



# Joint GIZ & DFAT Project final evaluation: Summary report

Integrated Coastal and Mangrove Forest Protection in the Mekong Provinces for the Adaptation to Climate Change (ICMP)

Project no.:	2010.2202.9
CRS Purpose Code:	41010 (Environmental policy and administrative management), 43040 (Rural development) and 41030 (Bio-diversity)
Module objective:	Governmental authorities at national and provincial levels (Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) and Provincial People's Committees (PPCs)) utilize enhanced political, planning and financial capacities to foster the climate-resilient development of the Mekong Delta's coastal ecosystems
Project term:	June 2011- July 2018
Project volume:	EUR 23,570,000
Commissioning party:	German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ); Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT)
Lead executing agency:	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)
Implementing organisations (in the partner country):	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)
Other participating development organisations:	Departments of Agriculture and Rural Development (DARD), Provincial People's Committees (PPCs), Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment (MONRE) and its Department for Viet Nam Administration of Seas and Islands (VASI), Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI), South-West Steering Committee (SWSC), Southern Institute for Water Resources and Research (SIWRR), Southern Institute for Water Resources and Planning (SIWRP)
Target groups:	The indirect target group is the population of the Mekong Delta (17 million people); the direct target group is the 3.5 million people living along the coastline of the five provinces served by the project (An Giang, Kien Giang, Ca Mau, Bac Lieu and Soc Trang) as well as 10,000 farmers benefitting from improvements in agriculture and aquaculture.

## Project description

### *Framework conditions*

Viet Nam is considered one of the countries facing extreme risks from climate change. The Mekong Delta is particularly vulnerable owing to its geography and population size (17 million people). The Delta is one of Viet Nam's most important economic regions for areas including rice production (also for export), aquaculture and industries. Flooding associated with a rise in sea levels may irrevocably reduce rice production by 40% (FAO, 2010). Coastal damage, including erosion and the loss of mangrove forests and dykes, is jeopardising the livelihoods of rural poor people who heavily rely on natural resources.

The increasing intrusion of sea water into groundwater resources and soil salinization, non-sustainable management practices (aquaculture and intensive rice production) coupled with large-scale irrigation infrastructure are contributing to the decline of the Delta's ecosystem. Climate change-related impacts and unsustainable land use practices are reducing the area available for agricultural production. Periodic flooding contributes to repeated harvest losses.

Immediate measures are needed to preserve the Mekong Delta and the livelihoods of its population in order to enhance resilience and foster adaptation to impacts of climate change, including the preservation and rehabilitation of coastal ecosystems. However, the absence of an interprovincial coordination mechanism as well as the lack of coordinated planning by government institutions at national and provincial levels and the lack of technical and financial capacity hinder the planning and implementation of effective measures. The legal and administrative basis has not yet been established for making systematic investments in climate resilience. The involvement of other strategic partners in planning and financing climate-resilient development measures is insufficient.

The Government of Viet Nam and the international donor community are showing strong political interest in measures to improve climate change resilience in the Mekong Delta and green growth issues. The Government of Viet Nam recognises the green growth approach as forging a link between fighting poverty, adaptation to climate change, reduction of greenhouse gases, protection of natural resources and economic growth. The 2012 National Green Growth Strategy (NGGS), the 2011 National Climate Change Strategy and the Mekong Delta Plan (MDP) are helping to harmonise the objectives pursued by the Government of Viet Nam and donors.

### *Strategic approach*

The programme's objective is: Governmental authorities at national and provincial levels (Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) and Provincial People's Committees (PPCs)) utilize enhanced political, planning and financial capacities to foster the climate-resilient development of the Mekong Delta's coastal ecosystems. The main focus of the programme is to establish the framework for better climate-resilient coastal protection by focusing on three fields of activity.

Field of activity 1, Policies and Standards, establishes the political, administrative and legal conditions for large-scale investments aiming to achieve climate resilience and green growth. The programme pilots specific and approved coastal protection and agricultural measures that serve to formulate and implement policies and standards and control the quality of measures.

Field of activity 2, Technologies and Investments, develops the technical and financial conditions for large-scale implementation of selected measures for climate-resilient coastal protection and water management as well as agricultural measures. National, regional and provincial authorities and partners gain stronger capacities; feasibility studies and investment plans for climate-resilient technologies and practices are prepared.

Field of activity 3, Institutions and Partnerships, aims to establish the institutional conditions needed for large-scale implementation of an approach that improves the climate-resilient development of coastal ecosystems in the Mekong Delta. The focus is on strengthening coordination and cooperation mechanisms at and between national and provincial levels to support coordinated implementation of supra-provincial and cross-sectoral measures. Cross-sectoral approaches and private-public partnerships (PPPs) are supported.

The programme works in six technical areas: agriculture, aquaculture, coastal protection, forestry, planning and budgeting, and water management. Each of these areas helps to develop climate-resilient solutions. The required framework and conditions (adequate political base, viable technical solutions and financial plans) have to be ensured prior to developing useful approaches that can be addressed in harmonised and coordinated cooperation. These approaches should be based on outputs from the six technical areas and should be implemented by the Government of Viet Nam or international donors.

### *Assessment of the programme design*

The methodological approach taken by the programme is coherent. The interventions in each field of activity consistently relate to the programme's objective and are strongly interlinked. The hypotheses underlying the results model are plausible. The structure of the results matrix is also mirrored by the operational structure. Contributions made by each of the six technical areas to the indicators and cooperation and synergies between the areas of work are defined and monitored.

At the operational level, the scope of the interventions and the cooperation system are well defined, and aimed at achieving the impact identified at the results level as well as by the programme objective indicators. The monitoring system developed by the programme is excellent.

*Basis for assessing the OECD-DAC criteria*

The appraisal covers the entire period of implementation from June 2011 to July 2018 with a focus on the second phase from August 2014 to July 2018.

Three indicators are formulated for the programme objective in order to assess the effectiveness of the measure. They largely correspond to SMART (specific, measurable, achievable, relevant and time-bound) criteria. Indicator 1 - development, ratification and implementation of a national gender-differentiated policy framework – and indicator 3 – use of the financial policy and investment planning capacity developed by the programme to acquire additional financing – are not time-bound. Both indicators are thus implicitly to be met by the end of the programme. The lack of any clear indication raises doubts about the possibility of delays at political level and may challenge the programme's effectiveness.

The intended impacts of the programme are primarily pursued by developing the capacity of partners at all levels.

Basis for assessment of the OECD-DAC criteria:	Individual and overall rating of the OECD-DAC criteria for ICMP:
<p>To determine the TC (Technical Cooperation) measure's overall rating, calculate the average of the individual ratings of the five OECD-DAC criteria:</p> <p>14 – 16 points: very successful  12 – 13 points: successful  10 – 11 points: rather successful  8 – 9 points: rather unsatisfactory  6 – 7 points: unsatisfactory  4 – 5 points: very unsatisfactory</p>	<p>Relevance: 16 points – very successful  Effectiveness: 16 points – very successful  Impact: 16 points – very successful  Efficiency: 13 points – successful  Sustainability: 14 points – very successful</p> <p>Overall, the programme is rated very successful with a total of 15 out of 16 points.</p>

**Relevance** (Are we doing the right thing?)

The programme is highly relevant as regards Viet Nam's development objectives. It contributed towards development of the Prime Minister's decision on regional coordination in the Mekong Delta (Prime Minister's Decision 593/QĐ-TTg), which will significantly improve climate resilience efforts in all provinces of the Mekong Delta. Practical implementation of Viet Nam's Green Growth Strategy is needed to effectively address the core problem. The programme responds to this need by intervening at the interface between policy, administration and implementation.

The contribution made to reducing poverty in the programme region is used as a criterion for assessing impact. Programme activities support revenue-generating measures for the sustainable use and protection of natural resources and access to and availability of food. The programme thus contributes to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, namely SDG 1 'End poverty in all its forms everywhere', SDG 13 'Take urgent action to combat climate change and its impacts', SDG14 'Conserve and sustainably use the oceans, seas and marine resources' and SDG15 'Sustainably manage forests, combat desertification, halt and reverse land degradation, halt biodiversity loss'. (Connection with a core problem faced by the target group: 4 out of 4 points).

The programme is also coherent with the objectives of German development policy, specifically regarding environmental policy and the sustainable use of natural resources in Viet Nam, and in general regarding adaptation to climate change and climate-resilient development. It is consistent with Australia's Economic Diplomacy Agenda regarding coordinated governance, development planning and investment in Viet Nam, as well as with the aid policy focus on resilience, water and food security and with Australia's global commitment made at COP 21 in Paris to address climate change with helping vulnerable nations to cope with climate change (Connection with relevant strategies: 4 out of 4 points).

The relevance of the programme is rated very successful with 16 points.

**Effectiveness** (Will we achieve the project's objective?)

Objectives indicator	Target according to the offer	Current status according to the project evaluation
<p>(1) MARD implements a gender-differentiated policy framework for the protection and climate-resilient development of coastal ecosystems (particularly legal frameworks for the promotion of mangrove forest rehabilitation, erosion protection, management of wetlands, water management and sustainable livelihoods) in the Mekong Delta.</p>	<p>A gender-differentiated national policy framework is implemented by MARD.</p>	<p>The programme has helped to develop the following regulations and policies through different instruments, in particular technical advice and capacity development. The gender issue was particularly addressed by supporting provincial Departments of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (DOLISAs) in integrating provincial Climate Change Action Plans into provincial Gender Action Plans. These are crucial to the objective's achievement.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>-The Prime Minister approved the first official policy for regional coordination within the Mekong Delta (Prime Minister's Decision 593/QD-TTg);</li> <li>- A coastal forest protection policy and development decree were developed to improve the sustainable management of 356,000 hectares of coastal forest and to reforest 46,000 hectares by 2020;</li> <li>- Operational regulations for the Quan Lo Phung Hiep irrigation system are in the review and submission phase; 8,624 km of canals will be managed more sustainably, which will benefit at least half a million people and provide better access to quality water supply for 329,000 ha;</li> <li>- The development of integrated coastal protection plans and of operational regulations for the Long Xuyen Quadrangle started in 2016;</li> <li>- The Vietnamese Green Growth Strategy (MPI) was translated into the context of one Mekong Delta province (An Giang);</li> <li>- At least three newly approved policies for coastal protection will be implemented in 2017;</li> </ul> <p><b>The indicator is on track and the programme's support for capacity building and regional exchange is likely to achieve more than anticipated until mid-2018.</b></p>

<p>(2) Five provinces' annual budget plans allocate funds to target climate change adaptation and mitigation that average at least 20% of their overall (investment) budget from 2015-2017.</p>	<p>20%</p>	<p>The following results were achieved thanks to a variety of in-depth capacity development measures, the networking of stakeholders to exchange information, awareness-raising of the need for prominent and transparent budgetary allocations to be made for climate change adaptation and mitigation measures. Four of the programme's five target provinces prepared this data for the period from 2013 to 2015; figures for 2016 are being prepared. 2017 data will be available in 2018. Three of the four provinces (Bac Lieu, Ca Mau and Soc Trang) had reached the 20% target by 2015. More importantly, despite their differences in economic strength and size, all four provinces did spend a similar annual budget of US\$20-30 million during that period. Funds are sourced from government budget allocations for a trusted purpose, allowing this mechanism to be used to track donor funding for climate change.</p> <p><b>The indicator will be achieved.</b></p> <p>A pilot green growth action plan (GGAP) including climate change issues is being developed for An Giang. Plans call for all other partner provinces to adopt this classification system in 2017.</p>
<p>(3) Programme partners (e.g. governmental authorities, civil society organisations, the private sector and research organisations) use capacities for investment policy, feasibility studies and investment plans developed by the programme as well as newly forged strategic partnerships to access additional funding of EUR 25 million from other development partners and international financing mechanisms (e.g. the Green Climate Fund) to implement measures fostering the climate-resilient development of the Mekong Delta.</p>	<p>EUR 25 million</p>	<p>Feasibility assessments and investment plans with a focus on coastal protection, agriculture and water management have been developed, finalised and presented to donors each year. In total, ICMP has developed feasibility studies which served as direct preparation for investments of EUR 110 million by providing technical support and building the capacity of partners. The allocation of funds is currently being prepared. Investors are expected to take up key suggestions from ICMP's feasibility studies, including massive upscaling of technical innovations developed by the programme. <b>This indicator has already been largely surpassed.</b></p>

The evaluation team comes to the conclusion that all three objective indicators will be *fully* achieved, if not surpassed, by the end of the programme.

Indicator 1 and 2 will be achieved entirely; Indicator 1 has the potential to be surpassed by mid-2018, also regarding the programme's activities in support to include gender into policies relevant to the climate resilient development and protection of coastal ecosystems; Indicator 3 has already been surpassed.

No unintended negative results were observed.

The effectiveness of the TC measure is rated very successful with 16 points.

**Overarching development results (impact)** (Are we contributing to the achievement of overarching development results?)

The programme actively supports the implementation of Viet Nam's Green Growth Strategy, which serves as the overarching political and strategical framework for ICMP's objective. The programme's intervention and support are clearly regarded as a major driver behind Prime Minister's Decision 593 on regional coordination in the Mekong Delta.

In figures, the ICMP's indirect benefits are to provide the framework to help to secure livelihoods for the Mekong Delta's population, e.g. the 17 million people living in its 13 provinces. People living in the Delta's coastal provinces and along the

coastline are the direct target group benefiting from the outputs of the programme's six areas of work. From a technical standpoint, the programme helps to safeguard and improve the livelihoods of 3.5 million people through coastal protection, and about 7 million people through improved water and agricultural practices and management measures. About 10,000 farmers have already benefited from ICMP's agriculture and aquaculture activities, and the potential for massive upscaling has been developed. Improvements in irrigated and floating rice schemes and shrimp farming are among these success stories.

ICMP helps to preserve the economic importance of the Mekong Delta, which presently accounts for about 20% of the country's GDP, by fostering interprovincial cooperation and connecting national and provincial institutions. It also connects actors at the different levels. This work is further supported by its involvement and as a co-chair together with the World Bank in the Mekong Delta Working Group. This body coordinates international support for the development of the Mekong Delta amidst the growing importance of climate change adaptation and resilience. In addition, a number of strategic partnerships exist to channel funding towards investments in increasing the protection and resilience of coastal ecosystems and safeguarding the livelihoods of people living in the Mekong Delta. These partnerships include the World Bank, the Netherlands, the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), KfW Development Bank, Agence Française de Développement (AFD), the Southern Institute for Water Resource Research and Planning and the private sector (Contribution to overarching development results: 4 out of 4 points).

In the broader context, the programme builds capacities for three major areas of impact: the political and strategic framework, the delivery of technical innovations and practical guidelines, and coordination and funding for massive upscaling.

In terms of the political and strategic framework, ICMP helps to develop the required gender-differentiated policy framework (gender tool, integration of targets from provincial climate change action plans into provincial gender action plans). A coordinated cross-provincial approach was established by bringing together national, provincial and interprovincial institutions through policy dialogue, capacity building, tangible planning and technical workshops.

The potential for upscaling built and fostered by the programme is not limited to technical and regulative achievements, but also includes tangible successes in developing feasibility assessments and mobilizing funding. Appropriate capacity development has made this possible. Most importantly, the programme complements its technical support for the implementation of the country's Green Growth Strategy – the political and strategic framework for climate-resilient and sustainable development of the Mekong Delta – with support for drafting feasibility studies that help to mobilise the necessary investments (Contribution to achieving broad impact: 4 out of 4 points).

The impact of the TC measure is very successful with 16 points.

#### **Efficiency** (Are the objectives being achieved cost-effectively?)

In the first phase running from 2011 to 2014, the programme focused on the provincial level, e.g. a clear focus was placed on activities in provinces with complementary interventions at the national level. In the second phase, the emphasis was on broad-scale outputs. This required a switch from the provincial level to an impact-driven and thematic focus. This switch increased efficiency as it made sure that solutions in one technical, regulative or management area can be applied in other, if not all, Delta provinces. The switch from upscaling and institutionalising the technologies developed during the first phase also enhanced efficiency in the second phase. The programme no longer worked towards a specific change, but towards a systematic one that focused on developing climate-resilient integrated coastal protection and management. This was possible because the first phase delivered technical and managerial innovations that were successfully translated into policies, thus becoming binding and ready for application on a greater scale during the programme's second phase.

Resource allocation was adjusted with the switch in methodology from the first to second phase. The number of international staff was reduced considerably. During the second phase, financial emphasis was placed on field of activity B, Technologies and Investments, followed by funds allocated for fields of activity A, Policies and Standards, and C, Institutions and Partnerships (Appropriate use of project resources: 3 out of 4 points).

The programme also made efforts to achieve much greater harmonisation with other donors, particularly with the World Bank, the Netherlands and UN organisations. Cooperation with other donors proved to increase efficiency, particularly in the framework of the Mekong Delta Working Group.

The programme has been able to increase its efficiency by leveraging funds from other development partners, which have been spent on joint activities. This refers to parallel financing of EUR 300,000 from the Embassy of the Netherlands on coastal protection; EUR 233,000 from the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) on coastal spatial planning; EUR 190,000 from the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) on regional coordination (Coordination with other donors and/or projects: 4 out of 4 points).

The efficiency of the TC measure is rated successful with 13 points.

### **Sustainability** (Are the positive results durable?)

The institutionalisation process pursued by the programme during the second phase enshrines the programme's outcomes in the governmental system of Viet Nam so that the national system will employ these independently from the programme. Several of the programme's measures thus aim at mainstreaming climate adaptation in governmental systems, e.g. translating programme outputs into procedures, regulations, guidelines and technical standards. As the programme directly contributes towards implementation of the government's engagement in the Mekong Delta, it can be assumed that the outcomes reached and changes induced by the programme will last.

A number of technical solutions developed, piloted and implemented by the programme are readily available for use by national or international partners. They will thus directly benefit the target group. These include solutions for coastal protection, agricultural and aquaculture livelihood and business models, sustainable irrigation and forestry.

A wide range of activities has been implemented at the level of target groups to pilot and introduce about 25 livelihood models. Three of these have been further developed in the second phase. In addition, numerous forest activities have been implemented (Degree to which the achieved results will be durable: 4 out of 4 points).

#### *At the level of institutional capacity building*

Capacity development is at the core of the programme's approach and is based on an in-depth capacity needs assessment, an internal stakeholder map and a SWOT analysis. At the same time, the programme's capacity development strategy could be used more thoroughly to guide programme interventions and identify possible barriers to successful capacity development.

From the beginning, the programme has considered and addressed key risks, most importantly the lack of coordination between and among sectoral and provincial actors. Overcoming this fragmentation has been a key approach of the programme (Consideration of risk factors: 3 out of 4 points).

The sustainability of the TC measure is rated very successful with 14 points.

### **Gender**

The programme has a cross-sectoral gender equality policy marker (GG marker according to DAC) of 1 (out of 2), meaning that gender equality is a significant but not principle objective of the programme. Gender aspects should hence be incorporated into the model/outcome as well as at an activity level. This requirement has been fulfilled.

The results of the baseline gender analysis commissioned at the outset, the programme's responses to gender, and gender equality issues to be addressed during the first and second phase were identified. Gender issues were also addressed more systematically and tangible results were pursued with the shift from the programme's first phase to its second phase. The programme has so far worked with five provinces to integrate climate change considerations into provincial gender action plans. A practical handbook for integrating gender into climate change activities at the community level has been developed. Furthermore, several women-oriented livelihood activities – such as the revolving fund in Soc Trang and the involvement of the Women's Union in floating rice in An Giang – have been carried out. Capacity building is used as a key measure to boost awareness of gender equality and consideration at community and provincial levels.

The evaluation mission recommended an assessment of the impact of gender-related activities to be implemented until the end of the programme. Results will be used to establish an impact-oriented and gender-disaggregated database that is linked to the programme's web-based monitoring system and thus available to all national partners. The programme will support the incorporation of outcomes and ideas for gender improvement into gender equality action plans and other sectoral plans through regular stakeholder meetings at provincial (and community) levels. In addition, gender capacity development will be provided to support the integration of gender and climate change into sectoral plans, and in particular for their implementation.

### **Published by**

Deutsche Gesellschaft für  
Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

Registered offices  
Bonn and Eschborn

Friedrich-Ebert-Allee 40  
53113 Bonn, Germany  
T +49 228 44 60 0  
F +49 228 44 60 1766

Dag-Hammarskjöld-Weg 1–5  
65760 Eschborn, Germany  
T +49 61 96 79 0  
F +49 61 96 79 1115

E [info@giz.de](mailto:info@giz.de)  
I [www.giz.de](http://www.giz.de)

**Annex 1: Recommendations for the remaining term of the TC measure**

<b>Result / Findings based on project evaluation</b>	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Receiver</b>
Major achievements yet to be fulfilled	Finalize and publish the coastal protection plan by MARD (indicator 1); verify indicator 2 (climate change spending of provinces) once data is available; consolidate successful and ongoing activities with focus on agri-food systems/PPP models (BRIA, aquaculture...)	Programme
An explicit CD strategy differentiated into personal, organizational and societal levels that outlines the link between CD measures and the objective of the programme is not available	Develop a CD Strategy that outlines the link between CD measures and the objective of the programme, e.g. allowing for assessing impact. The strategy should include gender to integrate gender and climate change into sectoral plans and for their implementation. The CD Strategy should also demonstrate how the lack of regional coordination is being addressed, and be linked to the programme's monitoring system.	Programme
The institutional, strategic and thematic fragmentation considered as a major challenge for integrated climate resilient management of the Mekong Delta needs regular exchange of information also on working level in government institutions	Further promote dialogue platforms on the working level, possibly together with the South-West Steering Committee	Programme
Gender as a cross-cutting subject	Perform an impact assessment on gender related activities; Support the incorporation of outcomes and ideas for gender improvement in Gender Equality Action Plans or any other sectoral plans through regular stakeholder meeting at provincial and community levels	Programme
Monitoring of gender related activities is done only by numbers, an impact assessment is not available	Establish an impact -oriented gender disaggregated database linked to the programme's web-based monitoring system	Programme
Documentation of best practices and lessons learned is not available	Develop best practices / lessons learned of all working areas including gender and widely distribute documents to all partners and stakeholders concerned.	Programme
An exit strategy for programme and activities at ground level does not exist	Develop an exit strategy for the programme and activities, particularly those at ground level to phase out first by end of 2017 without jeopardizing the smooth start of the new measure planned	Programme
	Prioritize on maximizing impact in accordance with ICMP's objective, and prepare the new programme to start in mid-2018	Programme

## Annex 2: Minutes of Mission



### Agreed Minutes of the Mission on the Joint Programme Evaluation of ICMP and the Appraisal of a Follow-on Programme

The four parties signing hereunder declare herewith that they agree with the findings and recommendations summarised in the attached report. Furthermore, the Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH and the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD) agree to continue the preparation of a programme concept for a new Vietnamese-German International Cooperation Programme under the working title 'Mekong Delta Climate Resilience Initiative' (MECRI) as discussed during the appraisal mission and during a planning and consensus-building workshop in Hanoi, Vietnam, on 20 January 2017. Australia takes note of these considerations and may choose at a later stage to join the discussion on a follow-on project to ICMP.

This summary report shall serve as the basis for eventually preparing a proposal (programme offer) to the German Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) for consideration and approval.

These Minutes do not represent a formal programme agreement, but rather reflect the assessment of the design mission and the results of the planning workshop discussion. They are not binding on either party to the extent that formal approval is subject to agreement by the Vietnamese authorities concerned and by BMZ.

(Place and date of signature) *Hanoi, 18<sup>th</sup> April 2017*

\_\_\_\_\_  
Mr. Tran Thanh Nam, of MARD  
Vice-Minister  
Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

*Tran Thanh Nam*

\_\_\_\_\_  
Ms. Luisa Bergfeld  
First Secretary  
Embassy of the Federal Republic of Germany



\_\_\_\_\_  
Mr. Jochem Lange  
Country Director  
Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale  
Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH

*Jochem Lange*

~~Ms. Claire Ireland~~ *Mr. Justin Baguley*  
Counsellor, Economic and Development  
Cooperation  
Australian Embassy Hanoi



## 1. Introduction

The 'Integrated Coastal and Mangrove Forest Protection in the Mekong Provinces for Adaptation to Climate Change Project', termed 'Integrated Coastal Management Programme', referred to in the following as 'ICMP' or 'the programme', is a joint development programme of the governments of Vietnam (Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, MARD), Germany (Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development, BMZ) and Australia (Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, DFAT).

A joint final evaluation mission was conducted in Vietnam from 10<sup>th</sup> to 24<sup>th</sup> January 2017 by a team consisting of staff from GIZ and DFAT as well as independent consultants.

Further to this final evaluation, the mission aimed at designing a new programme that is expected to start on 1<sup>st</sup> August 2018, and that will be based on experiences and lessons learned from ICMP. In the following, major findings and recommendations of the joint evaluation and the new programme appraisal mission are presented.

## Part A: Evaluation of ICMP

### 2. Summary of OECD-DAC Criteria

For each of the five OECD-DAC criteria relevance, effectiveness, impact, efficiency and sustainability, two questions are rated on a scale from 1 (not successful) to 4 (very successful). From this rating, an overall assessment for each criterion is derived on a scale from 1 to 16:

14-16 points:	very successful
12-13 points:	successful
10-11 points:	rather successful
8-9 points:	rather unsatisfactory
6-7 points:	unsatisfactory
4-5 points:	very unsatisfactory

### Relevance

ICMP can be regarded as highly relevant with regard to Vietnam's development objectives, especially with regard to the increasing importance of climate change issues in the Mekong Delta. The programme directly contributes to several key national strategies, such as Vietnam's Green Growth Strategy and the National Climate Change Strategy (NCCS, 05.12.2011). The programme itself supports the development of a new key policy for the Mekong Delta, namely the Prime Minister's Decision on regional coordination in the Mekong Delta (Prime Minister's Decision 593/QD-TTg).

The programme addresses the core problem identified in the programme document, i.e. that governmental institutions at the national and provincial level (especially MARD and PPCs) lack planning, technical and financial capacities to contribute to a climate resilient development of the coastal ecosystems in the Mekong Delta.

The programme contributes to Australia's global climate change commitment, its long-standing commitment to development in the Mekong Delta. ICMP is in line with Australia's Economic Diplomacy Strategy, and it is relevant to Australia's priorities to regional security as well as to helping vulnerable nations to cope with climate change.

The programme corresponds to the objectives of the German development policy with regard to climate change adaptation. One of the three focal points for the Vietnamese-German cooperation is 'Environmental Policy and Sustainable Use of Natural Resources', which includes adaptation to climate change in the coastal zone of the Mekong Delta.

**Relevance Rating: 16 = very successful**

The project sets out to address a core development problem faced by the target group	4
The project is in harmony with the relevant strategies.	4

**Effectiveness****Accordance with the indicators**

**Indicator 1:** MARD implements a national gender-differentiated policy framework for the protection and climate-resilient development of coastal ecosystems (particularly legal frameworks for the promotion of mangrove forest rehabilitation, erosion protection, management of wetlands, water management and sustainable livelihoods) in the Mekong Delta.

- The indicator is very likely to be fully met at the end of the programme. The programme contributed to the development of a number of policies, guidelines and regulations which have already been approved or are expected to be approved until the end of the programme. Most importantly, the support for the development of the Prime Minister's Decision 593 on Regional Coordination in the Mekong Delta can be regarded as an overarching frame for policy and investment interventions in the Mekong Delta.

**Indicator 2:** The funds aiming at climate change adaptation and mitigation allocated in the annual budget plans of 5 provinces in the timeframe 2015-2017 amount on average to at least 20% of the respective overall (investment) budgets.

- The indicator is very likely to be fully met at the end of the programme. Four of the five provinces prepared budgetary data for the timeframe 2013-2015, while data for 2016 is in preparation. Three of these four provinces (Bac Lieu, Ca Mau, Soc Trang) reached the 20% target already by 2015. A scaling up of the developed approach to 13 provinces with support from UNDP and GIZ is foreseen.

**Indicator 3:** The capacities of programme partners for investment policy and investment plans, feasibility studies and investment plans developed by the programme, as well as the newly built strategic partnerships have been used by programme partners (e.g. government authorities, civil society organizations, private sector, research organizations) to access additional funding of EUR 25 million from other development partners and international financing mechanisms (e.g. Green Climate Fund) for the implementation of measures fostering climate-resilient development of the Mekong Delta.

- The indicator has already been remarkably surpassed. ICMP supported feasibility studies for estimated investments of 110 million EUR. The investment projects are currently being prepared, especially in the area of coastal protection. The investment plans developed by the investors are expected to include key suggestions from ICMP's feasibility studies. This leads to a significant scaling up of innovations developed by the programme. The indicator level is expected to further increase until the end of the programme.

**Monitoring and evaluation**

The effectiveness of the programme was supported by an effective and innovative web-based monitoring system which allows both, GIZ and the national authorities to track progress of the

programme across all indicators and activities in real time. The monitoring system has replaced all reporting from GIZ to national authorities.

**No unintended negative results occurred or if they did, they were responded to**

- There is no indication for unintended negative results.

**Effectiveness Rating: 16 = very successful**

The project will achieve the objective agreed in the commission, in accordance with the indicators	4
No unintended negative results occurred or if they did, they were responded to	4

**Overarching development results / impact**

**Contribution to overarching development results**

- The programme actively supports the implementation of Vietnam's Green Growth Strategy, which is the overarching political and strategic framework applicable to ICMP's objectives. The programme is also unequivocally regarded as major contributor for the Prime Minister's Decision No. 593 which benefits the 17 million people living in the 13 provinces of the Mekong Delta.

**Contribution to broad impact**

- ICMP has been able to contribute to broad impact by building up capacities for three major impact areas: (1) improving political framework conditions; (2) developing technical innovations and practical guidelines; (3) supporting investment into climate resilience.
- Amongst others, the programme has been able to contribute to better protecting 720 kilometres of coastline of the Mekong Delta against extreme weather events like storms and floods. This is expected to make more than 3.5 million people in coastal districts more resilient against the impacts of climate change. ICMP also supported the development of the coastal forest policy which will bring 356,000 hectares of coastal forests under more sustainable management, including the afforestation of 46,000 hectares of new coastal forests by 2020. These 46,000 hectares will provide ecosystem services worth approximately 102 million USD annually.
- With regard to gender, the gender tool developed by the programme boosts participation of women in climate change and disaster preparedness activities. Based on the programme's support, provincial Departments of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs (DOLISAs) are expected to integrate provincial Climate Change Action Plan targets into provincial Gender Action Plans.

**Impact Rating: (16 = very successful)**

It is anticipated that the project will help achieve overarching long-term (political) objectives	4
The project helps achieve broad impact	4

**Efficiency**

The programme shifted its focus between its first phase (2011-2014) and second phase (2014-2018), in particular by moving from a province-oriented to an impact-oriented and systemic approach. This has led to increased efficiency and has allowed for a reduction of international long-term staff.

From Australia's viewpoint, the instrument of a delegated cooperation has been able to deliver tangible results, but has been limited in supporting Australian visibility towards Vietnamese and international partners. From Germany's perspective, the collaboration with Australia has been a success factor in helping to build a broad alliance for climate resilience in the Mekong Delta.

The programme has been able to increase its efficiency by leveraging funds from other development partners which have been spent in joint activities. This refers to parallel financing by the Embassy of the Netherlands of 300.000 Euro on coastal protection; by the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP) of 233.000 Euros on coastal spatial planning; and by UNDP of 190.000 Euro on regional coordination.

**Efficiency Rating: (13 = successful)**

The use of project resources is appropriate with regard to the achieved results	3
The opportunity of coordinating with other donors and/or projects has been explored and, if possible, implemented	4

**Sustainability**

**Durability of positive results of the TC measure**

The programme is closely aligned with the Vietnamese government, both on the strategic and the implementation level. Thus, it is highly likely that many of the programme's interventions will last after the programme's end, not least with regard to regional coordination, coastal protection including mangrove rehabilitation as well as water management (operational regulations) and agriculture (new business models / new cooperatives).

**At the level of target groups**

A wide range of activities has been implemented at the level of target groups, for instance 25 livelihood models, three of which have been further developed in the second phase, and numerous forest activities.

**At the level of institutional capacity building**

Capacity development is at the core of the programme's approach and based on an in-depth capacity needs assessment, an internal stakeholder map and a SWOT analysis. At the same time, the programme's capacity development strategy could be depicted and geared for better monitoring. Thus possible barriers for successful capacity development can be identified and properly addressed.

**Consideration of risk factors**

ICMP has considered and addressed key risks, most importantly the lack of coordination between and among sectoral and provincial actors. Overcoming such fragmentation has been a key approach of the programme.

**Sustainability Rating: (14 = very successful)**

It is anticipated that the project's positive results will be durable	4
The project takes into account possible risk factors that could influence the longer-term sustainability of results	3

### Overall rating

Criterion	Score	Rating
Relevance	16	very successful
Effectiveness	16	very successful
Impact	16	very successful
Efficiency	13	successful
Sustainability	14	▼ very successful
Average rating for all criteria	15	
Overall rating for the project	very successful	

### Gender

ICMP has a gender OECD/DAC classification (GG) of 1. The GG1 classification means that gender equality is a significant objective, i.e. although it is important it is not one of the principal reasons for undertaking the development measure. ICMP has worked with five provinces to integrate climate change considerations into provincial gender action plans and has developed a practical handbook for integrating gender into climate change activities on the community level. Furthermore, several women-oriented livelihood activities – such as the revolving fund in Soc Trang or the Women's Union's involvement in floating rice in An Giang – were carried out.

### Recommendations for the rest of the programme implementation until July 2018

#### **Major achievements yet to be fulfilled**

- Finalization and publication of the coastal protection plan by MARD (indicator 1)
- Verification of indicator 2 (climate change spending of provinces) once data is available
- Consolidation of successful and ongoing activities with focus on agrifood systems/PPP models (Better Rice Initiative Asia, aquaculture)

#### **Key recommendations**

- Phasing out of activities at ground level (farmer groups) until end of 2017
- Focus on all outputs that are yet to be completed and/or achieved with priority on maximizing impact in accordance with ICMP's objective, and to prepare the new programme to start in mid-2018

#### **Additional recommendations**

- Develop a capacity development strategy that outlines the link between capacity development measures and the objective of the programme, including gender and a link to the monitoring system
- Further promote dialogue platforms on the working level to promote regional coordination in the Mekong Delta, possibly together with Ministry of Planning and Investment, Ministry of Agriculture and rural Development, the South-West Steering Committee
- Ensure donor visibility throughout the programme

- Use feasibility study for coastal protection as best practice to develop – or to support the development of – similar studies for ICMP's agriculture and aquaculture working areas, including analysis of respective application areas and economic potential
- Gender: impact assessment of gender related activities. Provision of gender capacity development to integrate gender and climate change into sectoral plans and their implementation. Support the incorporation of outcomes and ideas for gender improvement in Gender Equality Action Plans or any other sectoral plans through regular stakeholder meetings at provincial (and community) levels; establish an impact-oriented gender disaggregated database that is linked to the programme's web-based monitoring system.
- Develop a transition strategy for the programme and activities to ensure no significant interruption period between the end of ICMP and the start of the new programme. A smooth exit strategy is required for those activities at ground level that will phase out first by end of 2017.

## **Part B: Design of a new technical cooperation programme**

### **3. Recommendations made in ICMP's evaluation for designing the new programme**

The design of the new programme is based on the findings of the evaluation mission, specifically:

- the insight that the key challenges for managing the Mekong Delta in a more climate-resilient manner are:
  - the lack of a robust institutional framework,
  - the need for a better coordination of investment planning on a regional level, and
  - the need for climate-adapted technologies and solutions for agriculture and water management;
- The idea to learn from successful approaches of ICMP in order to integrate them into the new programme.

### **4. Design of the new programme**

The draft title of the new programme is "Mekong Delta Climate Resilience Initiative" (MECRI). The programme aims to strengthen the climate-resilient management of the Mekong Delta with high technologies applied in land and water management. The programme focuses on three components:

- **Institutions**
  - Institutional framework conditions (policy advisory services, capacity building)
  - Mandates and responsibilities
  - Regional coordination/linkage mechanisms (sectoral or sub-regional)
- **Investment Policy**
  - Support to climate resilient investment planning (feasibility studies)
  - Regional and sectoral investment planning, processes and mechanisms
  - Capacity development for efficient cross-provincial investment projects
- **Technologies**
  - Cross-provincial, climate-resilient agro-food systems
  - Selected value chain agriculture and aquaculture development models (high technology application in agro producing and processing, market linkage models, and farmer organisation)
  - Climate-resilient water management technologies and solutions

The three components will focus but are not limited on regional coordination, water and land management (agriculture).

### 3.1 Objectives and indicators, and basic methodological approach

By applying a systemic approach, the new programme will be designed according to the following preliminary objectives and indicators:

Objectives	Indicators
<b>Outcome:</b> The Mekong Delta is managed in a more climate resilient manner.	<b>Indicator 1:</b> A regional coordination mechanism for the Mekong Delta serves as a framework for key actors to jointly decide on gender sensitive policies and investments for climate resilience. <b>Indicator 2:</b> Feasibility assessments and investment plans are used by government authorities and the private sector to approve on Investments of X million Euros. <b>Indicator 3:</b> Improved income from inclusive climate resilient agriculture and water management solutions <b>Baseline:</b> X <b>Target:</b> X
<b>Output A: Institutions</b> An institutional framework for regional coordination on climate resilience in the Mekong Delta is established.	<b>Indicator A1:</b> X regional or X sub-regional coordination unit is operational. <b>Indicator A2:</b> Two dialogue fora between Cambodian and Vietnamese authorities on water management in the Mekong Delta are conducted.
<b>Output B: Investment Policy</b> Climate resilient investment planning is coordinated on a regional level.	<b>Indicator B1:</b> Three feasibility studies or investment plans for cross-provincial climate resilience projects are elaborated. <b>Indicator B2:</b> A gender sensitive capacity development strategy to strengthen regional planning, priority setting and investment planning is implemented.
<b>Output C: Technologies</b> Climate-adapted technologies and solutions for agriculture and water management are established.	<b>Indicator C1:</b> Two new technologies (for instance in the area of water management) are established and used by government authorities or the private sector. <b>Indicator C2:</b> One new solution (for instance new agricultural inclusive business models) is established and used by government authorities or the private sector.

### 3.2 Target groups and other stakeholders

The target group of the programme is the population of the Mekong Delta of around 17 million women and men (2017). At the same time, capacity building activities will directly benefit decision-makers and technical staff from Vietnamese government authorities, research institutions and private sector companies.

### 3.3 Executing agency and partner structure

It is recommended that the executing agency of the programme is the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD). At the same time, the programme should interact directly with the South-West Steering Committee, the Ministry of Planning and Investments, the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment and other stakeholders as appropriate.

## 5. Programme area and planned term

The programme should run for a time period of three years. It should start on 1 August 2018 and consequently will terminate on 31 July 2021. The programme should have offices in Hanoi and Can Tho, possibly complemented by additional offices in Ho Chi Minh City and Mekong Delta provinces.

## 6. Key risks

The key risks related to achieving the programme objective are:

- The government engagement for regional coordination may lose momentum.
- Extreme weather events and natural disasters could reduce the expected impacts or delay the implementation of programme activities.
- Provinces take up fewer credits due to changes in ODA regulations (Decree 16) which may lead to less financing available for climate-resilient investments.

## 7. Next steps

Based on these minutes of the mission, the mission team will prepare a summary evaluation report which will be shared with all partners.

The mission team will also draft a project proposal for the new programme. This proposal will be closely discussed with the donors as well as with MARD.

In May 2017, the new programme shall be discussed at the Vietnamese-German government negotiations.

## 8. Summary of recommendations made by Vice Minister Nam and other representatives of MARD regarding the concept of the new programme

- An appropriate title for the new programme needs to be identified. Adaptation is an important strength of the Mekong Delta's population, for instance as demonstrated by the population how to deal and use benefits associated with floods. In the Vietnamese context, adaptation to climate change is preferred to 'resilience'.
- MARD agrees with the overall objective, the three pillars: institution, investment policy and technology proposed for the new programme.
- MARD needs a mechanism to closely link and coordinate with the 13 Mekong Delta provinces regarding planning, investment, advice and policy.
- Engagement of professional national technical staff adds the advantage of local knowledge.
- The new programme should support the development of agricultural and water management models that address the necessary shift in agriculture to enhance the production value, particularly in areas facing deterioration through salt water intrusion.

- The new programme should also support the development of region wide evaluation criteria for the agricultural sector in the Mekong Delta as a policy basis for MARD.