Government of Indonesia   **Government of Australia**

Asset Management Assistance Project (AMAP)

MID TERM REVIEW

REPORT

APPENDICES

November 2009

APPENDIX 1 TERMS OF REFERENCE

Mid Term Review for Asset Mapping Assistance Project

Introduction
These Terms of Reference (ToR) stipulate the requirements for the conduct of a Mid Term Review (MTR) to assess and review progress of the Asset Mapping Assistance in Aceh. The recommendations of the Review will refine the future direction of the project and provide guidance for further implementation of the project.

Background
On 26 December 2004 an earthquake of magnitude 9.0 on the Richter scale struck in the Indian Ocean creating a tsunami that devastated the coastal areas of Aceh and Nias. On 28 March the following year, another earthquake of magnitude 8.7 on the Richter scale struck offshore of Northwest Sumatera near the Island of Nias. These combined disasters killed at least 132,000 people and left 590,000 people homeless.

The region is nearing the end of the reconstruction phase and is focussed on longer term development challenges. Much infrastructure has been rebuilt and people displaced by the tsunami and earthquakes have returned to their new homes. BRR, the government agency for reconstruction and rehabilitation in Aceh, has built 120,000 houses plus estimated 20,000 of public assets such as schools and health facilities. Other donors have built an additional 44,000 houses.

Towards the completion of its mandate in April 2009, BRR approached AusAID for assistance in addressing issues related to the mapping of public assets to be transferred to the Provincial Government of Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam (NAD) and for the audit purposes. In response to this request AusAID provided A$5 million grant toward the asset mapping and management program which is being implemented by the German Technical Corporation (GTZ) in collaboration with the BRR and the NAD government authorities.

This program has three components with the following outcomes:
Component 1: Asset Mapping: By December 2008, BRR (PUSDATIN) and SIM-Centre/AGDC will have an asset database that accurately records geospatial and textual data for all 25,000 "fixed public assets" reconstructed/rehabilitated by BRR (both on and off budget) in NAD and Nias.

Component 2: Asset transfer: By April 2009, NAD provincial government (AGDC) will have the necessary tools and knowledge to effectively operate and maintain the AIMS database transferred from BRR.

Component 3: By November 2009, all district governments in NAD and possibly Nias will have the necessary tools and knowledge to effectively use spatial planning systems and safely implement OH&S practices when managing assets and hazardous building materials. The Scope of Services and working locations will be ascertained during this Mid Term Review.

Objectives
A Mid Term Review (MTR) will be undertaken in August 2009 to review AMAP outcomes and the Contractor's performance to date. The MTR team will also be involved in scoping Component 3 with inputs from the AIMS Lead Technical Adviser.

Scope of Review
1. The Mid Term Review Team will review AMAP outputs from each component as follows:

Component 1: Asset Mapping:
- (a) Refined definitions for "fixed public assets" in consultation with BRR.
- (b) High resolution imagery for areas containing "fixed public assets".
- (c) Database of geospatial data for 25,000 "fixed public assets" ready for BPK audit.
- (d) Database of textual data for 25,000 "fixed public assets".
- (e) Fully functioning AIMS using an integrated web-based GIS platform.
- (f) Quality Control and M&E of sub-contracted geospatial/textual data collection.
- (g) Ongoing technical support for PUSDATIN and AGDC.

Component 2: Asset Transfer:
- (a) Transfer consolidated asset database and AIMS from PUSDATIN to AGDC.
- (b) Train AGDC personnel in the installation, operation and maintenance of AIMS.
- (c) Develop an AIMS Operational Manual and rollout strategy for AGDC.
- (d) Provide technical support to PUSDATIN and AGDC during asset transfer.

Component 3: Asset Management:
- (a) Scoping Paper detailing activities proposed for Component 3 and local government counterparts.

2. To provide input on activities for Component 3 of the project.

Methodology

In undertaking the scope of the MTR, the following combination of instruments will be required by the Consultant:
- a. Familiarization with relevant program and activity documentation provided by AusAID;
- b. Participation in AusAID briefing sessions both prior to and at the conclusion of the field visit;
- c. A field visit to Banda Aceh to have a first hand review on the status of AMAP implementation, including meetings with AMAP team, stakeholders such as NAD Government agencies, AMS user group, BKRA and other agencies as appropriate.
- d. Presentation of initial findings of the MTR to AusAID Jakarta and GTZ team, followed by submission of draft and final MTR reports.

Reporting requirement

The MTR Consultant shall provide AusAID with the following:
- a. **Presentation and discussion -** on the initial findings of the MTR to be presented to AusAID at the completion of the in-country visit;

- b. **Draft MTR** – to be submitted to AusAID within two (2) weeks of completing field visit. AusAID may share the report with, and seek feedback from, GTZ and other key stakeholders, as appropriate;

- c. **Final MTR** – to be submitted within one week of receipt of AusAID's comments on the draft MTR. The MTR Consultant shall determine whether any amendment to the draft is warranted. The report should be a brief and clear summary of the MTR outcomes and focus on a balanced analysis of issues faced by the activity.

List of Key Documents:

1. AMAP Project Design Document
2. GTZ Contract
3. AMAP Scoping Paper

APPENDIX 2 PEOPLE MET

Date	Person	Organisation / Position
Tuesday 25 Aug Morning	Ralph Douglass	AMAP Team Leader
Afternoon	Yakob Ishadamy	Tim Asistensi. Head of Aceh Green
	Ms Lestari Suci	Research and Development Section Bappeda Propinsi, Acting Head of AGDC
	Ir. Iskandar	Chief of Operations BKRA
Wednesday Morning Visit to Jantho	Ir. Zulkifli Rasyid, MSi.	Head of Bappeda Aceh Besar
	Ir. Zakaria, MT	Head of GIS Centre, Aceh Besar plus his staff
	Anwar Ahmad, SE Ak.	Wakil Bupati Aceh Besar
	Drs. Iskandar	Kepala Dinas, DPPKA Aceh Besar
Afternoon	Muzailin Affan	Director, GIS and Remote sensing Development Centre, Syiah Kuala University
	Erik van der Zee	GIS adviser ADB EMS ETESP
	Lars Blomkvist	Adviser to Yayasan Leuser International
	Ahmad Abdullah	BKPP consultant Training curriculum design
	Erwien Garibaldi	BKPP consultant Training needs assessment
Thursday Morning	Katrina Doherty	Finance and Administration Manager AMAP
	Pak Fadli	Represent of Head of BPKP NAD
	Jufri and Alwi	Staff of BPKP
	Allan Williams	Capacity Building Specialist AMAP
	M. Hasyik Mastjik	Capacity Building Specialist AMAP
Afternoon	Kai Hauerstein	Legal Adviser, AMAP
	Tim Mollison	Adviser AMAP
		Head of Research and Development Section Bappeda
	Ms Lestari Suci	Research and Development Section Bappeda Propinsi, Acting Head of AGDC
	Marthunis	Research and Development Section Bappeda Propinsi
Friday Morning	Ramon Hogad	Lead Technical Adviser AGTP
	Pak Fauzi	Head of Asset Section. DPKKA
Afternoon		Collating information

APPENDIX 3 LOGFRAME

Design Logic	Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions
Goal			
• Facilitate the efficient allocation of scarce resources and safe management of public assets within the provincial and district governments of NAD and Nias, in line with GOI decentralisation objectives and Indonesian service delivery standards.	• Local government staff having increased knowledge of spatial mapping, GIS and the management of hazardous materials • Asset management incorporated into local government financial management systems • Improved planning and maintenance of local government assets • More effective local government spending on public investment and public services	• Interviews with local govt management • Outputs of AIMS • Local govt financial management reports • Physical inspections and textual information • Annual maintenance expenditures in local government financial reports • National and local government audit reports	• Local governments are committed to improving financial management and the provision of public services
Objectives			
• Provide provincial and district governments with the appropriate tools (i.e. AIMS) and knowledge (i.e. training on AIMS and hazardous building materials) to effectively and safely manage assets (handed over by BRR) from April 2009 onwards.	• BPK able to conduct the audit of BRR controlled non-housing reconstructed assets • AGDC operating the database without external assistance • Local government staff trained in asset management and spatial planning	• BPK audit report • Output of local government AIMS • AMAP completion review	• GOI allows the transfer to proceed on completion of the BPK audit • AGDC agree to the audited data and proceed with the transfer • Local governments are adequately staffed to continue with the AIMS work post-transfer
Components			
1 Asset Mapping	• Number of assets mapped • Number of assets mapped as percentage of targeted number of assets • Number of assets with textual data as a percentage of targeted number of assets • Quality indicator measuring accuracy and timeliness of data • Database with mapping and textual data assigned to individual assets	• Pre-BPK audit assessment by AMAP of the completeness of the database • Inspection of database • Inspection of input and output records • Data validation using existing data such as BRR RAN database • Signoff by kabupaten representatives	• Availability of sub-contractors for geospatial mapping, textual data capture and high resolution imagery to complete the exercise in time for the BPK audit
2 Asset Transfer	• Number of provincial government staff trained in AIMS • Extent of assistance provided to BRR thematic groups	• AGDC site inspection • AIMS reports • Training records	• AGDC agree to the audited data and proceed with the transfer • BRR does seek external assistance

Design Logic	Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions
	• Qualitative assessments of AIMS capability in provincial government • OH&S generic manual finalised	• Activity completion reports • Interviews with AGDC management & staff	
3 Asset Management	• Number of district government staff trained in AIMS spatial planning and OH&S • Qualitative assessment of capacity building in asset management • Number of district governments using AIMS to maintain an asset database • Number of district governments using spatial planning for asset management	• Interviews with AGDC management & staff • Outputs of AIMS • Inspection of input records • Information on local govt org structure • Personnel records • Interviews with local govt management	• Local governments remain interested in maintaining and further developing AIMS • AIMS work is adequately staffed • Local governments remain concerned about hazardous building materials
Outputs			
1.1 Asset Information Management System (AIMS)	• Formulation of GIS platform • A database of reconstruction assets that has GIS data combined with mapping data and textual data on individual assets • Completeness of key auditing and legal transfer information	• Pre-BPK audit assessment by AMAP of the completeness of the database • Inspection of database • Inspection of input and output records	• Good communication among counterparts • Availability of sub-contractors for geospatial mapping, textual data capture and high resolution imagery to complete the exercise in time for the BPK audit
1.2 High Resolution Imagery	• Images taken compared with total number of images required	• Images sighted and checked for appropriate resolution (highest resolution needed for most devastated areas)	• Image services functioning and able to be accessed
1.3 Geospatial mapping of each asset	• Number of assets located and described as % of total targeted number of assets	• Inspection of input records and database reports	• Local governments cooperate in data collection
1.4 Textual information on each asset	• Number of assets with textual data annotations as a percentage of total targeted number of assets	• Inspection of input records and database reports	• Local governments cooperate in data collection
2.1 Assistance to BRR thematic groups	• Number of requests for assistance from BRR thematic groups	• Activity completion reports on assistance provided	• BRR does seek external assistance
2.2 Transfer of AIMS	• Number of datasets and associated hardware re-established in AGDC compared with pre-transfer data sets • Time since database last updated • AGDC staff and management trained in operation and maintenance of AIMS	• AGDC site inspection • AIMS reports • AIMS reports • Training records	• AGDC agree to the audited data and proceed with the transfer

Design Logic	Indicators	Means of Verification	Assumptions
2.3 Training and support to provincial governments on AIMS	• Number of AGDC staff and management trained in operation and maintenance of AIMS • Qualitative assessments of AIMS capability in local governments	• Training records • Interviews with AGDC management and staff	• Local governments remain interested in AIMS work • AIMS work is adequately staffed
3 Yet to be fully scoped			

APPENDIX 4   UPDATED AMAP PROJECT OUTPUT DESCRIPTIONS AND WORK PLAN (based on ARARP1606)

	Descriptions and Planned Activities	Status at 14/6/09	Targeted Completion Date	Revised Completion Date	Status at 1 Sept 2009 observed by MTR team
AMAP Project Administration and Finance					
1	Project Core Team on ground, in Banda Aceh	**Complete**	Thu 18/09/08	No Change	
2	Establish a standalone AMAP Project Office suitably located near both key counterparts in Banda Aceh	**Complete**	Fri 28/11/08	No Change	
3	Recruit key local finance, administrative and technical Staff	**Complete**	Fri 28/11/08	No Change	
4	Mobilise a Procurement and Finance support team.	**Complete**	Fri 14/11/08	No Change	
5	Mobilise Database and GIS team to support component 1 – 3 activities	**complete**	Mon 30/11/09	No Change	
6	Establish Administration financial and procurement procedures for the AMAP Project	**Complete**	Wed 31/12/08	No Change	
7	Provision of support services and responsibility for managing the delivery of day-to-day financial and administrative activities	On-going	Thu 31/12/09	No Change	
8	Prepare a AMAP Funds Account Operations Manual detailing eligible funding activities, procurement policies, cash flow projections, banking details, authorised signatories, foreign exchange accounting, and acquittal/transaction reporting formats	**Complete**	Wed 17/12/08	No Change	
Quality Control and M&E for Component 1					
9	Mobilise a Quality Control / M&E team tasked solely with monitoring cost, quality and timing of AMAP activities and in particular sub-contracted activities.	**Component 1 M&E completed**	Fri 27/02/09	Mon 15/02/09	Component 1 M&E service contract completed 15/2/09. Rapid start up of AMAP required separate sourcing and contracting a suitably qualified M&E specialist for components 2&3
Component 1: Asset Mapping by 31 December 2008:					
12	By December 2008, BRR (PUSDATIN) and SIM-Centre/AGDC will have an asset database that accurately records geospatial and textual data for all 25,000 "fixed public assets" reconstructed/rehabilitated by BRR (both on and off budget) in NAD and Nias.	**Complete**	Mon 15/12/08	No Change	Letters of acceptance of data received from BRR on 15/12/08 Letter of appreciation for subsequent data processing and analysis requests from BRR to support asset transfer to NAD received 24/02/09
13	Establish, organise, host and chair the Strategic Coordination Committees and provide related secretarial services.	Committee appointed	Mon 19/10/09	No Change	Could be basis for seeking agreement on ongoing support to pilot CB activities and AIMS / AMS support to additional kabupatens.
14	Establish Technical Coordination Committees	Committee appointed and working	Mon 19/10/09	No Change	Should be used to support AMAP CB work and decision of strategic coordination committee.

		Descriptions and Planned Activities	Status at 14/6/09	Targeted Completion Date	Revised Completion Date	Status at 1 Sept 2009 observed by MTR team
15		BRR - AMAP regular technical steering and administrative coordination meetings – ongoing	**Complete**	Tue 28/04/09	16/04/09	Replaced by initiatives being developed with Aceh Governors' office and Pemda
16		Prepare, tender and manage sub-contracts for asset mapping	**Complete**	Fri 12/12/08	No Change	
17		Prepare, allocate and manage M&E Contract for Asset Survey	**Complete**	Mon 15/12/08	No change	
18		Mobilise AMAP Database and GIS Team to ensure the quality and integrity of incoming geospatial and textual asset data submitted by sub-contracted fixed asset field surveyors prior to hand over to BRR for appending to the main BRR database	**Complete**	Fri 31/10/08	No Change	
19		Completion of survey database of geospatial data for 25,000 ""fixed public assets"" and hand over to BRR and AGDC	**Complete**	Mon 15/12/08	No Change	
21		Quality Control and M&E of sub-contracted geospatial/textual data collection.	**Complete**	Mon 15/12/08	No Change	
		Ongoing technical support for BRR(PUSDATIN)	**Complete**	Thu 30/04/09	16/04/09	
22		Ongoing technical support for NAD/Nias (BAPPEDA /AGDC).	On-going	Thu 30/11/09	No Change	Being provided where practical. AGDC is still not operational. Governor decree has been issued and staff nominated for appointment. AGDC has been informally operating with trained unofficial staff from Bappeda.
23		Procure High resolution imagery for areas containing fixed public assets	On-going	Thu 30/04/09	30/06/09	Delivered on 26 August. Being checked before transfer to provincial government.
24		Review the technical and operational viability of providing a fully functioning AIMS using an integrated web-based GIS platform.	On-going	Fri 27/02/09	30/06/09	Not completed as unable to gain access to SIMBADA database. Included in TOR for Asset Management Framework Team to report on.
25		Organise a series of stakeholder meetings and workshops to ensure inputs from all stakeholders are confirmed and agreed to achieve the stated project objectives.	Initiated First meetings held 2/12/08, 10/12/08 and 29/01/09 Next scheduled meeting 12/06/09 Ongoing	Fri 27/02/09	30/11/09	AMS Stakeholder group out of NAD Governors office. AMS concept derived from counterpart and stakeholders requests
26		Institute concept discussion and approval to "synergize" output from ALGAP II and SLGSR (Existing GTZ governance support programmes in Aceh) for maximization of sustainability and reach of AMS capacity building	Agreement for cooperation and joint delivery of capacity building components. Ongoing and extended	Fri 5/12/08	30/06/09	Discussions with ALGAP II and UNDP on potential for joint partnership implementation of AMS capacity building ongoing. Agreements in place with AGTP/BKPP for BKPP trainers to lead delivery of GIS/remote sensing/inventory development capacity building in dinas dinas and kabupatens.
27		Initiate refocus of AMAP project from provision of detailed technical AIMS to provision of AMS; based on initial observations and requests from counterparts	**Complete**	Mon 2/03/09	No change	AMAP has produced draft final AMS framework and implementation plan for capacity building to support the framework. Framework uses experience of other asset management activities including IREP, ADB, NRP asset management training processes

	Descriptions and Planned Activities	Status at 14/6/09	Targeted Completion Date	Revised Completion Date	Status at 1 Sept 2009 observed by MTR team
Component 2: Asset Transfer by 30 April 2009:					
28	Complete employment of AMS technical advisor and complete AMS need assessment process in Aceh	Complete	Fri 27/02/09	30/04/09	Needs assessment report delivered and forms basis of CB activity planned for AMS framework.
29	Review and revise AMAP resource allocation In light of NAD/Nias governments requests for (a) greater internal capacity building; and (b) proposed shift in emphasis from AIMS to AMS ;	Complete	Fri 30/01/09	30/03/09	AMAP resources reallocated and recruited to implement AMS framework CB proposal.
30	Continue to Chair Technical and Steering Committee coordination meetings and provide secretariat services.	Initiated	Mon 19/10/09	No change	New committee required to be established in NAD post BRR. Asset Stake holders meeting held 12/6/09. Proposals awaiting AusAID budget approval
31	Develop and hold technical and administrative workshops with all stakeholders involved in AMS development in Aceh and Nias to ensure inputs from all stakeholders are confirmed and agreed to refine AMAP stated project objectives.	On-going	Tue 31/03/09	30/07/09	Links have been developed with the major stakeholders and draft letters of offer are being finalized with the cooperating agencies – Bappeda / AGDC, DPKK, DPKKA, BKPP, Aceh Besar, Aceh Jaya and Aceh Tenggara. No major issues raised on letters during MTR stakeholder meetings.
32	Review BRR AIMS design to assist the NAD provincial government (DPKKA/BAPPEDA/AGDC) to have the necessary tools and knowledge to effectively operate and maintain the AIMS database transferred from BRR	Initiated	Fri 30/04/09	30/06/09	Not achieved through lack of cooperation from SIMBADA team which has not finished development. AMAP is planning its CB activities to use both SIMBADA and national SIMDA systems with support to BPKP to link SIMDA data to a GIS.
33	Provide technical support to BRR (PUSDATIN) and the NAD provincial government (AGDC) during asset transfer.	On-going	Thu 30/06/09	No change	Follow up Survey and data clarification activities complete. AMAP staff working with unofficial AGDC counterparts in planned AGDC office.
34	Establish and operate project field offices in BAPPEDA (AGDC) to provide technical AMS development and logistical personnel to support the AGDC and AMAP project team.	Initiated	Thu 31/12/09	No change	AMAP staff working with unofficial AGDC counterparts in planned AGDC office. These staff are included in letter of offer between Bappeda and AMAP.
35	Develop an AMS Operational Manual and rollout strategy for NAD and Nias (BAPPEDA/AGDC).	Initiated	Thu 30/04/09	30/07/09	This output is unrealistic given the lack of resources and time to develop an AMS operational manual and the lack of direct AMS implementation experience. Development of the AMS manual is a 2-3 standalone project.
36	Design a capacity building program to develop Provincial Government and AGDC counterparts understanding and involvement in the installation, operation and maintenance of AMS.	Initiated discussions and meetings	Thu 30/04/09	30/07/09	Included in TOR of Asset Management Team. Full implementation subject to AusAID budget approval
MID TERM REVIEW					
37	Coordinate and participate in the Mid Term Review which will include amongst other tasks, arranging accommodation and transport, scheduling meetings with	Proposed for June	Thu 30/05/09	26-28 August	Due to uncertainty from change from AIMS to AMS focus, the MTR was not appropriate until the basic framework had been developed. MTR now completed and draft recommendations submitted on 31 st

	Descriptions and Planned Activities	Status at 14/6/09	Targeted Completion Date	Revised Completion Date	Status at 1 Sept 2009 observed by MTR team
	key stakeholders, coordinating the independent financial audit, and consulting with local government.				August .
38	Clarify and specify AMAP involvement in hazardous materials training for local government counterparts and any specialised inputs required.	Expert sourced through GTZ SES network.	Wed 15/04/09	30/07/09	Input from hazardous waste specialist in July 2009. Report not extensive nor clear on what training should be provided. This could be partially due to Aceh Jaya where the major issue exists not having a properly resourced kabupaten government.
39	Employ an occupational health, safety and environment specialist (OHSE) to design, implement and deliver the hazardous materials training programme for local government counterparts plus specify any specialized inputs required.	Expert sourced through GTZ SES network.	Wed 15/04/09	30/07/09	Input from hazardous waste specialist in July 2009. Currently not included in AMS CB activities.
Component 3: Asset Management by 31 December 2009:					
40	Work closely with the NAD government (DPKKA/BAPPEDA/AGDC)* and district government counterparts to prepare a Scoping Paper detailing activities proposed for Component 3 with input from the Mid Term Review team and local government counterparts.	Initial discussion and consultation complete	Thu 30/04/09	30/08/09	The scoping paper and the draft AMS framework are accepted by the MTR as outlining the planned activities for Component 3. The MTR will review the proposed budget for the planned activities.
41	Coordinate with ALGAP II and other agencies to develop and design joint capacity development in governance and AMS for NAD and Nias regional government counterparts	ongoing	Thu 31/12/09	30/09/09	AMAP has put in place cooperation arrangements with BPKK (AGTP) and Syiah Kuala University to assist with implementation of CB activities. Sib-contractors will also be used.
42	Deliver training to all district governments in AMS and AIMS, spatial planning tools and hazardous building materials. Subject to AusAID approval of the Scoping Paper	Not yet implemented	Mon 30/11/09	No change	Original and revised targets of assisting all kabupatens in AIMS then AMS training were unrealistic. In practice a sound start to CB will be made with the newly resourced AGDC and in Aceh Besar (which already has a functioning GIS centre) and Aceh Tenggara (which is close to completing its asset inventory. Aceh Jaya will be provided with basic resources and training but will require substantial ongoing support to achieve a sustainable outcome. Other kabupatens will receive an introduction to AMS and the project CB process and will receive documentation on the AMS process.