKM).	
Any policies/regulation related to	. Gender Based Violence/GBV:	2. Conduct public discussion to	2. MPs need more drive to use their
gender issues: MDGs, Health,	a. Education on GBV issues	identify aspiration of people.	budgeting function to respond to
Education, HIV/Aids?	b. Handling of GBV cases	identify aspiration of people.	crucial issues: women migrant worker,
Luucation, mv/mus:	c. Economic empowerment for women		GBV.
Any support from CSOs?	3. Public education on HIV/Aids issue	3. Set budget allocation for Women	3.Women MPS need more capacity
	4.Capacity building for women	Activities (Pendidikan Kesejahteraan	building on important skills: legal
	legislative candidates: LEGAL	Keluarga/PKK)	drafting, budgeting, political
	DRAFTING, BUDGETING,	4.Budget allocation for political	communication.
	COMMUNICATION IN POLITICS,	education for women MPs Cimahi City.	4. KPPI needs to be more empowered
	5.Conduct discussion forum for	eucation for women Mrs childhi City.	•
			and transformed to be a formal organ
	women parliamentarians across		in parliament
	parties (Kaukus Perempuan Parlemen		

Function and Responsibilities of Parliamentarians	Indonesia/KPPI) 6.Technical assistance on legal drafting for MPs and developing academic paper draft. 7.Conduct informal meeting and discussion between CSOs and MPs aiming to advocate strategic issues, including women issues 8.Research on women rights. 9.Public education on civil rights 10.Supporting women movement 1.Women Caucus in Parliament has same vision in fighting for women issues. 2.Parliament/DPRD Bandung has not allocated enough budget for the issue of maternal health in Bandung Regent. 4. Parliament in Bandung Regent has used its initiative to develop regulation (Raperda) on human trafficking. 5.Initiative right to propose a regulation had not utilized optimally. 6. Controlling and evaluation function of parliament has not effectively employed	 Controlling function in Bandung Regent is not effectively implemented because MPs more focused on regulations development Evaluation function is not effectively utilized towards regulations that have not yet the Regent Regulations (Peraturan Bupati). Function had been most implemented is budgeting. 	 1.MPs are not well aware of pro- women budgeting. 2.Low productivity of parliament in producing legislatures. 3.Lack of capability to utilize initiative rights, more depend on executives.
 1.What had been implemented? 2.Which function has most utilized? 3. Has Parliament applied its initiative rights to set policy? 4.Condition of parliament? 	1.MPs in the service period of 2004- 2009 was more cooperative 2.Women MPs within period of 2004- 2009 was more pro-actively in Special Committee of Perda KIBBLA 3.Parliament in period of 2009 – 2014 was more responsive towards GBV	-	

Problems and Challenges 1.What problems faced by MPs? 2.Any problems related to knowledge and skill?	 1.Incompetency of women candidates/ lack of capacity 2.Women MPs not actively participated in policy making. 3.Less transfer of knowledge from the previous MPs. 4. Lack of Supervisory function of parliament. 5.Lack of lobbying skill. 6.Less awareness of women issues among women MPs. 	 Inaccuracy of perceiving women issues. Cancelation of local regulations by MOHA, no umbrella law. Difficulties in implementing of local regulation (PERDA) because lack of Regent Regulation (Peraturan Bupati/Perbup). Budget allocated more for infrastructure, almost none for gender responsive budget. Budget for capacity building for women MPs is difficult to be approved by parliament. No reference on percentage of gender responsive budget. Less awareness of women issues among MPs, including women MPs. Lack of mechanism in handling migrant worker cases. Cases of dead women migrant worker is not seen as priority by the Regent/Mayor. Less access for public to get information regarding budget 	 1.Lack of knowledge and awareness of women issues of 2009-2014's parliament. 2.Decrease of quality of MPs of 2009- 2014's parliament 3. Less control from civil society towards local administration/Regent
3.Any women caucus at parliament?	 7.Less of women MPs in parliament, not possible to establish women caucus. 8.Potential women politicians perceived as threat in the political party 	 7.Lack of togetherness among members of KPPI (Provincial level) in fighting for women issues. 8.Women MPs were not able yet to "voice" women issues and budget; lack of budgeting skill. 9.Women MPs have not enough competence to gain bargaining position towards male MPs. 10.Less support from leaders of political parties toward women MPs. 11.Women members of parties had 	

4.Challenges for CSOs?	1.CSOs have to encourage MPs in producing regulations/Perda 2. CSOs have lack of capacities on: a. Documentation and research. b. Political mapping. c. Political communication d. Organizational management Political	not have opportunities to seat in strategic positions in the party and parliament.	
5.Any support to MPS to propose gender-based policies?	-	1. Gender sensitivity trainings/sessions for Male MPs and legislative candidates.	
6. What had been done to overcome problems?	 Capacity building in many kind of knowledge and skills., through: political parties, MPs, cooperation with Parliament Secretariat. Establish political contract between legislative candidates/parties and CSOs. Campaign for legislative candidates who have credible track record, especially women candidates. Encourage people to use their political right and vote for the good candidates (voters Education) 	 2. How to influence and convince leaders of political parties to give opportunities to women members to seat in strategic positions, both in the parties' and parliament's structure. 3. MPs need more : a. technical assistance b. data from research done by CSOs/NGOs. c. Additional budget for monitoring d. Input from community during the recess time. e. Personal empowerment from political leaders f. Skill on how to pack priority issue to be accepted in the program and budget plan. g. skill on how to utilize media 	
Support needed by MPs in the future? Means of support delivery?	1.Capacity building in many kind of knowledge and skills. ,through: political parties, MPs, cooperation	2. How to influence and convince leaders of political parties to give opportunities to women members to	CSOs had not advocate yet the chairs of political parties to give more opportunities to women candidates.

	with Parliament Secretariat. 2.Establish political contract between legislative candidates/parties and CSOs. 3.Campaign for legislative candidates who have credible track record, especially women candidates. 4.Encourage people to use their political right and vote for the good candidates (voters Education)	 seat in strategic positions, both in the parties' and parliament's structure. 3. MPs need more : a. technical assistance b. data from research done by CSOs/NGOs. c. Additional budget for monitoring d. Input from community during the recess time. e. Personal empowerment from political leaders f. Skill on how to pack priority issue to be accepted in the program and budget plan. g. skill on how to utilize media 	
--	--	--	--

Lombok Timur

Responses		Gap
CSO	Parliamentarian	
 Limited market place; many people chose to be migrant worker abroad (Tenaga Kerja Indonesia/TKI), both legally and illegally. Poverty impacted towards women and children (malnutrition, school dropout, etc) Lack of pro-poor policies/regulation. Lack of women leadership. Less women representation in public institutions. Low quality of local human 	 1.Patriarch system effected on women: polygamy, not-legal marriage (nikah siri) 2.Early marriage impacted on high rate of Divorce 3.Media, especially yellow papers forced violence against women. 4.Lack of accurate data on poor population as a base for developmental budget. 	Lack of interest on gender issues among male MPs Lack of interest of MPs on migrant worker problems.
resources: education,skill. 7.Lack of capacity of local resources to manage natural resources. 8.Lack of access of information to public about policies.		
1.Development of strategy and mechanism with MPs in forms of: a. Development Plan Meeting (MUSRENBANG), b. public hearing, c. Conduct thematic discussion with commission in parliament, d. Encourage MPs to use their initiative rights to propose regulation e. Facilitate local administration/PEMDA to produce policies/regulations in governance management,	Regulations/PERDA: a. Perda on Child Protection b. Perda on migrant worker protection c. Draft of Perda on child trafficking and violence against children (in the process of public hearing), initiated by executive. d. Draft of Education Policy, initiated by legislative. e. Perda on "Jilbab" f. Perda of Participatory Development Plan/Musrenbang with minimum	Only few local regulations produced by parliament responded to the local problems identified
	CSO 1.Limited market place; many people chose to be migrant worker abroad (Tenaga Kerja Indonesia/TKI), both legally and illegally. 2.Poverty impacted towards women and children (malnutrition, school dropout, etc) 3.Lack of pro-poor policies/regulation. 4.Lack of women leadership. 5.Less women representation in public institutions. 6. Low quality of local human resources: education,skill. 7.Lack of capacity of local resources to manage natural resources. 8.Lack of access of information to public about policies. 1.Development of strategy and mechanism with MPs in forms of: a. Development Plan Meeting (MUSRENBANG), b. public hearing, c. Conduct thematic discussion with commission in parliament, d. Encourage MPs to use their initiative rights to propose regulation e. Facilitate local administration/PEMDA to produce policies/regulations in governance	CSOParliamentarian1.Limited market place; many people chose to be migrant worker abroad (Tenaga Kerja Indonesia/TKI), both legally and illegally.1.Patriarch system effected on women: polygamy, not-legal marriage (nikah siri)2.Poverty impacted towards women and children (malnutrition, school dropout, etc)1.Patriarch system effected on women: polygamy, not-legal marriage (nikah siri)3.Lack of pro-poor policies/regulation. 4.Lack of women leadership.3.Media, especially yellow papers forced violence against women.4.Lack of women leadership.3.Lack of accurate data on poor population as a base for developmental budget.5.Less women representation in public institutions.4.Lack of accurate data on poor population as a base for developmental budget.7.Lack of capacity of local human resources:4.Lack of accurate data on poor population as a base for developmental budget.7.Lack of access of information to public about policies.1.Produced some Local Regulations/PERDA: a. Perda on Child Protection b. Perda on child trafficking and violence against children (in the process of public hearing), initiated by executive.6. Encourage MPs to use their initiative rights to propose regulation e. Facilitate local administration/PEMDA to produce management,1.Preda of Participatory Development Plan/Musrenbang with minimum

	participative PERDA of small, medium entrepreneur and other important policies.	g. Perda of Poverty Eradication	
Any policies/regulation related to gender issues: MDGs, Health, Education, HIV/Aids?	2.Develop documentation and Information 3.Develop cooperation with media 4.Community Empowerment in forms of: entrepreneurship training: management of organization, home industry, financial management, micro finance, business Plan, marketing 2.Capacity building for women migrant worker: financial management, business plan 3.Scholarship program for poor students	 Establishment of Child Protection Institution, but less of budget support. Dissemination of regulation of child protection on early marriage Fight for giving birth certificate for Children from early married couples Development of data documentation on policies and regulation 	Low achievement of parliament in producing local regulations/Perda, particularly related to MDGs.
Any support from CSOs?	 1.Technical guidance(SKPD) 2.Consultation assistance(expert team) 3. Conduct thematic discussion between CSOs and MPs. 4.Comparison study 5.Capacity building training. 6.Advocacy: conduct public hearing with Parliament on the policy of economic empowerment of the local entrepreneurs of traditional weavingmill (Central Lombok Regency). 	Many CSOs in Central Lombok work hand in hand to support parliament, eg : conduct public hearing with MPs MPs see the strategic roles of CSOs and need continuous support from CSOs, but could not always identify specific activities had been done by CSOs	MPs perceived CSOs as their partners, but not really aware what supports had been provided by CSOs.
Function and Responsibilities of Parliamentarians	1.Legislation function: produce some policy regulations; very few were parliament- based initiative regulations	MPs –participants of the FGD – not mention certain dominant legislative function they have implemented.	Lack of capacity and willingness of MPs to use its initiative rights to propose policies.
1.What had been implemented? 2.Which function has most utilized?	1.Lack of ideas and achievement of MPs	1.Lack of ideas and achievement of MPs	
3. Has Parliament applied its initiative	2.Lack of capacities of MPs: financial	2.Lack of financial support to hire	

rights to set policy? 4.Condition of parliament?	 analytical Skill, how to maintain relation with constituents. 3.Lack of financial support to hire experts 4.Conflict of interest between legislative and executive. 5.Tight competition among MPs in the electoral areas. 6.Lack of women representation in politics and parliament 	experts 3.Law No.32 tends to pro-executive, effected on the limited budgeting function of parliament –particularly on gender responsive budget because of arrow gender perspective of executive. 4.Lack of capacities of MPs in maintaining relation with constituents. 5.Poor relationship among MPs 6.Lack of gender perspectives among MPs	
Problems and Challenges 1.What problems faced by MPs? 2.Any problems related to knowledge and skill?	 Lack of ideas and achievement of MPs Lack of capacities of MPs: financial analytical Skill, how to maintain relation with constituents. Lack of financial support to hire experts Conflict of interest between legislative and executive. Tight competition among MPs in the electoral areas. Lack of women representation in politics and parliament 	 1.Lack of ideas and achievement of MPs 2.Lack of financial support to hire experts 3.Law No.32 tends to pro-executive, effected on the limited budgeting function of parliament –particularly on gender responsive budget because of arrow gender perspective of executive. 4.Lack of capacities of MPs in maintaining relation with constituents. 5.Poor relationship among MPs 6.Lack of gender perspectives among MPs 	 Same perception between CSOs and MPs on problems faced by MPs. MPS- including women MPs- do not see the importance of the existence of Women Caucus in parliament
3.Any women caucus at parliament?	7.No women caucus in local parliament	-	3.Less of women representation at parliament to build a women caucus
4.Challenges for CSOs?	-	-	
5.Any support to MPS to propose gender-based policies?	-	-	
6. What had been done to overcome problems?	1.Encourage local women leadership 2.Capacity building training for potential women members of political	Not much efforts from parties and local parliament to overcome their weaknesses	Different level of problems analytical skill between CSOs activist and MPs. Local CSOs have more concern and

	parties on: advocacy of basic human rights, political education. 3.Advocacy of migrant worker cases 4.Develop skill of data-based advocacy 5.Training in law for legislative candidates. 6.Monitoring on policies' implementation (Perda and Perbup) 7.Conduct talk show to discussion government Policy. 8.Develop Caucus of Women Concern of NTB (Kaukus Peduli Perempuan) consists of members of parliament, women Activist, board of social organizations.		interest on local issues as well capacity to map them.
Support needed by MPs in the future? Means of support delivery?	1.Strong coalition of CSOs/NGOs to urge on gender responsive policies.	1.Strengthening partnership between legislative and executive	MPs have not yet seen the importance of women leadership in the political
	2.To push on more active women	2. Strengthening partnership between	parties and parliament structures.
	leadership. 3.Empowe civil society organizations	CSOs and legislative.	
	to do advocacy.		
	4.Capacity building		

Cirebon

Topic Inquired	Responses		Gap
	CSO	Parliamentarian	
Understanding of local problems	 1.Political Problems: a. Less of women political cadres effected on difficulty to reach quota of women legislative candidates, currently only 15% b. System of political party do not support to give opportunity to women. c. Lack of self confidence of women to be existed within strong male hegemony. d. Political parties should fight for potential and talented women, which is limited in number. e. Political parties refused to provide capacity building to empower their women members. f. Wicked mentality of MPs: corruption, not discipline, no willingness to improve their quality, etc. g. Lack of awareness of women about the, political rights(to vote and to be voted). 2.Education problems: a. Lack of educational rights: policy of Cirebon Mayor (Peraturan Walikota/ PERWALI) No.34 Year 2013 which limit access of people from outside of the city to gain education in Cirebon. b. Lot of corruption in implementation 	Lack of awareness of MPs regarding political problems , women and children issues, as observed by civil society. MPs focused more on general problems: education, health, poverty. However, their concern on food security problem is a good one, this not seen by CSOs which tend to see the civil and political rights instead of economic rights	Lack of awareness of MPs regarding political problems , women and children issues, as observed by civil society. MPs focused more on general problems: education, health, poverty. However, their concern on food security problem is a good one, this not seen by CSOs which tend to see the civil and political rights instead of economic rights

	of free education.		
	 3.Problem of migrant worker which has big influence on family; too many social cost 4.Children issues: a. Violence against diffable children b. Lack of access to education for children because their names are not include in family card. 5. Domestic violence 		
What had been done?	 Policy advocacy based on public opinion. Propose draft of Protection of Migrant Worker(Raprda TKI) since 2005. Program of strengthening economical access to women. 	Field monitoring: data synchronization between planed and implemented programs.	1.CSOs: lack of specific and concrete programs to overcome identified issues.2.MPs : less action to "answer" identified problems.
Any policies/regulation related to gender issues: MDGs, Health, Education, HIV/Aids?	-	-	
Any support from CSOs?	-	-	
Function and Responsibilities of Parliamentarians	1. Mostly controlling function has been conducted through field monitoring to see the match between regulations and their implementation. However, it's not	1. MPs had applied the three functions of parliament: policy development (legislation), budgeting and controlling: mostly budgeting function, controlling function is still weak.	
	effectively done because of the target system in parliament, stress more on numbers instead of substance.2. Most local regulations are initiative Perdas; policy initiated by executive	2. Local parliament had produced 27 initiative regulations. The process is not difficult, draft academic paper had been prepared by expert team. Then, all proposed policies had discussed in Balegda (Local Legislation	

	will take time because of complicated procedure.3. Encourage parliament to propose policies using its initiative right	Commission) in parliament, continued with public hearing.	
 1.What had been implemented? 2.Which function has most utilized? 3. Has Parliament applied its initiative rights to set policy? 4.Condition of parliament? 	-	-	
Problems and Challenges 1.What problems faced by MPs? 2.Any problems related to knowledge and skill?	 Disorientation and pragmatism character of MPs: MPs not really fight for people interest but more follow the mainstream. MPs do not master the function, task and responsibilities of parliament members. Almost never do serious assessment to absorb aspiration of their constituents as well as study on policy draft. MPs prefer to do comparison study abroad or to other provinces. Less coordination among MPS and other significant stakeholders. 	 1.Educational background of MPs are not fit in with their placement in the commission at parliament caused many MPs do not understand the substance. 2.Lack of gender perspective among MPs resulted less of gender- based policies. 	Significant discrepancies between required and actual competences of MPs
3.Any women caucus at parliament?	 1.Women Caucus Indonesian Parliament (KPPI) was established in 2004 in Cirebon Regency and in 2003 in the City of Cirebon. The KPPIs no longer active in 2009 - 2014 2.KPPI had provided political education for women but have not able to work together to propose 	No response to this issue.	

	gender-based policies because the members are still stick to their parties' policy. Role of KPPI is more to prepare women legislative candidates.		
4.Challenges for CSOs?	-	-	
5.Any support to MPS to propose gender-based policies?	-	-	
6. What had been done to overcome problems?	 Lack of gender perspective among MPs resulted minimum pro-women policies. Although many MPs graduated from university, but yet do not understand their job as MPs. And also the problems in their community. No system that assure transparency of parliament and to absorb people aspiration. Parties are not "fully hearted" in giving opportunity to women. This is strengthened by strong patriarchy culture and religion interpretations that block women activities in public space Political education for political cadres is not well distributed. 	 1.Utilize available expert team 2.Open discussion of local regulation to get input from public, NGOs and media. 3.No significant support from parties and parliament, mostly ceremonial activities 	Lack of effort and creativity of MPs to overcome their obstacles.
Support needed by MPs in the future? Means of support delivery?	Support in forms of: a. Data as result of research as base on policy development.	Support in forms of: a. Relevant training and data. b. Commission-based capacity building	1.Decreased quality of 2009-2014 parliament, as observed by CSOs
	 b. Public hearing as a supporting process for parliament. c. Political communication: in the period of 2004-2009 ,lot of intensive communication had been done by 	training, Government has budget post for this. c. Skill training for women MPs, including advocacy and political communication.	2.CSOs had not successful market their ideas and inputs to be considered and accepted by parliament.

	CSOs, but not continued because Parliament often ignored CSOs' input. Considered, personal communication will be more effective. d. Strengthening women politician through political education e. Strengthening research and study to improve performance quality of parliament. f. Capacity building for legislative candidates, including on gender issues. g. Providing data for legislative candidates as a tool of campaign.	d. Ability to build network with NGOs and main stakeholders. e. Training on how to utilize media, including social media, particularly for the MPs	
Means of delivery?	-	Support can be delivered through political parties or direct to members of political parties, through partnership with related NGOs or institutions.	

Jakarta

Topic Inquired	Responses		Gap
	CSO	Parliamentarian	
Understanding of local problems	 1.Technical assistance through grant and self-implementation, urge for advocacy for issues: gender budgeting, environment, corruption. 2.Media relation, internship for technical expert, policy advocacy 	 1.Understand the local issues in general, but not all because of the complexity of the problems with their unique characteristics. Problem inputs are directly gained from constituents during recess or direct call during working days. 2.Certain women MPs open wide access to their traditional constituents and local community to get information as a base to develop a solution map. 3.The more often MPs visit to their electoral areas, the more they understand the local problems. 4.Kind of local problems: low community welfare because of poverty, lack of civil rights, migrant worker , land conflict, intolerance towards plurality, education, health, less of market place, poor infrastructure –mostly roads 	What had been done by MPs, some are likely outside of their three main function in form of direct assistance. They play a role as program implementor
What had been done?	 3.Establish caucus at local parliament/DPRD, Cooperation with commission and MPs through technical expert of MPs 4.Lobbying in many ways: individual MPs, commission, faction, caucus. 5.Prepare academic draft, monitoring of discriminatory policy monitoring, training for MPs. 	 1.Facilitate problem solution: contact technical ministries, utilize hearing forum in the commission to raise a problem. 2.One MPs has helped 160 villages in his electoral area in developing infrastructures (road, irrigation, water installation). 3. Use structural mechanism: local 	No significant differences between CSOs and MPs in seeing community problems.

	6.Advocacy of bill and academic draft	administration, ministries and parties.	
	for issue of migrant worker protection	Through the Ministry of Religion, MPs	
	in abroad has done advocacy of the bill	fight for scholarship of Islamic school	
	in 2005	students. Through companies'	
	7.Training for women MPs and newly	CSR,MPs had assisted to provide	
	elected.	scholarship and life insurance for	
	8.Facilitatecommunication forum	poor students and food aids.	
	between Provincial parliament and	4.Made efforts of village market pasar	
	stakeholders to discuss certain issues.	desa, Financial assistance for poor	
	9.Research on affirmative articles in	students (Bantuan Siswa Miskin),	
	certain laws	5.Propose bill of Nursing through	
	10. Empowerment of MPs n five	related Commission and Special	
	provinces	Committee.	
Any policies/regulation related to	1.UU PTPPO ; 2007	Bill of Gender Justice and Equality	
gender issues: MDGs, Health,	2.Law of Handling on Violence Against		
Education, HIV/Aids?	Women, 2004		
	3.UU PPILN		
	4.Bill of Gender Justice and Equality		
Any support from CSOs?	-	-	
Function and Responsibilities of	1.Budgeting function: only did budget	1.Budgeting function: provides input	CSOs perceived that parliament had
Parliamentarians	review	to government and deep study of	not optimally yet in implementing its
	2.Legislation function: some progress	budget usage.	legislative and budgeting function,
	but not yet effective, needs drive and	2.Legislation function: Provide input,	while MPs saw themselves were
	advocacy from CSOs. Process of	starting from composing National	already function well
	regulation development is	Legislation Program (Prolegnas) to	
	transparent, but not the process in	discussion and finalization it in	Lack of recognition and interest of
	Prolegnas.	Working Committee (Panitia	CSOs to see what been resulted by
	3. Constituent representation	Kerja/Panja), Special Committee	parliament.
	function: not yet happen, there is	(Panitia Khusus/Pansus) or in	Participation
	disconnection between MPs' function	Commission.	Lack of recognition and interest of
	in parliament and the representation	3.Monitoring function:	CSOs to see what been resulted by
	structure. Work during recess time is	a. Monitor and supervise budget	parliament.
	not able to be monitored.	implementation in government	parmament
	4. Monitoring function is much easier	ministries/institution.	Problems might be there is different
	T. Monitoring function is much easier	ministrics/mstitution.	i i obicinis inigiti de ulere is unierent

1.What had been implemented? 2.Which function has most utilized? 3. Has Parliament applied its initiative rights to set policy? 4.Condition of parliament?	for MPS to be applied, just need to talk. 1.Initiative in proposing political bill (Paket UU Politik); National Legislation Program does not have priority in producing bills, might be able it depends on certain deals with certain sides.	b. Established the Accountability Board of State Finance(Badan Akuntabilitas Keuangan Negara/ BAKN) as one of parliament tools (Alat Kelengkapan Dewan (AKD) functions to follow-up the audit result from State Board Accounting (Badan Pemeriksa Keuangan/BPK) aiming to establish good governance. c.Requested government to talk its strategic decisions, eg: in the selection of the Head of Police Department or other State Bodies. Some of Laws/Bills initiated by parliament: 1.Law of Social Conflict Management 2.Law of Poverty Management 3 Revision of Public Election/Pemilu Law 4.Draft of Bills: RUU ASN, RUU Ormas (Organization of community), RUU Tanah (Land bill), RUU Desa(Bill of Village Administration), RUU KKG (Bill of Gender justice and Equality/Keadilan dan Kesetaraan Gender), RUU Produk halal, and RUU Penyelenggaraan Haji (Bill of Pilgrimage Management).	perception between CSOs and MPs on what are the priority regulations needed by people.
Problems and Challenges 1.What problems faced by MPs? 2.Any problems related to knowledge and skill?	1.External Factors: a. Unclear authority to execute and cancel local regulations/Perda. Authority of Regent sometimes more dominant in the policy b. Strong influence from political	1.Extenal Factors:a. Money politics in many forms had changed political behavior of constituents and policy makers.b. Many decisions were based on political transaction	Basically, no big difference how CSOs and MPs perceive the problems and challenges of parliament. MPs had not seen their work during recess is still problematic; no system

	 parties: lack of support to MPs, strong dependency of MPs to fraction and their parties' leaders. c. Support from grass root community. d. Network of MPs e. Less coordination and cooperation among MPs of national, provincial and regency/city level during recess. f. Rotation of MPs without clear reason. 2. Internal Factors: a. Lack of knowledge and skills of newly elected MPs. b. Less willingness to improve themselves: arrogant attitude of some MPs. 3.Technical factors: a. Difficulty to monitor recess work of MPs b. Minimum facilities for MPs,eg working space and staff 	 c. Recommendation of parliament are not followed-up by government d. Less number and quality of expert team. 2.Internal factors: a. Conflict of interest between MPs and their political parties. b. Time management. c. Different perception of MPs on problems/issues affected in the process of policy development (time consuming) d. Lack of knowledge and skill of newly elected MPs; need to learn more. e. Mismatched between main capacity of MPs and placement in commission 	to monitor what they do and what the results are. Different level of capacity between senior MPs and the newly elected MPs is rather serious problem.
3.Any women caucus at parliament?	Lack of role of Women Caucus in Parliament (KPPRI) to drive gender- based policies. Potential women MPs mostly not involved in KPPRI. General problems of women Caucus : a. No staff, no secretariat b. In the case of case in the regencies, difficult to get together because of geographical problem. c. Women Caucus is not admitted yet as parliament toll.	1.KPPRI (in parliament) and KPPI (outside parliament) are existed and is actively in fighting for women issues in the Working Committee (Panja) and Special Committee (Pansus),eg: 30% women quota should be represented in the way of 1 women out of 3 legislative candidates 2.Women Caucus at National Parliament had been seen by male MPs as actively fight for gender-based policies, eg: through seminars,	CSOs see that women caucus in parliament is not effective

		advocacy meetings, discussion with related stakeholders.	
4.Challenges for CSOs?	-	-	
5.Any support to MPS to propose gender-based policies?	-	-	
6. What had been done to overcome problems?	-	-	
Support needed by MPs in the future?	1.Capacity building training	1.Technical Adviser is helpful, yet still	
Means of support delivery?	2.More Technical Advise/TAs	support from Experts Team, eg:	
	3.Supply of relevant material/data,	budget center, legislation center.	
	including result of research	Increase quantity and quality of	
	4.Internship program for	Technical Staff	
	5.Facilitate communication forum	3.Support from NGOs and Media;	
	6.MPs use consultants for specific	NGOs can provide alternatives thought	
	issues to assist in drafting and work on	and perspective, media can provide	
	the issues.	relevant information and "voice" the	
	7. Proper selection process for	issues discussed in parliament.	
	legislative candidates based on	4.Data/result from research and	
	competency and idealism.	academic studies, concept papers.	
	8.Conduct campaign on integrity	5.Facility to meet constituents, NGOs	
	9.CSOs should also able to advocate	and Research Institutions.	
	executive and political parties to		
	produce policies		

Surabaya

Topic Inquired	Responses		Gap
	CSO	Parliamentarian	
Understanding of local problems	 1.Women issues: a. Violence against women and children b. Poverty affected mostly women c. Women representation in parliament d. Women are not involved in planning and policy development process in the village. e. Less access to information for women. f. Reproductive health 2.Children issues: a. sex exploitation, b. street children, c. lack of access to education and to get birth certificate for marginalized children 	There is no structural problem with bringing gender sensitive issues. Chair of factions, Commissions, and other important positions can be held by women. Women becomes part of the journey of East Java parliament	Lack of interest of MPs regarding local problems , particularly women and children issues, as observed by CSOs.
What had been done?	1.Advocacy of women rights and free health service regulation/Perda Kesehatan2.Community organizing for urban poor women	The formation of Women Cooperatives (KOPWAN) in all villages in East Java as a policy in economic empowerment for women	MPs are not fully aware of what programs and activities had been done by CSOs to assist them.
Any policies/regulation related to gender issues: MDGs, Health, Education, HIV/Aids?	-	-	
Any support from CSOs?	1.Empowering of women MPs in 10 regencies/cities in Eastern Java:a. Personal capacity development:	Support from CSOs for candidates with pragmatic message: "take the money but don't chose the candidate"	

	lobbying and negotiation skill b. Assissting in developing of guidance book on "how to construct local regulations". c. Watching 15 local regulations/ Perda d. Establishing of Integrated Service Center (Pusat Pelayanan Terpadu/ PPT) for women victims in 2000 2.Researches on: a. Budget research, one of the results: 80% of local budget is for personnel cost and only 20% for people welfare. b. Research of reproductive health right in Banyuwangi, one of the results: 85% respondents do not know about reproductive health. c. Research of Regulation/Perda regarding Placement of Migrant Worker in abroad (revision of Perda TKI), as base for public hearing. 3.Advocacy based on research of gender issues, advocacy.		
Function and Responsibilities of Parliamentarians	-	MPs perceive they had implemented all parliament function: legislating, budgeting and controlling	Legislative and budgeting functions likely not optimally implemented by parliament.
 1.What had been implemented? 2.Which function has most utilized? 3. Has Parliament applied its initiative rights to set policy? 4.Condition of parliament? 	Local regulation draft/Raperda inisiated by parliament is on human trafficking	Several local regulations initiated by parliament are on: women empowerment and victims of domestic violence, subsidizes education, health insurance. Commission D of provincial parliament are welcome to gender equality and gender-responsive	Both CSOs and MPs do not have enough knowledge on substances questioned in Number II.1,2 and 3

		policies proposed by NGOS, including KPPI.	
Problems and Challenges 1.What problems faced by MPs? 2.Any problems related to knowledge and skill?	 1.Women MPs are minority in parliament, difficult to voice and vote for gender- based policies. 2.East Java Province has been very active in producing local regulations/ Perda, yet weak in the implementation and also not transparent in its budget. 3.In Gresik, none of 4 local regulations had a local data because the consultants employed are not local experts. 4.The Technical Advisers/TA of local parliament mostly have law education background that they only applied law as their reference and poor on other social context. 	 1.Internal factors: a. Pragmatism in political attitude has affected idealism of politicians (money politics, negative political transaction). b. Low quality of some MPS: education, communication skill, understanding of regulations and parliament functions, plus "low" of integrity; only around 10% are qualified c. Lack of MPs' capacity in "packaging and marketing" their ideas d. Male MPs perceive women MPs as threat (unhealthy competition) e. Poor recruitment system mechanism of legislative candidates; chair of commission at parliament not consider quality and credibility of the candidates, sometimes even based on "like-dislike". f. Challenges of women MPs are doubled, not enough support from political parties' leaders and sometimes also from families. 3.External factors: a. Unclear government development strategy and political will on gender mainstreaming b. Implementation of Perda is not yet maximum. c. Strong liberalism in political condition 	Increasing quality of MPs in many aspects -knowledge, parliamentary functions, gender perspective, understanding of local issues, discipline, integrity, dedication to its constituents - is crucial issue. Effective recruitment system id necessary. Available TA are not various in education and expertise background, mostly in law degree, not sufficient to provide comprehensive advise to MPs.
3.Any women caucus at parliament?	Women Caucus outside parliament/KPPI are existed in almost	1.Women caucus in parliament is existed, but not able to play significant	Women caucus in parliament is not strong enough to influence the

	all regencies/cities in East Java, but not all are active, because: weak structure and network, less women activist and potential women MPs are involved	role because of its minority status. 2.KPPI in Mojokerto had conducted meeting and discussion with small entrepreneurs	decision making process
4.Challenges for CSOs?	-	-	
5.Any support to MPS to propose gender-based policies?	 Research of Regulation/Perda regarding Placement of Migrant Worker in abroad (revision of Perda TKI), as base for public hearing. Research on local budget index in 20 regencies/cities in East Java. To urge political parties to develop network 	 Indonesian Women Coalition/ assisted East Java in developing Perda of Child Protection and Domestic Support from international organization, such as USAID Support from Civil Society Forum 	
6. What had been done to overcome problems?	-	-	
Support needed by MPs in the future? Means of support delivery?	 1.Capacity building for MPs 2.Stategy to urge for local regulation/Perda that voice women aspiration and gender sensitivity 3.How to build trust between CSOs and MPs 4.CSOs play more role as political cadres education to prepare good quality resources, particularly women, for political parties 5.How to intervene political parties to improve their MPs : a. Collaboration with Parliament Secretariat b. Construct cooperation with political parties c. Work directly with MPs 	 How to drive all potential support from NGOs/CSOs to establish Ideology Caucus Support of CSOs to campaign for potential legislative candidates (CALEG) How to mainstream gender perspective to all policy regulations Voters' education How to change personal assistance into institutional assistance relation. Collaboration with Parliament Secretariat Construct cooperation with political parties Work directly with MPs 	MPS do not see the needs for capacity building for them, while in fact they admitted there are incompetency problems.