# Independent Evaluation, Australia–Pacific Technical College Program (APTC)

# **ANNEXES**

Annex 1: Terms of reference Annex 2: People and organisations met Annex 3: Evaluation plan – primary and secondary questions Annex 4: APTC statistical profile Annex 5: Questionnaire results Annex 6: TVET capacity Annex 7: Labour mobility Annex 8: Impact on graduates and employers Annex 9: Value for money Annex 10: Future of the APTC References

# Table of contents

AN	INEX 1: TERMS OF REFERENCE	4
1	Background and orientation to the evaluation	
2	Evaluation scope and duration	8
3	Evaluation process	8
0.		
AN	INEX 2: PEOPLE AND ORGANISATIONS MET	
Fiii		
Âu	stralia	
Sa	moa	
Pa	pua New Guinea	
So	lomon Islands	
Va	nuatu	
Kir	ibati	
AN	INEX 3: EVALUATION PLAN: PRIMARY AND SECONDARY QUESTIONS	19
AN		
1	Summary	
2	Courses	
3	Admissions and scholarships	
4	Enrolments	
5	Graduates and completion rates	
6	Staffing	
ΔN	INEX 5: OUESTIONNAIRE RESULTS	57
1	Responses from current APTC students June-August 2014	
2	Responses from APTC graduates	60
3	Responses from employers	
4	Trainers and tutors	
5	Administrative staff	
6	Industry engagement at APTC – analysis of questionnaires completed by	
U	country managers	
AN	INEX 6: TVET CAPACITY	81
1.	APTC capacity – What quantitative and qualitative capacity has APTC established	
	or skills development?	
2	How closely attuned is APTC to industry and employers?	92
3	How equitable is the provision of APTC services?	101
4	To what extent have the governance and management arrangements facilitated	
	or impeded APTC's operations?	106
5	What are the main constraints on, and opportunities for, further development of	
	APTC capacity for skills development?	110
6	What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions,	
	including direct support, and demonstration effects?	113
Att	achment 1 to Annex 6: Overview of RTO Audit Schedules – Stage II	119
Att	achment 2 to Annex 6: The future of APTC scholarships	120
Att	achment 3 to Annex 6: APTC engagement with the Pacific TVET sector	123

AN	INEX 7: LABOUR MOBILITY	130
1	To what extent has APTC training enhanced access to regional and international	
	labour markets, and why?	130
2	Incidence: APTC graduates take-up of Pacific regional and international employment	131
3	Age and migration	132
4	Differences between Stage I and II graduates	132
5	Reasons given for migration	132
6	Qualifications of APTC migrants	132
1	Is language a barrier to migration?	133
0	Obstacles to migration	100
9 10	Changes in Jahour market demand	125
11	Supply factors: To what extent does APTC have the institutional capacity to train for	155
	regional and international markets?	137
12	To what extent were APTC students and graduates provided information.	
. –	search skills and support for regional and international employment?	138
13	Support needed to achieve APTC's labour mobility objective	139
14	Conclusions	140
Att	achment to Annex 7: Identifying demand for APTC qualifications	143
AN	INEX 8: IMPACT ON GRADUATES AND EMPLOYERS	145
1	Evidence of APTC impact on graduates	146
2	Employment rates by gualification	146
3	Assessing the demand for APTC qualifications	150
4	Estimating the demand for APTC graduates	150
5	Evidence of APTC impact from employers	155
6	Were APTC graduates hired on the same or different salaries as others?	156
7	How productive are APTC graduates compared with others with	
	same qualifications?	156
8	The value to employers of APTC graduates	158
9	Conclusions	159
Att	achment 1 to Annex 8: Program evaluation	161
AN	INEX 9: VALUE FOR MONEY	164
1	Introduction: value for money	167
2	Financial and education management information systems	168
3	Economy of inputs	169
4	Cost structure analysis	170
5.	Cost-benefit analysis	190
6.	Sustainability	198
7.	Concluding remarks	201
8.	Appendix tables	204
AN	INEX 10: FUTURE OF THE APTC	225
1	Short term: What could be done to strengthen APTC until the end of Stage II?	225
2	Medium to long term: In what form and under what conditions could APTC	000
C	Ontinue beyond 2015?	
3	How well does APTC fit within DFAT policies on future aid to the region?	
4	what key principles and lessons should guide decisions about the future of APTC?	
Э	what would success look like in the long term for APTC?	∠33
RE	FERENCES	239

### **ANNEX 1: TERMS OF REFERENCE**

# Independent Evaluation, Australia–Pacific Technical College Program

#### October 2013

#### **1** Background and orientation to the evaluation

#### **1.1 Brief orientation to the APTC Program**

The Pacific faces high levels of unemployment, and skills shortages, exacerbated by the youth bulge.

In its 2008 publication, Skilling the Pacific, the Asian Development Bank asserts that:

Skills development is becoming a priority for countries in the Pacific, fuelled in part by the surging numbers of youth who have completed formal schooling yet lack the practical skills that are useful in the labour market. Skills formation has also become a priority in countries of the Pacific where job growth and emigration have created skills shortages. (p. xvii)

In addition, Technical, Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in most Pacific countries has not received the same priority from governments and donors as primary (and higher) education. It has also often not been 'valued' as highly by parents, students and employers. Pacific technical institutions often receive inadequate capital or recurrent budget support. As a result, many are rundown, function with out-dated or inoperable equipment and facilities, their teachers often lack recent industry experience and qualifications, and students often receive little or no workplace experience or assessment.

Few Pacific Island countries have clear strategies, long-term plans or resources available to establish effective skills development systems. Quality-assured national skill standards or externally recognised qualifications are rare. Available training tends to be supply-driven and often of low or variable quality. Access to skills development is uneven and favours males in urban areas. With few exceptions, employer inputs to the direction, content, quality or financing of the skills development system are minimal.

The Australia–Pacific Technical College (APTC) is a development program delivering internationally recognised Australian qualifications in targeted industry sectors in the Pacific region. The APTC delivers a range of Australian Certificate III, IV and Diploma level training according to industry demand, including in the automotive, manufacturing, construction and electrical, tourism, hospitality, health and community sectors, designed to meet labour market needs.

The APTC enrols adult students from 14 Pacific Island Countries (PIC) into existing campuses in Fiji, PNG, Samoa and Vanuatu, and a new Solomon Islands campus which commenced delivery in semester two, 2013. The APTC exists in the campus countries through partnerships with relevant government, industry bodies and national TVET institutions to facilitate competency-based training and assessment activities in the workplace, reducing reliance on the acquisition of physical assets. These partnerships help ensure that APTC is able to offer training that is relevant, connected and responsive to Pacific Island industry requirements. APTC first commenced operations in June 2007 with AUD149.5 million for 2007–2011. Australia invested an additional AUD152 million into the APTC in response to the increasing demand from the Pacific Island countries for 2011–2015.

Within the program is a scholarship scheme that was developed to ensure that Pacific Islanders, particularly those from non-campus countries have access to the College (APTC). The scholarships are awarded under the principles of access, transparency, equity, and merit, and complement other sources of financial sponsorship of students such as private sector or other donors and Pacific Governments. The APTC

scholarship scheme is structured a little differently from the core bilateral Australian Scholarships for the Pacific, because the courses are shorter term, block structure with flexible delivery modes, and have labour mobility objectives.

The APTC provides Australian certificate and diploma training to achieve its objectives of:

- supporting skill development in the Pacific, in response to national, regional and international labour market requirements
- providing quality, demand-driven training that will present opportunities for Pacific Islanders to access international labour markets
- increasing productivity of individuals and organisations in the targeted industries and sectors.

It is anticipated that APTC will have produced 4000 graduates during Stage II to a total of at least 7000 graduates by June 2015.

APTC is fully funded by DFAT's Aid Program. Details of funding expended and allocated are in the table below.

APTC Stage I (June 2007 – June 2011)	Total expenditure: \$134,743,264.94
APTC Stage II (June 2011 – June 2015)	Expenditure to date: \$94,181,397.70 Allocation: \$152,000,000

Demand for APTC training has been strong from Pacific Island employers and students. Industry is recognising the high quality and standard of the trainers and the training. An independent review of the APTC in 2009 concluded that in a relatively short period of time the APTC had found a unique and respected niche at the middle to top end of vocational training in the Pacific. The review of 2009 also found that by setting an international standard in TVET training, APTC has had a demonstrable positive effect and is increasing regional understanding of and appreciation for quality TVET delivery and the need for strong linkages to the industry and employers. It also highlighted the need to rebuild and invest in local institutions.

Skills development and vocational education are key elements of some of the important pieces of regional policy architecture, including the Pacific Plan and Pacific Education Development Framework.

The Pacific Island Forum Leaders have formally endorsed their support for the APTC in two of their recent meetings, noting the continued contribution of the Australia–Pacific Technical College to regional TVET development.

Two Pacific countries (Kiribati<sup>1</sup> and Samoa<sup>2</sup>) have acknowledged APTC in their strategic plans, illustrating the growing relevance of the College.

A number of Pacific Partnerships for Development and national education plans are including skill development (including (TVET) as a priority, in recognition of the importance of employment outcomes for school leavers and private sector productivity to drive economic growth.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> APTC is acknowledged in the Kiribati Development Plan 2012–2015. Specifically, the Kiribati Development Plan 2012 states on p. 22: 'Plans are under way to raise the quality of standards at the KIT by twinning with the Australia–Pacific Technical College'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> In Samoa's Strategy for the Development of Samoa 2012–2016, in commenting on tourism development, the publication cites: 'A sector workforce plan is in its initial implementation stage but has ensured that the linkages across the sector and with the training institutions including the Australia–Pacific Technical College (APTC)...'

The Aid Program's Pacific Education Strategy and Training Agenda, which addresses the broader skill development and employability needs across the Pacific, focuses on:

- (i) making sure young people have the opportunities to gain the skills needed to connect to pathways to further education, training and employment
- (ii) ensuring increased numbers of people gain valued qualifications in post-secondary education and training.

The APTC, by providing internationally recognised qualifications, is central to these efforts.

Australia is committed to strengthening economic growth in the Pacific and promoting private sector development. Given this commitment and the success stories of APTC graduates in these areas, an independent evaluation of the program needs to be undertaken to understand how APTC has performed in relation to its objectives.

# **1.2 APTC governance model**

The Australian Government, through DFAT's Aid Program are the owners of the APTC. DFAT entered into a contractual agreement with a consortium consisting of the Queensland Government (Sunshine Coast Institute of TAFE) as lead contractor, Box Hill Institute and GRM International for Stage II of the APTC.

A Board representing the Managing Contractor of the APTC Stage II contract was established under a Consortium Agreement to provide strategic guidance, oversight and exercise proper corporate governance in respect of the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) in the performance of the APTC Contract and the Scope of Service.

DFAT expects the Consortium to advance APTC's objectives and ensure compliance with the Terms of the Contract. The functions of the Board are set out in clause 6.2 of the Agreement and provide the reference point for the accountabilities of the Board with respect to their governance accountabilities and contract performance with DFAT.

While the Board is the ultimate source of authority on behalf of the Managing Contractor for the APTC and must bear responsibility for the performance of APTC, the Board assigns certain powers, duties and responsibilities to the CEO and management team of the APTC as appropriate to carry out roles and responsibilities as prescribed in the contract with DFAT.

# **1.3 Purpose of the independent evaluation**

DFAT is conducting an independent evaluation of Australian aid to the APTC in order to:

- assess the performance of the APTC against its three stated objectives with regard to its relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability
- assess the contribution and impact of the APTC to skills development in the Pacific
- identify ways in which APTC's value for money (i.e. economy, efficiency and effectiveness) could be enhanced during the remaining years of the program cycle
- provide an evidence base that will inform future programming decisions beyond 2015.

# 1.4 Primary users of the evaluation

The primary users of the evaluation are staff of the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade including its Australian Aid Program (Senior Executive and Program staff at desk and Post), and Pacific regional stakeholders including partner government and TVET providers, industry and employers.

# 1.5 Management decisions to be informed by evaluation

Evidence and lessons learned from the evaluation will be used to inform the future direction of the APTC beyond the life of the current contract and other areas of assistance being planned at the post-secondary education level, including skills development and labour mobility schemes. Findings will also inform decisions about the refinement of programming and management within the current phase of the APTC.

### 1.6 Key issues

The APTC has been operating in the Pacific since July 2007. The College has been acknowledged by Pacific leaders as contributing to closing the skills gap in the Pacific and is appreciated by industry and employers.

APTC is moving into its seventh year. It currently operates in five countries: Fiji, PNG, Samoa, Solomon Islands and Vanuatu. It physically exists in three forms: in partnership with industry (e.g. with Tanoa Group of Hotels based in Rakiraki, Fiji); in partnership with local TVET institution (e.g. with National University of Samoa in Apia, Samoa or Vanuatu Institute of Technology in Port Vila, Vanuatu); or on its own where a partnership agreement has not been negotiated (e.g. the School of Health and Community Services in Suva, Fiji). The partnerships have proven to be a sustainable way of providing capacity building to partner institutions and improving standards in industry. Pathway models with the Kiribati Institute of Technology and Don Bosco Institute in Honiara are also proving to be an efficient way to build up the local institutions, grow the numbers of skilled TVET trainers and provide an opportunity for further study with APTC for their graduates.

As a college that is demand-driven, APTC has unexpectedly had a very low rate of labour mobility. While the Clemens study<sup>3</sup> has identified that the skills recognition requirements for nations such as Australia is an impediment, these compliance requirements do not apply to all nations. Identifying an enabling environment for labour mobility in the region and to other countries will be another focus of this evaluation, as this was part of the mandate of the original design of the APTC.

During the design of Stage II of the APTC, the longer-term form of the College was identified as a key issue to be looked into during this stage. Various options have been discussed which should be considered as background reading with the Skilling Youth of the Pacific draft design during this evaluation.<sup>4</sup> The contracting aid budget will also be a consideration. The existing APTC contract ends in June 2015 with the option to extend the contract for another four years. Emerging initiatives for the Aid Program, including Skilling Youth of the Pacific (SYP) and the new design of the Labour Mobility part of the Seasonal Workers Scheme, are also to be considered in this evaluation to determine how best APTC can place itself to complement upcoming initiatives. APTC Scholarships has always been run separately from all the other Aid Program Scholarships. Opportunities for collaboration going forward are to be considered.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Clemens, M.A; Graham C. & Howes, S. (2014). Skill development and regional mobility: Lessons from the Australia– Pacific Technical College

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> APTC Future Options concept paper

# 2 Evaluation scope and duration

### 2.1 Themes to be addressed

Based on the management decisions and key issues that the evaluation will address, the independent evaluation will focus on five evaluation themes: Cost effectiveness and value for money; Labour mobility; Private sector/industry linkage and skills demand; Capacity building of TVET sector; and Sustainability and future of the APTC. The team will evaluate the full life of the APTC to date and not just to the current stage of the College.

### 2.2 **Primary evaluation questions**

Consistent with the purpose of this evaluation, the primary questions to be addressed by the evaluation team are set out below. These primary questions are considered to be the priority questions for DFAT that must be answered with a good degree of rigor. Secondary questions, methods and stakeholders to engage should be detailed in the evaluation plan.

- 1) Value for money: To what extent have APTC activities been cost-efficient and implemented in the most efficient way compared to possible alternatives?
- 2) Labour mobility: To what extent has the APTC labour mobility objective been achieved, and what are the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of this objective?
- 3) Impact: What tangible differences has the APTC made to its primary beneficiaries – male and female students and industry – and to local and regional capacity for delivering quality TVET programs?
- 4) Relevance: To what extent is the APTC approach of continuing relevance to skills development in the Pacific taking into account any changes in demand for and supply of Australian qualifications in the Pacific since the APTC was originally designed?
- 5) Future of the APTC: What are the key principles and lessons that could guide decisions about the future of the APTC?

Secondary evaluation questions related to these will be reflected in the Evaluation Plan. Cross-cutting issues such as gender equality, disability, labour market analysis and learning and performance management should be integrated into the evaluation through use of secondary questions applied during document review and semistructured field interviews.

### 3. Evaluation process

### 3.1 **Preparatory briefing**

Suva Post will provide a verbal briefing of the key issues and priority information to the Team Leader before s/he prepares the draft Evaluation Plan and will provide a verbal briefing for the team before fieldwork commences. The briefings will discuss the background, issues and priorities for the independent evaluation and clarify the expectations of DFAT's Aid Program and other stakeholders from the evaluation.

### 3.2 Evaluation Plan

The Team Leader will prepare a detailed draft Evaluation Plan for review by and discussion with DFAT's Aid Program before it is agreed. This should outline the approach, evaluation questions, methods and tools, as well as a stakeholder engagement plan. The draft Evaluation Plan will be prepared after desk review of program documentation. Full document review of key documents will form part of the independent evaluation and will be conducted after the plan has been approved by Suva Post.

At a minimum the evaluation plan should be consistent with the Australian Aid Program's Standard 5 for Independent Evaluation Plans (see:

http://aid.dfat.gov.au/Publications/Pages/monitoring-evaluation-standards.aspx) and reflect the Australasian Evaluation Society Code of Ethics

(<u>http://www.aes.asn.au/about/Documents%20-%20ongoing/code\_of\_ethics.pdf</u>) and the American Evaluation Association Guiding Principles for Evaluators (<u>http://www.eval.org/Publications/GuidingPrinciples.asp</u>). The means that the evaluation plan should<sup>5</sup>:

- be developed collaboratively with DFAT
- clearly identify the primary intended users of the evaluation and ensure their evaluation needs are in line with ToR
- describe limitations or constraints of the evaluation (*e.g.* time frame; resources; available data; political sensitivities)
- state the purpose and/or objectives of the evaluation as per the ToR
- provide a broad investigatory framework to orient the reader to the overall evaluation design
- pose more detailed evaluation questions, based on the primary questions set out in these terms of reference (see Section 2.2) and demonstrate how the terms of reference a) have been interpreted; and b) will be met
- explain which questions are of higher priority and are expected to provide the most important information
- be flexible enough to allow unexpected issues that may emerge to be incorporated in the evaluation
- describe appropriate methods proposed to collect data for each primary question
- propose triangulation of data collection methods to strengthen the confidence in the findings
- have a clear and appropriate sampling strategy for the primary evaluation questions
- describe an approach to data processing that is consistent with the time and resources available
- address ethical considerations where relevant (*e.g.* privacy and confidentiality)
- make clear who will be making the judgments
- clearly allocate evaluation tasks to team members (*i.e.* data collection, processing and reporting)
- provide guidance on scheduling that reflects adequate time to answer the posed evaluation questions
- outline a draft interview protocol for the semi-structured interviews.

### 3.3 Data collection and analysis

Data collected by the team during fieldwork and collated from document review and other meta-data will be systematically analysed using rigorous methods to provide evidence, wherever possible, or to inform professional judgement in other cases. The resulting information will be interpreted and presented in the evaluation report.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Adapted from DFAT (2013) DFAT *Monitoring and Evaluation Standards* – DFAT, Canberra, Australia

# 3.4 Reporting requirements

The evaluation team will not be required to provide progress reports to DFAT during implementation of the fieldwork. An aide memoire at the end of each block of fieldwork will report initial findings and progress against the Evaluation Plan.

A draft evaluation report will be submitted to DFAT – Suva Post by 5 September 2014. The final draft report will include all necessary annexes. Consistent with DFAT Australian Aid Monitoring and Evaluation Standard 6, the final draft evaluation report will<sup>6</sup>:

- orient readers by including background information such as the total value of program initiatives; the duration of initiatives and their stage of delivery; key outcomes of the program; and the key issues identified in the terms of reference
- provide a brief summary of the methodology employed
- describe key limitations of the methodology and provide any relevant guidance to enable appropriate interpretation of the findings
- include an executive summary that provides all the necessary information to enable primary users to make good quality decisions based on evaluation findings
- clearly address all questions in these terms of reference
- fully describe each of the issues identified so that the reader feels they have been given the full picture
- communicate the relative importance of the issues
- present an appropriate balance between operational and strategic issues
- clearly establish that the evidence supports the arguments posed
- consider alternative points of view where appropriate
- fully explore complex issues
- explore the role of the context in program performance
- use appropriate methods/language to give the reader confidence in the findings and conclusions
- explore the factors that have influenced the issues identified and conclusions drawn
- explore the implications of key findings
- make clear the overall position of the team and its professional judgments
- ensure conclusions and recommendations logically flow from the presentation of findings and any associated analyses
- make recommendations that are feasible
- allocate responsibility to stakeholders for responding to recommendations.

DFAT Suva Post will review the draft report submitted by 5 September 2014 with its partners and return comments within 10 days to enable the final report to be completed before 11 October 2014. A formal peer review of the evaluation will be conducted. The final evaluation report will be provided within 10 working days of receiving the feedback, incorporating feedback from stakeholders. The report will be no more than 30 pages (plus annexes). This will include an Executive Summary, which could act as a standalone summary of main findings and recommendations for DFAT senior management. Findings, lessons, and recommendations should be clearly documented in the report. The final evaluation report will be published on DFAT's Aid Program website.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Adapted from DFAT (2013) *Monitoring and Evaluation Standards* – DFAT, Canberra, Australia

# **ANNEX 2: PEOPLE AND ORGANISATIONS MET**

The review team met with a wide range of stakeholders, including:

- in-country meetings with donors, government officials, TVET providers and APTC management
- meetings with the two RTOs, qualifications assessment agency and immigration authorities in Australia
- focus groups with employers, APTC trainers, tutors, administrative staff, students and graduates.

This annex provides a list of people and organisations met in the following countries:

- Fiji
- Australia
- Samoa
- Papua New Guinea
- Solomon Islands
- Vanuatu
- Kiribati.

### FIJI

**APTC students –** 47 individuals **APTC graduates –** 29 individuals

#### **APTC** management and staff

Betty Jitoko	Management	Amanda Young	Trainer
Bridget Gray	Management	Douglas Battison	Trainer
Denise O'Brien	Management	Glenn Ferguson	Trainer
James Knynenburg	Management	Karen Phillips-Ross	Trainer
Julius Zsadony	Management	Kerry Kirk	Trainer
Salome Tukuafu	Management	Neil Atkinson	Trainer
Wendy Draayers	Management	Roger West	Trainer
Benita McGovern	Management	Sajendra Bali	Trainer
Jennie Dehn	Management	Temalesi Lutu	Trainer
Marty Rollings	Management	Vincent Edwards	Trainer
Carol-Anne Blecich	Management	Ashbin Singh	Tutor
Geoff Cooper	Management	Isikeli Nayaga	Tutor
Kesaia Paulo	Administration	Jioje Marieta-Asiea	Tutor
Lydia Ting	Administration	Margaret Bulivorovoro	Tutor
Margaret Tunaulu	Administration	Mavuku Tokona	Tutor
Sheba Cavu	Administration	Mohammed Don-Kadir	Tutor
Soweri Qumivutia	Administration		
Timaima Marawa	Administration		
Cathy Joyce	Administration		

# Fiji, other organisations

Individual	Organisation	Type of group
John Davidson	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Lori Dutta	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Sheona McKenna	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Helen Tavola	Education Consultant	Education community
Nesbitt Hazelman	APTC Advisory Group	Fiji Rep
Akuila Savu	Fiji Higher Education Commission	Government of Fiji
Charmaine Kwan	Fiji Higher Education Commission	Government of Fiji
Dr Richard Wah	Fiji Higher Education Commission	Government of Fiji
Salote Rabuka	Fiji Higher Education Commission	Government of Fiji
Sereseini Vuki	Fiji Higher Education Commission	Government of Fiji
Waisea Rokobera	Fiji Higher Education Commission	Government of Fiji
Ledua Vakaloloma	Ministry of Finance – ODA Unit	Government of Fiji
Robert Sovatabua	Ministry of Finance – ODA Unit	Government of Fiji
Alumeci Tuisawau	Ministry of Education	Government of Fiji
Dr Brij Lal	Ministry of Education	Government of Fiji
Saimoni Waibuta	Ministry of Education	Government of Fiji
Epeli Waqavonovono	Bureau of Statistics	Government of Fiji
Dr Kandasamy Angamuthu	Fiji National University	Provider
Hasmukh Lal	University of the South Pacific	Provider
Professor John Blythe	University of the South Pacific	Provider
Litea Bola	ADRA Fiji	Employer/Industry
Sina Suliano	ADRA Fiji	Employer/Industry
Jeegar Bhavsar	FASANOC	Employer/Industry
Mere Tikoduadua-Fonmoa	Fenc Fiji	Employer/Industry
Gael Seru	Fiji Association for the Deaf	Employer/Industry
Joe Ramulo	Fiji Disabled Association	Employer/Industry
Emosi Uluilakeba	Fiji Police – Juvenile Bureau	Employer/Industry
Lasaro Senibulu	International Wise	Employer/Industry
John Barton	Lydhurst Limited (Kookai)	Employer/Industry
Mark Halabe	Mark One Apparel	Employer/Industry
Peni Taoi	National Training and Productivity Centre	Employer/Industry
Suresh Singh	Nivis Motor and Machinery Co. Ltd	Employer/Industry
Vani Cokanasiga	Pacific Centre for Peacebuilding	Employer/Industry
Tarusila Bradburgh	Pacific Youth Council	Employer/Industry
Akuila Temo	Public Works Department	Employer/Industry
Abdulla Muny	Salon Owner	Employer/Industry
Bipin Patel	United Apparel	Employer/Industry
Michael Farrugia	EduBytes	Employer/Industry
Michael Wong	Fiji Hotel & Tourism Association	Employer/Industry
Netani Sukanaivalu	Horeb Engineering	Employer/Industry
Ana Raivoce	SPC – SPBEA	Development Partner
Lafi Sanerivi	SPC – SPBEA	Development Partner

# **AUSTRALIA**

Denise O'Brien	APTC	Management
Jodi Schmidt	TAFE Queensland	Management
Marian Wilkinson	Box Hill Institute	Management
Mark Reilly	TAFE Queensland East Coast	Management

# Australia, other organisations/individuals

Individual	Organisation	Type of group
Peter Morris	Pacific TVET expert	Consultant to DFAT
Barry Peddle	Former APTC CEO	Consultant
Stephen Kaleb	Labour Mobility Section, DFAT	Development Partner
Michael Dean	Director, Pacer Plus Section, DFAT	Australian Government
Sophie Montgomery	Assistant Secretary, Regulatory Strategy & Special Projects Branch, DIBP	Australian Government
Megan Lilly	Advisory group member	Australian Industry Group (AIG)
Rosemary Woodger	Acting CEO, VETASSESS	Specialist TVET assessment body
Michelle Lucas	Manager Skills Recognition International, VETASSESS	Specialist TVET assessment body

### SAMOA

# **APTC students –** 21 individuals

# **APTC graduates –** 24 individuals

# APTC management and staff

Anisefo Chanting	Administration	Aaitui Palaamo	Tutor
Christabelle Schuster	Administration	Daniella AhLeong - Leota	Tutor
Donna Stanley	Administration	Devendhran Reddy	Tutor
Patricia Pulegs	Administration	Keri Lino	Tutor
Rita Malele	Administration	Lina Visinia	Tutor
Ruta Tofaeono	Administration	Naomi Asi	Tutor
Soteria Tufugu	Administration	Takemora Vaifale	Tutor
Tekoa Tafea	Administration	Tuasivi Kaleopa	Tutor
Veratina Isaia-losia	Administration	Francis Howes	Management
Angela Stent	Trainer		
Cheryl Payne	Trainer		
Dave Holak	Trainer		
Mark Robertson	Trainer		
Michael Mollier			
	Trainer		
Rachel Fox	Trainer Trainer		

Individual	Organisation	Type of group	
Anthony Stannard	Australian High Commission	Development Partner	
H.E. Sue Langford	Australian High Commission	Development Partner	
Michael Upton	NZMEAT	Development Partner	
Su'a Julia Wallwork	ADRA	Development Partner	
Hidevuki Suzuki		Development Partner	
Tetsuii Nakasone		Development Partner	
Sojuli Doul Wollwork			
	Ministry of Commerce Industry and	Samoa Rep	
Andrew Sheck	Labour	Government of Samoa	
Sauleone T. Eti	Ministry of Commerce, Industry and Labour	Government of Samoa	
Tanuvasa Faamanatu Solomona	Ministry of Commerce, Industry and Labour	Government of Samoa	
Fepulea'l Sinapi Moli	Samoa Qualifications Authority	Government of Samoa	
Tepora Afamasaga-Wright	Samoa Qualifications Authority	Government of Samoa	
Leota Valma Galuvao	Ministry of Education Sports and Culture	Government of Samoa	
Matafeo Tanielu Aiafi	Ministry of Education Sports and Culture	Government of Samoa	
Noumea Simi	Ministry of Finance	Government of Samoa	
Faamatuainu Suifua	Samoa Tourism Authority	Government of Samoa	
lade Eli	Samoa Tourism Authority	Government of Samoa	
Papali'l Matatamali'l Sonia			
Hunter	Samoa Tourism Authority	Government of Samoa	
Benjamin Sila	Samoa Bureau of Statistics	Government of Samoa	
Daniel Connelly	National University of Samoa	Provider	
Leapai Dr Asofou Soo - VC	National University of Samoa	Provider	
Leia Faiumu	National University of Samoa	Provider	
Papu Fala	Don Bosco Technical Institute	Provider	
Fatu Leitufiaoatua	Faculty of Applied Science, NUS	Provider	
Lianeta Tanamika Iyaroi	Faculty of Applied Science, NUS	Provider	
Breda Faitua	Coral Reef Academy	Employer/Industry	
Edwina Rasmussen	Edwina's Beauty Salon	Employer/Industry	
Douglas Tomane	Electric Power Corporation	Employer/Industry	
Toni Atilia	Electric Power Corporation	Employer/Industry	
Caroline Ah Chong	Eaa taua le Ola (El O)	Employer/Industry	
Anthony Ygosse	Fletcher Construction	Employer/Industry	
Adel Kruse	Insel Fehman Hotel	Employer/Industry	
Anasetasia Magele	NCECES	Employer/Industry	
Mele Pagaialii	Peace Chapel Preschool	Employer/Industry	
Meki Tu'u'u	Plumbing Association of Samoa	Employer/Industry	
lan Black	Sails Restaurant	Employer/Industry	
Sheree Stehlin	Salon Sheree	Employer/Industry	
	Samoa Association of Manufacturers and		
Laisene Tuioti Mariner	Exporters	Employer/Industry	
Kolone Tikeri	Samoa Water Authority	Employer/Industry	
Mahendra Mahimkar	SENESE	Employer/Industry	
Jason Strickland	Tanoa Tusitala	Employer/Industry	
Charlotte Brunt	The Orator	Employer/Industry	

#### Samoa, other organisations

# **PAPUA NEW GUINEA**

# **APTC graduates –** 108 individuals

# APTC management, staff and graduates

Anna Gideon	Administration	Billy Apini	Tutor
Anna Wurra	Administration	Hovosa Yasiva	Tutor
Edward Purkikil	Administration	Kelly Topoti	Tutor
Isaac Momak	Administration	Naisen Nambahin	Tutor
Ligoria Lowah	Administration	Nanai Sinemaue	Tutor
Marie Buku	Administration	Paul Moses	Tutor
Noliaso Gotaha	Administration	Peter Agua	Tutor
Tanya Naime	Administration	Ruben John	Tutor
Len Farren	Management	Vagi Daera	Tutor
Rick Harper	Management	Veira Waide	Tutor
Trevor Birney	Management	_	
Colin Wilson	Trainer	_	
Craig Reaks	Trainer	_	
Cynthia Jardine	Trainer	_	
David Pepyat	Trainer	_	
Gavin Page	Trainer		
Graeme Wells	Trainer	_	
Phil Dixon	Trainer		

# Papua New Guinea, other organisations

Individual	Organisation	Type of group
H.E. Deborah Stokes	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
James Hall	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Jane Racancoj	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Johnny Yap	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Aaron Batten	ADB	Development Partner
Caroline Aribi	Air Niugini Ltd	Employer
Robert Smith	Air Niugini Ltd	Employer
Camilus Liaia	PNG Power	Employer
John Tangit	PNG Power	Employer
Maxwell Kombia	PNG Power	Employer
John Gethin-Jones	National Catering Services	Employer
Helen Tiran	Lahara Pre-school	Employer
Bob Summerton	Oil Search (PNG) Limited	Employer
Ben Theordore	PNG Assembly for Disabled People	Employer
David Toua	The Business Council of PNG	Employer
Alex Wilson	The Grand Papua Hotel	Employer
Greg Anderson	The PNG Chamber of Mines and Petroleum	Employer
David Conn Esq	The Port Moresby Chamber of Commerce & Industry	Employer
Brent St. Hill	Coral Sea Hotels	Employer
Glen Murphy	Coral Sea Hotels	Employer
Karthik Vajjala	Avenell Engineering Systems Ltd	Employer

Individual	Organisation	Type of group
Konio Doko	Department for Community Development, Youth and Religion	Employer
Steve Johnson	Ela Motors	Employer
Barry Moore	Eurest	Employer
Chey Scovell	Manufacturers Council of PNG	Employer
David Twiggs	Boroko Motors	Employer
Chris Devlin	Digara Construction	Employer
Peter McGann	Curtain Bros PNG	Employer
Paul Barker	Institute of National Affairs	Research Institute
Kinivanagi Karo	Port Moresby Technical College	Training Partner
Alan Tira	Port Moresby Technical College	Training Partner
John Ritchie	Hastings Deering	Training Partner
Cedric Rondike	Hastings Deering	Training Partner
Emos Michael	Hastings Deering	Training Partner
Bilmor Bulatao	TVET Wing	Government of PNG
Damon Tiromry	TVET Wing	Government of PNG
Monica Maluan	TVET Wing	Government of PNG
Oli Mark	TVET Wing	Government of PNG
Reuben Aue	TVET Wing	Government of PNG
Rosa Apelis	TVET Wing	Government of PNG
Thomas Aiye	TVET Wing	Government of PNG
Vali Guise	TVET Wing	Government of PNG
Wini Leka	TVET Wing	Government of PNG
Joseph Aka	Deputy National Statistician	Government of PNG
Homolpio Warom	Data Processing National Statistical Office	Government of PNG
Benjamin Haichim	Data Processing, National Statistical Office	Government of PNG
Dianne Pakalu	National Training Council	Government of PNG
Florence Bana Bouaga	National Training Council	Government of PNG
Kevin Kalis	National Training Council	Government of PNG
Kinsella Geoffrey	National Training Council	Government of PNG
Stan	National Training Council	Government of PNG
Thomas Kipau	National Authority for Trade Testing Board	Government of PNG

# **SOLOMON ISLANDS**

# APTC graduates – 15 individuals

# APTC management and staff

Bede O'Brien	Management
Frances Howes	Management
Hilda	Administration
Jennifer Anisi	Administration
Lois Tito	Administration
Barry	Trainer
Chris	Trainer
Rebecca	Trainer
Russell Warde	Trainer

# Solomon Islands, other organisations

Name	Organisation	Type of group
Ed Smith	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Kirsten Hawke	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Jane Bastin-Sikimeti	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Dr Franco Rodie	Ministry of Education and Human Resource Development	Government of Solomon Islands
Father Dominic	Don Bosco Institute	Training Partner
Father Sramel	Don Bosco Institute	Training Partner
Kitione Malugulevu	Solomon Island Electricity Authority	Employer/Industry
Dr Patricia Rodie	Solomon Islands National University	TVET Institution

# VANUATU

### **APTC students –** 35 individuals

# APTC graduates – 12 individuals

# APTC management, staff and graduates

Alison Kalsuak	Administration	Brett Thompson	Trainer (senior)
Anne Niatu	Administration	Eunice David	Training Assistant
Roline Guila	Administration	Goimel Soalo	Tutor
Ronic Joe	Administration	Marie Shem	Tutor
Viviane Lalier	Administration	Vanessa Dick	Tutor
Kath Gray	Management		
Annie Dares	Trainer	_	
Esther Sope	Trainer		
Kevin Tabi	Trainer		
Marc Warin	Trainer	-	
Rollyne Liu	Trainer		

# Vanuatu, other organisations

Name	Organisation	Type of group
David Momlicivic	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Matt Harding	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Yvette Andrews	Australian High Commission	Development Partner
Fremden Shadrack	TVETSSP (DFAT program)	Development Partner
Janet Samuel	Department of Tourism	Government of Vanuatu
Jennifer James	Ministry of Education and Training	Government of Vanuatu
Roy Obed	Ministry of Education and Training	Government of Vanuatu
Esron Vano	Department of Correctional services	Employer/Industry
Dr Andrina Thomas	Live and Learn	Employer/Industry
Carol Batten	Pikinini Playtime Day Care	Employer/Industry
Elizabeth Emil	Save the Children	Employer/Industry
Christopher Bartlett	SPC GIZ	Employer/Industry
Charlie Johnson	Wan Smol Bag	Employer/Industry
Shirley Abraham	Youth Challenge	Employer/Industry
Julia King	Evergreen Tours	Employer/Industry
Roland Cowles	Poppys on the Lagoon	Employer/Industry
Troy Spann	The Edge Vanuatu	Employer/Industry
Astrid Boulekoune	Vanuatu Chamber of Commerce	Employer/Industry
Captain Nicholson Ben	Vanuatu Mobile Force Engineers	Employer/Industry
Bernie Caine	Vila Refrigeration and Air Conditioning	Employer/Industry
Kalpat Kalbeo	Vanuatu Institute of Technology	TVET Institution

# **KIRIBATI**

Name	Organisation	Type of group
Antoine Barnaart	Principal, Kiribati Institute of Technology	Management

# ANNEX 3: EVALUATION PLAN: PRIMARY AND SECONDARY QUESTIONS<sup>7</sup>

1. TVET capacity: To what extent has the APTC succeeded in building national and regional capacity for market-responsive skills development in the Pacific?<sup>8</sup> To what extent is there discernible lasting benefit to skills development of APTC in the Pacific?

Key sources and indicators: APTC statistics on applications, enrolment and scholarships by program, gender, nationality; access from non-campus countries; proportion of enrolees by sponsorship (government, employer, private, etc.); teaching staff by program, qualification, gender, nationality, salaries; work placements during training by program and campus; graduates by specialisation, levels, gender, nationality, etc.

### A. APTC capacity

- 1. What quantitative and qualitative capacity has APTC established for skills development?
  - Quantitative effectiveness of recruitment practices; enrolment; teaching staff; outputs achieved.
  - Quality assurance practices; pass rates; qualification standards achieved; whether Australian qualification standards are actually met given constraints on workplace training?
  - To what extent has APTC effectively used different and flexible delivery methods in different parts of the Pacific, including distance learning, blended approaches and outreach?
  - What articulation pathways have been established both to and from the APTC? To what extent are they being utilised and by whom?
- 2. How closely attuned is APTC to industry and employers?
  - Organisationally, to what extent is industry involved in APTC functions, e.g. governance, technical advice, provision of work places, financing?
  - What are the systems used by APTC to monitor and adjust to labour market trends, and how effective are they, including the Labour Market Analysis Action Plan?
  - How many formal industry partnerships have been established, and how effective are they, e.g. Tanoa Group of Hotels, Fiji?
  - How effective are APTC's school-to-work schemes, e.g. 'APTC-to-work' and employer reintegration plans?
  - To what extent does APTC provide direct services to industry, e.g. employee upgrading?
- 3. How equitable is the provision of APTC services?
  - Geographically (especially non-campus, small island states), by gender, by urban/rural location, family income and by disability?
  - How effectively has APTC minimised barriers to learning for all students, but in particular for women studying in non-traditional areas and for people with a disability?
  - How effective have been the bridging programs and English language, literacy and numeracy (ELLN) in promoting greater equity?
- 4. What are the main constraints on, and opportunities for, further development of APTC capacity for skills development?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Source: ERF, Evaluation Plan: Independent Evaluation of the Australia–Pacific Technical College, 2 June 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> APTC Objective 1: Support skills development in the Pacific in response to national, regional and international labour market requirements

# B. What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?

- 1. To what extent and how effectively has APTC provided additional professional development for the education and training sector? To what extent has the Centre for Professional Development been established and is effective in delivering services?
- 2. To what extent has APTC provided a demonstration effect on higher quality standards?
- What impact has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions, (e.g. National University of Samoa, VIT Vanuatu); and TVET pathway models (e.g. KIT, Don Bosco Honiara). Also, School of Health and Community Services Suva, and University of the South Pacific.
- 4. To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?

# 2. Labour mobility: To what extent has APTC training enhanced access to regional and international labour markets, and why?<sup>9</sup> Note: Pacific regionalism seems to take on greater importance as an underlying rationale in Stage II.<sup>10</sup>

Key sources and indicators: APTC graduate surveys, complemented by new surveys and follow-up; employment rates with the same or new employer, wages, remittances from graduate destination information.

#### A. Incidence

- 1. To what extent have graduates taken up Pacific regional and international employment? (by occupation, nationality, age, gender, etc.)
- 2. What were the major factors influencing their choices?
  - positive factors availability of labour market information, employer contacts, wages, family presence at international destinations, available social support services for immigrants, quality of contract offered before departure; available support from APTC for transition (i.e. counselling)
  - negative factors immigration requirements, family considerations.

### B. Changes in labour market demand

- 1. To what extent have the original analysis and assumptions of the international labour market turned out to be accurate? This will involve review of project design assumptions; ANZ labour market information; and feedback from employers.
- 2. What factors have changed, why and to what extent?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> APTC Objective 2: Provide quality, demand-driven training that will present opportunities for Pacific Islanders to access international labour markets

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> 'There is a clear strategic role for the APTC in supporting Pacific regionalism and regional market integration, including trade in services (labour mobility) both through regional service delivery and through skills development.' Stage II Design, p. i. See also MTR Rec. 15c.

#### C. Supply factors

- 1. To what extent does APTC have the institutional capacity to train for regional and international markets? Does it provide valid international qualifications?
- 2. To what extent were APTC students and graduates provided information, search skills and support for regional and international employment?

# 3. Impact: What tangible differences has the APTC made to its primary beneficiaries – graduates and industry?<sup>11</sup>

Key sources and indicators: graduate tracer studies; employer surveys – employment rates; competencies; confidence rates; comparison with control group, graduates of other Pacific TVET institutions, or those receiving only training on the job.

#### A. Graduates

- 1. What have been the employment rates / waiting time for employment of APTC graduates?
- 2. To what extent have graduates been employed in the same field as trained?
- 3. What are the wage levels of graduates, before and AFTER APTC training?
- 4. Any evidence on job satisfaction, stability or promotions?

#### **B.** Industry

- 1. How do the competencies of APTC graduates compare with other TVET graduates at the same level?
- 2. Were APTC graduates hired on the same or different salaries as others?
- 3. How productive are APTC graduates compared with others with the same qualifications?
  - a. in technical competencies
  - b. in good work habits punctual, reliable, ability to follow instructions and take initiatives
  - c. to what extent have APTC graduates trained co-workers and introduced new technologies?

# 4. Value for money: To what extent have APTC activities been cost-efficient and implemented in the most efficient way compared to possible alternatives?

Key sources and indicators: APTC management information systems and graduate tracer surveys: income by source, including DFAT, private tuition, employer-sponsored tuition, government-sponsored tuition; donor-sponsored tuition, fee-for-service, etc.; expenditures by type; student dropout and completion rates; full-time equivalent staff–student ratios and administrator-student ratios; unit costs – recurrent cost per student, per hour of instruction, per student hour of instruction, per graduate; cost comparisons with similar institutions in the Pacific and in Australia; graduate incomes before and after APTC training, and remittances.

- A. **Information**: How adequate is the quality of information about costs and financing of APTC? Has an effective consolidated financial management information system been established? What are the gaps?
- B. **Economy**: Has the APTC program been economical in buying inputs of appropriate quality at the right price?
- C. Cost-effectiveness, i.e. what have been the outputs in relation to inputs?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> APTC Objective 3: Increase productivity of individuals and organisations in the targeted industries and sectors

- D. Cost efficiency: What are the various unit recurrent costs, e.g. cost per trainee, cost per hour of instruction, cost per student hour of instruction and cost per graduate? What are other measures of internal efficiency, e.g. student completion rates, full-time equivalent ratios of students per teacher by program? What factors drive unit costs? What has been done (e.g. localisation), and what more could be done to achieve greater efficiency?
- E. **Economic analysis**: What has been the internal rate of return, net present value or benefit-cost ratios on the APTC investment? How does the ex-post economic rate of return compare with the ex-ante calculation of economic rate of return?<sup>12</sup>
- F. **Sustainability**: Analysis of the APTC Business Development Policy and non-DFAT sources of income, e.g. tuition sponsorships and fee-for-service with a view to judgements about financial sustainability. Is the Stage II target of 15 per cent of income from fee-for-service realistic?
- G. To what extent have the **regulatory environments** of APTC institutions affected effectiveness and efficiency?
- 5. What do the findings, evidence and lessons suggest for the future of the APTC?
  - A. Short term: What could be done to strengthen APTC until end of Stage II?
  - B. **Medium term**: In what form and under what conditions could APTC continue beyond 2015?
    - Is the APTC approach still relevant, given current and projected conditions in the Pacific and international labour market?
    - How sustainable is the current model, e.g. of providing international qualifications, in relation to possible options?
    - How well does APTC fit within DFAT policies on future aid to the region?

What key principles and lessons should guide decisions about the future of APTC?

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> APTC Stage II Design, section 3.6.2 and Annex H, 25 November 2010

# **ANNEX 4: APTC STATISTICAL PROFILE**

This annex was prepared from statistical data provided by APTC on courses, admissions, enrolment, and graduates (30 June 2014) and on staffing (15 July 2014). Further information and explanations were provided to the evaluation team on 12 August 2014. The purpose of the statistical annex is to describe visually, where possible, the dimensions of the APTC's activities, and provide input into the analysis. Note: 'to date' means through 30 June 2014.

1	Summary	25
<b>2</b> 2.1 2.2 2.3	Courses	<b>26</b> 26 28 29
<b>3</b> 3.1 3.2 3.3 3.4	Admissions and scholarships Applicants and intake Waitlist Entrants by source of funding Entrants by employment status	<b>31</b> 33 34 35
<b>4</b> 4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4	Enrolments	<b>36</b> 36 38 40 42
<b>5</b> 5.1 5.2	Graduates and completion rates Output of graduates Completion rates	<b>44</b> 44 46
<b>6</b> 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 6.5	Staffing Trainers and tutors Students per teacher Average class sizes Administrative (non-teaching) staff Management and administrative staff	<b>48</b> 51 52 54 56

# List of tables

Table 3.1.1: Number of applicants, those eligible, scholarship awards and	
uptake by stage, total and for females	31
Table 3.1.2: Applicants and those eligible by nationality and stage	32
Table 3.1.3: Ratio of entrants to applicants by nationality	33
Table 3.1.4: Scholarship awards as a percentage of applicants by nationality	33
Table 3.2.1: Applicants on waiting list, by campus, and as percentage of current enrolment.	33
Table 3.3.1: Percentage of entrants by funding source	35
Table 4.3.1: Females enrolled in traditionally male occupations	42
Table 5.2.1a: Completion rates - total, by school, gender, age group, employment status	47
Table 5.2.1b: Completion rates by campus country and nationality	47
Table 6.4.1: Academic and non-academic staff by nationality and gender, June 2014	54

# List of figures

Figure 2.1.1: Number of courses offered by school and level of gualification	27
Figure 2.1.2: Total number of courses offered by training area (all levels, current)	
Figure 2.1.2: Number of courses delivered by level of qualification and campus country	28
Figure 2.2.1: Number of courses offered by school and semester 2007–2014	28
Figure 2.3.1: APTC's least-offered courses	29
Figure 2.3.2: APTC's most-offered courses by number of times delivered	29
Figure 2.3.3: APTC qualifications added in Stage II and number of times delivered	30
Figure 2.3.4: Number of courses per training package by school and stage	
Figure 3.1.1: Student intake ratios by stage	
Figure 3.2.1: Courses and gualifications with largest waiting lists	
Figure 3.4.1: Percentage of entrants employed on entrance by school and stage	
Figure 4.1.1: Cumulative student enrolment by nationality since 2007	36
Figure 4.1.2: Ratio of enrolment by nationality to population per country	36
Figure 4.1.3: Cumulative total enrolment by school and training package. 2007 to present	
Figure 4.1.4: Enrolment by training package and stage	
Figure 4.1.5: Age distribution of students by school and stage	
Figure 4.2.1: Students enrolled by school and training package. Semester 1. 2014	
Figure 4.2.2: Enrolment by campus country. Semester 1, 2014	39
Figure 4.2.3: Enrolment in PNG by semester. 2007 to mid-2014	
Figure 4.3.1: Enrolment by gender and stage, 2007 to present	40
Figure 4.3.2: Females as a percentage of total enrolment by school and stage	40
Figure 4.3.3: Enrolment by gender and training package, 2007 to present (no. of students)	41
Figure 4.3.4: Female enrolment as a percentage of total enrolment by training package	41
Figure 4.4.1: Total enrolment by semester and stage, 2007 to present	43
Figure 4.4.2: Enrolment by school and semester, 2007 to present	43
Figure 4.4.3: Enrolments by campus country and semester, 2007 to present	44
Figure 5.1.1: Graduates by school and stage	44
Figure 5.1.2: Total graduates across all programs by semester, 2007 to 30 June 2014	45
Figure 5.1.3: Graduates by school and semester, 2007 to 30 June 2014	45
Figure 5.1.4: Number of graduates by training package and school, 2007 to 30 June 2014	46
Figure 5.2.1: Completion rates by training packages, 2007 to 30 June 2014	48
Figure 6.1.1: Number of trainers and tutors, 2007 to end 2014	48
Figure 6.1.2: Ratio of trainers to tutors, 2009 to end 2014	49
Figure 6.1.3: Number of APTC trainers and tutors by training package, Jan to June 2014	49
Figure 6.1.4: Number of APTC trainers by nationality grouping, 2007 to end 2014	50
Figure 6.1.5: Females as a percentage of total trainers and tutors, 2007 to present	50
Figure 6.1.6: Age distribution of trainers and tutors, Semester 1, 2014	51
Figure 6.2.1: Average number of students per teacher (trainers and tutors combined)	51
Figure 6.2.2: Average number of students per teacher by training package, Sem 1, 2014	52
Figure 6.3.1: Average number of students per class to date	53
Figure 6.4.1: Academic and administrative staff by location, June 30 2014	54
Figure 6.4.2: Number of teaching and non-teaching staff, 2007 to end 2014	55
Figure 6.4.3: Teaching staff as a percentage of total staff, 2007 to end 2014	55
Figure 6.5.1: Number of management and non-management staff, 2007 to end 2014	56
Figure 6.5.2: Management staff as a percentage of total administrative staff	56

### 1 Summary

**Qualifications.** Since its inception APTC has offered 35 specific qualifications, or courses, mostly at Certificate level III. Almost three-quarters of the courses are concentrated in four training packages: metal/engineering and construction trades in STT, and tourism/hospitality and community services in SHCS. About 40 per cent of the existing qualifications (15) were introduced in Stage II.

*Fluctuations in number of courses, enrolments and graduates.* The number of courses delivered varied greatly by semester, ranging from a low of 20 in the first semester of 2012 to a high of almost 90 in the first semester of 2013. Similarly, enrolment declined from 729 students in 2012 and rebounded to 2095 in 2013. The number of graduates also dropped sharply from 850 in the first half of 2011 to 215 in the first half of 2012, before increasing to a high of 1100 in the first term of 2014. Within these totals, output from STT fluctuated widely, dropping from 460 in the first half of 2013 then dropping to 100 in the first semester of 2014. APTC management attributes the reductions between stages to two factors: (1) fall off in new courses and enrolments at the end of Stage I when targets had been met; and (2) attrition and difficulty in recruiting new teaching staff in PNG owing to changes in terms of service at the start of Stage II.

**Applicants and scholarships.** APTC has received over 21,000 applications for admission and 16,000 applications for scholarships to date, about 40 per cent from women. The proportion of applicants deemed suitable for admission after testing increased from 56 per cent to 67 per cent between the two stages. Scholarship awards as a percentage of scholarship applicants remained steady in the two stages at about 50 per cent. By nationality, Samoa has a 10–14 percentage point advantage compared with Vanuatu and PNG, both in ratio of entrants to applicants and in scholarship awards as a percentage of applications.

*Wait list.* Currently 980 applicants, equivalent to just over half current enrolment, have been placed on the waitlist for entrance when places open. As a percentage of current enrolment, the waitlist represents 21 per cent of current enrolment in Samoa, 56 per cent in Fiji, 67 per cent in Vanuatu and 73 per cent in PNG.

*Financing.* About three-quarters of entering students were supported on scholarships. This remained constant over the two stages. Employer funding supported an average of 17 per cent of students over the two stages. Fee for service accounted for about six per cent in Stage II and self-financed trainees accounted for just under five per cent of the total. About two-thirds of the students were employed on entry to APTC.

**Enrolment by campus and nationality.** Currently by campus country, Fiji enrols 44 per cent of all students, followed by PNG with 19 per cent, Samoa with 16 per cent, Vanuatu with 13 per cent and Solomon Islands with 6 per cent. By nationality, students from PNG and Solomon Islands are the most under-represented in relation to population size.

*Gender.* Female enrolment increased from 36 per cent in Stage I to 40 per cent in Stage II. Female enrolment tends to be concentrated in SHCS, with only 24 per cent in STT. Since most students are already employed, low female enrolment in traditional trades reflects employment patterns in the workforce.

*Graduates and completion rates.* To mid-2014, APTC produced over 6750 graduates, 52 per cent from SHCS. Completion rates are high with relatively little variation according to school, gender, age, employment status, campus country and nationality. Overall, completion rates are 91 per cent, with 89 per cent for STT and 92 per cent for SHCS. Females had a higher completion rate than males, 93 per cent and 89 per cent, respectively. By nationality all countries had 90 per cent completion rate or

above, except PNG and Vanuatu at 89 per cent and 88 per cent, respectively. Solomon Islands nationals excelled with a 97 per cent completion rate among more than 700 participants. However, overall, more than 600 students did not complete their qualifications, of whom 70 per cent were male.

*Trainers and tutors.* Accelerated recruitment of tutors changed the ratio of trainers to tutors substantially. In 2009 there were 18 trainers for every tutor. This dropped to 1.6 trainers-per-tutor in mid 2014. The proportion of females among trainers and tutors increased during the second stage. Currently about 30 per cent of trainers and half of tutors are female.

**Teacher–student ratios and class sizes.** APTC has averaged 10.5 students-perteacher (trainers and tutors combined) from 2007 to mid 2014. The average varied widely at the beginning of APTC operations and declined substantially in 2012 commensurate with reduced enrolments. The average declined since 2010 when the hiring of tutors began.

Classes ranged from 11 to 31 students per qualification and averaged 17.2 students in SHCS and 14.4 in STT. Potentially higher class sizes in SHCS were limited by maximum sizes for some qualifications owing to equipment and safety considerations and dependence on scholarships. Courses offered through blended means, e.g. use of internet and e-learning combined with direct classroom instruction, offer some potential for increased class sizes.

**Staff profile.** Overall 58 per cent of the staff are female, including 42 per cent of the academic staff and 74 per cent of the non-academic staff. Currently, APTC has 187 staff, 48 per cent of whom are administrative/management. By nationality, Australians make up 38 per cent of total staff, followed by Fijians with 35 per cent of the total. The ratio between teaching and non-teaching staff has changed frequently, but teaching staff slightly outweighed non-teaching staff in the first half of 2014.

The proportion of management staff among total staff has decreased from a high of 33 per cent in 2009 to 16 per cent in mid-2014.

### 2 Courses

### 2.1 Courses by level, school, training package and campus country

Since its inception APTC has offered 35<sup>13</sup> specific qualifications, or courses, mostly at Certificate level III. STT provides two Certificate level II courses as lead-in to its Certificate III courses. STT and SHCS offer the same number of Certificate III qualifications. SHCS provides courses for Certificate IV and Diploma qualifications. STT provides one Certificate IV qualification – Training and Assessment (TAE). The following graph shows the number of courses by school and level of qualification.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> The number of qualifications offered in any one semester would be about one third fewer



Figure 2.1.1: Number of courses offered by school and level of qualification

Over 70 per cent of the courses are concentrated in four training packages: (i) metal and engineering; (ii) construction trades in STT; (iii) tourism and hospitality; and (iv) community services in SHCS. The distribution of courses is as follows.



Figure 2.1.2: Total number of courses offered by training area (all levels, current)

Source: APTC Table A.1

The same course is sometimes delivered in multiple locations. This means that the 35 courses were delivered 64 times in the first half of 2014. Fiji delivered 23 courses, Vanuatu 14 and Samoa 12. Solomon Islands delivered three courses, two at Certificate level IV. The following graph shows the distribution of courses delivered by campus country and level.

Source: APTC Table A.1



Figure 2.1.3: Number of courses delivered by level of qualification and campus country (includes multiple delivery of same course)

Source: APTC Table A.2

### 2.2 Courses by semester

The number of courses delivered varied greatly by semester, ranging from a low of 20 in the first semester of 2012 to a high of 88 in the first semester of 2013. The number of courses was particularly low in calendar year 2012, only 44, and notably high in calendar 2013 at 155. Reasons for the variation, which apply equally to enrolments and graduations, are given under Section 4.4.



Figure 2.2.1: Number of courses offered by school and semester, 2007–2014

Source: APTC Table A.4

# 2.3 Frequency of courses

The following graphs show the courses offered least and most since 2007.

#### Figure 2.3.1: APTC's least-offered courses



#### Figure 2.3.2: APTC's most-offered courses by number of times delivered



Note: Aged Care includes Certificate III in Home and Community Care. Training & Assessment (IV) includes VET Certificate IV offered once. Auto Mechanics III includes Automotive Servicing III. Source: APTC Table A.4, and comment by APTC management, 13 August 2014

Fifteen new qualifications were introduced in Stage II, or about 40 per cent of the total of the existing 35 qualifications. No Stage I courses were discontinued in Stage II (i.e. taken off scope), but some have not been offered since, such as the Certificate III in Indigenous Housing. In addition, courses have been discontinued in some locations for reasons of efficiency or saturated demand, e.g. automotive in Samoa.





Source: APTC Table A.4

The following figure shows the number of courses per training package by school and stage.



Figure 2.3.4: Number of courses per training package by school and stage

Source: APTC Table A.4

# 3 Admissions and scholarships

### 3.1 Applicants and intake

APTC has received over 21,000 applications for admission to date, about 40 per cent from women. Overall, just over 60 per cent of applicants were deemed suitable for admission after testing.

# Table 3.1.1: Number of applicants, those eligible, scholarship awards and uptake by stage, total and for females

	Total				Female	
	Total Stage I	Total Stage II to date	Total to date	Total Stage I	Total Stage II to date	Total to date
Applicants to APTC	12,433	8680	21,113	4899	3673	8572
Number eligible (based on LNN and VSK testing)	6961	5837	12,798	2537	2424	4961
Eligible as % of applicants	56%	67%	61%	52%	66%	58%
Scholarship applications	9196	7067	16,263	3949	3016	6965
Scholarship awards	4675	3486	8161	1860	1503	3363
Awards as % scholarship applicants	51%	49%	50%	47%	50%	48%
Uptake as % of awards	91%	88%	90%	92%	88%	90%

LLN: Language, literacy and numeracy / VSK: Vocational skills and knowledge Source: Calculated from APTC Table B1a and Bib.

Eligible applicants as a proportion of total applicants rose from 56 per cent in Stage I to 67 per cent in Stage II. Reasons for the increase include re-design of the application form, improved initial screening of applicants, re-design of LLN assessments as part of the Australian Core Skills Framework which increased reliability, and introduction of new industry entrant (NIE) courses which relaxed entry criteria for some courses.

Scholarship awards as a percentage of scholarship applicants remained steady in the two stages at about 50 per cent. Scholarship uptake as a percentage of awards also remained constant at about 90 per cent between the two stages.



#### Figure 3.1.1: Student intake ratios by stage

Source: APTC Tables B.1a and B.1b.

The following table compares the proportion of eligible applicants and scholarship uptake by nationality of applicants.

		Stage I			I		
Nationality	# Applications	# Eligible	% Eligible	# Applications	# Eligible	% Eligible	
Cook Islands	1	1	100				
FSM	33	6	18	9	5	56	
Fiji	3546	2247	63	2911	1795	62	
Kiribati	484	137	28	581	347	60	
Marshall Islands	53	29	55	36	26	72	
Nauru	162	67	41	46	29	63	
Niue	22	14	64	14	11	79	
Other	14	8	57	54	47	87	
Palau	13	10	77	23	21	91	
Papua New Guinea	3312	1698	51	1462	1015	69	
Samoa	1002	698	70	840	683	81	
Solomon Islands	1630	666	41	1194	745	62	
Tonga	530	325	61	221	153	69	
Tuvalu	118	67	57	127	70	55	
Vanuatu	1509	985	65	1158	777	67	
No citizenship indicated	4	3	75	4	2	50	
TOTAL	12,433	6961	56	8680	5837	67	

### Table 3.1.2: Applicants and those eligible by nationality and stage

NOTE: Number 'eligible' based on both LLN and VSK requirements requires a summation of candidates in various stages of processing, including: ready to consider for offer; offer sent; offer declined; offer deferred; offer accepted; scholarship round and not contactable/no response. Each of these categories has met both LLN and VSK requirements. (Source: Marty Rollings, APTC communication 12 August and 5 September 2014)

Several campus countries registered notable increases in eligibility rates between stages, including Solomon Islands from 41 per cent to 62 per cent, PNG from 51 per cent to 69 per cent and Samoa from 70 per cent to 81 per cent. Kiribati also raised the proportion of eligible applicants from 28 per cent to 60 per cent.

The two following tables indicate that by nationality, Samoa has a 10–14 percentage point edge compared with Vanuatu and PNG, both in ratio of entrants to applicants and in scholarship awards as a percentage of applications.

Campus c	ountry	Small island states		
Nationality	Entrants as a % of applicants	Nationality	Entrants as a % of applicants	
Samoa	48	Niue	58	
Fiji	40	Tonga	46	
Average all countries	39	Tuvalu	43	
Solomon Islands	37	RMI	43	
PNG	36	Average all countries	39	
Vanuatu	34	Nauru	38	
		Kiribati	34	
		Palau	33	
		FSM	21	

#### Table 3.1.3: Ratio of entrants to applicants by nationality

Source: APTC Table B.2

#### Table 3.1.4: Scholarship awards as a percentage of applicants by nationality

Campus c	ountry	Small island states		
Nationality	Scholarship awards as a % of applicants	Nationality	Scholarship awards as a % of applicants	
Samoa	42	Niue	50	
Fiji	31	RMI	40	
Average all countries	31	Tuvalu	36	
Solomon Islands	30	Tonga	46	
PNG	30	Average all countries	31	
Vanuatu	30	Nauru	30	
		Palau	28	
		Kiribati	25	
		FSM	17	

Source: APTC Table B.2

#### 3.2 Waitlist

Currently 980 applicants, equivalent to just over half of current enrolment, have been placed on the waitlist (W/L) for entrance when places open. As a percentage of current enrolment, the waitlist represents 21 per cent of current enrolment in Samoa, 56 per cent in Fiji, 67 per cent in Vanuatu and 73 per cent in PNG. The following table shows the number of accepted applicants on the wait list by campus location.

# Table 3.2.1: Applicants on waiting list, by campus, and as percentage of current enrolment

School		W/L			
	Fiji	PNG	Samoa	Vanuatu	total
SHCS	255	49	39	168	511
STT	213	204	26	0	443
Combined	7	16		2	25
Total W/L	475	269	65	170	979
Current enrolment	843	370	309	255	1937
W/L as % enrolment	56%	73%	21%	67%	51%

Source: APTC Table B.3.

Three training packages account for three-fourths of the waitlist (731 of 979): community services, tourism/hospitality and construction-related trades. The following chart shows the specific courses with largest wait lists by school.

# Figure 3.2.1: Courses and qualifications with largest waiting lists (number of admitted students, STT in red)



Source: APTC Table B.3

### 3.3 Entrants by source of funding

About three-quarters of entering students were supported on scholarships. This remained constant over the two stages. Employer funding supported an average of 17 per cent of students over the two stages, but dropped from 28 per cent to 11 per cent in STT between the two stages.<sup>14</sup> Income from fee-for-service and partnership agreements was virtually nil in the first stage and increased to a combined 5.7 per cent in Stage II. Self-financed trainees accounted for only an average of 4.5 per cent of the total.

APTC management provided the following explanation for the decline in fee-forservices: 'There were a number of industry-based courses conducted in PNG in Stage I. At the commencement of Stage II, delivery across PNG was consolidated to the Port Moresby campus with the implementation of the POMTech partnership. The commencement of Stage II also coincided with a contraction in work-based training due to decreased demand from the mining industry. OK Tedi and New Britain Palm Oil – APTC withdrew in 2011 (under Stage I) because the organisations were receiving subsidised training (not paying fees). Furthermore, APTC was paying rental for use of facilities. A decision was made by the end of Stage I not to continue to provide corporate clients with subsidised training. Feedback is that most of these companies would not pay fees. There was also a substantial turnover of PNG staff at the end of Stage I and this hampered the ability of APTC to deliver some planned industry-based training programs. The delivery profile in PNG also changed in Stage II to include more

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> The 2013–14 Annual Report and Plan stated 'Industry funding has been particularly strong in Fiji with 83% of Stage II non-scholarship funding provided by industry, and in Vanuatu industry funding accounts for approximately 35% of the non-scholarship funding for APTC students'. (p. 30)

SHCS delivery in line with the outcomes of the feasibility studies conducted on the commencement of the stage'. (Marty Rollings, APTC Management, written communication 12 August 2014)

	SHCS Stage		STT Stage		Total		
					Stage I		Total
	1	Ш	I	П	I.	Ш	to date
Scholarship	80	74	68	78	74.0	75.6	74.8
Employer funded	14	15	28	11	20.4	13.3	16.9
Self or privately funded	6	5	4	2	5.2	3.8	4.5
Fee for service	0	3	0	2	0.0	2.8	1.4
Partnership students	0	1	0	6	0.0	2.9	1.4
No source recorded	0	2	0	1	0.5	1.6	1.0
Total %	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

### Table 3.3.1: Percentage of entrants by funding source

Note: Stage II is to date. Source: APTC Table C.1a

### 3.4 Entrants by employment status

About two-thirds of the students were employed on entry to APTC. Between stages, the proportion increased in SHCS from 58 per cent to 75 per cent, and dropped from 67 per cent to 61 per cent in STT. The decrease in STT was due to the introduction of new industry entrant programs such as the Certificate III in Painting and Decorating and Certificate III in Wall and Floor Tiling.





Source: APTC D.10

# 4 Enrolments

### 4.1 Cumulative enrolment

The following graph shows cumulative enrolment to date by nationality.



Figure 4.1.1: Cumulative student enrolment by nationality since 2007

Enrolment by nationality as a proportion of country size is presented in the following graph. Citizens from small states may be disproportionately represented. Citizens of Samoa, Vanuatu and Fiji have a higher than average participation rates in APTC, and those from PNG (over 7 million people) have a much lower participation in relation to their population.



# Figure 4.1.2: Ratio of enrolment by nationality to population per country (cumulative enrolment, 2007 to present, per thousand population)

Source: Based on APTC Table D.7 and SPC/Prism mid-2013 population estimates.

Source: APTC Table D.8
The following chart shows cumulative enrolment by school and training package. Four training packages account for the bulk of enrolment: community services; tourism and hospitality; metal and engineering; and construction trades.



Figure 4.1.3: Cumulative total enrolment by school and training package, 2007 to present

Source: APTC Table D.1

The following chart shows the changes in enrolment by training package between stages. Community services increased the most, by about 500 students between stages. Compared to Stage I, enrolment in training and education decreased by 160 students. Metal and engineering also contracted, decreasing by about 150 students. Tourism and hospitality registered the greatest decline, by about 500 students.



# Figure 4.1.4: Enrolment by training package and stage

Source: APTC Table D.1

Total enrolment by age group is shown in the following graph. Students between the ages of 25 and 39 accounted for 60 per cent of the enrolments to date.

The age profile changed somewhat between stages and schools. Students enrolled in STT became noticeably younger, as follows, possibly due to the incorporation of New Industry Entrant programs into the training profile.



Figure 4.1.5: Age distribution of students by school and stage

Source: APTC Table D.6

#### 4.2 Current enrolment

The STT enrolled 55 per cent of the total students in the first semester of 2014, SHCS 33 per cent and common courses 12 per cent. The following chart shows enrolment by school and training package.



Figure 4.2.1: Students enrolled by school and training package, Semester 1, 2014

Source: APTC Table A.3

Currently by campus country, Fiji enrols 43.5 per cent of all students, followed by PNG with 19.1 per cent, Samoa with 15.9 per cent, Vanuatu with 13.2 per cent and Solomon Islands with 5.8 per cent.



Figure 4.2.2: Enrolment by campus country, Semester 1, 2014

'Other' includes courses offered in Kiribati, Palau and Nauru. Source: APTC Table A.3



# Figure 4.2.3: Enrolment in PNG by semester, 2007 to mid-2014

Source: APTC Table D.3.

Enrolment per semester declined from 221 students in the second semester of 2009 to just an average of 38 in 2012, but re-bounded to 300 students in the first semester of 2013. The main factor responsible was staff attrition between Stages I and II as a result of changes in terms of service.

# 4.3 Enrolment by gender

Female enrolment comprises 38 per cent of the total to date, and increased from 36 per cent in Stage I to 40 per cent in Stage II.





Source: APTC Table D2

The following chart shows the proportion of female enrolment by school and common courses shared between the two schools\_(i.e. TAE). To date, females account for just under half the enrolments in SHCS and about one quarter of enrolments in STT.



Figure 4.3.2: Females as a percentage of total enrolment by school and stage

Source: Ibid.

The following chart shows the distribution of enrolment by training package.



# Figure 4.3.3: Enrolment by gender and training package, 2007 to present (number of students)

Source: APTC Tables D1, D2

Female enrolment has been marginal in STT, except for 15 per cent of the total in construction trades, commercial cookery and in textiles/clothing. STT training packages are typically from traditional trades and most of the students are existing workers which reflects the employment patterns of the industry. The following chart shows the proportion of female enrolment by training package.



# Figure 4.3.4: Female enrolment as a percentage of total enrolment by training package, 2007 to present

Source: Calculated from APTC Tables D1, D2

Table 4.3.1 shows female enrolment in traditionally male-dominated trades.

Training package and	Fen	Female enrolment			% of Total		
qualification	Total Stage I	Total Stage II to mid- 2014	Total to mid- 2014	female total enrol- ment	enrol- ment to date (M+F)	as % total enrol- ment (M+F)	
Automotive - total	3	4	7	2	419	2	
Cert. II- Automotive Servicing		1	1		53	2	
Cert. III- Automotive Mechanical	3	3	6		366	2	
Tourism & Hospitality - total	134	75	209	48	615	34	
Cert. III- Commercial Cookery	134	75	209		615	34	
<b>Construction, Plumbing - total</b>	91	97	188	43	1273	15	
Cert. II- Construction		3	3		61	5	
Cert. III- Carpentry	5	6	11		674	2	
Cert. III- Painting & Decorating	60	53	113		261	43	
Cert. III- Plumbing	2	1	3		132	2	
Cert. III- Wall & Floor Tiling	24	34	58		145	40	
Metal and Engineering - total	7	14	21	5	1249	2	
Cert. III- Fabrication	2	4	6		341	2	
Cert. III in Diesel Fitting	2	3	5		464	1	
Cert. III- Fitting and Machining	2	5	7		317	2	
Cert. III- Refrigeration & A.C.	1	2	3		127	2	
Electrotechnology - total	4	5	9	2	311	3	
Cert. III- Electrotechnology	4	5	9		311	3	
Total	239	195	434	100	3867	11	
Female students enrolled	1619	1730	3349				
% in traditionally male qualifications	15	11	13				

Table 4.3.1: Females enrolled	in traditionally	/ male occupations
-------------------------------	------------------	--------------------

Source: Calculated from APTC Statistics, Table E.2

Over 90 per cent of female enrolment in traditionally male-dominated occupations is concentrated in two areas: commercial cookery and construction. In construction, women have made inroads in two new qualifications for the Pacific – painting and decoration, and wall and floor tiling. Females constituted 34 per cent of total enrolments to mid-2014 in commercial cookery, 43 per cent in painting/decorating and 40 per cent in wall and floor tiling. In other male-dominated trades, female enrolments averaged only about two per cent of the total.

# 4.4 Enrolment by semester

Enrolment by semester maps closely to the number of training courses offered (see Section 2.2). Enrolment declined from 760 students in the first term of 2010 to 287 in the first term of 2012, before rebounding to 1127 in the first term of 2013.

APTC management provided the following reasons for the decline in enrolments at the beginning of Stage II: 'As Stage I drew to a close much effort was concentrated on completing students by the end of June 2011. Enrolments dropped off from July 2010 as planning indicated that targets were going to be met. Continued emphasis on enrolment would have added to project expenditures after targets had been met. In the transition from Stage I to Stage II, the employment conditions for project staff were realigned to the AusAID ARF (wage scale) table, which meant a substantial change in employment conditions for delivery staff, especially those working in PNG where their employment packages were reduced by 50 per cent. There was no allowance for

hardship etc. for PNG under the ARF, and no capacity for a fly-in fly-out arrangement at the commencement of Stage II. Many PNG delivery staff opted to cease employment with APTC and there was substantial difficulty in recruiting new staff under the changed contractual conditions, leading to the postponement of planned programs in PNG. APTC renegotiated packages for PNG fly-in fly-out from March 2012 which enabled it to entice trainers back to PNG'. (Communication from Marty Rollings, APTC management, 12 August 2014)









Source for both figures above: APTC Table D.1.

Changes in enrolment by campus country are presented in the following graph.



Figure 4.4.3: Enrolments by campus country and semester, 2007 to present

Source: APTC Table D.5

# 5 Graduates and completion rates

# 5.1 Output of graduates

To mid-2014, APTC produced over 6750 graduates, 52 per cent from SHCS.

Figure 5.1.1:	Graduates	by school	and stage
---------------	-----------	-----------	-----------



Note: Stage II is through June 2014. Source: APTC Table E.1, updated 28 August 2014

The following graph shows the total graduates by semester. The numbers correlate closely with data presented earlier on number of courses and enrolments per semester.



Figure 5.1.2: Total graduates across all programs by semester, 2007 to 30 June 2014

Source: APTC Table E.1, updated 28 August 2014

This graph shows output by school. Output from STT fluctuated widely, dropping from 458 in the first half of 2011 to just 16 the following year, and from 321 in the second semester of 2013 to 100 in the first semester of 2014. According to APTC management, the same factors applied to fluctuating level of graduates as to courses offered and enrolments. (See Section 4.4 for APTC management explanation of reasons for fluctuations in enrolments, and by implication, graduates.)



Figure 5.1.3: Graduates by school and semester, 2007 to 30 June 2014

Source: Ibid

The following chart shows the number of graduates by training package and school.



# Figure 5.1.4: Number of graduates by training package and school, 2007 to 30 June 2014

Source: APTC Table E.1, updated 28 August 2014

# 5.2 Completion rates

Completion rates are high with relatively little variation according to school, gender, age, employment status, campus country and nationality. Overall, completion rates are 91 per cent<sup>15</sup>, with 89 per cent for STT and 92 per cent for SHCS. Females had a higher completion rate than males, 93 per cent and 89 per cent, respectively. Completion by age group ranged for 88 per cent for those 40–44 years, to 95 per cent of those in the age group 20–24 years. Employment status for those employed, self-employed and unemployed meant little difference in completion rates which were 92–94 per cent. However, for those without a registered employment status, the completion rate was only 83 per cent.

Among campus countries, students in PNG had the lowest completion rate at 86 per cent compared with Fiji five percentage points higher. By nationality, all countries had 90 per cent completion rate or above, except PNG and Vanuatu at 89 per cent and 88 per cent, respectively. Solomon Islands nationals excelled with a 97 per cent completion rate among more than 700 participants. Several small island states had extremely high completion rates, but for small numbers, including Marshall Islands and Nauru at 100 per cent. However, overall, 639 students did not complete their qualifications, of whom 70 per cent were male.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> As a comparison, completion rates in Australia were just 40% for Certificate III and 44% for Certificate IV and Diploma qualifications from 2009–2012. Source: NCVER. 'The likelihood of completing a VET qualification, 2009-12', NCVER Statistical report, 7 August 2014

	Entrants	Graduates	Completion rate %	No. of non- completers
Total (all graduates)	7276	6637	91	639
By school				
SHCC	4328	4022	92	306
STT	2948	2615	89	333
By gender				
Male	4285	3839	89	446
Female	2991	2798	93	193
By age group				
15-19	10	10	100	0
20-24	482	458	95	24
25-29	1562	1444	92	118
30-34	1549	1439	92	110
35-39	1301	1188	91	113
40-44	1024	905	88	119
45-49	685	616	90	69
>50	663	577	89	86
By prior employment				
Employed	4724	4386	92	338
Self-employed	312	292	94	20
Unemployed	918	859	93	59
Unpaid worker	21	21	100	0
No employment information	1301	1079	83	222

# Table 5.2.1a: Completion rates – total, by school, gender, age group, employment status

Source: APTC Tables E. 2-4, updated 28 August 2014

	Entrants	Graduates	Completion rate %	No. of non- completers
By campus country				
Fiji	3058	2840	93	218
PNG	1092	940	86	152
Samoa	1470	1349	91	121
Solomon Islands	94	93	99	1
Vanuatu	1492	1358	90	134
By nationality (>30 graduates)				
Fiji	2191	1996	91	195
PNG	1601	1432	89	169
Samoa	882	799	90	83
Solomon Islands	706	684	97	22
Vanuatu	1194	1058	88	136
Kiribati	209	193	92	16
Marshall Islands	31	30	100	1
Nauru	63	63	100	0
Tonga	292	280	96	12
Tuvalu	72	70	97	2

# Table 5.2.1b: Completion rates by campus country and nationality

Source: APTC Tables E. 5-6, updated 28 August 2014

The following graph shows completion rates by training package. Excluding business and hairdressing that had relatively few students, the highest completion rate was for community services at 96 per cent, and the lowest for STT courses (86–91 per cent).



Figure 5.2.1: Completion rates by training packages, 2007 to 30 June 2014

Source: APTC Table E. 2, updated 28 August 2014

# 6 Staffing

# 6.1 Trainers and tutors

Initially, students were taught only by expatriate trainers. Local tutors began to be hired in 2009. The recruitment of tutors accelerated in Stage II, as shown below.





Source: APTC Table F.1a and 1b

Accelerated recruitment of tutors changed the ratio of trainers to tutors substantially. In 2009 there were 18 trainers to every one tutor. This dropped to 1.6 trainers per tutor at present, as shown below.



Figure 6.1.2: Ratio of trainers to tutors, 2009 to end 2014

Source: Ibid

At present, the number of tutors exceeds the number of trainers in tourism and hospitality. The numbers are identical in metal and engineering trades. In construction trades, there are almost double the number of trainers as tutors.



# Figure 6.1.3: Number of APTC trainers and tutors by training package, January to June 2014

Source: APTC Tables F1.a and 1b.

Over the past year APTC began promoting Pacific Islanders from the tutor to trainer category. Reportedly 12 trainers will be Pacific nationals by the end of 2014 which would be about one quarter of the total.



Figure 6.1.4: Number of APTC trainers by nationality grouping, 2007 to end 2014

Source: APTC Table F.2

According to APTC's HR data submitted 15 July 2014, the proportion of females among trainers and tutors increased during the second stage. Currently about 30 per cent of trainers and half of tutors are female.



Figure 6.1.5: Females as a percentage of total trainers and tutors, 2007 to present

Note: data for Stage I are not available on gender. Source: APTC Tables F.3a and 3b.

The age distribution of trainers and tutors is almost reversed, as would seem appropriate. Trainers are mostly in their fifties while most tutors are in their thirties.



Figure 6.1.6: Age distribution of trainers and tutors, Semester 1, 2014

Source: APTC Tables F.4a and b.

# 6.2 Students per teacher

APTC has averaged 10.5 students per teacher (trainers and tutors combined) from 2007 to present. Data are presented in the graph below by semester for all qualifications. The average varied widely at the beginning of APTC operations and declined substantially in 2012 commensurate with reduced enrolments. The average declined since 2010 when the hiring of tutors began.



# Figure 6.2.1: Average number of students per teacher (trainers and tutors combined), 2007 to mid 2014

Source: APTC Tables D.1 and F.1a, F.1b



# Figure 6.2.2: Average number of students per teacher (trainers and tutors combined) by training package, Semester 1, 2014

Note: excludes health. Source: APTC Tables D.1 and F.1a, F.1b

APTC staff have pointed out that average class size is a better indicator of efficiency than average number of students per teacher (trainers and tutors combined.) This is because the placement of tutors was to build capacity and not mandatory for delivery of the qualification.

# 6.3 Average class sizes

The following chart shows average class sizes for the two stages to date. Classes ranged from 11 to 31 students. Eliminating the outliers, the averages range from 13 to 21. Overall, class sizes averaged 17.2 students in SHCS and 14.4 in STT. One would expect that SHCS could have a higher average. However, classes in cookery, patisserie and hairdressing have maximum class sizes for safety reasons of about 16 students. Class sizes in SHCS are typically dictated by the limits of physical facilities. Moreover, the APTC does not have access to lecture halls or classrooms that hold big numbers. Most STT class sizes are limited to 14–16 students for safety reasons. However, for STT the two Certificate II feeder courses with larger class sizes raise its average.

Courses offered through blended means, e.g. use of internet and e-learning as well as direct classroom instruction, offer potential for increased class sizes, as seen in the Certificate IV in Management and Diploma in VET.



# Figure 6.3.1: Average number of students per class to date

Last number in line description refers to number of times the course was offered. Excludes Diploma in VET, offered once for 53 students in blended mode. Source: Marty Rollins, APTC, 17 August 2014

# 6.4 Administrative (non-teaching) staff

Currently, APTC has 187 staff, 48 per cent of whom are administrative/management. The following graph shows the number of academic and non-academic staff by location.



Figure 6.4.1: Academic and administrative staff by location, June 30 2014

Source: Calculated from APTC HR Submission, 15 July 2014

Overall, 58 per cent of the staff are female, including 42 per cent of the academic staff and 74 per cent of the non-academic staff. By nationality, Australians make up 38 per cent of total staff, followed by Fijians with 35 per cent of the total.

# Table 6.4.1: Academic and non-academic staff by nationality and gender,June 2014

Nationality	Ac	ademic	nic Non-academic			Total	
	Total	% Female	Total	% Female	Number	% total	% female
Australian	44	36	27	70	71	38	49
Fijian	26	35	40	75	66	35	59
Samoan	9	78	8	75	17	9	76
Ni-Vanuatu	6	83	5	80	11	6	82
PNG	12	33	8	75	20	11	50
Solomon Islands	0		1	100	1	1	100
Other	0		1	100	1	1	100
Total	97	42	90	74	187	100	58
% total	52		48		100		

Source: Calculated from APTC HR Submission, 15 July 2014

Teaching staff slightly outweighed non-teaching staff in the first half of 2014. The ratios have fluctuated frequently, but the number of non-teaching staff has risen steadily from 41 at the end of 2008 to 97 at present.



Figure 6.4.2: Number of teaching and non-teaching staff, 2007 to end-2014

Source: APTC Tables F1a and F1b, and G1.



# Figure 6.4.3: Teaching staff as a percentage of total staff, 2007 to end-2014

Source: Ibid.

# 6.5 Management and administrative staff

The number of management staff has remained relatively constant at 10-12 while the number of administrative staff rose from 37 at the end of Stage I to 85 at present.



Figure 6.5.1: Number of management and non-management staff (excluding teaching staff), 2007 to end 2014

Source: APTC Table G.2

As a result, the proportion of management staff among total staff has decreased from a high of 33 per cent in 2009 to 16 per cent at present.



# Figure 6.5.2: Management staff as a percentage of total administrative staff, 2007 to end 2014

Source: APTC Table G.2

# **ANNEX 5: QUESTIONNAIRE RESULTS**

# Questionnaire results – Responses to review team questions, June–August 2014

## Table of contents

1	Responses from current APTC students, June-August 2014	. 58
1.1	Students' funding and employment status while a student	. 59
1.2	Student level of satisfaction with APTC	. 59
1.3	Future plans	. 59
1.4	Intention to migrate	. 59
1.5	Satisfaction with information provided by APTC	. 60
1.6	Suggestions to improve APTC	. 60
2	Responses from APTC graduates	. 60
2.1	Employment status of graduates	61
2.2	Skills match	61
2.3	Source of funds to study at APTC and adequacy of allowance	62
2.4	How satisfied are graduates with APTC?	62
2.5	Suggestions for improvement	62
2.6	Wage and other benefits from APTC gualification	63
2.7	APTC contact after graduation	63
2.8	Intention to migrate	63
2.9	Steps taken to migrate	64
3	Responses from employers	65
31	Nature of engagement with APTC	66
3.2	Employer views of APTC responsiveness to their needs	. 66
3.3	Employers' experience of skill shortages and their response	. 67
3.4	Benefits to business of employing APTC graduates	. 68
3.5	What APTC graduates do well or not do well	. 68
3.6	Pay benefits for APTC graduates	69
3.7	Suggestions for change	. 69
	Trainars and tutors	60
4	Introduction	.09
1.1	Trainers and tutors: Information compared	70
4.2	Commentary on the comparison of trainer and tutor information	71
4.0 4 4	Trainers and tutors' responses to open-ended questions (F- frequency)	72
45	Commentary on the trainers' and tutors' responses to open-ended questions	74
5	Administrative staff	75
5.1		75
5.2	Concluding comments on trainers, tutors and administrative statt	.76
6	Industry engagement at APTC – analysis of questionnaires completed by	_
_	country managers	. 76
6.1	Overview	76
6.2	Introduction	76

# List of tables

Table 5.1: Responses of current APTC students to the question 'Do you have plans to	
migrate for work to Australia or New Zealand at some stage in the future?' (%)	60
Table 5.2: Proportion of APTC graduates not with the same employer prior to APTC	
who are not working now (%)	61
Table 5.3: Plans of APTC graduates to migrate to other Pacific countries in the region,	
Australia or New Zealand, females, males and total (%)	64

Table 5.4: Estimated response rate of employers to the review team's survey, June–August 2014	. 66
Table 5.5: Ratings by employers of statements about APTC responsiveness, June–August 2014 (%)	.67
Table 5.6: Ratings by employers of statements about APTC's management of work placements, June–August 2014 (%)	.67
Table 5.7: Ratings by employers of statements about the performance of APTC graduates in their business, June–August 2014 (%)	. 68

This annex presents the results of questions that the review team asked the participants to complete at the end of each consultation. The analysis below is of the responses of: current students; APTC graduates; employers; trainers and tutors; administrative staff; and APTC industrial engagement.

Data input from the responses to the first three questions was undertaken by the Australian Council for Educational Research, while the fourth and fifth were by a review team member. The review team members undertook the analysis.

The review team acknowledges that the numbers of those responding to the questionnaires were relatively small in relation to the total numbers in each stakeholder group, particularly in the case of employers. This was highly dependent on the availability of the individual stakeholders and their willingness and motivation to be included.

However, in terms of the consequences of the limitations of the data, several points are noteworthy.

- The review team was confident that there was a high level of consistency between the responses to the questionnaires and the views expressed by each of the stakeholder groups during the many consultations conducted, informal comments by stakeholders and the team's observations during the field visits. If this had not been the case, the written responses would not have been cited.
- Annex 2 (list of persons met) includes the following numbers involved in the consultations by stakeholder group: Students/graduates – 291; Employers – 74; Trainers/tutors – 63; Administrative staff – 32; Pacific government representatives – 44.
- The biggest area of concern is the response rate to the written surveys from the employers, but the view was taken that it was preferable to include these responses than to ignore them.

Overall, the written responses to the questionnaires and the extent of the consultations were seen to be mutually reinforcing.

# 1 Responses from current APTC students, June–August 2014

The review team received 211 responses from the APTC students who responded to APTC's invitation to a consultation. The respondents were invited based on the classes being held on the day and so are not likely to be representative of the total current student population. Of APTC students surveyed, 64 per cent are men and 37 per cent are women, which is close to the gender profile for Stage II students. The largest age group is 20–24 years, accounting for three-in-ten students surveyed which is nearly twice the proportion in the first semester 2014 student population. The men are more concentrated in the 20–24 age range.

A profile of students by country of origin shows that Papua New Guinea is significantly over-represented in the survey with 40 per cent of the total compared with 19 per cent of students in Semester I, 2014. Students from Fiji and Solomon Islands are somewhat

under-represented in the survey compared with their share of current students (24 per cent compared with 32 per cent; 4 per cent compared with 9 per cent). The fields of study represented also differ significantly from the profile of current students, as students were chosen on basis of availability on the day requested.

# 1.1 Students' funding and employment status while a student

Four-out-of-five students are on an APTC scholarship. One-in-six students are funded by their employer. Only 4 per cent are self-funded. Most students surveyed are full-time (83 per cent). Only just over one-in-three are in paid work while a student. Of those students in paid work before APTC, 60 per cent are not in paid work while a student. This suggests that most employers have stopped paying their employees while they are studying. This situation applies to many students in children's services, electrotechnology, fabrication trade, automotive, fitting and machining and disability fields of study.

# **1.2 Student level of satisfaction with APTC**

Students are mostly very satisfied with the APTC, with 70 per cent very satisfied and 23 per cent satisfied. The proportion of women very satisfied is higher at 79 per cent. Major difficulties identified are those related to study, access to and use of computers, problems with English, the short duration of the course and financial matters. These issues accounted for half of the issues listed by students.

# 1.3 Future plans

Students were asked what they wanted to do after they graduated. Just over one-infour (28 per cent) said they would stay with the same employer. Just over one-in-three (36 per cent) said they would try to find a new job in the same field. One-in-ten said they would try to find a new job in their own country in another field to the one they were studying at APTC.

Over one-in-three (37 per cent) said they would try to find a job in another country. This applied much more for male than for female students (47 and 20 per cent respectively). Students were asked in which country they wanted to work. The largest number of mentions for a country was Australia (86), which was more than three times that of New Zealand (25). PNG was mentioned 18 times, followed by Vanuatu (14) and Fiji (6). The USA received four mentions. The 35–39 age group is most likely to say they want to migrate to another country.

#### **1.4** Intention to migrate

In response to a direct question about plans to migrate to Australia or New Zealand, nearly two-thirds of APTC students (64 per cent) said they were planning to migrate at some stage in the future (see Table 5.1). Another one-in-five (18 per cent) has taken steps to do so. Male students are slightly more likely to have taken steps to migrate than females (20 per cent compared with 14 per cent). The 30–34 year age group is most likely to plan to migrate or to have taken steps towards migration.

Of those students interested in migrating to Australia or NZ, over half planned to work there for over five years. Male students who want to migrate to Australia or New Zealand are much more likely to say they plan to work there for over five years than female students (64 per cent to 37 per cent).

Country of origin	No plans at all %	Not planning now	Neutral	Am planning to	Have taken steps to	Total	Ν
Fiji	2.1	4.3	2.1	68.1	23.4	100	47
PNG	3.8	3.8	11.3	67.5	13.8	100	80
Samoa	0.0	22.2	0.0	55.6	22.2	100	18
Solomon Islands	0.0	0.0	0.0	57.1	42.9	100	7
Vanuatu	15.2	9.1	6.1	57.6	12.1	100	33
Total	4.5	6.6	7.1	63.6	18.2	100	198

# Table 5.1: Responses of current APTC students to the question 'Do you have plans to migrate for work to Australia or New Zealand at some stage in the future?' (%)

# **1.5** Satisfaction with information provided by APTC

Students were asked, using a five-point scale, whether they were satisfied with the information APTC had given them about where to find jobs with the skills they were getting at APTC. Near to three-in-four students (73 per cent) were satisfied or very satisfied, with two-in-five (43 per cent) saying they were very satisfied. Female students were much more likely to be very satisfied than male students (54 per cent compared with 36 per cent).

# **1.6 Suggestions to improve APTC**

Students were asked to suggest changes to improve APTC. Two-thirds of the students wrote down their suggested changes. Two-in-five responses related specifically to the operations of APTC. Another one-in-ten related to a request for APTC to offer higher qualifications or more training. However, one-in-three responses (32 per cent) referred to help to find work, and one-in-five responses (20 per cent) specifically requested help to find work overseas.

The students from Fiji, Solomon Islands and PNG are the most likely to request help with finding work. Half of the suggestions from Fiji and Solomon Islands on how to improve APTC referred to help in finding work. Over one-in-three suggestions from PNG students (36 per cent) were related to help in finding work.

In relation to the requested help to find work overseas, students from Solomon Islands, Fiji and PNG were notably above the average response. Near to two-in-five Solomon Island student responses requested help to find work overseas, followed by three-inten responses for students from Fiji and one-in-four students from PNG. These responses are confirmed by the stated intentions of students by their country of origin.

# 2 Responses from APTC graduates

Some 174 graduates responded to an invitation to meet the review team and complete questionnaires. Of APTC graduates surveyed, 57 per cent are men and 43 per cent are women, which is close to the graduate population for Stage I. However, it should be noted that the sample is a self-selected one – graduates who were available during or at the end of a working day and who had made some effort to meet the review team. The graduates surveyed are somewhat older than the Stage II graduate population and differ in relation to the field of study profile of Stage II graduates. For example, 13 per cent of the graduates surveyed had a qualification in children's services compared with 3 per cent of all Stage II graduates.

# 2.1 Employment status of graduates

One-in-six of the graduates who met with the review team and responded to the questionnaire (15 per cent) are not working. However, it needs to be noted that near to half (45 per cent) are still with the same employer. Employment status of the graduate before APTC has a big impact on whether they are now working. Of those employed before starting at APTC, 88 per cent are now in work and 12 per cent are not working. However, for those not working before APTC, only two-in-five (40 per cent) are now working and three-in-five (60 per cent) are not now working.

As many as 94 per cent were employed before APTC but only half (48 per cent) are still with the same employer after graduation. Some graduates had to leave their jobs to start their APTC training. Of those employed before APTC, three-in-five (62 per cent) continued in work while a student and two-in-five did not.

Overall, just over one-in-four graduates not with the same employer are not now employed. However, the proportion of graduates not in work varied greatly by qualification (see Table 5.2). The qualifications with the highest proportion of graduates not still with the same employer out of work are: Youth Work, (57 per cent), Children's Services (50 per cent), Hospitality Operation (50 per cent), Home and Community Care/Aged Care (50 per cent), Mechanical Trade (Fitting & Machining) (40 per cent), Fabrication Trade (40 per cent), Tourism (33 per cent), Community Services Work (33 per cent), Hospitality Supervision (29 per cent) and Carpentry (10 per cent).

Qualification	Not employed - %	N
Youth Work	57	7
Children's Services	50	12
Hospitality Operations	50	4
Home and Community Care/Aged Care	50	2
Mechanical Trade (Fitting & Machining)	40	10
Fabrication Trade	40	5
Tourism	33	9
Community Services Work	33	3
Hospitality Supervision	29	7
Carpentry	10	10
Average/total	27	96

# Table 5.2: Proportion of APTC graduates not with the sameemployer prior to APTC who are not working now (%)

PNG and Fiji have the highest proportion of total graduates not working now (19 and 18 per cent respectively). If those graduates still working with the same employer are excluded, the proportion of graduates not working increases to 38 per cent in Fiji and 33 per cent in PNG. The proportion not in work in Solomon Islands is 10 per cent and 8 per cent in Samoa. All graduates who responded from Vanuatu are now working.

# 2.2 Skills match

All graduates with the same employer say they are working in the same field as their qualification. For graduates not with the same employer, over four-in-five (83 per cent) are working in the same field as their qualification.

# 2.3 Source of funds to study at APTC and adequacy of allowance

Only 5 per cent of APTC graduates who met the review team were solely sponsored by an employer. A small number of graduates were supported by their employer in addition to their APTC scholarship. Close to six-out-of-ten APTC graduates said their allowance was enough to live on always or most of the time, with a third saying it was enough to live on some of the time and 7 per cent saying none of the time. One-in-ten male graduates said that their allowance was not enough to live on. However, in openended responses to a question about your greatest difficulty at APTC, only five responses referred to the allowance as their greatest difficulty.

# 2.4 How satisfied are graduates with APTC?

Nearly all APTC graduates surveyed by the review team say they are satisfied with what they learnt at APTC. Two-thirds of the graduates say they are very satisfied. Only 2 per cent of graduates are not satisfied and 4 per cent are neutral. There is only a small difference in levels of satisfaction between graduates in work and not now in work, with the latter slightly less likely to be very satisfied (60 per cent compared with 67 per cent).

In response to a question about the aspect they liked best about the training at APTC, 123 respondents gave a response. Five categories of responses were identified. Near to half of the responses related to training content, one-in-four related to the trainers, one-in-ten mentioned training delivered to Australian standards and one-in-ten mentioned the equipment or tools they were able to use. Only two per cent of the responses mentioned work placements as the aspect they liked best about their training at APTC.

Graduates were asked to say if anything disappointed them about their time at APTC. Only 53 responses from 174 respondents were received. Of these responses, about half (47 per cent) were related to the time to learn being too short. In response to comments about what graduates liked least about APTC training, a pattern was harder to identify. The most common response was also that the time for the training was too short. In response to a 'What was your greatest difficulty at APTC?', 71 responses were received. Of these, the two most important set of difficulties related to time available for the course and study problems, with each accounting for 31 per cent of responses. Being away from home and coping with different cultures, accessing and learning how to use computers, and coping with the level of English required were other difficulties mentioned.

Nine-out-of-ten APTC graduates rated their work experience as satisfactory, with over half (54 per cent) rating it as very satisfactory. The same proportion of APTC graduates also rated as satisfactory the personal support they needed on their work experience, with 56 per cent rating it as very satisfactory. In response to the question 'Did the APTC provide the help you wanted to help you learn', 72 per cent of APTC graduates rated this help as very satisfactory, with a further 22 per cent rating it as satisfactory.

In response to the question 'Did APTC tell you about what options you had for further study', 57 per cent of APTC graduates said yes, 34 per cent said no and 9 per cent did not answer.

# 2.5 Suggestions for improvement

Respondents were invited to suggest changes to improve APTC. The suggestions offered were open-ended and were coded into four categories. Four-out-of-five APTC graduates gave a response. Half of the responses related directly to suggestions for improvement to APTC itself and one-in-four related to requests for the opportunity to obtain higher qualifications or more training. However, over one-third of the responses (37 per cent) related to requests for help to find work and one-in-five comments

(21 per cent) related specifically to a request for help to find work overseas, usually in Australia.

# 2.6 Wage and other benefits from APTC qualification

Three-in-four graduates in work (73 per cent) said their wage had increased since graduating. The proportion was higher for male graduates (78 per cent) compared with female graduates (66 per cent). Two-thirds of APTC graduates in work also mentioned receiving other benefits as well.

# 2.7 APTC contact after graduation

Six-out-of-ten graduates said that the APTC had contacted them since graduating to find out what they were doing, a third said they had not been contacted and 8 per cent did not respond to the question. Women graduates were more likely to be have been contacted (64 per cent compared with 55 per cent for men).

#### 2.8 Intention to migrate

Table 5.3 below reports the intention of APTC graduates to migrate to other countries for work. Over half of APTC graduates surveyed (54 per cent) are planning to migrate for work to other Pacific countries in the region and another 22 per cent have taken steps to migrate. In relation to Australia, half of the APTC graduates surveyed (49 per cent) are planning to migrate for work and another three-in-ten (29 per cent) have taken steps to migrate. Similar but lower proportions apply to the intentions of APTC graduates to migrate to New Zealand for work. It is worth noting the absence of major differences between women and men graduates in their intention to migrate. The age group from 20 to 39 years is most likely to say they plan to migrate.

Half (48 per cent) of those planning to migrate for work to Australia or New Zealand said they planned to stay there for over five years, one-in-four for four to five years, and one-in-five for one to three years. In response to the question: 'Did APTC help you to find out how to migrate for work', only one-in-ten APTC graduates (9 per cent) said they had received information from APTC.

APTC graduates from Fiji are most likely to have taken the steps to migrate. In the case of migration to Australia, half (50 per cent) of APTC graduates from Fiji had taken steps to migrate and more than a third (36 per cent) were planning to. APTC graduates from Fiji have a lower level of interest in migrating to New Zealand, with only one-in-five having taken steps to and two-in-five planning to do so. APTC graduates from Fiji who want to migrate for work are much more likely (77 per cent) to say they plan to work abroad for over five years compared with graduates from other countries.

For Solomon Islands, two-in-five APTC graduates (40 per cent) had taken steps to migrate to Australia and three-in-five (60 per cent) planned to. The interest in New Zealand is a little less, with one-in-five taking steps to migrate there and two-in-three planning to. More than half (53 per cent) of Solomon Islands graduates who want to migrate for work would like to do so for more than five years.

Plans to migrate for work to other Pacific	Female	Male	Total
No plans at all	4	13	9
Not planning to now	9	.0	8
Neutral	11	6	8
Lam planning to	54	52	53
Have taken steps to migrate	22	23	22
Total	100	100	100
N	74	96	170
Plans to migrate for work to Australia?	Female	Male	Total
No plans at all	4	7	6
Not planning to now	1	4	3
Neutral	16	13	14
I am planning to	49	48	49
Have taken steps to migrate	29	28	29
Total	100	100	100
N	75	96	171
Plans to migrate for work to New Zealand?	Female	Male	Total
No plans at all	14	14	14
Not planning to now	7	5	6
Neutral	25	20	22
I am planning to	39	44	42
Have taken steps to migrate	15	17	16
Total	100	100	100
Ν	72	95	167

Table 5.3: Plans of APTC graduates to migrate to other Pacific countries in the region, Australia or New Zealand, females, males and total (%)

In the case of PNG, one-in-four APTC graduates (25 per cent) had taken steps to migrate and more than half planned to. There is also strong interest among APTC graduates from PNG in migrating to New Zealand, with one-in-five taking steps and near to half (45 per cent) planning to. Near to half of APTC graduates from PNG (45 per cent) who want to migrate for work would like to work overseas for more than five years.

For APTC graduates in Samoa, the propensity to migrate for work to Australia is lower: one-in-five had taken steps to migrate and only one-in-six (14 per cent) were planning to. This same lower propensity to migrate also applies to New Zealand. Over half of the APTC graduates from Samoa (55 per cent) who want to migrate for work would like to do so for more than five years.

For APTC graduates from Vanuatu, none had taken steps to migrate to Australia but near to half (44 per cent) were planning to. Only one-in-four APTC graduates from Vanuatu who want to migrate for work want to stay overseas for more than five years.

# 2.9 Steps taken to migrate

It was decided to add some additional questions after the first two campus countries were visited. These questions sought information on the actual steps taken to migrate to Australia and New Zealand and what problems the graduates had encountered. Most responses related to Australia, with a much smaller number of APTC graduates giving details of the steps they had taken to migrate to New Zealand. The most common step taken (46 per cent of graduates) is to look at the website of Australian Immigration. Less than one-in-five (17 per cent) said they had got information from APTC on how to migrate. One-in-five graduates (22 per cent) had started to apply to migrate online, one-in-six (16 per cent) had asked for help from an immigration agent in Australia and only 7 per cent of graduates had completed the process successfully. Three-in-ten graduates had taken other steps. Just over half of those who said what action they had taken said they were first looking for a job in Australia.

Some 68 APTC graduates outlined the problems they had encountered. The greatest barrier encountered (34 per cent of the problems mentioned) in applying to migrate was the lack of information or a suitable guide to turn to for help. The next two barriers were the cost or lack of finance to apply for a visa and the difficulty of applying for a visa (16 per cent respectively). The lack of a job offer was the next most important barrier identified (13 per cent), followed by lack of internet access (8 per cent). Other issues mentioned were: qualification not recognised for entry to Australia or New Zealand (5 per cent), lack of accommodation or contacts (6 per cent) and personal reasons (3 per cent).

Graduates were asked what steps they could take to overcome the problems they had encountered. The most prominent step they identified was to seek information from the APTC (28 per cent of all proposed steps). A further 6 per cent of the responses suggested that APTC could help them find a job overseas. Other sources of information referred to were the Internet, and government officials from Australia or New Zealand. Some graduates suggested that the APTC alumni association could play a valuable role in providing information and guidance on how to apply to migrate. However, few graduates were aware of the importance of getting a job offer first, the need to have the required qualification level or appropriate work experience as basic requirements for approval to enter Australia or New Zealand as a skilled migrant.

# 3 Responses from employers

The response by employers to the invitation to meet the review team was low. Employers completed only 38 questionnaires with widely varying responses by country, although a number of other employers, especially in PNG, took part in the discussions. A request for employers to provide detailed wages information may have contributed to a low response rates, especially in PNG, Solomon Islands and Vanuatu. Samoan employers contributed 18 questionnaires although three are from employer associations. Vanuatu had 9 responses, Fiji had 7 and PNG only 4. No questionnaires were received from employers in Solomon Islands.

APTC provided a list of the employers with whom they have a relationship. This list, which is entitled 'Industry Relationships – Informal (employer/work placement/ industry support)', includes employers in four of the five campus countries (Fiji is missing). The number of employers by country is presented in the table below and provides the basis for estimating country response rates.

Three-in-five employers (58 per cent) did not identify themselves and in many cases did not provide other information as well. The unidentified employers were on average small employers (median 14 employees). The employers who identified themselves were often very large employers (range 400 to 2000 employees). These small numbers of employers and wide range for employment size from 2 to 2000 make it difficult to draw any clear conclusions from the following results.

Country	No. of responses	No. of employers on APTC list	Response rate
Fiji	7	n/a	
PNG	4	32	12.5
Samoa	15	110	13.6
Vanuatu	9	49	18.4
Solomon Islands	0	74	0.0

# Table 5.4: Estimated response rate of employers to the review team's survey, June–August 2014

# 3.1 Nature of engagement with APTC

The most common form of employer engagement with APTC is to provide work placements (74 per cent), followed by hiring graduates (55 per cent), sponsoring students (40 per cent), fee-for-service activities (32 per cent) and taking part in an advisory role (24 per cent). Four employers mentioned other forms of engagement.

In relation to the advisory role, the 11 employers provided an average of 2.5 days in that role in the year to the survey. The number of days was higher in Samoa (average of 4). The average number of students sponsored was 3.2 per employer (range 1 to 14), with the highest number of sponsored students for employers in Fiji. Employers provided an average of 4.6 work placements (range 1 to 15), varying from 6.7 work placements in Fiji to 4 in Vanuatu. The average number of APTC graduates hired was 3.2 per employer (1 to 16). However, only between 17 and 22 employers responded to these questions. Six employers indicated the amount they paid for fee-for-service activities.

# 3.2 Employer views of APTC responsiveness to their needs

Employers rated four statements about how well APTC responded to the needs of their business. Four-in-five employers agree that APTC graduates have the right kinds of skills needed in their business, with one-in-three strongly agreeing with the statement. On the issue of whether APTC students on work placements 'have the right kinds of skills our business needs', three-in-four employers agreed. Employers also agreed that 'APTC has made an effort to find out what kinds of skills our business needs', with two-in-five strongly agreeing with this statement.

A smaller number of employers had experience with APTC's fee-for-service activity. Of those employers who had paid for this training, near to three-in-four agreed that APTC was good at identifying 'the right kinds of skills we needed in our business', with two-infour strongly agreeing with the statement.

APTC responsiveness to employer needs	Strongly disagree	Dis- agree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly agree	Total	Ν
APTC graduates have the right kinds of skills our business needs	6		12	50	32	100	34
APTC students on work placements have the right kinds of skills our business needs	3	3	18	43	33	100	33
APTC has made an effort to find out what kinds of skills our business needs	8	3	8	39	42	100	36
In fee-for-service training, APTC was good at identifying the right kinds of skills we needed in our business	9	9	9	34	39	100	23

# Table 5.5: Ratings by employers of statements about APTC responsiveness, June–August 2014 (%)

The ratings differed by country. In general, employers in Fiji and Samoa were much more likely to strongly agree with the first three statements. However, the number of responses by country are small so reporting them, apart from indicating a clear trend, may give an inaccurate picture of the responsiveness of each country campus.

Employers were asked to rate another set of statements related to APTC management of work placements. Four-in-five employers agreed that APTC had managed well the placement of students in their business and that they had sought feedback on how each student performed. Employer agreement with the statement about the assessment process used by APTC was only slightly lower at three-in-four employers (74 per cent). One-in-three employers or more gave the highest rating for each statement. Again, there were differences by country with Fiji and Samoa employers much more likely to give the highest ratings.

# Table 5.6: Ratings by employers of statements about APTC's management of work placements, June–August 2014 (%)

APTC management of work placements	Strongly disagree	Dis- agree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly agree	Total	Ν
APTC managed well the placement of their students in our business	7	3	10	48	32	100	31
APTC sought feedback from your business on how well each student performed	13		6	44	37	100	32
The assessment process APTC required to assess the competencies of each student on work placement was good	7	3	16	37	37	100	30

# 3.3 Employers' experience of skill shortages and their response

Three-in-five employers experience skill shortages, with little difference by country. Large employers are much more likely to experience skill shortages. The average employment size of an enterprise stating that they experienced skill shortages was 162 employees compared with an average employment size of 17 employees for employers who said they did not experience skill shortages.

Of the 21 responses on skill shortages, eight related to APTC current qualifications offered, nine responses related to skills usually covered by higher level qualifications and four related to short courses such as report writing, computer skills and customer service.

Three-in-ten employers had a plan or strategy to overcome skill shortages. The largest employers were more likely to have a plan or strategy in place. Two-thirds of enterprises with 500 to 1000 employees had a plan or strategy in place. Near to half of the enterprises said they thought there was scope for APTC to provide training to meet their skill shortages. Enterprises with 51 to 500 employees were most likely to say there was scope for APTC to help them meet their skill shortages.

#### 3.4 Benefits to business of employing APTC graduates

Four-out-of-five employers agree that the APTC graduates they employ perform well on the job in terms of technical competencies compared with other workers at the same level, with two-in-five agreeing strongly. A smaller number of employers were asked to rate a statement on the work habits of their APTC graduates. Four-in-five agreed that their APTC graduates had good work habits but only one-in-five agreed strongly.

There is high employer agreement with the statement that 'APTC graduates have helped to train their co-workers to work better', although this was only asked of some employers due to a revised questionnaire. Most employers agreed that their APTC graduates added more value to their business compared with other workers at the same level, with two-in-five agreeing strongly.

Finally, of the smaller number of employers who were asked, near to four-in-five employers agreed that the work performance of APTC graduates has enabled their business to expand.

# Table 5.7: Ratings by employers of statements about the performance of APTC graduates in their business, June–August 2014 (%) Performance of APTC graduates Strongly Dis- Neutral Agree Strongly Oregon Strongly Strongly Oregon Strongly Stro

Performance of APTC graduates	disagree	Dis- agree	Neutral	Agree	agree	lotal	N
APTC graduates in our business perform well on the job in terms of technical competencies compared with other workers at the same level	3	3	12	41	41	100	32
APTC graduates in our business perform well in terms of work habits such as being punctual, reliable, good at following instructions and taking initiatives		12	6	63	19	100	16
APTC graduates have helped to train their co-workers to work better		7	7	40	46	100	15
APTC graduates in our business add more value to our business compared with other workers at the same level		3	19	36	42	100	31
The work performance of APTC graduates has enabled me to expand my business		8	15	38	38	100	13

# 3.5 What APTC graduates do well or not do well

Three-in-four employers offered their open-ended comments on what their APTC graduates do well. Nearly half of employers (46 per cent) identified the technical skills of APTC graduates as the distinctive aspect of what they do particularly well. One-in-three employers identified in particular the soft skills APTC graduates now have such as 'confidence, 'listening, following, taking instruction', and 'professionalism in attendance, participation, sharing information and encouraging others towards excellence'. One-in-ten employers identified both the technical and soft skills of their APTC graduates as the features of what they do particularly well.

Fewer employers offered a comment on what their APTC graduates are not good at doing. The most common comment related to attitudes to work such as 'sometimes too cocky', 'expected higher pay prior to demonstrating ability', failure to spread the knowledge they have learnt, and 'unlearning old habits and perceptions'. A smaller number of comments related to technical skills such as 'not fully utilising their skills', basic finance, budgeting and report writing, and 'engineering'.

# 3.6 Pay benefits for APTC graduates

Only 17 employers provided information about whether they pay APTC graduates more than other graduates in the same occupations and levels. Three-in-ten employers (29 per cent) said there was no difference in pay for their APTC graduates, one-in-three (35 per cent) said there was a small difference in pay and one-in-three said there was a large difference in pay.

# 3.7 Suggestions for change

Employers were asked to say in conclusion how they think APTC should change to meet the needs of enterprises in the future. Nearly all employers offered a comment and most of these related to changes they would like to see. Two-in-five comments related to operational matters such as more days in work experience, the structure of the teaching day, more flexible blocks of training, night classes, more part-time courses, a more transparent scholarship selection process, need for statement of attainment for specific skill sets, and a year plan of future activities.

Two-in-five comments referred to a request for APTC to provide related or higher qualifications in the same fields of study. Refresher courses were also requested as were programs focusing on specialised skill needs. Three comments related to the future direction of APTC. One comment referred to the value of expanding APTC but warned that a 80 per cent nationalisation target with Australian standards would be the 'start of the end of it'. Two employers suggested providing more opportunities for school leavers and 'training students younger before they pick up bad habits from technical centres'.

# 4 Trainers and tutors

# 4.1 Introduction

During the field visits, questionnaires were conducted with the available trainers, tutors and administrative staff in the five countries visited, including 29 trainers, 28 tutors and 45 administrative staff. The same questionnaire was used for trainers and tutors, using a mixture of closed and open-ended questions. Closed questions on biographical information were followed by the following open-ended questions:

- How do you keep up-to-date with the skills and knowledge of the areas in which you teach?
- What do you think have been APTC's greatest achievements? (Name up to 3)
- What are the main challenges you face as a trainer/tutor? (Name up to 3)
- Do you have the opportunity to discuss these challenges with your direct supervisor?
- How responsive is your supervisor to the issues you raise?
- What do you think are the major challenges faced by students? (Name up to 3.)
- Do you have any suggestions as to how these challenges might be addressed?
- Have you participated in a quality audit in your area of teaching? If so, how many times and with what results?
- Do you have regular contacts with employers of your students? If so what form do these take?

- Do your students undertake work placement? If so what arrangements are in place to support students and monitor workplace training?
- What arrangements are in place for competency-based assessment for the Australian qualifications?
- How well do you think the assessment process is carried out?
- What could be done to improve teaching in APTC?
- What could be done to improve post-training outcomes for graduates?
- What role should APTC have in the future in the region?
- Do you have any other comments about the APTC or your role?

The analysis of the most telling items on the questionnaires follows with comparisons between trainers and tutors.

#### 4.2 Trainers and tutors: Information compared

TRAINER RESPONSES: N = 29		TUTOR R	ESPONSES: N = 28	
Trainers: Years at APTC		Tutors: Years at APTC		
<1	9	<1	4	
1–2	10	1–2	21	
>4	9	>2	3	
No response	1			

Trainers by gender		Tutors by gender	
Male	19	Male	13
Female	9	Female	15
Blank	1		

Trainers by nation	onality	Tutor
Australian/Anglo-Saxon	25	Fijian/Indo-Fijian
Ni-Vanuatu	2	Ni-Vanuatu
Fijian	1	PNG
No response	1	Samoan

Trainers' vocational q	ualifications
Certificate III or equivalent	9
Certificate IV	2
Diploma	5
Advanced Diploma	4
Bachelor	1
None/ no response	4

Trainers' teaching o	ualification
Has Cert IV TAE40110	28
No TAE40110	0
Studying TAE40110	0
No Response	1

Trainers participating	g in a quality audit
Yes	20
No	6
No response	3

PNG	10
Samoan	9
Tutors' vocationa	al qualifications
Certificate III	15
Certificate IV	2
Diploma	2

Tutors by nationality

5

4

Dipioma	Z
Postgraduate	1
None/ no response	8

Tutors' teaching	qualification
Has Cert IV TAE40110	22
No TAE40110	6
Studying TAE40110	5
No response	1

Tutors participating	in a quality audit
Yes	14
No	11
No response	3

Trainers' discussion of issues with supervisor		Tutors' discussion of issues with supervisor		
Issues discussed	29	Issue discussed	25	
Not discussed	0	Not discussed	3	
Supervisor responsive	16	Supervisor responsive	21	
Not responsive	4	Not responsive		
Neutral	8	Neutral	1	
Not applicable	1	Not applicable	6	
Trainer teaching hours per week		Tutor teaching hours	Tutor teaching hours per week	
15 or less	1	15 or less	15	
16–40	26	16–40	12	
40+	6	40+	4	
Varies	1	Varies	1	
No response	1	No response	1	

## 4.3 Commentary on the comparison of trainer and tutor information

It can be seen from the above results, and it was apparent during the consultations that:

- almost half of the trainers have been with APTC for more than four years i.e. before Stage II
- proportionately more female tutors are employed at APTC than female trainers
- national trainers are still small in number (although more have since been approved)
- tutors' vocational qualifications are low compared with those of trainers
- significant progress has been made with tutors undertaking or completing the Certificate IV in Training and Assessment
- almost half the tutors have experienced a quality audit although most have not been with APTC for more than two years
- the extent to which trainers and tutors raise issues of concern with supervisors varies, with tutors more likely to regard their supervisor as responsive than trainers. In turn, tutors' supervisors are most likely to be trainers
- some teachers appear to have an allocation of more than 40 hours a week a cause for some dissatisfaction.

# 4.4 Trainers and tutors' responses to open-ended questions (F= frequency)

Trainers and tutors perceptions of the main chanenges they face				
Trainers	F	Tutors	F	
Dealing with language, literacy and numeracy (LLN) issues with students	9	Coping with cultural and linguistic diversity (CALD) of students	9	
Difficulties associated with cultural and linguistic diversity (CALD) among students	8	Lack of access to professional development, including in Australia	6	
Employment conditions for trainers, including high workload, lack of flexibility and living conditions	8	Lack of resources and space	6	
Lack of resources and space	6	Dealing with mature-aged students returning to education, including different learning styles	5	
Timeframes for courses	5	Language literacy and numeracy (LLN) issues	4	
Lack of pre-requisite knowledge and technology skills in students, including dealing with students failing	5	Lack of trainer support	3	
Delivering an Australian qualification in the Pacific, including lack of Pacific- context materials	4	Planning a lesson	3	
Lack of support and response from management including lack of administrative support	4	Meeting timeframes for course requirements	3	
Homesickness among students	3	Adapting to the APTC system	2	
Lack of IT access and support	3	Lack of Pacific context resources	2	
Catering to the different learning styles and levels of students' abilities	3	Working while studying TAE	2	

# Trainers' and tutors' perceptions of the main challenges they face

Challenges faced by students: Trainers' and tutors' perceptions							
Trainers	F	Tutors	F				
Homesickness	11	Difficulties with language, literacy and numeracy (LLN)	21				
Difficulties with language, literacy and numeracy (LLN)	8	Mature-aged students returning to education, including different learning styles	8				
Time management and study/life balance	8	Time management	7				
Lack of resources	7	Coping with cultural and linguistic diversity (CALD)	5				
Coping with cultural and linguistic diversity (CALD)	7	Lack of confidence	2				
Living conditions	5	Financial concerns	2				
Financial concerns	5	Lack of employment	2				
Learning standards and teaching styles	4	Homesickness	2				
Lack of pre-requisite knowledge and technology skills	4	Lack of industry exposure/experience	2				
Employer interference in and/or resistance to training	4	Lack of student social activities	2				
Complexity of the learning environment, APTC systems and learning tasks	4						
Transport costs	3						
Boredom and substance abuse	3						
Student challenges: Trainers' and tutors' suggestions for addressing							
--	----	---	----	--	--	--	--
Trainers	F	Tutors	F				
Increased language and bridging support – including greater use of LLN tutors and Learning Support Facilitators	12	Increased language and bridging support – including greater use of LLN tutors and Learning Support Facilitators	14				
Extension of timeframes for course completion	10	Provision of more student study and social support such as group work, support groups, technology training, activities, cultural sharing and transport	9				
Provision of more social support for students such as counselling, cultural awareness, an alcohol-free club, budgeting workshops, social events, peer support and housing for those living a long distance away	9	Extension of time frames for course to provide more time for explanation/demonstration and catching up	8				
Provision of more study resources and study areas	5	Increase in support and reassurance from teacher	4				
Increased stipends for students	5	Improvement in students' access to industry experience and transition to work	3				
Maintaining a high standard of students through monitoring and holding them accountable and failing students where necessary.	5	Professional development in Australia for tutors	2				
Development of more Pacific-context resources	4	Improved initial orientation of students	2				
Better links with industry/employers, including input into training program, encouragement of contribution to costs of training and clarification of student expectations	4						
Maintain the quality of trainers and trainers' input into programs	3						

Improving teaching at APTC: Trainers' and tutors' suggestions							
Trainers	F	Tutors	F				
Improved trainer support: preparation in Australia, communication between those in similar industry sectors, succession planning, consultation and input into programs	6	Up-skilling of teachers in teaching area and IT/technology and maintain emphasis on TAE training	13				
More group moderation	5	More professional development/work placement in Australia and elsewhere in the Pacific, including other APTC campuses	5				
Increased time frames for course completion	4	Improvement in resources/ technology/ facilities/ space	5				
More professional development, including in Australia	4	More variation in delivery styles/ types of assessment	3				
Better e-resources	3	More use of moderation/validation	2				
Better links with industry	2	Offering of higher level courses	2				
Development of Pacific-context resources	2	Greater marketing and funding for APTC	2				
Maintenance of expatriate trainers	2						
Better administrative/technical support	2						

improving graduate outcomes. Trainers and tutors suggestions						
Trainers	F	Tutors	F			
Offer higher courses/pathways	12	Provide additional workshops and higher level courses to graduates	10			
Better links with industry/employers and promotion of graduates to employers	10	Evaluate graduate outcomes, including sending trainers to graduate workplaces for this purpose	5			
Follow-up workshops for graduates, including in business skills and IT training	6	Ensure trainers' and tutors' skills remain current	2			
Maintain contact with graduates and evaluate graduate outcomes	5	Promote high achieving graduates to employers	2			
Promote other opportunities for graduates such as other training, scholarships or sponsored work in Australia	2	Increase emphasis on assessment and moderation	2			

#### Improving graduate outcomes: Trainers' and tutors' suggestions

## 4.5 Commentary on the trainers' and tutors' responses to open-ended questions

Trainers generally provided more information in the survey forms than did tutors, but in both cases the comments were consistent with the consultations conducted with the two groups.

- Trainers and tutors face many of the same issues, particularly dealing with students who have language literacy and numeracy challenges, with students from different cultural backgrounds and with students' different leaning styles.
- Both are concerned about time frames for courses and the limitations of space and resources and both would like more Pacific-context learning resources.
- Trainers are more likely to express dissatisfaction with their employment terms and conditions than tutors.
- Tutors cite LLN difficulties as by far the biggest issue for students, whereas trainers see it as one of many concerns.
- Trainers see homesickness as a major concern for students, with tutors citing this much less often.
- Both groups consider that dealing with cultural diversity is an issue for students, which may well mean dealing with Australian, as well as different Pacific, cultures.
- Financial concerns, living conditions and lack of social activities are also common themes of the two groups.
- Trainers and tutors are united in their views on the ways students' issues can be addressed with LLN support, provision of more study and social support and the extension of time frames for course, ranking in the three most mentioned suggestions for both groups.
- Both trainers and tutors emphasise the importance of professional development in maintaining and improving the quality of teaching at APTC, including work placement in Australia. Tutors also see opportunities in other Pacific countries and at other APTC campuses as important professional development opportunities.
- Both trainers and teachers support the use of moderation and validation as a means to improve teaching.

- The provision of follow-up workshops for graduates, as well as pathways or access to higher level qualifications are seen as ways to improve graduate outcomes.
- Both groups also highlighted the need for follow-up evaluation of graduate outcomes (tracer studies and the like).

## 5 Administrative staff

#### 5.1 Overview

Administrative staff were also requested to complete a questionnaire on a confidential basis. This was shorter than those used for tutors and trainers. Staff involved included those operating in country campus offices as well as the head office in Nadi. Because of the relatively small numbers and the confidentiality issues, results are presented in summary form only.

AP	TC Administrative Staff N =45				
1.	Gender	Male	12	Female	32
2.	2. Location		Number of admin sta		
	<ul> <li>Fiji – Nadi</li> </ul>			16	
	<ul> <li>Fiji – Suva</li> </ul>			6	
	• PNG			8	
	• Samoa			7	
	Solomon Islands			3	
	Vanuatu			5	
3.	Time employed at APTC	Numb	er of	admin st	aff
	• < 1 year			16	
	• 1–4 years			24	
	• > 4 years			5	
4.	Staff undertaking or completed training while at APTC	Yes	34	No	11
_					
5.	Staff undertaking or completed Certificate IV in Business			21	
-					
6.	Experience working at APTC (open-ended)			- ·	
	Positive or very positive			31	
	WIXed			11	
	Negative or very negative			2	
				2	
7					
7.	Main reasons for mixed or negative response	tor ooro	orpoi	tha	
	Levels of remuneration	ler care	er par	115	
	Comparisons with expertise and trainer/futer terms and conditions				
	• Compansons with expande and trainer/tutor terms and conditions.				

# 5.2 Concluding comments on trainers, tutors and administrative staff

While the analysis above demonstrates that trainers, tutors and administrative staff at APTC all face considerable challenges in their work, their responses to the survey forms were overwhelmingly thoughtful and constructive, revealing a concern to maximise APTC's potential to deliver vocational education and training in the Pacific.

# 6 Industry engagement at APTC – analysis of questionnaires completed by country managers

## 6.1 Overview

The survey on industry engagement contained 21 questions relating to the diverse forms of industry engagement practised by a typical TVET provider in Australia. These forms of industry engagement assume a demand-driven, industry-led TVET system like Australia and so test the progress APTC has made in this regard. There are variations between countries, particularly the Solomon Islands where the partnership is relatively new.

Salient features from the results of the questionnaire are as follows:

- of the 21 forms of industry engagement listed, only one had no APTC involvement, namely employer/industry involvement in the selection of staff; this may change as more national staff are employed
- in all countries, employers provide work placement and in all but the Solomon Islands which is fairly new, they provide live work projects for students
- employers have supported work placement for APTC tutors in three countries and for trainers in one
- in two countries, employers/enterprises have been involved in the assessment of students
- there is extensive use of APTC facilities by industry for training, meetings and other events
- APTC staff are involved in industry associations where they exist: Fiji (5), PNG (2), Samoa (5) Solomon Islands (1) and Vanuatu (8).

# 6.2 Introduction

The primary APTC student cohorts are existing workers and new industry entrants. This means that engagement with industry is integral to program delivery. However, there are many different forms of industry engagement according to the programs offered, the enterprises/industries involved and the priority placed on engagement by individual providers and the enterprises concerned. This issue can present challenges in instances where engagement by educational institutions with industry and enterprises has not been practised as a matter of course, as is the case in the Pacific.

Between June and August 2014, a questionnaire on industry engagement was completed by the then two Country Managers for Fiji (with joint responsibility as School Directors) and the Country Managers of Papua New Guinea, Samoa, Solomon Islands and Vanuatu.

The questions relate to standard ways in which TVET providers in Australia engage with industry and required the response of YES, NO or NOT APPLICABLE for the particular area of responsibility.

The table below summarises the responses and provides progressive commentary on some of the points raised. While there are some slightly different interpretations of the questions, the summary provides an overview of industry engagement at APTC.

# Industry engagement questionnaire responses and commentary

The following codes are used:

- STT School of Trades and Technology PNG Papua New Guinea SOL Solomon Islands

SHCS – School of Hospitality and Community Services SAM – Samoa VAN – Vanuatu

Que	stion	YES	NO	NA
1.	Do employers/enterprises allow industry visits from your students? Comments: There were many examples of this in all countries, except in the Solomon Is where it was not yet applicable.	SHCS STT PNG SAM VAN		SOL
2.	Do employers/enterprises provide work placements for your students? Comments: Because most students are existing employees or new industry entrants, work placement is integral to the course. Even in the Solomon Is some Certificate II graduates students were beginning to get work placements.	SHCS PNG STT SAM SOL VAN		
3.	Do employers/enterprises provide industry placement for your staff? Comments: Where this has occurred, placements were for mainly for tutors, but also some trainers. In the past 12 months: SHCS – 7 tutors and 2 trainers; SAM – 2 tutors; VAN – 1 tutor	SAM SHCS VAN	SOL PNG	STT
4.	Do employers/enterprises participate in course advisory committees (or similar) for the APTC? Comments: STT: Previously there were informal advisory committees. A formal committee for the combined trades commenced in February 2014. VAN: Informal advisory mechanisms exist, mostly through functions organised by APTC for this purpose.	STT VAN PNG	SHCS SAM SOL	
5.	Are employers/enterprises involved in joint learning materials development projects for the APTC? Comments: VAN: In the past 12 months, employers contributed approximately 150 hours in this capacity.	VAN PNG	SHCS SOL	STT SAM
6.	Do employers/enterprises participate in any governing or advisory bodies for the APTC? Comments: Country Managers responding positively to this question referred to the involvement of the country representative in the APTC Advisory Group.	SAM SOL PNG VAN	SHCS STT	
7.	Do employers/enterprises participate in the strategic planning process for APTC? Comments: SHCS – referred to employer involvement in training profile decisions and the implementation of new training package requirements. VAN – referred to the APTC Advisory Group strategic planning workshop held in Vanuatu in May 2014, at which Vanuatu employers and stakeholders were invited to speak.	SHCS VAN	STT PNG SAM SOL	
8.	Do employers/enterprises provide any live work projects for students? Comments: With the exception of the Solomon Is where students are studying Certificate II, all other respondents provided multiple examples of live work projects.	SHCS STT PNG SAM VAN	SOL	

9.	Do employers/enterprises engage APTC staff for training their own staff? Comments: This question was somewhat confused between scholarship and fee-for-service activity. Value cited of this training in the past 12 months was: SHCS – AUD 65,000 (approx.); PNG – AUD 290,000; SAM – AUD 1m in fee-for service income, mostly through government departments and using donor funding; SOL – AUD \$200,000; VAN – not specified.	SHCS PNG SAM SOL VAN	STT	
10	Do employers/enterprises sponsor awards or scholarships for your students? Comments: PNG – The question was somewhat confused with routine scholarships. SAM – A few awards and scholarships were sponsored by NZ Aid. VAN – There are instances of employers contributing to scholarships.	SAM PNG VAN	SHCS STT SOL	
11.	Does the APTC sponsor any industry awards for employers/ enterprises? Comments: SHCS – In-kind sponsorship only. VAN – In-kind sponsorship only at a total of 43 functions in the past 12 months.	SHCS PNG VAN	STT SAM SOL	
12.	Do employers/enterprises participate in selection of APTC staff at any level? Comments: The negative answer to this is a function of the way APTC operates with expatriate staff and the approach to tutor development.		SHCS STT PNG SAM SOL	VAN
13.	Are employers/enterprises involved in the assessment of students? Comments: PNG/VAN – Involvement in assessment is through employer feedback on student performance as recorded in work placement books or through employers working with trainers to design appropriate assessment tools.	PNG VAN	SAM SHCS STT SOL	
14.	Do employers/enterprises use TVET facilities e.g. for training, industry meetings, displays or conferences? Comments: In the past 12 months: SHCS – 20 events (approx.) in various facilities in Fiji; STT – limited numbers; PNG – Coral Seas use of APTC training restaurant; SAM – occasional hire of specialist facilities; VAN – occasional hire of facilities, if facilities are available.	SHCS STT PNG SAM VAN	SOL	
15.	Do employers/enterprises promote their products at APTC? Comments: SAM – At a regional level, products were displayed in refrigeration and air-conditioning, with employers attending from all over the Pacific. VAN – products in the hospitality industry have been displayed (beverages). In some instances, products in the Pacific may be dated and are therefore not actively promoted. Generally, there are relatively few enterprises with products to promote.	SAM VAN	SHCS STT PNG SOL	
16.	Do employers/enterprises participate in any events promoting the APTC? Comments: PNG – Graduations, PNG Business Council meetings, Port Moresby Chamber of Commerce and Industry, National Apprenticeship Trade Testing Board; SAM – Employers participate in recruitment droves for students and in graduations; VAN – See question 11.	PNG SAM VAN	SHCS STT SOL	

17.	Does APTC collaborate with or provide support to any other TVET providers when they are seeking to engage with employers/ enterprises? Comments: STT – collaboration with the Fiji National University at staff level and with Vivekananda Technical Centre. PNG – POMTECH Urban Youth Project, Lae Polytechnic Centre of Excellence SAM – collaboration with the National University of Samoa and other TVET providers SOL – collaboration with Don Bosco Technical Institute, Solomon Islands Association of Rural Training Centres, Solomon Islands National University and the Ministry of Education and Human Resource Development VAN – collaboration with Vanuatu Institute of Technology, Vanuatu Chamber of Commerce and Industry and the Vanuatu Rural Development Training Centre Association.	STT PNG SAM SOL VAN	SHCS	
18.	Do employers/enterprises contribute any actual or in-kind financial resources to the APTC other than scholarships or awards? Comments: SHCS – Informal support when requested, for example, loan of items. SAM – Limited support from the Samoan Water Authority.	SHCS SAM	STT PNG SOL	VAN
19.	Are there any other ways in which employers/enterprises are involved in the APTC? Comments: SHCS – APTC hosts functions which employers/enterprises attend. PNG – Donations of equipment. SAM – There is a general climate of support for APTC among employers. VAN – There are multiple examples of employers/enterprises being involved running workshops, delivering training, as guest speakers, as panel members at student presentations and the like	SHCS PNG SAM VAN	STT SOL	
20.	Are you or any of your staff a member of any employer associations in the Pacific? SHCS: Fiji Chefs Association; Fiji Hospitality and Tourism Association; Fiji Early Childhood Association (West and East); SKAL (Tourism) STT: Fiji Master Builders Association. The APTC also made attempts to support the establishment of an association in the Finishing Trades (e.g. P&D, W&FT) but these efforts came to nothing. PNG: Business Council of PNG (incorporates Manufacturers' Council, Chamber of Mines and Petroleum); Port Moresby Chamber of Commerce and Industry SAM: Samoa Hotels Association; Samoan Tourism Authority; Samoan Association of Manufacturers and Exporters; Plumbers Association of Samoa; Engineers Association SOL: Solomon Islands Chamber of Commerce & Industry VAN: Youth Livelihood Network; Youth Stakeholders Association; Disability Services Network; Youth Justice Forum; Pacific Institute of Public Policy Advisory Group; Vanuatu Hotels and Resorts Association; Vanuatu Tour Operators Association Port Vila Kindergarten Association	SHCS STT PNG SAM SOL VAN		

# 21. Do you have any other comments relevant to industry engagement at APTC?

STT: There are some real opportunities for the APTC to have S more direct involvement with industry. However, there are some V political sensitivities about realising these.

SAM: There is a role for the future APTC in capacity-building across industry and across TVET. APTC can provide up-skilling opportunities for industry for example in skill sets and 'just-in-time training.

SOL: Solomon Islands Campus is new, only 12 months old. The SI Campus focus during this time has been to upgrade the partner's facilities, establish a presence in SI and provide the first cohort of Certificate II graduates in the areas of Light Automotive and Construction to the industries to enable the graduates to complete their OJT (On Job Training) and provide a pathway to APTC Certificate III programs. During the establishment phase, there has been much ad-hoc industry engagement, both for the APTC SI Certificate II programs and for the whole of the APTC Scope of Services. As APTC gets firmly established in SI, industry becomes familiar with CBT delivery and the quality of the Certificate II graduates, it is envisaged that regular/formal industry engagement will happen and be a major part of the SI Campus operations.

VAN: Vanuatu Campus places great emphasis on the need to engage with industry. It is often challenging to get industry and employers together at the same time, however the nature of the work placement program enables substantial one-on-one engagement. Staff are regularly onsite discussing project goals, work outcomes, industry needs and training needs. These engagements provide real win-win outcomes for employers, students and APTC.

Codes: STT – School of Trades and Technology PNG – Papua New Guinea SOL – Solomon Islands SHCS – School of Hospitality and Community Services SAM – Samoa VAN – Vanuatu

STT SHCS SAM PNG

SOL VAN

# **ANNEX 6: TVET CAPACITY**

# To what extent has the APTC succeeded in building national and regional capacity for market-responsive skills development in the Pacific? To what extent is there discernible lasting benefit to skills development of APTC in the Pacific?

Overall, APTC has achieved success in building national and regional capacity for market-responsive skills development in the Pacific which is likely to have lasting benefits.

### Table of contents

1.	APTC capacity – What quantitative and qualitative capacity has APTC established	
	for skills development?82	2
1.1	What quantitative capacity has APTC established for skills development?	2
1.2	What qualitative capacity has APTC established for skills development?	3
1.3	What are the main challenges faced by staff and students?	3
1.4	To what extent has APTC effectively used different and flexible delivery methods? 89	)
1.5	To what extent has APTC established articulation pathways both to and from the APTC,	
	and to what extent are they being utilised and by whom?90	)
1.6	To what extent has APTC catered for country characteristics in its regional program?92	2
2	How closely attuned is APTC to industry and employers?	2
2.1	Organisationally, to what extent is industry is involved in APTC functions	3
2.2	What are the systems used by APTC to monitor and adjust to labour market trends?95	5
2.3	How many formal industry partnerships have been established?	7
2.4	How effective are APTC's school-to-work schemes?	3
2.5	To what extent does APTC provide direct services to industry?	)
3	How equitable is the provision of APTC services?	
4	To what extent have the governance and management arrangements facilitated	
11	Consortium arrangemente What is the impact of the three member consortium?	) 2
4.1	Advisory Group How does the membership and role of the Advisory Group	,
4.2	contribute to the impact of the APTC2	7
13	Organisational structure – How well does the organisational structure support the	
4.5	operational requirements of the APTC2	ג
_		,
<b>b</b>	What are the main constraints on and opportunities for further development of	
5	ABTO consistent of a development of	
<b>ј</b> Е 1	APTC capacity for skills development?	)
5.1	APTC capacity for skills development?	)
5.1 5.2	APTC capacity for skills development?	)
5.1 5.2 5.3	APTC capacity for skills development?	)   
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entropched enposition to develop partnerships       111	<b>)</b>   
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalization of trainers and other staff       112	)       
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113	
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113	<b>D</b>       2 <b>3</b>
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions,       114	
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113	
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional       114	
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       113	
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1 6.2	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       113         What impact has APTC provided an effect on higher quality standards?       114	
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1 6.2 6.3	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       113         To what extent has APTC provided an effect on higher quality standards?       116         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116	
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       113         To what extent has APTC provided an effect on higher quality standards?       114         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers,       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers,       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers,       116	
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       113         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116         To what extent has APTC conducted the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116	
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 Att	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       113         To what extent has APTC provided an effect on higher quality standards?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116	<b>)</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>2</b> <b>3</b> <b>3</b> <b>3</b> <b>3</b> <b>3</b> <b>3</b> <b>4</b> <b>4</b> <b>4</b> <b>5</b> <b>5</b> <b>5</b> <b>6</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b> <b>1</b>
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 Att. Att.	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       113         To what extent has APTC provided an effect on higher quality standards?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?	D         I <thi< th=""> <thi< th=""> <thi< th=""> <thi< th=""></thi<></thi<></thi<></thi<>
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 Att: Att:	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       113         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116         To what extent has APTC could an effect on higher quality standards?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       118	<b>)</b> 1 1 1 2 3 3 3 <b>)</b> <b>)</b> <b>)</b> <b>)</b>
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 Atta Atta 1.	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       113         To what extent has APTC had on education and training at partner institutions?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined	0       1       1       2       2       3       5       3       1       1       1       2       3       3       5       3       3       5       3       3       1
5.1 5.2 5.3 5.4 5.5 5.6 5.7 6 6.1 6.2 6.3 6.4 Atti 1. 2.	APTC capacity for skills development?       110         Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific.       110         The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications       111         The need to generate more of its own revenue       111         Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management       111         Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships       111         Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff       112         Attracting staff to work in less secure countries       113         What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?       113         To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector?       116         To what extent has APTC provided an effect on higher quality standards?       116         To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?       118         achment 1 to Annex 6: Overview of RTO Audit Schedules – Stage II.       116         achment 3 to Annex 6: APTC engagement with the Pacific TVET sector       122         APTC engagement with partner institutions in campus countries       124	D         1         1         2         3         3         5         3         1         1         1         2         3         5         3         3         1         1         1         2         3         3         5         3         3         1

## List of tables and figures

Figure 6.1: Student intake ratios by stage	
Table 6.1: Total APTC graduates to mid-2014	
Table 6.2: APTC student completion rates	
Table 6.3: Internet penetration rates in the Pacific	
Table 6.4: APTC informal industry relationships	94
Table 6.5: Cumulative entrants by citizenship and location	102
Table 6.6: Geographical index on student participation by nationality	102
Table 6.7: Scholarship awards as a percentage of applicants	103
Table 6.8: Key data for the Centre for Professional Development	115

# 1. APTC capacity – What quantitative and qualitative capacity has APTC established for skills development?

**Overview.** APTC has established strong capacity for skills development within a contained student cohort of existing workers and new industry entrants. Over Stages I and II (to date) there have been 6780 graduates with an impressive completion rate of 91 per cent. Trainers meet the required Australian standards and class sizes are consistent with Australian training package and occupational health and safety requirements. Although somewhat slow to get underway, the process of enabling national tutors to become tutors is now beginning to show results. Quality compliance audits are conducted regularly with trainers and tutors involved. There are multiple examples of flexible approaches to delivery and, considering the technological and financial constraints involved with e-learning and blended learning in the Pacific, satisfactory progress has occurred in this regard. Partnerships have facilitated the development of pathways to and from APTC qualifications.

# 1.1 What quantitative capacity has APTC established for skills development? Effectiveness of recruitment practices; enrolment; teaching staff; outputs achieved<sup>16</sup>

The APTC targets a niche market of existing workers (with industrial experience) and new industry entrants (who meet the basic requirements for entry into the course but have little to no practical experience). The resulting student cohort consists mostly of mature-aged persons (93 per cent are 25 years and over) with clear employment history and goals. This group was specifically targeted to avoid competition with local institutions that cater for school leavers. Fundamentally, the nature of APTC operations is such that, from a quantitative perspective, there are limitations in the capacity for skills development. This is the result of the nature of the student cohort and the basis on which delivery currently is funded. APTC has established strong capacity for middlelevel skills development within the confines of its target group.

APTC is offering training in five campus countries and to students from a further nine countries. Students are predominantly those who have received scholarships. Only persons classified as existing workers and new industry entrants are eligible to receive scholarships. The resulting student cohort is contained and specifically designed to avoid competition with local institutions that cater for school leavers. Within this context, the following analysis leads to the conclusion that while recruitment and enrolment practices appear sound, the number of graduates is low for the investment involved.

**Recruitment practices and enrolment.** To date, APTC has received over 21,000 applications for admission, 12,800 (61 per cent) of whom were eligible after testing for vocational skills and knowledge (VSK) and language, literacy and numeracy (LLN).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> This section should be read in conjunction with Annex 4 which provides comprehensive quantitative information relevant to APTC's capacity, only some aspects of which are in this section.

These tests are applied to ensure applicants can cope with course content and reflect only the level of prior skills and experience of applicants. About 40 per cent of applicants were female, with 58 per cent of females being eligible after testing. About 50 per cent (8161) of all those who applied for a scholarship (16,263) were successful. Of the applicants for scholarships, 43 per cent (6965) were female; of these, 48 per cent were successful. (Annex 4, Table 3.1.1). No significant differences exist between males and females in the impact of VSK and LLN testing, success in scholarship application or scholarship uptake.

Figure 6.1 shows the results of the various filtering stages, including variations between Stages I and II.



# Figure 6.1: Student intake ratios by stage

Attachment 2 presents a more detailed discussion of scholarships along with some potential future options.

With respect to enrolments, the following trends are noteworthy:

- in actual numbers, the most significant enrolments are in the campus countries with Fiji being the largest (APTC Statistical Annex Figure 4.1.1)
- small numbers in other countries may represent a high percentage in terms of the percentage of population (APTC Statistical Annex Figure 4.1.2)
- the ratio of enrolment to population for PNG is third lowest out of all 14 countries and, at less than one per cent, below the average although it has by far the largest population. (APTC Statistical Annex Figure 4.1.2)

Enrolments are further analysed in later sections.

**Teaching staff.** In Stage I APTC relied almost entirely on expatriate trainers, with the appointment of national staff as tutors only commencing in 2009. Even so, the number of national tutors was not significant until 2012. In Stage II, a Nationalisation Strategy<sup>17</sup> has been developed which provides a process for national tutors to become fully qualified as APTC trainers in accordance with Australian standards. The strategy is aimed at reduced reliance on expatriate trainers, improved cost-effectiveness,

Source: APTC Statistical Annex Figure 3.1.1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> APTC Nationalisation Strategy, version 7

maintenance of quality and sustainability of the program over time. The national tutor development program is a four-stage process which takes some time to achieve, just as it would take time to become a fully qualified trainer in Australia. The strategy proposed one national trainer for every six expatriate trainers by the end of 2014.

Implementation of the strategy and, therefore, the conversion of tutors to trainers was initially delayed. As at May 2014, there were 41 expatriate trainers and two national trainers<sup>18</sup>. However, the Briefing Note on the National Tutor Training Program dated 3 July 2014 states that, by the end of June 2014, 10 national trainers had been appointed. More recently it has been reported that 12 national tutors will be converted to trainers by the end of 2014 – about one quarter of the total. Overall it can be asserted that, even taking into account the time for a national tutor to qualify as a trainer, the process has been slow.

Graduates. The number of graduates to mid-2014 is outlined by school in Table 6.1.

School	Total Stage I	Total Stage II to date	Total to date
School of Hospitality and Community Services (SHCS)	2011	2012	4023
School of Trades and Technology (STT)	1520	1237	2757
TOTAL	3531	3249	6780

## Table 6.1: Total APTC graduates to mid-2014

Source: APTC Statistical Annex Figure 5.1.1 Note: number of graduates calculated as 30/06/14 and included some anticipated results for students in Semester 1 2014 as total results for both schools were not complete at the time.

This number of graduates can be seen as low given the total investment in APTC over Stage I (AUD149.5 million) and Stage II (AUD152 million).

There is limited capacity for students to fund their own training or for employers to support them financially. The reliance on scholarships did not reduce between Stages I and II as might be expected. Across Stage II, 76 per cent of students were on scholarship compared with 74 per cent in Stage I. Only 13 per cent were funded by employers in Stage II, compared with 20.4 per cent in Stage I. (Annex 4, Table 3.3.1)

**Class sizes.** Maximising class sizes is a common way to improve cost-effectiveness. However, class sizes may be constrained by training package requirements and, in the APTC context, can be a result of funding available for scholarships or success in feefor-service activity. The average class sizes to date range from 13 to 21 students with 17 in SCHS and 14 in STT (APTC Statistical Profile, Figure 6.3.1). From consistent observation during the field visits, class sizes are broadly in line with training package and workplace health and safety guidelines.

*Completions.* While the number of graduates is relatively small, completion rates are high as shown in Table 6.2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Source: APTC HR Report to the Consortium Board, May 2014

## Table 6.2: APTC student completion rates

School	Total to date	Completion rates
School of Hospitality and Community Services	3665	92%
School of Trades and Technology	2546	89%
TOTAL	6211	91%

Source: APTC Statistical Profile, Table 5.2.1a

Quantifiable factors that might contribute to high completion rates are as follows:

- VSK and LLN screening of applicants as noted above
- age of entrants because the student cohort consists of existing workers and new industry entrants, students are mature-aged, have work experience and have made an employment choice. The largest age groups of graduates to date are 25–29 years (22 per cent), 30–34 years (21 per cent), 35–39 years (17 per cent) and 40–44 years (13 per cent). Thus 73 per cent of students are between the ages of 25 and 44 years. (Annex 4, Table 5.2.1a)
- scholarship uptake scholarships are highly prized as evidenced by the fact that 81 per cent of scholarships awarded across Stage I and Stage II to date were taken up
- waitlists are significant, with 979 applicants, equivalent to 51 per cent of the current enrolment, awaiting a place (APTC Statistical Profile 3.2.1). This is likely to act as an incentive to value and complete the course/qualification.

APTC management is keen to move away from the image of being a 'scholarship college' and to encourage both co-contribution to the costs of training and a full feepaying clientele. Increased fee-for-service income can come from full payment for or negotiated co-contribution to the tuition fees for complete qualifications or full payment for or co-contribution to the cost of any other program or service either offered by APTC or requested by an enterprise/stakeholder. Options to maximise fee-for-service income, to increase throughput in APTC facilities, and to reduce costs are yet to be fully explored. They include expanded offerings of targeted training such as skill sets and short courses, the introduction of some higher level qualifications, greater utilisation of Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) and working with industry to identify areas of unmet demand. A strong reliance on Australian trainers to undertake the bulk of the training to date is another factor in the relatively high cost of APTC.

Corporate/administrative staff costs are relatively high due to complex employment arrangements, relatively high numbers of Australian staff (49 per cent) and the costs of operating in a multi-country/multi-campus context. As at June 2014, the ratio of teaching to corporate/ administrative staff was 52:48 (Statistical Annex Table 6.4.1). This compares with a 2011 Australian Government Productivity Commission report which found that across Australia the proportion of general/administrative staff to total TAFE staff was 36 per cent.<sup>19</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Australian Government Productivity Commission. (2011). Vocational education and training workforce, p. 347. The report cited the proportion in non-TAFE VET providers as 48 per cent.

### 1.2 What qualitative capacity has APTC established for skills development? Quality assurance practices; completion rates (see above) qualifications standards achieved; whether Australian qualifications standards are actually met given constraints on workplace training

From a quality perspective, APTC has performed well in skills development. This is evidenced by the various approaches to quality assurance outlined below. APTC is not a Registered Training Organisation (RTO) in its own right under the Australian Skills Quality Authority (ASQA). The lead RTOs, Box Hill Institute and TAFE Queensland East Coast, are responsible for ongoing compliance with the Australian standards. In ensuring compliance, they require the full cooperation of APTC staff. APTC staff maintain quality requirements and are involved in compliance audits.

**Standards for trainers and tutors.** Trainers and tutors are required to meet Standard 15.4 of the Australian Standards for NVR Registered Training Organisations<sup>20</sup> in order to deliver training, and tutors must fully meet this standard before converting to trainers. For tutors, this often involves upgrading both vocational and professional (Certificate IV in Training and Assessment (TAE40110)) qualifications, which takes time.<sup>21</sup> In addition, APTC encourages trainers to complete the Diploma of Vocational Education and Training (TAE50111) (one qualification level higher than the required standard) and makes this available online.

According to the surveys of trainers and tutors conducted by the evaluation team, all trainers responding had the Certificate IV in TAE and all tutors responding either had or were undertaking the Certificate IV in TAE, except for one 'no response'. (Annex 5 – Staff).

*Meeting training package requirements.* Considerable investment has been made to ensure that the facilities and equipment used for training meet the training package requirements for the qualification levels offered. These facilities were sighted during the field visits. Where the facilities standards cannot be met, the program is not offered. For example, as a result of changes to the training package requirements for the Diploma of Early Childhood Education and Care, delivery of this program (formerly the Diploma of Children's Services) will cease.

**Stakeholder feedback.** There was constant and consistent feedback during the field visits that the quality offered by APTC was highly regarded. This feedback came from students, graduates, partner institutions, government agencies and employers alike. Comparisons were often made with local institutions with the view expressed that APTC substantially surpassed the quality offered locally. The quality of delivery is also likely to be a factor in the high completion rates referred to above.

There were mixed views as to why APTC delivers such high quality. Some suggested that it was because APTC was far better resourced than local providers. Others took the view that the Australian qualification standards were more rigorous and more stringently adhered to. If student satisfaction can be regarded as an indicator of quality, it is noted that students are very satisfied with APTC. According to the student survey

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Standard 15.4 of the Australian Standards for NVR Registered Training Organisations 2012 states that: Training and assessment is delivered by trainers and assessors who:

<sup>(</sup>a) have the necessary training and assessment competencies as determined by the National Skills Standards Council or its successors (Certificate IV in Training and Education); and

<sup>(</sup>b) have the relevant vocational competencies at least to the level being delivered or assessed; and

<sup>(</sup>c) can demonstrate current industry skills directly relevant to the training/assessment being undertaken; and

 <sup>(</sup>d) continue to develop their vocational education and training (VET) knowledge and skills as well as their industry currency and trainer/assessor competence.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Australian researcher John Mitchell identifies 16 core skills for the new VET practitioner and 14 for the advanced VET practitioner (Mitchell, J. (2009). Advanced VET practitioners. John Mitchell and Associates, NSW Australia)

conducted by the evaluation team, 70 per cent of students were very satisfied and 23 per cent were satisfied. (Annex 5 – Students).

**Auditing for quality compliance.** In accordance with Australian standards, programs are audited on a regular basis. With two RTOs being responsible for program delivery, there are two approaches to quality assurance and auditing. Audits, either full or partial, are conducted by a senior Australian representative of the RTO concerned. Attachment 1 provides an overview of the Stage II audit schedules for each RTO. This shows that by the end of August 2014, Box Hill Institute had conducted 19 audits and TAFE Queensland East Coast had conducted 20 audits. Surveys of trainers and tutors showed that 77 per cent of responding trainers and 56 per cent of responding tutors had experienced an audit. With respect to tutors, it is important to bear in mind that 89 per cent of them had been with APTC for two years or less. (Annex 5 – Staff)

While it is not within the scope of this evaluation to conduct audits, a commentary on the results of a recent audit report of the Certificate IV in Training and Assessment in one country gives a snapshot of the situation. Of the 31 standards/requirements applicable, APTC was compliant with 27. The non-compliant areas related to: teacher vocational competence mapping; appropriate documentation of individual staff development plans to maintain vocational and professional currency; and the completion of a moderation and validation schedule. The 20-page audit report required rectification of these non-compliances within 10 working days.<sup>22</sup>

The Australian Quality Standards Agency (ASQA) has indicated that it intends to conduct audits off-shore for the first time in 2015. By conducting regular audits, APTC is preparing for this eventuality. Failure to comply with audit requirements constitutes both serious reputational risk and risk of de-registration.

**Qualification standards achieved.** The Scope of Services requires APTC to deliver training at Certificate level III and above. This is generally the case except where APTC is involved in joint delivery at Certificate level II as a means to up-skill teachers and to provide a pathway for students to Certificate level III, for example at Don Bosco Technical Institute (DBTI) in the Solomon Islands and Vivekananda Technical Centre (VTC) in Fiji.

Although there are some challenges with workplace training, it is frequently built into the program design and therefore supported by APTC. Existing workers often have an automatic opportunity for work placement, while new industry entrants are more likely to need APTC support. There was little reference to the difficulties in finding work placement in the consultations or in the student surveys.

**Exposure to Australian standards.** Exposure of tutors and students to workplaces that are equivalent to those in Australia is an area of some contention. This is related to debate as to whether Australian experience is essential in order to maintain compliance and whether local workplaces are of sufficient standard to ensure relevant current experience in the industry. APTC commissioned expert advice on how to resolve this debate.<sup>23</sup> It states that the standards do not require experience across the whole industry, but that which is relevant to the qualification and that there is no explicit requirement that the current experience is specific to Australia. It also includes a range of suggested strategies for professional development that do not necessarily entail travel to Australia. Overall, it does not accept that industry experience in Australia is essential.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> APTC Audit Report: TAE40110 Certificate IV in Training and Assessment, Samoa, 12/08/14

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> For example, the APTC contracted an expert consultant to review the Nationalisation Strategy: Bateman, A. (2014). Review of the nationalisation strategy: report to APTC

Nonetheless many national tutors and trainers are keen to gain experience in Australia as part of their professional development. According to the survey results and as confirmed by the consultations, tutors in particular saw lack of access to Australian experience as a major setback. It was also identified as an important means to improve the quality of delivery at APTC (Annex 5 – Staff). The evaluation team was advised that to date, one month is the longest time any national has spent in Australia. In the last two years, nine national trainers/tutors have gone to Australia from the School of Trades and Technology (STT) and one national trainer from the School of Hospitality and Community Services (SHCS). This compares with nine expatriate trainers from STT and two from SHCS. A recent example consisted of a total of nine days: three at an industry conference, three in the host institute and three visiting workplaces. Cost considerations are no doubt an element in the length of these visits. One of the challenges is to identify opportunities for placement that do not require travel to Australia. International companies operating in the Pacific are a possible option.

An interesting initiative has been the quality coaching program in Vanuatu, designed to assist the Vanuatu Institute of Technology in the introduction of quality policies and processes and the minimising of non-compliances. This was so successful that it was picked up by the Vanuatu TVET Sector Strengthening Project and will be used with rural training providers.

#### 1.3 What are the main challenges faced by staff and students?

Stakeholder surveys of staff and students show that they face considerable challenges.

Trainers and tutors commented that they face many of the same issues, particularly dealing with students who have insufficient language, literacy and numeracy (LLN) skills, with students from different cultural backgrounds and with students' different leaning styles. Both are concerned about time frames for courses and the limitations of space and resources and both would like more Pacific-context learning resources.

Both trainers and tutors considered that dealing with cultural diversity is an issue for students, which may well mean dealing with Australian, as well as different Pacific, cultures. Financial concerns, living conditions, lack of social activities and homesickness were also identified as challenges. (Annex 5 – Staff)

This is consistent with what the students said themselves. Major difficulties they identified were those related to study, such as access to and use of computers and problems with English, as well as insufficient time to complete the course and financial matters. These issues accounted for half of the issues listed by students.

Most students are full-time (83 per cent). Only just over one-in-three are in paid work while a student. Of those students in paid work before APTC, 60 per cent are not in paid work while a student. This suggests that most employers have stopped paying their employees while they are students and accounts for the financial difficulties many of them face. (Annex 5 – Students)

Trainers and tutors are united in their views on the ways students' issues can be addressed with more LLN support, provision of more study and social support and the extension of time frames for the course ranking in the three most mentioned suggestions for both groups. The provision of follow-up workshops for graduates, as well as pathways or access to higher level qualifications, were seen as ways to improve graduate outcomes.

These challenges illustrate the reality and complexity of the student target group and the environment in which APTC operates; they are likely to continue, despite concerted efforts by APTC through a range of support services to students discussed elsewhere in this report.

# 1.4 To what extent has APTC effectively used different and flexible delivery methods in different parts of the Pacific, including distance learning, blended approaches and outreach?

Given the significant educational, technological and financial constraints that exist in this regard, APTC has only been able to make limited progress in implementing e-learning and blended learning but has otherwise implemented flexible and outreach delivery methods.

*E-learning/ Blended learning/ Distance learning.* In the TVET/applied learning environment, where practical skills are to be assessed and training package requirements are to be met, there are limits to the extent to which distance and e-learning approaches can be used. Although there is scope for the theoretical component of the course to be delivered online, practical, hands-on skills need the appropriate industry/workplace setting or its simulated version.

Implementation of e-learning is further constrained by the nature and age of the APTC student cohort – existing workers or new entrants. They often have limited prior educational experience or have been away from formal training for some time and they typically have limited access to technology unless at an APTC campus.

A recent study provided details of internet penetration rates in the Pacific. See Table 6.3 below.

Country	% population accessing the internet	Country	% population accessing the internet
Cook Islands	Not available	Palau	6
Fiji	28	Papua New Guinea	2
Federated States of Micronesia	20	Samoa	7
Kiribati	10	Solomon Islands	6
Marshall Islands	3.5	Tonga	12
Nauru	6	Tuvalu	40
Niue	83	Vanuatu	8

## Table 6.3: Internet penetration rates in the Pacific

Source: Pacific Media Assistance Scheme, 2013, Regional State of Media and Communication Report http://www.pacmas.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/PACMAS-REGIONAL-REPORT\_FINAL.pdf

The variation in these rates means that over-reliance on e-learning is problematic. The penetration rates are also subject to rapid change. The evaluation team was advised that the submarine optical fibre cable connecting Vanuatu with Suva, Fiji had resulted in dramatic changes in internet speed. However, this does not necessarily mean that students have access in their homes. Where there is good coverage, there also needs to be reliable end-user support and media usage is still quite expensive.

APTC has offered blended/online delivery in qualifications that are not equipmentintensive, but at this stage they appear to be limited to the Diploma of VET (for tutors) and Certificate IV in Business (for administrative staff). A program of introducing tablets into classrooms has also commenced, with approximately 100 in use at present. These are provided in sets of 20 to 24 and currently include one set for the Centre for Professional Development for fee-for-service training, one set for Early Childhood Education and Care in Fiji and one set each for Samoa and Vanuatu. Initial trials are proving positive and staff are beginning to develop their own materials online and to access off-the-shelf products, such as Futura e-learning resources in hospitality. However, there are no further funds available for purchase of additional tablets at this stage.

*Flexible delivery and outreach.* Apart from the electronic media, APTC has demonstrated a proactive approach to showcasing different and adaptable forms of training delivery as can be highlighted by the following examples.

- APTC partnered with the Samoa Adventist Disaster Relief Agency (ADRA) and the local community to build new cyclone resistant traditional shelters (fale) for 200 of the most severely affected families in Samoan villages following the devastation caused by Cyclone Evan in December 2012. The project involved the training of 15 young men and women from the devastated areas in a Certificate III in Carpentry. The APTC received a 2013 Pacific Human Rights Award for this work.
- The Fiji Community Development Program identified relevant units from the Certificate IV in Community Development for practising community development workers. It was designed for students from all over the country, many from remote communities where they typically have no access to training at all and where there is little to no coordination of community development projects between villages. This DFAT-funded program was designed to both train workers in the field and to strengthen the organisations for which they work or volunteer. Students have a potential pathway to complete the qualification at APTC.
- In Vanuatu, where APTC facilities are limited, hospitality training involves some use of the training restaurant owned by Vanuatu Institute of Technology but much of the training occurs in the workplace and very little in classrooms.

# 1.5 To what extent has APTC established articulation pathways both to and from the APTC, and to what extent are they being utilised and by whom?

APTC has made considerable progress in creating articulation pathways through partner institutions in the campus countries as well as in some non-campus countries. These include both pathways within the Australian Qualifications Framework and pathways to and from local qualification frameworks and Australian qualifications.

*Partnerships and pathways.* The following partnerships are in place in the campus countries.

University of South Pacific (Fiji – Regional)		
Vivekananda Technical College (Fiji)		
Port Moresby Technical College		
National University of Samoa		
Don Bosco Technical College		
Vanuatu Institute of Technology		

Three additional agreements are in place in non-campus countries.

- Kiribati: Kiribati Institute of Technology
- Palau: Palau Community College
- Tonga: Ahpanilolo Training Institute (Tonga).<sup>24</sup>

These partnerships are outlined in detail in Attachment 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> In the other non-campus countries namely the Cook Islands, Federated States of Micronesia (FSM), Republic of the Marshall Islands (RMI), Nauru, Niue and Tuvalu, the partnership arrangements focus on scholarship provision.

Examples of articulation pathways built into these agreements include the following.

- The agreement with Vivekananda Technical Centre in **Fiji** involves mapping of the local qualification with the Australian qualification. Joint delivery of the Certificate II Hospitality and Certificate II in Automotive enables students to progress to Certificate level III at APTC.
- The agreement with the University of the South Pacific (USP) in **Fiji** incorporates the option of 'dual badging'<sup>25</sup> (USP and APTC) qualifications.
- In Samoa, the National University of Samoa (NUS) offers local Certificate level I and II qualifications. There is a pathway to Certificate level III at APTC.
- Australian qualifications are offered at Kiribati Institute of Technology (KIT) in Kiribati. The agreement between KIT and APTC gives KIT students a pathway to Certificate level III at APTC. Two groups representing 31 young i-Kiribati have now completed this pathway.
- Joint delivery arrangements in the **Solomon Islands** offer pathways for both tutors and students.

There is also potential for pathways to be established from skill sets or units of competency to full qualifications. The Fiji Community Development Program is a case in point, as is the skill set identified for administrative staff from the Certificate IV in Business. Pathways from APTC exist where local universities have subsequent qualifications, usually at Diploma level, or to Australian institutions.

Instances of students taking advantage of pathways within APTC are likely to depend on being awarded a second scholarship, or a first scholarship if the initial training consisted of selected units of competency. The current Scholarship Policy states that a student may receive consecutive scholarships provided they meet certain conditions, including evidence of employer and trainer support and completion of at least one year's employment in the relevant occupation.<sup>26</sup>

**National and Australian qualification pathways.** Despite the many examples that exist of articulation pathways, APTC faces challenges and sensitivities in this area. While many countries are using well-established international qualifications frameworks, including the Australian Qualifications Framework and the associated training packages as a basis for their own, there is sometimes an assumption that the qualifications are automatically equivalent, but that is not necessarily the case. What exists on paper may not be translated into practice and a promise of pathways might be misleading. A Pacific expert working in the field and consulted during the field visits described this phenomenon as 'academic drift and qualifications inflation' and went on to elaborate that it can even be dangerous if lower level qualifications are removed and qualification 'stepping stones' are no longer in place for students. At the same time, APTC can be accused of academic elitism if it challenges qualification parity.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> 'Dual badging' refers to the issuing of certificates/testamurs with two institution logos and/or common seals – in this case both the APTC and USP. It can only occur when the two institutions concerned agree to the equivalence of the qualification.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> APTC. (2014). Scholarship Policy. (draft – uncontrolled document), p. 6

It is therefore important that APTC staff take every available opportunity to participate in the process of developing qualifications at system level in the relevant countries to facilitate pathways for students between the two qualification systems. To date this has occurred in ways such as:

- assisting with the development of qualifications frameworks
- mapping local and Australian qualifications
- participating in industry sector advisory bodies developing standards
- providing updates on industry trends and training package developments in Australia. (Attachment 3)

As national qualifications frameworks are finalised and quality assurance practices are implemented, this issue may prove to be less problematic, but the process is proving to be slow. In addition, the concept of a Pacific Qualifications Framework (PQF) has had the support of the Pacific Island countries and territories at Ministerial level for over a decade and the South Pacific Board for Educational Assessment (SPBEA) has had this role since 2009. However, although it is sometimes used as a reference point, the prospect of a PQF replacing national systems appears doubtful for the time being. The evaluation team was advised that individual countries value national sovereignty in this regard.<sup>27</sup>

# 1.6 To what extent has APTC catered for country characteristics in its regional program?

The APTC is a regional program and establishing it on a regional basis was understandably a high priority in Stages I and II. However, as the APTC matures, the distinctive nature of each country is becoming more marked. This is based on the defining characteristics of each country's economy and industries, local TVET sector, government, culture and the training resources available as part of the APTC investment. It is also influenced by the length of time of an Australian presence, both before and following the establishment of APTC.

The distinctiveness is evident in the partnerships described in Attachment 3, as well as the relationships with industry described in the Questionnaire Results Annex – Industry Engagement. As a result, the need for a greater focus on country-specific planning was evident. This would entail individual strategic plans for the development of each country campus, based on its unique characteristics and potential and containing clear performance targets appropriate for the country campus concerned. Further, empowering each country campus, through greater levels of delegation to Country Managers is as an important next step in the evolution of APTC.

# 2 How closely attuned is APTC to industry and employers?

**Overview.** Little scope exists for industry to be involved in the governance of APTC, but – mirroring the industry engagement practices of TVET institutions in Australia – extensive involvement with enterprises exists at the level of program delivery. Only a limited number of formal partnerships with enterprises/industries are in place but APTC has hundreds of informal partnerships across at least 10 countries.

There are weaknesses in APTC's approaches to monitoring and adjusting to labour market trends. A more rigorous approach is needed. Inconsistency in the effectiveness in the APTC-to-Work program has prompted a review. Greater involvement in providing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Some countries, such as Fiji, have little interest in Pacific qualifications and intend to align instead with those of an advanced country, such as New Zealand.

direct services to industry is limited by the capacity and/or willingness of enterprises to pay.

# 2.1 Organisationally, to what extent is industry is involved in APTC functions, e.g. governance, technical advice, provision of workplaces, financing

The only way in which industry could play a role in governance of the APTC is through membership of the Advisory Group, but with the exception of the two places made available for Australian industry representatives on the group, there is no requirement for the other members to come from industry. Of the eight countries represented on the Advisory Group at present, only three representatives are from the private sector, four are from government departments/agencies and one is from another educational institution.

However, APTC has initiated industry engagement in many other aspects of its functions, particularly those related to program delivery.

The fact that the primary APTC student cohorts are existing workers and new industry entrants means that engagement with industry is integral to program delivery, with work placement built in to program design. The issue poses some barriers in the Pacific where engagement by educational institutions with industry and enterprises has not been practised as a matter of course in the past and expectations from industry in this regard are therefore not high. APTC is to some extent forging new ground. In the Pacific, governments are major employers and also need to be considered as part of the industry engagement process.

Between June and August 2014, a questionnaire on industry engagement was completed by the then two Country Managers for Fiji (with joint responsibility as School Directors) and the Country Managers of Papua New Guinea, Samoa, Solomon Islands and Vanuatu. The results are contained in the Annex 5 – Industry Engagement. There were 21 questions relating to the diverse forms of industry engagement practised by a typical TVET provider in Australia. These forms of industry engagement assume a demand-driven, industry-led TVET system like Australia and so test the progress APTC has made in this regard. The results showed variations between countries, particularly the Solomon Islands where the partnership is relatively new, but still a strong level of overall engagement.

Salient features from the results of the questionnaire are as follows.

- Of the 21 forms of industry engagement listed, only one was not applicable to APTC, namely employer/industry involvement in the selection of staff. This may change as more national staff are employed.
- In all countries, employers provide work placement and in all but the Solomon Islands which is a fairly new campus country, they provide live work projects for students.
- Employers have supported work placement for APTC tutors in three countries and for trainers in one.
- In two countries, employers/enterprises have been involved in the assessment of students, mostly through verification of practical skills in workplace log-books.
- There is extensive use of APTC facilities by industry for training, meetings and other events.
- APTC staff are involved in industry associations where they exist: Fiji (5), PNG (2), Samoa (5) Solomon Islands (1) and Vanuatu (8).

However, to date there are still only limited examples of industry contributing to the cost of training, with in-house or outsourced training for employees likely being beyond the financial capacity of many smaller companies.

Recent work by APTC with the fashion industry to design a training qualification exemplifies APTC's willingness to meet the demands of industry.

APTC provided a list of companies and organisations with which it has informal partnerships. That is to say, there is no Memorandum of Understanding or other written agreement, but there is ongoing contact. These partnerships may not be in depth, but they represent a genuine association arising from sponsorship of employees to attend APTC, taking students on work placement, site visits, guest speakers and the like.

Country	No. of informal industry relationships	Country	No. of informal industry relationships
Fiji	128	Samoa	110
Kiribati	20	Solomon Islands	74
Nauru	3	Tonga	17
Niue	1	Tuvalu	10
PNG	32	Vanuatu	49

## Table 6.4: APTC informal industry relationships

Source: APTC Industry Partnerships List 16.07.14

# 2.2 What are the systems used by APTC to monitor and adjust to labour market trends, and how effective are they, including the Labour Market Analysis Action Plan?

There are weaknesses and inconsistencies in APTC's approaches to monitoring and adjusting to labour market trends through the Labour Market Analysis process and weaknesses in the APTC Environmental Scan.<sup>28</sup>

The Stage II Design Document required APTC's Annual Training Profile to provide 'a rationale for the proposed courses and explanation of the expected outputs and development benefits'. The Annual Training Profile was to include, among other things, a description of the 'evidence of sufficient industry demand'.<sup>29</sup>

The APTC's 2012–13 Annual Report describes the information and evidence used to compile its demand-driven training profile. Missing from this evidence is information from the APTC tracer surveys of graduates about the employment outcomes for specific qualifications and other information on skill shortages in the Pacific, such as the occupations of foreign workers and census data on the extent of post-school qualifications of job-holders in relevant occupations.

The 2011 Annual Report noted that the same training programs offered in the School of Trades and Technology, as specified in the Second Stage Request for Tender, continued to be offered. With few exceptions, the same training programs continued in 2013–14 and are proposed for 2014–15. The delivery of the Certificate III in Automotive Mechanical Technology was stopped in Samoa, initially justified as an efficiency measure: delivering the program from one site rather than two. However, after protests from the Government of Samoa, this decision was justified by a survey of the skill needs of automotive repairers.

In contrast, the training programs in the School of Hospitality and Community Services have changed over time, with additional programs and programs offered at higher levels. However, no evidence of 'sufficient industry demand' is presented to justify the introduction of these certificates. In Hospitality, a number of new certificates were also added in 2012. The only evidence of sufficient industry demand is piecemeal, based on requests from two employers in two countries.<sup>30</sup>

New courses in Community Services were commenced in Semester 1, 2013. In the most recent Annual Report, however, these courses have been halted, with the reason given that 'demand for this qualification has peaked'. No other evidence is presented so it is not clear whether this refers to the social demand (from applicants to APTC) or to industry demand.

No training programs were cancelled in the 2013–14 training profile but eight programs were withdrawn from the 2014–2015 training profile. Only one of the programs not delivered listed a reason for withdrawal related to employment outcomes.<sup>31</sup>

Feasibility studies have been commissioned by APTC into setting up a campus in Solomon Islands, a school of tourism and hospitality in Palau and a scoping report on the training needs of Fiji's Textiles Clothing and Footwear (TCF) industry and its

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> APTC Environmental Scan 2014

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> APTC Stage II: 2011–2015, Design Document, 25 November 2010, p. 11

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> The APTC Annual Report for 2011, p. 51 noted: 'Harmonisation with the AusAID Vanuatu TVET Sector Strengthening Program which is currently supporting the development of island bungalows and tour guiding in Malekula and Santo will generate demand for places in APTC hospitality and tourism courses. In Fiji an additional commercial cookery program was added S2/2011 due to demand from an industry client at Port Denarau.'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> The Diploma in Children's Services may also have been withdrawn because the requirements for facilities identified in the training package could not be met.

emerging fashion sector. However, none of these reports makes use of systematic evidence of economic demand such as census data on occupations.

APTC Advisory Group members have requested the results of employment tracer studies and suggested work permit approvals as a good single source of labour market information. Other suggestions were to 'map where existing information is currently located: focus to be first in-country, national, regional and then international' and quarterly analysis of labour market data to show when courses should be put on hold and what courses continue to be relevant. However, available minutes for Advisory Group meetings in Port Moresby (2013) and Port Vila (2014) show no evidence that systematic labour market information was presented at the meetings or discussed as an issue.

**APTC Environmental Scan (eScan) 2014**. The APTC eScan developed in 2013 and early 2014 provides a base for: 'detecting economic, social and political trends and events important to APTC; defining the threats, opportunities or changes for APTC implied by the trends and events; and promotes forward thinking and highlights areas for action'.<sup>32</sup>

There are some weaknesses in the eScan as outlined below.

- It does not present a statistical profile on any country from a census or a large national survey of employment by relevant occupations and highest level of completed education.
- There is no information about skill shortages in any Pacific country or New Zealand.
- Opportunities to develop a simple measure of occupations in-demand have been missed, for example by collecting data on job vacancies over time from job advertisements in newspapers, on the radio and in a government gazette to produce a job opportunity index or use of information from work permits about the occupations of foreign workers.
- In the case of Australia, the eScan refers to the existence of Skilled Occupation List (SOL) but not to the more relevant Consolidated Sponsored Occupation List (CSOL),<sup>33</sup> a much more extensive list which focuses on current employer demand for skills.
- It does not refer to the form of skilled migrant entry to Australia most likely to appeal to APTC graduates – the Temporary Work (Skilled) visa (subclass 457),<sup>34</sup> which permits a skilled worker to work in their nominated occupation for an approved employer for up to four years.

APTC documents lack an understanding about occupations and the qualification level required to be eligible for skilled migrant entry to Australia as is evident in the information provided on the APTC website about the launch of a pilot training program in the Certificate III in Aged Care in Tonga.<sup>35</sup> The news story notes that: 'The pilot program in Tonga is an example of a targeted approach to supporting labour mobility of Pacific Islanders who graduate from APTC'. However, the story does not mention that the eligible qualification to gain entry to Australia to work as a residential care worker is a Diploma.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> APTC, 2014, Summary of Labour Market Analysis Processes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> APTC Environmental Scan 2014, pp. 30–33

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> http://www.immi.gov.au/Visas/Pages/457.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> See 'APTC launches pilot program in Aged Care' http://www.aptc.edu.au/index.php/april-2012/407-aptc-launchespilot-program-in-aged-care

Addressing the issues outlined above requires resources and expertise that may not be currently available. APTC should be appropriately resourced to undertake proper labour market analysis as a basis for determining and adjusting its training plan.

# 2.3 How many formal industry partnerships have been established and how effective are they?

The establishment of formal industry partnerships has been limited to date.

These partnerships fall within the ambit of the APTC Commercialisation Strategy, ideally classified as Sector 1 covering large enterprises and multinationals, but can also be Sector 2 for small to medium enterprises (APTC Commercialisation Strategy, p. 2). They contribute to the achievement of one of the targets set as part of the Stage II contract, namely AUD500,000 profit on fee-for service activity.

As the Commercialisation Strategy did not become operational until February 2013, it is not surprising that the AUD280,000 achievement by August 2014 was behind target. Recent developments<sup>36</sup> give some cause for optimism that the target could be reached.

As at July 2014, the APTC Partnerships List<sup>37</sup> cites eight active formal industry partnerships operating under Memoranda of Agreement: two in PNG and one in each of the Solomon Islands, Vanuatu, Marshall Islands, Tonga, Samoa and Fiji. A ninth partnership is under negotiation in Fiji. On closer inspection, two of the eight are with educational institutions and two with Education Ministries.

The Tanoa Group of Hotels is an example of an early formal partnership.

#### Tanoa Group of Hotels, Fiji

Following a series of negotiations, a Memorandum of Agreement was signed with the Tanoa Group of Hotels in 2009. It lasted for five and a half years and covered two distinct areas – development of a work-based training model for APTC and the provision of student accommodation. Ultimately, the work-based training model did not meet APTC's expectations on a range of criteria related to delivery of the training package. Some of the reasons for this included less work experience opportunities for students than anticipated, facilities limitations and isolation of the premises.

In the meantime, approximately 380 APTC students studied and lived at the Tanoa Rakiraki, in the north of Viti Levu. For the most part, the relationship was a positive one despite the ongoing concerns. The arrangement for student accommodation saw approximately 35 APTC students per semester living in self-catering accommodation at the Tanoa Skylodge in Nadi. Both arrangements ceased as a result of the School of Health and Community Services relocation to Suva.

#### Source: APTC

Of more recent interest are three partnerships, progressively being formalised:

- Fashion Industry, Fiji
- Hospitality Industry, PNG
- Cruise Tourism Industry, Vanuatu.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> One of APTC's targets is AUD500,000 profit on commercial activity for Stage 2. As of early November 2014, APTC management projected a profit from FFS of \$484,000 without any additional income beyond one newly approved project. This is 97 per cent of the 30 June 2015 target. (Communication from Denise O'Brien, 3 November 2014)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> APTC Industry Partnerships List 2014, prepared for the evaluation team, July 2014

## Textile Clothing and Footwear Council (TCFC), Fiji

A seven-month pilot program for the fashion industry began in March 2014 in Suva in partnership with the Textile Clothing and Footwear Council of Fiji. It involves the introduction of the Certificate III in Applied Fashion Design and Technology in response to the industry's advice on the growing demand for technical skills for the garment manufacturing and fashion industry in the country.

During the field visits, the evaluation team met with representatives from the industry, who were clearly impressed with the responsiveness of APTC to addressing the lack of skills in the industry and identifying their training requirements. One of the representatives from the TCFC stated: 'If needs be, we will go down on our hands and knees and beg to continue the course in the future'.

Source: APTC and field visit consultations

## **Coral Sea Hotels, PNG**

A partnership with Coral Sea Hotels in PNG is significant because it involves eight hotels across the country: Port Moresby (3), Lae (2), Goroka (1), Mt Hagen (1) and Madang (1). This hotel group is sending 150 students to APTC to undertake Certificate III in Hospitality – 90 in Food and Beverage and 60 in Commercial Cookery – paying for their wages while in the course, as well as travel costs, board and lodging and a contribution to the tuition fee. During the field visits, the evaluation team was advised by executives of Coral Sea Hotels that this investment had paid off in retention of staff, service levels and skill levels and was vastly superior to the in-house on-the-job training that occurred previously. Specifically, of the 60 who have already completed the course, no-one has left. Usually there is a 40+ per cent annual turnover rate of staff but this has been reduced to 10 per cent and staff morale has increased. The company intends to maintain the same level of training through APTC in 2015 and then re-assess the situation in light of circumstances in the industry.

Source: Interview with General Manager, Coral Sea Hotels

## Carnival Australia, Vanuatu

At the time of the field visits, a promising concept paper and indicative proposal for a Pilot Work Readiness Program had been prepared by APTC for Carnival Australia in response to their need for work-ready employees in the growing cruise tourism industry. If successful, it would train at least 150 prospective staff in relevant units from the Hospitality and Tourism training package. If a successful pilot is completed, the challenge for the continuation of the program will be the level of co-contribution involved.

Source: APTC Concept Paper and Indicative Proposal: Carnival Australia Work Readiness Program

# 2.4 How effective are APTC's school-to-work schemes, e.g. 'APTC-to-Work' and employer reintegration plans.

**APTC-to-Work.** APTC's school-to-work schemes vary in their effectiveness. The evaluation team observed some excellent work, but this was not consistently the case across all countries. This is acknowledged by APTC in its current review of the program.

The 2013–14 Annual Report and Plan notes that the APTC-to-Work program provides training in a number of industry work ready skills. These include communication, teambuilding, problem-solving, technology, planning and organising to help students to

move from training to work. The program also helps students to prepare a resume, identifies employment opportunities, and helps them to apply for jobs and to develop interview skills. Students are also supposed to receive assistance with introducing new skills into the workplace, starting a new business and developing a business proposal. Each country campus has an APTC-to-Work tutor to carry out this role. This is done by designing a specific training program and delivering classes as part of the normal timetable.

The Stage II Scope of Services identifies the goals of the program as: 'to improve employment rates and productivity'. Specifically, the program is to show students how to identify employment opportunities and to help them apply for work 'domestically and overseas' (Para 5.21). It is clear from feedback from APTC students that information on overseas job opportunities was not provided. This aspect will be addressed in the review of the program.

Another key role for the APTC-to-Work tutor is to organise work placements for students who are not in employment. They may be new industry entrants who were unemployed when they applied or those who left their employer to undertake the course at APTC. Existing workers with five or more years of experience may be either sponsored by their employer and will return to their employer after graduation or they may have lost their job when they were accepted to do the APTC course. Those students in trade programs not in employment need extended work placements between blocks of classroom training which requires finding employers who are willing to take on students during their training and ideally looking to employ a student after graduation. Finding suitable work placements requires making contact with, and keeping a database of, employers who are willing to provide work placements. The role is therefore quite demanding and requires the incumbent to work independently.

During the field visits it was not possible to have individual interviews with APTC-towork tutors in all countries and so it is impossible to generalise about the effectiveness of the work being done. However, the excellent work being done in PNG stood out as exceptional and the fact that a review is being undertaken confirms the initial assessment by the evaluation team that there is room for improvement.

*Employee re-integration plans.* The Scope of Services required the contractor to trial the development of Reintegration Plans with selected partners and other large employers and their employees. Reintegration Plans were, in the context of providing flexible course delivery, to identify and promote effectiveness of APTC training. They were to do this by showing how the student's training was being utilised in the workplace, to work out the student's career path and how the training would improve business productivity or otherwise contribute to the business objectives of their employing organisation. The contractor was asked to follow up with employers/ graduates after six months to assess whether the employment/productivity objectives were achieved.

A shortcoming of APTC's management of the evaluation process is its failure to collect systematic information on the impact of APTC training on the productivity of enterprises. The Employee Reintegration Plans, as specified in the Scope of Services, offered a good opportunity to work with employers to collect this information on how APTC training benefits productivity. However, the plans were not implemented beyond a small trial.

APTC conducted a trial of Reintegration Plans involving 44 students and their managers/employers and reported on it in 2012. The pilot narrowed considerably the scope of the Reintegration Plans and what information they could produce, as envisaged in the Scope of Services. Students were asked to respond to a limited set of questions. Employers were not involved in the design of instruments so that they could see benefit in the exercise. The report on the trial recommended against continuing the

exercise because 'the administration of this small pilot by APTC with students and their employers proved time-consuming and onerous for the APTC staff involved'. The accompanying claim that surveys of APTC graduates and employers would serve the same purpose is not supported. Detailed analysis of APTC's impact on productivity in the workplace remains important and should not be abandoned.

# 2.5 To what extent does APTC provide direct services to industry, e.g. employee upgrading?

APTC has the capacity to provide direct training services to industry as outlined in examples already cited above. However, teaching staff generally have full teaching loads and any new programs would require additional staff or overtime payment. As more tutors convert to trainers, this may be less of a problem. More significantly, many local enterprises have limited capacity to pay for training of staff. Because of the age cohort of APTC scholarship recipients and the availability of scholarships, training for enterprises tends to happen in this way. While there is scope to introduce cocontribution arrangements with industry and this has commenced, expectations about the availability of scholarships are difficult to reverse once they are in place.

The example of Boroko Motors in PNG illustrates the complexity of this issue.

### Boroko Motors, Papua New Guinea

Boroko Motors has a strong commitment to training and advised that it invests approximately five times the amount on training spent by other companies in the industry in PNG. The company and APTC enjoyed a very productive relationship in Stage I and Boroko Motors supported APTC unreservedly. Prior to this, in-house training had been fragmented and unstructured so the APTC option was seen as a welcome development and an important step forward.

At the beginning of APTC Stage II, there was considerable turnover of APTC trainers causing disruption in the availability of staff to conduct the training. In addition, in response to fee-for-service targets in the new Stage II APTC contract, there was a move to a policy of providing enterprise training on a full cost recovery basis. Suddenly the cost to Boroko Motors of using APTC as its training arm escalated to the extent that two dedicated full-time locally-employed expatriate trainers could be hired for the same cost. Filling the positions at APTC also took time causing frustration and interruptions with Boroko Motors' training program.

These factors caused the partnership between APTC and Boroko Motors to come to an end early in Stage II with Boroko Motors establishing its own in-house training capability. If the issue of the cost of training could be resolved, Boroko Motors would resume the partnership immediately as training is not considered to be part of the core business and the quality and expertise offered by APTC is highly valued. This would require APTC to re-negotiate the arrangement with Boroko Motors and reach agreement on co-contribution.

Source: Evaluation team interview with Boroko Motors executives

APTC has been contracted to provide staff training for employees of government departments but this is usually donor funded.

The evaluation team was advised of several instances where older workers trained by APTC influenced younger workers on their return to the workplace. A documented example of this is the case of an APTC graduate from the Certificate III in Engineering in Fiji who used the skills he learnt in the course to improve the productivity of the 100+ staff he supervises, particularly in relation to time management and accountability. He has also introduced international workplace health and safety standards and improved

environmental work practices.<sup>38</sup> These benefits are indirect but if replicated by multiple graduates represent an important contribution by APTC to workplace productivity.

## 3 How equitable is the provision of APTC services?

- geographically (especially non-campus, small island states), by gender, by urban/rural location, family income and by disability
- minimising barriers to learning (for all students, but in particular for women studying in non-traditional areas and for people with a disability)
- effectiveness of bridging programs and ELLN in promoting greater equity

**Overview.** APTC appears to have been largely successful in satisfying equity goals, with some exceptions. It uniquely provides second chance opportunities for workers to upgrade skills.

No data are collected on income level of those admitted, but location can be used as a proxy. Two campus countries – PNG and Samoa – do particularly well in enrolling students from remote and rural areas. Applicants from small island states tend to be well covered in proportion to their populations. However, PNG is well below the norm for enrolment in relation to population, and Solomon Islands scores low on the same index. This points to the importance of expansion of service delivery for nationals of those two countries. Females make up over 40 per cent of enrolments. They tend to be concentrated in non-trade areas, but APTC has achieved significant female enrolment in three non-traditional trades: commercial cookery, painting and decoration, and wall and floor tiling. Two qualifications in disability have enrolled more than 150 students. Only 0.6 per cent of APTC students are disabled, but it is difficult to assess this level of performance in the absence of norms and comparators.

APTC reports that: 'The course profile sets enrolment targets for gender, especially in non-traditional disciplines, and under-represented locations. In particular, the allocation of scholarship places to target populations is an effective tool for ensuring equity of access to programs'.<sup>39</sup>

**Opportunity.** A distinguishing feature of APTC from other organisations is that it provides a second chance for adults who have finished or dropped out of education. Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL) is an essential avenue for working people to gain access to APTC qualifications. Applicants must pass basic literacy and numeracy tests, but prior educational qualifications do not factor into admissions.

*Income and location.* APTC determined it was not feasible to collect information on family income on entrants. A proxy for income could be urban-rural location. Students from remote and rural areas are likely to be from lower income families. A majority of students in PNG and Samoa come from remote and rural locations. In contrast, about three-fourths of students in Fiji and Vanuatu are local, i.e. from urban areas.<sup>40</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> APTC Impact Case Study: A Beacon of Light

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> APTC 2013–14 Annual Report and Plan: p. 8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Students classified as from the capital city, Port Vila, Vanuatu may actually live in a rural area.

Citizenship	Local %	Remote %	Rural %
Fiji	75	10	15
Papua New Guinea	47	19	34
Samoa	28	23	49
Vanuatu	71	28	1

#### Table 6.5: Cumulative entrants by citizenship and location

#### Source: APTC

Local = someone who is close enough to the campus of study not to require accommodation, although most local students receive a daily stipend to cover transport costs.

Remote = full time students, from campus countries, who live/work in remote locations and need extra support to relocate to an APTC campus within the campus county or from another country.

**Nationality.** APTC has encouraged participation by small island states (SIS) and applicants from SIS receive preferential treatment in the selection process. To mid-2014, over 10 per cent of total APTC enrolment (890 students) came from SIS and would otherwise not have had the opportunity to undergo skills training at Certificate III and above. Given the relatively small populations, except for Kiribati, attendance tends to be highly skewed. However, small island states in the northern part of the Pacific tend to be under-represented, including Palau, RMI and FSM. A recent course was delivered in Palau.

Campus country		Non-campus country	
Nationality	Enrolment per 1000 population in country	Nationality	Enrolment per 1000 population in country
Samoa	5.5	Niue	13.3
Vanuatu	5.1	Tuvalu	7.7
Fiji	3.1	Nauru	6.7
Solomon Islands	1.5	Tonga	3.2
Average all countries:	0.9	Kiribati	2.5
PNG	0.3	Palau	1.5
		Average all countries	: 0.9
		RMI	0.7
		Cook Islands	0.1
		FSM	0

### Table 6.6: Geographical index on student participation by nationality

Source: APTC data and World Bank Development Indicators for population estimates. Enrolment is cumulative from 2007 to June 2014.

PNG citizens accounted for 22 per cent of cumulative enrolment up to mid-2014 (1895 students out of a total enrolment of 8715. Annex 4, Figure 4.1.1). This was second only to Fiji with 30 per cent of total enrolment. However, enrolment of PNG nationals was low in relation to total population. PNG stands as an outlier among campus countries in low enrolments related to population, only 0.3 students cumulatively per thousand population (Annex 4, Figure 4.1.2). Several factors account for this, including low enrolment targets for PNG in Stage I and the slow start of programs<sup>41</sup> at the PNG campus in Stage II owing to staff attrition from changes in terms

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> In 2012 enrolment at the PNG campus averaged only 38 students per semester, compared with an average of 165 students in all semesters since 2012.

of employment (Annex 4, Section 4.4). The Solomon Islands also ranks low on geographical equity at 1.5 students per thousand population. Factors responsible include weak supply of trainees and, until recently, lack of APTC training within country. These facts point to the importance of expanding opportunities in the two campus countries.

APTC has stated that applicants from SIS countries are given preference. Table 6.7 shows the relative shares of applicants who obtain scholarships by country. The rate of awards varies substantially both for nationals from campus countries and SIS. This may reflect qualifications of applicants as well as need. About half the Samoan applicants received scholarships, compared with just over a third for PNG and Vanuatu.

Cumulative completion rates for SIS were generally higher than for the campus countries – ranging from 92 per cent for Kiribati nationals to 100 per cent for RMI and Nauru versus 88 per cent and 89 per cent for Vanuatu and PNG. (Annex 4, Table 5.2.1b)

Campus country		Non-campus country	
Nationality	Scholarship awards as a % of applicants	Nationality	Scholarship awards as a % of applicants
Samoa	48	Niue	58
Fiji	40	Tonga	46
Average all countries	39	Tuvalu	43
Solomon Islands	37	RMI	43
PNG	36	Average all countries	39
Vanuatu	34	Nauru	38
		Kiribati	34
		Palau	33
		FSM	21

### Table 6.7: Scholarship awards as a percentage of applicants

Source: APTC data

Among campus countries, the below-average rate of scholarship awards for Solomon Islands and PNG indicates a comparatively weak pool of candidates.

**Bridging and LLN.** The APTC program has shifted from seeking to improve the skills of potential applicants prior to application (e.g. as piloted in KIT and USP MI in 2012)<sup>42</sup> to an integrated model. The integrated model is based on the finding that adults learn LLN best in a context, i.e. as part of the vocational training and development.<sup>43</sup> So the emphasis, rather than on bridging, is now on upgrading the LLN skills of trainees after admission and during training. Students are supported during training by Learning Support Facilitators (LSF) who work alongside the vocational trainers to deliver the integrated LLN program. One LSF is based in each of Vanuatu, PNG, Samoa and the Solomon Islands, while two are located in Fiji.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> APTC 2012–13 Annual Report and Plan: p. 34

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup>Ibid: p. 21

This approach is consistent with current practice in Australia. The initial LLN assessment scores are aligned to the Australian Core Skills Framework – a comprehensive diagnostic tool designed to assist LLN practitioners describe an individual's performance in the five core skills of learning, reading, writing, oral communication and numeracy. This ensures that LLN support is tailored to individual student needs and available at the commencement of each class. High overall completion rates to strict standards attest to the success of the LLN program.

*Gender.* APTC has stated that it 'continues to...employ gender sensitive student recruitment practices, and model best-practice in marketing initiatives. Images depicting women and men in non-traditional trades are displayed on the APTC website, in advertising, and in official APTC brochures. The course profile sets enrolment targets for gender, especially in non-traditional disciplines, and under-represented locations. In particular, the allocation of scholarship places to target populations is an effective tool for ensuring equity of access to programs.'<sup>44</sup>

**Enrolments.** The training of women tends to be constrained by family responsibilities that make it difficult for women to attend training in other countries. Still, females accounted for 38 per cent of enrolments and 42 per cent of graduates to date, with the female shares of both higher in Stage II than Stage I. Females accounted for only 24 per cent of the recorded non-completions. Overall, females recorded a 6 percentage point higher completion rate than males, 93 per cent compared to 87 per cent, respectively. (Annex 4, Table 5.2.1a)

Female students and graduates are highly concentrated in the non-trade areas, although some small inroads are being made in non-traditional occupations (e.g., tiling). Females make up about half the enrolments in the SCHS, but only a quarter of STT trainees. By training package, females account for the majority of cumulative students in tourism and hospitality (56 per cent), health (65 per cent), and community services (85 per cent). In STT, females made up 15 per cent of enrolments in construction/plumbing and 77 per cent in textiles and clothing, but only about 2 per cent in electro-technology, metal/machining and automotive. (Annex 4, Figure 4.3.4) Since APTC recruits mainly existing workers from the trades, the gender distribution of enrolments reflects the prevailing gender distribution in the occupations in the labour market.

APTC has achieved success in enrolling women in non-traditional occupations in two areas: commercial cookery and construction. In construction, women have made inroads in two new qualifications for the Pacific – painting and decoration, and wall and floor tiling. Females constituted 34 per cent of total enrolments to mid-2014 in commercial cookery, 43 per cent in painting/decorating and 40 per cent in wall and floor tiling. (Annex 4, Table 4.3.1).

**Graduates.** Little information exists on the outcomes of APTC training for female graduates. The annual APTC tracer surveys have not recorded gender at all, or they have not collected information on the occupations of the respondents consistently. APTC tracer surveys did not report employment rates by qualification, let alone occupation and gender. No information was collected on earnings. Lack of robust tracer information on graduates, including females, is a serious impediment to identification of outcomes.

The little available information suggests mixed results. Some aggregate information can be gleaned from the NCVER survey of Stage I APTC graduates. These results suggest that females have benefited in some ways proportionately more than males from APTC training. The employment rate for males was slightly higher (97 per cent)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Ibid: p. 8

than females (95 per cent.) Still, female graduates were more likely than males to say that they had benefited in some way from their APTC qualification. Some 96 per cent of female APTC graduates said they received a benefit, compared with 87 per cent of male graduates. These benefits ranged from getting a job, setting up their own business, to getting a promotion or an increase in earnings.<sup>45</sup>

According to further analysis of the same survey, nearly half (46 per cent) of APTC graduates have remained with the same employer as before training. More female than male graduates still with the same employer had gained a promotion or increased status at work (68 per cent and 56 per cent, respectively.) Female graduates still with the same employer had benefited just as much as (even slightly more than) male graduates in increased earnings (64 per cent and 61 per cent, respectively.)

Stage I female graduates *not* with the same employer were much more likely to say that APTC training helped them to get their current job compared with male graduates. Just over half of female graduates (54 per cent) said that their APTC training had helped them to get their current job compared with just over one-third of male graduates (37 per cent.) For female graduates in the trades-based qualifications, this was a particularly important benefit, with 63 per cent saying their APTC training had helped to get their current job compared with 39 per cent for male graduates. (Source: Evaluation team analysis of the survey data).

Female graduates tend to be concentrated in qualifications and occupations that have higher rates of unemployment. For example, women account for 81 per cent of enrolments in community services (Annex 4, Figure 4.3.4), but the evaluation team survey found relatively high unemployment rates in youth work, children's services, and home and aged care (Annex 8, Table 8.3). Several female graduates in the focus groups stated that they were strictly speaking unemployed, but they had commenced or resumed volunteer work in their communities which was contributing to the strengthening of those communities. Much of this involved working with churches or NGOs and was considered by the graduates to be a successful outcome.

**Special needs.** One question for the evaluation is: how effectively has APTC minimised barriers to learning...in particular...for people with a disability? (Annex 3). Applicants with special needs receive preferential treatment in the selection process. APTC has introduced two certificate programs – Certificate III and Certificate IV in Disability – that did not exist previously and that train students to work with people with disabilities. Some 156 students have enrolled in the two courses. However, APTC has enrolled only 56 students with special needs, just 0.6 per cent of cumulative enrolments. On the surface, this level of enrolment of students with disabilities seems low.<sup>46</sup> However, it is not possible to assess the adequacy of this level of performance in the absence of norms and comparators. Thus, it is not possible to assess how effectively ATPC has minimised barriers to learning for the disabled.

The APTC tracer survey of graduates found that 89.3 per cent of those surveyed with a disability were employed compared with 96.1 per cent of those without a disability. However, more persons with disabilities (96.6 per cent) reported having received an employment benefit from APTC training than those without a disability (90.3 per cent). In addition, most graduates with a disability (93.1 per cent) reported a sense of achievement from their training. They were more likely to cite getting into further study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> NCVER, 2013, APTC Graduates Down the Track, p. 17 and Appendix B, Table B1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup>It has to be kept in mind that APTC upgrades those already in the labour force, either existing workers or NIEs. The apparently low proportion of enrolments may reflect the low proportion of persons with disabilities in APTC-type occupations in the labour force.

(37.9 per cent) and being seen as a role model in the community (86.2 per cent) than those without a disability (18.2 per cent and 63.9 per cent, respectively).<sup>47</sup>

# 4 To what extent have the governance and management arrangements facilitated or impeded APTC's operations?

The governance and management arrangements have impeded, rather than facilitated, APTC's operations. There are inefficiencies and duplication in the consortium arrangements and the organisational structure, which need to be addressed. A shift to a country-based approach to advisory mechanisms would better position APTC for the future than the current Advisory Group arrangements.

# 4.1 Consortium arrangements – What is the impact of the three member consortium on the effectiveness and efficiency of the operations of the APTC?

The Stage II Scope of Services stated that APTC would adopt a 'whole-of-college model'.<sup>48</sup> However, the consortium arrangements are cumbersome and inefficient. The consortium consists of three entities, TAFE Queensland (formerly South Coast Institute of TAFE) as the lead contractor, Box Hill Institute in Victoria and GRM International. This has involved duplication of functions and personnel, affecting both administrative and educational functions.

Administratively, each has responsibilities for employment: TAFE Queensland East Coast for STT staff: Box Hill Institute for SHCS staff. TAE trainers and national staff (administrative and tutors); and GRM International for short-term advisers. This means that there are three different employment arrangements and three sets of staff to manage them, along with the human resource (HR) function based in Nadi. Employment terms and conditions for expatriate trainers are modifications of Australian industrial awards rather than purpose-designed for APTC circumstances. As well as being inefficient and costly, inconsistency in employment arrangements has been the cause of tension among staff as they compare the two different sets of conditions and benefits. As employees of different organisations, they are accountable to these organisations and not directly to the APTC CEO. This invites staff to regard themselves as employees of the employing body rather than of APTC - an undesirable split in loyalties. The evaluation team was even advised that differences in employment conditions had hampered the appointment of national HR staff in Nadi because the arrangements were too complex to expect a national to administer and therefore too risky to contemplate. Similar duplication exists for other administrative functions. Perceptions by some staff that the administration is 'top-heavy' is in part a result of the duplication of staffing required to maintain these inefficiencies. There should be one employer and one line of accountability, with the CEO having full accountability for managing performance.

From an educational perspective, since both RTOs have all programs currently and likely to be delivered by the APTC on their scope of registration, there is no longer a necessity to have two RTOs involved. Moreover, duplication also occurs in quality assurance. Each of the two institutes has its own arrangements for quality compliance and auditing, neither of which was custom-made for APTC purposes. These different approaches need to be understood in each country and implemented accordingly. With the Australian Skills Quality Authority announcing that it intends to conduct off-shore audits in 2014, streamlining of the quality and compliance arrangements has become essential. There should be a single quality management system, designed to meet

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Ibid., Table B1, and p. 20

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> APTC. (2010) Stage II Scope of Services: p. 3

APTC requirements and a single and coordinated approach to quality compliance and auditing.

Consortium members have worked diligently to harmonise these areas of duplication. Much has been achieved. However, differences remain even towards the end of Stage II. This has required goodwill and extensive time and effort that might have been better spent in other more productive and future-oriented activities. Addressing these inefficiencies is imperative as the APTC matures and positions itself for the future.

Importantly, APTC can achieve significant cost efficiencies by separating the education function (under the responsibility of an RTO) from the administrative/employment function (under the responsibility of a different agent). For example, separating the administrative/employer function from the education function of an RTO has the advantage of being able to develop employment terms and conditions specifically for APTC's requirements without being constrained by Australian TAFE terms and conditions. This could also be achieved through a sub-contracting arrangement. Such a separation would see the two parties focusing on their core business.

# 4.2 Advisory Group – How does the membership and role of the Advisory Group contribute to the impact of the APTC?

The structure and nature of the APTC Advisory Group limits its impact, compared with alternatives.

The current group has representatives from each country campus and three non-campus countries. Typically, they are stakeholders chosen for their connections with and support for the APTC. Additional members are two industry representatives from Australia. The group is chaired by the Minister Counsellor, Regional Pacific Aid, Australian Aid based in Fiji, who also determines the agenda.

Recommendation 12 of the Mid-Term Review<sup>49</sup> proposed that the strategic role and contribution of the APTC Advisory Group be strengthened. This was taken up in the Stage II design with a redefinition of the Advisory Group's purpose to reflect a greater role in strategy, advocacy and performance monitoring and a proposal for the chair's role to be assumed by a regional or industry representative.

According to stakeholders, (including advice from the four members of the Advisory Group that the evaluation team met) the main role of the Advisory Group is as a stakeholder communication forum. The group provides a vehicle for consultation on projects such as the Environmental Scan or the Annual Plan to ensure that all major aspects have been appropriately addressed. The Country Reports keep members upto-date with developments in other countries and the Australian representatives provide useful information on industry training and trends in Australia.

However, the more strategic role envisaged for the Advisory Group in Stage II has not eventuated. Reasons cited include infrequent meetings, turnover in membership and incomplete country representation. Lack of clear dissemination mechanisms further limits its impact. In addition, the Consortium Board is ultimately accountable to DFAT as the client and there is ongoing contract management. This means that there is little genuine scope for an Advisory Board of this nature to exercise a strategic role in APTC operations.

As highlighted earlier, a greater focus on the distinctiveness of each country would be more appropriate in future. This points to the desirability of a country level approach to an advisory mechanism.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Schofield, K., Tan, H., Bryant, C. and Catchlove, J. (2009). APTC Mid-Term Review – Final Report. Prepared for AusAID, Australian High Commission, Suva, Fiji: xix

Under new DFAT arrangements, the responsibility for the APTC will shift from Fiji to Canberra. This in itself may require a different approach to an advisory mechanisms but it would also open up the way for greater involvement of DFAT officers in the APTC at country level and promote integration with the bi-lateral programs, through actively involving DFAT in a country-based advisory mechanism.

It is therefore proposed that a consultative forum be established at country level with the following features:

- a small membership, in the order of 5–7 members
- members appointed by the local DFAT office in consultation with the Country Manager
- membership comprising at least 50 per cent private industry and/or industry association members
- an Industry Chairperson
- one DFAT representative to have observer status
- Country Manager to have observer status
- meetings to be held four times per year
- consideration of a modest sitting fee for members.

The terms of reference for such a forum might include:

- providing input into the Country Strategic Plan
- sourcing/providing ongoing advice on industry trends and local industry intelligence
- providing feedback on the quality and relevance of APTC training
- advocating for the APTC with industry and government in the country and disseminating information about the APTC at country level.

The APTC is looking to move away from its current reliance on scholarships and to market its services to industry on a fee-paying basis. A consultative forum at country level would assist this process. With each country becoming increasingly distinctive, it would also support a country-specific approach to strategic planning and development.

Were such country-based consultative forums to be established, there would be a field from which to draw membership of a new Pacific consultative forum. Membership could include:

- the Chairs of each Country Consultative Forum, rotating as Chairperson
- a government representative from each Country Consultative Forum
- the CEO, APTC
- a representative from the managing contractor
- up to 2 co-opted members as agreed by the Consultative Forum (e.g. from Australia or other Pacific countries)
- meetings to be held twice per annum in rotating countries
- Country Managers and local DFAT representatives would have observer status.

These new arrangements recognise the evolution of the APTC.
# 4.3 Organisational structure – How well does the organisational structure support the operational requirements of the APTC?

The organisational structure reflects the consortium arrangements and exhibits the associated inefficiencies. It reveals the high number of corporate/administrative staff required to maintain reporting lines to two institutes, compared with what would be required with one RTO. As a result, the structure has elements of duplication and confusion and is top-heavy.

At the time of the field visits, there were two School Directors with coverage of the programs offered by the two institutes. One Director in charge of all aspects of teaching and learning, possibly at Deputy CEO level, would be more typical for an organisation of APTC's size. The fact that the two share the role of Country Manager Fiji bears this point out. However, it confuses the skills ideally required for each position and necessitates both positions being based in Fiji. It means that there is no single point of educational leadership at the second level of the organisation. There is also no single Fiji Country Manager – an undesirable situation when the operations in Fiji are dispersed. In the other countries where a single Country Manager exists, they have achieved considerable profile and standing among and across the stakeholders.

At the Australian end, there are two Service Managers with RTO teams of five to six staff in each. The two teams provide parallel support functions such as human resource management, student administration and finances, including recruitment, mobilisation, travel, payroll, etc. GRM also has some responsibility for these functions as they relate to short-term advisers. Potentially four to six staff positions could be saved by eliminating this duplication. This potential has already been identified by the consortium and some steps are being taken to enact change. However, this is overdue.

There was a range of reasons for locating the APTC Head Office in Nadi during the establishment phase, including proximity to Nadi airport. There were also programs located at the western end of Viti Levu. However, this is no longer the case. The opportunity presents itself to consolidate the administration of APTC in one centre. Continuation in Nadi isolates the Head Office from the rest of the Fiji operations. Savings and cost implications of office consolidation would need to be considered.

Maintaining Australian staff to carry out administrative/corporate functions at the APTC headquarters in Nadi is costly. There are no national staff at senior level and only two out of the current seven at manager level. These positions should be reviewed with the aim of ascertaining whether the functions might more cost-effectively be carried out in Australia (where staff allowances would be much less) or by employing national staff, in the same way as tutors are mentored to become trainers. Wherever practicable, national staff with administrative functions might be mentored to assume responsibility in their respective areas.

# 5 What are the main constraints on, and opportunities for, further development of APTC capacity for skills development?

**Overview.** Critical constraints and opportunities for further development of APTC capacity for skills development can be summarised as follows.

•	Lack of a long-term vision for APTC in the
	Pacific and the ability to plan for the future

Constraints

- The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications
- The need to generate more of its own revenue by encouraging greater co-contribution to the cost of training by individuals, employers, donors and Pacific governments
- Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management
- Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition
- Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff while at the same time addressing the associated risks of quality deterioration if national trainers are not properly supported
- Attracting staff to work in less secure countries

#### **Opportunities**

- Clarity for both APTC, DFAT and other stakeholders about what constitutes success for APTC
- More flexible programs such as skill sets and accredited short courses
- Overcoming the reputation of being a scholarship college
- More streamlined operations and availability of more resources for delivery
- Development of partnerships with local institutions of best fit
- Educational and financial benefits from capability-building of national staff and reduced reliance on national trainers
- Greater staffing and program stability and improved outcomes

# 5.1 Lack of a long-term vision for APTC role in the Pacific and the ability to plan for the future

In its consultations across the five country campuses, the evaluation team was impressed by the level of agreement among all stakeholders about the value and impact of the APTC and the importance of it continuing. In fact, it was often stated that it would not be feasible to discontinue APTC at this stage. However, lack of clarity about the longevity and future role of APTC in the Pacific was also noted. Of necessity the APTC consortium works to the four-year cycle of the contract. This militates against anything more than medium-term planning. Another four-year cycle, regardless of the contracting arrangements, would simply repeat this situation.

Country-based DFAT offices appear to be supportive of the APTC arising out of positive experience and anecdotal information about it locally. They generally support its continuation, in some cases without setting any time limits. Because it is a regional program and they have no real control over it, the relationship between DFAT country offices and APTC is typically at 'arm's length' and there is no imperative to give anything more than brief consideration to APTC's future. This situation is not conducive to effective long-term, holistic planning for the Australian aid program at country level and optimal synergy with bilateral programs.

As Stage II draws to an end, it is timely for the Australian Government to articulate its long-term vision for the APTC as a basis for strategic planning and to engage and consult with other stakeholders, such as donors and Pacific governments, about this vision.

# 5.2 The contractual requirement to deliver full qualifications

The APTC model of delivering full qualifications assumes that this is what is required by all students and their employers and implies a rigidity of approach. It means that students must be released from the workplace for long enough to complete the training and has, in some cases, meant that students must resign from their jobs to take up a scholarship. It does not assist the process of encouraging employers to contribute to the cost of training because they may only require certain skills. A move to more flexible forms of training, such as skill sets, is likely to appeal to employers.

#### 5.3 The need to generate more of its own revenue by encouraging greater co-contribution to the cost of training by individuals, employers, donors and Pacific governments and so overcome the reputation of being a scholarship college

The preponderance of student financial assistance has led to what APTC management and staff frequently referred to as APTC's reputation in the Pacific of being a 'scholarship college'. This is not likely to be sustainable in the long term. Other forms of income must be generated using all available sources. Efforts are being made to introduce co-contribution by industry and individuals and this must continue to be pursued. As described above, it may mean more emphasis on highly targeted training for enterprises. The arrangement with Coral Sea Hotels in PNG that involves a substantial contribution from industry is a model to be replicated. However, greater mobilisation of income from industry requires sufficient staff time for business development.

Opportunities to generate income from donors and Pacific governments would be enhanced if APTC's long-term role in the Pacific were clarified and donors and Pacific governments were involved in the associated consultation process. In the longer term, as APTC's reliance on scholarships is reduced, consideration could be given to establishing pathways for outstanding APTC graduates by earmarking scholarships through the Australia Awards scholarships program. Further discussion of this form of cooperation is contained in Attachment 2.

### 5.4 Elimination of cost inefficiencies in organisation and management

Some examples of cost-inefficiencies are addressed in earlier points. Of particular note are the costs associated with the consortium arrangements and the organisational structure. Addressing these areas would free up resources to be directed towards skill development. APTC can achieve significant cost efficiencies by separating the administrative/employment function from the education function and to have a different agent responsible for each. Divorcing the administrative/employer function from the education function for the education function has two advantages. First, one employer with one set of employment terms and conditions for all staff makes this function much simpler to manage, and requires fewer staff to do so. Second, it would allow APTC to develop its own employment terms and conditions tailored to its own needs, and be de-linked to Australian TAFE terms and conditions that an Australian-based RTO must follow.

# 5.5 Overcoming pockets of entrenched opposition to develop partnerships with local institutions of best fit

Despite attempts by the APTC at cooperation, some pockets of entrenched opposition remain even towards the end of the second stage. The concept of an Australian institution operating in its own right in the Pacific has been interpreted by some local institutions as an affront to their capability and contrary to a development approach which would invest more directly in local capacity-building. This has been evident in both Fiji and the Solomon Islands. In those two countries, it has prevented a partnership with the most obvious institutions, the national universities. It has required the APTC to 'work around' the situation. Efforts are continuing to resolve this situation.

This is a costly issue because the selection of an institutional partner typically necessitates capital investment by the APTC in order to comply with Australian standards of delivery. Where partnerships falter, investment is likely to be required in an alternative partner. This is the case in Fiji where investment in hospitality facilities was required twice.

# 5.6 Pursuing the nationalisation of trainers and other staff while at the same time addressing the associated risks of quality deterioration if national trainers are not properly supported

As outlined earlier, the APTC has instituted a process of replacing Australian trainers with national trainers aimed at achieving both educational and financial benefits, through lifting the teaching capability of local staff and reducing reliance on expatriate trainers. An important measure of the success of the program is the capacity of national trainers to replace the Australian trainers without compromise to quality. Reducing reliance/ dependence on the Australian trainers has the flow-on financial benefit that national trainers can be employed at significantly lower cost. Because the national trainers must meet Australian standards, the process takes time and it is only towards the end of Stage II that they are starting to be appointed.

The size of operations at APTC means that only one Australian trainer has been appointed for a particular industry in each country. These trainers have commented that, in the absence of other colleagues in the same industry, a high degree of selfreliance is required to remain up-to-date with changes in training requirements. Some have also commented on the sense of professional isolation that can occur in this environment. National trainers will face the same challenges and they may also be required to train national tutors to achieve trainer status. Ongoing and intensive professional support for national trainers is therefore critical.

The main strategies to support national trainers could include:

- ongoing professional development vocational and pedagogical
- the presence of a senior trainer at country level to provide ongoing 'on-the-ground support', mostly of a general nature
- the employment of Australian trainers to act as visiting vocational/industry specialists on a short term basis
- the establishment of 'communities of practice' to provide professional support
- industry experience or placement in Australia and/or Pacific countries where Australian standards apply.

Senior trainers are in place in all countries except the Solomon Islands, where the partnership is still in its early stages. Since national trainers have only been employed in the last few months, visiting specialists are only a possible future option. The role of a short-term visiting specialist would gradually replace that of a resident expatriate trainer in a planned way as more national trainers become qualified. Opportunities for industry experience have been quite limited and short-term to date. There is a risk that the quality of training will deteriorate over time as national trainers lose currency in their expertise through lack of ongoing support or an over-emphasis on savings.

There is also an attrition risk of having to replace national trainers if they leave. This is critical given the substantial lead time required for upgrading tutors into trainers. Planning is required to ensure that contingencies are in place. There are also planning

issues associated with the impact on national trainers if courses are rested,<sup>50</sup> and smooth and realistic succession planning for national tutors.

While the proportion of national staff in administrative positions appears relatively high at 60 per cent (Annex 4, Table 6.4.1), these are usually in the lower level positions. There is a risk that APTC might be seen to be less concerned about career opportunities for administrative staff than for trainers. This issue was raised in the staff survey (Annex 5 – Staff). More emphasis could be placed on the nationalisation of administrative staff at the higher levels, particularly those based in Nadi.

### 5.7 Attracting staff to work in less secure countries

APTC staff expressed concerns about slow progress in skills development in PNG. This is due in part to security issues, cost and difficulties in recruiting staff. In PNG, security issues mean there is little attraction for family members to join staff and this is exacerbated by the high cost of housing and high costs of education of young family members. Similar safety issues apply in the Solomon Islands although not to the same extent. This can have an impact on families. Expatriate staff in PNG advised that they all had families at home and worked on a six weeks on – one week off basis. Problems in PNG associated with changes to terms and conditions for staff at the end of Stage I appear to have been mainly overcome but require ongoing monitoring.

### 6 What influence has APTC had in building capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions, including direct support, and demonstration effects?

APTC has had considerable influence in building the capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions. The Centre for Professional Development is well established, delivering the TAE program and supporting nationalisation. The demonstration effect of APTC on higher quality standards is widely recognised among the stakeholders. APTC's influence in building the capacity of other Pacific TVET institutions has been extensive with the partner institutions in campus countries that have been in place since Stage I (PNG, Samoa and Vanuatu). There are also signs of its influence in the newer partnerships in campus countries (Fiji and Solomon Islands) and in the most established partnerships in a non-campus country (Kiribati).

### 6.1 To what extent and how effectively has APTC's provided additional professional development for the education and training sector? To what extent has the Centre for Professional Development been established and is effective in delivering services?

APTC has been successful in upgrading the teaching qualifications of many staff in the education and training sector. Partner institutions commented that they have received and appreciated professional development, particularly but not only the Certificate IV in Training and Assessment. Skills upgrading in vocational specialisations was also appreciated. Professional development has also been provided beyond the immediate partner institutions.

The establishment of the Centre for Professional Development (CPD) was recommended by the Mid-Term Review and is therefore a Stage II initiative.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Expatriate trainers can be moved more easily to other campus countries than national trainers.

The review team noted that the activities of the CPD are consistent with the role identified in the Scope of Services and can be broken down as follows:

- delivery of Certificate IV in Training and Assessment (TAE)
  - to partner institutions
  - to APTC staff
  - on a fee-for-service basis to the wider TVET sector
- supporting nationalisation
- other professional development.

**Delivery of Certificate IV in TAE to partner institutions.** In Stage I TAE was scholarship funded. This is no longer the case. Partnership agreements outline the extent of delivery and this has been adhered to.

**Delivery of Certificate IV in TAE to APTC staff.** The quantum of delivery is determined by drawing on the approved individual Capability Development Plans completed by tutors and trainers on an annual basis.

**Delivery of Certificate IV in TAE on a fee-for-service basis.** This may be either for individuals wishing to complete the qualification or for an organisation requiring training for a group of employees. One example of the latter is training by the CPD staff for the Oceania Olympic Committee paid by the Australian Institute of Sport (through Australian Aid). Other examples relate to the wider TVET sector. The Certificate IV in TAE is gaining momentum as a fee-for-service product. However, it is coming under increasing competition from other providers offering similar programs in Fiji.

Arrangements have been made with a qualified resident consultant to deliver the training for the Certificate IV in TAE in PNG as a cost-efficiency measure. Apart from this, most of the training occurs in Fiji. During the field visits, the evaluation team was advised of some tensions associated with these delivery arrangements, with the view taken by some trainers that it was not necessary for all training other than in PNG to be conducted by the CPD. The responsible RTO will not allow the training to be delivered by a national at this stage and this is also likely to cause tension in the future, especially among those national trainers who have completed the higher level qualification – Diploma of VET.

**Supporting nationalisation.** The CPD has a major role in supporting nationalisation and assisting tutors to meet the qualification requirements to enable them to progress through the four levels and become a trainer. In the interests of sustainability in the longer term, excluding national trainers from delivery of the TAE training package by national trainers could not be justified.

**Other professional development.** The CPD offers units from the Diploma of VET, which all APTC trainers are encouraged to undertake: Facilitation and Professional Development. Following a training needs analysis undertaken for administrative staff, a skill set from the Certificate IV in Business was identified, consisting of four units of competency. These units are offered to all administrative staff. Completion of the qualification can occur through online training and/or RPL. Almost half – 21 (48 per cent) of the 44 administrative staff survey respondents – were undertaking or had completed the Certificate IV in Business (Annex 5 – Staff).

*My Village* is a learning management system with a Moodle-based online learning platform for the Certificate IV in Business and the Diploma of VET which staff can access. IPads are also used. It has taken some time for national staff to be ready for online learning but this is now occurring and e-learning is expected to grow in future.

The need for the services of the CPD is likely to grow. Firstly, it will need to meet APTC's internal needs as more national staff are employed. As highlighted above, this means the provision of ongoing professional development and the organisation of

placements to support industry currency and capability development, either in Australia or in appropriate locations in the Pacific. The training needs of administrative staff are also a consideration, especially if nationalisation is to occur more systematically for that group. Secondly, the CPD has an ongoing role with partner institutions, three of which are still relatively new. Finally, the CPD should further capitalise on external opportunities for fee-for-service activity, from the point of view of both income generation and building APTC's profile and reputation.

Any assessment of the CPD needs to take into account the resources allocated to its operations. There is only one continuing staff member with Box Hill Institute and Queensland TAFE sourcing staff on a short-term basis to deliver the TAE training as required in accordance with demand. This ensures flexibility of staffing in response to demand. The CPD delivers to partner institutions in accordance with the partnership agreements. The income from fee-for-service delivery contributes to the overall fee-for-service income target for APTC. Table 6.8 shows key data for the CPD to date. Bearing in mind the limited resources available, 225 fee-for-service enrolments (representing over 60 per cent of total enrolments) and associated income of \$731,802 can be regarded as a solid performance.

## Table 6.8: Key data for the Centre for Professional Development

1.	1. Enrolments in Certificate IV in Training and Assessment – Stage II				
	Partner institutes	1	06		
	APTC staff	3	37		
	Fee-for-service	2	25		
2.	Fee-for-service Certificate IV in Training and Assessment				
	Income received/pending as of 30 August 2014 \$731,802				
3.	Other enrolments by APTC staff				
	Diploma of VET (Pathway qualification from Cert. IV)	6	65		
	Certificate IV in Business (Administrative staff) 35				
4.	Support for capability development in Australia	STT	SHCS		
	National tutors	9	1		
	Expatriate trainers	9	2		

Source: APTC Centre for Professional Development

# 6.2 To what extent has APTC provided a demonstration effect on higher quality standards?

During the consultations there were instances of stakeholders from every category expressing the unsolicited view that the APTC had provided a demonstration effect on quality standards. The following are just a few of numerous examples:

APTC is a benchmark for international standards in training. Qualifications authority, Fiji

APTC has provided our company with qualified staff who can perform. Previously finding people who fill that bill was virtually impossible. Employer, Vanuatu

APTC is providing excellent training. Their facilities are much better than those of the local institutions. Government authority, PNG

APTC staff are role models for our staff. Students feel the difference. Partner institution, Solomon Islands *APTC is providing quality training not available elsewhere in the country.* (Alumnus, PNG)

'There has been an improvement in the productivity of the workforce since the existence of APTC.' (Government authority, Samoa)

Where opposition to the APTC existed, the counter view expressed was that local institutions could provide the same quality standards if they had access to the same resources. However, one Vice-Chancellor stated that the university concerned could not have achieved the same result as APTC even if it had received the same level of resources.

6.3 What impact has the APTC had on education and training at partner institutions, (e.g. National University of Samoa and VIT Vanuatu); and TVET pathway models, (e.g. KIT and Don Bosco Honiara), also, the School of Health and Community Services, Suva, and University of the South Pacific?

The APTC has had considerable impact on education and training at partner institutions. Some of the main ways in which this has occurred are:

- vocational skills upgrading of partner institution staff
- upgrading of teaching methodologies, including delivery of the Certificate IV in Training and Assessment
- training delivery support
- implementation of pathways with APTC qualifications, including curriculum design and mapping
- upgrading of facilities and equipment
- planning, infrastructure and equipment advice
- TVET quality systems support
- leadership and governance development and support
- joint delivery (Solomon Islands, Fiji).

Further details are outlined in Attachment 3. The following brief institutional snapshots illustrate this impact.

#### National University of Samoa (NUS)

The longest-standing institutional partnership is with NUS. In 2007, the Government of Australia and the Government of Samoa signed an agreement to establish the APTC in Samoa. As a result, an APTC campus was built adjacent to NUS with the parties agreeing to avoid duplication. New facilities established by APTC include commercial kitchens and a training restaurant, workshops to conduct training in the plumbing, metal fabrication and air-conditioning and refrigeration trades to the Australian Certificate III standard; computer laboratories; and associated general and theory classrooms.

The Vice-Chancellor expressed the view that the relationship was close and that it had brought many benefits to staff and students, such as demonstrating training at a higher level, providing training for NUS staff, lifting the status of TVET in the minds of the community and bringing students from other countries onto the campus.

Source: Review team interview with Vice-Chancellor

### Don Bosco Technical Institute (DBTI), Solomon Islands

The APTC/DBTI partnership is the most recent one to be established. DBTI caters for students from generally poor families with limited opportunity for vocational training. The partnership involves the upgrading of the automotive and construction workshops and joint delivery of Certificate II level programs by Australian and national staff. Successful students will have a pathway opportunity by applying for an APTC scholarship to complete level III.

A critical component of the partnership is supporting the pathway through *joint delivery* as a means of up-skilling DBTI staff. This occurs in a staged approach. It starts with the APTC trainer identifying the skills of the DBTI tutor so that these can be complemented in the training program. The DBTI tutor then participates in the classes as both a tutor and a student. After a number of weeks, the DBTI tutor takes over the class in a review of the previous weeks' training content. An assessment by the APTC trainer of the skills and knowledge of the training package demonstrated by the DBTI tutor allows feedback on areas for improvement to be given. By this time, the DBTI tutor can take over a group for practical training in the workshop. Progressively, the APTC trainer coaches the DBTI tutor in the elements of compliance with Australian standards, such as assessment processes, feedback to and from students and documentation.

Source: Review team consultation with DBTI and APTC staff

#### Kiribati Institute of Technology (KIT)

The first group of KIT students to be awarded APTC scholarships had completed the Australian Certificate II in Construction at KIT. This had taken 18 months, as many students (aged 35 and below) needed various forms of support.

Scholarships were granted for students to undertake the Certificate III, which was completed in five months full-time with a 100 per cent pass rate. Subsequently all students gained jobs, many with a New Zealand company working in Kiribati on a major road construction project. The company regarded the students as 'work ready'.

A tracer study of 11 graduates 10 months later revealed that 15 were still working and nearly all were earning a good salary by Kiribati standards. Of the remaining five that did not make the survey, four were reported to be working and one unemployed by choice. Three of the graduates (including one female) are working as trade teachers in respective secondary schools. Having trade-qualified people teaching in the schools is regarded as a successful outcome.

Subsequently, a second group of 15 KIT Certificate II graduates recently completed the Certificate III in Carpentry at APTC. This means that 31 young I-Kiribati have completed this pathway. One has a job with APTC as the Carpentry Storeperson while two have temporary government work. The resumes of the remaining 13 have been submitted for jobs supporting a new donor-funded housing project at Bairiki.

Source: Interview by TVET specialist with Principal KIT

# 6.4 To what extent has APTC duplicated the training of local/national training providers, or undermined local training capacity?

APTC was established in such a way as to avoid competition with local providers. It was acknowledged by partner institutions during the field visits that this goal has essentially been achieved. As outlined above, there is an over-riding view that APTC has introduced training at a higher level than that previously available in the Pacific, which sets a benchmark for quality and therefore a unique standard.

Moreover, APTC has a clear policy of not poaching staff from existing local and partner institutions as this would undermine their capacity. Instead, APTC provides upgrading training for local training staff.

If anything, there is emerging evidence of other providers duplicating APTC, especially in Fiji. With Certificate IV in Training and Assessment gaining momentum as a fee-forservice product, other providers are seeing it as an opportunity. They are sending staff to APTC to undertake the TAE training and either developing their own version of the same course or adapting existing courses designed for TVET staff to incorporate aspects of the TAE qualification. This may cause some initial problems of qualification parity, but it shows the impact APTC is having in the Pacific.

# **Attachments:**

- 1. Overview of RTO audit schedules
- 2. The future of APTC scholarships
- 3. APTC engagement with the Pacific TVET sector

# Attachment 1 to Annex 6: Overview of RTO Audit Schedules – Stage II

S	chool of Hospitality and Community Services – Box Hill Institute	
Date	Course	Country
December 2012	SIT30807 Certificate III in Hospitality (Commercial Cookery) SIT30707 Certificate III in Hospitality CHC30708 Certificate III in Children's Services CHC30208 Cert III in Aged Care/CHC30308 Cert III in Home and Community Care	Fiji
May 2013	SIT30707 Certificate III in Hospitality SIT30107 Certificate III in Tourism CHC50612 Diploma of Community Services CHC30712 Certificate III in Children's Services	Vanuatu
May 2013	CHC30412 Certificate III in Disability SIT30707 Certificate III in Hospitality CHC30712 Certificate III in Children's Services SIT30107 Certificate III in Tourism HLTFA301B Apply first aid	Samoa
July 2014	SIT30713 Certificate III in Hospitality SIT30813 Certificate III in Commercial Cookery TAE40110 Certificate IV in Training and Assessment	Samoa
July 2014	SIT30813 Certificate III in Commercial Cookery CHC41812 Certificate IV in Youth Work TAE50111 Diploma of Vocational Education and Training	Fiji
November 2014	SIT30112 Certificate III in Tourism CHC40808 Certificate III in Community Development SIT30713 Certificate III in Hospitality	Vanuatu
November 2014	SIT30713 Certificate III in Hospitality TAE40110 Certificate IV in Training and Assessment	PNG
	19 audits to end August 2014	

School of Trades and Technology – TAFE Queensland East Coast					
Trade	Fiji	PNG			
Automotive	14/08/2012	05/04/2013			
	13/02/2014	30/08/2013			
Carpentry	10/08/2012	03/04/2013			
	-	30/08/2013			
Diesel Fitting	15/08/2012	01/07/2013			
	06/03/2014	-			
Electrical	24/05/2013	27/10/2011			
	-	24/05/2013			
	-	02/07/2013			
Fitting and Machining	15/08/2012	-			
	04/07/2013	-			
Metal Fabrication	-	02/07/2013			
Painting and Decorating	26/04/12	-			
	16/08/2012	-			
Wall and Floor Tiling	10/08/2012	-			
20 audits to end August 2014					

# Attachment 2 to Annex 6: The future of APTC scholarships

## 1. Introduction

The terms of reference for the evaluation require specific consideration of future options for APTC scholarships:

APTC Scholarships has always been run separately from all the other Aid Program Scholarships. Opportunities for collaboration going forward are to be considered. (Terms of Reference, p.4)

This attachment specifically addresses this issue.

### 2. The current situation

APTC awards its own scholarships within a scholarship policy based on the requirements of the Scope of Services. APTC is required to manage the scholarships in a way that maximises 'opportunities for students from all PIF countries to access and successfully complete APTC qualifications with a particular focus on redressing gender, isolation and income discrimination'. (Scope of Services, component 4)

Annex 4 provides details about the outcomes of the administration of the scholarships to date which show that:

- 50 per cent of scholarship applicants were awarded a scholarship (Table 3.1.1) within a context where eligibility requirements are applied rigorously (61 per cent of all applicants were deemed eligible after testing for language, literacy and numeracy and for vocational skills and knowledge)
- overall there has been a 90 per cent uptake of scholarships offered (Table 3.1.1).
- there is a 91 per cent completion rate of APTC entrants (Table 5.2.1a)
- percentages for males and females do not vary considerably on these measures.

These outcomes give a considerable degree of confidence that the scholarship program is well-managed.

# 3. Future opportunities for collaboration with other aid program scholarships

In considering any options for future collaboration with other aid program scholarships, it is important to recognise that the APTC scholarship program has many unique features which distinguish it from other scholarship programs. Salient ones are:

- Scholarship duration: The APTC scholarship scheme is structured differently from the core bilateral Australian Scholarships for the Pacific. They are shorter term, block structure, with flexible delivery modes and have labour mobility objectives. (Terms of Reference, APTC Independent Evaluation, p. 1)
- Target group: The Australia Awards Scholarship Programs cater for school leavers, undergraduates and graduates to complete higher level qualifications, whereas APTC scholarships cater for existing workers and new industry entrants adults being offered a 'second chance' for formal training at Certificate III level.
- Eligibility: The Australia Awards Scholarship Programs focus on academic ability, whereas APTC scholarships test for vocational knowledge and skills (VKS) and language, literacy and numeracy capability.
- Individualisation; The APTC scholarships take an individualised or 'casemanagement' approach to supporting access for scholarship recipients

depending on their home country and personal circumstances, with different allowances applying accordingly, whereas other scholarship programs tend to apply uniform criteria.

• Funding support: APTC aims to move towards a co-contribution arrangement to the cost of the tuition, either from individuals or employers, whereas the Australia Awards Scholarship Programs offer full financial support.

Two scholarship programs might have relevance when considering opportunities for collaboration with APTC: Australia Awards Scholarships and Australia Awards Pacific Scholarships.

### Australia Awards Scholarships

These scholarships provide opportunities for people from developing countries, particularly those countries located in the Indo-Pacific region, to undertake full-time undergraduate or postgraduate study at participating Australian universities and Technical and Further Education (TAFE) institutions. The study and research opportunities provided by Australia Awards Scholarships develop skills and knowledge of individuals to drive change and contribute to the development outcomes of their own country. A number of TAFE institutes are listed as participating institutions, including Box Hill Institute and several Queensland TAFE institutes. (Source: DFAT website.)

#### Australia Awards Pacific Scholarships

Australia Awards Pacific Scholarships are offered to people from the Pacific to study at Pacific tertiary institutions in Papua New Guinea, the Solomon Islands, Vanuatu, Fiji, Samoa and New Caledonia. The purpose of the scholarships is for people to gain knowledge and skills which will help the development of their home country. Scholarships are available to people from Fiji, Federated States of Micronesia, Kiribati, Marshall Islands, Nauru, Palau, PNG, Samoa, Solomon Islands Tonga, Tuvalu and Vanuatu. (Source: DFAT website.)

In theory, common administration of all Australian scholarships, including those of APTC, could yield efficiency. However, APTC scholarships are different from other programs in terms of duration, the target group, eligibility, individualisation and funding support. In practice, any administrative integration would therefore be likely to harm the effectiveness of APTC's scholarship program. Arguably APTC should maintain full control of its scholarship program, so that it has the flexibility to maintain the case management approach and to amend its scholarship policy as circumstances change.

However, there may be some other opportunities for collaboration.

- The Australia Awards Scholarship programs could be considered as a pathway for successful APTC graduates. Formal communication structures between the two programs might facilitate this process for the most successful APTC graduates. For example, a small number of scholarships could be set aside in the Australia Awards scholarships for successful APTC graduates to undertake further study in a participating RTO in Australia. The Australia Awards Pacific Scholarship program has less potential in this regard, because of the lack of high quality TVET providers in the Pacific.
- The eligibility requirements for the Australia Awards Pacific scholarships state that applicants must meet the meet specific eligibility criteria imposed by the government of the applicant's country of citizenship. If this has not already occurred, these requirements might be further explored on a country-by-country

basis to see whether they should be incorporated into APTC entry criteria, for example, if they relate to specific skill needs in those countries.

According to APTC, no discussions, either formal or informal have been held about linking the APTC scholarship program with either of the Australia Awards Scholarship programs.

#### 4. Conclusion

Based on the unique characteristics of the APTC scholarships, combining them with other scholarship programs such as the Australia Awards Scholarships is not recommended at this stage. However, DFAT could consider earmarking a number of Australia Awards Scholarships for further training in a participating institution in Australia as a means to establish a pathway for outstanding APTC graduates.

# Attachment 3 to Annex 6: APTC engagement with the Pacific TVET sector

### Overview

This attachment sets out to give a comprehensive picture of the current status of APTC's engagement with the TVET sector. This can be considered in three categories.

- 1. Engagement with partner institutions in campus countries, both formal and informal
- 2. Engagement with partner institutions in non-campus countries
- 3. Engagement with the wider TVET sector, principally through the support of the relevant Ministries and Government agencies.

The ways of engagement are interdependent and they illustrate that APTC is now deeply enmeshed in the Pacific TVET systems.

1. APTC engagement with partner institutions in campus countries – as outlined in formal agreements

The APTC has either a Letter of Agreement (LOA) or Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) with six partner institutions in the campus countries. A summary is outlined below. A commentary on the status of the partnership is included in each case.

SUMMARY	Fiji	PNG	Samoa	Solomon Is	Vanuatu
Sectors of focus					
Technical Institution		$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
University/Higher Education	$\checkmark$				
Private TVET (faith-based)	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$	

While the LOA/MOA states certain areas of cooperation and collaboration, in practice the partnership is often more comprehensive and informal, based on needs as they arise. Some of the many forms of collaboration are:

- vocational skills upgrading of partner institution staff, including industry placement
- upgrading of teaching methodologies, including delivery of the Certificate IV in Training and Assessment (TAE)
- training delivery support
- implementation of pathways with APTC qualifications, including curriculum design and mapping
- upgrading of facilities and equipment
- sharing of facilities and equipment
- planning, infrastructure and equipment advice
- TVET quality systems support, including the Quality Coaching Program (Vanuatu)
- leadership and governance development and support
- assisting providers with tendering proposals and processes (PNG)
- joint delivery (Solomon Islands, Fiji)
- joint funding of facilities development (PNG)
- student support, including accommodation.

#### FIJI

a) Partner Institution: Vivekananda Technical Centre (VTC)				
Sector	Private TVET – faith-based			
Description of partner	Established in 1981, Vivekananda Technical Centre (VTC) is owned and managed by Ramakrishna Mission, Fiji – a registered charitable organisation. VTC aims to provide quality and relevant vocation training to create employment opportunities for youth and to meet the needs of industry.			
Date of agreement	14.08.2013			
Date of termination	30.06.15			
MOA description of APTC support	<ul> <li>With a focus on Certificate II qualifications in Automotive Mechanical and Cookery: <ul> <li>Curriculum mapping and training delivery support</li> <li>Teaching methodologies, mentoring and experiences</li> <li>Staff training and development</li> <li>Equipment and infrastructure advice</li> <li>Joint training delivery</li> </ul> </li> </ul>			
APTC investment	Curriculum mapping and training delivery support Capability development Enhancement of facilities Communication and utilities costs <b>Total</b>	AUD 110,000 143,000 30,000 <u>8,000</u> 291,000		

The MOA with VTC is relatively new. The VTC is situated in farmlands and tends to attract students from farming families, many of whom are poor. Considerable upgrading of the hospitality kitchen and automotive mechanical workshop was underway at the time of the field visits.

National trainers were able to clearly articulate how their teaching practices had changed as a result of undertaking the Certificate IV in TAE as part of the MOA. Short-term Australian advisers were providing support in the two vocational areas.

b) Partner Institution: University of the South Pacific (USP)				
Sector	University			
Description of partner	Founded in 1968, USP serves the regional tertiary education needs of its 12 member countries in the Pacific, including four of the five APTC campus countries, namely Fiji, Samoa, Vanuatu and the Solomon Islands. USP offers education and training, research and consultancy services and technical expertise to its members.			
Date of agreement	February, 2014			
Date of termination	30.06.15			
MOA description of APTC support	<ul> <li>With an initial focus on Certificate III in Hospitality and Certificate III in Hospitality (Commercial Cookery): <ul> <li>Pathways to higher level qualifications</li> <li>TVET teaching methodologies, mentoring and experiences</li> <li>TVET staff training and development</li> <li>Industry specific equipment and infrastructure provision and/or advice</li> <li>Joint training delivery where applicable and agreed by both parties</li> <li>TVET quality systems support</li> <li>Course articulation and support for international accreditation.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>			
APTC investment	Capability development for TVET trainers Enhancement of training kitchen Direct training delivery Scholarship provision Student accommodation <b>Total</b>	AUD 30,000 250,000 430,000 300,000 <u>1,100,000</u> 2,110,000		

This partnership is also relatively new following the shift of hospitality training from Nadi to Suva. USP is in the process of building its TVET provision on a fee-for-service basis and mostly in low cost areas. The introduction of hospitality training is the first resource-intensive area of training to be introduced. Once established, the partnership will mostly involve parallel delivery with USP running its own programs under its own accreditation.

### **PAPUA NEW GUINEA**

The partnership involves both APTC-specific facilities on leased land and shared facilities with POMTECH that have been upgraded through APTC investment. A new jointly-funded automotive workshop designed for joint use was underway at the time of the field visit. An interesting feature of the partnership was support provided by APTC staff in proposal/tender writing which had assisted POMTECH to be successful in gaining funding for an urban youth employment program for 1000 students. This initiative also incorporated training in financial management and accountability. The Letter of Agreement (LOA) is an extension of an earlier one, signed in December 2008.

Partner Institution: Port Moresby Technical College (POMTECH)				
Sector	Technical Institution			
Description of partner	Port Moresby Technical College (POMTECH) is one of the two biggest government technical colleges in Papua New Guinea. Established in 1947 as a Technical Training Centre, Port Moresby Technical College is now one of the eight technical colleges in the country specialising in 10 trade areas.			
Date of agreement	02.06.2012			
Date of termination	30.06.15			
LOA description of APTC support	<ul> <li>Provision of resources and funding for:</li> <li>Payment for the lease of land upon which APTC facilities sit</li> <li>Payment for utilities and communication costs</li> <li>A contribution to the refurbishment of the POMTECH trades facilities which may include Automotive/Diesel and Engineering/Metals</li> <li>A contribution the an assets maintenance fund</li> <li>A contribution to a capacity building strategy in six key areas</li> <li>Site redevelopment plans</li> </ul>			
APTC investment	Lease of land Utilities Trade facilities refurbishment Asset maintenance Capacity-building Site redevelopment Staff housing (in-kind) <b>Total</b>	AUD 200,000 50,000 378,000 195,000 250,000 140,000 <u>450,000</u> <u>1,663,000</u>		

#### SAMOA

Partner Institution: National University of Samoa (NUS)				
Sector	University			
Description of partner	Established in 1984, the National University of Samoa (NUS) is the main tertiary institution in Samoa apart from the USP. 2006 saw the merger with the Samoan Institute of Technology so that NUS offers both higher education and TVET programs.			
Date of agreement	21.03.2012			
Date of termination	30.06.15			
LOA description of APTC support	<ul> <li>Collaboration on developing institution capability and capacity in areas such as:</li> <li>Leadership and governance support and development</li> <li>Staff training and development</li> <li>Facilities and equipment upgrades</li> <li>Student services and support, including accommodation (if applicable)</li> <li>Teaching methodologies, mentoring and experiences</li> <li>Curriculum design and development</li> </ul>			
APTC investment	AUD849,000			

Samoa was the first country to enter into a partnership with APTC. The current LOA is an extension of the first one, which was signed in December 2006. The partnership is now well established.

# **SOLOMON ISLANDS**

Partner Institution: Don Bosco Technical Institute (DBTI)					
Sector	Private TVET – faith-based	Private TVET – faith-based			
Description of partner	Based at Henderson, Honiara, Don Bosco Technical Institute is a Catholic school open to boys and girls ready to follow the discipline, commitment and hard work necessary to prepare themselves to work in the industry. Preference is given to technically inclined students who experience life's difficulties over academic achievers and to those who are ready to change.				
Date of agreement	02.05.2013				
Date of termination	30.06.15				
MOA description of APTC support	<ul> <li>Collaboration on developing institution capability and capacity in areas such as:</li> <li>Leadership and governance support and development</li> <li>Joint training delivery</li> <li>Staff training and development</li> <li>Facilities and equipment upgrades</li> <li>Student services and support, including accommodation</li> <li>Teaching methodologies, mentoring and experiences</li> <li>Curriculum design and development</li> </ul>				
APTC investment	Joint delivery and curriculum mapping Capability enhancement Enhancement of training facilities Enhancement of general facilities Student scholarships Communication and utilities costs <b>Total</b>	AUD 975,470 187,500 555,000 145,500 50,000 <u>176,030</u> <b>2,089,500</b>			

DBTI caters for students from generally poor families with limited opportunity for vocational training. Upgrading of the automotive and construction workshops and joint

delivery of Certificate II level programs by Australian and national staff has attracted increased numbers of students. Successful students will have the opportunity to apply for an APTC scholarship to complete level III.

# VANUATU

Partner Institution: Vanuatu Institute of Technology (VIT)				
Sector	Technical Institution			
Description of partner	Established in 2001, Vanuatu Institute of Technology (VIT) is the major Vanuatu government-funded bilingual tertiary institution. Located in Port Vila, VIT has a focus on providing students with relevant skills to enter the job market. As a nationally registered training provider, all courses are accredited under the Vanuatu National Training Council (VNTC).			
Date of agreement	01.07.2012			
Date of termination	30.06.15			
LOA description of APTC support	<ul> <li>30.06.15</li> <li>Collaboration on developing institution capability and capacity in areas such as: <ul> <li>Leadership and governance support and development</li> <li>Staff training and development</li> <li>Facilities and equipment upgrades</li> <li>Student services and support, including accommodation (if applicable)</li> <li>Teaching methodologies, mentoring and experiences</li> </ul> </li> </ul>			
APTC investment	AUD935,000			

This LOA is an extension of the first one, which was signed in September 2007. The partnership is now well-established.

# 2. APTC engagement with partner institutions in non-campus countries – as outlined in formal agreements

The APTC has either a Letter of Agreement (LOA) or Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) with three partner institutions in non-campus countries. A summary is outlined below. The LOA/MOA states certain areas of cooperation and collaboration, which are usually limited in nature. The evaluation team did not visit the non-campus countries.

SUMMARY	Kiribati	Palau	Tonga
Sectors of focus			
Community College		$\checkmark$	
Technical Institution	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$

### KIRIBATI

Partner: Kiribati Institute of Technology (KIT)									
Sector	Technical Institution								
Date of agreement	2012								
Date of termination	June 2015								
Areas of collaboration in LOA	<ul> <li>Competency based curriculum reform</li> <li>Contemporary teaching approaches for literacy and numeracy</li> <li>TVET teacher development</li> <li>Workforce development</li> <li>Quality management of TVET systems</li> <li>Monitoring, evaluation and applied TVET research</li> </ul>								
Financial arrangements	Generally 'in-kind' contributions from both parties. Individual development activities funded on a case-by-case basis.								

#### PALAU

Partner: Palau Community College (PCC)									
Sector	Community College								
Date of agreement	18.04.14								
Date of termination	June 2015								
Areas of collaboration in MOA	Collaboration on the delivery by APTC with support of PCC the Australian accredited Certificate III in Hospitality Program to 24 students from Palau from 7 April 2014 to 29 August 2014 to support the Pacific Forum Meeting.								
Financial arrangements	PCC Contribution: Access to facilities and equipment free of charge to APTC								
	APTC Contribution: Fee waiver (funded by the Australian Government through the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade) in lieu of venue provision								

### TONGA

Partner: Ahopanilolo Technical Institute (ATI)								
Technical Institution								
10.06.14								
e delivery by APTC with support of ATI the ed Certificate III in Aged Care/Home and rogram to 20 students from Tonga from 9 December 2014 to support the potential for lia.								
ccess to facilities and equipment free of charge : Fee waiver (funded by the Australian gh the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade) vision								

## 3. **APTC engagement with the wider TVET sector**

The main ways of working with the wider TVET sector are through support of the relevant Ministries and Government Agencies and through them to other providers.

The areas of engagement vary from country to country but include:

- alignment with government TVET planning (where available)
- assisting with development of qualifications frameworks
- assistance with implementation of quality, compliance processes
- assisting with training package/curriculum development
- participating in industry sector advisory bodies developing standards
- harmonising/mapping Australian and local qualifications
- achieving and maintaining registration as a local provider
- achieving and maintaining registration of trainers, where applicable
- harmonising training with the apprentice training systems
- serving on government agency boards and committees
- assisting with trade testing
- assisting with licencing arrangements
- assisting with development of legislation, policy, regulations
- providing skills upgrading on a fee-for-service basis
- providing updates on industry trends and training package changes in Australia.

# ANNEX 7: LABOUR MOBILITY

#### **Table of contents**

1	To what extent has APTC training enhanced access to regional and international labour markets, and why?	130
2	Incidence: APTC graduates take-up of Pacific regional and international employment	131
3	Age and migration	132
4	Differences between Stage I and II graduates	132
5	Reasons given for migration	132
6	Qualifications of APTC migrants	132
7	Is language a barrier to migration?	133
8	What were the major factors influencing APTC graduates choices?	133
9	Obstacles to migration	134
<b>10</b> 1(	<b>Changes in labour market demand</b>	135
1(	labour market turned out to be accurate?	135
1(	<ul><li>Demand for AFTC qualifications</li><li>D.3 What factors have changed, why and to what extent?</li></ul>	135
11	Supply factors: To what extent does APTC have the institutional capacity	127
1	1.1 Intention to migrate	137
11	1.2 Does APTC provide valid international qualifications?	138
12	To what extent were APTC students and graduates provided information, search skills and support for regional and international employment?	138
13	Support needed to achieve APTC's labour mobility objective	139
14	Conclusions	140
Att	achment to Annex 7: Identifying demand for APTC qualifications	143

# 1 To what extent has APTC training enhanced access to regional and international labour markets, and why?

Fewer than one-in-twenty APTC graduates have migrated to other countries in the Pacific or to high-income labour markets. This is confirmed by data from several sources. APTC has collected information on the number of its graduates who have migrated overseas.<sup>51</sup> Their destinations are mainly Australia and New Zealand but also other countries in the Pacific, as well as USA and Canada. The APTC count in June 2014 is 158 APTC graduates who have migrated overseas, which is 2.5 per cent of the 6211 APTC graduates to June 2014. However, this count does not include at least 25 APTC graduates from Papua New Guinea who migrated to Australia in 2011 and 2012. This increases the number of recorded APTC graduates who have migrated overseas at some stage to 180 or 2.9 per cent of APTC graduates to June 2014.

This migration rate is consistent with the 2013 NCVER's APTC Graduates Down the Track survey of Stage I graduates which found that 3.3 per cent had migrated to a different country. Detailed analysis of the APTC Past Student Tracer Survey also found that less than 3 per cent of graduates had migrated to Australia or New Zealand

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> The main source of information on APTC migrants is a database compiled by APTC based on data on graduates who have migrated. As well as information on country migrated to, and reason for migrating, the APTC database also has data on country of origin, sex, age, qualification, year of graduation, vocational skill and knowledge and language, literacy and numeracy test scores, whether employed before APTC and whether awarded a scholarship.

(Clemens, Graham and Howes 2014). However, the above calculation assumes all APTC graduates have an equal chance of migrating. As noted below, less than half of APTC graduates (46 per cent) are in an approved occupation or appropriate qualification level to be eligible to gain skilled migrant entry to Australia or New Zealand.<sup>52</sup> Also new industry entrants to APTC in eligible occupations may not have relevant or sufficient work experience to qualify for skill migrant entry. So time since graduation needs to be taken into account. The number of APTC graduates in approved occupations and eligible qualifications for the period from 2007 to the end of 2012 was 2598. Using this as the denominator, the number of APTC graduates who had migrated as a proportion of eligible APTC graduates from 2007 to end-2012 is 6.9 per cent.

# 2 Incidence: APTC graduates take-up of Pacific regional and international employment

Using the APTC database of graduates who have migrated, the destination countries for APTC migrants is shown in Table 7.1. Less than one per cent of APTC graduates have migrated to Australia, the largest regional labour market with the most opportunities for work for skilled migrants.

APTC migrants have made use of existing ties between specific Pacific countries and the main destination countries of Australia, New Zealand, Canada or the USA. In the case of the 69 APTC migrants in Australia, the largest numbers are from PNG (30), Vanuatu (15) and Fiji (14). The large number of PNG migrants in Australia is most likely due to close linkages of mining companies between both countries. The strong preference of APTC migrants for New Zealand reflects the greater strength of existing ties due to a large diaspora community and easier access for migrants from Samoa, Tonga and Fiji. Of the 51 APTC migrants in New Zealand, 22 are from Samoa, 10 are from Tonga and 10 are from Fiji.

Country of destination	%	Country of destination	%
Australia	38.3	Vanuatu	4.4
New Zealand	28.3	Other	2.8
Other Pacific countries	7.2	Canada	2.2
Samoa	5	PNG	2.2
USA	5		100
Fiji	4.4	Ν	180

#### Table 7.1: Country of destination of APTC migrants, June 2014 (%)

Source: APTC EMIS

The country of origin of APTC migrants needs to be compared with the country of origin of all APTC graduates. This comparison shows that APTC migrants from Fiji, Papua New Guinea, Solomon Islands, and Vanuatu are under-represented compared with their country's share of all APTC graduates. In contrast, APTC migrants from Samoa in particular are over-represented compared with their share of all APTC graduates. APTC migrants from Tonga, Marshall Islands, Kiribati and Tuvalu are also over-represented compared with their share of all APTC graduates. Two-in-five of APTC migrants are women; the balance between the sexes is the same as the profile of all APTC graduates.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> The proportion of graduates from Stage I in eligible occupations and the required qualification level is 49 per cent. In Stage II it is 42 per cent.

# 3 Age and migration

Apart from the barriers to migration, discussed below, the age of many APTC graduates may have been a disincentive to migrate. There is a stronger tendency for the 25–29 and 30–34 age groups to be migrants. Over half of the APTC migrants (54 per cent) are in these age groups compared with 44 per cent of all graduates. The specific age group with the strongest likelihood of migrating is 25–29 years (29 per cent of all migrants compared with 22 per cent of all graduates).

The high proportion of APTC graduates outside these prime ages for migration is one factor that may have discouraged the migration of many APTC graduates. Seven-in-ten enrolled students have been aged 30 years or more and close to half of the APTC have been aged over 35 years of age.

One factor that disposes the 25–34 year age group of APTC graduates to migrate is being an established existing employee with the savings to migrate. An existing employee in a junior position and lower end of the wage scale also has a strong economic incentive to migrate. This age group is also more likely to be married but with young children who are not yet settled in school. In contrast, APTC graduates in older age groups are much more likely to be settled and hence have a disincentive to migrate. They are likely to have a more senior position at work and earn a higher pay. Their children will be in higher levels at school and they and their families have ties which embed them more in the community. Younger APTC graduates also have a disincentive to migrate if they have had limited employment experience before APTC. This absence of an employment record or the savings makes it much harder for them to decide to migrate.

# 4 Differences between Stage I and II graduates

Three-out-of-four APTC migrants (75 per cent) are from Stage I and one-in-four are from Stage II. This compares with 57 per cent of APTC students in Stage I and 43 per cent to December 2013 in Stage II. The larger share of APTC migrants from Stage I may indicate that the decision to migrate increases with the length of time after graduation. This is consistent with the requirement in many cases for 'post qualification relevant employment' for skills-based migrant entry to Australia. It may also indicate that APTC gave more emphasis to the labour mobility objective in Stage I than in Stage II. This is suggested by the fact that the proportion of graduates from Stage I in eligible occupations and the required qualification level to migrate fell from 49 per cent to 42 per cent in Stage II.

# 5 Reasons given for migration

Employment is not the only reason for APTC graduates to migrate. Further study is also important, especially to New Zealand. The APTC database on graduates who have migrated only has information on reason for migration for two-out-of-three APTC migrants. Only three-in-five (62 per cent) APTC migrants have done so for employment reasons and one-in-three have migrated for further study. Of the APTC migrants who have gone to Australia, two-in-three have migrated for employment and a third for further study. However, for New Zealand a different pattern is evident. Near to three-in-five APTC migrants (57 per cent) have migrated for further study and only two-in-five (43 per cent) have migrated for employment.

# 6 Qualifications of APTC migrants

The largest number of APTC migrants has qualifications obtained in SHCS. However, this simply reflects the larger share of graduates from this School. More APTC graduates with trades-based qualifications have migrated compared with their share of APTC graduates (40 and 34 per cent respectively).

In terms of migration to Australia, the largest group is trades-based, accounting for nearly half (46 per cent) of the qualifications of APTC migrants to Australia. The next largest group has qualifications related to tourism and hospitality. Three qualifications, Certificates III in Tourism, Hospitality, and Hospitality (Supervision) account for over one-in-five (22 per cent) of the qualifications of all APTC migrants to Australia. These occupations are not eligible occupations for skilled migrant entry as a primary applicant. So these APTC graduates are not likely to have gained entry to work in Australia through the skilled migrant visa. This is despite the fact that employment was given as their reason for migrating.

In the case of APTC migrants going to New Zealand, the most common APTC qualification is the Certificate IV in Training and Assessment, accounting for one-in-five migrants. Most of these certificate holders (80 per cent) had further education as the reason for migrating. This may be due to the close ties with some countries such as Samoa and Tonga have with New Zealand educational institutions. The next largest group of the APTC migrants to New Zealand have qualifications related to hospitality including commercial cookery, hospitality, patisserie, and hospitality (supervision). The trades-based qualifications account for only one-in-four (27 per cent) of all APTC migrants to New Zealand.

# 7 Is language a barrier to migration?

APTC test scores for language ability show that APTC graduates with trade qualifications had a higher standard of English when they applied to APTC than other APTC applicants. In addition, APTC graduates who have migrated had a higher English score (and lower standard deviation around that score) when they applied to APTC compared to their peers. A higher standard of English prior to starting at APTC may be an important factor predisposing a trade-qualified APTC graduate to migrate.

# 8 What were the major factors influencing APTC graduates choices?

Three factors have a strong influence over the APTC graduate's decision to migrate. The first is the pull of diaspora in the destination country. Second is ease of access to the destination country and third is the role of intermediaries in facilitating the migration.

The size of the diaspora in the destination country is a strong pull factor. As noted above, Samoan APTC graduates are over-represented in the migrant stream compared with their share of all APTC graduates. The ease of entry for migrants from some Pacific countries to New Zealand, and via New Zealand, to Australia means APTC graduates from Samoa and Tonga are more likely to migrate to New Zealand. New Zealand's special Pacific Access Category visa for these countries also makes it much easier and cheaper to obtain entry, compared with the skilled-based entry requirements for Australia. The Pacific Access Category visa requires the applicant to have a job but there is no skill threshold requirement for this job offer. Samoa and Tonga have large diaspora in Australia, especially in light of their populations.<sup>53</sup>

In contrast, the lower share of APTC migrants to Australia from Solomon Islands in particular, followed by Papua New Guinea and Vanuatu reflect much lower historical migrant flows from these countries (Bedford and Hugo 2012, pp. 54–55). The obstacles facing migrants from the Melanesian countries are the reverse of those noted above. The first is the absence of a large diaspora from Solomon Islands and Vanuatu in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> The 2011 Australian Census shows that Samoa has the largest number of residents in Australia originally from the Pacific who identify as being Samoan numbering 55,846, followed by Tonga with 25,095 and Fiji with 23,768. Residents who identify as being from PNG number 15,462, Solomon Islands 1401 and Vanuatu 706. (See Richard Curtain, 2014, Labour mobility between the Pacific and Australia, Development Policy Centre, ANU, 4 June, Table 5, p. 6)

Australia.<sup>54</sup> The second obstacle is the lack of a special access visa and the difficulty of meeting the skilled migrant entry requirements. The case of PNG is different because it has a diaspora of some size in Australia and a recent significant number of migrants who have gained skilled migrant work in Australia (Filer et al 2013). The role of labour market intermediaries such as labour hire companies in the mining industry in both countries may be one factor in understanding how PNG skilled migrants overcame the obstacles to skilled migration faced by Solomon Islands and Vanuatu.

# 9 Obstacles to migration

The 2013 NCVER APTC Graduates Down the Track survey shows that just under one-in-ten APTC graduates from Stage I (8 per cent) had applied to migrate to another country for work and had been unsuccessful. Analysis undertaken for this review shows that Australia was the least successful country for APTC graduates, accounting for half of the unsuccessful applicants. In contrast, only four per cent of unsuccessful applicants had applied to migrate to New Zealand. The two most common reasons given for their lack of success were related to immigration requirements (47 per cent) and personal factors (36 per cent).

Half of the 174 APTC graduates (49 per cent) who were surveyed by the review team were planning to migrate for work to Australia, and three-in-ten (29 per cent) had taken steps to migrate. Half (48 per cent) of those planning to migrate for work to Australia or New Zealand said they planned to stay there for over five years, one-in-four for four to five years, and one-in-five for one to three years. A smaller number of graduates (94) were asked about actual steps taken to migrate to Australia. One-in-five graduates (22 per cent) had started to apply to migrate online, one-in-six (16 per cent) had asked for help from an immigration agent in Australia and only 7 per cent of graduates had completed the process successfully. Three-in-ten graduates had taken other steps.

Feedback was sought from those who wanted to migrate but encountered problems in applying to migrate. Some 68 APTC graduates gave details of the problems they had encountered. The greatest barrier they identified (34 per cent of the problems mentioned) was the lack of information or a suitable guide to turn to for help. The next two barriers were the cost or lack of finance to apply for a visa and the difficulty of applying for a visa (16 per cent respectively). The lack of a job offer was the next most important barrier identified (13 per cent of the responses), followed by lack of internet access (8 per cent). Other less prominent issues mentioned were: qualification not recognised for entry to Australia or New Zealand (5 per cent), lack of accommodation or contacts (6 per cent) and personal reasons (3 per cent).

Graduates were asked what steps they could take to overcome the problems they had encountered. The most prominent step they identified was to seek information from the APTC (28 per cent of all proposed steps). A further six per cent of the responses suggested that APTC could help them find a job overseas. Other sources of information referred to were the internet, and government officials from Australia or New Zealand. Some graduates suggested that the APTC alumni association could play a valuable role in providing information and guidance on how to apply to migrate.

However, only a few graduates were aware of the importance of getting a job offer first, and the need to have the required qualification level or appropriate work experience as basic requirements for approval to enter Australia or New Zealand as a skilled migrant.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> As noted in the footnote above.

# 10 Changes in labour market demand

# **10.1** To what extent have the original analysis and assumptions of the international labour market turned out to be accurate?

It is not clear what source was used to produce the original list of qualifications specified in the Stage I Scope of Services. The Australian Department of Immigration uses two skill shortages lists to identify approved occupations for skilled migrant entry: the Skilled Occupations List (SOL) and the Consolidated Sponsored Occupations List (CSOL).<sup>55</sup> The first list focuses on more specialised skills that are needed in the economy over the medium to longer term. The second list is applicable to the Temporary Work (Skilled) 457 visa, focuses on the current skill needs of employers, and is used to approve applications for Temporary Work (Skilled) visas (subclass 457). Information about the occupations of 457 visa holders since 2007 is used below to show Australian employer demand for occupations related to APTC qualifications.

## **10.2** Demand for APTC qualifications

APTC was conceived in 2006 when skilled labour shortages related to the mining sector and elsewhere in the economy were acute in Australia (ACCI 2007). Pacific employers and others may have seen the setting up of the APTC as a way to fill skill vacancies in Australia. However, labour demand in the mining sector has since cooled and skills are not in such high demand.

In general, data on the occupations of 457 visa holders between the first quarter of 2008 and first quarter of 2014 shows that one-in-five (20 per cent) are in trades-related occupations and only one per cent are in community and personal service worker occupations. The occupational profile of the permanent skill migration stream for the three years between financial year 2010/11 and 2012/13 shows a similar pattern. One-in-four (24 per cent) of the primary migrants in the permanent skilled migration stream over the three years to end of June 2013 had trades-related occupations. Only one per cent of the same skilled permanent migrants were community and personal service workers.

On this evidence, there is little demand for migrants with qualifications related to community or personal service. This includes occupations related to child and aged care, as well as in tourism and hospitality. In part, this is due to the fact that these occupations or related qualifications below diploma level are not approved for entry to Australia as skilled migrants. In the case of aged care, skilled entry requires migrants to have a relevant qualification at least at diploma level. The lack in PICs of suitable qualifications at this level may make it hard for potential migrants to meet this requirement. Also, this type of work compared with other areas of similar work, such as general nursing, may not be paid as well and hence less attractive to potential migrants.

### 10.3 What factors have changed, why and to what extent?

Since the original analysis for the design of the APTC in 2006, Australia's and New Zealand's skilled migration systems have become notably more employer-led and with a greater focus on access for skilled migrants on short-term visas. Australia's skilled migration program, particularly since 2009, has moved from 'supply-driven' independent skilled migration towards 'demand-driven' outcomes, in the form of employer and government-sponsored skilled migration. The objective of this demand-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> The Australian Department of Employment collects data on and publishes lists of skill shortages at the national and state and territory levels. However, this research does not quantify the extent of skill shortages because of the limited sample sizes of the surveys used in the analysis. There is a substantial overlap between the Department of Immigration & Border Protection's Consolidated Sponsored Occupation List and the Department of Employment's Indicative Skill Shortage Ratings. However, there are some skilled occupations in shortage that are not eligible for skilled migration visas. Examples relevant to the APTC qualifications are motor mechanic and child care worker.

led approach is to ensure that migrants go directly to jobs offered by employers in an approved occupation (Phillips and Spinks 2012; Cully 2011).

The significance of this greater reliance on employer selection in both countries has been highlighted by a comparative study of the migration systems of Australia and New Zealand: 'Employers in both countries have come to exert extraordinary influence on permanent as well as temporary entry flows' (Hawthorne 2011, p. 157). The study notes in particular that Australian employers in selecting migrants want migrants with high-level English language ability. They are also seeking people from comparable high-quality education systems, and who can fit into the workplace at speed.

This new emphasis on employer-led skill migration has been further strengthened with the introduction in 2012 of the Skilled Migrant Selection Model known as SkillSelect. The new selection system requires prospective applicants to submit an expression of interest before being invited to make a visa application by an employer or state or territory governments. The new selection system applies to both temporary and permanent employer-sponsored migrant visas.

A related change in the migration system is the growth in Temporary Work (Skilled) (457) visas. This growth has been described as 'one of the greatest changes in immigration patterns to Australia in the last decade' (Phillips 2013). Three aspects of the greater use of temporary work visas for migrant selection are worth noting. First, its high responsiveness to labour market need means that considerable benefits accrue not only to employers but also to the skilled migrant. Because employer-sponsored migrants go directly to jobs, they have a high employment rate in a job matched to their skill set and work experience (Department of Immigration and Border Protection, 2010, p. 5).

The second potential benefit to both the employer and skilled migrant is the chance for both parties to assess whether they want to make the job and move a permanent one. In the year to end-March 2014, one-in-three temporary visa holders applied for permanent residence (Department of Immigration and Border Protection, 2014, p. 2).

The third feature of the temporary skilled work visa pathway to work in Australia is that many 457 visa applications come from students and working holiday makers already in the country. In the year to end-March 2014, three-in-five applicants (58 per cent) for the temporary work visa were already in Australia (Department of Immigration and Border Protection, 2014, pp. 1–2).

New Zealand, in particular, has emphasised the importance of the two-step process of migrant selection: encouraging employers and migrants to use the temporary skilled work visa as a pathway to permanent migration. Over half of permanent migrants to New Zealand had a temporary work visa at some stage (OECD, 2014, p. 19).

The profile of approved occupations for skilled migrant entry has also changed since 2006. For example, the APTC Stage II Design noted the removal in May 2010 of hospitality and related occupations from the Skilled Occupation List for migration to Australia.

# 11 Supply factors: To what extent does APTC have the institutional capacity to train for regional and international markets?

## 11.1 Intention to migrate

Most APTC graduates want to migrate, one-in-four have a strong intention to do so and many have taken steps towards this. APTC graduates from Fiji, PNG and Solomon Islands, in particular plan to migrate. APTC graduates see their Australian-recognised qualification as making it easier for them to do this. Graduates with trade-based qualifications are more likely to have a strong intention to migrate.

In the 2013 NCVER APTC Graduates Down the Track survey, graduates were asked to rate on a five-point scale whether they agreed or disagreed with the statement: 'In the future, I intend to move country or region for work'. Most either agreed with the statement (60 per cent) or strongly agreed (25 per cent). As many as four-out-of-five APTC graduates from PNG (81 per cent) said they strongly agreed with the statement. Nearly half (46 per cent) of APTC graduates from Solomon Islands also strongly agreed with the statement.

Responses from the 174 APTC graduates who met the review team and responded to the questionnaire confirmed the findings above. Over half of APTC graduates surveyed (54 per cent) are planning to migrate for work to other Pacific countries in the region and another 22 per cent have taken steps to migrate. In relation to Australia, half of the APTC graduates surveyed (49 per cent) are planning to migrate for work and three-inten (29 per cent) have taken steps to migrate. Similar but lower proportions apply to the intentions of APTC graduates to migrate to New Zealand for work.

Responses from the 211 current APTC students on future plans after graduation showed that over a third of the students (37 per cent) said they would try to find a job in another country. Virtually every APTC graduate (98 per cent) who responded to 2013 'Graduates Down the Track' survey indicated that if they decided to migrate, their APTC qualification would make it easier for them to get a job. The qualifications of graduates who say they are mostly likely to migrate in the future are set out in Table 7.2. Graduates with trade-based qualifications are more likely to have a strong intention to migrate.

APTC qualification	%
Cert III Eng – Mechanical Trade	43
Cert III Painting/Decorating	38
Cert III Wall & Floor Tiling	36
Cert III Auto Mech Technology	35
Cert III Carpentry	33
Cert III Tourism	33
Cert IV Hospitality (supervision)	30
Cert III Hospitality (operations)	27
Cert III Children's Services	27

# Table 7.2: Qualifications of APTC graduates most likely to migrate(% for each qualification)

Source: NCVER APTC Graduates Down the Track survey, December 2013

- (based on percentage of each qualification giving a rating of five on a five-point scale of intention to move country or region)

# 11.2 Does APTC provide valid international qualifications?

APTC does provide valid international qualifications but many are not at a level which is sufficient to enter Australia or New Zealand as a skilled migrant. As noted above, APTC graduates see their qualification as giving them the chance to work in Australia and New Zealand. However, APTC has not provided eligible qualifications to enable most APTC graduates to migrate to work in Australia or New Zealand. The proportion of graduates from Stage I in eligible occupations and the required qualification level was 49 per cent. In Stage II it is even less – 42 per cent. New industry entrants also may be ineligible if they do not have relevant employment experience or a sufficient record of post-qualification employment.

Unlike the trades-based occupations of STT, most of the qualifications offered by SHCS are not at the required qualification level to gain skilled migrant entry to Australia. APTC graduates in the general or non-trades occupations with qualifications less than a diploma are not eligible to work in an approved occupation. VETASSESS, an Australian assessment agency which approves most migrants' qualifications at sub-degree level, informed the review that it has no scope to assess relevant work experience as a substitute for a qualification. The means that APTC qualifications at Certificate III or IV levels do not meet the requirements of approved non-trades occupations. The three APTC Level IV Certificates in Disability, in Youth Work and in Community Development are only of value to the assessment of relevant employment experience required for skilled migrant entry.

The only two qualifications offered by APTC that may meet the qualification threshold requirements of approved general occupations are the Diploma of Children's Services and the Diploma of Community Services Work. However, APTC is not offering the Diploma of Children's Services in the future after the current intake has graduated because the qualification has been superseded. The APTC will not offer the new Diploma of Early Childhood Education and Care because the facilities requirements cannot be met.

The Diploma of Management may meet the threshold requirement for a managerial position in accommodation and hospitality, cafe or restaurant manager, residential care or hair or beauty salon manager if it is combined with a relevant Certificate III or IV qualification and relevant work experience.

# 12 To what extent were APTC students and graduates provided information, search skills and support for regional and international employment?

Feedback from APTC students and graduates shows that APTC did not provide information on overseas job opportunities. The Stage II Scope of Services identifies the goals of the APTC-to-Work program as: 'to improve employment rates and productivity'. Specifically, the program is to show students how to identify employment opportunities and to help them apply for work 'domestically and overseas' (Para 5.21). APTC, in the specification for an internal review of the program, acknowledges this information gap by stating that the review is to look at including additional content such as migration information for APTC students (APTC 2014).

Responses to the review team's questionnaire showed that APTC did provide just over a majority of graduates with information about options for further study. However, in open-ended responses from graduates on suggestions to improve APTC, over one-third of the responses (37 per cent) related to requests for help to find work and one-in-five comments (21 per cent) related specifically to a request for help to find work overseas, usually in Australia. Another set of open-ended responses by graduates on problems encountered in applying to migrate showed that their biggest problem was the lack of information or a suitable guide to turn to for help. Graduates were also asked what steps they could take to overcome any problems they faced in seeking to migrate overseas. Seeking information from the APTC was the largest group of responses (28 per cent of all proposed steps). A further six per cent of the responses suggested that APTC should help them find a job overseas.

Current students were asked whether APTC had given them good information about where to find jobs with the skills they are getting at APTC. Near to three-in-four students (73 per cent) were satisfied, and two-in-five (43 per cent) were very satisfied. However, other responses indicated that some APTC students wanted more help to find work after graduating. In response to a request for suggestions on changes to improve APTC, two-thirds of the students provided open-ended responses. One-in-three responses from students (32 per cent) referred to the need for APTC to help them to find work, and one-in-five responses (20 per cent) specifically requested help from APTC to find work overseas.

# 13 Support needed to achieve APTC's labour mobility objective

Many Pacific employers see a conflict between the national and international focus of the APTC objective of helping Pacific Islander women and men with Australian qualifications realise improved employment opportunities. The employers who agree to release their employees to attend APTC and support them while they are students are entitled to have their investment protected. This principle should underpin APTC publicity about, and eligibility for, its support for APTC graduates to migrate overseas.

APTC, in the information it provides to students and graduates through the alumni network, should give due emphasis to the importance of a job offer from an Australian or New Zealand employer. Analysis of the open-ended responses of graduates on problems encountered in seeking to migrate show that few graduates surveyed by the review team realised the importance of this essential step in the migration process.

The most accessible way for most migrants with qualifications and work experience to apply to work in Australia and New Zealand is via a temporary skilled work visa. As noted above, this visa has become a pathway to permanent employment and residence. This means employers want to be involved directly in the selection process. Some employers, such as mining and construction companies in PNG, have direct experience of the standard of skills and work conditions of workers from the Pacific. However, many Australian employers do not have this background and so need the opportunity to gather first-hand knowledge of the capabilities of APTC graduates.

APTC graduates who want to migrate for work in Australia need information about the skills assessment process. Applicants for entry to work in Australia on a Temporary Work (Skilled) Visa (subclass 457) with trade-based Australian recognised qualifications do not have to have to undertake a skills assessment. They only need to submit evidence of their Australian qualification, relevant employment and undertake a technical interview. The interview assesses a person's employability skills based on 30 questions such as how do they plan their work day, and how they work safely. The latter can be conducted online or face-to-face interview and usually lasts for 30 minutes.

Problems may occur in assessing the relevance of type of employment and the extent of employment. Applicants may find it difficult to provide evidence of relevant employment. Asking for a letter from an employer can jeopardise an applicant's current position. So VETASSESS seeks other evidence such as pay slips. However, if pay slips are not available, other forms of evidence need to be presented. APTC also needs to inform especially new industry entrants about relevant employment requirements and need for evidence of this employment so that they respond appropriately if they need to. In some cases, Australian employers, due to enterprise agreements, may not recognise APTC qualifications. For 33 APTC graduates from Papua New Guinea seeking to work in Australia in 2011 and 2012, there was a lack of compatibility between their qualification (APTC Certificate III in Engineering Mechanical Trades – Fitting & Machining) and the requirements of the workplace they were recruited for (Mechanical Fitter). VETASSESS addressed this by giving the APTC qualified workers from PNG a skills assessment, using the recognition of prior learning (RPL) process to give them a qualification (fitter) which complied with the union requirements for a worksite. Labour hire companies in PNG played a key role in managing this process. APTC may need to offer to conduct a similar RPL process where an Australian employer does not recognise an APTC qualification, due to enterprise agreement requirements.

APTC graduates seeking to migrate to Australia need also to undertake a language test which is assessed separately to the qualification assessment process. Applicants for a work visa for all approved occupations below a certain high salary limit are required to show evidence of their proficiency in English.<sup>56</sup> The requirements are to meet an International English Language Testing System (IELTS) test score of at least 5 in each of the four test components of speaking, reading, writing and listening. The cost of this test is AUD330. APTC assesses and rates the English language capability of all applicants and puts considerable resources into helping students lift their language, literacy and numeracy skills. A valuable post-test of the improved English language capability of graduates would be for APTC to conduct the IELTS test.

APTC graduates wanting to migrate for work to Australia need also be informed about the required character and health checks. To obtain the required evidence for the health check may involve some expense and advance planning. In the case of PNG applicants, for example, this requires obtaining a digital chest x-ray report to provide evidence of the absence of TB. The review team was told that obtaining this x-ray was expensive and only available from one location in Port Moresby.

In summary, there are a number of potential ways APTC could help graduates interested in using their qualifications to work in Australia or New Zealand.

APTC needs to state on its website which of the qualifications it offers are eligible to work as a skilled migrant in Australia or New Zealand. APTC also should provide information on its website and via its teaching or support staff on how APTC graduates seeking to migrate to Australia have to undertake a number of steps to gaining a work visa in addition to obtaining an appropriate qualification. The APTC website should also provide a link to the information about the skills assessment and other requirements for skilled migrant entry to Australia and New Zealand.

# 14 Conclusions

Few APTC graduates have migrated overseas and only a minority of those who did so came via skilled migrant entry. In large part, this is due to APTC's lack of promotion of its labour mobility objective. Another key obstacle is graduates' lack of information on a range of issues. These relate to what qualifications are eligible, work experience and English language requirements and the importance of having a job offer. Graduates also lack information about what eligible occupations are in demand in Australia or New Zealand. For example, how many graduates know that there is little demand for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Exemptions to this language requirement are granted to passport holders from Canada, United States of America, United Kingdom, Republic of Ireland and New Zealand. Exemptions are also granted to applicants who can provide evidence that they have completed at least five consecutive years of full-time study in a secondary and/or higher education institution where the instruction was delivered in English.

migrants with qualifications related to community or personal service? This includes occupations related to child and aged care as well as in tourism and hospitality.

However, despite a lack of promotion by APTC, most students and graduates believe, not unreasonably, that APTC is giving them the means to migrate to Australia or New Zealand. The fact that this is not the case for a majority of students and graduates needs to be corrected as soon as possible. APTC, as a matter of urgency and good practice, should provide more information on its website about its qualifications and the migration process to prospective and current students as well as to graduates. The APTC brand and reputation and, indeed that of the Australian aid program, is at risk of being accused of allowing a widespread impression to exist without correcting it.

Prospective students need to be given information about the link – or lack of it – between specific Australian qualifications that APTC offers and migration for work to Australia or New Zealand. Information should be provided also on the additional Australian regulatory requirements for trade-based qualifications in electrical, plumbing and refrigeration and air conditioning. The APTC website should also provide a link to the information about the skills assessment and other requirements for skilled migrant entry to Australia and New Zealand.

APTC should provide, as part of the APTC-to-Work program and within existing resources, information to current students and through alumni networks to graduates. This information should include:

- details of the eligible qualifications for different types of skilled entry to Australia and New Zealand
- for new industry entrants in particular, details of the requirements for relevant employment/work experience needed for the migrant skills assessment process and the type of evidence needed
- up-to-date advice on trends in employer demand in Australia and New Zealand based on the occupations of migrants, especially those on temporary work visas, based on publicly available data from the websites of immigration authorities in each country
- advice to students and graduates on the costs involved for each step in the migration process.

APTC should change its focus from delivering merely outputs in the form of qualifications to delivering employment outcomes: the placement of graduates in jobs matched to their skills and consistent with their realistic preference. This requires the APTC-to-Work tutor to set up and maintain a database of employers and to take an active role in matching unemployed graduates to available jobs. It should also include ensuring unemployed students are given work placements with employers who want to employ APTC graduates. A focus on graduate outcomes should also include support based on publicly available information for eligible graduates to migrate. Not eligible for this support should be graduates who are working for the same employer and who were supported by that employer during their time at APTC.

The support APTC could offer should include conducting the IELTS test for students on request near to or after graduation. This can be justified as a quality measure to provide as an external assessment of the language support given to students during their training. Where students just fail to meet this external standard, APTC should provide, if requested, additional support through existing LLN staff to help students meet this standard. This support may need to be on a fee-for-service basis.

APTC should invite, through relevant industry associations, employers from Australia, New Zealand and PNG to visit APTC campuses and industry partner workplaces. This is to allow employers to assess for themselves the enthusiasm of the students, the quality of the training and the performance standards of work-based qualifications. Employers should also be invited to select and interview job applicants from a pool of eligible graduates who want to migrate, with eligibility limited to those not with the same employer prior to their training and not sponsored by that employer during their training.

APTC-to-Work tutors, as part of their role in placing graduates in appropriate jobs, could offer to be the contact point for employers from Australia, New Zealand or PNG who wish to offer a job to an APTC graduate based on their performance while at APTC. APTC trainers should be encouraged to offer employers endorsements of specific eligible graduates. APTC should also offer to be a host venue for the conduct of technical interviews by VETASSESS by Skype and conduct RPL assessments where these are required.

# ATTACHMENT TO ANNEX 7: IDENTIFYING DEMAND FOR APTC QUALIFICATIONS

Number of eligible APTC qualifications for skilled entry to Australia compared with number of primary temporary visa holders (457 visas) in matched occupations approved in each specified period, mid-2008 to end-2013

ANZSCO occupations for temporary work visa (457) & APTC qualification	30-Jun- 08	31-Dec- 08	30-Jun- 09	31-Dec- 09	30-Jun- 10	31-Dec- 10	30-Jun- 11	31-Dec- 11	30-Jun- 12	31-Dec- 12	30-Jun- 13	31-Dec- 13
Carpenter	807	879	992	797	905	886	1193	1289	2084	2181	3325	2876
Certificate III in Carpentry	37	28	54	46	63	81	50	27	10	3	153	91
Commercial Cook	3817	3858	3650	3199	2655	2336	2211	2692	3753	5692	8059	10,423
Certificate III in Hospitality (Commercial Cookery)	54	59	38	71	70	61	42		26	32	53	49
Diesel mechanic	19	31	46	57	66	128	344	612	1242	1711	2176	2031
Certificate III in Engineering – Mechanical Trade (Diesel Fitter)	47		29	122	47	1	40	25		1	99	28
Metal Fabricator	3175	3135	3170	2303	2109	1587	1550	1225	1700	1627	2003	1620
Certificate III in Engineering – Fabrication Trade	23	20	59	1	42	1	26	34		7	64	21
Fitter (General)	2287	2466	2554	1975	1835	1559	1441	1244	1722	1628	1844	1516
Certificate III in Engineering – Mechanical Trade (Fitting & Machining)	22	27	57	8	38	16	-	6	10	3	83	5
Electrician (General)	804	825	865	711	690	671	878	1014	1530	1650	2161	1725
Certificate III in Electrotechnology	57	76		14		13	12	24		4	83	·
Painting Trades Worker	369	450	439	364	380	317	340	374	474	565	781	743

Certificate III in Painting & Decorating	19	2	32	31	16	41		28	2	1	60	
Community worker	34	46	56	53	63	71	82	96	129	147	186	182
Diploma of Community Services Work			19	19		24		43		20	20	
Wall & Floor Tiler	275	300	270	207	207	207	218	219	289	313	355	368
Certificate III in Wall & Floor Tiling	15	7	7	7	3	18	9	17		1	46	15
Pastry cook	289	319	303	265	239	252	276	309	459	689	950	1207
Certificate III in Patisserie			16	16	16	7	16		23	14	13	2
Hairdresser	608	627	638	572	500	461	448	558	676	882	1264	1566
Certificate III in Hairdressing			15		14	12	13	15	10	16	12	30
Residential Care Officer	329	302	281	215	189	166	150	105	111	133	175	203
Diploma of Children's Services (Early Childhood Educ & Care)				21	25	2	24		15			25
Plumber (General)	140	150	153	127	161	182	269	265	399	443	617	497
Certificate III in Plumbing	3	14	18		1		11	9			13	48
Air-conditioning & Refrigeration Mechanic	322	371	375	290	285	257	251	267	322	339	387	364
Certificate III in Engineering – Mechanical Trade (Refrigeration & Air-conditioning)	22			17	16		13	7		8	19	25
Diploma of Management							18			6		20
Source: 457 visa holders quarterly pivot table 2014-03-31.xlsx, Australian Department of Immigration & Border Protection												
### ANNEX 8: IMPACT ON GRADUATES AND EMPLOYERS

### Table of contents

1	Evidence of APTC impact on graduates	146
<b>2</b> 2.1	Employment rates by qualification Current employment status of APTC graduates	<b>146</b> 149
3	Assessing the demand for APTC qualifications	150
<b>4</b> 4.1 4.2 4.3 4.4 4.5	Estimating the demand for APTC graduates Employer demand for APTC qualifications? A direct measure of skill shortages To what extent have graduates been employed in the same field as trained? What are the wage levels of graduates, before and after APTC training? Evidence on job satisfaction, stability or promotions	<b>150</b> 152 152 154 155 155
<b>5</b> 5.1 5.1.	<ul> <li>Evidence of APTC impact from employers</li></ul>	<b>155</b> 156 156
5.1. 5.1.	<ul> <li>2 In relation to good work habits</li> <li>3 To what extent have APTC graduates trained co-workers and introduced new technologies?</li> </ul>	156 156
6	Were APTC graduates hired on the same or different salaries as others?	156
7	How productive are APTC graduates compared with others with same qualifications?	156
8	The value to employers of APTC graduates	158
9	Conclusions	159
Atta	achment 1 to Annex 8: Program evaluation	161

#### List of tables

Table 8.1: Proportion of Stage I APTC graduates by qualification not in the same job before APTC who are employed 2007– lune 2011 (%)	47
Table 8.2: Proportion of Stage II APTC past students by qualification now not in employment and in other than full-time work one year after graduation, proportion of enrolled students by qualification employed before starting APTC	48
Table 8.3: Proportion of APTC graduates by qualification not with the same employer prior to APTC who are not working now June-August 2014 (%)	49
Table 8.4: Comparison of the supply of APTC graduates 2007–2013 and number of available jobs in Fiji, Kiribati, Nauru, Samoa, Solomon Islands, Tonga, Tuvalu and	
Vanuatu, 2009–2012	51
Table 8.5: Numbers of APTC graduates from Fiji compared with the numbers of job-holders in relevant occupations, Fiji 2011	51
Table 8.6: Number of foreign workers in selected occupation groups, Fiji, Kiribati, Nauru, PNG, Samoa, Solomon Islands, Tonga, Tuvalu and Vanuatu, 2009–2012	53
Table 8.7: Estimates of the need for post-school qualifications in skill-based occupations in Fiji, Kiribati, Nauru, Samoa, Solomon Islands, Tonga, Tuvalu and Vanuatu, based on low, middle and high-end estimates, 2009–2012	53
Table 8.8: Response of employers of APTC graduates by type of employer to the question: 'What impact has APTC training had on the productivity or overall performance of your business?', 2012 and 2013 (%)	57
Table 8.9: Type of impact on business for respondents who say impact of APTC training is positive, by type of employer (%)       15	57

### **1** Evidence of APTC impact on graduates

Three main data sources are available on the employment outcomes of APTC graduates. The tracer surveys are not sample surveys. The populations they surveyed are of all eligible graduates. The first is the NCVER 2013 APTC Graduates Down the Track survey of Stage I graduates. The total population surveyed was 4804 graduates and the response rate was 19 per cent, numbering 904 responses. The second main data source is the combined results of the APTC Past Student Tracer Surveys July 2011–May 2014. The latter surveys have an overall response rate of 20 per cent for the total population of Stage II graduates, numbering 1149 responses. The third data source is the survey of 174 APTC graduates conducted by the review team, based on those who responded to an invitation sent out on social media and by email for the graduates to meet with the review team. Each of these surveys has limitations, as explained below. However, the availability of three separate data sources on graduates and two on employers of graduates enables more robust conclusions to be drawn from the findings than reliance on only one source of data allows.

The likelihood of bias from low response rates is confirmed by a comparison of countries of origin of the respondents with the total population. In the NCVER APTC Graduates Down the Track survey, only four per cent of PNG graduates have been surveyed compared with 25 per cent of enrolled students in Stage I being from PNG. In contrast, Samoan graduates are over-represented in the survey (25 per cent compared with 12 per cent in the Stage I student population). In the combined APTC Past Student Surveys, Vanuatu and Samoa are over-represented (24 and 17 per cent respectively compared with 16 and 12 per cent, respectively, in the Stage II population). Solomon Islands is under-represented in the survey results (seven per cent compared with 14 per cent in the total Stage II population). The review team survey of graduates is also unrepresentative of Stage II students in relation to country of origin as PNG students account for 58 per cent of responses and only 19 per cent of the Stage II student population.

The relatively small number of responses for each survey also means that the response rates by qualification vary greatly. The low number for many qualifications meant that further breakdown by gender of the graduate, where available, was not possible. In the NCVER APTC Graduates Down the Track survey, the response rate for the total number of graduates in each qualification ranges from 33 per cent to 7 per cent. In the APTC Past Student Tracer Surveys, the response rates by qualification rate vary from 100 per cent to 5 per cent. The results on employment outcomes presented below also include the response rates for each qualification. These varying response rates mean in many cases it is not possible from specific surveys to reliably identify employment outcomes by qualification. However, it is possible to identify broad patterns of demand for types of qualifications from the two sets of surveys and the reviewer's survey of graduates.

### 2 Employment rates by qualification

According to the 2013 Graduates Down the Track survey, 96 per cent of Stage I graduates are in employment (either in a wage job or own business). However, nearly half of the graduates surveyed (46 per cent) are still in the same job they were in before they started their training at APTC. This means that just over half of APTC graduates (54 per cent) are in a new job. Table 8.1 presents data on the employment rates of graduates not in the same job before APTC.

Several qualifications have notably higher not-employed rates. One third of graduates in Certificate III in Hospitality (Patisserie) not with the same employer are not employed, although the response rate for this qualification is low. Graduates in the trades-based qualifications are not exempt from being out of work. As many as

17 per cent of graduates with a Certificate III Engineering – Mechanical Fitting not now with the same employer are not in employment. One-in-six graduates in Certificate III in Children's Services not with the same employer are not now employed. Graduates in Certificate III in Wall and Floor Tiling, Plumbing and Carpentry also have above average not-in-employment rates.

APTC qualification	Not employed %	Response rate for all graduates in qualification %
Certificate III in Hospitality - Patisserie	33	9
Cert III Engineering - Mechanical Fitting	17	19
Certificate III in Children's Services	14	30
Certificate III in Wall and Floor Tiling	14	33
Certificate III in Plumbing	14	47
Certificate IV in Training and Assessment	14	26
Certificate III in Carpentry	11	19
Certificate IV in Hospitality (Supervision)	8	19
Certificate III in Painting/Decorating	7	16

### Table 8.1: Proportion of Stage I APTC graduates by qualification not in the samejob before APTC who are employed, 2007–June 2011 (%)

Source: NCVER APTC Graduates Down the Track survey, December 2013, response rate by qualification for the tracer survey based on total number of graduates by qualification in Stage I.

Being in employment does not say anything about whether that job provides an adequate income. Most Stage I graduates in employment (84 per cent) agreed with the statement that 'I am able to support myself and my family well'. One-in-ten Stage I APTC graduates (10 per cent) could not identify a benefit or stated a negative outcome since completing APTC training. Some 14 per cent agreed with the statement that 'I find it difficult to earn enough to support myself and my family' while only one per cent agreed that 'I cannot earn anywhere near enough to support myself and my family'. However, for those still in the same job, as many as one-in-five APTC graduates (20 per cent) found it difficult or very difficult to 'earn enough to support myself and my family well'. This result compared with one-in-ten of APTC graduates (12 per cent) in a new job.

The APTC Past Student Tracer Surveys July 2011–May 2014 did not ask whether graduates were still in the same job or not. However, it is clear from data on a student's prior employment status, available separately from the EMIS, that this differed widely between qualifications. Table 8.2 below reports the proportions of graduates not in employment and in other than full-time work at the time the surveys were conducted, and the combined proportion not in full-time work or any work at all. The table also reports the proportion of enrolled students by qualification who were employed before starting their APTC course. This evidence of employment outcomes by qualification is indicative. It has not been possible to link an individual's prior employment status with their post-graduation employment status. The last column reports the response rate for the tracer survey based on the total number of graduates in each listed qualification.

Table 8.2: Proportion of Stage II APTC past students by qualification now not in employment and in other than full-time work one year after graduation, proportion of enrolled students by qualification employed before starting APTC, July 2011–May 2014 (%)

APTC qualification	Not employed %	Other than FT work %	No work or less than FT work	Employed prior to APTC %	Response rate for all graduates in qualification %
Wall & Floor Tiling	38	25	63	42	5
Youth Work	27	13	40	60	13
Aged Care	25	25	50	61	11
Tourism	15	4	19	63	37
Fabrication Welding/ Boilermaking	14	18	32	61	11
Painting & Decorating	12	44	56	55	13
Diploma Children's Services	11	11	22	84	14
Hospitality Supervision	9	2	11	66	33
Hospitality Operations	8	3	11	63	40
Diploma of Management	8	0	8	91	24
Community Services	0	25	25	88	100
Disability	0	9	9	79	30

Source: APTC Past Student Tracer Surveys July 2011–May 2014, response rate by qualification for the tracer survey based on total number of graduates by qualification in Stage II

Table 8.2 above shows a range of employment outcomes for each qualification. In particular, high levels of not employed and in less than full-time work (see column 3) are evident for graduates with Certificates III in Wall and Floor Tiling, Painting/ Decorating, Aged Care, Youth Work, Fabrication Welding/Boilermaking, Community Services, Tourism and the Diploma of Children's Services.

However, even in these difficult labour market conditions, how have APTC graduates performed? The fourth column shows that many students were not in paid work when they started their training for most of these qualifications. A comparison of the employment rates before (the reverse of column 1) and after graduation (column 4) shows that in all instances there has been an improvement in the employment rates after APTC training. Improvements in employment rates of between 42 and 30 percentage points are evident for past students in hairdressing, carpentry, automotive mechanical, painting and decorating, mechanical fitting and machining, and training and assessment. Even with the past students in Certificate III in Wall and Floor Tiling who were mostly not in paid work before APTC, there is an improvement of 20 percentage points in their employment rate after graduation. Similarly, with the graduates of the Certificate III in Tourism, there is an improvement of 22 percentage points in their post-graduation employment rate.

### 2.1 Current employment status of APTC graduates

One-in-six of the graduates (15 per cent) who met with the review team and responded to the questionnaire are not now working. This high proportion of graduates not working reflects in particular labour market conditions in PNG for specific qualifications.

The employment status of graduates prior to APTC has a big impact on whether they are now working or not. Of those employed before starting at APTC, 88 per cent are now in work and 12 per cent are not now working. However, for those not working before APTC, only two-in-five (40 per cent) are now working and three-in-five (60 per cent) are not now working.

As many as 94 per cent were employed before APTC but only half (48 per cent) are still with the same employer after graduation. Some graduates had to leave their jobs to start their APTC training. Of those employed before APTC, three-in-five (62 per cent) continued in work and two-in-five were not in work while they were students. Overall just over one-in-four graduates not with the same employer are not now working. However, the proportion of graduates not in work varied greatly by qualification (see Table 8.3).

### Table 8.3: Proportion of APTC graduates by qualification not with the sameemployer prior to APTC who are not working now, June–August 2014 (%)

Qualification	Not employed %	N
Certificate IV in Youth Work	57	7
Certificate III in Children's Services	50	12
Certificate III in Hospitality Operations	50	4
Certificate III in Home and Community Care/Aged Care	50	2
Certificate III in Mechanical Trade (Fitting & Machining)	40	10
Certificate III in Fabrication Trade	40	5
Certificate III in Tourism	33	9
Certificate III in Community Services Work	33	3
Certificate III in Hospitality Supervision	29	7
Certificate III in Carpentry	10	10
Total	27	96

Source: Review Team Survey of APTC Graduates, June-August 2014

The qualifications with the highest proportion of graduates not with the same employer and out of work are: youth work, (57 per cent), children's services (50 per cent), hospitality operations (50 per cent), home and community care/aged care (50 per cent), mechanical trade (fitting & machining) (40 per cent), fabrication trade (40 per cent), tourism (33 per cent), community services work (33 per cent), hospitality supervision (29 per cent) and carpentry (10 per cent).

PNG and Fiji have the highest proportion of all graduates not working now (19 and 18 per cent respectively). If those graduates still working with the same employer are excluded, the proportion of graduates not working now increases to 38 per cent in Fiji and 33 per cent in PNG. The proportion not now in work in Solomon Islands is 10 per cent and 8 per cent in Samoa. All graduates who responded in Vanuatu are now working. In the absence of labour force data on employment rates by occupation, it is not possible to know whether these not-employed rates are high or low. However, the data do point to the need for APTC to play closer attention to collecting better data on,

and monitoring, employment rates by qualification. The APTC-to-Work program also needs to provide support to improve the employment outcomes of graduates with these qualifications.

### 3 Assessing the demand for APTC qualifications

Some patterns can be identified. Graduates in a number of qualifications focused on work in the community sector such as youth work, aged care, children's services and community services face difficult labour market conditions. There may also be a limited demand for diploma graduates in children's services.

Some qualifications serving the construction industry such as wall and floor tiling and painting and decorating may have a skills set which is too narrow in scope for smaller employers who are likely to need workers with a broader range of construction skills. A similar narrow scope of skills may also be limiting employment chances for graduates in patisserie. The demand for qualifications in hospitality and tourism may also be variable, depending on seasonal and other variable factors, especially in countries without a large tourist industry.

The varying proportions of graduates in less than full-time work in Table 8.3 provides other evidence of the limited opportunities for regular full-time work in industry sectors such as construction. The lack of regular work affects graduates in painting and decorating, and wall and floor tiling in particular, as well as metal fabrication and carpentry.

The labour market conditions facing graduates also differ by country. In Fiji and Solomon Islands, one-in-ten APTC past students were not in employment. Labour market conditions for APTC graduates in Kiribati are also difficult as one-in-four did not have paid work or were in casual or part-time work.

### 4 Estimating the demand for APTC graduates

Comparing the supply of APTC graduates with the economic demand for these graduates is a relatively simple one. As one of the purposes of the APTC training is to upgrade the skills of existing workers, an upper estimate of the size of the demand is the total number of workers in the relevant occupations.

Table 8.4 below presents a comparison of the fields of study of APTC graduates with the total number of jobs (also known as the stock of jobs) in related occupations for eight Pacific countries. Data for PNG at this level of disaggregation are not available. These data on occupations are based on different levels of detail about occupations in each country, so the aggregate data offer only broad brush information. However, it is possible to conclude that there is a danger of oversupply of skills in three sectors.

Supply: APTC graduates by field of study	Ν	Stock of jobs in related occupations, in selected Pacific countries	Ν	Ratio of supply to stock
Community services	1039	Community services	3463	3.3
Hairdressing	119	Hairdressing	1741	14.6
Tourism, travel & hospitality	2226	Tourism, travel & hospitality	13,451	6.0
Automotive retail, service & repair	297	Auto retail, service & repair	8794	29.6
Construction, plumbing & services	833	Construction, plumbing & services	28,905	34.7
Electrotechnology	195	Electrotechnology	3259	16.7
Metal & engineering	812	Metal & engineering	4628	5.7
Total	5521	Total	63,293	11.5

Table 8.4: Comparison of the supply of APTC graduates 2007–2013 and number of available jobs in Fiji, Kiribati, Nauru, Samoa, Solomon Islands, Tonga, Tuvalu and Vanuatu, 2009–2012

Source: Most recent country census or employment survey 2009-2012

Table 8.4 shows in the community services sector in particular, the stock of jobs is relatively small and the supply of APTC graduates in comparison has been high. This applies especially on a country-by-country basis as two-thirds of jobs in community services are concentrated in Fiji. Similar situations where the supply of APTC graduates is high compared to the total stock of jobs apply in the metal and engineering and tourism, travel and hospitality sectors. This also is the situation in the smaller countries, as Fiji accounts for many of the jobs in manufacturing and tourism, travel and hospitality.

The 2011 Fiji Survey of Employment and Unemployment results provide more detailed occupational data. These data are at a level where it is possible to align qualifications with relevant occupations. Table 8.5 below compares the number of APTC graduates from Fiji in each community services-related qualification with the estimated number of job-holders in the related occupations in Fiji. This comparison shows that number of APTC graduates in aged care is high compared with the stock of jobs in aged care.

APTC qualification, Fiji graduates	N	Stock of jobs Fiji 2011	N	Ratio of supply to stock
Certificate III in Children's Services	175	Worker, child care	1210	5.2
Diploma of Children's Services	59	Worker, child care	1219	5.2
Certificate III in Disability	14			
Certificate IV in Disability	43	Officer welfare	049	0.5
Certificate IV in Youth Work	21	Onicel, wenale	940	9.0
Diploma of Community Services Work	22			
Certificate III in Home & Community Care/Certificate III in Aged Care	43	Attendant, nursing/home	110	2.6
Total	377		2277	6.0

Table 8.5: Numbers of APTC graduates from Fiji compared with the numbers of job-holders in relevant occupations, Fiji 2011

Source: Fiji Survey of Employment & Unemployment 2011

Similarly, the numbers of APTC graduates in children's services and disability, youth work and community services may also be high compared with the stock of jobs. This comparison assumes that job turnover is low and that there is a limited employer demand for qualifications for existing workers in these sectors. The basis for the latter assumption is discussed below.

#### 4.1 Employer demand for APTC qualifications?

In all Pacific countries, a low proportion of existing workers have a post-school qualification. This applies even in skilled occupations such as mechanics, fitters and electricians where a post-school qualification would be expected in Australia and New Zealand. In Fiji in 2011, the proportion of carpenters with a post-school qualification is only one-in-ten; for plumbers, it is only two-in-five, and for electricians it is near to two-in-three. For metal fabricators, their post-school qualification rate is one-in-five and for welders it is two-in-five. Only two-in-five automobile mechanics have a post-school qualification, as do three-in-five diesel fitters and air conditioning mechanics. It is not clear, without surveying employers, what the extent of the demand for post-school qualifications is in these sectors. Employers may prefer to make do with specific skill sets to meet their needs, including a shorter time away from the workplace.

In the community sector, the demand for post-school qualifications may be at a higher qualification level than that provided by APTC. In Fiji in 2011, seven-in-ten welfare officers working in community services have a post-school qualification and two-in-five have a diploma or degree. The high proportion of APTC graduates in community services not in employment, noted above, indicates that the demand for qualifications at Certificate III and IV may be limited.

#### 4.2 A direct measure of skill shortages

The most direct evidence of employers' demand for skills is their decision to employ foreign workers in occupations that require a substantial skills set to perform the work. This involves incurring the additional cost of recruiting the worker from overseas in the case of the Pacific. It also usually involves paying the foreign worker a higher wage than the domestic workers doing the same work.

The extent of economic demand for post-school qualifications in skills-based occupations in the Pacific can be estimated from the number and qualifications of foreign workers in these occupations. The number of foreign workers in a skills-based occupation gives a low-end estimate of a skills shortage in that occupation. Comparing the post-school qualifications rate of foreign workers with that for domestic workers gives an upper-end estimate of the potential demand for post-school qualifications for specific occupations. A mid-point between these two estimates can be used to identify the number of skilled occupations needed. This is based on the assumption that many small employers using skilled occupations are not willing or able to pay for workers with post-school qualifications.

Table 8.6 presents the aggregated count of foreign workers in mostly skill-based occupations for nine Pacific countries based on the results of each country's most recent census. Most foreign workers (84 per cent) work as managers, professionals and technicians. The smaller number of foreign workers in trades-related and personal service jobs suggests that the demand for workers with internationally recognised skills in these occupations may be low.

Census data show that foreign workers have a higher post-school qualifications rate than domestic workers in the same occupations. Using this gap in post-school qualifications between the two groups, it is possible to identify a skills gap for each occupation where post-school qualifications are expected and to calculate the number of domestic workers without a post-school qualification.

Table 8.6: Number of foreign workers in selected occupation groups,
Fiji, Kiribati, Nauru, Papua New Guinea, Samoa, Solomon Islands, Tonga,
Tuvalu and Vanuatu, 2009–2012

Skilled occupation	N
Managers	2129
Professionals	2028
Technicians and associate professionals	544
Craft and trades workers	545
Personal service workers	404

Source: Most recent country census, 2009–2012

The result of this calculation in aggregate is evidence, on face value, that there are large numbers of domestic workers who need to obtain post-school qualifications to reach the same skill level as foreign workers in these same occupations. Table 8.7 below shows, in the column titled high-end estimate, the large number of building workers and metal trades workers who do not have a post-school qualification.

However, this estimate assumes that all employers want to close this qualifications gap. As discussed above, many small employers may not see post-school qualifications as necessary for their workforce. They may not be able to afford to give their workers time off to gain the qualification or to pay them more once they have acquired the qualification. One way to adjust for the impact of a low-wage, low-skills trap that affects small employers in particular is to halve the number of domestic workers in skill-based occupations who represent the demand for post-school qualifications. Table 8.7, therefore, offers three estimates of the economic demand for post-school qualifications.

# Table 8.7: Estimates of the need for post-school qualifications in skill-based occupations in Fiji, Kiribati, Nauru, Samoa, Solomon Islands, Tonga, Tuvalu and Vanuatu, based on low, middle and high-end estimates, 2009–2012

Trades-related occupations	Low-end estimate	Mid- range	High-end estimate
Extraction and building trade workers	165	1150	1969
Building finishers and related trades workers	2	104	204
Painters building structure cleaners and related trades workers		12	23
Metal machinery and related workers	288	1148	2057
Mechanics and fitters		802	1604
Electricians and electrical fitters		202	404
Total	828	5007	8715

Source: Most recent country census, 2009-2012

Table 8.7 shows the size of the skills gap for APTC-related occupation groups in construction and engineering. The number of foreign workers in specific trades-based occupations provide a minimum or low-end estimate of the economic demand for skills in eight Pacific countries.<sup>57</sup> A high-end estimate is based on the post-school qualifications gap between foreign and domestic workers applied to the number of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Data from the PNG at the required level of detail are not available.

domestic workers in that occupation. The high-end estimate refers to the number of domestic workers who would need to acquire a post-school qualification to reach the same rate as foreign workers in the same occupation.

The construction and engineering sectors in most Pacific countries may have limited potential to grow because of their small, low growth economies. Many businesses are small in scale and face a high level of variability in the demand for their services from year to year. These fluctuations are due to small domestic markets with large injections of donor funds for certain activities such as large construction projects. The mid-range estimate of the demand for post-school qualifications in trade-based qualifications reflects the likely lack of demand for post-school qualification from small employers employing these workers.

The data presented in column 2 in Table 8.7 suggest that APTC supply of qualifications in construction and metal trades may exceed the demand by employers for these qualifications, given the likelihood that many employers may have a limited requirement for workers with post-school qualifications.

One participant in the most recent Advisory Group meeting in Port Vila in May 2014 suggested that APTC needed to analyse labour market data on a quarterly analysis. This analysis he said was needed to show when courses should be put on hold, and what courses continue to be relevant. He asked: 'Will we ever get to a saturation point? Not while populations are growing! But some countries will get close to a saturation point at some time and some countries are nowhere near. There needs to be a constant analysis of labour data and needs analysis'.

The APTC surveys of employers six to 12 months after graduation provide another data source on whether APTC qualifications are addressing employers' skill shortages. Employers were asked about whether they are experiencing skill shortages and to list the names of the jobs that are hard to fill. Some 77 per cent of employers identified positions they found hard to fill or skills they needed. These open-ended responses were coded. Only one-in-four of the identified skill needs of employers relate to a current APTC qualification. Another 13 per cent of the skills identified refer to training offered by APTC but usually at a higher level, e.g. Certificate IV in Carpentry. Some 17 per cent of the skills or jobs refer to skill levels beyond the scope of APTC's mandate such as diploma or degree level or refer to higher skilled occupations such as technicians. Some 19 per cent of the skills identified by employers refer to basic skills needed in the workplace such as IT skills, teamwork and basic financial literacy, which are usually provided by short courses.

### 4.3 To what extent have graduates been employed in the same field as trained?

Most APTC graduates are now in jobs closely related to their training at APTC. The NCVER APTC Graduate Down the Track survey showed that near to nine-in-ten Stage I graduates (87 per cent) said their current job was closely related to their APTC training, and one-in-ten said it was partly related. Only three per cent said it was not related at all. Among those graduates in a new job, 84 per cent said their current job was closely related to their APTC training and 11 per cent said their current job was partly related to the training they had received. Only four per cent said their current job was not related at all to the training they had received.

A half to one fifth of graduates in five fields of study said their current job was not closely related to what they trained in. These fields of study were: community services work (current job for 50 per cent was closely related), children's services (63 per cent), tourism (75 per cent), mechanical fitting (75 per cent) and hospitality supervision (79 per cent). The lack of match between qualification and job may indicate a lack of jobs in the sector that the qualification is targeted at.

### 4.4 What are the wage levels of graduates, before and after APTC training?

Three-in-five of the Stage I APTC graduates (61 per cent) surveyed in 2013 said they had gained an increase in earnings since completing their APTC training. This proportion differed little between whether the graduate was still in the same job or a new job. The qualifications least likely to be linked to an increase in earnings after graduation were: Certificate IV in Training and Assessment, Diplomas of Community Services Work and Children's Services and a number of trades-related qualifications such as wall and floor tiling, plumbing, painting and decorating, mechanical fitting, and automotive mechanical technology. The Certificate IV in Training and Assessment is aimed at TVET instructors who are likely to be on wages fixed by government. Some of the trades may also be working for public works departments and state-owned enterprises where there is little scope to increase wage rates.

### 4.5 Evidence on job satisfaction, stability or promotions

Most (84 per cent) of the Stage I APTC graduates in employment (either in a wage job or own business) agreed with the statement that 'I am able to support myself and my family well'. Only 14 per cent agreed with the statement that 'I find difficult to earn enough to support myself and my family' and only one per cent agreed that 'I cannot earn anywhere near enough to support myself and my family'. However, for those still in the same job, as many as one-in-five (20 per cent) found it 'difficult or very difficult to earn enough to support myself and my family well' compared with one-in-ten (12 per cent) in a new job. Of those already in a job, two-in-three (62 per cent) had received a promotion and a similar proportion (63 per cent) gained an increase in earnings. However, one-in-ten (10 per cent) could not identify a benefit or stated a negative outcome since completing APTC training.

The combined results of the APTC Past Students Tracer Survey showed that 86 per cent of respondents agreed that their job satisfaction had significantly improved, with one-in-four agreeing strongly with this statement. The levels of job satisfaction varied by qualification and reflected different working conditions. The qualifications with high levels of job satisfaction were youth work and aged care, community services, disability, metal fabrication, plumbing, hospitality supervision and patisserie.

Half of the respondents said they had been promoted since completing their studies at APTC. The promotion rate varied widely by qualification, from one-in-four to seven-inten. Differences in promotion rates may be due in part to fewer opportunities for promotion for jobs in the public sector.

Close to nine-in-ten graduates agreed that their employment prospects or ability to apply for a job have significantly improved, with 28 per cent strongly agreeing. Again, agreement with the statement varied by qualification, depending on labour market conditions. So the higher proportions of graduates less likely to agree that their job prospects have improved are evident for those with qualifications in community services, aged care, automotive mechanical, painting and decorating and metal fabrication.

### 5 Evidence of APTC impact from employers

The APTC conducted surveys of employers in 2012 and in 2013. The total number of responses was 190, from 607 questionnaires sent out. This represents a response rate of 31 per cent. However, nine enterprises were surveyed in both years so the final usable number of enterprises is 181. Another source of employer feedback is the responses of 38 employers who took part in meetings with the review team or were asked separately to complete a questionnaire.

### 5.1 How do the competencies of APTC graduates compare with other TVET graduates at the same level?

Employers were asked to offer an overall assessment of their level of satisfaction with the APTC training program. Nine-in-ten employers (89 per cent) were satisfied or very satisfied with the APTC training program. Non-government organisations (NGOs) were more likely to be very satisfied (55 per cent), followed by the private sector (43 per cent) and the public sector (39 per cent).

### 5.1.1 In relation to technical competencies

Nine-in-ten or more employers surveyed in 2012 and 2013 agree that their APTC graduates perform well in the workplace. In particular, they agree that they are able to use relevant skills and technology, have a working knowledge of their industry, understand relevant technical words, work effectively with minimal supervision, are able to take on increased responsibility, solve common work-related problems and can communicate effectively with their supervisor, co-workers and clients/customers. In relation to nearly all of the above aspects of work performance, over a third of employers strongly agreed with each statement.

Four-out-of-five employers who completed the review team's questions in 2014 agree that the APTC graduates they employ perform well on the job in terms of technical competencies compared other workers at the same level, with two-in-five agreeing strongly that this is the case.

### 5.1.2 In relation to good work habits

Employers were also asked to assess the degree of change in their employee's attitude and work ethic since completing APTC training compared with before the course. They were asked to do so in relation to two statements: 'Graduates are motivated and show initiative' and 'Graduates display an appropriate attitude and ability to work, are reliable and professional'. In relation to both statements, over nine-in-ten employers said their employees had improved after their APTC training, with three-in-ten saying their employees had significantly improved.

### 5.1.3 To what extent have APTC graduates trained co-workers and introduced new technologies?

Nine-in-ten employers (89 per cent) surveyed in 2012 and 2013 said that their APTC graduates since completing their training had 'improved the work standards/productivity of other workers in your company. Only eight per cent said they had not and three per cent did not answer the question. This finding is confirmed by the employers who responded to the review's questions which showed high employer agreement with the statement that APTC graduates have helped to train their co-workers to work better, although this was only asked of some employers.

### 6 Were APTC graduates hired on the same or different salaries as others?

No information is available on whether APTC graduates have been hired on the same or different salaries.

### 7 How productive are APTC graduates compared with others with same qualifications?

Most employers have recognised in some way the greater productivity of their APTC graduates. Over three-in-four employers (77 per cent) said that they had promoted their APTC graduates or given them greater responsibilities since returning from study, one-in-five (19 per cent) said they did not and four per cent did not answer the question.

A key question for the evaluation is to assess the nature and extent of the impact that APTC training has had on enterprise productivity. Employers were asked: 'What impact has APTC training had on the productivity or overall performance of your business?' Nine-in-ten responding employers said the impact was positive, with six per cent saying there had been no impact and one per cent saying the impact was negative (see Table 8.8). The positive impact was highest for NGOs and public sector employers (100 and 97 per cent respectively). Employment size accounted for little difference in the proportion of employers who said the impact was positive. The two industry sectors less likely to say that the impact of APTC training was positive were Other Business Services (60 per cent) and Electricity, Gas and Water Supply (80 per cent).

Type of impact on business	Private sector	Public sector	NGO/ not for profit	Total
Positive impact	85.8	97.2	100.0	89.0
Negative impact	1.5	0.0	0.0	1.1
No impact	8.2	0.0	0.0	6.1
No response	4.5	2.8	0.0	3.9
Total	100	100	100	100
N	134	36	11	181

Table 8.8: Response of employers of APTC graduates by type of employer to the question: 'What impact has APTC training had on the productivity or overall performance of your business?', 2012 and 2013 (%)

Source: APTC Employer Survey 2012 and 2013

It is possible to estimate how many enterprises have experienced a major positive impact from APTC training. One way to do this is to compare the enterprises stating a positive impact with those that gave strongly agreed responses to a series of statements about the work performance of their APTC graduates. Between 30 and 38 per cent of all employers surveyed both state a positive impact from APTC training and strongly agree with eight statements about the benefits of improved work performance of their APTC graduates.

Employers also had the opportunity to explain in their own words the nature of that impact. Four-out-of-five employers gave more information about the nature of the positive impact. These open-ended responses were coded into five broad types of impact: Table 8.9 reports the results of this coding.

### Table 8.9: Type of impact on business for respondents who say impact of APTC training is positive, by type of employer (%)

Type of impact on business	Private sector	Public sector	NGO/ not for profit	Total
1. Staff perform better	41.7	34.3	36.4	39.8
2. Expanded business/work now performed in-house	6.1	0.0	0.0	4.3
3. Customers satisfied	4.3	5.7	0.0	4.3
4. More efficient, effective service delivery, improved productivity	26.1	37.1	54.5	30.4
5. Depends	1.7	0.0	0.0	1.2
6. No reply on why positive	20.0	22.9	9.1	19.9
Total	100	100	100	100
Ν	115	35	11	161

Source: APTC Employer Survey 2012 and 2013

The most common response of employers about the impact on their business was that staff perform their job better. The next most common response was that the impact was more efficient, effective service delivery or improved productivity.

However, few enterprises said that having staff trained at APTC had helped them to expand their business. Only one-in-twenty (five per cent) of private sector businesses surveyed said the impact of APTC training had enabled them to expand their business or to reduce costs by performing work in-house. For all employers regardless of sector, only four per cent of those surveyed gave a reason related to expanding their activities or performing work in-house.

No open-ended response from an employer about any benefits from having APTC graduates referred to replacing foreign workers. However, other evidence, gathered from the consultations and confirmed by published statements, confirms that some enterprises achieved considerable cost savings from replacing foreign workers.<sup>58</sup>

Employers were also asked whether they would employ another APTC graduate or work placement student. Nearly all respondents (93 per cent) said they would. However, only one-in-five enterprises (19 per cent) gave as their reason the need for more skilled people, to increase profits or to meet customer demand. This response suggests that only a minority of employers surveyed are in a situation where they can use their APTC graduates to expand their business.

### 8 The value to employers of APTC graduates

The economies of Pacific countries served by APTC vary from the small or very small size, insignificant private sectors and low growth prospects, to economies with significant sectors in tourism and other services to larger, more diversified economies, driven by an expanding resources sector. One of the APTC objectives is to increase the productivity of individuals and organisations in targeted industries and sectors.

The above responses of the employers surveyed by the APTC and the review team indicate that APTC's standardised output does not fit the needs of all employers. Indeed, the evidence suggests that employers' needs have taken second place in the supply-driven mode of operation that APTC was designed to provide. The widespread use of scholarships to recruit existing employees gave employers little say in who should be trained and in what skills. A more employer-responsive focus would have put more effort into finding out about the skill needs of employers, in terms of skill sets and qualifications and off-the-job training arrangements that more closely suited their requirements.

Also APTC's predominant focus on qualifications initially aimed at meeting Australian skill shortages simply assumed that these skills overlapped with the needs of Pacific countries. The evidence presented above suggests that only a minority of employers, ranging from a low of one-in-twenty to a third or more, have gained a significant economic benefit from having employees with Australian qualifications. This issue

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Feedback from representatives of the Electricity Power Corporation (EPC) in Samoa was later confirmed by the APTC country manager for Samoa who provided an APTC Impact Case Study entitled: Industry Capability Development Training for Business Success: Investment in employee training and development is paying off for Samoa's Electricity Power Corporation. The case study noted: "Investing in employees' training has direct financial benefits for EPC by enabling local employees to perform at a higher level, therefore reducing the reliance on overseas consultants for regular maintenance activity. 'For the future of EPC we want to lessen the cost of relying on experts coming from overseas. That is a high cost and we don't want that, we want our own staff to do that', says [Douglas Tomane, EPC Training and Development Officer]". The case study noted that five APTC graduates had gone to New Zealand for degree level studies [in engineering].

Feedback from an employer in Vanuatu noted that: "We have been able to drop two expatriate staff, which has been a significant saving to the payroll."

needs to be investigated more through a carefully designed evaluation strategy, an issue addressed in the proposed evaluation plan in Annex 3.

#### 9 Conclusions

Most APTC graduates have benefited from their training in terms of better employment outcomes, wage increases, promotions at work and higher levels of job satisfaction. However, some graduates have not benefited to the same extent. The evidence presented in this chapter shows that it is possible to identify, by qualification and country, which graduates are in employment which matches their skills, or in other work, or unemployed.

The range of different graduate employment rates by qualification and country point to the need for APTC to pay closer attention to collecting better data on, and monitoring, graduate employment rates at these levels. There is also a need for APTC to provide support to improve the employment outcomes of graduates with specific qualifications and, in particular, country labour markets.

Most employers are satisfied with the performance of APTC and of their APTC graduates. However, it is difficult from the available evidence to gauge the nature of this benefit and its extent. Some indicative evidence suggests that a majority of employers operate under conditions where they have limited scope to reap significant benefits.

Australian aid funding of TVET in the Pacific places a strong emphasis on responding to the demonstrated demand for skills. One way to enlist the support of Pacific governments and employers for demand-led TVET is to identify a specific goal and targets that can be monitored and reported on regularly. One such goal is to train up domestic workers to replace foreign workers. Targets for specific skills-based occupations below professional level could be set, based on recent census data on the number of foreign workers by occupation.

A demand-led regional TVET strategy, in which APTC should be playing a key role, needs to have as its foundation resources allocated to a simple, low-cost and reliable methodology for identifying the economic demand for skills in each applicable country.

There are five important data sources identifying the demand for skills that provide the level of information TVET providers need to be held accountable to its funding sources. Reliable information is also needed to enable informed choices by key stakeholders, such as prospective students, parents, employers and governments. These data sources are presented below. However, APTC and other TVET providers can only initiate one of these data sources – qualification level tracer surveys. It is the role of government (and donors through governments) to fund the collection and analysis of labour market information.

Apart from planning purposes to inform budget allocations, information is needed to enable the end users of TVET to decide which type of TVET in which to invest. Labour market information, therefore, has the characteristics of what economists call a 'public good'. This means that the information is shared without limiting its access to others, and so there are few incentives for the market to provide this information (Wood and O'Leary 2006). As a 'public good', governments need to provide labour market information in the same way that they fund budget police and basic services in education and health. The private sector firms and TVET providers do not have sufficient incentives or resources to provide this service.

The information is needed to enable citizens to decide which jobs and careers to pursue and invest in, and for employers to work out the economic value to their enterprise of specific forms of skills training.

The first data source is recent census or national survey data, such as labour force or household income and expenditure surveys, to identify in each skills-based occupation the stock of jobs, the number of foreign workers and post-school qualification rates of domestic and foreign job-holders. This data source now exists for every Pacific country.

The second data source is a survey of employers. Employers in the private and public sectors should be asked about their short and medium-term need for skills and in what form. This may vary from specific skill sets, post-school qualifications or short training courses. They should also be asked about the number of domestic and foreign workers they employ in skilled occupations and their qualifications.

The third data source is a list of job vacancies to produce a simple measure of occupations in-demand. This can be compiled by collecting data over time from job advertisements in newspapers, on the radio and in a government gazette. The data should include: name of employer, job description, industry sector, required qualification, work experience and salary range. The data can be used to produce a job opportunity index based on the International Standard Classification of Occupations (ISCO) (Powell 2012, p. 13). Information from work permits about the occupations of foreign workers is another useful data source if the occupations are recorded in a systematic way.

Tracer surveys are the fourth data source. APTC tracer surveys have been carried out to meet contract reporting requirements but they are not geared to provide information on employment outcomes at qualification level and by country. Also lacking is information on wages of APTC graduates, skills match of job with qualification, and whether graduates are with the same employer. APTC should focus on identifying the demand for specific qualifications in each country. This can be done in large part by putting more resources into collecting information at qualification level on the employment outcomes achieved by graduates. This involves devolving responsibility and some funding for collecting basic employment-related data as close as possible to trainers in charge or involved with specific courses in each campus country. One way to do this is to fund an alumni group to hold a social gathering between six and 12 months from graduation and to ask those who attend to seek out information on other graduates they know.

Help from APTC headquarters staff can be provided to ensure that the information collected is consistent and is presented in a meaningful way to graduates. This same decentralised mode of data collection could also be used to administer a lengthier questionnaire. Again, funding alumni groups to administer a questionnaire is a valuable way to tap their knowledge of how to find their fellow graduates.

The fifth data source to estimate future skill needs is a listing of government priorities for future infrastructure projects and other planned investments by donors and the private sector. Assessment of the domestic demand for skills from these planned projects will also depend on the willingness of governments to require that contractors employ domestic skilled workers and/or provide training placements for apprentices. In other words, governments in many cases will have to specify the sources for the skilled labour required. If governments want to use domestic sources of skills, they will need to allocate resources as part of the planned investment to ensure the domestic skills pool is available when needed.

The attachment to Annex 8 sets out the kinds of information required in a strong system of monitoring and evaluation for APTC.

### ATTACHMENT 1 TO ANNEX 8: PROGRAM EVALUATION

This attachment relates to Recommendation 15 of the review. A DFAT official asked the evaluation team to list out the kinds of information needed in a future robust system of monitoring and evaluation for APTC.

#### **1 Program evaluation**

The purposes of the evaluation are to:

- assess for DFAT value for money of the investment in APTC
- show Pacific governments the contribution of high quality TVET skills to enterprises and their economies
- provide evidence of the value of a demand-led TVET strategy for the Pacific.

#### **1.1 Design principles**

- Use comparisons related to employment of graduates (e.g. wage rates, type of job matched to field of study, job-related benefits) based on information collected before, during and after APTC training.
- Use comparisons related to employment (e.g. wage rates, job-related benefits, type of job matched to field of study) between APTC graduates and other TVET graduates in country labour markets. This requires use of a common questionnaire for all TVET tracer studies.
- Fund and conduct the evaluation independently of APTC, with the necessary labour market and economic expertise.
- Conduct the evaluation with the close cooperation and support of APTC, and in a way that APTC can see immediate benefits for its needs.
- Pilot test survey instruments for students, graduates and enterprises to ensure that respondents easily understand the questions and provide reliable data on key variables such as wage rates and income for the self-employed.
- Improve response rates for tracer surveys by collecting better contact information in the initial student application form, such as an alternative point of contact. Confirm this information at graduation, through alumni activities and tracking via social media.
- Work out ways to involve and fund alumni groups in collecting information on the employment of graduates by qualification
- Conduct employer surveys face-to-face using experienced interviewers who can explain well the purpose of the data collection and the benefits to employers.

#### **1.2** Key features needed for the evaluation strategy

The following outlines key features needed for the evaluation of the three goals of the APTC: skills training; employment of graduates; and improved productivity of individuals and organisations.

### Goal (a) Training: Increased supply of skilled workers in targeted sectors in the Pacific region

Evaluation data needed: Make use of information from APTC's EMIS plus information on the supply of post-school qualification and skills sets from other TVET providers directed at the targeted sectors in overseas (Australia and New Zealand), regional (PNG, Fiji) and domestic labour markets.

Analyse available census and national survey information to assess the economic demand for skills by targeted sector.

Identify skill shortages by noting the number of foreign workers by occupation.

Identify skills gaps by occupation by comparing the post-school qualification rate of foreign workers with domestic workers.

Measure the learning outcomes measures by gains in skills and knowledge achieved by graduates usually measured by pre- and post-tests. Make use of the pre-tests in LLN and VSK already carried out. Post-tests are also needed, e.g. IELTS results, a test of skill.

# Goal (b) Employment: Pacific Islander women and men with Australian qualifications realise improved employment opportunities nationally, regionally and internationally in targeted sectors

Evaluation data: Measure improved employment opportunities by collecting data on the employment outcomes of APTC graduates compared with TVET graduates with an equivalent qualification in the same labour market. This requires the collection of information on the employment outcomes of both APTC and other TVET graduates. It also requires collecting employment information from students such as wage rates and type of job held and wage rate prior to enrolling in APTC.

Collect information from APTC students and graduates on whether their postgraduation job is with the same employer at the start of training, during training or after graduation. Also collect information on type of job matched to field of study, income and time period for income, benefits gained if in same job after graduation. Collect information on time taken to find a job based on date of first employment after completing APTC training, and duration of job search, if not currently employed.

The data requirements include information on the graduate's:

- specific APTC qualification or qualifications (level of qualification, field of study)
- type of job or employment coded in ISCO and ANZSCO
- gross wage or income per week
- an indicator of the reliability of that wage or income.

A common core tracer survey questionnaire needs to be developed and an agreement reached in each campus country to use this questionnaire for the conduct of any TVET tracer surveys. Additional questions could be asked in each country as required.

Administer APTC-wide graduate tracer surveys at qualification level one year after graduation and APTC-wide three years after graduation. Ensure that the response rates are high enough to gather robust information on the employment outcomes of graduates by qualification.

### Goal (c) Productivity: Increased productivity of individuals and organisations in targeted industries and sectors

Evaluation data: Enterprise and graduate data needs to be collected on:

- (1) behaviour change in the workplace
- (2) improved productivity due to the input of APTC graduates
- (3) cost benefits to the enterprise through the replacement of foreign workers.

The first can be measured by identifying the behavioural change produced by APTC graduates applying in the workplace the skills and knowledge they gained in their APTC training. The behaviour change can be measured by a survey of graduates and separately of enterprises.

Graduates in employment need to be asked whether they are responsible for, or contributed to, formal or informal training for fellow employees in their current organisation. They should also be asked about their role in the introduction of new and

more efficient workplace practices to replace traditional ways used by their organisation.

Employers should also be asked about the role of APTC graduates in formal or informal training for fellow employees and to estimate the number of co-workers benefiting from these specific activities. They should also be asked to assess impact on organisational performance of APTC graduates' effect on co-workers.

Employers should also be asked:

- 1) on a five- or seven-point scale about the nature and extent of changes to work practices and their impact on the productivity of their organisation
- for information on their organisation's current wage structure for employees in the type of work performed by APTC graduates and for each APTC graduate in particular
- for information on productivity changes, including asking them to estimate the productivity difference (in percentage terms) between individual APTC graduates and similar workers who did not take part in APTC training.

The change to productivity can be measured by quantifying the results produced by APTC graduates in achieving the organisation's goals. This requires that enterprises identify critical processes or customer requirements; work out specific, quantifiable outputs of work; and set targets against which results can be scored.

The measurement of productivity change may need to be done on a case study basis because enterprises need to make a substantial commitment to put in place the framework for measuring productivity and to collect the required data.

Information on the total cost of employment of foreign workers needs to be collected, including salary, benefits, housing and recruitment costs. Information is also needed on the costs involved in employing the APTC graduate who is replacing the foreign worker, covering the same items.

### ANNEX 9: VALUE FOR MONEY

Question posed in the evaluation plan for this review: To what extent have APTC activities been cost-efficient and implemented in the most efficient way compared to possible alternatives?

### Contents

1	Introduction: value for money	
2	Financial and education management information systems	
3	Economy of inputs	
4	Cost structure analysis	
4.1	Total costs	
4.2	Analysis of unit costs	
4.3	Unit costs by training location	
4.4	Student-teacher ratios, double-blocking and economies of scale .	
4.5	Nationalisation of APTC staff	
5.	Cost-benefit analysis	
6.	Sustainability	
7.	Concluding remarks	
8.	Appendix tables	

### List of tables

Table 1: APTC approval limits for purchases	169
Table 2: Approximate annual compensation (base salaries and benefits), APTC staff as of 31 July, 2014 (AUD)	186
Table 3: Coefficients used by review team to estimate approximate benefits	187
Table 4: Australian income tax rates for FY 2013/2014	187
Table 5: Range of values for key parameters of the models used to estimate the ERRs and to conduct sensitivity analyses	192
Table 6: Average weekly earnings of migrants from Pacific with Certificate III and IV training to Australia (AUD)	194
Table 7: Impact on baseline ERRs of quantifying external (indirect) benefits and adding these to the ERR models (AUD)	198

#### List of figures

Figure 1: Expenditure in Stages I and II by capital, scholarships, management, and other recurrent costs (AUD millions)	171
Figure 2: Stage II capital expenditure (AUD millions, total \$10.7 million)	171
Figure 3: Management fees paid to TAFEQ, Stage II (AUD millions, total \$20.7 million).	172
Figure 4: Recurrent expenditure other than management fees, Stage II (AUD millions, total \$112.6 million)	172
Figure 5: Recurrent expenditure by economic purpose, Stage II	173
Figure 6: Unit costs, Stages I and II (AUD thousands)	174
Figure 7: Costs per student of national training institutions (NTIs) in the Pacific as compared with APTC (AUD thousands)	174
Figure 8: Costs per FTE – a comparison of APTC with RTOs in Australia	176
Figure 9: Students by semester, 2007–2015	177
Figure 10: Students and graduates by semester, 2007–2015	177
Figure 11: Expenditure at training locations and on overhead categories, Stage II	178
Figure 12: Percentage distribution of direct training costs by location, Stage II	179

Figure 13: Expenditure by location with overhead costs allocated to locations, Stage II 179
Figure 14: Students and graduates by training location, Stage II
Figure 15: Cost per student and cost per graduate by training location, Stage II 180
Figure 16: GDP per capita, Pacific Island Countries, 2013 (AUD) 180
Figure 17: Index of APTC national staff base salaries 181
Figure 18: Population (in thousands) of 14 Pacific Island countries
Figure 19: Student-teacher and student-trainer ratios, Stages I and II 183
Figure 20: Average numbers of students, trainers, and tutors per semester
Figure 21: Number of training packages offered by the five training locations
Figure 22: Number of training locations offering courses in different training packages 185
Figure 23: APTC staff by nationality (Pacific Island nationals and expatriates)
and by position category as of 31 July 2014 (total staff 186)
Figure 24: Approximate salaries and benefits, expatriate and national staff, FY 2013/14 188
Figure 25: Breakdown of benefits, expatriate and national staff, FY 2013/14
Figure 26: Nationalisation of staff by broad categories, comparison of 2014 and 2019 189
Figure 27: Estimated personnel costs broken down by compensation categories and
nationality (2014 prices, AUD millions), comparison of 2014 and 2019
Figure 28: Costs and benefits of APTC Stages I and II – the model 1 investment
Figure 29: Direct and indirect costs of APTC Stages I and II – the model 1 investment 195
Figure 30: Benefits (increased graduate earnings) of APTC Stages I and II – the model 1 investment (AUD millions)
Figure 31: ERRs of base case scenarios, models 1, 2, 3.1, and 3.2 as compared with 11% (opportunity cost of capital)
Figure 32: ERRs of base case scenarios with indirect benefits per graduate varying from \$0 to \$33 per week (AUD)
Figure 33: Cost recovery, APTC Stage II

### List of appendix tables

Table A.1: Total expenditure by APTC operational categories, APTC Stage I (AUD)	204
Table A.2: Total expenditure by economic purpose, APTC Stage I (AUD)	204
Table A.3: Total expenditure by Basis of Payment (BOP) categories, as claimed by APTC and TAFEQ for reimbursement from DFAT, APTC Stage II (AUD)	205
Table A.4: Total expenditure by economic purpose (capital, personnel, scholarships, other recurrent, management), APTC Stage II (AUD)	205
Table A.5: Capital expenditure by economic purpose (civil works, equipment, maintenance, handover reserve), APTC Stage II (AUD)	205
Table A.6: Management fees paid to contractor (TAFEQ) for APTC Stage II	205
Table A.7: Recurrent expenditure by economic purpose, APTC Stage II (AUD)	206
Table A.8: APTC recurrent expenditure, first semester of FY 2013/2014,	195
Table A.9: APTC recurrent expenditure, second semester of FY 2013/2014,	209
Table A.10: Unit costs (cost per graduate, cost per student, cost per student contact hour, and cost per full-time equivalent student), APTC Stages I and II	211
Table A.11: Unit costs as estimated by <i>Research into the financing of TVET in the Pacific</i> (country case studies managed by ACER and Austraining on behalf of AusAID/DFAT)	<i>fic</i> ) . 211
Table A.12: Costs per annual hour of curriculum (AHC) for Australia, Queensland,	
TAFE Queensland, and Mt. Isa TAFE, 2009-2014 (AUD)	212
Table A.13: Total expenditure broken down by overhead costs and direct training costs, with direct training costs further broken down by training location, APTC Stage II	213
Table A.14: Direct training costs as percentage of total direct training costs by location, APTC Stage II (AUD)	213
Table A.15: Total expenditure by training location with overhead costs allocated in proportion to direct training costs, APTC Stage II (AUD)	213
Table A.16: Number of matriculating students by training location, APTC Stage II	214

Table A.17: Number of graduates by training location, APTC Stage II	. 214
Table A.18: Cost per student by training location, APTC Stage II (AUD)	. 214
Table A.19: Cost per graduate by training location, APTC Stage II (AUD)	. 214
Table A.20: Students, trainers and tutors by school (SCHS and STT) and training package, APTC Stages I and II (- end of 2014)	. 215
Table A.21: Student-teacher and trainer-tutor ratios by school (SHCS and STT), APTC Stages I and II (- end of 2014)	. 216
Table A.22: Training packages (and specialisations) offered across five campus countries and three small island states, January – June 2014	s . 216
Table A.23: APTC staff by position, location, and nationality as of 31 July 2014 a/	. 217
Table A.24: Approximate annual compensation (base salaries and benefits), APTC staff	217
Table A 25: APTC appual base calaries national and expertiate staff (AUD)	217
Table A.20: APTC shaft as of 20, lung, 2015 as prejected by CEC of APTC of	210
Table A.26: APTC stall as of 30 June, 2015 as projected by CEO of APTC a/	. 219
Table A.27: Approximate annual compensation, APTC stall as of 30 June 2015	. 219
Table A.28: APTC staff by 30 June 2019 (assuming Stage III will be funded) as projected by CEO of APTC a/	. 220
Table A.29: Approximate annual compensation (base salaries and benefits), APTC staff as of 30 June 2019, assuming Phase III will be funded (AUD, 2014 prices)	. 220
Table A.30: Flow variables (direct costs, graduates, and students enrolled) needed to estimate the economic rates of return (ERRs) for models 1, 2, 3,1, and 3,2,	. 221
Table A.31: Results of ERR and sensitivity analysis – model 1 (year 0 = 2007)	. 222
Table A.32: Results of ERR and sensitivity analysis – model 2 (year 0 = 2011)	. 222
Table A.33: Results of ERR and sensitivity analysis – model 3.1 (year 0 = 2015, cost savings 10 per cent over four years of Stage III)	. 223
Table A.34: Results of ERR and sensitivity analysis – model 3.2 (year $0 = 2015$ ,	000
cost savings 20 per cent over four years of Stage III)	. 223
Table A.35: Cost recovery (revenues from sources other than DFAT), APTC Stage II	. 224
Table A.36: APTC course tuition fees by school and by campus country	. 224

### 1 Introduction: value for money

The 19<sup>th</sup> century historian Thomas Carlyle referred, somewhat unkindly, to economics as the 'dismal science' – because of its focus on scarcity, costs and trade-offs, and the need, in a world of limited resources, of always having to choose between more of this and more of that. DFAT's call for an independent review to assess whether APTC has provided value for money (VfM) borrows from the economist's playbook by asking the difficult and disquieting question: Could the \$278 million of spending on APTC between 2007 and 2015 have been spent differently so as to deliver greater 'value' to the Australian taxpayer? At a meeting of the APTC Consortium Board in a Fiji hotel in March 2014, board members were shown, in a PowerPoint presentation (APTC 2014, July), that AusAID/DFAT had been spending \$42,860 on average to produce each graduate since 2007<sup>59</sup> and asked to ponder the question: Has this amounted to value for money?

The answer depends, of course, on the goals of APTC, the extent to which these goals have been achieved, and the values one places on them. The earliest documents provided to the review team articulating a rationale for the College stated that the goal of APTC was twofold: (1) increasing the supply of skilled workers and increased productivity in targeted sectors in the Pacific region; and (2) helping Pacific Islander women and men realise improved employment opportunities nationally, regionally and internationally (APTC 2007, November).

By all accounts (feedback from current students, graduates, employers, and Advisory Group members), the first goal has been well achieved. APTC students acquire skills that meet ASQA standards, and graduates are judged by virtually all stakeholders as being good workers whose productivity is enhanced by the training they receive. Because students entering APTC are not school leavers (so that APTC will not compete with national training institutions), and because a majority of students, whether EWs or NIEs, have been employed before they enter the College, the effect of APTC on *rates of employment* has been minimal. On the other hand, *improved employment* (jobs with greater responsibility and paying higher wages) would seem to be an outcome for most graduates – not necessarily right after they graduate, but over a period of time, as employers witness the graduates' increased productivity and realise that they now have other employment opportunities to which they can move.

As discussed earlier in this review, one goal expressed for APTC, to facilitate the migration of Pacific Islanders to Australia and other high-income economies (for the benefit of the migrants, who can earn much more than at home, and for the benefit of receiving countries with shortages of skills) has *not* been broadly achieved. Only a very small minority of those who have graduated from APTC since operations began in mid-2007 have decided to migrate and then succeeded in doing so by meeting the significant costs (both financial and social/psychological) and by clearing the formidable barriers to immigration imposed by Australia and other high-income economies. While the possession of an Australian training certificate may be a necessary (or, at least, a helpful) condition for Pacific Islanders seeking an Australian work visa, it has not proven to be a sufficient condition (see Annex 7). This means that, at least for now, a positive VfM assessment of APTC will depend on the benefits that graduates (and their families), their employers, and their co-workers receive at home in the Pacific. *If* APTC can be justified based on these domestic benefits alone, then any opening up of migration pathways in the future will simply reinforce this positive result.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Actually, the review team's unit cost estimate for the eight years of Stages I and II is a bit lower than this.

### 2 Financial and education management information systems

# <u>Questions listed in the evaluation plan</u>: How adequate is the quality of information about costs and financing of APTC? Have effective consolidated financial and education management information system been established? What are the gaps?

During Stage II, Corporate and Student Services (CSS, the Pacific headquarters of APTC, located in Nadi) has implemented consolidated financial and education management information systems (FMIS and EMIS) to generate the data needed by the management team and Consortium Board for purposes of M&E and planning. The newly installed FMIS and EMIS mark a significant improvement over the tools and procedures available in APTC's early years.

During Stage I, separate financial accounts were maintained by the three Stage I contractors – Sinclair Knight Merz (SKM), Sunshine Coast Institute of TAFE (SCIT), and Box Hill Institute of TAFE (BHIT). The DFAT office in Suva is the only place where some (but not all) of this information is currently available in one place. In 2013, APTC purchased and installed MS Dynamics NAV (a resource planning product that Microsoft acquired in 2002 from the Danish company, Navision).<sup>60</sup> NAV allows APTC's Finance Manager in Nadi to record all revenues as they come in and expenditures as they are made and to generate detailed financial reports on a regular basis for the APTC board and management team.

At about the same time, APTC acquired two other software products, which underpin the current EMIS. MS Dynamics CRM, a customer relationship management program developed by Microsoft<sup>61</sup>, is used by APTC to track applicants through to the point of ready-to-enrol status (for those accepted for training) or to the point of rejection (for those who are not). Graduates are also tracked by CRM when they leave the College. The other software used for APTC's EMIS is the stand-alone package, EduPoint, which the College uses to track students from the point of their enrolment through to their separation from the College as graduates or dropouts.

Using these software products, APTC's Quality Performance and Research unit (QPR) was able to respond accurately and quickly to the numerous requests for EMIS data submitted by this independent review team. In addition, QPR must prepare regular reports for APTC's corporate offices in Australia (TAFEQ East Coast in Brisbane and BHIT in Melbourne). There the spreadsheets are entered manually into the RTOs' database systems (ISAS)<sup>62</sup> in the case of TAFEQEC, and SMART<sup>63</sup> in the case of BHIT). The two Australian RTOs are now in the process of upgrading their database systems. These will need to be more sophisticated than APTC's, and they are likely to be different from one another,<sup>64</sup> but both should be able to interface electronically with APTC's database so as to eliminate the need for the manual transfer of data in the future.

The data in CRM and EduPoint are integrated by means of project management software called Flow.<sup>65</sup> Additional integrations, for example between the EMIS and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> www.microsoft.com/en-us/dynamics/erp-nav-overview.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> www.microsoft.com/en-us/dynamics/crm.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> www.oracle.com/us/products/applications/peoplesoft-enterprise/campus-solutions/overview/index.html

<sup>63</sup> www.smartcorp.com/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> TAFEQEC's, for example, must tie into TAFEQ's larger system, given that it is just one of several institutes under the TAFEQ parental umbrella.

<sup>65</sup> www.getflow.com/

FMIS databases, are possible, but depending on their complexity, these tend to be costly, and the necessary software was not included in APTC's recent purchases.

Still, the addition of CRM and EduPoint represents already a significant improvement over the situation that prevailed in Stage I, when APTC relied on the graphics process management software, Blue.<sup>66</sup> With Blue, EMIS data were entered by the APTC team in Nadi, but an experienced ICT person at BHIT in Victoria had to write the queries to generate reports, meaning that the information needed for monitoring and planning was not available on a timely basis, unlike the much better situation today.

It should be noted, however, that APTC's current M&E system focuses very much on operational matters (spending, staffing, enrolments, and qualifications awarded) but remains quite weak on external efficiency indicators (employment, migration and, especially, earnings) needed for a VfM analysis. The Scope of Services calls for the APTC contractor to collect data on outcomes and impact (Section 11.2.) However, the Performance Assessment Framework (PAF) has virtually nothing on employment and earnings.<sup>67</sup> This point will be returned to later in this annex.

### 3 Economy of inputs

### Question listed in the evaluation plan: Has the APTC program been economical in buying inputs of appropriate quality at the right price?

There is no reason to believe that APTC over-pays for the goods and services it procures. Procurement follows Commonwealth guidelines (Commonwealth of Australia 2008). Procedures for purchases in different price ranges are spelled out in an APTC procurement manual, as shown in Table 1.

Up to AUD 5,000	One written quote
AUD 5,001 to AUD 25,000	Three written quotes
AUD 25,001 to AUD 149,999	Three written quotes and an assessment of the chosen
	supplier based on value for money, quality and service
AUD 150,000 and over	Select or public tender

#### Table 1: APTC approval limits for purchases

Source: APTC 2012c.

Wherever possible, APTC uses local suppliers, provided that cost and delivery schedules match or compare favourably with Australian quotes.

All expenditure incurred by APTC must be approved in accordance with APTC financial and administrative delegations and must not exceed the annual budget. Instruments of financial delegation are issued to positions within APTC by the CEO and approved by the Board (APTC 2012a and 2012b).

Salaries paid to national staff in each of APTC's five campus countries and elsewhere in the Pacific are benchmarked against salaries paid locally for comparable work (Maxumise 2013).

<sup>66</sup> www.bluesoftware.com/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> The PAF is divided into five areas: starting with marketing, reputation and image, followed by partnerships, quality learning, student and scholarship management and management and governance. (Schedule 1, Scope of Services, APTC DD Annex F.)

### 4 Cost structure analysis

<u>Questions listed in evaluation plan</u>: What have been the outputs in relation to inputs? What are the various unit recurrent costs, e.g., cost per trainee, cost per hour of instruction, and cost per graduate? What are other measures of internal efficiency, e.g., student completion rates, full-time equivalent ratios of students per teacher by program? What factors drive unit costs? What has been done (e.g. localisation), and what more could be done to achieve greater efficiency?

#### 4.1 Total costs

Given the absence of a consolidated FMIS until recently, detailed information on Stage I costs was difficult for the review team to obtain. As indicated above, separate financial accounts were maintained by the three Stage I contractors; this information has never been systematically integrated. By comparison, detailed information on Stage II is readily available given the introduction of the NAV financial database.<sup>68</sup>

Tables A.1 and A.2 in the section of appendix tables at the end of this annex show that a total of \$134.4 million was spent during Stage I (including \$7.1 million on planning and preparations during FY2006/07, which preceded the official launching of APTC in July 2007). About \$22 million (16 per cent) of Stage I expenditure was capital spending (on civil works and equipment), and the remaining \$113 million was split among management fees paid to the three contractors (\$12 million), scholarships to cover student travel and living expenses (\$13 million), and other recurrent costs (\$88 million). Stage I operational costs (everything other than the \$13 million in scholarship costs) covered three main activities: program development and coordination, the responsibility of SKM (8 per cent); training in programs that would, in Stage II, become the School of Trades and Technology (STT), the responsibility of SCIT (61 per cent); and training in what would, in Stage II, become the School of Hospitality and Community Services (SHCS), the responsibility of BHIT (31 per cent).

Counting the \$7 million spent in FY2006/07 as part of the total, APTC spent \$134.4 million during Stage I, or an average of \$16.8 million per semester over the eight semesters, during which time 4436 students were enrolled and 3531 graduated. By comparison, \$143.4 million will have been spent by the end of Stage II, or an average of \$17.9 million per semester (Appendix Tables A.3 and A.4). Enrolment over the four years of Stage II is projected to reach 5401, and graduates, 4898. Expenditure in Table A.3 is organised according to the Basis of Payment (BOP) structure that DFAT requires APTC and the contractor (TAFEQ) to use for claiming cost reimbursements. The five BOP categories are: (1) capital & establishment, (2) corporate & student support, (3) direct training delivery, (4) personnel costs, and (5) scholarships. Table A.4 and the remaining expenditure tables and graphs in this annex will make use of chart of account categories more familiar to most economists and accountants and as suggested by the APTC Finance Manager. Figure 1 shows total expenditure in Stage I (2007–2011) and Stage II (2011–2015).<sup>69</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> The field work and analysis for this independent review were conducted between June and September of 2014. All of the financial and educational data reported in the review reflect actual values for the seven years from July 2007–June 2014, whereas all later data (from July 2014) are projected figures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> The review team acknowledges a mistake in the dollar figure shown for *Stage II management fees*. The amount should be \$20.7 million and not \$20.1 million (see Figure 3, below). This mistake resulted in a comparable underestimation of *Stage II total costs*. The total should be \$144,036,546 and not \$143,417,171 (the figure that appears throughout this independent review), a 0.4 per cent difference. The review team apologises for the mistake, which may have been a clerical error, or it may have been based on an earlier set of cost figures used for the analysis. The lower total cost figure has resulted in unit cost estimates slightly lower, and economic rate of return estimates slightly higher than they would be if the higher total cost figure were used in a re-estimation of all of the quantitative results. Given the relatively small size of the difference between the two dollar figures, the conclusions and recommendations based on these different results would be the same.



### Figure 1: Expenditure in Stages I and II by capital, scholarships, management, and other recurrent costs (AUD millions)

Source: Appendix Tables A.1 – A.4

Appendix Tables A.5 to A.9 show further breakdowns of expenditure by economic purpose and over the eight semesters of Stage II, for which the NAV software has made detailed analysis possible. Figure 2 shows the breakdown of the \$10.7 million of capital expenditure in Stage II. Figure 3 shows the payment of management fees over the four years of Stage II to TAFEQ, the single contractor and lead organisation in the APTC consortium. These fees amount to 14.0 per cent of projected Stage II total costs as compared with management fees in Stage I, which amounted to 8.9 per cent of Stage I total costs.

### Figure 2: Stage II capital expenditure (AUD millions, total \$10.7 million)



Source: Appendix Tables A.5 - A.9



#### Figure 3: Management fees paid to TAFEQ, Stage II (AUD millions, total \$20.7 million)

Figure 4 shows the breakdown of recurrent expenditure (everything other than management fees) over the four years. Figure 5 shows the same expenditure by the chart of account categories used by APTC's Finance Manager. Personnel costs and scholarships<sup>70</sup> account for \$54 million (48.3 per cent) and \$22 million (19.5 per cent) of recurrent expenditure, respectively. Course expenses, which include course consumables, student uniforms, and student excursions, account for \$9 million (8.1 per cent). Appendix Table A.7 provides additional information on what is included in each of the chart of account categories, and Tables A.8 and A.9 show more detailed breakdowns for two recent semesters (July–December 2013 and January–June 2014), for which actual expenditure information was available when this review was conducted.



### Figure 4: Recurrent expenditure other than management fees, Stage II (AUD millions, total \$112.6 million)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Scholarships, for students given them, cover transportation and accommodation costs. Scholarship students do not pay the nominal tuition fees paid by a very few students (about 3 per cent to date) or by the employers of some students (20 per cent to date).



### Figure 5: Recurrent expenditure by economic purpose, Stage II (AUD millions, total \$112.6 million)

Source: Appendix Tables A.3 - A.9

#### 4.2 Analysis of unit costs

A fundamental indicator of 'internal efficiency', the extent to which a school, a college, or an entire education system succeeds in producing outputs (of specified quality) at the lowest possible cost, is the *unit cost* – how much is spent per enrolled student or per full-time equivalent student (FTE), or how much is spent to produce one graduate. APTC has received criticism, both from Australian politicians and academics and from vocational trainers in the Pacific, for being such a high-cost training college, together with questions regarding the College's long-term sustainability. Figure 6 shows APTC's unit costs (cost per enrolled student, cost per full-time equivalent student (FTE), and cost per graduate) since the College opened its doors in July 2007. It can be seen that unit costs have come down over time, with the cost per student and cost per FTE 12–13 per cent lower and the cost per graduate 23 per cent lower in Stage II than in Stage I. This reflects, *inter alia*, the higher capital costs in Stage I (16.3 per cent of total expenditure versus 7.5 per cent in Stage II) and increased enrolments in Stage II (6162 FTEs versus 4432 in Stage I), which have led (all else equal) to an increase in the student–teacher ratio.

APTC's high unit costs can be attributed to a range of factors, including: (1) the high quality of the training that APTC provides (widely acknowledged, even by most critics of the College); (2) the dispersed population of the region, making potential economies of scale difficult to achieve; (3) the region's poverty (as well as Australia's generosity), which has led to the current situation wherein scholarships amount to a significant fraction of APTC's total cost (9.5 per cent in Stage I and 15.2 per cent in Stage II); and (4) APTC's heavy reliance to date on Australians and other high-cost expatriates to fill key administrative and teaching positions, in particular the positions of managers and trainers. The first three factors are ones that APTC and its stakeholders either do not wish to change (the high quality of training) or are powerless to address (the region's dispersed population and current poverty). The fourth factor (the reliance on expatriate staff) is one that APTC has begun to address, especially during 2014, and has plans to address further in any third stage of funding (see below, section 4.5). Moreover, the heavy financial burden on APTC of providing scholarships to approximately threequarters of students over the College's first seven years could be reduced in the future, especially if DFAT could replace scholarships with student loans (as proposed in section 6 below).



#### Figure 6: Unit costs, Stages I and II (AUD thousands)

Source: Appendix Table A.10

As for the capital costs, in analysing an institution's expenditure researchers would normally want to amortise these costs over the working lives of the assets. In the case of APTC, however, where funding has occurred in two four-year tranches, with no assurance of continuation beyond 2015, it was decided to treat all costs, including capital costs, as current. If DFAT decides not to renew APTC's funding for a third stage, presumably the capital assets will be handed over to the governments or partner institutions in the five campus countries, but their use for a continuation of anything resembling APTC seems doubtful, or at least uncertain.

In 2012 and 2013, AusAID commissioned (through two Australian firms, ACER and Austraining) a series of case studies on the financing of TVET in the Pacific. Final versions of five of the eight case studies were submitted to AusAID (now DFAT) in time for consideration by the authors of this review of APTC. The case studies estimate various measures of unit costs for the national training institutions (NTIs) studied in the five countries (Fiji, PNG, Samoa, the Solomon Islands, and Tonga). Appendix Table A.11 is an attempt to summarise the results for the five countries. Figure 7 compares the results for the five countries with APTC's estimated unit costs. The differences are striking, with APTC spending between 8 and 26 times as much per student and 6 to 12 times as much per graduate as the NTIs.



### Figure 7: Costs per student of national training institutions (NTIs) in the Pacific as compared with APTC (AUD thousands)

Source: Appendix Table A.11

Note: # APTC, Stages I and II combined.

Comparing unit costs in APTC with the 'average' NTI in a Pacific Island country is really, however, a comparison of 'apples and oranges'. The NTIs studied in the five countries offer courses at many levels and of widely different durations, whereas APTC offers mostly Certificate III (and a few Certificate IV and diploma) qualifications lasting between 4 and 18 months.<sup>71</sup> Moreover, despite the emergence of national quality authorities in some PICs, such as the SQA in Samoa and the Higher Education Commission in Fiji, there is not yet a common qualifications framework for the Pacific and no systematic and independent pegging of the emerging country-specific frameworks with the AQF in Australia. APTC may spend ten times as much to produce graduates as does a national training institution, but its graduates may also be 'ten times better'. To address this question requires the kind of 'external efficiency' indicators (impact of the training received on employment and on earnings) as recommended in Annex 8 of this review, for a fair comparison of the two training institutions.

A more meaningful comparison of APTC's unit costs is with TAFE institutions in Australia<sup>72</sup>, since APTC must satisfy the same AQF standards as the Australian institutions. The chair of the APTC Consortium Board, who is also the CEO of TAFE Queensland (TAFEQ, the Australian RTO awarded the contract for Stage II of APTC), provided the review team with estimates of costs per annual hour of curriculum (AHC) for RTOs in all of Australia and all of Queensland; for TAFEQ; and for Mount Isa TAFE (one of 11 campuses that comprise TAFE Queensland North, one of six locations under the TAFEQ umbrella following the 2013 reorganisation of the state's RTOs); see Appendix Table A.12. The reason for looking separately at Mount Isa TAFE is that it is a remote campus with a relatively small enrolment within Queensland and expected, therefore, to have higher than average unit costs, making for a fair comparison with APTC. The suggestion to compare APTC with Mount Isa TAFE came from the Consortium Board chair.

Figure 8 shows these comparisons (with AHCs having been converted to FTEs by dividing them by 720, which is assumed to be the instructional load of a full-time student). APTC's cost per FTE (\$28,100) is almost three times that of the Australian average (\$9700). It is, however, closer to that of Mount Isa TAFE (\$22,200), one of the highest cost TAFEs in Queensland.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> This is the range for Stage II. Course durations were longer in Stage I – between 5 and 22 months. This reduction in completion times is another explanation for lower unit costs in Stage II. (It should be noted that course durations include the time spent in work placement in addition to the time spent in APTC workshops and classrooms. This affects completion times for students in STT courses especially.)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> The evaluation team also looked into comparing APTC with TAFEs in Australia with respect to cost per graduate. As stated in an NCVER report, completion rates for VET programs in Australia by qualification level were: Diploma and above (44.3%), Certificate IV (44.3%), and Certificate III (40.0%) (NCVER 2014, Australian vocational education and training statistics – the likelihood of completing a VET qualification 2009–2012, p. 2). Since APTC completion rates have been higher, a comparison of costs per graduate would narrow the difference between APTC and Australian institutions. A completely fair comparison could not be done, however, because it was unclear whether the Australian data included students in VET institutions who are studying for less than full qualifications and because the team did not have details for comparative purposes of the specific qualifications pursued by students in the two places. An in-depth examination in the future of the Australian findings on completion rates would prove useful for refining the assessment of value for money of the APTC investment.



### Figure 8: Costs per FTE – a comparison of APTC with RTOs in Australia (AUD thousands)

Source: Appendix Table A.12

Typically, RTOs in Australia do not cover the transportation and living expenses of students, whereas 75 per cent of students entering APTC are awarded scholarships to offset these costs. The top bar in Figure 8 shows APTC's unit cost with \$34.6 million in scholarship costs excluded from the expenditure total. This adjustment brings APTC's unit cost within 12 per cent of Mount Isa TAFE's unit cost.

On the other hand, the counterfactual here is not the cost of sending approximately 10,000 Pacific Islanders to Mount Isa between 2007 and 2015 but, rather, the cost of sending them to RTOs in Australia with more typical unit costs (\$9 to \$10 thousand). To do so, Australia would have needed to subsidise, in full or nearly in full, their travel and living expenses. While travel to Australia and the cost of living there are certainly higher than the travel and living expenses for students who stay home and enrol at APTC, almost certainly they do not equal the 18 to 19 thousand AUD difference between APTC's unit cost and Australia's average unit cost. In other words, it may have been cheaper over the eight-year period (though, arguably, less beneficial for the 14 PICs) to send 10,000 Pacific Islanders to Australia for training than to establish and operate a new college for them in the Pacific.

This calculation may well change, however, as one looks ahead to a third funding stage for APTC (whether another four-year tranche or an open-ended renewal) with measures taken to rein in costs as recommended throughout this review. This is a decision for DFAT and Australia's body politic to consider. From an economist's perspective, what has already been spent on APTC can be treated as 'sunk costs'. What matters now is what amounts to the *best investment for the future*.

A related and perverse point is the fact that DFAT's indecision as of the second half of 2014 about whether APTC's funding will be renewed past the middle of 2015 almost certainly contributes to higher unit costs as this closing date approaches. APTC's planned enrolment for the first half of 2015 (387 students) is the lowest since 2012 and only a third of APTC's peak enrolment (in the first half of 2013 – 1127 students; see Figure 9). APTC management cannot plan on enrolling students in the first half of 2015 who would not be able to complete everything by 30 June 2015, the Stage II closing date. DFAT's late decision is, in fact, resulting in higher unit costs than would be the case if continuation were assured.

#### Figure 9: Students by semester, 2007–2015



Sources: Actuals (2007-June 2014) APTC EMIS, Projected (July 2014-June 2015), APTC management

Graduates in the final semesters of Stage II will actually exceed enrolments, as students who matriculated in earlier semesters complete courses that span more than one semester, but the number of graduates will fall (from its peak level in the first half of 2014 – 1106 graduates; see Figure 10). The same pattern of falling enrolments followed by falling graduates can be seen at the end of Stage I, although the declines were less dramatic, perhaps because the decision to extend APTC's funding for a second stage was made earlier in relation to the first closing date, making planning somewhat easier. If APTC funding is extended to 'Stage III' with another four-year tranche, DFAT's decision in regard to any extension beyond 2019 should be made at least one full year in advance.



#### Figure 10: Students and graduates by semester, 2007–2015

Sources: Actuals (2007-June 2014) APTC EMIS, Projected (July 2014-June 2015), APTC management

#### 4.3 Unit costs by training location

APTC was launched in 2007 with training locations in four Pacific Island countries – PNG, Samoa, Vanuatu, and Fiji (which is also where the Coordination Office, renamed Corporate and Student Services (CSS) in Stage II, is located). A fifth campus country (the Solomon Islands) was added during Stage II. In addition, APTC has offered smallscale, on-site training courses in four Small Island States (SIS's) during Stage II – Kiribati, Nauru, Palau and Tonga.

The NAV software enables the APTC Finance Manager to monitor expenses in all locations on a continuous basis.<sup>73</sup> Figure 11 shows the allocation of direct training costs to the training locations, as well as spending on 'overhead' cost items, which for purposes of this review will be allocated to the training locations on a pro rata basis (percentage of overhead costs = percentage of direct training costs). Two-thirds of Stage II expenditure supported direct training in the several training locations, and one-third supported overhead costs.<sup>74</sup> Figure 12 shows the percentage distribution of direct training costs by training location.

### Figure 11: Expenditure at training locations and on overhead categories, Stage II (AUD millions)



Source: Appendix Table A.13

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> The current structure of DFAT payments to APTC involves seven 'companies', all with bank accounts in appropriate locations and currencies. Five of the companies are the APTC offices in the five campus countries (with bank accounts denominated in FJD, PGK, WST, SBD and VUV). The sixth is the office in Australia, representing the consortium members – TAFEQ; TAFEQ East Coast (comprising the recent merger between Sunshine Coast Institute and Wide Bay Institute, with TAFEQ serving as the parent RTO); BHIT; and GRM. The seventh company is a 'consolidating company' into which DFAT makes payments in AUD to reimburse expenses incurred and claimed by the other six companies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> The bulk of APTC's overhead is made up of the management fees paid to TAFEQ, the Stage II contractor (42 per cent), expenditures on APTC by consortium members in Australia (17 per cent), and costs incurred by CSS, the corporate headquarters in Nadi (33 per cent). Allocating only two-thirds of total costs to direct training activities contributes to APTC's high unit costs, and planning for any third round of APTC funding should include measures to increase this percentage and reduce the share going to overhead. These measures would probably need to include a reduction in the negotiated management fees paid to whichever Australian RTO wins the contract for the next round, a streamlining of the complicated consortium arrangement used to manage Stage II (which has involved a division of responsibilities among two Australian RTOs and a development management firm), and the nationalisation of more staff, especially management staff, in CSS.





Figure 13 shows total Stage II expenditure by training location with the \$47.8 million in overhead costs allocated to locations on a pro rata basis. Fiji has accounted for the largest share of expenditure, as one would expect given that 42 per cent of Stage II enrolments and 43 per cent of Stage II graduates have received their training there. The Solomon Islands have accounted for the smallest share, which also makes sense given its delayed start-up (the campus in Honiara opened its doors only during 2012) and the relatively small numbers of students and graduates (7 and 9 per cent of Stage II totals). PNG has accounted for 80 per cent more expenditure than Samoa, which is rather surprising given that the two campuses enrolled about the same number of students (16 and 18 per cent of the Stage II total at PNG and Samoa, respectively).





Source: Appendix Table A.15

Appendix Tables A.16–A.19 provide the figures needed to take a closer look at unit costs across APTC's training locations. Figure 14 below shows the numbers of students who will have matriculated at and graduated from the several locations during Stage II, and Figure 15 presents the unit costs, obtained by dividing these numbers into the expenditure amounts shown in Figure 13 above. Costs per student are below the APTC-wide average for all of the training locations *except for PNG*, where it is 92 per cent higher (nearly double). PNG's cost per graduate is 75 per cent higher than the college-wide average.



Figure 14: Students and graduates by training location, Stage II

Source: Appendix Tables A.16 - A.19

### Figure 15: Cost per student and cost per graduate by training location, Stage II (AUD thousands)



Source: Figure 13 above and appendix Tables A.16 - A.19

The reasons for the much higher costs of training in PNG are complicated. On the one hand, although large in terms of population, PNG is among the poorest of the 14 PICs. Per capita income, about \$1.9 thousand in 2013 (see Figure 16), is less than half that of Fiji (\$4.2 thousand) and also well below that of Samoa and Vanuatu (\$3.4 and \$3.1 thousand, respectively). Only the Solomon Islands among APTC's five campus countries has a lower GDP per capita (\$1.8 thousand). Salaries paid by APTC to PNG national staff are about in the middle of the salaries paid in the five campus countries (Figure 17). These factors might lead one to expect unit costs in PNG to be the same as, if not lower than, those in the other campus counties.


#### Figure 16: GDP per capita, Pacific Island Countries, 2013 (AUD)

Note: No information available for Cook Islands, Nauru, Niue. Source: World Bank (2014), converted @ AUD =.0926 USD.



#### Figure 17: Index of APTC national staff base salaries

Source: Computed from salary data in APTC (2014d) ...

However, several other factors combine to explain PNG's higher than average unit costs. Security is a bigger issue than in the other four countries, and special measures to protect facilities and personnel add significantly to costs. Generally, APTC budgets 38 per cent more for equipment and materials in PNG and Solomon Islands than other countries owing to higher transportation costs and supplier markups. It is harder to recruit expatriate staff to work in PNG, leading to higher personnel costs; trainers in PNG work on a fly-in fly-out model, and they are provided with a higher remuneration package, and management staff receive an accommodation allowance (\$11 thousand per month) five times greater than staff in Fiji. Per student scholarships are also more, to cover higher lodging and local transportation costs. Finally, the most important single factor contributing to higher costs in PNG is the lower ratio of enrolments to fixed training costs. For example, in FY 2013/14 staff costs per student were twice as high in PNG (about \$12 thousand) as in Fiji. APTC PNG had several months at the start of Stage II without any trainers in place (owing to difficulty in sourcing) but needed nonetheless to carry the high cost of facility management.<sup>75</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Communication from APTC CEO 19 September 2014

Assuming that not much can be done to bring training costs at the PNG campus in line with those in the other four countires, a tempting recommendation for the future of APTC would be for training operations in PNG to be phased out. However, PNG accounts for three-quarters of the region's population (7.4 million out of 9.7 million – see Figure 18), so the cost-reducing impact of transferring training now offered in PNG to lower-cost training locations would be offset to some extent by the additional travel and subsistence costs for more PNG students having to go to Fiji, Samoa, Vanuatu and the Solomon Islands.<sup>76</sup> Also, the push-back from PNG in response to the loss of administrative and teaching jobs at APTC's PNG campus (not to mention the loss of other benefits of APTC's presence in the country, for example, the increased demand for housing and other commercial services, and disappointment on the part of some large firms in PNG that indicated to the review team their high level of satisfaction with the training offered by APTC in PNG) would be considerable. Therefore, the idea of closing down PNG operations in any extension of APTC, is almost certainly a political non-starter.



### Figure 18: Population (in thousands) of 14 Pacific Island countries (total 9,716.0 thousand), 2013 or latest available year

Source: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List\_of\_countries\_by\_population

#### 4.4 Student–teacher ratios, double-blocking and economies of scale

A key driver of unit costs in any school or college is the student-teacher ratio. Often, an easy way to reduce unit costs is to increase the number of students without increasing the number of teachers (or reduce the number of teachers without reducing the number of students). The scope for APTC to apply this strategy is constrained, however, by quality concerns, and also by safety considerations that limit the number of students in each student group (class), especially in courses that involve the use of potentially dangerous tools and machinery, as in many of STT's training packages and some of SHCS's programs (e.g., cookery).

APTC's student–teacher ratio has actually *fallen* between Stages I and II, even though the ratio of students to trainers has risen (see Figure 19). The explanation for this paradox is the College's increased use of tutors (Figure 20). The introduction of tutors,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Since 2007, PNG students have accounted for approximately 22 per cent of all APTC students, with Fiji, Samoa, the Solomons, and Vanuatu accounting for about 30, 12, 10, and 16 per cent, respectively, and the small island states together accounting for 10 per cent.

all of whom are Pacific Islanders and less expensive than trainers, most of whom, to date, have been Australian or other expatriates, was part of a strategy to reduce unit costs in the long run, by replacing Australian trainers with national trainers as the national tutors qualify for promotion. In the interim, however, the addition of tutors actually adds to operational cost given that most training (according to APTC management) does not need to be staffed by both a trainer and a tutor. In Stage I, the same courses were usually staffed by one trainer alone.



#### Figure 19: Student-teacher and student-trainer ratios, Stages I and II

Note: "Teacher" refers to the total of trainers and tutors. Source: Appendix Tables A.20 – A.21





Source: Appendix Tables A.20 - A.21

One way by which APTC *has* managed to reduce unit costs in some training locations is by running two (or more) offerings in the same subject area (not necessarily the same qualifications or competencies) at the same time. This has been referred to as double-blocking, and it results in cost savings if it can be done with three staff (one trainer and two tutors) for two course offerings, while most single blocks in Stage II have been implemented with two staff (one trainer and one tutor) for one course offering. This approach has been piloted in Suva, in carpentry and building (the construction, plumbing and services training package), diesel fitting (metal and engineering training package), and automotive, and it has recently been introduced also in Samoa. While double-blocking is certainly a way of reducing costs, the review

team heard from some expatriate trainers that the practice imposes increased levels of stress on trainers now responsible for simultaneous courses and for overseeing two, rather than just one, tutor. With the promotion of the first national tutors to trainer status in 2013, wherever double-blocking is in existence, this practice has been continued with two trainers (two national trainers, or one expatriate and one national) and with one or no tutors, resulting in even greater cost savings because of the salary difference between expatriate and national trainers.

Looking to the future, APTC might try to increase double-blocking possibilities by having the five campus countries specialise in smaller numbers of training packages. Up to this point, each of the five training locations may, in effect, have been doing too little of too many different things. Figure 21 shows that Fiji, in the first half of 2014, offered courses in 10 of the 11 training packages offered by APTC across all five locations – all of the packages except for health (HLT). Samoa and PNG offer courses in seven and six of the 11 training packages, respectively.



### Figure 21: Number of training packages offered by the five training locations, January – June 2014

Figure 22 shows where courses in the 11 training packages were offered in the first half of 2014. Construction, plumbing and services courses were offered in all five locations (actually, carpentry and building in all five, and plumbing and tiling and painting and decorating in only one location each). Tourism, hospitality and events courses were offered in four of the five locations (hospitality and tourism in all four, and cookery in three of the four). The question is whether costs could be further reduced by closing programs in some countries and enlarging the number of students in those programs in the other countries.<sup>77</sup>

Source: Appendix Table A.22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> There are, of course, counter-arguments. Mentioned already would be the increased travel and living expenses for students who could no longer study in their own countries. Also, the option of studying part-time that these students now have would essentially be eliminated.



### Figure 22: Number of training locations offering courses in different training packages, January – June 2014

Source: Appendix Table A.22

It is worth noting, however, that when APTC decided in 2013 to rest the automotive program in Samoa, in effect moving it to PNG, where a market analysis showed relatively higher demand for automotive graduates than in Samoa following six years of automotive training there, this led to an outcry of protest from Samoan stakeholders and politicians who viewed it as a kind of national betrayal. This demonstrates that annual or biennial fine-tuning of training offerings may be politically difficult for APTC to achieve.

#### 4.5 Nationalisation of APTC staff

APTC's high unit costs can be attributed to a range of factors, including: (1) the high quality of the training that APTC provides (widely acknowledged, even by most critics of the College); (2) the dispersed population of the region (making potential economies of scale difficult to achieve); and (3) the region's poverty (as well as Australia's generosity), which has led to the current situation wherein scholarships (awarded to offset student travel and living expenses – costs that are incidental to the training *per* se and not included, at least to the same degree, in the budgets of most other training institutions) amount to a significant fraction of APTC's total cost (9.5 per cent in Stage I and 15.2 per cent in Stage II). These three factors are ones that the College and its stakeholders either do not wish to change (the quality of training) or are powerless to address (the region's dispersed population and current poverty). A fourth factor related to APTC's high costs, however, which *can* be addressed and which the College *plans* to address (APTC 2013a) is its heavy reliance in Stages I and II on Australians and other high-cost expatriates to fill key administrative and teaching positions, in particular the positions of managers and trainers.

APTC's nationalisation strategy includes three objectives (APTC 2013a, p. 2):

(1) to maximise the strategic value of national employees (recruitment);

(2) to develop the strategic value of national employment (training and career planning); and (3) to contribute to the capability development of TVET institutions in the Pacific (partnerships and workplace opportunities for the staff of the partner institutions). While less specific in terms of the targets for management positions, the College's 2013 strategy set an explicit target of having 'one national trainer for every six expatriate trainers by the end of 2014' (ibid., p. 4) – in other words, having one out of every seven trainer positions filled by a Pacific Islander. When the fieldwork for this review began in June 2014, this target for the number of national trainers was far from having been met (only two national trainers), but two months later, by the end of July,

the target had been surpassed – with one out of five trainer positions nationalised as shown in Figure 23. By that date, only one out of seven management positions was filled by a Pacific Islander, but Pacific Islanders filled most (105 out of 116) of the positions in the other three categories in Figure 23.



### Figure 23: APTC staff by nationality (Pacific Island nationals and expatriates) and by position category as of 31 July 2014 (total staff 186)

Source: Appendix Table A.23

To estimate the impact of nationalisation on APTC costs over time (between July 2014 and July 2015 – the end of Stage II, and then, assuming there will be an extension of APTC funding, by July 2019 – the end of Stage III), the review team attempted first to break down APTC's personnel costs during FY 2013/14 (approximately \$15 million; see Appendix Tables A.8 and A.9) by nationality (expatriates and Pacific Island nationals), location (Australia and APTC's five campus countries), and compensation category (base salaries and the various benefits received by expatriate and national staff). Table 2 (a copy of Appendix Table A.24) shows the results of the team's (admittedly crude) analysis. The base salary amounts are derived from information obtained from APTC's Human Resources Manager on base salary rates (Appendix Table A.25) and on the number of staff in each position/location/nationality category (Appendix Table A.23).

#### Staff Benefits Total Contributions Payroll taxes Tax-free Leave compen Average Staff APTC campus (home, status of to supersation compenannuation Overseas Housing insuranc countries othe sick. Australians Benefits Base (base + sation per than Vanuatu) fund allowances allowance costs recreation in Pacific sub-total Worker group salary benefits) worker Coun 115,912 Australians in Australia 11.0 974.051 130.523 22,403 268,838 1.242.889 112,990 Australians (& oth. expats) in Pacific 56.5 4.950.881 826.619 1,217,917 1,688,250 113.870 233,240 589,155 1.572.800 6.241.851 11.192.732 198.101 Pacific Islanders working in Fiji 64.0 1,267,147 169,798 29,144 65,892 150,790 415,624 26,293 1,682,771 Pacific Islanders working in PNG 20.0 266,849 35,758 6,138 13,876 31,755 87,526 354,375 17,719 343,443 40,870 46.021 7.899 17.859 112.649 456.093 21.719 Pacific Islanders working in Samoa 21.0 Pacific Islanders working in Solomons 20 17.576 2.355 404 914 2.092 5,765 23.341 11.671 Pacific Islanders working in Vanuatu 11.0 222,516 29,817 5,118 26,479 61,414 283,930 25,812 Total 185.5 8,042,463 1,240,891 1,217,917 1,688,250 184,977 331,781 957,053 1.572.800 7,193,668 15,236,132 82.135

### Table 2: Approximate annual compensation (base salaries and benefits), APTC staff as of 31 July 2014 (AUD)

Sources: Staff numbers from Denise O'Brien, CEO, and additional information from Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, and Geolf Cooper, Manager Human Resources.

The benefit amounts are derived from rough coefficients estimated by the review team from the breakdown of personnel expenditure in FY 2013/14 (Appendix Tables A8 and A.9), which are then applied to the base salaries of staff in each of the location/ nationality categories. The coefficients as estimated by the review team are shown in Table 3.

	Coefficient	
	applied to	
Benefit	base salary	Staff receiving this benefit
Contribution to superannuation fund	13.4%	All
Overseas allowance	24.6%	Expatriate
Housing allowance	34.1%	Mostly expatriate
Staff insurance	2.3%	All
Payroll taxes (all countries except Vanuatu) a/	5.2%	All except those posted in Vanuatu
Leave (home, sick, recreation)	11.9%	All
Tax-free status of Australians working in Pacific	See table 4	Expatriate (Australian)

Table 3: Coefficients used by review team to estimate approximate benefits

Note: a/ Fiji, PNG, Samoa, and the Solomon Islands all collect payroll taxes. Vanuatu does not.

The Australian Tax Office (ATO) exempts Australian nationals working abroad from paying taxes at home (and the Pacific Island countries benefiting from APTC do not subject them to income taxes either). Although not shown on APTC's books, the tax exemption amounts to a cost borne by other Australians and should be considered as an additional cost of Australia's support of APTC. The taxes foregone by ATO have been estimated by the review team based on the applicable marginal tax rates in FY 2013/14. The rates are shown in Table 4.

Inco	ome	Marginal tax				
From	From To					
\$0	\$18,200	0%				
\$18,201	\$37,000	19%				
\$37,001	\$80,000	32.5%				
\$80,001	\$180,000	37%				
\$180,001	and above	47%				

#### Table 4: Australian income tax rates for FY 2013/2014

Source: Australian Tax Office (2014).

The results displayed in Table 2 can be summarised in two graphs. Figure 24 shows the allocation of personnel costs in FY 2013/14 to expatriates and Pacific Islanders and for each of the two groups by base salaries and benefits. The cost of employing 68 expatriates (nearly all Australian) was 4.4 times more than the cost of employing 118 Pacific Islanders, and benefits account for a much larger share of the total compensation going to expatriates (52 per cent) than the compensation going to Pacific Islanders (32 per cent). Figure 25 shows the approximate breakdown of each of the benefits for the two national groups.

### Figure 24: Approximate salaries and benefits, expatriate and national staff, FY 2013/14 (AUD millions; total \$15.2 million)



### Figure 25: Breakdown of benefits, expatriate and national staff, FY 2013/14 (AUD millions; total \$7.2 million)



Source: Appendix Tables A.23 – A.25

The reason for breaking down personnel costs in the base year (FY 2013/14) in Table 2 was so that personnel costs could then be estimated for later years as nationalisation takes place. APTC's CEO provided the review team with staffing projections for two points in the future, the end of Stage II (30 June 2015) and the end of a third four-year stage for APTC (30 June 2019). These are presented in Appendix Tables A.26 and A.28, with each table followed by the review team's re-estimation of total compensation to reflect the higher number of national staff as a share of the total (Appendix Tables A.27 and A.29).

Figure 26 compares the breakdown of staff in July of 2014 (actual figures as reported by APTC's CEO and HR Manager) and in June of 2019 (the end of Stage III, if there were to be a Stage III, as projected by the CEO). Across all staff categories, the CEO projects that national staff would increase from 64 per cent of the total in 2014 to 88 per cent in 2019, but the key changes resulting in cost savings will be from the increases in two categories – managers (from 15 per cent to 64 per cent) and 'teachers', the total of trainers, tutors, learning facilitators, and APTC-to-Work facilitators (from 58 per cent to 81 per cent, with most of the change consisting of the increase in national trainers).



### Figure 26: Nationalisation of staff by broad categories (managers, other admin., teachers), comparison of 2014 (actuals) and 2019 (projected)

Figure 27 summarises the results of the cost analysis, showing a comparison of the estimated personnel costs in 2014 and 2019. The main takeaway from this analysis is that the planned nationalisation of APTC's staffing will result (other things remaining the same) in a *reduction* of APTC costs – a reduction that is *significant*, but perhaps *not a game changer*. Increasing the number of national trainers from 10 in mid-2014 to 43 in mid-2019 and increasing the percentage of management positions filled by PI nationals from 17 per cent to 55 per cent would appear to result in \$2.1 million in annual savings by FY 2018/19. This amounts to 5.9 per cent of APTC's average annual expenditure during Stage II.<sup>78</sup> Whether the cost savings from nationalisation and other efficiency measures will result in a positive economic rate of return (ERR) on the investment in APTC to date and in any renewal is the key question, to be discussed in the next section.

Source: Appendix Tables A.23 and A.28

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> It should be noted that the dollar amounts in Figure 27 are 'real costs', meaning that DFAT would need to allocate more than \$13.2 million in the last year of any new four-year funding cycle in order to cover price inflation.

Figure 27: Estimated personnel costs broken down by compensation categories and nationality (2014 prices, AUD millions), comparison of 2014 and 2019



Source: Appendix Tables A.23 – A.29

#### 5. Cost-benefit analysis

# <u>Questions listed in the evaluation plan</u>: What has been the internal rate of return, net present value or benefit-cost ratio of the APTC investment? How does the ex-post economic rate of return compare with the ex-ante calculation of economic rate of return (EER)?

Surprisingly, and perhaps because APTC was initiated at the highest political level, with public pronouncements made by senior Australian and Pacific community officials, there seems to have been no appraisal, of the kind one would expect for an investment of this size, conducted by AusAID in 2006 and 2007 before APTC's launching in July of 2007. The first real mention of cost-benefit analysis (CBA) that the review team could find appeared in the Mid-Term Review of Stage I (Schofield et al. 2009). This only provided a *framework* for conducting a CBA (or ERR analysis) but no actual such analysis.

The design document for Stage II of APTC (Barber et al. 2010) did include an ERR analysis, but the document provided few details of the underlying assumptions and variable flows that would allow others to re-estimate the results. The document concluded that the base case ERR on the APTC Stage I investment, 'assuming 25 per cent of graduates find work in Australia soon after graduation, [stay] for 10 years and [remit] 40 per cent of their net earnings – is just under 12 per cent'. We know from tracer studies of APTC graduates that the percentage of graduates migrating to Australia and other high-income countries has been well below 25 per cent, probably below 3 per cent (Swanton & Ong 2013). The assumption of ten years away seems reasonable, but the percentage of earnings remitted by migrants back to the Pacific is not relevant to the estimation of the ERR. Higher earnings on the part of APTC graduates, no matter where these are earned or where they are spent, should all be treated as benefits of the APTC. In other words, the assumption in the Stage II design that 25 per cent of graduates would migrate to Australia results in an upward bias of the ERR estimation, whereas counting only earnings remitted back home results in a downward bias. In any case, the design document concluded that, 'if graduates obtain work only in their home countries after graduation, the ERR in most cases does not exceed 8 per cent'.

The current independent review generates new estimates of the ERR on the APTC investment, with assumptions and variable flows spelled out. ERRs are estimated from three different time perspectives:

- 1. Model 1 2007 to 2015: APTC was launched in 2007, so the first model takes 2007 to be 'year 0', the decision year for the investment. The costs of this analysis include all of the APTC expenditure between 2007 and 2015, the end of Stage II, plus an estimate of any earnings foregone by the students while enrolled at APTC. The benefits consist of the additional earnings attributable to the training on the part of graduates, most of whom will remain in the Pacific and not migrate, but some of whom will migrate to and find work in Australia or another high-income economy. The average age of those graduating from APTC is 35, and the analysis assumes that they will work for 20 years following their graduation to the average age of 55, the official retirement age in most (but not all) of the PICs. In fact, the assumption about retirement age is not very critical, given that benefits this far into the future are so heavily discounted in the CBA formulation.<sup>79</sup> The ERR estimates from the perspective of the 2007 investment decision will be referred to below as the model 1 estimates.
- 2. Model 2 2011 to 2015: The estimates of model 2 are from the perspective of 2011, the year in which it was decided to extend APTC funding for a second four-year tranche. Even if model 1 results in ERR estimates well below 11 per cent (assumed here to be the cost of capital and, therefore, the break-even ERR separating 'good' investments from 'bad' ones), the decision in 2011 can be thought-of as a forward-looking decision in which all Stage I costs are treated as sunk costs. Model 2, therefore, will look only at costs and benefits attributable to Stage II of APTC.
- 3. **Model 3 2015 to 2019**: By the same logic, model 3 will treat all Stage I and Stage II costs as sunk costs and estimate ERRs based only on the costs and benefits of a third four-year tranche. In model 3, the clock is reset once again, and 2015 becomes the decision point, or year 0. This is, in fact, the relevant decision for DFAT and Australia to consider at this time. What will be the value for money (VfM) of an APTC renewal that channels *additional* Australian tax dollars into this eight-year-old aid project? Of course, the answer to this question depends on how much money will be spent in any next operational round, how efficiently the money will be spent (as compared with Stages I and II), and how many Pacific Islanders will enrol, graduate, and benefit from the training in the next round.

It should be noted that the analysis in this independent review considers only the *dollar* costs and the *dollar* benefits of the investment. Questions having to do with Australia's reputation in the Pacific (and in the eyes of the global community at large) and the likely pushback from any decision to walk away from the project after eight years of support (whether abruptly, or over a period of time, according to some well-prepared and transparent exit strategy), while certainly relevant to Australia's ultimate decision, are not factored into the economic analysis.

Table 5 shows the parameters used for estimating the ERRs according to the three CBA models. For each of the parameters, the models are estimated with three different values: (1) a base case value, which amounts to the review team's 'best guess' of the real value, (2) a low or 'pessimistic' value, and (3) a high or 'optimistic' value.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Extending the assumed working life by seven years (retirement at age 62) was tried, and it was found to increase the base case ERR of model 1 from 6.4 per cent to 6.9 per cent.

### Table 5: Range of values for key parameters of the models used to estimate the ERRs and to conduct sensitivity analyses

				Values of v ERR se	variable for o	conducting alysis a/
				(1) Base "best	(2) Low ("pessi-	(3) High ("opti-
	Benefit or cost	Definition of variable	Unit	guess"	mistic)	mistic)
A.	Direct benefits in Pacific	Average earnings differential (taking unemployment into account) for those who stay in the Pacific	AUD/week	55	40	70
В.	Direct benefits for	1. Number of graduates who successfully migrate	%	2.5%	1.8%	3.2%
	those who migrate	2. Average time between graduation and migration	Years	4	8	2
	(to Australia or	3. Average earnings differential while living abroad	AUD/week	700	500	900
	another high-income economy)	4. Average duration (time between migration and return home)	Years	10	5	28 a/
		5. Average earnings differential after return home as multiple of A(2) above	AUD/week	= 2 x 55 (A1) = 110	= 1 x 55 (A1) = 55	= 10 x 55 (A1) = 550
C.	Opportunity costs (indirect costs or foregone earnings)	Production foregone while students in training (average earnings per week before entering APTC)	AUD/week	140	165	115
D.	Market discount rate (opportunity cost of capital)	Discount rate used to compute net present value (NPV = PV of benefits minus PV of costs ) and to compare with the estimated ERR to asses whether or not APTC has been/will be a "good" investment	%	11%	12%	10%

Note: a/ "Low" values are those that will result in relatively low estimates of the ERR, and "high" values those that will result in relatively high estimates.

The base case value for A, the *additional earnings* per week on average *of APTC graduates who stay in the Pacific and do not migrate*, is based on nearly 200 responses to questions included in a questionnaire administered to graduates in the five campus countries who attended focus-group meetings with the review team between June and August of 2014: (i) 'How much did you earn in the week before you started training at APTC?' and (ii) 'How much did you earn last week?' The difference between (ii) and (i), extrapolated over the graduate's remaining working lifetime, can be interpreted as the benefit received from the APTC training. The review team has settled on \$55 per week as its best guess estimate of this benefit.<sup>80</sup>

In addition to using these responses from graduates, the review team administered questionnaires to more than 200 *current* APTC students, who were also asked the first of the two questions that graduates were asked: How much did you earn in the week before you started training at APTC? The students' responses were combined with the responses from graduates and employers to estimate C, the *earnings foregone*, on average, by students who enrol at APTC. About two thirds (68 per cent) of the students and graduates reported that they were employed prior to enrolling. The loss of earnings (or the loss of production at work, even in the case of those (relatively few) students whose employers continue to pay them while they are studying) is an indirect cost (an opportunity cost) of the APTC training, and it needs to be added to the direct cost (expenditure by the College) in estimating the ERRs. The review team has decided on \$140 per week as its best guess estimate of C, the average opportunity cost of the time spent studying.<sup>81</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> The review team made an assumption about how to deal with graduates who worked and earned wages prior to APTC training but had not yet started working and earning again following graduation. Most of the graduates responding to the questionnaire in the focus group meetings had graduated quite recently (within the past two years). With their upgraded skills, many may decide to engage in an extended search for better (higher paying) jobs than they had before, rather than returning quickly to their old jobs (if still on offer) or to comparable jobs. It would be a mistake to interpret a positive wage prior to training and a zero wage shortly after training as a 'negative benefit' of the training. In estimating the average pre- and post-training earnings differential of APTC graduates, it was decided to treat cases such as the one just described as amounting to a 'zero benefit'. If anything, assuming that many individuals such as this will soon again find jobs, this is probably an underestimation of the benefit they will receive from their APTC training.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> To the extent that APTC graduates can replace high-cost foreign workers employed by industry and governments in the PICs, the savings in the salaries paid constitute another benefit accruing to the APTC investment. There is

The values for B (the parameters relating to the benefits of APTC training for graduates who migrate to Australia and other high-income economies) are based on a variety of sources. A recent tracer study of APTC graduates<sup>82</sup> showed that 112 of 6211, or 1.8 per cent, of respondents had migrated to Australia, New Zealand, the United States, Canada and the United Arab Emirates. Migrants are harder to track than graduates who stay home and, therefore, guite likely to be under-represented in APTC's tracer studies. It is also likely that some graduates who have not migrated in the short time since APTC started producing graduates will still do so at a later date. Of those who have migrated, or who, in responding to the survey questionnaire, express an intention to migrate, 52 per cent say that they would expect to stay away for more than five years. 43 per cent say they would expect to stay away for less than five years. and 5 per cent are unsure. Based on the above survey results, the review team decided on 2.5 per cent, four years, and 10 years as the best guess estimates for the percentage who will eventually migrate (B1 in Table 5), the average number of years between graduation and migration (B2), and the average time away before they return home (B4).

For B3 (the average *earnings differential of APTC graduates living abroad*), the review team conducted an analysis of Australian 2011 Census data showing the earnings of migrants to Australia from Fiji, PNG, and Samoa. In total, there were nearly 50,000 migrants from these three countries for whom weekly earnings data were available. The team extracted data only for those with Certificate III and Certificate IV credentials (N = 1769) and, from this group, for those whose occupations matched closely the qualifications offered by APTC's two schools, STT (N = 401) and SHCS (N = 578). The weighted average of weekly earnings for the two groups was \$862; see Table 6. On this basis, the team chose \$700 as its best guess estimate for the earnings differential of APTC migrants (over and above the counterfactual earnings of those at home in the Pacific without APTC training, which was assumed, as stated above, to be \$140 per week). For B4 (the *earnings differential of migrants after they return home*), given the absence of any hard evidence on which to base a best guess evidence, the review team chose \$110, or two times A (the differential for those who stay home and never migrate).

anecdotal evidence (e.g., assertions from employers who met with the review team) that some replacement of foreign workers by APTC graduates has occurred (see Chapter 4 and Annex 8), but the review team was unable to obtain reliable quantitative data on the extent to which it has occurred, so this benefit is not taken explicitly into account in the ERR analysis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Results provided to review team by Marty Rollings, Manager Quality, Performance and Research, APTC, Nadi.

	STT occupatio	ns	SHCS occupation	ons	All occupations a/		
Country	Average weekly		Average weekly		Average weekly		
of origin	earnings	Ν	earnings	Ν	earnings	Ν	
Fiji	1,104	131	780	431	876	804	
PNG	860	103	914	75	927	234	
Samoa	896	167	776	72	767	731	
Weighted	955	401	797	578	020	1 760	
averages		862		979	038	1,769	

### Table 6: Average weekly earnings of migrants from Pacific with Certificate III and IV training to Australia (AUD)

Note: a/ Includes occupations that do not correspond to APTC training; hence an N larger than the sum of the STT and SHCS N's.

Source: Australian Bureau of Statistics (2011).

Also needed to estimate each of the three ERR models are values, for each operational year included in the model, of the following flow variables: (1) direct costs (i.e., APTC expenditure); (2) the number of beneficiaries (i.e., graduates); and (3) the number of students enrolled. The third variable is needed for estimating opportunity costs (foregone earnings). It is also needed for estimating the costs for 2015–2019, the years of a hypothetical Stage III for APTC, in model 3. Two versions of model 3 were estimated. In 3.1, the base case scenario, it is assumed that the various efficiency measures introduced over the eight semesters of Stage III as recommended in this review will reduce the unit cost (i.e., cost per student) from its average level in Stage II to 90 per cent of that level by the last semester of Stage III (January–June 2019). In 3.2, a more optimistic scenario, it is assumed that efficiency measures will be twice as effective, reducing unit costs to 80 per cent of the Stage II average. The flow variable values (*actual values* for July–December 2007 through January–June 2014) and *projected values* for July–December 2014 through January–June 2019) are shown in Appendix Table A.30.

Given the values for the flow variables and for the parameters, it is then possible to picture each version of the APTC investment (models 1, 2, 3.1, and 3.2) by graphing the costs and the benefits – as shown in Figure 28 for model 1. The bar graph shows the total costs and benefits over the 29-year 'life' of the investment. The nominal totals in the model 1 case are \$296 million in costs and \$586 million in benefits, but as with any investment, the costs are 'front-loaded' and the benefits start later and continue into the future. Given the 'time value of money', the APTC investment can be deemed a 'good investment' only if the best alternative \$296 million investment would have resulted in a smaller (i.e., less valuable) future benefit stream. The conventional measure of the best alternative investment is the market discount rate, assumed here (in the base case scenario) to be 11 per cent. For the investment to be deemed a good investment, it would need to have an ERR of 11 per cent or higher.



### Figure 28: Costs and benefits of APTC Stages I and II – the model 1 investment (AUD millions)

In Figures 29 and 30, the costs and benefits of APTC Stages I and II are broken down into their component parts. By comparison with APTC expenditure (the direct costs), the foregone earnings of students (indirect costs) are small. Also, given the small number of APTC graduates who are expected to migrate to Australia and to other high-income economies, the increased earnings of those who stay and find work at home in the Pacific swamp the benefits associated with international labour migration.



### Figure 29: Direct and indirect costs of APTC Stages I and II – the model 1 investment (AUD millions)



### Figure 30: Benefits (increased graduate earnings) of APTC Stages I and II – the model 1 investment (AUD millions)

The estimation results of the four models are shown in Appendix Tables A.31 to A.34. The ERRs for the base case scenarios are summarised in Figure 31. None of the four models results in an ERR of 11 per cent or higher as needed to pass the break-even test. Models 3.1 and 3.2, however, result in ERRs at or above 10 per cent, which some analysts take to be the cost of capital and, therefore, the appropriate discount rate to use for CBA; 11 per cent is a more conservative criterion.

### Figure 31: ERRs of base case scenarios, models 1, 2, 3.1, and 3.2 as compared with 11% (opportunity cost of capital)



What the results suggest, therefore, looking only ahead and treating all costs in Stages I and II as sunk costs, is that APTC might be a marginally viable investment for GoA to consider supporting after Stage II funding comes to an end. An important lesson of APTC's first eight years, however, should not be forgotten – that any investment of APTC's magnitude ought to be properly appraised and subjected to a thoroughgoing, ex ante CBA. Probably that analysis would have shown a below-market ERR, and if so, the APTC investment should not have been undertaken *unless there were other good reasons for overriding the ERR criterion.* 'Good reasons' might have included a demonstrated impact on equity issues (addressing inequality across national, ethnic,

socioeconomic, and gender lines) or a strong belief in the existence of 'externalities' – benefits that accrue to individuals other than students and graduates (the direct beneficiaries) that are difficult to measure and that cannot, therefore, be reflected in an ERR analysis. Annex 6, above, included a discussion of APTC's impact on equity. This annex (Annex 9) will return shortly to the elusive question of indirect benefits, or externalities.

Appendix Tables A.31 – A.34 include, in addition to the base case ERR estimates, additional results showing how the ERR changes as each of the parameter values is changed, in turn, from the best guess value to a low (pessimistic) and then to a high (optimistic) value. Except for the substitution of \$70 for \$55 as the average earnings differential for APTC graduates in the Pacific (parameter A), and except for model 3.2 (efficiency gains amounting to 20 per cent of the average Stage II unit cost rather than 10 per cent), the optimistic assumptions do not raise the estimated ERRs to the 11 per cent break-even level. In other words, sensitivity analysis reinforces the conclusion that, based on measurable direct benefits alone, APTC has been a poor or, at best, a marginal investment by GoA.

There is, however, a *deus ex machina* that can make everything look better quickly, and this is the possible role of externalities or indirect benefits. There is ample reason to believe that APTC graduates contribute to workplace productivity, by passing along knowledge to co-workers and improving workplace organisation and procedures. It can, in addition, be argued that APTC enhances social welfare by training, for example, health care workers (leading to improved public health) and police force workers (helping to reduce crime and domestic violence). APTC's courses have also included a number of teaching staff of the national training institutions, enhancing the quality of training provided by these institutions. There is, in fact, a long list of possible and quite credible examples of indirect benefits. The problem is that these benefits are difficult (perhaps impossible) to measure, which means that incorporating them into the CBA requires bold assumptions.

Russell Mckay, a GRM consultant, has conducted an interesting analysis of APTC costs (Mckay 2014), in which he attempts to measure the 'indirect results achieved by the APTC'. His analysis concludes that, 'during Stage I there were 3610 graduates out of APTC, of these 3487 are employed and of these 2544 have affected the productive of their workplace on return', and that 'those 2610 graduates [have been] able to transfer skills and knowledge to an additional 9422 beneficiaries' (ibid, p. 18). The results for Stage II are similar: 4350 graduates, 4201 employed, 3065 affecting workplace productivity, and an additional 11,354 beneficiaries. In other words, the results of this study suggest that there have been 2.61 indirect beneficiaries for each direct beneficiary for both Stage I (9422 ÷ 3610) and Stage II (11,354 ÷ 4350). The author then re-computed the unit cost (cost per beneficiary) for APTC by dividing the costs by the sum of the direct and indirect beneficiaries, which naturally results in a much lower unit cost than the unit cost as conventionally measured. The study does not, however, proceed to the next step, try to put a dollar value on the benefits (how much value over time for each graduate, and how much for each indirect beneficiary), and estimate an ERR.

To complete the ERR analysis, the review team decided to be bold and extend the models by making assumptions about the number of indirect beneficiaries per graduate and the value accruing over time to each indirect beneficiary. The results of this hypothetical exercise are shown in Table 7. The ratio of indirect to direct beneficiaries was raised from 0 (the value in the earlier estimates) by integer steps to 3, reflecting Mckay's estimate of 2.6. For the dollar value accruing to each indirect beneficiary, the team had no data or earlier research to go by, so values were chosen that seemed quite low, erring perhaps on the side of caution – \$5.50 and \$11.00 (10 per cent and 20 per cent of the estimated value of the assumed direct benefit of each graduate

working in the Pacific). Even with these conservative assumptions, however, the impact on the ERR results are dramatic. The results are shown in Table 7 below and summarised in Figure 32. Very quickly as indirect benefits are added to the four models, the ERRs approach and then surpass the 11 per cent break-even value. The assumed indirect benefits are, however, only theoretical. To be fully credible, an ERR incorporating them would need to be based on empirically established evidence.

A. Number of indirect beneficiaries per graduate	0 (base case)	1	2	3	1	2	3
B. Benefit per indirect beneficiary as compared with	\$55 (assu	imed to be	e the <i>direc</i>	t benefit p	er graduat	te in the ba	ase case)
1. As % of \$55 per week	0%		10%			20%	
2. In AUD per week	\$0.00		\$5.50			\$11.00	
C. Indirect benefits per graduate ( = A x B2)	\$0.00	\$5.50	\$11.00	\$16.50	\$11.00	\$22.00	\$33.00
Model 1 (year 0 = 2007)	6.4%	7.6%	8.7%	9.8%	8.7%	10.8%	12.9%
Model 2 (year 0 = 2011)	8.8%	10.2%	11.6%	12.9%	11.6%	14.3%	16.9%
Model 3.1 (year 0 = 2015, cost savings 10%)	10.0%	11.6%	13.1%	14.7%	13.1%	16.2%	19.2%
Model 3.2 (year 0 = 2015, cost savings 20%)	10.9%	12.5%	14.1%	15.7%	14.1%	17.2%	20.4%

### Table 7: Impact on baseline ERRs of quantifying external (indirect) benefits and adding these to the ERR models (AUD)

### Figure 32: ERRs of base case scenarios with indirect benefits per graduate varying from \$0 to \$33 per week (AUD)



#### 6. Sustainability

<u>Tasks and questions listed in the evaluation plan</u>: Analyse the APTC Business Development Policy and non-DFAT sources of income, e.g., tuition sponsorships and fee-for-service, with a view to assessing APTC's financial sustainability. Is the Stage II target of 15 per cent of income from fee-for-service realistic?

The activity design document for the Stage II School of Health and Community Services (SHCS), prepared in 2008 by two consulting firms together with BHIT, concluded with a short statement in regard to the sustainability of APTC: '... issues of sustainability as would normally be associated with a development activity do not arise with respect to the operations of the APTC. The delivery of Australian qualifications by the SHCS will only remain sustainable while Australian Government funding continues' (Box Hill Institute, Gordon Institute, & MDI International 2008, p. 74). This section of Annex 9 will review facts that may have led to this conclusion and explore the extent to which they still seem applicable today, five years after the Stage II design, and applicable to APTC as a whole and not just to SHCS (one of APTC's two schools – the one for which BHIT is the responsible RTO and APTC consortium member).

One reason to doubt the sustainability of APTC in the absence of GoA funding is the College's high costs relative to incomes in the Pacific (see Figure 16 above) and in comparison with the costs of national training institutions (Figure 7 above). Even if APTC manages, by means of increased student throughput, nationalisation of staff (both management and training), and other efficiency measures, to reduce unit costs by as much as 20 per cent over the course of a third four-year funding cycle, the average cost per graduate will still be six times (in the case of Fiji and Tonga) to 15 times (in the case of Kiribati) higher than GDP per capita across the 14 PICs.<sup>83</sup>

Another reason to doubt APTC's sustainability is the fact that APTC students are generally not eligible for, or find it difficult to access, national training funds that are available for students who attend national training institutions (NTIs). This is true in a country like Samoa where political support for APTC has been rock-solid from the outset and even truer in a country like Fiji where there has been greater suspicion of APTC – seen as competing with NTIs for potential students and possibly contributing to skills drain,<sup>84</sup> and where APTC has been excluded from use of the national training levy. Cost recovery from APTC's beneficiaries (not just students but also employers in industry, government and donor organisations that need the specialised skills that the College imparts) would ease the burden on DFAT and contribute to APTC's long-term sustainability, but APTC's ability to recover costs has proven to be quite limited and inconsequential in relation to operational costs.

The Stage II contract for APTC included two targets for income generation over the four years: (1) \$2 million from tuition fees, and (2) \$5 million from fee-for-service activities, 10 per cent of which should be profit, to be split 50–50 between DFAT and APTC (the consortium). Figure 33 (based on Appendix Table A.35) shows APTC's revenue from sources other than DFAT during Stage II. The total of \$3.9 million amounts to just 2.8 per cent of total costs during Stage II, and only 52 per cent of this \$3.9 million had actually been received when this study was conducted in the middle of 2014. The rest (48 per cent) was projected by APTC's Finance Manager to come in over the last year of the four-year cycle. Even if these projections prove correct, the totals will amount to just 45 per cent and 50 per cent of the original targets for tuition fees and fee-for-service income, respectively.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> This statement excludes Palau, a PIC outlier, whose GDP per capita of nearly \$11,000 is more than double that of Fiji and Tonga. Even in Palau, however, GDP per capita would be less than half the estimated unit cost of APTC graduates in 2019 (\$23,400).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> This charge confirms that APTC is subject to attack from both sides on the issue of migration. Some argue that Australia has made it too difficult for graduates with Australian qualifications to enter the country for work, while others say that APTC paves the way for a skills drain that would be detrimental to the Pacific economies.





Source: Appendix Table A.35

In the case of tuition fees, these are set by APTC based on local provider rates for similar (Certificate I or II equivalent) courses, with a notional premium of 20 per cent to reflect the higher-level qualifications (Certificates III and IV) and recognised high quality of APTC's offerings. The fees for the same APTC qualifications differ across campus countries. They are assessed, in part, based on industry capacity to pay, which results, for example, in higher fees generally for STT courses in PNG than in Fiji despite the per capita income difference between the two countries. Appendix Table A.36 shows the fees by school and by country in 2014. The fees range from a low of \$380 (VUV 33,000) for some SHCS courses in Vanuatu to highs of \$2181 (PGK 4950) for some STT courses in PNG and \$2239 (FJD 3850) for some SHCS courses in Fiji. Clearly, even the high-end fees, those in excess of \$2000, reflect a significant APTC/DFAT subsidy, given that average unit costs are known to be in the \$26,000–\$30,000 range (Figure 6, above).

In general, students in the Pacific cannot afford to pay even the low-end tuition fees. From the start of APTC through June of 2014, according to APTC EMIS data only 127 students had financed their own APTC courses.<sup>85</sup> The lion's share (2860 or 72 per cent over the seven years) had received scholarships from APTC. A significant number of students (794 or 20 per cent) had been financed by their employers, and it might be reasonable to think this percentage could be nudged up in the future. For example, one proposal might be to require international employers to pay the tuition fees of enrolled employees or otherwise contribute funds to the College. More might be willing to do so, but the likelihood of some 'free riding' is evident. An international employer could 'fire' his or her workers prior to their applying for APTC training, with the implicit understanding between employer and workers that they will be rehired at the end of their training.

A possibility for the future would be for APTC to transition from a system of grants (scholarships) to a system of loans. If training increases the average graduate's weekly

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> One of the four peer reviewers, who happens to be from one of the 14 PICs served by APTC, claims that, despite poverty in the region, many families would be willing to pay tuition fees if they had reason to believe that the APTC credential would lead to international labour migration. Given, however, the low rates of migration on the part of APTC graduates to date, few families seem willing to incur any direct costs of APTC training.

wage by \$55, a \$380 tuition fee represents just seven weeks of additional earnings, and a \$2200 tuition fee, nine months. Spread out over a few years, graduates could easily afford to pay off these loans. The loans could be made income-contingent.<sup>86</sup> The key for APTC, of course, is how to ensure repayment once graduates are 'out the door'. One possibility would be to require every loan recipient to have an established, demonstrably dependable individual (a parent or other older relative, or perhaps the student's employer) to co-sign and guarantee the loan. If APTC (or DFAT) could make this work and establish a revolving loan scheme fund, this would amount to approximately 15 per cent in APTC cost savings (which, in terms of expenditure in Stage II, was more than \$5 million per year).

Another way for APTC to increase revenues from students would be to offer programs not oriented to full qualification outcomes – short courses that cover limited skill sets, but skill sets that students (or their employers) need for the work they are doing at the moment and should, therefore, be willing to pay for. Because these courses could be as short as a few weeks or even a few days, the fees would be smaller and more affordable than full-course fees. Students who have completed the short courses might decide, at a later date, to re-enrol to master other needed skills and, perhaps eventually, to complete full qualifications so as to obtain the corresponding credentials. According to the CEO of TAFEQ, who also chairs the APTC board, this behaviour is observed frequently on the part of TVET students in Australia.

Fee-for-service programs probably offer even greater scope for APTC cost recovery. Whereas tuition fees apply to the College's core programs and will continue to be highly subsidised by GoA, fee-for-service activities are off scope, and the costs are intended to be fully recovered, with no subsidisation from GoA. In fact, fee-for-service activities are meant to yield a 10 per cent profit over and above costs, for DFAT and the College to split. Some fee-for-service activities have been relatively small-scale, such as the Certificate IV course in TAE and the Diploma of Management, for which clients are already charged. There would seem to be scope, however, for larger fee-for-service activities demanded by industry and donor organisations. To date, APTC has landed few fee-for-service contracts with industry, but there has been modest success with donors, including FAO, the EU, NZAID, and UNDP *– as well as AusAID/DFAT*, which can contract with APTC for training that it needs in its bilateral aid projects.

Expenditure for project-related training appears as a cost on the donor's books but as a revenue item on APTC's books. In the interest of APTC sustainability, such arrangements could perhaps be pursued more vigorously. The successful examples to date have tended not to involve competitive tender, for which APTC would need to be more aggressive and quicker off the mark. APTC country and CSS managers have not had the time to devote much of their attention to business development activities. For a trial period, APTC hired a full-time business development officer based in Australia, but the position was dropped shortly thereafter because it seemed that the business generated would be unable to cover that person's salary.<sup>87</sup>

#### 7. Concluding remarks

As part of this independent review of APTC, which amounts to a belated mid-term review of Stage II, the review team was asked by DFAT to conduct a value for money (VfM) assessment of the APTC investment – looking back, between 2007 and the end of Stage II, and also looking ahead to a possible third round of funding. Unfortunately, the database needed for a proper VfM assessment has never been a demonstrated

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Australia should know about income-contingent loan schemes, having practically invented the concept (with the Higher Education Contribution Scheme) and having promoted the approach in a number of developing countries.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> For the above insights on tuition fees, fee-for-service activities and other revenue generating activities, the team acknowledges the help of Denise O'Brien and Jennie Dehn, APTC's CEO and Director of Corporate Services.

AusAID/DFAT priority when it comes to APTC. The mid-term review of Stage I, conducted five years before this review, included a careful list of essential survey information that would be needed to conduct a thoroughgoing and credible CBA (Schofield et al. 2009, Annex J), but those recommendations have been, to borrow from Shakespeare, 'more honoured in the breach than in the observance'.

APTC has conducted a series of graduate and enterprise surveys to provide information on training outcomes. A question on earnings in one of the early tracer study questionnaires was deleted in subsequent rounds in response to complaints from national staff that this question was culturally inappropriate in the Pacific, where people are uncomfortable supplying specific salary information. The question was replaced with another, innocuous and essentially useless one: Do you now earn more, the same, or less than you earned before you trained at APTC? For purposes of this new review, the team had to rely on answers to questions about pre- and post-training earnings included in a questionnaire administered to graduates (who were, it should be noted, surprisingly forthcoming for the most part) in focus group meetings in the five campus countries between June and August 2014. However, only some 200 graduates were able and willing to attend these meetings, and that turnout cannot be considered a representative sample of the approximately 8000 APTC graduates to date.

Questions about salary levels are culturally sensitive the world over presumably, but APTC and DFAT have both the leverage and a due diligence obligation to obtain credible information on the impact of APTC training on earnings. APTC's M&E system should be expanded to collect much fuller information on employment and wages from all APTC students before, during, and after their APTC training. One strategy would be to require, as a condition of their matriculation and certainly of any scholarship (or loan) support, a commitment from incoming students to provide this information. Entering students should be asked to sign an agreement that they will maintain an ongoing relationship with the College following graduation and cooperate when asked to provide status updates, including information on wages. The alumni associations in the various countries and locations within countries (e.g., the Fiji East and Fiji West associations) could be mobilised to assist the College in this regard. If loans replace scholarships in the future, one idea would be to offer some degree of loan forgiveness to graduates who provide information on a regular and timely basis.

To improve the ex post ERR analyses conducted in this review, more complete information on the employment and earnings of the historical Stage I and II cohorts (and, if possible as well, a sample of those trained in national institutions) ought to be collected. Although past students will be under no moral obligation, having signed no agreements to provide this information, the review team observed a high degree of goodwill and willingness to cooperate on the part of APTC graduates. Mail surveys would need to be followed up with emails and phone calls (as has been the case in most of APTC's earlier surveys), again with the help of the alumni associations. To test the validity of the tracer survey results, small sub-samples of non-respondents should be randomly selected and then followed up even more vigorously until enough data are available to determine whether respondents differ systematically from (initial) non-respondents.

DFAT's renewal of APTC funding should be contingent on a detailed, costed plan for an improved M&E system. Given the short time that now remains before the end of Stage II (30 June 2015), DFAT might want to consider a provisional APTC extension for a shorter than four-year time period (perhaps two years), enough time for APTC's board and management to complete the plan and initiate its implementation. A provisional extension for a limited time period would underline the point that another four-year renewal is not automatic but will require that issues, many of which were identified quite early on, finally get addressed. A decision at the end of the interim period to renew APTC funding for a longer period should be based on a convincing strategic plan that will include, inter alia, the improved M&E mechanisms so as to obtain, on a regular basis, feedback from employers on training needs and the performance of APTC graduates, as well as information on the prior training and work history of entering students and the labour market outcomes of graduates.

DFAT's decision (at the end of an interim period or at the end of a possible APTC Stage III) should be made at least one year before committed funds come to an end, so that APTC's management and Board can plan ahead and complete efficiently the necessary procurement (including recruitment of staff) so as to be ready for the next operational round (or, in the event of a 'no-go' decision, to wind down APTC operations in an orderly fashion). The decision at the end of Stage II (the decision that this review is meant to inform) will happen too late, contributing to a waste of resources.

Whatever DFAT's decision turns out to be, it should not be heavily influenced by any retroactive ERR analysis. Money spent between 2007 and 2015 is really 'water under the bridge'. DFAT's decision should be forward-looking and based on whether or not funding for APTC *in the future* seems to offer value for money. The economic analysis presented in this annex suggests that the answer to this question is, 'yes, perhaps', but a positive net present value will depend very much on the implementation of cost-cutting measures as recommended in this review and on there being a robust future pipeline of students trained in STT and SHCS specialisations for which there is demonstrated demand in the 14 PICs (and in Australia and other countries to which more Pacific Islanders might wish to migrate for work). Evidence on market demand in the future needs to be collected on an ongoing basis so that the ERR results can be updated continuously. Any review team asked in four or six years' time to assess whether APTC has provided VfM should not look back to this review as the most recent evaluation of this important, but expensive, aid program given to the 14 Pacific Island countries and funded by the taxpayers of Australia.

#### 8. Appendix tables

### Table A.1: Total expenditure by APTC operational categories, APTC Stage I (AUD)

							Total	Percent of
	Activity	2006/07 a/	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	Stage I b/	total
APTC OPE	RATIONS	7,071,948	28,395,799	30,059,536	30,948,518	25,170,313	121,646,113	90.5%
06B403	APTC Coordination Office	107,778	2,830,664	1,256,570	2,505,346	2,718,879	9,419,237	7.0%
06B404.1	School of Hospitality and Tourism	3,535,154	5,940,906				9,476,060	7.1%
06B405	Design of Health and Community Services Programs		720,812	-41,411			679,400	0.5%
06B404.2	School of Hospitality, Tourism, Health and Community Services c/			9,511,706	9,718,997	8,647,936	27,878,639	20.7%
06B406	School of Automotive, Construction, Electrical and Manufacturing d/	3,427,920	18,857,341	19,017,074	18,699,466	13,753,698	73,755,498	54.9%
06B407	Program Development and Coordination	1,096	46,077	315,597	24,709	49,800	437,279	0.3%
APTC SCH	IOLARSHIPS		1,472,011	2,251,733	7,664,577	1,365,058	12,753,379	9.5%
	Total by semester	7,071,948	29,867,810	32,311,268	38,613,095	26,535,372	134,399,493	100.0%
	Percent of total	5.3%	22.2%	24.0%	28.7%	19.7%	100.0%	

Notes:

a/ Spent on planning and preparations before the launching of APTC in July of 2007.

b/ Of which AUD 7,618,034 (5.7%) covered management fees and approximately AUD 21.9 million (15.9%) infrastructure (capital) costs.

c/ Became the School of Hospitality and Community Services (SHCS) in Stage II.

d/ Became the School of Trades and Technology (STT) in Stage II.

Source: Tina Seniloli, Program Manager, Skills Development and Labour Mobility, DFAT, Australian High Commission, Suva, Fiji.

#### Table A.2: Total expenditure by economic purpose, APTC Stage I (AUD)

							Total	Percent
	Activity	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	Stage I	of total
SC	CHOLARSHIPS	NA	1,472,011	2,251,733	7,664,577	1,365,058	12,753,379	9.5%
M	ANAGEMENT FEES a/	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	11,957,094	8.9%
	Sinclaire Knight Merz	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	7,305,886	5.4%
	Box Hill Institute of TAFE	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	4,066,381	3.0%
	Sunshine Coast Institute of TAFE	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	584,827	0.4%
01	HER OPERATIONAL COSTS	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	109,689,019	81.6%
	Capital	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	21.9 m	16.3%
	Recurrent	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	87.8 m	65.3%
	Total by semester	7,071,948	29,867,810	32,311,268	38,613,095	26,535,372	134,399,493	100.0%
	Percent of total	5.3%	22.2%	24.0%	28.7%	19.7%	100.0%	

Notes:

a/ Stage 1 was managed by three Australia-based contractors. Sinclair Knight Merz (SKM) for development and coordination and for operating the Coordination Office in Nadi. Box Hill Institute of TAFE (BHIT) was responsible for the programs in hospitality, tourism, health and community services. Sunshine Coast Institute of TAFE (SCIT) was responsible for the trades programs (automotive, construction, electrical and manufacturing).

Sources: The figure of AUD 21.9 million in capital spending cam from the 2009 mid-term review of APTC (Schofield et al. 2009). All other figures were provided by Tina Seniloli, Program Manager, Skills Development and Labour Mobility, DFAT, Australian High Commission, Suva, Fiji.

### Table A.3: Total expenditure by Basis of Payment (BOP) categories, as claimed by APTC and TAFEQ for reimbursement from DFAT, APTC Stage II (AUD)

	2011	2011 2012		20	13	20	14	2015	Total	Percent
Type of expenditure	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	of total
Capital & establishment	780,483	4,587,776	1,118,425	158,966	773	2,601,644	1,546,146	2,287,378	13,081,592	9.1%
Corporate & student support	316,686	692,925	465,482	196,334	569,258	456,004	392,252	276,192	3,365,132	2.3%
Direct training delivery	849,850	3,844,777	3,290,529	6,000,037	3,082,179	2,348,750	3,783,235	3,098,355	26,297,712	18.3%
Personnel costs	5,170,419	6,070,344	6,019,352	11,840,322	5,473,238	9,161,965	7,212,316	7,821,081	58,769,038	41.0%
Scholarships	2,700,000	1,752,030	1,792,197	3,125,150	3,439,325	3,088,008	3,388,890	2,555,471	21,841,071	15.2%
Sub-total (BOP)	9,817,438	16,947,853	12,685,985	21,320,809	12,564,774	17,656,372	16,322,839	16,038,477	123,354,546	86.0%
Management (TAFEQ)	4,980,625	4,380,625	619,375	4,380,625	619,375	3,843,250	619,375	619,375	20,062,625	14.0%
Total by semester	14,798,063	21,328,478	13,305,360	25,701,434	13,184,149	21,499,622	16,942,214	16,657,852	143,417,171	100.0%
Percent of total	13.1%	18.9%	11.8%	22.8%	11.7%	19.1%	15.0%	14.8%	100.0%	

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamics NAV database.

### Table A.4: Total expenditure by economic purpose (capital, personnel, scholarships, other recurrent, management), APTC Stage II (AUD)

	2011	20	12	20	2013		14	2015	Total	Percent
Type of expenditure	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	of total
Capital costs	285,560	1,568,059	982,323	1,092,814	139,332	4,326,439	755,000	1,621,461	10,770,988	7.5%
Personnel costs	5,017,745	5,935,632	5,687,454	7,426,589	8,232,437	7,388,122	7,795,975	6,848,677	54,332,631	37.9%
Scholarships	2,700,000	1,752,030	1,792,197	3,125,150	3,439,325	3,088,008	3,388,890	2,555,471	21,841,071	15.2%
Other recurrent costs	269,159	8,593,927	4,278,188	5,321,096	3,606,253	4,301,907	5,454,973	4,584,353	36,409,857	25.4%
Management fees (TAFEQ)	4,980,625	4,380,625	619,375	4,380,625	619,375	3,843,250	619,375	619,375	20,062,625	14.0%
Total by semester	13,253,089	22,230,273	13,359,538	21,346,274	16,036,722	22,947,726	18,014,213	16,229,337	143,417,171	100.0%
Percent of total	11.8%	19.7%	11.9%	19.0%	14.2%	20.4%	16.0%	14.4%	100.0%	

Note: Although the Stage II grand total is the same in tables A.3 and A.4, the allocations shown by semester are different because this table shows expenditures as they are incurred whereas table A.3 shows them according to when they are reimbursed by DFAT.

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamics NAV database.

### Table A.5: Capital expenditure by economic purpose (civil works, equipment, maintenance, handover reserve), APTC Stage II (AUD)

	2011	20	12	20	13	20	)14	2015	Total	Percent
Type of captital expenditure	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	of total
Major works			127,735	610,484	3,498	3,765,519	300,000	141,341	4,948,575	45.9%
Minor works	143,910	84,273	340,834	83,858	34,708	700		250,000	938,284	8.7%
Equipment	141,649	1,483,786	513,754	398,472	101,126	560,220	430,000	480,120	4,109,129	38.1%
Maintenance a/							25,000	250,000	275,000	2.6%
Handover reserve b/								500,000	500,000	4.6%
Total by semester	285,560	1,568,059	982,323	1,092,814	139,332	4,326,439	755,000	1,621,461	10,770,988	100.0%
Percent of total	2.7%	14.6%	9.1%	10.1%	1.3%	40.2%	7.0%	15.1%	100.0%	

Notes:

a/ Excluding any maintenance counted elsewhere under recurrent expenditures.

b/ Reserve for handover of premises to partner institutions in the event of APTC close-down.

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamics NAV database.

### Table A.6: Management fees paid to contractor (TAFE Queensland) for APTC Stage II (AUD)

Milestone		2011	20	12	20	13	20	)14	20	15	Total	Percent
type	Due dates	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan	-Jun	Stage II	of total
Flat manage-	Date	6/2011	6/2012		6/2013		6/2014				14 477 400	70.0%
ment fees	Fee	3,731,025	3,761,250		3,761,250		3,223,875				14,477,400	70.0%
	Indicator	Transition	Annual	Progress	Annual	Progress	Annual	Progress	Annual report	Completion		
Fees against	indioditor	deliverables	report/plan	report	report/plan	report	report/plan	report	7 minual report	report		
verifiable	Date	40,892	40,953	41,135	41,319	41,500	41,684	41,865	42,049	42,065	6,204,600	30.0%
Indicators	Fee	1,249,600	619,375	619,375	619,375	619,375	619,375	619,375	619,375	619,375		
Total	by semester	4,980,625	4,380,625	619,375	4,380,625	619,375	3,843,250	619,375	619,375	619,375	20,682,000	100.0%
Per	cent of total	24.1%	21.2%	3.0%	21.2%	3.0%	18.6%	3.0%	3.0%	3.0%	100.0%	

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamics NAV database.

		-								
Type of recurrent	2011	20	12	20	13	20	14	2015	Total	Percent of
expenditure	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	total
PERSONNEL	5,017,745	5,935,632	5,687,454	7,426,589	8,232,437	7,388,122	7,795,975	6,848,677	54,332,631	48.3%
Admin remuneration	1,901,439	2,795,498	2,377,487	2,978,181	2,902,860	2,734,945	2,922,372	2,948,372	21,561,155	19.2%
Trainer staff remuneration	2,257,532	2,608,066	2,332,480	3,745,459	4,413,204	3,970,040	3,477,009	2,909,106	25,712,897	22.8%
Tutor remuneration	90,660	108,886	227,176	345,585	492,986	666,254	544,786	541,183	3,017,517	2.7%
Other personnel costs	768,114	423,182	750,310	357,363	423,386	16,883	851,808	450,016	4,041,062	3.6%
PROPERTY COSTS	375,595	2,900,708	350,073	1,193,795	1,001,301	760,974	1,362,285	1,416,812	9,361,544	8.3%
Property Leases	96,551	965,079	127,037	360,901	541,691	267,743	698,939	703,465	3,761,408	3.3%
Other property costs	279,043	1,935,629	223,036	832,894	459,610	493,231	663,346	713,346	5,600,136	5.0%
ICT EXPENSES	107,750	350,199	312,922	566,623	489,632	505,264	663,823	477,055	3,473,269	3.1%
OTHER MINOR EQUIPMENT	24,896	301,749	34,907	97,036	184,317	335,619	1,019,153	343,500	2,341,176	2.1%
MISCELLANEOUS COSTS	587,150	2,202,494	1,179,413	1,999,721	1,456,245	1,047,857	1,268,009	1,445,776	11,186,665	9.9%
Consultants & profl fees	59,090	33,098	249,496	44,245	117,349	10,365			513,642	0.5%
Travel	281,448	457,269	491,922	972,349	714,929	350,304	806,063	956,063	5,030,348	4.5%
Transportation	23,628	147,770	60,092	188,285	106,579	114,493	94,620	92,100	827,568	0.7%
Other expenses	222,984	1,564,356	377,903	794,842	517,388	572,695	367,326	397,613	4,815,107	4.3%
COURSE EXPENSES	423,901	1,263,441	1,708,134	1,296,586	982,851	1,033,417	1,451,109	935,800	9,095,240	8.1%
SCHOLARSHIPS	1,349,807	2,983,581	2,448,683	3,292,485	2,931,233	3,374,244	3,079,483	2,520,881	21,980,395	19.5%
CAPACITY BUILDING	100,061	343,786	36,253			332,540			812,640	0.7%
TOTAL BY SEMESTER	7,986,904	16,281,590	11,757,839	15,872,835	15,278,015	14,778,037	16,639,838	13,988,501	112,583,559	100.0%
PERCENT OF TOTAL	7.1%	14.5%	10.4%	14.1%	13.6%	13.1%	14.8%	12.4%	100.0%	

#### Table A.7: Recurrent expenditure by economic purpose, APTC Stage II (AUD)

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamics NAV database.

Code	Expenditure item	Australia	Fiji CSS	Fiji	PNG	Samoa	Solomons	Vanuatu	SIS Kiribati	SIS Tonga	SIS Palau	SIS Nauru	All	locations
510000	PERSONNEL												8,232,4	37
	Admin & overhead staff salaries												2,2	18,490
	Admin & overhead staff LTA (> 6 months)	584,672	641,685	260,988	166,651	194,044	96,421	102,749	5,655	2,790	0	3,420		2,059,075
	Admin & overhead staff STA (< 6 months)	31,416	115,008	0	0	0	1,885	11,105	0	0	0	0		159,415
	Trainers, assessors & tutors salaries	415	2,299	1,085,424	463,403	532,590	75,247	309,630	0	0	0	5,395	2,4	74,402
	Superannuation	81,383	94,808	164,250	83,037	68,170	19,229	43,912	0	0	0	490	555	5,279
	Mobilisation/demobilisation	0	1,020	19,977	1,324	810	15,535	4,795	0	0	0	0	43,	461
	Mobility (overseas) allowance	1,583	116,288	277,760	39,210	108,538	36,649	65,163	0	0	0	0	645	i,191
	Housing allowance	0	91,673	271,755	301,617	93,366	90,267	89,722	0	0	0	0	938	3,400
	Staff accommodation (short-term housing)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	-
	Staff insurance costs	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	253	3,449
	Professional Indemnity and Staff insurances	4,274	0	0	216,514	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		220,789
	Staffinsurance	-12,074	7,714	24	19,436	2,998	3,838	6,400	0	0	0	0		28,335
	Work Accident (Samoa)	0	0	112	0	4,213	0	0	0	0	0	0		4,325
	WWO (work-in-work-out) allowances (for staff who fly in and out rather than set up residence)	0	0	0	109,357	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	109	),357
	Training & development	3,489	8,408	14,395	85	0	177	186	0	0	0	0	26,	740
	Payroll taxes (all governments except Vanuatu, which does not have an	35,165	40,968	38,860	68,753	61,213	7,812	5,633	0	0	0	185.87	258	3,589
	Miscellaneous	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	709	1,079
	Other staff on-costs (home, sick and recreation leave)	63,856	68,895	186,140	132,078	52,767	49,393	36,610	0	0	0	608.7		590,347
	Staff and visitor meals	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0
	Staff uniforms	638	507	3,512	2,759	7,110	935	138	0	0	0	0		15,598
	Other staff expenses (police checks, work permits, medical and fitness assessments, driver permits, etc.)	1,251	1,763	6,309	55,344	2,361	1,743	1,672	0	0	0	0		70,443
	Recruitment Costs	471	7,645	0	12,400	591	4,894	0	0	0	0	0		26,001
	Other allowances (misloaded PNG housing allowances)	0	0	0	6,689	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		6,689
	NA	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		0
511000	PROPERTY COSTS												1,001,3	01
	Property lease & rental payments	0	43,145	39,992	254,303	108,616	30,826	64,810	0	0	0	0	541	,691
	Other property charges	0	8,956	33,852	166,893	24,153	19,542	1,590	0	0	0	0	254	1,985
	Facilities & venue hire	0	0	0	5,850	3,243	933	218	0	0	0	0	10,	244
	Security	23	177	12,291	86,268	8,029	2,990	2,264	0	0	0	0	112	2,041
	Cleaning & waste disposal	0	1,270	11,742	63	40,448	841	15,296	0	0	0	0	69,	661
	Property repairs & maintenance	0	2,657	17,449	22,426	-31,833	175	1,802	0	0	0	0	12,	678
	Property insurance	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
511250	ICT EXPENSES			1			•						489,632	2
	Computer network costs	14,760	17,200	52,552	45,580	23,435	20,625	13,136	78	157	156	933.26	188	3,612
	Software related costs	6,081	42,156	23,326	11,488	9,909	4,661	5,560	251	480	762	1184.38	105	,858
	Hardware related costs	220	882	3,044	510	293	193	3,565	0	0	0	0	8,7	08
	Telephone charges	6,569	20,678	31,023	76,099	20,189	15,888	15,568	0	0	0	440	186	i,455
511500	OTHER MINOR EQUIPMENT					1				1	1		184,31	1
	Offset (depreciation) - buildings, plant and equipment	17,778	0	61,298	3,246	15,222	0	0	0	0	0	0	97,	543
	Offset (depreciation) - computer hardware/Ssoftware	12,009	0	5,256	0	2,310	1,100	0	0	0	0	0	20,	675
	Offset (depreciation) - "portable and attractive" (< \$2k)	0	7,016	21,746	3,413	1,082	32,841	0	0	0	0	0	66,	098

#### Table A.8: APTC recurrent expenditure, first semester of FY 2013/2014, July 2013 – December 2013 (page 1 of 2)

Code	Expenditure item	Australia	Fiji CSS	Fiji	PNG	Samoa	Solomons	Vanuatu	SIS Kiribati	SIS Tonga	SIS Palau	SIS Nauru	A	All loc	ations
512000	/ISCELLANEOUS COSTS												1,456	,245	
	Banking, marketing, registrations, consultants and other fees	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	29,07	4
	Advertising/Marketing/Promotions	585	42,511	2,438	13,103	7,852	1,257	2,233	0	0	0	0			69,979
	Bank Charges	31,615	1,248	835	2,522	1,102	356	775	60	24	0	0			38,538
	Consortium costs	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0			0
	Registration and fees	2.045	713	0	439	0	0	11	0	0	0	0			3,208
	Professional Fees	0	82.397	403	26.051	7,949	548	0	0	0	0	0			117.349
	Travel	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8	51.17	5
	Travel - International Airfare	30 415	74 468	29 825	83 591	23 117	6.048	9 139	0	0	0	3382.54			259,986
	Travel - Transport	8 365	6 597	5 108	10 533	5 336	1 368	1 325	0	0	0	0			38 631
	Travel - Accomm Meals and Other Incidentals	16 205	54 051	21 8/4	52 323	3/ 11/	11 2/1	22 230	0	0	0	453 75			212 462
	Per Dieme	16,203	24 500	52 0/15	22 580	27 27/	6 /08	16 510	0	2 800	0	400.10			203 850
	Matar Vahida aata	270	11 706	32,043	53,300	0 210	2,400	10,510	0	2,800	0	1474.00			106 570
	Other Travel Related costs	3/8	5 222	20,008	2 964	0,310	2,035	4,013	0	0	0	5818 47		+	20,579
	Staff amonities, graduations and other functions	3,455	0	0,991	3,904	1,915	2,322	0	0	0	0	J010.47	1	32 57	29,000
	Staff Amenities (e.g. coffee tea milk in offices)	3 173	4 779	7 637	2 131	2 380	527	2 247	0	0	0	0		02,011	22 875
	Functions & Graduations	371	24,815	36,630	12,621	18,205	6,781	7,114	0	3,166	0	0			109,702
	Consumables, postage, and freight	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	75,79	17
	Printing & Stationery	9,223	7,232	38,408	23,538	59,726	5,892	12,022	0	0	0	232.5			156,274
	Postage, Courier & Freight	841	2,615	3,028	9,140	1,070	633	2,197	0	0	0	0			19,524
	Other	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	6	7,622	
	Minor Equipment (< \$2k and not "portable and attractive")	2,069	6,913	15,569	5,066	2,589	0	1,321	0	0	0	0			33,528
	Rental/Lease costs - other (e.g., sound equipment)	0	0	-2	349	0	-98	0	0	0	0	0			248
	Equipment (< \$2K) mainetnance and repairs	287	687	1,884	11,167	0	0	14,249	0	0	0	0			28,275
	Miscellaneous Expenses	-39	122	1,001	2,898	810	46	602	131	0	0	0			5,571
542000		0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	000.0	20	0
513000 (		0	0	210 071	112 727	100 200	17 620	50.225	0	0		500.0	982,2	.39	
	Other Course related expenses (e.g., laundering of uniforms, student industry)	0	0	319,071	113,727	109,309	17,030	50,335	0	0	0	090.9	0	10,00	4
	visits, etc.)	66	32,113	36,058	167,041	8,015	0	22,039	0	0	0	0	2	65,33	1
	Student uniforms & PPE (property/plant and equipment, e.g. worker tool kits)	0	0	19,670	16,753	64,889	0	4,418	0	0	0	514.05	1	06,24	4
	Student excursions	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	
513500	CHOLARSHIPS (STUDENT-RELATED EXPENSES)												2,931	,233	
1 T	Student Accommodation	0	0	265,780	450,407	68,147	626	107,091	0	0	0	24445	9	16,49	5
	Student Living Allowance (Stipend)	0	15,582	251,764	50,723	251,713	0	188,834	0	0	0	7808.98	7	66,42	.5
	Student Travel (Airfares & Travel costs)	0	288,609	117,808	191,267	229,514	6,641	71,023	0	0	0	34386.74	9	39,24	8
	Scholarship Management	0	0	323	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	23	
	ourier scriolarsnip expenses (e.g., med. costs, sign language/disability assistance, orientation)	0	237	165,690	38,637	6,496	1,237	3,609	0	0	0	0	2	15,90	7
	Student Establishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)	0	5,547	16,067	17,726	27,037	0	6	0	0	0	0	6	6,383	j
	Student visas	0	0	9,326	195	15,462	977	492	0	0	0	0	2	6,451	
	Student medical	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	J	
514000	CAPACITY BUILDING		1		1		1		1			-	0		
	Partnership capacity building grants (contributions to partner VET institutions to build capacity)	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	)	
GRAND	TOTAL	979,268	2,045,484	4,094,945	3,746,550	2,346,206	607,716	1,345,960	6,175	9,416	918	94,765	1	15,27	7,404

#### Table A.8: APTC recurrent expenditure, first semester of FY 2013/2014, July 2013 – December 2013 (page 2 of 2)

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamics NAV database.

Code		Expenditure item	Australia	Fiji CSS	Fiji	PNG	Samoa	Solomons	Vanuatu	SIS Kiribati	SIS Tonga	SIS Palau	SIS Nauru	Α	II loca	tions
510000	PER	SONNEL												7,388	,122	
	/	Admin & overhead staff salaries												2,	,058,50	)3
		Admin & overhead staff LTA (> 6 months)	497,475	947,218	4,597	192,448	98,371	72,267	145,765	3,840	-1,651		1,200		1	,961,530
		Admin & overhead staff STA (< 6 months)		88,503	1	-2,713		39	11,143							96,972
	-	Trainers, assessors & tutors salaries	6,700	815	995,076	449,286	497,672	95,507	338,164		1,405	26,393	728	2,	,411,74	47
		Superannuation	61,421	62,416	181,029	83,645	63,260	23,390	48,911		130	305	64	52	24,571	
	Ī	Mobilisation/demobilisation		383	18,056	1,849	9,358	2,344	4,417		477			36	<u></u> д,884	
	Ī	Mobility (overseas) allowance		120,855	245,555	50,363	106,966	42,375	73,170					63	39,284	
	I	Housing allowance		106,994	215,395	230,925	95,638	79,043	112,441			4,517		84	44,953	
		Staff accommodation (short-term housing)				276,003	14,761		21,841					31	12,605	
	\$	Staff insurance costs												-7	1,257	
		Professional Indemnity and Staff insurances	-4,274			-116,050			0							-120,324
		Staffinsurance	-5,930	-1,934	6	43,765	5,569	-54	2,494							43,917
		Work Accident (Samoa)		1,773	265		3,059	54								5,150
	1	MWO (work-in-work-out) allowances (for staff who fly in and out rather than set up residence)	552			120,582								12	21,134	
	-	Training & development	1,910	400	8,980	1,931	664	0	768					14	4,653	
	I	Payroll taxes (all governments except Vanuatu, which does not have an	30,006	29,357	-2,055	6,178	18,064	-5,542	-126				54.55	75	5,936	
	Ī	Miscellaneous												4′	19,110	
		Other staff on-costs (home, sick and recreation leave)	26,870	75,944	68,492	104,941	40,613	19,892	32,534		35	82	298.96			369,702
		Staff and visitor meals				54,317			487							54,805
		Staff uniforms	448		8,928	5,744	82	0				29				15,232
		Other staff expenses (police checks, work permits, medical and fitness assessments, driver permits, etc.)	124	-464	-1,989	-28,363	-2,253	-900	-1,596				240			-35,200
		Recruitment Costs	1,388	3,388	405	4,568	2,808	6,634	2,228		1,232					22,650
		Other allowances (misloaded PNG housing allowances)				-6,213	-									-6,213
		NA					-1,866									-1,866
511000	PRO	PERTY COSTS												760,9	74	
	I	Property lease & rental payments		34,556	124,495	-126,377	143,479	32,337	59,252					26	37,743	
	(	Other property charges		3,681	12,922	122,999	16,800	13,165	-4,391					16	35,175	
	1	Facilities & venue hire			1,796	4,674	3	1,483	-3,176				294	5,	074	
		Security		359	16,463	120,591	-7,286	4,683	631					13	35,441	
	(	Cleaning & waste disposal		2,971	11,891	1,538	27,307	839	9,350					53	3,896	
	1	Property repairs & maintenance		1,194	20,315	48,424	26,165	149	27,070					12	23,318	
		Property insurance				1,601	269		8,456					1(	),326	
511250	ICT I	EXPENSES			1									505,26	ô4	
	(	Computer network costs	8,997	16,343	44,511	81,461	64,600	16,960	13,307	117	234	234	410.97	24	47,175	
	;	Software related costs	11,411	23,506	29,385	14,728	17,231	4,250	9,097	302	388	388	193.83	11	10,879	
	1	Hardware related costs		715	179	590	3,444							4,	928	
		Telephone charges	2,645	22,394	20,515	55,054	17,043	9,296	15,204			133		14	12,283	
511500	ОТН	ER MINOR EQUIPMENT								-	-			335,6	19	
		Offset (depreciation) - buildings, plant and equipment		21,577	201,477	3,545	6,110		297					23	33,007	
		Offset (depreciation) - computer hardware/Ssoftware		47,272	16,142	22,781		-78						86	3,117	
	(	Offset (depreciation) - "portable and attractive" (< \$2k)			467			16,028						16	3,495	

#### Table A.9: APTC recurrent expenditure, second semester of FY 2013/2014, January 2014 – June 2014 (page 1 of 2)

Since INFERSION CONFINE C	Code		Expenditure item	Australia	Fiji CSS	Fiji	PNG	Samoa	Solomons	Vanuatu	SIS Kiribati	SIS Tonga	SIS Palau	SIS Nauru		All loc	ations
Beaking marking, spatiation, conclute in other lass         Desc.         Conc         Conc         Sign 20         Sign 20 <td>512000</td> <td>MISCE</td> <td>LLANEOUS COSTS</td> <td></td> <td>943,8</td> <td>B13</td> <td></td>	512000	MISCE	LLANEOUS COSTS												943,8	B13	
by-dense Mariney Densions         model         56,07         50,09         37.27         38.08         model         95.21         95.8         95.40         95.00         95		Bar	nking, marketing, registrations, consultants and other fees												ŀ	159,20	0
Image: Sector for the construction of the			Advertising/Marketing/Promotions		58,376	8,009	10,823	2,070	1,727	3,803			512	80.8			85,400
p         p<			Bank Charges	36,231	986	1,125	2,164	1,195	401	969	114	48	71				43,306
Page and notabas         Boy         9,667         2,72         153         6,040         97         1,10         No			Consortium costs		283												283
Proteom         Image         Proteom         Image         Proteom         Image         Proteom         Image         Proteom         Image			Registration and fees	80	9,667	2,727	153	6,014	97	1,110							19,848
Image         Image <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>Professional Fees</td><td></td><td>191</td><td>-183</td><td>8,752</td><td>1,450</td><td></td><td>155</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>10,365</td></t<>			Professional Fees		191	-183	8,752	1,450		155							10,365
Tore-I-Intersoot         8.307         58,864         11,015         59,773         13,849         2,395         4,363         2,002         2,693         0         1         812,820           Tree-I-Intersoot         3,083         10,078         6,525         15,666         641         940         1,277         770         2,275         116         4,388           Fer Diars         10,652         2,266         14,415         10,208         24,464         4,197         15,609         2,275         116         4,388           Orber Travel Acloand Made and Other Indetentio         -1,008         10,464         32,009         7,791         5,588         -590         387         313         90         -4,576         3,851           Staff Annifes (q.2, obs, tau, nik o nfloa)         1,621         7,970         16,081         5,058         4,377         1,640         3,807         -2         205         15,42         4,40.02           Concumbels position and other Indetention         1,621         7,970         16,081         5,058         4,377         1,640         3,807         -2         205         16,42         1         42,022           Concumbels position and other Indetention         1,527         4,388         5,		Tra	avel				,	,							4	428,60	)6
Travel - Tanapot         3,083         10,078         6,525         15,66         -641         949         1,277         770         Image 1         Image 1         2,776         1mage 1         2         7700         Image 1         7700         Ima			Travel - International Airfare	8,307	58,864	11,015	59,773	13,849	2,395	4,363		2,002	2,693				163,262
Travel - Accom. Mails and Oher Incidentitis         985         1.210         2.4,031         19,088         691         -1,234         -663         1,232         2.275         1190         493.85           Pirr Dimm         10,652         22,686         14,415         10,281         24,464         4,197         15,609         -2,309         -         -         -         114.433           Other Timed Related costs         -1,103         4,621         -356,69         94         -598         387         131         90         -4376         3.810           Est ammentis, graduations and oth truckins         -1,103         4,621         -356,69         94         -598         -508         3.97         1.60         3.907         -         -         -         1.688         -         40.052           Est ammentis, graduations and oth truckins         -1,521         7,770         16,081         5,568         4.377         1,640         3.307         -         -         2.722.11         44.827           Consumbles, ontiget and freight         1,318         10.205         15,691         1.597         -,466         3.707         -         -         2.925         6.642         1.940         1.924         46.844			Travel - Transport	3,083	10,078	6,525	15,666	-641	949	1,277	770						37,708
Profile         10,02         22,866         14,415         10,281         24,464         4,197         15,699         -2,369         I <thi< <="" td=""><td></td><td></td><td>Travel - Accomm, Meals and Other Incidentals</td><td>985</td><td>1,210</td><td>24,803</td><td>19,908</td><td>691</td><td>-1,234</td><td>-663</td><td>1,232</td><td></td><td>2,275</td><td>190</td><td></td><td></td><td>49,398</td></thi<>			Travel - Accomm, Meals and Other Incidentals	985	1,210	24,803	19,908	691	-1,234	-663	1,232		2,275	190			49,398
Index         Mode         <			Per Diems	10,652	22,686	14,415	10,281	24,464	4,197	15,609		-2,369					99,935
Det         Trans         4,213         4,621         -35,469         94         -508         -59         387         131         90         -4.78         3.81           Stiff member         Comments         Comments <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>Motor Vehicle costs</td><td>1,068</td><td>10,445</td><td>32,050</td><td>57,791</td><td>5,958</td><td>2,202</td><td>4,978</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>114,493</td></t<>			Motor Vehicle costs	1,068	10,445	32,050	57,791	5,958	2,202	4,978							114,493
Staf Anemies (ag., odies, ba., mik in olicos)         1,621         7,970         16,081         5,088         4,377         1,640         3,37         1         6         1         1         4,002           Staf Anemies (ag., odies, ba., mik in olicos)         1,621         7,970         16,081         5,088         4,377         1,640         3,37         1         4         4         40.022           Consumbles, postige, and freight         2         10,222         21,482         35,414         23,393         7,646         13,707         4         205         142         12,273           Postage, Course A Freight         1,318         10,026         15,089         16,159         2,388         1,100         1,728         553         92         842.1         448.42           Minor Equipment( <sz and="" atracher)<="" not_portable="" td="">         4         5,748         3,839         35,594         642         5,949         24         6         6         4         42.422           Minor Equipment(<sz and="" atracher)<="" not_portable="" td="">         1,940         11,073         20,272         13,576         -2,597         6         6         6         6         4.302           Ratiel Gasin cosis-cosis-cosis-cosis anderis conintrables         1,940         25</sz></sz>			Other Travel Related costs	-1,103	4,621	-35,469	94	-508	-59	387	131	90		-4376			-36,191
Image: Sub-American Subscription         1,621         7,970         16,081         5,058         4,377         1,640         3,307         Image: Subscription         40.022           Fundors & Graduators         And Subscription         7,516         12,462         14,642         6,355         6,222         Image: Subscription         12722.31         48.027           Printing & Subscription         12,396         10,222         21,482         35,241         22,359         7,646         13,707         Image: Subscription         13.02         14,042         49,494           Other         Fright         1,318         10.020         15,089         16,159         14,172         553         92         84,21         49,494           Other         Fundories & Graduatories         Fright         1,318         10,072         2,945         -         1,797         -         14,424         49,494           Reside Calena Cases         1,904         11,073         2,927         13,576         -2,597         -         -         14,428         2,945           Equipment (* S2N manetranes and repars         1,904         11,073         2,927         13,576         -2,597         -         -         14,4584           Reside Calena Cases		Stat	ff amenities, graduations and other functions												5	88,880	)
Fundings & Science         Image: constraint of the science of t			Staff Amenities (e.g., coffee, tea, milk in offices)	1,621	7,970	16,081	5,058	4,377	1,640	3,307							40,052
End         Consumables, possige, and regint         Image Assignment         Image Assignm			Functions & Graduations		7,516	12,462	16,947	-3,438	6,395	6,222				2722.31			48,827
Printing Associate & Freight         12,396         10,222         21,482         35,241         22,358         1,709          205         15,42         43,434           Postage, Courier & Freight         1,318         10,205         15,089         16,159         2,358         1,109         1,728         553         92         85421         43,434           Minor Equipment (< \$2X, and not "portable and atracke")         5,748         3.39         35,594         642         5,949         24           43,434           Minor Equipment (< \$2X, and not "portable and atracke")         5,748         3.39         35,594         642         5,949         24            43,434           Equipment (< \$2X, mainthance and repairs         1,904         11,073         20,327         13,576          -2,597            44,822           Misodiances Express         31.36         1.307         20,3008         77,237         69,064         10,527         4,877         103,347           Stadent Long realised scanses         9,488         79         31,340         20,300         77,237         69,064         1,506         1,852         475.81           Stadert		Cor	nsumables, postage, and freight												·	172,73	37
Postage. Couler & Freight         1,318         10,205         15,089         16,159         2,358         1,109         1,728         553         92         884.21         49,480           Other         Minor Equipment (< 20x and not "portable and attractive")         5,748         3,839         35,594         642         5,949         24           1         94.390           Rental Lasse costs Other (e.g., sound equipment)         5,748         3,839         35,594         642         5,949         24           1         94.390           Rental Lass costs Other (e.g., sound equipment)         1,904         11,073         2,945           2,257         1.31            1         44.822           Miscellanceus Expenses         1,904         12,073         20,277         13,576          2,131            4.4282           Other Course related expenses (e.g., laundering of unforms, student industy         1,076         30,505         65,944         72,715         69,064         10,527         4,847         1250.14         78.384           Student Normodelion         9,483         29,230         25,001         10,405         74,743 <td></td> <td></td> <td>Printing &amp; Stationery</td> <td>12,396</td> <td>10,222</td> <td>21,482</td> <td>35,241</td> <td>22,359</td> <td>7,646</td> <td>13,707</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>205</td> <td>15.42</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>123,273</td>			Printing & Stationery	12,396	10,222	21,482	35,241	22,359	7,646	13,707			205	15.42			123,273
Other         Other         Image         Image <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>Postage, Courier &amp; Freight</td><td>1,318</td><td>10,205</td><td>15,089</td><td>16,159</td><td>2,358</td><td>1,109</td><td>1,728</td><td></td><td>553</td><td>92</td><td>854.21</td><td></td><td></td><td>49,464</td></t<>			Postage, Courier & Freight	1,318	10,205	15,089	16,159	2,358	1,109	1,728		553	92	854.21			49,464
Minor Equipment (< \$2x and not "portable and attacky")         5,748         3,839         3,594         642         5,949         24         Image: Comparing the second attacky and a		Oth	er												9	94,390	)
Rendul case costs - other (e.g., sound equipment)			Minor Equipment (< \$2k and not "portable and attractive")		5,748	3,839	35,594	642	5,949	24							51,797
Equipment (< \$2K) maintance and repairs         1,904         11,073         20,327         13,576         -2,597             4,832           Macellaneous Expenses         1.36         -3.0         -4,999         670         -1.31            1.634           Status         Course consumables         1.36         -3.0         -4,999         670            1.64.34           Realsed Cantrol Course consumables         1.940         235,451         1.46.481         203,008         77.237         69.064         1.0,527         4,847         761.058           Course consumables         1.940         235,451         1.46.481         203,008         77.237         69.01         1.0,52         4,847         761.058           Student coursions         PPE (property/plant and equipment e.g. worker look like)         1.076         35.944         27,415         1.24         6,917         1.24         1.457         1.843         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938         1.938			Rental/Lease costs - other (e.g., sound equipment)				2,945										2,945
Micelaneous Expenses         136         -310         -4,999         670         -131         I         I         I         4,634           71300         COLVES         0 <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>Equipment (&lt; \$2K) mainetnance and repairs</td><td></td><td>1,904</td><td>11,073</td><td>20,327</td><td>13,576</td><td></td><td>-2,597</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>44,282</td></td<>			Equipment (< \$2K) mainetnance and repairs		1,904	11,073	20,327	13,576		-2,597							44,282
Realese GainsLosses         O			Miscellaneous Expenses		136	-310	-4,999	670			-131						-4,634
S1300         COURSE EXPENSES         1,033,417			Realised Gains/Losses					0									0
R         Course consumables	513000	COURS	SE EXPENSES												1,033	3,417	
Other Course related expenses (e.g., laundering of unforms, student industry Student informs & PPE (property/iplant and equipment e.g., worker tool kits) Student exactions         1,076         30,505         65,944         27,415         124         6,917         124         1,457         5         133,622           Student exactions         Student exactions         PPE (property/iplant and equipment e.g. worker tool kits)         54,334         29,202         25,001         10,405         4,081         1,26         1,26         475.59         126,884           Student exactions		Cou	urse consumables		1,940	235,451	146,481	203,008	77,237	69,064		10,527	4,847	12501.44		761,05	i8
Student unforms & PPE (property/plant and equipment, e.g., worker bolk kis)         54,334         29,230         25,001         10,405         4,081         1,506         1,852         475.59         126.884           Student excursions         9,468         79         1,805         561         Image: Constraint of the state of the st		Oth	er Course related expenses (e.g., laundering of uniforms, student industry		1,076	30,505	65,944	27,415	124	6,917		124	1,457			133,56	j2
Student excursions       9,468       79       1,805       561       0       11,913         51300       SCHULARSHIPS (STUDENT-RELATED EXPENSES)       3374,244         Student Accommodation       496,630       674,384       86,993       131,875       0       1,389,881         Student Living Allowance (Spend)       3366,762       66,968       208,093       131,875       0       1,389,881         Student Travel (Arfares & Travel costs)       324,816       266,141       204,158       754       39,265       0       0       835,134         Scholarship Management       21       1,143       0       0       835,134         Other scholarship expenses (e.g., med. costs, sign language/disability assistance, orientation)       11,975       12,305       2,778       279       235,157         Student travel (arrange ment)       51,034       11,447       29,963       0       0       0       45,142         Student visas       Student students during their training or work placement)       0       31,859       4,969       8,314       0       0       0       883         Student visas       Student medical       62       21       800       0       0       0       883         Student visas		Stu	dent uniforms & PPE (property/plant and equipment, e.g. worker tool kits)			54,334	29,230	25,001	10,405	4,081		1,506	1,852	475.59		126,88	34
3,374,244         § Student Accommodation       496,630       674,384       86,993       131,875       0       1,389,881         Student Accommodation       366,762       66,968       208,094       125,468       0       714.65       774,439         Student Travel (Artares & Travel costs)       324,816       266,141       204,158       754       39,265       0       1,163         Other scholarship expenses (e.g., med. costs, sign language/disability assistance, orientation)       49,075       51,133       119,587       12,305       2,778       279       235,157         Student Visas       51,034       11,447       29,963       0       0       0       45,142         Student visas       51,034       11,447       29,963       0       0       0       45,142         Student visas       62       21       800       0       0       883       883         Student visas       69,867       226,000       36,673       0       332,541         Partnership capacity building grants (contributions to partner VET institutions to build capacity)       69,867       226,000       36,673       0       322,541         GRAND TOTAL       714,383       1,883,414       4,109,978       3,748,742 </td <td></td> <td>Stu</td> <td>dent excursions</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>9,468</td> <td>79</td> <td>1,805</td> <td></td> <td>561</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>·</td> <td>11,913</td> <td>\$</td>		Stu	dent excursions			9,468	79	1,805		561					·	11,913	\$
Student Accommodation         496,630         674,384         36,993         131,875         6         6         1,389,881           Student Living Allowance (Stipend)         366,762         66,968         208,094         125,468         6         6         774,439           Student Tavel (Airfares & Travel costs)         324,816         266,141         204,158         754         39,265         6         6         835,134           Scholarship Management         21         1,143         6         6         6         968         2,778         279         235,157           Other scholarship expenses (e.g., med. costs, sign language/disability assistance, orientation)         49,075         51,133         119,587         12,305         2,778         279         235,157           Student Visas         51,034         11,447         29,963         6         6         6         8.314         6         6         8.83           Student visas         Student medical         51,034         11,447         29,963         6         6         6         8.314         6         6         8.83           Student rest listions         Student medical         51,034         11,447         29,963         6         6         8.83         8	513500	SCHOL	ARSHIPS (STUDENT-RELATED EXPENSES)			1	r	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	3,374	4,244	
Student Living Allowance (Stipend)         Student Living Allowance (Stipend)         Student Living Allowance (Stipend)         774.65         774.439           Student Travel (Aifares & Travel costs)         Student Travel (Aifares & Travel costs)         324,816         266,141         204,158         754         39,265         Image: Control Control Costs         835,134           Scholarship Management         Image: Control Costs         Student Travel (Aifares & Travel costs)         Image: Control Costs         1,163         Image: Control Costs         1,163         Image: Control Costs         Image: Control Costs         1,163         Image: Control Costs         Image: Control Co		Stu	dent Accommodation			496,630	674,384	86,993		131,875					·	1,389,	881
Student Travel (AirBares & Travel costs)         Scholarship Anagement         324,816         266,141         204,158         754         39,265         Image: Control of the state of the sta		Stu	dent Living Allowance (Stipend)			366,762	66,968	208,094		125,468				7146.5	, i	774,43	39
Scholarship Management         21         1,143            1,163           Other scholarship expenses (e.g., med. costs, sign language/disability assistance, orientation)         49,075         51,133         119,587         12,305         2,778         279         235,157           Sudent Establishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         51,034         11,447         29,963            92,444           Student visas         51,034         11,447         29,963             45,142           Student visas         51,034         11,447         29,963             45,142           Student visas         51,034         11,447         29,963             45,142           Student visas         51,034         11,447         29,963            883           Student training or work placement)         62         21         800           883           Student training student capacity         69,867         226,000         36,673           332,541           GRAND TOTAL		Stu	dent Travel (Airfares & Travel costs)			324,816	266,141	204,158	754	39,265					8	835,13	\$4
Other scholarship expenses (e.g., med. costs, sign language/disability assistance, orientation)         49,075         51,133         119,587         12,305         2,778         279         235,157           Sudent Establishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         51,034         11,447         29,963         Image: Content Contend Contend Content Contend Content Content Content Content Conte		Sch	nolarship Management			21		1,143							·	1,163	
Bit destruction         Student Stablishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         51,034         11,447         29,963         Image: Control of the stablishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         92,444           Student visas         31,859         4,969         8,314         Image: Control of the stablishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         92,444           Student visas         0         31,859         4,969         8,314         Image: Control of the stablishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         1mage: Control of the stablishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         92,963         Image: Control of the stablishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         92,944           Student visas         0         62         21         800         Image: Control of the stablishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         92,944           Student residue         62         21         800         Image: Control of the stablishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training or work placement)         332,541           Partnership capacity         Total         714,383         1,883,414         4,109,978         3,748,742         2,172,013         556,094         1,398,803         6,37		Oth	er scholarship expenses (e.g., med. costs, sign language/disability		49,075	51,133	119,587	12,305		2,778			279			235,15	j7
or work placement)         or work placement)         S1,034         11,447         29,963         Image: Constraint of the state of		Stu	dent Establishment (STB, allowances paid to students during their training			54 024	44 447	20.002								00.44	
Student visas         Student		or v	work placement)			51,034	11,447	29,963								92,444	<i>.</i>
Student medical       62       21       800       69       62       21       800       69       683         Stiduot       CAPACITY BUILDING       Partnership capacity building grants (contributions to partner VET institutions to build capacity)       69,867       226,000       36,673       69,867       332,541         GRAND TOTAL       714,383       1,883,414       4,109,978       3,748,742       2,172,013       556,094       1,398,803       6,375       14,732       46,366       23,095       14,673,994		Stu	dent visas			31,859	4,969	8,314							4	45,142	2
514000  CAPACITY BUILDING       Partnership capacity building grants (contributions to partner VET institutions to build capacity)       69,867       226,000       36,673       1,398,803       6,375       14,732       46,366       23,095       14,673,994		Stu	dent medical			62	21	800							ł	883	
Partnership capacity building grants (contributions to partner VET institutions to build capacity)         69,867         226,000         36,673         56,094         36,673         332,541           GRAND TOTAL         714,383         1,883,414         4,109,978         3,748,742         2,172,013         556,094         1,398,803         6,375         14,732         46,366         23,095         14,673,994	514000	CAPAC	CITY BUILDING			1	n		1		1		1		332,	541	
GRAND TOTAL 714,383 1,883,414 4,109,978 3,748,742 2,172,013 556,094 1,398,803 6,375 14,732 46,366 23,095 14,673,994		Par buil	thership capacity building grants (contributions to partner VET institutions to Id capacity)			69,867	226,000			36,673						332,54	11
	GRAN	D TOTA	L	714,383	1,883,414	4,109,978	3,748,742	2,172,013	556,094	1,398,803	6,375	14,732	46,366	23,095		14,67	3,994

#### Table A.9: APTC recurrent expenditure, second semester of FY 2013/2014, January 2014 – June 2014 (page 2 of 2)

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamics NAV database.

#### Table A.10: Unit costs (cost per graduate, cost per student, cost per student contact hour, and cost per full-time equivalent student), APTC Stages I and II

	Total Stage I	2011	20	12	20	13	20	14	2015	Total
Indicator	July 2007-June 2011	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec a/	Jan-Jun a/	Stage II
Graduates	3,531	356	215	638	394	540	1,106	1,035	614	4,898
Students enrolled	4,436	529	287	442	1,127	968	926	735	387	5,401
Student contact hours (SCHs) b/	3,191,117	388,449	191,645	286,459	960,790	670,166	611,816	549,899	255,599	3,914,823
Full-time equivalent students (FTEs) c/	4,432	540	266	398	1,334	931	850	764	355	5,437
Total APTC costs (AUD)	134,399,493	13,253,089	22,230,274	13,359,538	21,346,273	16,036,722	22,947,725	18,014,213	16,229,336	143,417,171
Cost per graduate (AUD)	38,063	37,228	103,397	20,940	54,178	29,698	20,748	17,405	26,432	29,281
Cost per student (AUD)	30,297	25,053	77,457	30,225	18,941	16,567	24,782	24,509	41,936	26,554
Cost per SCH (AUD)	42.12	34.12	116.00	46.64	22.22	23.93	37.51	32.76	63.50	36.63
Cost per FTE (AUD)	30,324	24,565	83,518	33,579	15,997	17,229	27,005	23,587	45,717	26,377

Notes:

a/ The numbers of graduates, students, and student contact hours for July-December 2014 and January-June 2015 are projections by APTC for planning purposes.

b/ Student contact hours (referred to in other studies as student training hours or as annual hours of curriculum) are calculated by APTC as the number of students enrolled in each qualification course times the nominal hours in that course.

c/ Full-time equivalent students (FTEs) are calculated by dividing student contact hours by 720 (assumed to be the load of a full-time student). Note that a smaller divisor (520, in other words, FTE = SCH/520) is used in some studies, resulting in a larger estimate of FTEs.

Source: Marty Rollings and Benita McGovern, Managers QPR and Finance, and extracted from APTC's Edupoint and NAV databases.

## Table A.11: Unit costs as estimated by *Research into the financing of TVET in the Pacific* (country case studies managed by ACER and Austraining on behalf of AusAID/DFAT)

	Number of			Estimated uni	it costs (AUD)	
	TVET	Minimum & maximum		Per full-time		
Country (and	institutions	values across	Per student	equivalent		
time period of	studied (other	institutions studied and	training hour	student	Per enrolled	
data)	than APTC)	average of two values	(STH)	(FTE)	student	Per graduate
Fiii		Minimum	NA	NA	85	135
(2012)	11	Maximum	NA	NA	2,121	19,472
(2012)		Average	NA	NA	1,070	2,964
Papua New		Minimum	NA	NA	2,486	NA
Guinea	7	Maximum	NA	NA	5,756	NA
(2010)		Average	NA	NA	3,594	NA
Somoo		Minimum	0.40	291	649	1,014
(2011)	5	Maximum	2.43	1,752	2,140	4,391
(2011)		Average	1.23	888	1,324	2,690
Solomon		Minimum	0.26	189	423	1,021
Islands	12	Maximum	18.92	13,623	4,803	18,277
(2012)		Average	2.98	2,148	1,911	5,269
Tongo		Minimum	0.17	121	117	1,722
(2011/12)	7	Maximum	1.02	737	2,778	7,013
(2011/12)		Average	0.50	363	1,215	3,616
Average of	of averages (5 c	ountries studied)	1.57	1,133	1,823	3,635

Notes:

A student training hour (STH) is referred to in other places, including elsewhere in this report, as a student contact hour (SCH) or annual hour of curriculum (AHC). This variable is often used to compute full-time equivalent students (FTEs) or equivalent full-time students (EFTs) by dividing by the number of AHCs taken to be the instructional load of one full-time student. Divisors of 540 and 720 are used by different educational researchers. For the purposes of this review, 720 is used, that is, FTE = STH  $\div$  720, and the cost per FTE = the cost per STH x 720.

#### Sources:

Fiji (Maglen, Wall, & Rokvunisei, 2012), PNG (Horne, Ngangan, & Tavil-Melachon, 2013), Samoa (Maglen, Brown, & Lene, 2013), Solomons (Bateman, Cassity, Fangalasuu, 2013), Tonga (Bateman, Brown, & Uera, 2013).

Cost per annual hour of curriculum (AHC) a/														
Calendar year data	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	Average								
Australia (ROGS) b/	\$14.41	\$13.58	\$13.45	\$12.62	n/a	\$13.52								
Queensland (ROGS) c/	\$18.10	\$15.94	\$15.06	\$15.98	n/a	\$16.27								
Financial year data	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	Average								
TAFE Queensland d/	\$14.36	\$15.06	\$15.90	\$14.58	\$14.49	\$14.88								
Mount Isa TAFE e/	\$27.34	\$31.73	\$26.84	\$29.08	\$38.99	\$30.80								
Cost	Cost per annual full-time equivalent student (FTE) a/													
Calendar year data	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	Average								
Australia (ROGS) b/	\$10,375	\$9,778	\$9,684	\$9,086	n/a	\$9,731								
Queensland (ROGS) c/	\$13,032	\$11,477	\$10,843	\$11,506	n/a	\$11,714								
Financial year data	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	Average								
TAFE Queensland d/	\$10,339	\$10,843	\$11,448	\$10,498	\$10,433	\$10,712								
Mount Isa TAFE e/	\$19,685	\$22,846	\$19,325	\$20,938	\$28,073	\$22,173								

Table A.12: Costs per annual hour of curriculum (AHC) for Australia, Queensland, TAFE Queensland, and Mount Isa TAFE (a remote campus of TAFE Queensland), 2009–2014 (AUD)

Notes:

- a/ An annual hour of curriculum (AHC) is referred to in other places, including elsewhere in this report, as a student contact hour (SCH) or student training hour (STH). This variable is often used to compute full-time equivalent students (FTEs), also known as equivalent full-time students (EFTs), by dividing by the number of AHCs taken to be the instructional load of one full-time student. Divisors of 540 and 720 are used by different educational researchers. For the purposes of this review, 720 is used, that is, FTE = AHC ÷ 720, and the cost per FTE = the cost per AHC x 720.
- b/ Australian national average real recurrent expenditure per annual hour curriculum (AHC) per Report of Government Services (ROGS). Expenditure per annual hour is weighted to recognise different proportions of relatively more expensive and less expensive training programs that occur across jurisdictions.
- c/ Queensland variance to national average has through many investigations been found to be influenced by a number of factors including regionality, particularly in relation to remote area servicing and the mix of student cohort including those with high learning needs for a variety of reasons.
- d/ TAFE Queensland average total cost per AHC inclusive of capital and all other non-training associated business expenditures. Variability influenced by lumpy capital expenditures and profiles of delivery across years.
- e/ Mt Isa TAFE average total cost per AHC inclusive of capital and any other non-training activities and business expenditure. Variability influenced by quantum of output (AHCs) which dropped in 2013/2014 to 212,264 AHC from a 2012/2013 output of 414,580 AHCs, thus average cost increased due to fixed costs and other overheads.
- Source: AHC estimates and notes b e were provided by Jodi Schmidt, CEO of TAFE Queensland and Chair of the APTC Consortium Board.

# Table A.13: Total expenditure broken down by overhead costs and direct training costs, with direct training costs further broken down by training location, APTC Stage II (AUD)

		2011	20	12	20	13	20	14	2015	Total	Percent
	Training location	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	of total
DIREC	CT TRAINING COSTS	5,792,174	13,376,050	9,570,575	13,278,033	12,188,602	16,322,174	13,841,619	11,207,682	95,576,909	66.6%
Fij	ii training	2,427,386	6,628,789	4,516,810	4,230,250	3,931,108	5,191,372	4,008,436	2,862,984	33,797,135	23.6%
PN	١G	1,005,668	3,393,619	2,285,830	4,823,520	3,765,465	6,642,490	4,155,288	3,794,598	29,866,481	20.8%
Sa	amoa	1,285,744	2,025,047	1,604,883	2,416,644	2,353,191	2,174,635	2,369,846	1,856,735	16,086,726	11.2%
So	olomon Islands	4,429	1,108	108,017	465,880	681,452	752,555	1,562,757	1,288,399	4,864,597	3.4%
Va	inuatu	1,068,946	1,327,434	1,055,036	1,087,710	1,346,112	1,470,554	1,519,962	1,174,087	10,049,842	7.0%
SIS	S Nauru	0	0	0	244,903	94,765	23,095	6,263	6,263	375,287	0.3%
SIS	S Kiribati	0	51	0	3,216	6,175	6,375	28,710	57,460	101,987	0.1%
SIS	STonga	0	0	0	5,747	9,416	14,732	103,939	88,269	222,103	0.2%
SIS	S Palau	0	0	0	162	918	46,366	86,418	78,887	212,751	0.1%
OVER	RHEAD COSTS	7,460,915	8,854,224	3,788,962	8,068,240	3,848,121	6,625,551	4,172,594	5,021,654	47,840,262	33.4%
Au	istralia APT C	854,098	1,513,938	914,456	1,389,885	979,268	714,114	861,482	861,482	8,088,724	5.6%
Fij	i CSS	1,393,875	2,720,231	1,285,588	1,765,289	1,802,892	1,895,509	2,319,110	2,816,111	15,998,606	11.2%
SIS	S unspecified	232,317	239,430	22,950	0	0	0	0	0	494,698	0.3%
Ot	her unspecified	0	0	946,593	532,441	446,585	172,678	372,626	224,686	2,695,609	1.9%
Ha	andover reserve	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	500,000	500,000	0.3%
Ma	anagement (TAFEQ)	4,980,625	4,380,625	619,375	4,380,625	619,375	3,843,250	619,375	619,375	20,062,625	14.0%
	Total by semester	13,253,089	22,230,274	13,359,538	21,346,273	16,036,722	22,947,725	18,014,213	16,229,336	143,417,171	100.0%

Notes:

SIS = Small Island State, without an APTC campus.

CSS = Corporate and Student Services, APTC Headquarters, Nadi.

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamics NAV database.

#### Table A.14: Direct training costs as percentage of total direct training costs by location, APTC Stage II (AUD)

	2011	20	)12	20	13	20	14	2015	Total
Training location	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II
Fiji	41.9%	49.6%	47.2%	31.9%	32.3%	31.8%	29.0%	25.5%	35.4%
PNG	17.4%	25.4%	23.9%	36.3%	30.9%	40.7%	30.0%	33.9%	31.2%
Samoa	22.2%	15.1%	16.8%	18.2%	19.3%	13.3%	17.1%	16.6%	16.8%
Solomon Islands	0.1%	0.0%	1.1%	3.5%	5.6%	4.6%	11.3%	11.5%	5.1%
Vanuatu	18.5%	9.9%	11.0%	8.2%	11.0%	9.0%	11.0%	10.5%	10.5%
SIS Nauru	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	1.8%	0.8%	0.1%	0.0%	0.1%	0.4%
SIS Kiribati	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.1%	0.0%	0.2%	0.5%	0.1%
SIS Tonga	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.1%	0.1%	0.8%	0.8%	0.2%
SIS Palau	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.3%	0.6%	0.7%	0.2%

Notes: SIS = Small Island State, without an APTC campus.

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamic NAV database.

### Table A.15: Total expenditure by training location with overhead costs allocated in proportion to direct training costs, APTC Stage II (AUD)

	2011	20	12	20	13	20	14	2015	Total	Percent
Training location	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	of total
Fiji	5,554,110	11,016,691	6,305,001	6,800,711	5,172,216	7,298,670	5,216,790	4,145,757	51,509,947	35.9%
PNG	2,301,072	5,640,012	3,190,783	7,754,476	4,954,278	9,338,832	5,407,912	5,494,786	44,082,151	30.7%
Samoa	2,941,914	3,365,520	2,240,252	3,885,089	3,096,127	3,057,371	3,084,242	2,688,654	24,359,170	17.0%
Solomon Islands	10,134	1,841	150,780	748,967	896,596	1,058,035	2,033,854	1,865,673	6,765,881	4.7%
Vanuatu	2,445,859	2,206,125	1,472,721	1,748,645	1,771,099	2,067,486	1,978,159	1,700,143	15,390,236	10.7%
SIS Nauru	0	0	0	393,715	124,683	32,469	8,150	9,068	568,086	0.4%
SIS Kiribati	0	85	0	5,170	8,124	8,963	37,365	83,205	142,913	0.1%
SIS Tonga	0	0	0	9,239	12,389	20,712	135,272	127,818	305,430	0.2%
SIS Palau	0	0	0	261	1,208	65,187	112,469	114,232	293,358	0.2%
Total by semester	13,253,089	22,230,274	13,359,538	21,346,273	16,036,722	22,947,725	18,014,213	16,229,336	143,417,171	100.0%

Notes: SIS = Small Island State, without an APTC campus.

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamic NAV database.

	2011	201	12	20	)13	20	14	2015	Total	Percent
Training location	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	of total
Fiji	275	203	174	587	302	419	245	87	2,292	42.4%
PNG	48		11	278	123	132	176	96	864	16.0%
Samoa	94	50	120	170	211	137	139	57	978	18.1%
Solomon Islands				9	106	48	90	97	350	6.5%
Vanuatu	112	34	137	64	185	171	65	50	818	15.1%
SIS Nauru				19					19	0.4%
SIS Kiribati					41				41	0.8%
SIS Tonga									0	0.0%
SIS Palau						19	20		39	0.7%
Total across all countries	529	287	442	1,127	968	926	735	387	5,401	100.0%

#### Table A.16: Number of matriculating students by training location, APTC Stage II

Source: Marty Rollings, Manager Quality Performance & Research, and extracted from APTC's Edupoint database.

#### Table A.17: Number of graduates by training location, APTC Stage II

	2011	1 2012		20	13	20	14	2015	Total	Percent
Training location	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	of total
Fiji	200	104	363	184	244	398	371	224	2,088	42.6%
PNG	31	12	82	23	98	213	260	139	858	17.5%
Samoa	49	39	111	128	78	199	190	116	910	18.6%
Solomon Islands				9	47	193	121	90	460	9.4%
Vanuatu	76	60	82	50	73	56	58	45	500	10.2%
SIS Nauru						30			30	0.6%
SIS Kiribati						17			17	0.3%
SIS Tonga							17		17	0.3%
SIS Palau							18		18	0.4%
Total across all countries	356	215	638	394	540	1,106	1,035	614	4,898	100.0%

Source: Marty Rollings, Manager Quality Performance & Research, and extracted from APTC's Edupoint database.

#### Table A.18: Cost per student by training location, APTC Stage II (AUD)

	2011	2012		20	13	20	14	2015	Average	Index
Training location	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	(avrg=1)
Fiji	20,197	54,269	36,236	11,586	17,127	17,419	21,293	47,652	22,474	0.85
PNG	47,939		290,071	27,894	40,279	70,749	30,727	57,237	51,021	1.92
Samoa	31,297	67,310	18,669	22,853	14,674	22,317	22,189	47,169	24,907	0.94
Solomon Islands				83,219	8,458	22,042	22,598	19,234	19,331	0.73
Vanuatu	21,838	64,886	10,750	27,323	9,574	12,091	30,433	34,003	18,814	0.71
Small Island States				21,494	3,571	6,702	14,663		13,230	0.50
Average across all countries	25,053	77,457	30,225	18,941	16,567	24,782	24,509	41,936	26,554	1.00

Source: Marty Rollings and Benita McGovern, Managers QPR and Finance, and extracted from APTC's Edupoint

#### Table A.19: Cost per graduate by training location, APTC Stage II (AUD)

	2011	2011 2012		20	)13	20	14	2015	Average	Index
Training location	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	(avrg=1)
Fiji	27,771	105,930	17,369	36,960	21,198	18,338	14,061	18,508	24,670	0.93
PNG	74,228	470,001	38,912	337,151	50,554	43,844	20,800	39,531	51,378	1.93
Samoa	60,039	86,295	20,182	30,352	39,694	15,364	16,233	23,178	26,768	1.01
Solomon Islands				83,219	19,077	5,482	16,809	20,730	14,708	0.55
Vanuatu	32,182	36,769	17,960	34,973	24,262	36,919	34,106	37,781	30,780	1.16
Small Island States						1,082			15,973	0.60
Average perces all countries	27 220	102 207	20.040	5/ 170	20 600	20 749	17 405	26 422	20.201	1 10

 Average across all countries
 37,228
 103,397
 20,940
 54,178
 29,698
 20,748
 17,405
 26,432
 29,281
 1.10

 Source: Marty Rollings and Benita McGovern, Managers QPR and Finance, and extracted from APTC's Edupoint
 Source
 Source

and NAV databases.

		Cate-	Stage 1								Stage 2 (through end of 2014)								Total Stage	Total Stages
	Training package		2007	20	08	20	09	20	10	20	11	20	12	20	13	20	14	Total	Il (thru end	I and II (thru
School	(ANZSCO code)	a/	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Stage I	of 2014)	end of 2014
		St	18	128	38	61	35	148	86	82	26		58	31	154	166		596	435	1,031
Both	Training and	Tr	1	1	1	1	2	3	3	3	2	1	2	3	3	2	1	15	14	29
School Both SHCS SHCS SHCS SHCS SHCS	assessment (TAE IU)	Tu																0	0	0
		St								18			6		20	61		18	87	105
SHCS	Business services	Tr																0	0	0
	(BSB07)	Tu																0	0	0
		St			61	37	92	45	66	88	109	107	168	154	185	178	160	389	1.061	1.450
SHCS	Community services	Tr			2	3	4	4	4	5	4	4	10	10	10	10	10	22	58	80
	(CHC08)	Tu				-	-	-		-	1	1	3	4	8	8	4	0	Total Stage II (thru end I of 2014)         I           14         0           87         0           87         0           0         1           0         1           0         1           1,061         58           29         83           7         1           4         0           37         2           1         1,329           75         2           353         27           15         761           776         48           155         2           7         15           761         7           6866         1           51         2           7         6           511         3           32         2           0         5,013           329         1           188         1           0         5,013           329         1           102         1	29
		St				15		14	12	13	15	10	16	12	30	-		54	83	137
SHCS	Hairdressing (SIH11)	Tr				1	1	1	1	2	1	1	1	2	1	1		6	7	13
	3(1)	Tu					-					-	1	1	1	1		0	4	4
		St														17	20	0	37	37
SHCS	Health (HLT)	Tr														1	1	0	2	2
		Tu															1	0	1	1
		St	19	157	238	178	298	282	237	210	186	146	160	190	222	206	219	1.619	1.329	2.948
SHCS	Tourism, hospitality	Tr	3	10	12	18	19	17	16	15	9	11	11	13	13	0	0	110	75	185
	and events (SIT07)	Tu	Ŭ	10	12	10	10		10	10	1	3	8	8	12	12	8	0	52	52
	Automotive industry retail, service and repair (AUR12)	St		37	39	83	40	28	16	21	16	2	6	105	100	37	87	264	353	617
STT		Tr	2	1	2	5	5	5	4	4	4	2	3	2	5	5	6	28	27	55
0		Tu	-	-		1	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	2	3	3	3	5	15	20
	Construction	St		74	51	. 111	. 84	100	140	70	81	. 12	5	287	178	97	101	630	761	1 391
STT	Construction,	Tr	2	4	7	a	10	14	16	10	10	7	7	10	13	13	11	72	71	143
0	services (CPC08)	Tu	-	-	,	2	2	4	4	4	4	6	7	7	0	8	7	16	/8	64
	. ,	St		57	76	2	14	4	13	12	24	0	4	83	3	28	16	172	155	327
STT	Electrotechnology	Tr	1	3	3	5	5	4	5	3	24	3	4	3	5	20	1	20	22	51
0	(UEE11)	Tu		5	5	5	5	4	5	5	5	5	4	1	2	1	2	0	7	7
		St	0	114	47	145	148	143	18	79	72	10	10	265	79	110	131	694	686	, 1 380
STT	Metal and	Tr	5	7	10	11	12	11	12	0	0	5	6	7	10	7	7	77	51	128
0	engineering (MEM05)	Tu	Ŭ	,	10		1	1	2	2	3	3	4	4	7	7	4	6	32	38
		St							~	2	Ŭ	5	-	-	,	26	-	0	26	26
STT	Textiles, clothing and	Tr														1	1	0	20	20
0	footwear (LMT07)	Tu																0	0	0
		St	37	567	550	630	711	760	599	503	520	297	442	1127	068	026	734	4 436	5.013	9.449
Tota	l across all training	Tr	14	26	37	53	58	59	61	51	42	34	442	50	60	520	47	359	329	688
packa	ages (including TAE)	Tu	0	20	0	33	30	59	7	7	42	14	26	27	42	40	47	27	199	215
		St	10	157	200	230	300	341	315	320	310	262	350	356	457	462	200	2 080	2 507	4 677
Total a	across SHCS training	Tr	3	10	14	230	24	22	21	329	14	16	22	25	24	21	20	138	1/2	280
	packages	Tu	0	0	0	0	24	0	0	0	2	4	12	13	24	21	13	0	86	86
		C+	0	202	242	220	200	0	107	100	2	4	12	740	21	21	13	1760	1091	2744
Total	across STT training	Tr	10	282	213	339	200	2/1	10/	162	193	17	34	22	357	290	335	206	172	3741
	packages	т.,	10	15	22	30	32	34	3/	20	20	17	20	22	33	29	20	200	1/3	3/9
		IU	0	0	0	3	4	6	1		8	10	14	14	21	19	16	27	102	129

### Table A.20: Students, trainers and tutors by school (SCHS and STT) and training package, APTC Stages I and II (- end of 2014)

Notes: JI = July, De = Decmeber, Ja=January, Jn= June, St = students, Tr = trainers, Tu = tutors. Sources:

EMIS: Martin Rollings, Manager Quality Performance and Research, APTC CSS, and extracted from APTC's Edupoint databases. Human Resources: Geoff Cooper, Manager Human Resources, APTC CSS.

### Table A.21: Student-teacher and trainer-tutor ratios by school (SHCS and STT), APTC Stages I and II (- end of 2014)

			Stage 1								Stage	2 (thr	ough	)		Stage II (thru	Stages I and II		
Component of		2007	2007 2008		20	09	20	2010		11	2012		2013		2	014	Total	end of	(thru end
APTC	Ratio	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Ja-Jn	JI-De	Stage I	2014)	of 2014
	Student-teacher a/	2.6	21.8	14.9	11.3	11.5	11.7	8.6	10.2	10.2	6.0	6.3	14.6	9.5	10.1	9.7	11.5	9.7	10.5
APTC as a	Student-trainer	2.6	21.8	14.9	11.9	12.3	12.9	9.6	11.6	12.6	8.4	10.0	22.5	16.1	17.8	15.6	12.4	15.2	13.7
whole	Student-tutor	No tut	ore in /		210.0	177.8	126.7	84.0	84.7	52.9	20.5	17.0	41.7	23.0	23.2	25.3	164.3	26.7	43.9
	Trainer-tutor	NO LUI	013 117		17.7	14.5	9.8	8.7	7.3	4.2	2.4	1.7	1.9	1.4	1.3	1.6	13.3	1.8	3.2
	Student-teacher a/	18.0	128.0	38.0	61.0	17.5	49.3	28.7	27.3	13.0	No TAE	29.0	10.3	51.3	83.0	No TAE	39.7	31.1	35.6
Training and assessment	Student-trainer	18.0	128.0	38.0	61.0	17.5	49.3	28.7	27.3	13.0	courses	29.0	10.3	51.3	83.0	courses	39.7	31.1	35.6
(TAE)	Student-tutor													No TAE tutors					
	Trainer-tutor							1		luior 3									513
School of	Student-teacher a/	6.3	15.7	21.4	10.5	16.3	15.5	15.0	15.0	19.4	13.2	10.3	9.4	10.2	11.0	12.1	15.1	11.4	12.8
hospitality and	Student-trainer	6.3	15.7	21.4	10.5	16.3	15.5	15.0	15.0	22.1	16.4	15.9	14.2	19.0	22.0	20.0	15.1	18.3	16.7
community	Student-tutor			N		C tutor				155.0	65.8	29.2	27.4	21.8	22.0	30.7	No SHCS	30.2	54.4
services	Trainer-tutor			1		o tutora	5			7.0	4.0	1.8	1.9	1.1	1.0	1.5	tutors	1.7	3.3
	Student-teacher a/	No	18.8	9.7	10.3	7.9	6.8	4.3	5.5	5.7	0.9	1.0	20.6	6.6	6.2	8.0	7.6	7.2	7.4
School of	Student-trainer	STT	18.8	9.7	11.3	8.9	8.0	5.1	7.0	7.4	1.4	1.7	33.6	10.8	10.3	12.9	8.5	11.5	9.9
technology	Student-tutor	cours	No S	STT	113.0	71.5	45.2	26.7	26.0	24.1	2.4	2.4	52.9	17.0	15.7	20.9	65.2	19.4	29.0
teernlology	Trainer-tutor	es	tuto	ors	10.0	8.0	5.7	5.3	3.7	3.3	1.7	1.4	1.6	1.6	1.5	1.6	7.6	1.7	2.9

Note:

a/ The number of "teachers" used to compute the "student-teacher" ratio is the total of trainers and tutors.

Sources:

EMIS: Martin Rollings, Manager Quality Performance and Research, APTC CSS, and extracted from APTC's Edupoint databases.

Human Resources: Geoff Cooper, Manager Human Resources, APTC CSS.

#### Table A.22: Training packages (and specialisations) offered across five campus countries and three small island states, January – June 2014

	Training package (ANZSCO code)									Number of
	Program of study (specialisation)	within			Solomon		SIS	SIS	SIS	countries where
School	I training package a/	Fiji	PNG	Samoa	Islands	Vanuatu	Kiribati	Nauru	Palau	courses offered
Both	Training and assessment (TAE10)	1	1	1	1	1	1			6
SHCS	Business services (BSB07)	1				1				2
	Community services (CHC08)	1		1		1		1		4
SHUCS	Aged/disabled	1		1						2
51105	Child/youth	1		1		1				3
	Other	1				1		1		3
SHCS	Hairdressing (SIH11)	1		1						2
SHCS	Health (HLT)			1						1
	Tourism, hospitality and events (SIT07)	1	1	1		1			1	5
SHCS	Hospitality/tourism	1	1	1		1			1	5
	Cookery	1		1		1				3
STT	Automotive industry retail, service and re (AUR12)	epair 1	1		1					3
	Construction, plumbing and services (C	PC08) 1	1	1	1	1				5
	Building and carpentry	1	1	1	1	1				5
STT	Painting and decorating	1								1
	Plumbing			1						1
	Wall and floor tiling	1								1
STT	Electrotechnology (UEE11)	1	1							2
STT	Metal and engineering (MEM05)	1	1	1						3
STT	STT Textiles, clothing and footwear (LMT07)									1
Total ti	training packages offered at this loo	cation 10	6	7	3	5	1	1	1	8
	SHCS training packages	4	1	4	0	3	0	1	1	5
	STT training packages	5	4	2	2	1	0	0	0	5
	Training and Assessment	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	0	1

Note:

a/ Broken down for training packages that comprise several distinct programs usually requiring different trainers and tutors.
					Adminis-	Adminis-			Learning	APTC to		
		Assistant	Supervisor/	HR/ICT	trative	trative			support	Work		
Position title	Manager	manager	coordinator	officer	officer	clerk	Trainer	Tutor	facilitator	tutor	Labourer	
Grade (PI national staff)	NS6	NS5	NS4	NS3	NS2	NS1	NT5	NT 1&2	LSF1	NT2	b/	Total
			Australia	n nationa	Is (and oth	er expatria	te staff)		-			
Australia BHI	0.5	0.5	2	1	2							6
Australia SCIT	0.5	1	1.5	2								5
Fiji Corp. HQ	7	1	1				2					11
Fiji campuses	3						11					14
PNG campus	1		1				10					12
Samoa campus	1						5.5					6.5
Solomons campus	1						5					6
Vanuatu campus	1						4					5
Palau							2					2
Total expatriate	15	2.5	5.5	3	2		39.5					67.5
Percent of expatriate staff	22%	4%	8%	4%	3%		59%					100%
				Pacific	c Island na	tionals						
Australia BHI												0
Australia SCIT												0
Fiji Corp. HQ	2		6	9	6						1	24.0
Fiji campuses	1		3	3	2	2	6	13	2	2	5	39
PNG campus				4	1	3		10	1	1		20
Samoa campus			2	3	3		2	8	1	1	1	21
Solomons campus			1		1							2
Vanuatu campus			2	3			2	2	1	1		11
Palau								1				1
Total PI nationals	3		14	22	13	5	10	34	5	5	7	118
Percent of PI national staff	3%		12%	19%	11%	4%	8%	29%	4%	4%	6%	100%
				A	II APT C sta	ff	-	-				
Australia BHI	0.5	0.5	2	1	2							6
Australia SCIT	0.5	1	1.5	2								5
Fiji Corp. HQ	9	1	7	9	6		2				1	35.0
Fiji campuses	4		3	3	2	2	17	13	2	2	5	53
PNG campus	1		1	4	1	3	10	10	1	1		32
Samoa campus	1		2	3	3		7.5	8	1	1	1	27.5
Solomons campus	1		1		1		5					8
Vanuatu campus	1		2	3			6	2	1	1		16
Palau							2	1				3
Total all staff	18	2.5	19.5	25	15	5	49.5	34	5	5	7	185.5
Percent of all staff	10%	1%	11%	13%	8%	3%	27%	18%	3%	3%	4%	100%
PI nationals as % of total	17%	0%	72%	88%	87%	100%	20%	100%	100%	100%	100%	64%

#### Table A.23: APTC staff by position, location, and nationality as of 31 July 2014 a/

Notes:

a/ Any worker designated as "part-time" (PT) is given the weight of 0.5 for purposes of this table.

b/ Office cleaners (several of whom are hired as part-time workers) and workshop storepersons.

Sources: Denise O'Brien, APTC CEO, and Geoff Cooper, Manager Human Resources, APTC CSS.

### Table A.24: Approximate annual compensation (base salaries and benefits), APTC staff as of 31 July 2014 (AUD)

						Staf	Benefits					
											Total	
			Contributions				Payroll taxes	Leave	Tax-free		compen-	Average
			to super-			Staff	(APTC campus	(home,	status of		sation	compen-
		Base	annuation	Overseas	Housing	insurance	countries other	sick,	Australians	Benefits	(base +	sation per
Worker group	Count	salary	fund	allowances	allowances	costs	than Vanuatu)	recreation)	in Pacific	sub-total	benefits)	worker
Australians in Australia	11.0	974,051	130,523			22,403		115,912		268,838	1,242,889	112,990
Australians (& oth. expats) in Pacific	56.5	4,950,881	826,619	1,217,917	1,688,250	113,870	233,240	589,155	1,572,800	6,241,851	11,192,732	198,101
Pacific Islanders working in Fiji	64.0	1,267,147	169,798			29,144	65,892	150,790		415,624	1,682,771	26,293
Pacific Islanders working in PNG	20.0	266,849	35,758			6,138	13,876	31,755		87,526	354,375	17,719
Pacific Islanders working in Samoa	21.0	343,443	46,021			7,899	17,859	40,870		112,649	456,093	21,719
Pacific Islanders working in Solomons	2.0	17,576	2,355			404	914	2,092		5,765	23,341	11,671
Pacific Islanders working in Vanuatu	11.0	222,516	29,817			5,118		26,479		61,414	283,930	25,812
Total	195.5	8 042 463	1 2/0 801	1 217 017	1 688 250	18/ 077	331 781	057 053	1 572 800	7 103 668	15 236 132	82 125

Sources: Staff numbers from Denise O'Brien, CEO, and additional information from Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, and Geoff Cooper, Manager Human Resources.

	N	ational st	aff							
			Base sala	aries (AUD	equivalent	ts)		Expatriate staff (based in th	e Pacific	;)
Grade	Role/title	Fiji	PNG	Samoa	Vanuatu	Solomons	Grade	Role/tile	From	То
NS1.1	Administration Clerk	11,250	6,523	10,083	10,961	2,468				
NS1.2	\$	11,813	6,849	10,587	11,509	2,742				
NS1.3	\$	12,403	7,191	11,117	12,085	3,046				
NS1.4	\$	13,023	7,551	11,672	12,689	3,385				
NS1.5	\$	13,674	7,982	12,256	13,324	3,761				
NS2.1	Administration Officer	14,768	8,721	13,236	14,389	4,179				
NS2.2	\$	15,507	9,157	13,898	15,109	4,643				
NS2.3	\$	16,282	9,615	14,593	16,864	5,159				
NS2.4	\$	17,096	10,096	15,323	16,658	5,732				
NS2.5	\$	17,951	10,600	16,089	17,490	6,369				
NS3.1	HR Officer / IT Officer	19,387	11,660	17,376	18,890	7,077				
NS3.2	\$	20,357	12,243	18,248	19,834	7,785				
NS3.3	\$	21,374	12,856	19,157	20,826	8,563				
NS3.4	\$	22,443	13,498	20,115	21,867	9,419				
NS3.5	\$	23,565	14,173	21,121	22,961	10,361				
NS4.1	Supervisor / Coordinator	24,450	15,591	22,810	24,797	11,397	A2	Office Supervisor	78,517	98,151
NS4.2	\$	26,723	16,370	23,951	26,037	12,537				
NS4.3	\$	28,059	17,189	25,149	27,399	13,791				
NS4.4	\$	29,462	18,048	26,406	28,706	15,170				
NS4.5	\$	30,935	18,951	27,726	30,141	16,687				
NS5.1	Assistant Manager	32,482								
NS5.2	\$	34,106								
NS5.3	\$	35,811								
NS5.4	\$	37,602								
NS5.5	\$	39,482								
NS6.1	Manager (incl 20% allow)	47,378					A3	Manager (Corporate Services)	103,818	119,391
NS6.2	\$	49,378								
NS6.3	\$	52,235								
NS6.4	\$	54,846								
NS6.5	\$	57,589								
NT1.1	Vocational Tutor Level 1	12,500	12,730	11,739	11,134	5,538				
NT1.2	\$	13,125	13,367	12,326	11,690	5,815				
NT1.3	\$	13,781	14,035	12,943	12,275	6,106				
NT2	Vocational Tutor Level 2	16,409	16,689	15,487	14,752	7,327				
NT3	Vocational Tutor Level 3	18,191	18,526	17,084	16,203	8,060				
NT4	Vocational Tutor Level 4	22,193	22,602	20,843	19,767	9,833				
NT5.1	Trainer	30,627	31,191	28,763	27,279	13,570	B2	Trainer (BHI)	81,964	91,087
NT5.2	\$	32,158	32,751	30,201	28,643	14,249		. ,		
NT 5.3	\$	33,766	34,388	31,711	30,075	14,961				
						,				
LSF1.1	Lrng Supp. Faciltator Lvl 1	18,301	18,639	17,187	16.301	8,108				
LSF1.2	Unite and	19,216	19,571	18,047	17,116	8,513				
LSF1.3		20,177	20,549	18,949	17,972	8,939			1	1
LSF2.1	Lrng Supp. Faciltator Lvl 2	24,359	24,808	22,876	21,696	10,816				

### Table A.25: APTC annual base salaries, national and expatriate staff (AUD)

Sources: APTC (2014d) and additional information from Geoff Cooper, Manager Human Resources, APTC, Nadi.

### Table A.26: APTC staff as of 30 June 2015 (end of Phase II) as projected by CEO of APTC a/

					Adminis-	Adminis-			Learning	APTC to		
		Assistant	Supervisor/	HR/ICT	trative	trative			support	Work		
Position title	Manager	manager	coordinator	officer	officer	clerk	Trainer	Tutor	facilitator	tutor	Labourer	
Grade (PI national staff)	NS6	NS5	NS4	NS3	NS2	NS1	NT5	NT1&2	LSF1	NT2	b/	Total
, ,			Australia	n nationa	Is (and oth	er expatria	te staff)					
Australia BHI	0.5	0.5	1	1	1							4
Australia SCIT	0.5	1.5	0.5	1								3.5
Fiji Corp. HQ	7	1					1					9
Fiji campuses	2						5					7
PNG campus	1		1				11					13
Samoa campus	1						4					5
Solomons campus	1						5					6
Vanuatu campus	1						2					3
Total expatriate	14	3	2.5	2	1		28					50.5
Percent of expatriate staff	28%	6%	5%	4%	2%		55%					100%
				Pacifi	c Island na	tionals						
Australia BHI												0
Australia SCIT												0
Fiji Corp. HQ	2	1	6	11	7						0.5	27.5
Fiji campuses	1		3	3	2	2	12	5	2	2	9	41
PNG campus			2	4	1	3	2	11	1	1	1	26
Samoa campus			2	3	3		4	3	1	1	3	20
Solomons campus			1	2	1			1	1	1		7
Vanuatu campus			2	3			3	1	1	1	3	14
Total PI nationals	3	1	16	26	14	5	21	21	6	6	16.5	135.5
Percent of PI national staff	2%	1%	12%	19%	10%	4%	15%	15%	4%	4%	12%	100%
				A	II APTC sta	ıff						
Australia BHI	0.5	0.5	1	1	1							4
Australia SCIT	0.5	1.5	0.5	1								3.5
Fiji Corp. HQ	9	2	6	11	7		1				0.5	36.5
Fiji campuses	3		3	3	2	2	17	5	2	2	9	48
PNG campus	1		3	4	1	3	13	11	1	1	1	39
Samoa campus	1		2	3	3		8	3	1	1	3	25
Solomons campus	1		1	2	1		5	1	1	1		13
Vanuatu campus	1		2	3			5	1	1	1	3	17
Total all staff	17	4	18.5	28	15	5	49	21	6	6	16.5	186.0
Percent of all staff	9%	2%	10%	15%	8%	3%	26%	11%	3%	3%	9%	100%
PI nationals as % of total	18%	25%	86%	93%	93%	100%	43%	100%	100%	100%	100%	73%

Notes: See table A.23 notes.

Sources: Denise O'Brien, APTC CEO, and Geoff Cooper, Manager Human Resources, APTC CSS.

### Table A.27: Approximate annual compensation (base salaries and benefits), APTC staff as of 30 June 2015 (AUD, 2014 prices)

						Staff	Benefits					
											Total	
			Contributions				Payroll taxes	Leave	Tax-free		compen-	Average
			to super-			Staff	(APTC campus	(home,	status of		sation	compen-
		Base	annuation	Overseas	Housing	insurance	countries other	sick,	Australians	Benefits	(base +	sation per
Worker group	Count	salary	fund	allowances	allowances	costs	than Vanuatu)	recreation)	in Pacific	sub-total	benefits)	worker
Australians in Australia	7.5	788,464	105,654			18,135		93,827		217,616	1,006,081	134,144
Australians (& oth. expats) in Pacific	43.0	4,454,795	743,790	1,095,880	1,519,085	102,460	216,442	530,121	1,210,251	5,418,030	9,872,824	229,601
Pacific Islanders working in Fiji	68.5	1,641,738	219,993			37,760	85,370	195,367		538,490	2,180,228	31,828
Pacific Islanders working in PNG	26.0	433,900	58,143			9,980	22,563	51,634		142,319	576,219	22,162
Pacific Islanders working in Samoa	20.0	382,853	51,302			8,806	19,908	45,559		125,576	508,428	25,421
Pacific Islanders working in Solomons	7.0	67,049	8,985			1,542	3,487	7,979		21,992	89,040	12,720
Pacific Islanders working in Vanuatu	14.0	273,665	36,671			6,294		32,566		75,531	349,196	24,943
Total	186.0	8,042,463	1,224,538	1,095,880	1,519,085	184,977	347,770	957,053	1,210,251	6,539,554	14,582,017	78,398

Sources: Staff numbers from Denise O'Brien, CEO, and additional information from Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, and Geolf Cooper, Manager Human Resources.

### Table A.28: APTC staff by 30 June 2019 (assuming Stage III will be funded) as projected by CEO of APTC a/

					Adminis-	Adminis-			Learning	APTC to		
		Assistant	Supervisor/	HR/ICT	trative	trative			support	Work		
Position title	Manager	manager	coordinator	officer	officer	clerk	Trainer	Tutor	facilitator	tutor	Labourer	
Grade (PI national staff)	NS6	NS5	NS4	NS3	NS2	NS1	NT5	NT 1&2	LSF1	NT2	b/	Total
, , ,			Australia	n nationa	ls (and oth	er expatria	te staff)					
Australia BHI												0
Australia SCIT												0
Fiji Corp. HQ	4						1					5
Fiji campuses	1						5					6
PNG campus	1						4					5
Samoa campus	1						2					3
Solomons campus	1						1					2
Vanuatu campus	1						1					2
Total expatriate	9						14					23
Percent of expatriate staff	39%						61%					100%
				Pacifi	c Island na	tionals						
Australia BHI												0
Australia SCIT												0
Fiji Corp. HQ	10		9	11	7						0.5	37.5
Fiji campuses	1	1	3	3	2	2	15	2	2	2	10	43
PNG campus		1	2	4	1	3	12	2	1	1	7	34
Samoa campus		1	2	3	3		7		1	1	4	22
Solomons campus		1	1	2	1		5		1	1	3	15
Vanuatu campus		1	2	3			4		1	1	2	14
Total PI nationals	11	5	19	26	14	5	43	4	6	6	26.5	165.5
Percent of PI national staff	7%	3%	11%	16%	8%	3%	26%	2%	4%	4%	16%	100%
				A	II APTC sta	aff						
Australia BHI												0
Australia SCIT												0
Fiji Corp. HQ	14		9	11	7		1				0.5	42.5
Fiji campuses	2	1	3	3	2	2	20	2	2	2	10	49
PNG campus	1	1	2	4	1	3	16	2	1	1	7	39
Samoa campus	1	1	2	3	3		9		1	1	4	25
Solomons campus	1	1	1	2	1		6		1	1	3	17
Vanuatu campus	1	1	2	3			5		1	1	2	16
Total all staff	20	5	19	26	14	5	57	4	6	6	26.5	188.5
Percent of all staff	11%	3%	10%	14%	7%	3%	30%	2%	3%	3%	14%	100%
PI nationals as % of total	55%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	75%	100%	100%	100%	100%	88%

Notes: See table A.23 notes.

Sources: Denise O'Brien, APTC CEO, and Geoff Cooper, Manager Human Resources, APTC CSS.

#### Table A.29: Approximate annual compensation (base salaries and benefits), APTC staff as of 30 June 2019, assuming Phase III will be funded (AUD, 2014 prices)

						Staff	Benefits					
											Total	
			Contributions				Payroll taxes	Leave	Tax-free		compen-	Average
			to super-			Staff	(APTC campus	(home,	status of		sation	compen-
		Base	annuation	Overseas	Housing	insurance	countries other	sick,	Australians	Benefits	(base +	sation per
Worker group	Count	salary	fund	allowances	allowances	costs	than Vanuatu)	recreation)	in Pacific	sub-total	benefits)	worker
Australians in Australia	0.0											
Australians (& oth. expats) in Pacific	23.0	3,175,330	530,166	781,131	1,082,788	73,033	154,410	377,864	568,555	3,567,946	6,743,276	293,186
Pacific Islanders working in Fiji	80.5	2,936,156	393,445			67,532	152,680	349,403		963,059	3,899,215	48,437
Pacific Islanders working in PNG	34.0	816,328	109,388			18,776	42,449	97,143		267,756	1,084,083	31,885
Pacific Islanders working in Samoa	22.0	561,787	75,279			12,921	29,213	66,853		184,266	746,053	33,911
Pacific Islanders working in Solomons	15.0	176,487	23,649			4,059	9,177	21,002		57,888	234,375	15,625
Pacific Islanders working in Vanuatu	14.0	376,375	50,434			8,657		44,789		103,880	480,255	34,304
Total	188.5	8,042,463	1,182,362	781,131	1,082,788	184,977	387,929	957,053	568,555	5,144,794	13,187,257	69,959

Sources: Staff numbers from Denise O'Brien, CEO, and additional information from Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, and Geoff Cooper, Manager Human Resources.

# Table A.30: Flow variables (direct costs, graduates, and students enrolled) needed to estimate the economic rates of return (ERRs) for models 1, 2, 3.1, and 3.2

Direct costs in AUD (APTC in Pacific and 7           2007         2008         2009			c and Aus	stralia)				Comments				
		2007	20	08	20	09	20	10	2011	Total	Average	
1	Stage I (actual)	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage I	Stage I	
		22,005,853	14,933,905	16,155,634	16,155,634	19,306,547	19,306,547	13,267,686	13,267,686	134,399,493	16,799,937	← Expenditures as provided by DFAT in Suva.
	Stage II (actual 1st 6	2011	20	12	20	13	20	14	2015	Total	Average	
2	semesters, projected	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	Stage II	
	last 2 semesters)	13,253,089	22,230,273	13,359,538	21,346,274	16,036,722	22,947,726	18,014,213	16,229,337	143,417,171	17,927,146	← As reported by APT C in Nadi (from MS NAV).
		2015	20	16	20	17	20	18	2019	Total	Average	
3.1	Stage III (projected) -	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage III	Stage III	
0.1	base case scenario	20,321,969	20,064,729	19,807,489	19,550,249	19,293,008	19,035,768	18,778,528	18,521,288	155,373,028	19,421,628	Projected total cost in each semester as national-
		2015	20	16	20	17	20	18	2019	Total	Average	isation and other efficiency measures amounting to
3.2	Stage III (projected) -	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage III	Stage III	10 per cent in cost savings are introduced. a/
	optimistic scenario	19.421.628	19.164.388	18.907.148	18.649.908	18.392.668	18.135.428	17.878.188	15.537.303	146.086.660	18.260.832	Projected total cost in each semester as national-
		-7 7	., . ,	Unit c	ost (cost per	students) in	AUD	11			.,,	isation and other efficiency measures amounting to
		2007	20	08	20	09	20	10	2011		a	20 per cent in cost savings are introduced, b/
4	Stage I (actual)	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Average	Stage I	
-	olage (dotadi)	594,753	26,338	29,374	25,644	27,154	25,403	22,564	22,374	30,2	97	← Row 1 divided by row 10.
	Stage II (actual 1st 6	2011	20	12	20	13	20	14	2015	Avorago	Stago II	
5	semesters, projected	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Average	Stage II	
	last 2 semesters)	25,053	77,457	30,225	18,941	16,567	24,782	24,509	41,936	26,5	54	← Row 2 divided by row 11.
		2015	20	16	20	17	20	18	2019			
6.1	Stage III (projected) -	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Average	Stage III	
0	base case scenario	26 222	25,800	25 558	25.226	2/ 80/	24 562	24 230	23 808	25.0	60	Unit costs reduced over the 8 semesters to become
		20,222	20,000	20,000	20,220	47	24,002	40	20,000	20,0	00	90% of the Stage II average by the end of Stage III a/
~ ~	Stage III (projected) -	2015	20	10	20	17	20	10	2019	Average	Stage III	50 /0 of the oldge in average by the end of oldge in. a/
0.2	optimistic scenario	Jui-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jui-Dec	Jan-Jun			
		25,060	24,728	24,396	24,064	23,732	23,401	23,069	20,048	#DIN	//0!	Unit costs reduced over the 8 semesters to become
	Graduates	(primary be	neticiaries -	assumed	to enter labo	or market in	year after g	graduation a	nd work for	25 years)		80% of the Stage II average by the end of Stage III. b/
		2007	20	08	20	09	20	10	2011	l otal	Average	
7	Stage I (actual)	Jui-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jui-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jui-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jui-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage I	Stage I	
		10	104	189	403	541	563	869	852	3,531	441	← As reported by APT C in Nadi (EMIS).
	Stage II (actual 1st 6	2011	20	12	20	13	20	14	2015	Total	Average	
8	semesters, projected	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	Stage II	
	last 2 semesters)	356	215	638	394	540	1106	1035	614	4,898	612	← As reported by APT C in Nadi (EMIS) for 3 years and
		2015	20	16	20	17	20	18	2019	Total	Average	estimated by the research team for the final year.
9	Stage III (projected)	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage III	Stage III	
		698	698	698	698	698	698	698	698	5,580	698	← As projected by APT C management team. c/
		Students	s (for estima	ating oppor	tunity costs	of those wh	o do not w	ork while stu	udying)			
		2007	20	08	20	09	20	10	2011	Total	Average	
10	Stage I (actual)	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage I	Stage I	
		37	567	550	630	711	760	588	593	4,436	555	← As reported by EMIS.
	Stage II (actual 1st 6	2011	20	12	20	13	20	14	2015	Total	Average	
11	semesters, projected	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	Stage II	
	last 2 semesters)	529	287	442	1,127	968	926	735	387	5,401	675	← As reported by EMIS thru Jun 2014 and then
		2015	20	16	20	17	20	18	2019	Total	Average	projected by APT C management team.
12	Stage III (projected)	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage III	Stage III	
		775	775	775	775	775	775	775	775	6,200	775	← As projected by APT C management team. b/

Notes:

a/We have estimated above that the average cost per student of APT C in Stage II was AUD 26,554. Although potential cost savings in Stage III will depend on the steps taken by APT C and can only be estimated, for purposes of computing an ex-ante ERR for Stage III, we have assumed, in the base case scenario, that the cost per student by the end of Stage III will be 90 per cent of the Stage II average, or AUD 23,898 and that these savings will be phased in over the four years of Stage III in a linear progression.

b/ In the optimistic scenario, the cost savings are assumed to be even greater than in the base case scenario, namely, that the cost per student by the end of Stage III will be 80 per cent of the Stage II average, or AUD 20,048.

c/ Graduates assumed to be 90% of student enrolments in each semester, given dropout, withdrawals, and students "not yet competent."

			1					
	loromotoro for optimoti	ing alternative ERR and NRV require based on	Ec	onomic rate o	of return	Net Present	Value (discoun	t rate = 11%)
Г	altornativo low (nos	simistic) and high (optimistic) assumptions	Deceline	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Deceline	Pessimistic	Optimistic
	alternative, low (pes	simistic) and high (optimistic) assumptions	Baseline	assumption	assumption	Baseline	assumption	assumption
Α.	Direct benefits in	Average earnings differential (taking unemployment into		2.40/	0.00/		(00.000.040)	(22.500.000)
	Pacific	account) for those who stay in the Pacific		3.4%	9.2%		(00,000,210)	(23,308,988)
В.	Direct benefits for	1. Percent of graduates who successfully migrate		6.0%	6.9%		(61,081,048)	(51,088,160)
	those who migrate	2. Average time between graduation and migration		6.0%	6.7%		(62,375,624)	(51,806,024)
	(to Australia or	3. Average earnings differential while living abroad		6.0%	6.9%		(61,315,636)	(50,853,568)
	economy)	4. Average duration (time between migration and return	6.4%	5.0%	7.0%	(56,084,603)	(61 206 040)	(51 345 602)
	cooloniyy	home)	<sup>m</sup> 6.4%	0.9%	1.0%		(01,290,040)	(51,545,692)
		5. Average earnings differential after return home as		6 49/	6.0%		(56 571 790)	(52 197 190)
		multiple of A(2) above		0.4 /0	0.5 /6		(30,371,700)	(32,107,100)
C.	Opportunity costs	Production foregone while students in training (average						
	(indirect costs or	earnings per week before entering APTC)		6.2%	6.7%		(60,420,404)	(51,748,804)
	foregone earnings)							
D.	Market discount	Discount rate used to compute net present value (NPV =				Discount	Discount	Discount
	rate (opportunity PV of benefits minus PV of costs ) and to compare with				rate = 11%	rate = 12%	rate = 10%	
	cost of capital)	the estimated ERR to asses whether or not APTC has				(56,084,603)	(62,406,112)	(48,120,788)

### Table A.31: Results of ERR and sensitivity analysis – model 1 (year 0 = 2007)

### Table A.32: Results of ERR and sensitivity analysis – model 2 (year 0 = 2011)

			Ec	onomic rate o	of return	Net Present V	/alue (discour	nt rate = 11%)
P	arameters for estimation alternative low (pestimation)	ing alternative ERR and NPV results based on simistic) and high (optimistic) assumptions	Pacolino	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pacolino	Pessimistic	Optimistic
	anomativo, iow (poo		Daseiiile	assumption	assumption	Daseinie	assumption	assumption
Α.	Direct benefits in	Average earnings differential (taking unemployment into		5 2%	12 1%		(40 453 444)	7 940 441
	Pacific	account) for those who stay in the Pacific		5.2 /0	12.170		(40,433,444)	7,540,441
В.	Direct benefits for	1. Percent of graduates who successfully migrate		8.2%	9.3%		(19,994,736)	(12,518,268)
	those who migrate	0 American fine between and a fire and a institut		0.00/	0.40/		(00.000.000)	(40.070.004)
	(to Australia or	Alia or 2. Average time between graduation and migration high-income 3. Average earnings differential while living abroad		8.2%	9.1%		(20,929,682)	(13,078,231)
	another high-income							
	economy)	3. Average earnings differential while living abroad	8.8%	8.2%	9.3%	(16 256 501)	(20,142,286)	(12,370,715)
		4. Average duration (time between migration and return		0.494		(10,200,001)	(00.407.700)	
		home)		8.1%	9.4%		(20,127,730)	(12,272,336)
		5. Average earnings differential after return home as		0.70/	0.00/		(40,000,000)	(40.070.005)
		multiple of A(2) above		8.1%	9.3%		(10,000,088)	(12,979,805)
C.	Opportunity costs	Production foregone while students in training (average	1					
	(indirect costs or	earnings per week before entering APTC)		8.5%	9.1%		(18,721,736)	(13,791,265)
	foregone earnings) Earning particle between between the ing in the optimized by the second terms of the optimized for the op							
Ď.						Discount	Discount	Discount
	rate (opportunity PV of benefits minus PV of costs ) and to compare with				rate = 11%	rate = 12%	rate = 10%	
	cost of capital) the estimated ERR to asses whether or not APT C					(16,256,501)	(21,730,450)	(9,766,386)

	anon atom for actim at	ing alternative FDD and ND\(requilta based on	Ec	onomic rate of	return	Net Present	Value (discoun	t rate = 11%)
F	alternative low (pos	simistic) and high (antimistic) assumptions	Deceline	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Deceline	Pessimistic	Optimistic
	allemative, low (pes		Baseline	assumption	assumption	Baseline	assumption	assumption
Α.	Direct benefits in	Average earnings differential (taking unemployment into		0.40/	40.70/		(00 474 500)	04 400 500
	Pacific	account) for those who stay in the Pacific		0.1%	13.7%		(30,171,360)	21,193,526
Β.	Direct benefits for	1. Percent of graduates who successfully migrate		9.4%	10.6%		(11,923,986)	(3,054,046)
	those who migrate	2. Average time between graduation and migration		9.4%	10.5%		(13,027,675)	(3,722,127)
	(to Australia or	3. Average earnings differential while living abroad		9.4%	10.6%		(12,094,454)	(2,883,578)
	another high-income	4. Average duration (time between migration and return	10.0%	0.40/	40.70/	(7.489.016)	(40.077.000)	(2 600 272)
	economy)	home)		9.4%	10.7%	(1,403,010)	(12,077,202)	(2,090,373)
		5. Average earnings differential after return home as		40.00/	40.00/		(7.000.005)	(0.540.400)
		multiple of A(2) above		10.0%	10.0%		(1,982,333)	(3,342,408)
C.	Opportunity costs	Production foregone while students in training (average						
	(indirect costs or	earnings per week before entering APT()		9.7%	10.3%		(9,954,252)	(5,023,781)
	foregone earnings)							
D.	Market discount	Discount rate used to compute net present value (NPV =				Discount	Discount	Discount
	rate (opportunity	PV of benefits minus PV of costs ) and to compare with				rate = 11%	rate = 12%	rate = 10%
	cost of capital)	of capital) the estimated ERR to asses whether or not APT C will be a "good" investment				(7.490.046)	(14 029 406)	200 702
						(1,403,010)	(14,030,400)	200,702

# Table A.33: Results of ERR and sensitivity analysis – model 3.1 (year 0 = 2015, cost savings 10 per cent over four years of Stage III)

### Table A.34: Results of ERR and sensitivity analysis – model 3.2 (year 0 = 2015, cost savings 20 per cent over four years of Stage III)

	Parameters for estimating alternative ERR and NPV results bas		Eco	onomic rate of	freturn	Net Present	Value (discour	nt rate = 11%)
Р	alternative low (nest	ing allemative ERR and NPV results based on	Pagalina	Pessimistic	Optimistic	Pagalina	Pessimistic	Optimistic
	alternative, low (pes		Daseillie	assumption	assumption	Daseillie	assumption	assumption
Α.	Direct benefits in	Average earnings differential (taking unemployment into		6 00/	44 70/		(20 779 024)	27 596 460
	Pacific	account) for those who stay in the Pacific		0.0 %	14.7 %		(29,110,924)	27,300,100
В.	Direct benefits for	1. Percent of graduates who successfully migrate		10.2%	11.4%		(5,531,352)	3,338,589
	those who migrate	2. Average time between graduation and migration		10.1%	11.4%		(6,635,041)	2,670,508
	(to Australia or	r 3. Average earnings differential while living abroad ncome 4. Average duration (time between migration and retu home)		10.2%	11.5%		(5,701,820)	3,509,057
	another high-income			40.29/	44 50/	(1.096.382)	(E COA ECO)	2 702 262
	economy)	home)		10.2%	11.3%	(1,000,002)	(3,004,300)	3,102,202
		5. Average earnings differential after return home as		40.00/	44 40/		(4 590 700)	2 950 466
		multiple of A(2) above		10.0%	11.470		(1,569,700)	2,030,100
C.	Opportunity costs	Production foregone while students in training (average						
	(indirect costs or	earnings per week before entering APT C)		10.5%	11.2%		(3,561,617)	1,368,854
	foregone earnings)							
D.	Market discount	Discount rate used to compute net present value (NPV =				Discount	Discount	Discount
	rate (opportunity	PV of benefits minus PV of costs ) and to compare with				rate = 11%	rate = 12%	rate = 10%
	cost of capital) the estimated ERR to asses whether or not APTC will be a "good" investment				(4.000.000)	(7.040.500)	6 006 044	
					(1,090,382)	(1,042,522)	0,000,914	

# Table A.35: Cost recovery (revenues from sources other than DFAT), APTC Stage II (AUD)

	2011	20	2012		2013		2014		Total	Percent
Revenue source	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Jul-Dec	Jan-Jun	Stage II	of total
Fee-for-service				400,718	94,474	708,412	600,000	696,395	2,500,000	63.3%
Employer contributions				73,218	26,750				99,969	2.5%
Fees paid by students	15,659	15,054	37,879	168,793		66,186	470,146	129,680	903,397	22.9%
Other a/	8,604	74	8,686	131,697	252,746	43,091			444,898	11.3%
Total by semester	24,263	15,128	46,565	774,427	373,970	817,689	1,070,146	826,075	3,948,262	100.0%
% of cost recovery	0.6%	0.4%	1.2%	19.6%	9.5%	20.7%	27.1%	20.9%	100.0%	
% of total costs (\$143.4 m)	0.2%	0.1%	0.3%	3.6%	2.3%	3.6%	5.9%	5.1%	2.8%	

Notes:

a/ "Sale of student-produced goods and services, refunded taxes, and other income recognised in the accounts on behalf of DFAT."

Source: Benita McGovern, Manager Finance, APTC Corporate and Student Services, and extracted from APTC's MS Dynamic NAV database.

### Table A.36: APTC course tuition fees by school (STT and SHCS) and by campus country

Country	Papua New Guinea		Fiji		Samoa		Vanuatu		
Exchange rate	PGK 1 =	0.4407 AUD	FJD 1 = 0.5816 AUD		WST 1 = 0.4654 AUD		VUV 1 = 0.0115 AUD		
Range of fees	Minimum	Maximum	Minimum	Maximum	Minimum	Maximum	Minimum	Maximum	
		So	chool of Tr	ool of Trades and Technology					
Local currency	4,950	4,950	1,760	1,760	2,530	2,530	77,000	90,200	
AUD	2,181	2,181	1,024	1,024	1,177	1,177	886	1,037	
AUD avrg a/	2,181		1,024		1,177		961		
Index b/	2.27		1.06		1.22		1.00		
School of Hospitality and Community Services									
Local currency	2,750	4,500	1,980	3,850	880	2,090	33,000	90,200	
AUD	1,212	1,983	1,152	2,239	410	973	380	1,037	
AUD a/	1,598		1,695		691		708		
Index b/	2.26		2.39		0.98		1.00		
STT/SHCS c/	1.37		0.60		1.70		1.36		

Source: http://www.aptc.edu.au/index.php/course-fees.

Notes:

a/ Average (arithmetic mean) of minimum and maximum course fees for this country.

b/ Average for this country ÷ average for Vanuatu.

c/ STT average ÷ SCHS average for this country.

### ANNEX 10: FUTURE OF THE APTC

#### What do the findings, evidence and lessons suggest for the future of the APTC?

#### Table of contents

<b>1</b>	Short term: What could be done to strengthen APTC until the end of Stage II?	<b>225</b>
1.1	Actions that could be undertaken by APTC	225
1.2	Actions that could be undertaken by DFAT	226
2	Medium to long term: In what form and under what conditions could APTC continue beyond 2015?	226
2.1	Is the APTC approach still relevant, given current and projected conditions in the Pacific and the international labour market?	226
2.2	How sustainable is the current model e.g. of providing international qualifications, in relation to possible options?	227
3	How well does APTC fit within DFAT policies on future aid to the region?	228
4	What key principles and lessons should guide decisions about the future of APTC?	230
5	What would success look like in the long term for APTC?	233
5.1	Seven long-term options for APTC	223

Figure 1: A new strategic framework for the Australian aid program	
Table 1: Long-term structural options for APTC	
Table 2: The change of roles envisaged for APTC	

# 1 Short term: What could be done to strengthen APTC until the end of Stage II?

Several actions could be taken to strengthen APTC until the end of Stage II and in preparation for any continuation. These can be divided into those actions that could be undertaken by APTC and those that could be undertaken by DFAT.

#### 1.1 Actions that could be undertaken by APTC

The following actions by APTC would strengthen its operations until the end of Stage II.

- Continue the process of eliminating duplication in the organisational structure: At the time of the field visits, APTC was taking steps, through the consortium and as vacancies arose, to eliminate duplication.
- Commence the development of a Risk Management Plan for the Nationalisation Strategy: Annex 6 outlines some of the risks associated with nationalisation of the management and teaching staff. Addressing those risks should not be postponed, particularly providing appropriate support for national trainers where they are working without an equivalent expatriate trainer and to balancing the ratio of expatriate trainers to national trainers as the training profile changes over time.
- **Complete the Review of APTC-to-Work:** The 2013–14 Annual Report and Plan projected that this review would be complete by April 2014. This had not occurred by the time of the field visits. The role of APTC-to-Work tutors is critical and when performed well, has a significant impact. The tutors should be integrated with the teaching staff. The review should include the issue of how to develop and maintain a database of employers interested in employing APTC graduates and in providing work placements. It should also include the issue of how best to provide more support to unemployed graduates to find work matched to their skills.

- Address communication problems with staff: Evidence arose during the field visits of some dissatisfaction among small pockets of staff, much of which seemed to be related to communication. There are dangers that poor communication could endanger a smooth transition to a subsequent stage.
- Update the APTC website with information about APTC qualifications and eligibility for migration, and provide appropriate links to agencies conducting skills assessment for Australia and New Zealand. Also provide relevant information to alumni networks in each country and support to help them disseminate information to graduates on the requirements of the migration process.

#### 1.2 Actions that could be undertaken by DFAT

The following actions by DFAT would strengthen APTC operations until the end of Stage II.

- Institute a consultative process to develop (a) a regional TVET strategy, and, within it, (b) a long-term vision for APTC. In light of the forthcoming shift of DFAT responsibility for APTC from Fiji to Canberra, this consultative process should take a country focus and involve DFAT posts involved with bilateral TVET programs. This would allow any future vision for APTC to be more closely inter-connected with bilateral programs. An important focus should be to identify, from DFAT programs and other donors, potential and likely sources of demand for APTC training. There is also an opportunity to engage national governments and industry parties to gain commitment and 'buy-in' for APTC's future, within the context of DFAT's wider regional TVET strategy.
- Start the design of a new M&E system to identify economic impact of APTC's outputs. Annex 8 (Attachment 1) indicates the types of information that need to be collected.
- Engage with Australian immigration authorities to determine how DFAT can support APTC to provide a coordinated approach to promoting labour mobility in the Pacific. Surveys undertaken with students during the field visit revealed that most APTC students are planning to migrate (64 per cent) or have taken steps to do so (18 per cent) with most setting their sights on Australia. The gaining of an Australian qualification raises expectations in this regard and it is important that APTC is in a position to provide accurate information and appropriate support to students about how to realise the opportunity to migrate for work.

# 2 Medium to long term: In what form and under what conditions could APTC continue beyond 2015?

APTC remains relevant in the medium term but the current model is not sustainable and other options need to be considered for APTC in the longer term.

### 2.1 Is the APTC approach still relevant, given current and projected conditions in the Pacific and the international labour market?

The current APTC approach has strengths and weaknesses, as listed below.

• The focus on a student cohort of existing skilled workers and new industry entrants gives APTC a clear and manageable market niche. It avoids duplication and competition with other national providers and hence averts tensions in this regard. However, the focus on the former group in the context of the labour mobility objective will continue to raise employers' fears of 'brain drain'.

APTC will have provided a useful service to Pacific economies until this market niche becomes saturated. As Annex 8 shows, there is a danger in the smaller Pacific economies that this will become the case. For APTC to remain relevant to the skill needs of the Pacific, new sources of economic demand for training need to be identified. This will require major changes to how APTC now operates as a provider of standardised qualifications.

Some stakeholders expressed the view that APTC's courses should be available to school leavers. However, this would dilute its current focus and impact. It could place an unmanageable and unaffordable burden on APTC while allowing national governments to abrogate responsibility for this group. Moreover, it would create confusion and overlap with DFAT's planned 'Skilling Youth in the Pacific' project.

- Employers frequently commented that APTC provided training of a depth and quality not available elsewhere and that APTC was providing a boost to the economy by enabling local enterprises to aim for international standards. The partnership with the textiles, clothing and footwear industry in Fiji exemplifies this.
- APTC is having some success in driving up the standards of training in the Pacific by working closely with partner institutions, supporting the development of robust national qualification systems and providing a demonstration effect on higher quality standards (Annex 6). APTC needs to continue to move from being 'the light on the hill' to proactive involvement in lifting the performance of Pacific TVET systems. The nature that this might take will be clear from the country level consultations DFAT undertakes in finalising its regional TVET strategy.
- APTC needs to build on these ways of moving beyond its initial concept of a scholarships-driven provider of full qualifications aimed at the Australian labour market. Large employers, especially in PNG, offer the prospect of being longterm clients, provided their needs are met and they pay for the training they want. Meeting the needs of these clients will require changes to the breadth of skills (e.g. skill sets), type of skills, training content and mode of delivery that APTC now provides.

### 2.2 How sustainable is the current model e.g. of providing international qualifications, in relation to possible options?

As outlined elsewhere in this report, the current model is not sustainable in the long term. This can be examined from a number of perspectives:

- educational
- management and governance
- financial.

*Educational:* In the long term, the best providers in the Pacific countries will be in a position to offer international level qualifications themselves and will become less reliant on Australia's assistance. They will be able to do this either in their own right or with other partners. They are working towards this now. There are already signs of competition in some areas, especially those that are not capital intensive.

**Governance:** The current management and governance arrangements will not serve APTC well into the future (Annex 6). They are cumbersome, costly and inefficient. There is a need for streamlining these arrangements.

*Financial:* APTC's unit costs are very high relative to incomes in the Pacific and as compared with the costs of national training institutions (NTIs) (Annex 9). Moreover, APTC students are generally not eligible for, or they find it difficult to access, national

training funds that are available for students who attend NTIs. Tuition fees are set at notional levels across the five campus countries, but few students (or employers of students) pay even these heavily subsidised fees. In any extension of APTC under a third tranche of DFAT funding, it will be important both to implement measures to reduce unit costs and to diversify sources of funding.

# 3 How well does APTC fit within DFAT policies on future aid to the region?

From both a geographic and thematic/investment perspective, APTC fits well with the new policy on aid introduced by the Australian Government in June 2014.<sup>88</sup> This policy, hereafter referred to as 'the Australian aid policy', is regarded by DFAT as a fundamentally changed approach. It is therefore important to consider the extent to which it provides both a broader and a specific framework within which APTC's future can be shaped.

The policy states the purpose of the Australian aid program as follows:

The Australian aid program will promote prosperity, reduce poverty and enhance stability with a strengthened focus on our region, the Indo-Pacific.

The purpose of the aid program is to promote Australia's national interests by contributing to sustainable economic growth and poverty reduction.<sup>89</sup>

Figure 1 illustrates the inter-relationships in the policy.



#### Figure 1: A new strategic framework for the Australian aid program

Source: DFAT 2014, op. cit., p. 9

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. (2014). Australian Aid, Promoting Prosperity, Reducing Poverty, Enhancing Stability. Retrieved from http://aid.dfat.gov.au/aidpolicy/Pages/home.aspx
 <sup>89</sup> Ibid., p. 5

**Specific/direct relevance of the Australian aid policy to APTC**. Geographically, the focus is the Indo-Pacific region, Australia's immediate neighbourhood:

From 2014–15 at least 90 per cent of country program aid will be directed to the Indo–Pacific region, especially South East Asia and the Pacific.<sup>90</sup>

The evaluation team was advised by one DFAT officer that this could mean more funding for APTC than in the past, because investment is likely to be reduced in countries beyond the Indo-Pacific region.

The combined sector of education and health is one of the six investment priorities. TVET is specifically included among the five priorities for education:

Prioritise skills for growth to enable people to be job-ready and adaptable, by improving access to quality-assured technical education and training, which matches the needs of the local private sector.<sup>91</sup>

**Broad/indirect relevance of the Australian aid policy to APTC**. Other priorities of the Australian aid policy also provide pointers to the potential future directions for APTC. In particular, they are:

- a strong focus on aid for trade and associated emphasis on strengthening private sector development, including small and micro-businesses
- an emphasis on agriculture and fisheries as a means to promote food security
- provision of humanitarian assistance in response to emergencies
- value for money
- gender equality and empowerment of women and girls.

Implications for APTC of these priorities are:

- *Private sector development*. APTC contributes to private sector growth by supporting employment (including self-employment) and reducing reliance on the public sector. This also has implications for its own operations, where becoming more self-sustaining financially is also a goal.
- *Emphasis on agriculture and fisheries.* APTC has been exploring opportunities in this area for some time, particularly in agri-business. Delivery of training in this field would support the Australian aid policy, including in small and micro-businesses.
- Provision of humanitarian assistance in response to emergencies. The Pacific region is vulnerable to natural disasters such as cyclones, earthquakes and tsunamis. APTC has joined with other partners to provide humanitarian assistance in the past, for example following Cyclone Evan in 2012, and this can be seen as consistent with the Australian aid policy.
- Value for money: APTC has developed sound management information systems which can readily provide the data for analysing value for money (Annex 9). It will be in APTC's best interests to develop sophisticated performance and impact measurement systems.
- *Gender equality and empowerment of girls.* APTC has a strong commitment to gender equality (Annex 6).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Ibid., p. 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Ibid., p. 19

#### Challenges of regional service delivery

The eventual goal of Pacific ownership of APTC as a regional service agency will face a number of challenges. A recent assessment of regional service delivery among small island states in the Pacific (Dornan & Cain 2013) has highlighted the problems of topdown, all-encompassing efforts to set up region-wide service pooling arrangements. The authors note that the slow progress of the 20 initiatives reviewed are due to problems inherent in voluntary regionalism. Added to this are complications created by the diversity of Pacific island states, politico-economic factors, and problems of accountability and legitimacy.

A better approach, they suggest, is to start at a sub-regional level. This requires working slowly towards pooled service delivery based on good evidence of what works in the countries affected. Also needed is the political will and economic desire for the pooling arrangements and the national institutions capable of supporting the required cooperation. Bottom-up change based on local ownership requires building up broad support from a diversity of stakeholders who can see the benefits. APTC needs a strategy on how best to do this, and time to achieve it. The country focus emphasised throughout this report steps in this direction.

# 4 What key principles and lessons should guide decisions about the future of APTC?

First and foremost, the principles underpinning the Australian aid policy will guide strategic decisions about the future of APTC together with the policies of the Pacific Island countries.

The future success of APTC as a stand-alone, relevant and sustainable institution also depends in part on how well it addresses the four Busan principles of aid effectiveness.<sup>92</sup> These principles can be posed as questions for APTC in five to 10 years' time.

- How well has APTC addressed the development priorities of each country and of the region it serves?
- What solid evidence is there for the lasting results APTC has achieved?
- How well has APTC worked in effective partnerships with governments, employers and donors, based on openness, trust, mutual respect and learning?
- Has APTC been transparent and accountable to its intended beneficiaries for the outcomes it has been asked to deliver?

After eight years of delivery of Australian qualifications in the Pacific, what key principles and lessons should guide decisions about the future of APTC?

 Need for long-term perspective. One key lesson is the importance of a long timeframe to implement a large program across a diverse geographical, political and social landscape. This underscores the necessity of a long-term perspective in planning APTC's future. Finding: APTC has been limited by working in a planning environment aligned to the four-year contract and without a clear view provided by DFAT of a long-term vision for its future. Implication: APTC should operate within a strategic framework developed by DFAT that articulates the criteria and time lines by which the ultimate success of APTC can be judged.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Busan Partnership for Effective Development Co-operation, Fourth High Level Forum on Aid Effectiveness, Busan, Republic of Korea, 29 November–1 December, 2011

- 2. Emphasis on outcomes. The need for a shift in emphasis from inputs/outputs to outcomes is noted in PESDA 2011 (p. 10). Finding: The APTC program focuses on outputs (qualifications produced) not on labour market results and impact on enterprise productivity. As a result, the evaluation could say relatively little about economic impact. In addition, the lack of evidence on employment outcomes, such as wage rates and skills match by qualification and gender for each country, has been a lost opportunity to show governments and other stakeholders the beneficial impact of investing in TVET. Implication: A carefully designed and adequately resourced evaluation system focused on outcomes has to be a key element in showing key stakeholders the value of investing in APTC and high quality TVET.
- 3. **Demand-driven**. PESDA 2011 stated that APTC will provide demand-driven qualifications (p. 9). Finding: Insufficient information is collected about labour market demand and employment outcomes. As a result, APTC risks over-supplying the market in some fields. Implication: APTC should: (1) undertake systematic tracer studies by country, qualification and gender; and (2) strengthen the collection and analysis of labour market information.
- 4. **Placing quality first**. Finding: APTC has succeeded in delivering Australian standards in the Pacific. It has done so by relying almost exclusively on Australian staff until recently. Implication: Sustaining high quality requires effort in maintaining the professional currency of teaching staff, particularly as nationalisation of staff accelerates.
- 5. **Client orientation**. Finding: APTC has focused primarily on being accountable to one client (DFAT) in its contractual obligations. Implication: APTC needs to place more emphasis on being accountable to other clients (employers, Pacific governments, students and graduates).
- 6. **Country differentiation**. Finding: Major country differences exist in the levels of economic demand and potential, TVET provision and country support. As APTC matures, the differences in potential and development of the campus countries are becoming increasingly clear. Implication: Planning for APTC should take into account the different characteristics and stages of development of the five campus countries, as well as SIS.
- 7. Country support, partnership and ownership. APTC's success in Samoa shows the positives that result from strong government support for APTC. The Paris Principles for Aid Effectiveness call for greater partnership and country ownership of foreign assistance programs, and this is echoed in PESDA 2011. The review team found little or no interest in country ownership for APTC, other than in Samoa. More country participation in governance and, gradually, financing should be sought as a means to build local ownership. Implication: As a first step, create: (1) campus country-specific APTC strategies, taking into account local developments and constraints; and (2) campus country advisory groups to guide APTC operations, from which the regional advisory body would be formed.
- 8. **Promoting equity**. Finding: APTC has a strong commitment and salient achievements in equity. However, students from PNG and Solomon Islands, the largest and third largest countries by population in APTC's list of eligible countries, are proportionately under-represented in APTC enrolment relative to their populations. Female enrolments constitute about 40 per cent of the total, but little can be said about the labour market outcomes of female graduates due to the absence of Stage II tracer survey results by gender. APTC provides two training programs in disability, but enrols relatively few disabled students.

Implications: Achieve economies of scale to expand enrolments of nationals from PNG and Solomon Islands based on economic demand. As stated above, carry out systematic tracer studies of graduate outcomes by gender. Establish protocols for tracking participation of those with disabilities.

#### 9. Efficiency-reducing costs per output.

- Administrative efficiencies. Findings: While having two RTOs involved in the operations of APTC may have had advantages at the time of establishment, after eight years this is now at the expense of efficiency and effectiveness. Implication: Educational and administrative processes should be streamlined and simplified and delegations to the CEO and Country Managers maximised.
- Nationalisation. Findings: Even taking into account the time taken to develop a fully qualified VET practitioner under the Australian system, APTC was slow to implement a nationalisation strategy. Now that it has been introduced, it is clear that there is much to be gained in terms of capability building and skills transfer as well as cost-effectiveness. Implication: APTC should aim for a largely nationalised staff, with expatriates employed only on a short-term adviser basis as specialists and/or mentors. The pace at which this occurs should give due account to the quality and sustainability risks involved, as well as the educational and financial benefits.
- Financial information. Findings: APTC has developed sound management information systems which can readily provide the data for analysing value for money (Annex 9). Implication: It will be in APTC's best interests to develop robust impact measurement systems as well.
- 10. Cost-sharing. Finding: Reliance on DFAT funding and operating on a scholarship model is convenient for the contractor but is not sustainable in the long term. Greater efforts are called for to share the costs of APTC with beneficiaries employers and trainees. Implications: (1) Targets for income generation should be increased to progressively reduce reliance on DFAT funding support. (2) Explore other revenue sources to sustain APTC including replacing some scholarships with student loans to reduce the financial burden on Australia.

#### 11. Maximising benefits.

- Labour mobility. Labour mobility to Australia and New Zealand can produce strong benefits for Pacific Islanders in the form of remittances (as indicated by the Stage II hypothetical rates of return). Notwithstanding potential opposition to labour mobility by some national governments, ongoing uncertainty about APTC's role in labour mobility has been detrimental. It has exposed APTC to criticism within Australia, and it has left students who wish to migrate without proper guidance. Implication: APTC's role in labour mobility should be clarified and, if appropriate, labour mobility targets should be introduced, taking into account the constraints that exist in relation to Australian migration policy and cultural mores.
- APTC should, through its APTC-to-Work Tutors, assist graduates in hospitality who are unemployed or under-employed to work in Australia for up to six months in the accommodation trial of the Seasonal Worker Program.
- 12. **Division of effort complementarity rather than competition**. Finding: APTC has succeeded in complementing rather than competing with national providers. Implication: APTC should continue to attract those students not targeted by national providers and otherwise avoid competition with national providers.

13. **Contract adaptation to local requirements**. Finding: APTC operates in a unique and complex training environment which merits purpose-designed working terms and conditions, not the application or adaptation of TAFE terms and conditions designed for Australian circumstances. Implication: APTC should have terms and conditions for trainers specifically designed to meet its own circumstances.

#### 5 What would success look like in the long term for APTC?<sup>93</sup>

Essentially, this question concerns the 'end game'. The answers depend on DFAT's long-term vision for APTC. Is DFAT's objective that:

- APTC should remain only as long as it fills its unique market niche, then it can be phased out?
- a permanent regional TVET system, owned and operated by PICs, can deliver Australia standard qualifications?
- the APTC brand survives as a beacon of high quality skills training as part of a wider regional post-secondary skills formation strategy?
- DFAT does not have to provide core funding anymore?
- Australia's reputation as a donor is enhanced and not damaged by a cessation of funding?

Increased resource mobilisation would seem to be an essential requirement for success. Figure 2 depicts this process showing the shift in funding arrangements and the different stages of country campus development. At some point in this process, Pacific-based income exceeds aid income. This likely will occur at different times for each campus.



#### Figure 2: An indicative long-term trajectory for APTC

Source: Review team, with acknowledgement to APTC management.

Several alternatives can be conceived for how APTC ends. Table 1 sets out some of the long-term structural options for APTC.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> The review team acknowledges with thanks the contribution of senior APTC staff to this section.

Option	APTC ownership	APTC financing	Advantages	Disadvantages
1. Close APTC at end of Stage II (mid-2015)	Would cease	Would cease.	Financial savings to the Australian Government	Loss of prestige, push back by employers, some governments, loss of skills formation, loss of opportunity for better living standards
2. Variation on status quo	DFAT owns, one RTO implements, APTC delivers with more control	Largely DFAT, but with increasing revenue from fee-for-service and students (via loans)	Operates with strengths as at present, reaps benefits from lower costs from one RTO, staff nationalisation & more external revenue	Requires indefinitely heavy DFAT financing Ends with cessation of DFAT funding
3. APTC becomes independent Technical College of the Pacific with its own regional administration	Participating Pacific governments	Pacific governments + substantial residual DFAT support	Becomes analogous to USP, but as a regional provider of high quality technical skills	Pacific government interest & financial support uncertain vis a vis support for their own NTIs Need to create new administration
4. APTC is taken over by an existing regional organisation	e.g. USP	e.g. USP	Savings on administrative overhead	Still requires major DFAT funding Regional organisation may not give priority to technical skills or labour mobility
5. Devolution of APTC as legal entity	Third party owner, or jointly with APTC	Third party owner	Relieves DFAT financial responsibility in the long term	Cannot become a RTO Still requires DFAT med. term funding
6. Franchising APTC name and model	DFAT	Franchisee	Makes use of APTC brand to continue quality skills training Enables franchising to individual countries	Requires APTC to be a legal entity Dependent on uncertain donor funding & large enterprise & donor demand for skills training
7. Transfer – APTC integrated fully into partner NTIs, country by country	NTIS	NTIs, with bilateral DFAT financing	The option that best supports local capacity building & integration with national TVET systems	Assumes NTIs can manage the direct training Breaks up the APTC as a regional body APTC ceases to exist as separate entity
8. APTC focuses exclusively on technical support and ceases direct student training	DFAT	DFAT funding, at much smaller scale than present	APTC continues for technical support to national TVET systems	Assumes NTIs can manage the direct training

Table 1: Long-term structural options for APTC

Source: Evaluation team

#### 5.2 Long-term options for APTC's future

**Option 1:** One extreme option would be to conclude that the costs of APTC have exceeded its outputs, and close APTC in mid-2015 at the end of Stage. In effect, there would be no long-term future for APTC. This would save money for the Australian Government and the aid program that could be allocated to other priorities. However, closure could prompt pushback by employers who value APTC's contributions to raising the domestic supply of skills. It would deprive NTIs of a source of support to build their standards and teaching capacities. Importantly, it would deprive thousands of low-income Pacific Islanders the opportunity for better living standards through higher occupational qualifications. Finally, such a move could entail loss of prestige and would deprive Australia of the continued diplomatic benefits of a visible, successful assistance program, not to mention the enthusiastic support of students and graduates. The negative consequences would far outweigh the benefits.

**Option 2:** Variation on the status quo. This assumes that nationalisation continues and its targets are achieved, the recommendations in this report on administrative changes are implemented (e.g. single contractor, uniform procedures, elimination of duplication, separate employment arrangements), and that revenue increases through student loans and a much greater emphasis is placed on fee for service. However, Australian aid would likely remain the dominant source of financing. When Australian aid ceases, the APTC would cease to exist. This option carries several risks: eventual aid fatigue; APTC becoming less relevant as NTIs become capable of delivering the same kinds of qualifications; as an independent organisation, APTC may become isolated from national priorities.

**Option 3:** APTC could become a new, independent regional organisation. Option 3 entails transfer of APTC ownership to Pacific governments and creation of a new administrative structure. It would, in effect, become similar to the USP, but focused on middle-level TVET. Having its own purpose, governance and administration could ensure that skill training has top priority and that a regional provider of high quality skills endures. However, creation of a separate administration to maintain high quality skills training would be costly. Pressure on the new institution to maintain high quality skills training would come from having to meet the requirements of delivering Australian qualifications. There is a risk that the delivery of at least some, if not most, Australian qualifications would cease and that the labour mobility objective would not be promoted.

**Option 4:** Under option 4, APTC would be subsumed into an existing regional organisation, such as USP. One advantage would be savings on overheads. This option would not require independent financing for APTC or the creation of a separate administration. The existing organisation, suitably strengthened, could take over management of APTC's programs. APTC would cease as an independent entity. Indirect funding would still be required by DFAT, as the regional organisation could not absorb the full costs. However, there is a risk that the organisation might not give sufficient priority to TVET. USP, for example, has little background, infrastructure or expertise in program delivery to support such an integration. It also sees TVET solely as a fee-for-service activity, in order that it not compromise investment in the university academic program and research. Among the current USP Strategic Plan objectives<sup>94</sup>, TVET is number 20 out of 30. This set of circumstances may not augur well for a transfer of APTC's operations.

<sup>94</sup> USP Strategic Plan 2013–18, p. 27

**Option 5:** APTC is made a legal entity and is transferred by the Australian Government to a third party. An ideal result would be the option for the Australian Government to be in a position to sell APTC as a going concern. This would be a concrete measure of APTC's success. The advantage of the option is that DFAT could eventually reduce substantially, if not eliminate, its financing of the APTC. The Stage I mid-term review recommended consideration of establishing APTC as a separate legal entity. The advantages were described:

As a legal entity, the APTC would have a business structure that allows it to operate with autonomy, within its rules of incorporation, in order to respond to the continuously changing needs of the labour markets of the Pacific and to enter into long-term partnerships.<sup>95</sup>

However, several potential disadvantages characterise this proposal. Under current regulations, registration with the Australian Quality Standards Agency would not be possible as a provider operating offshore. Australian RTO support for the APTC would still be required. There would need to be a move to an auspicing<sup>96</sup> arrangement, which is subject to the possibility of reduced commitment or even revoking. There would also be less incentive for the auspicing RTO to make its best staff available to the APTC. Current financial benefits would be lost (e.g. no import tax, refund on Goods and Services Tax). A decision would need to be made on the country in which the legal entity is established, creating potential for tension. Establishment of a legal entity may reduce the prestige of the institution and be a disincentive for staff recruitment and retention. The feasibility of this option from a strictly business view appears remote at present because APTC is a money-losing operation.

**Option 6:** Australia would retain ownership of APTC, but would franchise its operation to a third party, i.e. allow the name of APTC to be used for delivery of courses within agreed parameters. DFAT would need to ensure the quality of program delivery. Another variation is for DFAT to sell the APTC as a franchise to a TAFE or private provider in Australia which, in turn, would license TVET providers in the Pacific to deliver Australian and Pacific qualifications. The pressure to maintain quality of program delivery would come from external audits by the Australian Quality Standards Agency which may require a policy change in its current focus of operations. Option 6 would also require that the APTC becomes a legal entity, with carries the same risks as noted for option 5. There is also a question of what APTC legally owns that could be franchised. For example, the two current RTOs own the courses offered by APTC. The legal status of the systems, procedures and manuals developed by APTC would need to be confirmed.

**Option 7:** APTC is integrated, country-by-country, with national training institutions. During the field visits, when asked what long-term success would look like, the APTC CEO put the answer succinctly: 'To be successful we need to put ourselves out of business.'<sup>97</sup> The ultimate aim would be for national training institutions to be strengthened to the point where they could take over APTC's delivery. This is clearly the best option from the viewpoint of national capacity building and integration with Pacific TVET systems. APTC would cease to exist as a separate entity. This option would require careful partnering by APTC with key NTIs and clear strategies for building sufficient local capacities. Sustained DFAT financing would also be required, not only leading up to the transfer, but shifting after the transfer to bilateral assistance in each campus country. Separate arrangements would be needed for continuing to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Schofield, K., Tan, H., Bryant, C. and Catchlove, J. (2009). APTC Mid-Term Review – final report. Prepared for AusAID, Australian High Commission, Suva, Fiji, p. 51

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> The process by which a registered training organisation authorises another organisation to deliver training and/or conduct assessment.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Evaluation team interview with APTC CEO, 20/8/2014

provide training services to small island states. This option also carries risks. Partnering with key NTIs has met resistance in Fiji and Solomon Islands. These may be difficult to overcome, and it could happen elsewhere. Another risk is the length of time required for NTIs to be fully capable of taking over APTC training. One aid official in a major Pacific country estimated it could take 30 years for national training institutions to assume APTC functions.

**Option 8:** APTC becomes a technical support organisation. APTC's role would change from a best practice provider of Australian qualifications to that of an enabler, or adviser, to Pacific TVET institutions and systems. As a support organisation, APTC would not need necessarily to be located in the Pacific, but would need to be in a position to provide assistance as required on short notice. Table 2 depicts the change of roles.

		_		_		-	
Table 2.	The	change	of	roles	envisaged	for	ΔΡΤС
		onunge	<b>U</b> 1	10100	christagea		

Role						
From Provider	To Adviser/Enabler					
<ul> <li>Delivery of Australian qualifications to Australian standards at Certificate III and above</li> <li>Focus on adult learner (existing worker/ new entrant)</li> <li>Scholarship program</li> <li>Provision of facilities and equipment</li> <li>Capacity building to TVET partners</li> <li>Management of stand-alone regional institution – APTC</li> <li>Industry consultation to meet training needs</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Focus on capacity development (including teacher training; ongoing coaching and mentoring; leadership skills; ongoing professional development) to maintain quality of delivery and systems</li> <li>Strong support for individual countries' and regional qualifications frameworks and TVET quality systems</li> <li>Increased use of M&amp;E capability to answer major questions about the value of TVET to individuals, enterprises and governments</li> <li>Quality monitoring and evaluation at institutional level to inform prospective students and employers of the learning and employment outcomes achieved</li> <li>Develop systems to enable TVET providers to be more responsive to economic demand</li> <li>Support for an industry-led system – lead in meeting emerging skill requirements</li> </ul>					
Funded predominantly by Australian aid Some commercial activity / tuition fee contributions (enterprise or individual)	Funded by Pacific governments, donor aid, industry/enterprises and individual students (offered loans in lieu of scholarships)					

Note: With acknowledgement to APTC management

These changes clearly would take time. They would also need to take into account the fact that there is no 'one-size-fits-all' for country campuses.

The options above have been presented separately, but they are not necessarily mutually exclusive. For example, option 8 could be compatible with option 7, or could be the end game for option 2. Option 8 could involve APTC being lodged in a regional organisation.

Moreover, the options should not be seen as static. Developments can change the viability of the options. The more APTC can reduce its costs and raise revenue, the more viable other options become. That is, APTC's reduced cost per student will affect all options not involving DFAT's continuation of core funding. The interest of potential owners is likely to be very different in two years, if APTC has a clear vision, is operating as one RTO, with nationalisation targets achieved and demonstrable sources for long-term revenue.

Options 3 and 7 should be seen as the preferable alternatives in a sequence of stages to an end point, depending on the outcome of DFAT consultations on options with Pacific governments, the selected sole RTO, relevant DFAT and other donor programs, and large PNG and regional enterprises wanting to purchase skills training.

#### REFERENCES

ADB and PIFS. 2008. *Skilling the Pacific: Technical and Vocational Education and Training in the Pacific.* Manila, Philippines

Alampi, Amanda et al. 2013. *Beyond Skill Visibility: A New Framework for Migration and Development Policy.* WagnerSchool of Public Service, New York University

APTC. (2007). Final report to AusAID for the APTC coordination and country program design

APTC. (2010). Australia–Pacific Technical College Stage II: 2011–2015, design document

APTC. (2011). 2011 Annual Report

APTC. (2012a). APTC financial delegations and authorisations. QP-FI-005

APTC. (2012b). APTC instrument of financial delegation and authority. QP-CS-142

APTC. (2012c). APTC procurement. QP-FI-010

APTC. (2013a). APTC nationalisation strategy. Printed document undated

APTC. (2013b). 2012–13 Annual report and plan

APTC. (2014a). 2013–14 Annual report and plan

APTC. (2014b). Audit report: TAE40110 Certificate IV in Training and Assessment, Samoa

APTC. (2014c). Environmental Scan 2014

APTC. (2014d). Impact Case Study: A Beacon of Light

APTC. (2014e). Industry Partnerships List 16.07.14

APTC. (2014f). HR Report to the Consortium Board, May 2014

APTC. (2014g) Nationalisation Strategy (version 7)

APTC. (2014h). News article APTC launches pilot program in aged care. Retrieved from http://www.aptc.edu.au/index.php/april-2012/407-aptc-launches-pilotprogram-in-aged-care

APTC. (2014i). Scholarship Policy (draft - uncontrolled document)

APTC. (2014j). Summary of Labour Market Analysis Processes

APTC. (2014k). Response for review team re reintegration plan and APTC-to-Work Review, 17 July

APTC. (2014I). APTC business development strategy

APTC. (2014m). APTC contact list

APTC. (2014n). APTC managing contractor consortium planning meeting, Fiji, 11–14 March 2014

APTC. (2014o). APTC national staff salaries, version 6 (2013). Information updated by Geoff Cooper, Manager Human Resources, APTC

APTC. (Updated periodically). Course fees. Retrieved from http://www.aptc.edu.au/index.php/course-fees

AusAid. (2011) Pacific Education and Skills Development Agenda: Guidance on education and skills development across the Pacific. Canberra. Retrieved from: http://aid.dfat.gov.au/Publications/Documents/pesda-2011.pdf

AusAID. (2011). Scope of Services – Schedule 1. APTC DD Annex F. 1 June

AusAID (2006). Australia–Pacific Technical College (APTC) Concept Paper. Annex A to Scope of Services, Request for Tender, 24 May

Australian Bureau of Statistics. (2011). Census of population and housing. Tables on migrants from Pacific to Australia provided by ABS to Richard Curtain, member of independent review team

Australian Bureau of Statistics. (Updated periodically). Employee earnings and hours, May 2012. Canberra. Retrieved from www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/mf/6306.0/

Australian Chamber of Commerce and Industry (ACCI) (2007). ACCI Review, November/December, Number 153

Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. (2010). Australia–Pacific Technical College Quality at entry (QAE) report. Retrieved from www.abs.gov.au/ausstats/abs@.nsf/mf/6306.0/.

Australian Government Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. (2014). Australian aid, promoting prosperity, reducing poverty, enhancing stability. Retrieved from http://aid.dfat.gov.au/aidpolicy/Pages/home.aspx

Australian Government Department of Immigration and Border Protection. (2014) Information on Temporary Work (Skilled) visa (subclass 457). Retrieved from http://www.immi.gov.au/Visas/Pages/457.aspx

Australian Government Productivity Commission. (2011).Vocational education and training workforce. Retrieved from

http://www.pc.gov.au/\_\_data/assets/pdf\_file/0009/108369/vocational-workforce.pdf

Australian Skills Quality Authority. (2012). Standards for NVR Registered Training Organisations. Retrieved from http://www.asqa.gov.au/about-asqa/national-vet-regulation/standards-for-nvr-registered-training-organisations.html

Australian Tax Office. (2014). Australia tax rates for the 2013/2104 tax year. Retrieved from http://www.superguide.com.au/how-super-works/income-tax-rates.

Bateman, A. (2014). Review of the nationalisation strategy: report to APTC. Bateman and Giles Pty Ltd

Bateman, A., Brown, J., & Uera M. (2013). Tonga Country Report: research into the financing of TVET in the Pacific. Australian Council for Educational Research and Australining

Bateman, A., Cassity, E., & Fangalasuu, J. (2013). Solomon Islands Country Report: research into the financing of TVET in the Pacific. Australian Council for Educational Research and Austraining

Bedford, R; & Hugo, G. (2012). Population Movement in The Pacific: A Perspective on Future Prospects. Labour & Immigration Research Centre, Department of Labour, New Zealand

Box Hill Institute, Gordon Institute, & MDI International. (2008). Activity design document for the Australia–Pacific Technical College, Phase II detailed design School of Health and Community Services (Children's Services and Community Welfare)

Clemens, M.A; Graham C. & Howes, S. (2014). Skill development and regional mobility: Lessons from the Australia–Pacific Technical College. Discussion Paper 34, Development Policy Centre, The Australian National University, May

Commonwealth of Australia. (2008). Commonwealth Procurement Guidelines. Financial management guidance No. 1

Cully, M. (2011). Skilled migration selection policies: recent Australian reforms. Migration Policy Practice Vol. 1, 1, pp. 4–7

Curtain, R. (2014). *Labour mobility between the Pacific and Australia. Development Policy Centre*, Australia National University

Department of Immigration & Border Protection (2014). Trends in the subclass 457 Temporary Work (Skilled) visa program, quarter ending 31 March 2014. Australian Government, Canberra

Department of Immigration & Citizenship (2010). How New Migrants Fare: Analysis of the Continuous Survey of Australia's Migrants. Australian Government, Canberra. Retrieved from www.immi.gov.au/media/publications/research/

Dornan, M; & Newton Cain, T; (2013). Regional Service Delivery among Small Island Developing States of the Pacific: An Assessment. Asia and the Pacific Policy Studies (APPS) Working Paper Series 04/2013, The Australian National University, October

Education Resources Facility (ERF). (2014). Evaluation Plan: Independent Evaluation of the Australia–Pacific Technical College (APTC). 2 June

Filer, C; Andrew, M; Carr, P; Imbun, B; & Sagir, B. (2013). Papua New Guinea Draft Chapter for World Development Report Companion Volume on 'Jobs', 21 June

Fourth High Level Forum on Aid Effectiveness. (2011). Busan partnership for effective development co-operation, Busan, Republic of Korea, 29 November–1 December

Hawthorne, L. (2011). *Competing for Skills: Migration Policies and Trends in New Zealand and Australia*. Department of Labour, New Zealand Government, Wellington, New Zealand

Horne, R., Ngangan, K., & Tavil-Melachon, S. (2013). Papua New Guinea: Report on Phase 1 and Proposed Plan for Phase 2: research into the financing of TVET in the Pacific. Australian Council for Educational Research and Austraining

International Average Salary Income Database. (Updated periodically). Australia average salaries and expenditures, 2005. Retrieved from http://www.worldsalaries.org/australia.shtml.

Maglen, L., Wall, M.W., & Rokvunisei, M. (2013). Fiji Country Report: research into the financing of TVET in the Pacific. Australian Council for Educational Research and Australiang

Maglen, L., Brown, J., & Lene S.P.T. (2013). Samoa country report: research into the financing of TVET in the Pacific. Australian Council for Educational Research and Australiang

Maxumise (Fiji) Ltd. (2013). APTC 2013 salary and structure review for the Pacific Region

Mckay, R. (2014). Results measurement at the APTC: a VfM perspective. Effective Development Group, GRM International

Mitchell, J. (2009). Advanced VET practitioners. John Mitchell and Associates, NSW Australia

NCVER. 2014. Australian Vocational Education and Training Statistics – The Likelihood of Completing a VET Qualification 2009–2012. Department of Industry, Australian Government OECD. (2014). *Recruiting Immigrant Workers: New Zealand 2014*. OECD Publishing, Paris. http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/9789264215658-en

Pacific Islands Forum, Forum Communiqué 25–27 October 2005, 36th Pacific Islands Forum, PIFS(05)12

Pacific Islands Forum Secretariat. (2012) A Regional Framework for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Development in the Pacific Island Countries: 2012-2015. Suva: SPC. Retrieved from: http://www.forumsec.org/resources/uploads/ attachments/documents/2012FEdMM.08\_Paper1.pdf

Pacific Islands Forum Secretariat. (2009). *Pacific Education Development Framework* (*PEDF*). Suva: PIFS. Retrieved from:

http://www.forumsec.org/resources/uploads/embeds/file/Pacific%20Education%20 Development%20Framework%202009-2015(1).pdf

Pacific Media Assistance Scheme. (2013). Regional state of media and communication report. Retrieved from http://www.pacmas.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/PACMAS-REGIONAL-REPORT\_FINAL.pdf

Phillips, J. (2013). Temporary skilled migration and the 457 visa, Flagpost, information and research from the parliamentary library, posted 13/03/2013

Phillips, J; & Spinks, H. (2012). Skilled migration: temporary and permanent flows to Australia. Background Note, Parliamentary Library, Social Policy Section, Parliament of Australia, 6 December

Powell, M. (2012). 'Skills Development and Technical and Vocational Education' Current Issues in Education, commissioned by the Education Thematic Group in AusAID through the Education Resource Facility, Canberra

Schofield, K., Tan, H., Bryant, C. & Catchlove, J. (2009). APTC Mid-Term Review – final report. Prepared for AusAID, Australian High Commission, Suva, Fiji

Swanton, T., & Ong, A. (2013). *APTC Graduates Down the Track*. National Centre for Vocational Education Research Consultancy (NCVER), University of the South Pacific. (2013) USP Strategic Plan 2013–2018. Suva, Fiji

Woods, J. & O'Leary, C. (2006). Conceptual Framework for an Optimal Labour Market Information System: Final Report. Upjohn Institute Technical Report No. 07-022. Kalamazoo, MI: W. E. Upjohn Institute for Employment Research

World Bank. (2014). Online database of development indicators updated on 1 July 2014. Retrieved from:

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List\_of\_countries\_by\_GDP\_(PPP)\_per\_capita.

Note: The Memoranda/Letters of Agreement with the five campus countries and three non-campus countries are also referenced in Annex 6, Attachment 2.