

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Sent: Saturday, 11 November 2023 2:12 PM
To: Gemma Huggins; s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Cc: DM Israel-Gaza-Taskforce; Ridwaan Jadwat
Subject: RE: **Media enquiry for action/advice** due 2pm today / s 47F(1) / s 47G(1)(a) / Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Hi Gemma

Have spoken with s 22(1)(a)(ii) (MLS) again and we agreed that Defence will draft and we can review.

Cheers

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Sent: Saturday, 11 November 2023 2:06 PM
To: Gemma Huggins <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Cc: s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au>; Ridwaan Jadwat <Ridwaan.Jadwat@dfat.gov.au>
Subject: RE: **Media enquiry for action/advice** due 2pm today / s 47F(1) / s 47G(1)(a) / Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Hi Gemma

I spoke with s 22(1)(a)(ii) in MLS and they read it as military aid. They will discuss and potentially seek clarification from s 47G(1)(a)

We can hold for now. We don't provide humanitarian aid to Israel, so should be a straightforward response.

Cheers

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: Gemma Huggins <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>
Sent: Saturday, 11 November 2023 1:52 PM
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Cc: s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au>; Ridwaan Jadwat <Ridwaan.Jadwat@dfat.gov.au>
Subject: Re: **Media enquiry for action/advice** due 2pm today / s 47F(1) / s 47G(1)(a) / Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Can we confirm its military aid that's being asked about?

From: "s 22(1)(a)(ii)" @dfat.gov.au>
Date: Saturday, 11 November 2023 at 1:05:44 pm
To: "Gemma Huggins" <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>
Cc: "s 47E(d)" @dfat.gov.au>, "Ridwaan Jadwat" <Ridwaan.Jadwat@dfat.gov.au>

Subject: RE: **Media enquiry for action/advice** due 2pm today / s 47F(1) s 47G(1)(a) Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Hi Gemma,

Noting Defence will respond to the first two points, we suggest a response to the third as drafted below.

Finally, what is DFAT's/Defence's position in providing aid to Israel in the midst of the Hamas/Israel conflict?
DFAT is not aware of Israel requesting military aid from Australia.

Kind regards,
s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: Gemma Huggins <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>
Sent: Saturday, 11 November 2023 12:50 PM
To: s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au
Cc: Ridwaan Jadwat <Ridwaan.Jadwat@dfat.gov.au>
Subject: Fwd: **Media enquiry for action/advice** due 2pm today / s 47F(1) s 47G(1)(a) / Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay[SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Team - We'll need some standard lines re our aid to Israel please.

From: "Chantelle Taylor" <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>
Date: Saturday, 11 November 2023 at 12:26:13 pm
To: "Media" <media@dfat.gov.au>, "Sarah deZoeten" <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>, "s 22(1)(a)(ii)" @dfat.gov.au
Cc: "Ridwaan Jadwat" <Ridwaan.Jadwat@dfat.gov.au>, "Gemma Huggins" <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>, "Marie-Charlotte McKenna" <Marie-Charlotte.McKenna@dfat.gov.au>, "s 47E(d)" @dfat.gov.au, "s 47E(d)" @dfat.gov.au, "s 47E(d)" @dfat.gov.au, "s 22(1)(a)(ii)" @dfat.gov.au
Subject: Re: **Media enquiry for action/advice** due 2pm today / s 47F(1) /s 47G(1)(a) Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay[SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Thanks for flagging with Defence Media. I've also left a message with Emily Hall, AS Defence Export Controls.

Ridwan/Gemma - please weigh in if you have anything further to the export controls angle.

Kind regards,

Chantelle

From: "Media" <media@dfat.gov.au>
Date: Saturday, 11 November 2023 at 12:11:47 pm
To: "Chantelle Taylor" <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>, "Sarah deZoeten" <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>, "s 22(1)(a)(ii)" @dfat.gov.au

LEX 9712 - Documents

Cc: "Ridwaan Jadwat" <Ridwaan.Jadwat@dfat.gov.au>, "Gemma Huggins" <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>, "Marie-Charlotte McKenna" <Marie-Charlotte.McKenna@dfat.gov.au>, "s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au", "s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au", "s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au", "s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au", "Media" <media@dfat.gov.au>

Subject: RE: **Media enquiry for action/advice** due 2pm today / s 47F(1) s 47G(1)(a) / Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Thanks Chantelle,

Appreciate the confirmation.

I'll also reach out to Defence Media and let them know.

Cheers,
s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>

Sent: Saturday, 11 November 2023 12:10 PM

To: Media <media@dfat.gov.au>; Sarah deZoeten <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au

Cc: Ridwaan Jadwat <Ridwaan.Jadwat@dfat.gov.au>; Gemma Huggins <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>; Marie-Charlotte McKenna <Marie-Charlotte.McKenna@dfat.gov.au>; s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au; s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au; s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au; s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au; s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au

Subject: Re: **Media enquiry for action/advice** due 2pm today / s 47F(1) s 47G(1)(a) / Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Thanks MLS,

This is a Defence lead, but happy to be consulted on their proposed response.

I'll call DEC at Defence now to ensure they're onto it.

Kind regards,

Chantelle

From: "Media" <media@dfat.gov.au>

Date: Saturday, 11 November 2023 at 11:22:40 am

To: "Sarah deZoeten" <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>, "Chantelle Taylor" <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au

Cc: "Media" <media@dfat.gov.au>, "Ridwaan Jadwat" <Ridwaan.Jadwat@dfat.gov.au>, "Gemma Huggins" <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>, "Marie-Charlotte McKenna" <Marie-Charlotte.McKenna@dfat.gov.au>; s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au; s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au; s 47E(d) @dfat.gov.au; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au

Subject: **Media enquiry for action/advice** due 2pm today / s 47F(1) / s 47G(1)(a) Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Good morning Sarah and Chantelle,

We've received the below enquiry from s 47F(1) s 47G(1)(a) asking about Defence exports and aid to Israel with a protest going on in Botany Bay.

Grateful for your advice if this is one for DFAT or Defence to lead on. If it is for DFAT, we would be grateful for a **cleared response back by 2pm today** to allow for FMO timeframes. Although, we will try to manage the journalist's expectations.

We would also appreciate **confirmation of receipt** of this request.

It is a requirement that draft responses are **cleared at SES level** before they are returned to MLS.

As the lead line area, you should consult relevant areas/Agencies as appropriate before returning the final draft response to MLS.

s 47E(d)

For more guidance and tips, please read [this fact sheet on the intranet](#).

Warm regards,
s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Media Liaison Officer | Media Liaison Section
Media and Communications Delivery Branch
Strategic Communications Division

T s 22(1)(a)(ii) | E s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au



© Kim Hill, *Among Women* (2011)

[We acknowledge](#) the Traditional Custodians of Country throughout Australia, and their continuing connection to land, waters and community. We pay our respects to all First Nations peoples, their cultures and to their Elders, past, present and emerging.

From: s 47F(1) >
Sent: Saturday, 11 November 2023 10:53 AM
To: Media <media@defence.gov.au>; Media <media@dfat.gov.au>
Cc: s 47F(1) >
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Request for comment - s 47G(1)(a) . Protest outside ZIM ship in Sydney's Botany Bay

CAUTION: This email originated from outside the organisation. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender.

Good morning,

We are seeking comment on an unfolding protest out the front of a ZIM Shipping Line ship at Botany Bay. The protestors claim that ZIM is involved in the shipping of “weapons of mass destruction.”

Can Defence/DFAT confirm whether ZIM ships are transporting lethal aid/weapons/ammunition to Israel from Australian ports?

And what is DFAT/Defence’s response to Australians protesting an Israeli owned shipping firm’s transport freighter in Botany Bay?

Finally, what is DFAT’s/Defence’s position in providing aid to Israel in the midst of the Hamas/Israel conflict?

We would like to provide the Government the opportunity to respond. Our deadline is 4:00pm AEDT time.

See an attached screenshot for context.

Thank you,

s 47F(1)

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Sent: Tuesday, 5 December 2023 5:05 PM
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Cc: Chantelle Taylor; s 22(1)(a)(ii) Hall, Emily MS 2;
s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Subject: RE: F-35s asked about in Senate Question Time [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]
Hi s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Many thanks for the quick turnaround.

Thanks
s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Assistant Director | Strategic Policy & Engagement Section
Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence & National Security Policy Division

p s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @defence.gov.au>
Sent: Tuesday, 5 December 2023 4:54 PM
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Cc: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>; Hall, Emily MS 2 <emily.hall2@defence.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @defence.gov.au>
Subject: RE: F-35s asked about in Senate Question Time [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]
Hi s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Thanks for the below. DEC has not received any applications from s 47G(1)(a) to export controlled goods or technology to Israel.

Cheers,

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Director Defence Export Assessments & Regimes
Defence Export Controls | Defence Industry Policy Division

Strategy, Policy and Industry Group

Department of Defence

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

[@defence.gov.au](mailto:dfat@defence.gov.au)

s 22(1)(a)(ii) | Russell Offices | Canberra, ACT 2600

IMPORTANT: This email remains the property of the Department of Defence. Unauthorised communication and dealing with the information in the email may be a serious criminal offence. If you have received this email in error, you are requested to contact the sender and delete the email immediately.

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii) [@dfat.gov.au](mailto:dfat@dfat.gov.au)>

Sent: Tuesday, 5 December 2023 3:54 PM

To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) [@defence.gov.au](mailto:dfat@defence.gov.au); s 22(1)(a)(ii)

[@defence.gov.au](mailto:dfat@defence.gov.au)>

Cc: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii)

[@dfat.gov.au](mailto:dfat@dfat.gov.au); s 22(1)(a)(ii)

[@dfat.gov.au](mailto:dfat@dfat.gov.au); s 22(1)(a)(ii)

[@dfat.gov.au](mailto:dfat@dfat.gov.au)>

Subject: F-35s asked about in Senate Question Time [REDACTED]

Hi s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Below is my rough transcript of F-35 questions in Senate QT this afternoon. We would be grateful if you could advise today (apologies for the turnaround) whether DEC has received applications from s 47G(1)(a) for export to Israel.

Thanks in advance

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

s 47C(1)

s 47C(1)

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Assistant Director | Strategic Policy & Engagement Section
Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence & National Security Policy Division

Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

dfat.gov.au | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Instagram](#) | [LinkedIn](#)



© Kim Hill, *Among Women* (2011)

[We acknowledge](#) the Traditional Custodians of Country throughout Australia, and their continuing connection to land, waters and community. We pay our respects to all First Nations peoples, their cultures and to their Elders, past, present and emerging.

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Sent: Monday, 23 October 2023 3:03 PM
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Cc:
Subject: RE: FOR SP&I ACTION - Priority 2 media enquiry - 23-2417 - s 47G(1)(a) - Israel exports - Deadline 1030, Thursday 19 October [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

s 22(1)(a)(ii) I tried to validate it against the EDRMS folder structure and identified one more in 2020 – which gives the totals below.

I'll put it on a page with the Defence media enquiry for Sarah.

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Sent: Monday, 23 October 2023 11:52 AM
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Cc: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Subject: RE: FOR SP&I ACTION - Priority 2 media enquiry - 23-2417 - s 47G(1)(a) - Israel exports - Deadline 1030, Thursday 19 October [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Hey s 22(1)(a)(ii)

s 22(1)(a)(ii) this is the info I could get out of it.

s 47C(1), s 47E(d)

Grateful if you could confirm, let me know if you need more info.

Best

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Graduate Policy Officer | Strategic Policy and Engagement Section
Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence and National Security Division
Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Sent: Monday, 23 October 2023 11:24 AM

To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@dfat.gov.au>
Cc: s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@dfat.gov.au>
Subject: RE: FOR SP&I ACTION - Priority 2 media enquiry - 23-2417 - s 47G(1)(a) - Israel exports - Deadline 1030, Thursday 19 October [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

No prob

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@dfat.gov.au>
Sent: Monday, 23 October 2023 11:20 AM
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@dfat.gov.au>
Cc: s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@dfat.gov.au>
Subject: FW: FOR SP&I ACTION - Priority 2 media enquiry - 23-2417 - s 47G(1)(a) - Israel exports - Deadline 1030, Thursday 19 October [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Hiya

If you have a moment, s 22(1)(a)(ii) will get you to cross check/double check some DEC stats. s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Thanks
 s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Assistant Director | Strategic Policy & Engagement Section
 Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence & National Security Policy Division

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>
Sent: Monday, 23 October 2023 8:43 AM
To: Hall, Emily MS 2 <emily.hall2@defence.gov.au>
Cc: s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@defence.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@defence.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@defence.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) <@dfat.gov.au>
Subject: RE: FOR SP&I ACTION - Priority 2 media enquiry - 23-2417 - s 47G(1)(a) - Israel exports - Deadline 1030, Thursday 19 October [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Sorry Emily s 22(1)(a)(ii)
 team will also forward you our Estimates brief for your visibility.

Agree and the

s 22(1)(a)(ii) I will be watching Estimates carefully. I
 have cc'd s 22(1)(a)(ii) (acting as me) and s 22(1)(a)(ii) the DFAT policy officer for Tech Transfer, Export controls and DEC.

Please keep them in the loop also.

Kind regards,

Chantelle Taylor

Assistant Secretary
Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence and National Security Policy Division
Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
s 22(1)(a)(ii)

dfat.gov.au | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Instagram](#) | [LinkedIn](#)



© Kim Hill, *Among Women* (2011)

We acknowledge the Traditional Custodians of Country throughout Australia, and their continuing connection to land, waters and community. We pay our respects to all First Nations peoples, their cultures and to their Elders, past, present and emerging.

From: Hall, Emily MS 2 <emily.hall2@defence.gov.au>
Sent: Thursday, 19 October 2023 1:42 PM
To: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>
Cc: s 22(1)(a)(ii) <[s22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)@defence.gov.au](mailto:s22(1)(a)(ii)@defence.gov.au)>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) <[s22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)@defence.gov.au](mailto:s22(1)(a)(ii)@defence.gov.au)>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) <[s22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)@defence.gov.au](mailto:s22(1)(a)(ii)@defence.gov.au)>
Subject: FW: FOR SP&I ACTION - Priority 2 media enquiry - 23-2417 s 47G(1)(a) - Israel exports - Deadline 1030, Thursday 19 October [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Hi Chantelle,

FYI – a media request that came through overnight. Our proposed response is outlined below.

Keen to stay connected in the lead up to Senate Estimates.

Emily

From: Media <media@defence.gov.au>
Sent: Wednesday, 18 October 2023 4:39 PM
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) <[s22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)@defence.gov.au](mailto:s22(1)(a)(ii)@defence.gov.au)>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) <[s22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)@defence.gov.au](mailto:s22(1)(a)(ii)@defence.gov.au)>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) <[s22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)@defence.gov.au](mailto:s22(1)(a)(ii)@defence.gov.au)>; SP&I Media <spi.media@defence.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) <[s22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)@defence.gov.au](mailto:s22(1)(a)(ii)@defence.gov.au)>
Cc: Media <media@defence.gov.au>
Subject: FOR SP&I ACTION - Priority 2 media enquiry - 23-2417 - s 47G(1)(a) - Israel exports - Deadline 1030, Thursday 19 October [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Good afternoon SP&I media,

Thanks for the chat just now s 22(1)(a)(ii). As discussed, please see the below media enquiry for your action.

Insert other background for line area as appropriate.

23-2417 - s 47G(1)(a) - Israel exports

PRIORITY 2**Deadline to** 1030, Thursday 19 October**Defence Media:****Journalist/outlet:** s 47F(1) s 47G(1)(a)**Responsible** SP&I**Group/Service:****Final Clearance:** s 47E(d)**Question:**

s 47G(1)(a)

Between 2017 and March this

year, Defence has approved 322 permits to Israel. The Defence Minister has been contacted for comment.

I'm seeking responses to the following:

1. The latest DEC (Defence Export Controls) Statistics <https://www.defence.gov.au/sites/default/files/2023-06/Financial-Year-2022-23-Statistics.pdf>

show no data for the 3rd and 4th quarter of the 22-23 financial year. This is contradictory to the Qon 1901 lodged by David Shoebridge that shows exports to March 2023. Why haven't the quarters been reported, and is the department able to provide figures?

2. Can the department provide a breakdown of how many items were exported to Israel (rather than defence permits), and what type of items in recent years? Why are these figures not publicly available?

3. How does the department track items sold by Australia within a country to ensure it is not onsold to other organisations?

4. Which country receives the highest number of defence exports, and which items are these?

Questions sent to ODPM (noting significant overlap):

I'm seeking comment from minister Marles on the following:

1. Can the Minister provide a greater level of detail about the items Australia is exporting to Israel

2. Is the Minister concerned these exports are being used in the current conflict with Palestine?

3. What safeguards are in place to ensure these exports are not onsold to other groups by Israeli companies?

Human rights experts have raised concerns Australia lacks transparency in the detail of our arms exports, including whether the value of exports; what items are being exported (such as a breakdown of whether they are category 1 or 2); and tracking whether the arms are onsold.

4. Does the minister have plans to improve regulation and transparency around arms

5. Does the minister still hope to make Australia one of the top 10 defence exporters in the world, as Chris Pyne previously said?

6. Australia's arms and ammunition export to Israel was worth \$ 2.3 million and imports were worth \$16.8 million in 2022. What safeguards are in place, if any, to ensure Australia doesn't import arms that have been tested or use on Palestinian civilians or children?

Defence Export Control System

- Australia's export control obligations draw from our membership of international export control regimes.
- Australia assesses each export application against relevant legislation.
 - This legislation addresses a range of issues including foreign policy, human rights, national security, regional security and Australia's international obligations.

- . A wide range of goods and technologies require an export permit, many of which are used for legitimate civilian and commercial purposes.
- . A case-by-case approach enables legitimate trade and mitigates the risk of inadvertently preventing exports that are in Australia's national interest, such as those going to humanitarian missions or global health activities.

Background (for journalist): Exports to Israel

- . Defence has issued the following numbers of export permits to Israel, broken down by calendar years:
 - 54 permits in 2019;
 - 27 permits in 2020;
 - 61 permits in 2021;
 - 47 permits in 2022; and
 - 41 permits in 2023 (as at 18/10/2023).
- . Permit approvals should not be confused with weapons sales as permits are required for a broad range of goods and technologies.
- . This includes, but is not limited to, munitions (including sporting firearms and munitions under Australian unilateral controls), radios, computing components, software, and chemicals that have legitimate civilian and commercial purposes.
- . Export permits are also required for goods being returned to Australia for repair.

s 47C(1), s 47E(d)

CLEARANCES				
	Name	Position/Appointment	Contact Phone	Date and Time

Drafting officer				
Contact officer				
Additional line area consulted and contact				
Additional line area consulted and contact				
Additional line area consulted and contact				
Strategic Comms Advisor				
Group/Service 2 Star or above				
Cleared/FYSA OSEC/OCDF				

Kind regards,
s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Assistant Director Defence Media

Media and Information Disclosure Branch | Department of Defence

Russell Offices | Canberra ACT 2600

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

[@defence.gov.au](mailto:media@defence.gov.au)

Alt E: media@defence.gov.au

IMPORTANT: This email remains the property of the Department of Defence. Unauthorised communication and dealing with the information in the email may be a serious criminal offence. If you have received this email in error, you are requested to contact the sender and delete the email immediately.

IMPORTANT: This email remains the property of the Department of Defence. Unauthorised communication and dealing with the information in the email may be a serious criminal offence. If you have received this email in error, you are requested to contact the sender and delete the email immediately.

IMPORTANT: This email remains the property of the Department of Defence. Unauthorised communication and dealing with the information in the email may be a serious criminal offence. If you have received this email in error, you are requested to contact the sender and delete the email immediately.

From: Sarah deZoeten
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) Chantelle Taylor
Cc: David Woods; Marc Innes-Brown; Gemma Huggins; Marie-Charlotte McKenna; s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Subject: RE: Media article on DFAT statistics [SEC=OFFICIAL]
Date: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 10:10:08 AM
Attachments: image001.png

OFFICIAL

Thanks s 22(1)(a) – this is very helpful

Sarah

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Sent: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 10:09 AM
To: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>
Cc: David Woods <David.Woods@dfat.gov.au>; Sarah deZoeten <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>; Marc Innes-Brown <marc.innes@dfat.gov.au>; Gemma Huggins <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>; Marie-Charlotte McKenna <Marie-Charlotte.McKenna@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Subject: RE: Media article on DFAT statistics [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Chantelle/Sarah

I will keep sending through items of relevance:

Sarah – as just spoken on the accuracy of goods classifications and who classifies them:

Scope and coverage deficiencies

11.23 The statistics are compiled from export and import declarations and are not collected by sample survey so they are not subject to sampling errors. However, they are subject to reporter error. While the Department of Home Affairs apply various logical and legality checks and are able to audit business records they operate in a self-regulation environment which mainly targets declarations with perceived risk.

Chantelle – on quality:

11.1 Among national statistical agencies, quality is generally accepted as "fitness for purpose". Fitness for purpose implies an assessment of an output, with specific reference to its intended objectives or aims. Quality is therefore a multidimensional concept which does not only include the accuracy of statistics, but also includes other aspects such as relevance and interpretability.

11.2 The [ABS Data Quality Framework](#) uses seven dimensions of quality, reflecting a broad and inclusive approach to quality definition and assessment. The seven dimensions of quality are institutional environment, relevance, timeliness, accuracy, coherence, interpretability and accessibility.

11.3 There are often trade-offs between the different dimensions of quality. In order to make economic statistics timely enough to be relevant indicators for the analysis of current and recent economic conditions this is likely to be at the expense of some degree of accuracy. The ABS, in consultation with data users, aims to optimise the different dimensions of quality.

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Sent: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 10:00 AM
To: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>
Cc: David Woods <David.Woods@dfat.gov.au>; Sarah deZoeten <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>; Marc Innes-Brown <marc.innes@dfat.gov.au>; Gemma Huggins <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>; Marie-Charlotte McKenna <Marie-Charlotte.McKenna@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Subject: RE: Media article on DFAT statistics [SEC=OFFICIAL]

Data is attached.

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Sent: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 9:59 AM
To: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>
Cc: David Woods <David.Woods@dfat.gov.au>; Sarah deZoeten <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>; Marc Innes-Brown <marc.innes@dfat.gov.au>; Gemma Huggins <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>; Marie-Charlotte McKenna <Marie-Charlotte.McKenna@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au>
Subject: RE: Media article on DFAT statistics [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Hi Chantelle

Please see attached for a more detailed run-down of our exports of arms and ammunition to Israel. The key point over all of this is likely that the ABS publishes this information whether or not DFAT works it into pivot tables and other products.

- **Where does the data come from?**
 - Official Australian trade data, collected by Australian Border Force and collated and released by the Australian Bureau of Statistics, based on [International Trade in Goods, September 2023 | Australian Bureau of Statistics \(abs.gov.au\)](#)
- **Why does DFAT publish it?**
 - DFAT value-adds and publishes all ABS-released Australian goods and services trade data in pivot tables and spreadsheets on the department's website to inform the department and public regarding Australian trade. Important to note that this trade data is also released on the ABS website (beta site), and any member of the public is able to procure any official Australian trade statistics through the ABS' consultancy service.
- **Is it accurate?**
 - Sources, Concepts and Methods document on ABS website [International Merchandise Trade, Australia: Concepts, Sources and Methods, 2018 | Australian Bureau of Statistics \(abs.gov.au\)](#). Question should be directed to the ABS.
- **What is the criteria for ABS classification as 'arms and ammunition'?**
 - UN Standard International Trade Classification. Ref Concepts, Sources and Methods above as to how goods are classified. Question is best directed to the

ABS as the data custodian.

Cheers
s 22(1)(a)(ii)

A/g Director | Trade Data Section
Trade and Investment Economics Branch | International Economics and Green Economy Division
Ms 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>
Sent: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 9:28 AM
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au
Cc: David Woods <David.Woods@dfat.gov.au>; Sarah deZoeten <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>; Marc Innes-Brown <marc.innes@dfat.gov.au>; Gemma Huggins <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>; Marie-Charlotte McKenna <Marie-Charlotte.McKenna@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au
Subject: RE: Media article on DFAT statistics [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Hi s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Confirming we need background on:

- Where does the data come from?
- Why does DFAT publish it?
- Is it accurate?
- What is the criteria for ABS classification as 'arms and ammunition'?

Kind regards,

Chantelle Taylor

Assistant Secretary
Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence and National Security Policy Division
Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
Ps 22(1)(a)(ii) | Ms 22(1)(a)(ii)
dfat.gov.au | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Instagram](#) | [LinkedIn](#)



© Kim Hill, *Among Women* (2011)
[We acknowledge](#) the Traditional Custodians of Country throughout Australia, and their continuing connection to land, waters and community. We pay our respects to all First Nations peoples, their cultures and to their Elders, past, present and emerging.

From: Chantelle Taylor
Sent: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 9:19 AM
To: s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au
Cc: David Woods <David.Woods@dfat.gov.au>; Sarah deZoeten <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>; Marc Innes-Brown <marc.innes@dfat.gov.au>; Gemma Huggins <Gemma.Huggins@dfat.gov.au>; Marie-Charlotte McKenna <Marie-Charlotte.McKenna@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii) @dfat.gov.au
Subject: FW: Media article on DFAT statistics [SEC=OFFICIAL]
Importance: High

OFFICIAL

Thanks s 22(1)(a)(ii) — appreciate your urgent action.

Kind regards,

Chantelle Taylor

Assistant Secretary
Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence and National Security Policy Division
Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
Ps 22(1)(a)(ii) | Ms 22(1)(a)(ii)
dfat.gov.au | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Instagram](#) | [LinkedIn](#)



© Kim Hill, *Among Women* (2011)
[We acknowledge](#) the Traditional Custodians of Country throughout Australia, and their continuing connection to land, waters and community. We pay our respects to all First Nations peoples, their cultures and to their Elders, past, present and emerging.

From: Chantelle Taylor
Sent: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 8:51 AM
To: Sarah deZoeten <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>; Marc Innes-Brown <marc.innes@dfat.gov.au>
Subject: Media article on DFAT statistics [SEC=OFFICIAL]
Importance: High

OFFICIAL

Hi Sarah/Marc,

FMO needs background on this by 10am.

The country and commodity pivot table below is what the article [Australian arms and ammunition exports to Israel totalled \\$13m over past five years, data reveals | Australia news | The Guardian](#) refers to. Link to DFAT website is [Trade statistical pivot tables | Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade \(dfat.gov.au\)](#).

AUSTRALIA'S
MERCHANDISE
EXPORTS AND
IMPORTS

Trade type	Total Exports															
Country	Israel															
Sector	(All)															

Sum of A\$000	Column Labels															
Row Labels	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022
891 Arms & ammunition	15	1,114	89	103	427	219	1,419	3	15	533	1,948	3,248	3,020	2,707	1,763	2,322
Grand Total	15	1,114	89	103	427	219	1,419	3	15	533	1,948	3,248	3,020	2,707	1,763	2,322

13,060

Defence have updated their QTB to direct any question on this data to DFAT as follows:

- If asked: about The Guardian’s article on arms and ammunition figures
- I understand that these statistics refer to broader international trade goods and services data from the ABS.
 - Further questions on the reported data should be directed to DFAT.
 - Defence publishes quarterly statistics on permits issued, including estimated total values as reported by applicants. These values include estimates over the life of a permit that may stretch over several years.
 - Defence statistics do not equate to actual exports as there is no obligation to report on an activity under a permit.

Kind regards,

Chantelle Taylor

Assistant Secretary
Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence and National Security Policy Division
Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
Ps 22(1)(a)(ii) | **Ms 22(1)(a)(ii)**
[dfat.gov.au](#) | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Instagram](#) | [LinkedIn](#)



© Kim Hill, Among Women (2011)
[We acknowledge](#) the Traditional Custodians of Country throughout Australia, and their continuing connection to land, waters and community. We pay our respects to all First Nations peoples, their cultures and to their Elders, past, present and emerging.

From: **s 22(1)(a)(ii)** <[@defence.gov.au](#)>
Sent: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 8:05 AM
To: Chantelle Taylor <[Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au](#)>; **s 22(1)(a)(ii)** <[@dfat.gov.au](#)>
Cc: **s 22(1)(a)(ii)** <[@defence.gov.au](#)>; **s 22(1)(a)(ii)** <[@defence.gov.au](#)>; **s 22(1)(a)(ii)** <[@defence.gov.au](#)>; **s 22(1)(a)(ii)** <[@defence.gov.au](#)>
Subject: Media article on DFAT statistics [SEC=OFFICIAL]
Importance: High

OFFICIAL

Hi Chantelle **s 22(1)(a)(ii)**

We’re updating our QTB this morning following the below article. Does your team have any ready TPs that talks to the DFAT data? The data seems to be from the following DFAT page and it looks to me like a broader category of goods/commodities. If you are able to send 1 or 2 TPs our way in the next 15-20 minutes that would be great!

[Trade statistical pivot tables | Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade \(dfat.gov.au\)](#)
[Australian arms and ammunition exports to Israel totalled \\$13m over past five years, data reveals | Australia news | The Guardian](#)

Kind regards,

s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Director
Export Controls Policy and Governance | Defence Industry Policy Division
s 22(1)(a)(ii) | Russell Offices | PO Box 7901 | Canberra ACT 2600
s 22(1)(a)(ii) | **Ms 22(1)(a)(ii)**
s 22(1)(a)(ii) | [@defence.gov.au](#)

IMPORTANT: This email remains the property of the Department of Defence. Unauthorised communication and dealing with the information in the email may be a serious criminal offence. If you have received this email in error, you are requested to contact the sender and delete the email immediately.

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

From: Chantelle Taylor
Sent: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 10:37 AM
To: s 47F(1)
Cc: Sarah deZoeten; Marc Innes-Brown; s 22(1)(a)(ii)
Subject: RE: Arms and Ammunitions exports to Israel media article - background on DFAT published data [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Of course s 47F(1)

Here is the link - <https://unstats.un.org/unsd/trade/sitcrev4.htm> and PDF https://unstats.un.org/unsd/publication/SeriesM/SeriesM_34rev4E.pdf. The code structure is as follows:

Division 89 – Miscellaneous manufactured articles, n.e.s.

891	ARMS AND AMMUNITION		
891.1	Armoured fighting vehicles and arms of war		
891.11	Tanks and other armoured fighting vehicles, motorized, whether or not fitted with weapons, and parts of such vehicles	8710.00	
891.12	Military weapons (other than revolvers, pistols and the arms of headings 891.13)	9301.11-90	
891.13	Swords, cutlasses, bayonets, lances and similar arms and parts thereof and scabbards and sheaths therefore	9307.00	
891.14	Revolvers and pistols (other than those of heading 891.31)	9302.00	
891.2	Bombs, grenades, torpedoes, mines, missiles and similar munitions of war and parts thereof; cartridges and other ammunition and projectiles and parts thereof, including shot and cartridge wads		
891.22	Cartridges for shotguns	9306.21	
891.23	Airgun pellets and parts of cartridges for shotguns	9306.29	
891.24	Other cartridges and parts thereof	9306.30	
891.29	Munitions of war and parts thereof, n.e.s.	9306.90	
891.3	Non-military arms		
891.31	Firearms, n.e.s. and similar devices which operate by the firing of an explosive charge (e.g., sporting shotguns and rifles, muzzle-loading firearms, Very pistols and other devices designed to project only signal flares, pistols and revolvers for firing blank ammunition, captive-bolt humane killers, line-throwing guns).	9303.10-90	
891.39	Other arms (e.g., spring, air or other gas guns and pistols, truncheons), excluding those of heading 891.13	9304.00	
891.9	Parts and accessories of articles of headings 891.12, 891.14 and subgroup 891.3		
891.91	Parts and accessories of revolvers or pistols	9305.10	
891.93	Shotgun barrels of shotguns of heading 891.31	9305.21	
891.95	Other parts of shotguns and rifles of heading 891.31	9305.29	

Kind regards,

Chantelle Taylor

Assistant Secretary

Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence and National Security Policy Division

Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade

P s 22(1)(a)(ii) | **M** s 22(1)(a)(ii)

dfat.gov.au | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Instagram](#) | [LinkedIn](#)



© Kim Hill, *Among Women* (2011)

We acknowledge the Traditional Custodians of Country throughout Australia, and their continuing connection to land, waters and community. We pay our respects to all First Nations peoples, their cultures and to their Elders, past, present and emerging.

From: s 47F(1)

@dfat.gov.au>

Sent: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 10:24 AM

To: Chantelle Taylor <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>; s 47F(1)

@dfat.gov.au>

Cc: Sarah deZoeten <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>; Marc Innes-Brown <marc.innes@dfat.gov.au>; s 22(1)(a)(ii)
@dfat.gov.au>

Subject: Re: Arms and Ammunitions exports to Israel media article - background on DFAT published data[SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Thanks Chantelle - could you point us to that UN classification and what it includes?

s 47F(1)

From: "Chantelle Taylor" <Chantelle.Taylor@dfat.gov.au>

Date: Wednesday, 29 November 2023 at 10:15:30 am

To: s 47F(1) @dfat.gov.au>, s 47F(1)

@dfat.gov.au>

Cc: "Sarah deZoeten" <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>, "Marc Innes-Brown" <marc.innes@dfat.gov.au>, s 22(1)(a)(ii)
@dfat.gov.au>

Subject: Arms and Ammunitions exports to Israel media article - background on DFAT published data [SEC=OFFICIAL]

OFFICIAL

Hi s 47F(1)

Please see the below background on the data referenced in the article [Australian arms and ammunition exports to Israel totalled \\$13m over past five years, data reveals | Australia news | The Guardian](#) refers to. Link to DFAT website is [Trade statistical pivot tables | Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade \(dfat.gov.au\)](#).

- **Where does the data come from?**
 - Official Australian trade data, collected by Australian Border Force and collated and released by the Australian Bureau of Statistics, based on [International Trade in Goods, September 2023 | Australian Bureau of Statistics \(abs.gov.au\)](#)
- **Why does DFAT publish it?**
 - DFAT value-adds and publishes all ABS-released Australian goods and services trade data in pivot tables and spreadsheets on the department's website to inform the department and public regarding Australian trade. Important to note that this trade data is also released on the ABS

website (beta site), and any member of the public is able to procure any official Australian trade statistics through the ABS' consultancy service.

- **Is it accurate?**
 - Sources, Concepts and Methods document on ABS website [International Merchandise Trade, Australia: Concepts, Sources and Methods, 2018 | Australian Bureau of Statistics \(abs.gov.au\)](#). Question should be directed to the ABS.
- **What is the criteria for ABS classification as 'arms and ammunition'?**
 - UN Standard International Trade Classification. Please refer Concepts, Sources and Methods above as to how goods are classified. Question is best directed to the ABS as the data custodian.

What we cannot answer is how the ABF data correlates with Defence's Export data as we do not have visibility. DPMO and ABF may be best placed to provide this advice.

Please call me with any questions.

Kind regards,

Chantelle Taylor

Assistant Secretary
 Defence Strategic Policy Branch | Defence and National Security Policy Division
 Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
 P s 22(1)(a)(ii) | M s 22(1)(a)(ii)
dfat.gov.au | [Twitter](#) | [Facebook](#) | [Instagram](#) | [LinkedIn](#)



© Kim Hill, *Among Women* (2011)

[We acknowledge](#) the Traditional Custodians of Country throughout Australia, and their continuing connection to land, waters and community. We pay our respects to all First Nations peoples, their cultures and to their Elders, past, present and emerging.

From: [Hall, Emily MS 2](#)
To: [Chantelle Taylor](#)
Cc: [s 22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)](#)
Subject: FW: Exports to Israel [SEC=OFFICIAL:Sensitive]
Date: Friday, 1 December 2023 11:16:40 AM
Attachments: [image001.jpg](#)

OFFICIAL: Sensitive

Hi Chantelle,

The ABS report is based on ABF data and doesn't reflect defence export permit numbers. We asked ABF for some of their data to better under the Guardian article. We provided this information to Sarah and [s 47E\(d\)](#) and hope it provides some useful background for you too.

Cheers

Emily

IMPORTANT: This email remains the property of the Department of Defence. Unauthorised communication and dealing with the information in the email may be a serious criminal offence. If you have received this email in error, you are requested to contact the sender and delete the email immediately.

From: Nockels, David MR <david.nockels@defence.gov.au>
Sent: Thursday, 30 November 2023 4:43 PM
To: Sarah deZoeten <Sarah.Dezoeten@dfat.gov.au>
Cc: [s 47E\(d\)](#) <[@defence.gov.au](#)>; Hall, Emily MS 2 <[emily.hall2@defence.gov.au](#)>
Subject: FW: Exports to Israel [SEC=OFFICIAL:Sensitive]

OFFICIAL: Sensitive

Sarah,

To our discussion earlier today.

[s 47E\(d\)](#)

Rgds,

David Nockels

First Assistant Secretary Defence Industry Policy

Strategy, Policy and Industry Group | Department of Defence
Russell Offices [s 22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)](#) | Canberra ACT 2600 | Australia
PO Box 7902 | Canberra BC ACT 2610 | Australia
T: [s 22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)](#)
Mob: [s 22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)](#)



I acknowledge the Traditional Custodians of Country throughout Australia. I recognise their connection to

traditional lands and waters and pay my respects to their Elders past and present.

IMPORTANT: This email remains the property of the Department of Defence. Unauthorised communication and dealing with the information in the email may be a serious criminal offence. If you have received this email in error, you are requested to contact the sender and delete the email immediately.

From: s 22(1)(a)(ii) <[s22\(1\)\(a\)\(ii\)@defence.gov.au](mailto:s22(1)(a)(ii)@defence.gov.au)>
Sent: Thursday, 30 November 2023 4:24 PM
To: Nockels, David MR <david.nockels@defence.gov.au>; Hall, Emily MS 2 <emily.hall2@defence.gov.au>
Subject: Exports to Israel [SEC=OFFICIAL:Sensitive]

OFFICIAL: Sensitive

Hi David and Emily

To better understand the nature of the goods that make up the \$13 million worth of arms and ammunition sales reported in the Guardian article as being sent to Israel, the team requested export data from ABF between 2018 to 29 November 2023 s 47E(d)

s 47E(d)

Please let me know if you would like any further information.

Kind regards

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

s 22(1)(a)(ii)

Director Regulatory Affairs and Compliance

Defence Export Controls

Defence Industry Policy Division | Strategy, Policy and Industry Group | Department of Defence

s 22(1)(a)(ii) | Russell Offices | PO Box 7901 | Canberra BC | ACT 2610

P: **s 22(1)(a)(ii)** | E: **s 22(1)(a)(ii)** [@defence.gov.au](mailto:s.22(1)(a)(ii)@defence.gov.au)

IMPORTANT: This email remains the property of the Department of Defence. Unauthorised communication and dealing with the information in the email may be a serious criminal offence. If you have received this email in error, you are requested to contact the sender and delete the email immediately.