



Australian Government

AusAID

Prepared by: Dili Post

Approved by: Vincent Ashcroft, Minister Counsellor Dili

Date Approved: 19 April 2013

Independent Evaluation of AusAID's Support to Rural Water, Sanitation and Hygiene in Timor-Leste

MANAGEMENT RESPONSE

Initiative Summary

Initiative Name			
AidWorks initiative number	ING002		
Commencement date	17 September 2007	Completion date	16 September 2012
Total Australian \$	\$41,079,188.00		
Total other \$			
Delivery organisation(s)	IDSS		
Implementing partner(s)	Ministry of Infrastructure (Mol) Ministry of Health (MoH)		
Country/Region	Timor-Leste		
Primary sector	Rural Water, Sanitation and Hygiene (RWASH)		
Initiative objective/s	<p>The initiative aims to improve the health and quality of life of rural people in Timor-Leste through three main objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ A more enabling sector environment for sustainable and equitable delivery of RWASH services ▪ Sustainable water systems delivered to targeted communities ▪ Improved hygiene and sanitation behaviour and practices in targeted communities 		

Evaluation Summary

Evaluation Objective: The primary purpose of this Independent Completion Report (ICR) is to identify lessons learnt to inform program improvement for Rural Water Supply and Sanitation Program (RWSSP), known locally as '*Bee, Saneamentu no Ijiene iha Komunidade*' or BESIK phase 2 and more broadly in relation to other initiatives within AusAID's Timor-Leste program. The secondary purpose of the evaluation is respond to AusAID's accountability requirements for a transparent and independent evaluation of the \$41 million initiative.

Evaluation Completion Date: 3 December 2012

Evaluation Team: Paul Crawford (Team Leader) and Juliet Willets (M&E Specialist for WASH, gender equality and development effectiveness)

AusAID's response to the evaluation report

The independent completion report was managed and guided by AusAID's Timor-Leste program in Dili and Canberra in consultation with BESIK, Ministry of Public Works (MoPW) and the Ministry of Health (MoH). Representatives from MoPW and MoH participated in the field visits and community discussions. AusAID considers the evaluation to be of good quality and it has that addressed the Terms of Reference thoroughly. The report was also consistent with the Evaluation Plan. The report used case studies which were very useful in drawing out key issues.

AusAID has taken the ICR recommendations for consideration in BESIK phase 2 and some of the recommendations have been noted in the QAI 2012 management responses.

AusAID's response to the specific recommendations made in the report

Recommendation One

Recommendation: Commission an update of earlier analysis of the Public Finance Management (PFM) and related governance issues in the RWASH sector to take account of government and contextual changes. Such analysis should provide recommendations on the best methods to address PFM challenges currently faced

Response: Agree

Actions: Recruitment of Long Term Adviser (LTA) PFM adviser, update to PFM Analysis to be undertaken, along with a separate Fiduciary Risk Assessment (FRA), PFM adviser will work in close coordination with MOH PFM Adviser for Health Sector Strategic Plan – Support Project (HSSP-SP) and the AusAID Governance for Development (G4D) program.

Responsibility: AusAID Program Director (PD) with BESIK

Recommendation Two

Recommendation: Engage in policy dialogue to address cashflow and recurrent budget constraints at district level faced by DNSA and MoH (in concert with work by HSSP-SP)

Response: Agree

Actions: As above PFM LTA and National PFM staff will be recruited to strengthen national level budgeting for re-current costs and national/sub-national level management of those budgets. In 2013, District SAS (*Servisu Aqua no Saneamentu* - Water and Sanitation Services) monthly re-current budgets have increased 150%, however recurrent budgets for MoH remain low. AusAID will liaise with HSSP-SP (PFM adviser) on planning and budgeting processes. In addition, BESIK is supporting the development of strategies for both water and sanitation to provide a road map and financing requirements to meet the GoTL Strategic Development Plan requirements.

Responsibility: Program Director (AusAID) and BESIK for implementation

Recommendation Three

Recommendation: Engage in dialogue with relevant Government of Timor-Leste (GoTL) stakeholders to clarify the purpose and value of a water resources management function in the context of the Timor-Leste Strategic Development Plan. This may include reconsidering where *DNCQA (Direcção Nacional do Controlo da Qualidade da Água - National Water Control and Quality Directorate)* is located within the ministerial structure to maximise the investments made in DNCQA in BESIK

Response: Agree –in engaging in dialogue to increase GoTL recognition of Water Resources as being key for sustainable management of water as a key natural resource which has a range of users.

Actions: Program Director and BESIK Water Resources Management (WRM) Adviser engage in policy dialogue with the Minister (MoPW) around the institutional location of Water Resources Management within GoTL structures (lack of clarity in the GoTL Organic law). BESIK will provide ongoing policy support on the location of the Directorate to maximise investments made.

Responsibility: Program Director & BESIK

Recommendation Four

Recommendation: **Ensure that SIBS (*Sistema Informasaun Be'e no Saneamentu* – Water and Sanitation Information System) is adequately supported in the medium term, both with respect to 'supply side' factors (technology maintenance/support and data quality) and 'demand side' factors (capacity, incentives and motivation to utilise sector information)**

Response: Agree

Actions: LTA Information Management System (IMS) Advisor recruited to mentor the supply side factors, with BESIK providing organisational development support for the demand side factors

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Five

Recommendation: **Work to support strengthened GoTL leadership of the WASH Forum including ensuring all relevant ministries and directorates are actively involved**

Response: Agree – and further high level linkages between all ministries on WASH through the Program Steering Committee (PSC).

Actions: Ongoing support to engaging other ministries in WASH Forum. High level strategic engagement in PSC.

Responsibility: PD & BESIK

Recommendation Six

Recommendation: **Ensure close coordination with DNSA's (*Diresaun Nasional Saneamentu no Aqua* – National Directorate of Water and Sanitation) internal planning for human resource development and new infrastructure projects**

Response: Agree

Actions: Regular meetings with Counterpart Directors to ensure that all planning for Human Resources (HR) or project implementation is with full knowledge.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Seven

Recommendation: **Increase its engagement with Ministry State Administration and Territorial Management (MSATM) and ADN (*Agencia Dezenvolvimentu Nasional* – National Development Agency) in relation to the coordination of water supply projects in communities, based on a sound assessment of the most appropriate focus of such engagement—either policy dialogue or direct partnership and capacity building**

Response: Agree

Actions: Ongoing engagement in strengthening sustainability of delivery or rural water supply, strategic level engagement through PSC and as appropriate capacity development with key ADN or MSATM staff.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Eight

Recommendation: **Support a Joint Sector Review focused on the rural water supply sector**

Response: Partially agree

Actions: BESIK is working with Water and Sanitation Program (WSP) and GoTL on a Service Delivery Assessment report for the WASH sector which includes the rural water supply sector. It is likely that this will replace elements of a Joint Sector Review. BESIK will also focus on supporting the GoTL to develop a road map for achieving the rural water component of the Strategic Development Plan, linked to the transition to a Water Services Delivery approach.

Responsibility: Program Director & BESIK

Recommendation Nine

Recommendation: **Facilitate inter-ministerial coordination measures to support school WASH interventions between Ministry of Education (MoE), MoH, MPW and MSATM**

Response: Agree

Actions: Needs to be in-coordination with UNICEF who currently play a large role in this. Focus on the sustainability (functionality – management) and coverage of WASH in schools.

Responsibility: Program Director & BESIK; AusAID Education team

Recommendation Ten

Recommendation: **Support formalisation and strengthening of GoTL staff accountability with respect to gender equality across relevant directorates involved in WASH. Advocacy should initially focus on key processes where a focus on gender is critical (e.g. CAP (Community Action Plan) and PAKSI (*Planu Asaun Komunitade ba Saneamentu no ljiene* – Community Action Plan for Sanitation and Hygiene) and on its inclusion in position descriptions. AusAID's Governance for Development initiative should consider providing focussed support for this agenda**

Response: Agree

Actions: Program Director will work with G4D on opportunities to strengthen accountability to gender equity through Civil Service Commission and Gender Responsive Budgeting. BESIK Social Inclusion & Gender Adviser, with BESIK staff and Program Director will support strengthening inclusion of gender equitable approaches, monitoring and outcomes with GoTL counterparts.

Responsibility: BESIK and AusAID

Recommendation Eleven

Recommendation: **Assist MPW to operationalise gender working groups to address shortcomings of the gender focal point model**

Response: partially agree – BESIK will focus at the Secretary of State (SoS) for Water and Sanitation so as do not dilute the efforts across a large Ministry.

Actions: BESIK will focus at the SoS level, and is also working closely with SEPI (*Sekretariu Estado Promosaun no Igualdade* – Secretary State of promotion and Equality), to strengthen SEPI's linkages to these groups, including looking at developing criteria to be met and accountabilities.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Twelve

Recommendation: **Actively collect and share evidence of benefits arising from the employment of female government staff in WASH to give support to the gender equality agenda**

Response: Agree

Actions: While focusing on female SDFs (Sub-District Facilitators), Institutionalising the evidence of gendered program delivery is also important.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Thirteen

Recommendation: **Review gender equality training to identify ways to more effectively harness women's inherent motivation to improve sanitation**

Response: agree

Actions: PAKSI manual reviewed, with training on engaging women and men in sanitation a key part of Sanitarian and other sanitation related training, monitoring systems established.

Responsibility: BESIK team – sanitation and SI&G Adviser

Recommendation Fourteen

Recommendation: **Proactively engage in the issue of menstrual hygiene—both in the home and in schools**

Response: Agree

Actions: Motivate interest in menstrual hygiene with GoTL counterparts, identify entry points through a range of areas of the BESIK program (Sanitation, Water, School WASH), with clear outcomes for the current phase.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Fifteen

Recommendation: **Undertake an in-depth gender impact assessment to allow wider gender equality changes to be captured and articulated and to inform gender development strategies in Timor-Leste**

Response: Partially Agree

Actions: Undertake an assessment of key impact indicators that relate to gender equality that can arise from gender integration into WASH programming – these would include but not limited to sustainability of rural water systems as a result of women's engagement in management roles, increased time available and use of the time and perceptions of women in leadership roles by men and women.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Sixteen

Recommendation: Focus on supporting sectoral knowledge and skills to enable practical implementation of measures to improve WASH access for persons with a disability

Response: Agree

Actions: Through BESIK activities implement targeted practical activities to increase access to WASH facilities for people living with a disability (PLWD). Provide sector level support to increasing access to WASH for PLWD, through inking and supporting both the WASH and Disability Sector NGOs, and through engaging MSS with WASH line ministries to implement practical measure to improve access to people living with a physical disability.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Seventeen

Recommendation: Work with MoH and DNSSB (*Diresaun Nasional Serbisu Saneamentu Baziku* – National Directorate for Basic Sanitation Services) to model the role of NGOs in promoting hygiene and sanitation at household level, and develop a comprehensive plan to best utilise PSFs (*Promotor Saude Familia* – Family Health Promoter), NGO staff and the planned sanitarians

Response: Agree

Actions: BESIK will work with DNSC (*Diresaun Nasional Serbisu Comunitaria* – National Directorate of Community Health) and DNSSB on developing partnerships to achieve the sanitation targets set in the National Sanitation Policy and Strategic Development Plan (SDP). Practically this will be achieved through the Sanitation Strategic Plans, sharing responsibilities for agreed targets across GoTL Ministries and NGO partners. Strategic Plans will be monitored on an annual basis. Sanitarian's will be employed, trained and deployed by August and in line with the MoH developments for SISCa (*Serbisu Integradu Saude Comunitaria* – Integrated Community Health Services) and the use of PSF, there will be clear roles of PSF and support for PSFs in the environmental health role by the sanitarians established and monitored.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Eighteen

Recommendation: Engage in policy dialogue and joint studies with GoTL concerning the best use of public finance to improve rural sanitation. This will require sophisticated methods to ensure that the market is strengthened and vulnerable households are sufficiently supported

Response: Agree

Actions: BESIK is recruiting specialist advisory support to bring the global experiences of financing through incentives and subsidies combined with the context of rural sanitation in Timor-Leste.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Nineteen

Recommendation: **Undertake sophisticated market analysis to identify key limitations and opportunities for various approaches to improving the supply of sanitation products and services**

Response: Agree

Actions: BESIK is currently undertaking further analysis of the market development needs for sanitation and hygiene products.

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Twenty

Recommendation: **Offer a set of low-cost dry toilet options that are appropriate in areas with low or unreliable water supply**

Response: Partially agree – low cost dry toilet options were available at the time of review, however popular demand is for a pour flush toilet (not necessarily low cost or appropriate).

Actions: Look at options for a social marketing campaign to promote low-cost dry toilet options (in light of current popular demand for Pour flush toilet). This would include support to move public perception which is currently that a household can build a simple toilet (commonly viewed as provisional), with a perception that 3rd party assistance is required for a more permanent toilet (& that a permanent toilet is pour flush)

Responsibility: BESIK

Recommendation Twenty one

Recommendation: **Clarify who best should carry responsibility for the provision of technical advice on toilet design to communities and masons, and for facilitation of ‘informed choice’ processes, followed by capacity building support to ensure these aspects are an integral part of the broader sanitation approach.**

Response: Agree

Actions: This is being discussed with the GoTL, an option is that it is a combination of people e.g. Sanitarians (MoH staff) and Sub-District WASH Facilitators (SAS staff). This could involve a cadre of trained “toilet builders” that could provide assistance to families to build their toilet for a small fee – needs further investigation.

Responsibility: BESIK